

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled after Lunch at Eight
Minutes past Fourteen of the Clock*

(Shri Sharad Dighe in the Chair)

14.08 hrs.

**MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S
ADDRESS—Contd.**

MR. CHAIRMAN : Shri Sultanpuri may continue now.

[Translation]

SHRI KRISHAN DUTT SULTANPURI (Shimla) : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I was speaking on the President's Address yesterday. Today again I would like to point out that the steps proposed for the welfare of hill people in the President's Address are highly commendable. Excesses were committed on women in Uttar Pradesh. The hill people in Uttar Pradesh face a number of problems. The main problem is that the capital of the State is situated at Lucknow but the hill people hardly get any benefit from this place. There is no administration in hill area. It has been stated in para eight of the Presidents' Address that the Government is going to solve the problems there amicably. My submission is that areas like Transgiri, Shillai, Rohdu, Jubbal, Chaupal, Rajgarh and Renuka of my constituency are adjacent to Jaunsar Bawar area of Uttar Pradesh which has been declared as Scheduled Tribes area. They have their relatives there. The people of that area have formed a Sabha named Hati near Transgiri and a deputation thereof met me today. Alongwith the deputation I met the hon. Minister of Welfare today. The people of these areas demand that their areas also should be declared as tribal areas. It has been said in the President's Address that the Government is endeavouring to solve the problems of the people of hill areas. I want that like Jaunsar Babar, the Giripar area of Sirmaur district should be declared tribal area so that justice could be meted out to the people there. I congratulate the Government for making an allocation of Rs. 1,000 crore for horticulture and fishery, etc. Rs. 24 crore were allocated in the last Five Year Plan for the purpose. But this allocation has been raised to Rs. 1,000 crore in this Five Year Plan. Earlier the B.J.P. Government had done injustice to the apple growers by resorting to lathi-charge on them. But the Government of India has provided funds for the people engaged in agriculture and horticulture. Today we have record buffer stock of foodgrains.

Today itself during the Question Hour an hon. Member had asked as to what was the achievement in the field of family planning after so many years of Independence. My submission is that it is a national issue. It has to be solved at the national level. Members belonging to all parties should think about it.

People demand the remunerative prices for sugarcane and rice. I also demand an increase in their prices. But how can it be justified if on the one hand the remunerative prices are demanded and on the other hand the Government is criticised for its failure to contain the price rise. The opposition should be unequivocal. But they have always taken equivocal stance. The V.P. Singh Government had absolute majority. Yet it could not rule more than two and a half years. These Governments are short-lived. If we want to strengthen the country, we have to think as to what type of Government should have. The Congress Government has been functioning for several years. We have tried our best to give our full cooperation to any party that was in power, yet those Governments did not last long. Shri Devi Lal came, quarrelled and quit the Government criticising Shri V.P. Singh he had said that he was yet to come across a person of the like of V.P. Singh. He further said that it was he who supported V.P. Singh in gaining the highest post. But people know it very well as to what he had done in this respect. Nobody should humiliate any Prime Minister. The communists and other progressive persons should also understand it that the B.J.P. is the party which plays gimmick. It cannot do justice to anybody, it rather can spoil everybody. We must have a word of praise for Shri Beant Singh who has been instrumental in bringing normalcy back in Punjab. The BJP had joined hands with the then Chief Minister Shri Surjeet Singh Barnala.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Your time is over.

SHRI KRISHAN DUTT SULTANPURI : When Shri Prakash Singh Badal was the Chief Minister, the BJP had joined hands with him also. But today the Congress is in power there on its own. Today I am happy that the Congress has won absolute majority in elections there. Today our party is in power in five States. Himachal Pradesh, Haryana, Punjab, Madhya Pradesh are ruled by the Congress. It is in power in the Centre also. But where is your party in power? The opposition should realise that we have to run the administration of the country, so you should cooperate with the Government. Shri Narasimha Rao is strong today. He is working to strengthen the country. The opposition should extend cooperate to him in his work.

I am grateful to you that you gave me time to speak here. The time was very short, however, I do take care others too get time to speak. I earnestly request that due attention should be paid to my constituency. While allocating Rs. one thousand crore, a mention of which has been made in the hon. President's Address, it should be ensured that a major share of these funds go to Himachal Pradesh and the Garhwal regions for the development of horticulture.

Before I conclude, I would like to express my gratitude to the hon. Members of the B.J.P. who did not interrupt my speech. But I know that the reason for their silence is that only those who are rational and speak the truth are sitting here and the provocative ones ones have gone out.

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur) : Mr. Chairman. Sir, in spite of our high regard for Rashtrapati, we cannot support the Motion moved by Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar which, of course, does not mean any personal disrespect to our President.

Sir, before I go into the merits of the Motion, I cannot but express our sense of unhappiness to put it mildly that we should be discussing this Motion nearly two and half months after the Address was delivered. This is a very unwelcome situation. For Standing Committees to function, we have bifurcated the Budget Session last year and this year it has been trifurcated apparently as the Government did not wish to annoy a Constitutional authority which is bent upon exercising unconstitutional power of draconian proportions.

Sir, I believe the time has also come, of course, I am not going into the details now, that on the basis of the experience that we have gathered of the functioning of the Standing Committees over the last two years that sooner than later a review should be made, especially as the Government treats the reports casually and hardly they are being acted on.

Mr. Chairman, yesterday we had two major speeches, one representing the Ruling Party, struggling for its very survival and another representing the forces of division, disunity and confrontation of dangerous dimensions. We cannot but notice and I am sorry that our respected Rashtrapati had to utter many cliches and inexactitudes as is being required to read the Address prepared by a Government which has lost all connections with the people and is almost a non functioning Government.

The Address not only gives a misleading picture of the real situation prevailing in the country but also conceals many important facts which should have been highlighted. The real object is that this Government wants to hoodwink the people.

At the very beginning of the Address, it talks of optimism and self-assurance but significantly does not mention whose optimism and whose self-assurance it is.

Sir, the Address talks of the country achieving a turn around but does not indicate to which direction it has turned around. Sir, significantly the Address does not mention the continued privation and misery of the people nor of the unabated price rise except a reference to express almost a mock concern. It does not refer to the continued rising unemployment figures, nor of greater and greater tension in the body politic of our country. It does not mention of the indecent burial of the principle of self-reliance to which this country has been committed and still committed and of the unproductive foreign intrusion into our economy.

Of course, the Address refers to the people having responded handsomely by reasserting their faith in social stability. I agree, Sir, that the people have

responded by obliterating the Congress Party from almost all the States and that too, very handsomely.

Sir, this is the Address which is a product of a Government whose hallmark is vacillation, inaction, dissention, surrender of national interests and compromise with communal and fundamentalist forces. Unfortunately, at the same time in this House we have the major Opposition Party, which is out to destroy the fabric of our secular structure and divide the people on the ground of religion, totally unashamed of the wanton destruction of the Babri Masjid. It has now embarked upon a course of the grossest form of disunity and disintegration just to assume political power with the so-called majority being in danger. It has now openly joined hands with the fascist forces to win elections. Of all persons I heard yesterday, Shri Vajpayee was supporting the exercise of an extra-constitutional authority by remote control operator because according to him Sanjay Gandhi had done it. This is the only justification. Thus, today BJP's ideal is that of Sanjay Gandhi and Bal Thackeray. Sir, what will happen to this country's unity and integrity if people will have to obtain permits to stay in a particular place or enter a particular State or enter a particular city and hordes of mafias are let loose to drive away innocent Indian citizens without going through any legal or the civilised process of identification, from one State in the name of identification of foreigners. If they are foreigners, can you throw them into another State? And this is all being supported openly.

But, Sir, time has come that this Parliament should very categorically state that this sort of situation will not be tolerated and will not be tolerated for long. We must stand up against this sinister attempt to divide the nation in this manner. What will happen if the people of any particular community or the people speaking a particular language are only allowed to stay in a State? What remains of the unity and integrity of the country and what remains but for total disintegration of the country?

Mr. Chairman, in this very serious situation that is being faced by the country today, what is the response of this Government? How seriously is the situation even contemplated by this Government? We know, Sir, that we are reaching a position where the Congress Party will remain only in pages of history and probably in some sign boards, and the writing on the wall is for all to see. Now the process of requiem is going on. But, still unfortunately the country is under the administration of this Government under this Party at the Centre. Therefore, it cannot abdicate its responsibilities and functions. It cannot allow the country's unity and integrity to be played about, to be challenged openly and divisive forces to get the upper hand; and the country's unity and integrity will be at the mercy of some people who are out to destabilize the country. Of course, it is an illusion to expect this Government to function. It has lost all capacity to function and probably its will to function. It is just waiting for total obliteration at the next hustings.

Sir, again on the other hand, the main Opposition Party in this House is now gloating over its present success—what I call temporary successes and the people will have to rise. The common people and the struggling people of this country will have to rise against this and to fight this menace with all the resources at their command and that they have also started realizing that the people cannot be hoodwinked for long as the recently held Uttar Pradesh local Governmental elections have shown. Now what is the reaction of the B.J.P. to the results of the Uttar Pradesh election? Yesterday, they demanded the dismissal of the Government in Uttar Pradesh and which is nothing but an undemocratic and an unconstitutional demand. They are also showing total insensitiveness to our constitutional set up, to the federal structure in this country and whichever does not suit them, they are out to destroy it.

Therefore, Sir, we are in the midst of these twin dangers. A non-functioning anti-people Party is still clinging to power at the Centre and somebody thinks that he is now waiting in the wings to come into power at the Centre. It is daydreaming, I hope. Now here, Sir, we are trying to strive to forge an alternative in co-operation with other Left secular and democratic forces so that the people's interests are protected and advanced by routing both these forces of evil.

Sir, this third alternative will not only be an electoral alternative, we hope, but an alternative for radical transformation of the society which will emerge out of the mass struggles of all sections of the working people and of the society. Sir, I submit this should be the endeavour of all right thinking people of this country. Otherwise, we shall be overtaken by sinister, divisive forces and communal and fundamentalist elements.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, for over 47 years, this Congress Party, to the greatest detriment of the common people of this country has ruled India, and the result is for all to see.

More than half the people are still below the poverty line. More and more people are unemployed. Larger number of people are remaining illiterates. There is greater and greater strain on national unity and integrity and now there has been a total surrender to IMF and World Bank with whom the Government has compromised the nation's economic sovereignty.

Our former President Shri R. Venkataraman — nobody can question his patriotism, his vast knowledge and his long association with the Congress Party — has also been forced to say that the Congress (I) has given up its declared objectives

and has gone back on the promises of bringing poverty and exploitation to an end.

What we find today is the result of this Government's performance — so-called performance — is greater and greater accentuation of the rich and poor divide and benefiting only a handful of the people of this country and the rest of the people are condemned to continued privation and misery. Corruption has become institutionalised and now synonymous with the Congress Party.

The JPC Report still remains to be implemented. It is a unanimous report. I need not go through the details; everybody is aware and the modified ATR is nothing but an apology for so-called enforcement or implementation of the JPC Report. It required not only weeks and months but years to get rid of people from the Government, Ministers against whom unanimous findings had been made by the Committee representing all the sections of the House. But the Prime Minister did not choose to do so until it became too hot for him.

We are being told that an economic miracle has been created or brought about in this country. But what has been the bedrock of our policy and which should be the bedrock of policy of any self-respecting independent country, namely, the principle of self-reliance has been given a go-by or an indecent burial.

Today the industrial sickness is overtaking all so-called progress in the industrial field. Three hundred thousand or more units are sick and sickness does not depend on the location because people say that they are sick in West Bengal only. More units are sick in your State. I do not mind giving you that honour of belonging to the State which has the largest number of sick units.

The Bengal Potteries was almost an institution. I remember so many times we met so many Prime Ministers and everybody said that in their houses there was crockery manufactured by the Bengal Potteries. The Prime Minister remembered that in Hyderabad also he had it. But under the control, administration and ownership of the Government of India with a three-year record book — orders being full for three years — it was closed down, a lock was put without any notice to anybody and over 3,000 workers were on the street. When we went to court and obtained an injunction the Government of India, without any work being allotted to them, spent Rs. 26 crore by payment of idle wages. When the workers had been asking for work and the Tata Consultancy Services had given a report that Rs. 10 crore would be necessary to revive this unit, against Rs. 10 crore, Rs. 26 crore were paid as idle wages. Ultimately, our present Prime Minister has taken a decision that enough is enough and let us get rid of them finally. Rs. 17 crore were spent for giving them

their gratuity, provident fund, etc. So, Rs. 43 crore were spent against Rs. 10 crore. This is the policy of this Government. Mr. Scindia, I want you to make a note of this Bengal Pottery. Our Steel Minister gives an impression of steelier attitude and appearance also. But what is happening to one of the greatest industrial units in this country? With all the difficulties, it is making profit. The Government of India is unable to find Rs. 6,000 crore to revamp it. Thirty thousand people are totally uncertain about their future. One of our greatest units is in great danger of being totally closed down. Jessop, Bräithwaite, Burn Standard, how many shall I mention? All these are in the Central sector. They have been the finest industrial undertakings in this country. They are all owned and operated by the Government of India, but all of them are sick and no effort is being made to revive them. They are limping, until the BIFR puts them into oblivion. And this BIFR, we have all been saying since long time back—not that I am saying something new—as the Bureau of Industrial Funeral Rites! What is the role of this Bureau? What is the future of the workers there? What is their fault? What is the crime they have committed? What is this industrial policy which does not seek to revive them? What is the industrial policy which does not consider the fate of these workers? In this country, there is no social security. No alternative job and employment is available in this country. Then what do they do? Well, no answer is forthcoming. This sickness is not due to industrial relations problems either. The Reserve Bank of India has given its report saying that perhaps maximum in two per cent of the cases, there may have been some industrial problems, but mostly, it is a problem of management, problem of technology, problem of funds. Now, whose responsibility it is to do that? There are no answers. I remember, when this Government first came into office, probably their first product was to publish a booklet containing names of 43 industrial undertakings which were liable to be closed down. At last we have been challenging the correctness of their assessment and happily some of them, like Bengal Chemicals, have already been taken out of that list. We are proud of an undertaking like that. Acharia P.C. Ray had established it. Similarly, Bengal Immunity, Smith Stanistreet and Biecco Lawrie have already been taken out of that list of sick industries and they are all running well. With little input of capital, with little input of management, with little concern about their well-being, they have already turned around their corner and they are making profit.

The workers are not on the streets. I can tell you, everybody knows in this country that our working class has shown tremendous sense of responsibility in spite of great difficulties and problems. In many of the Units we have seen that when the workers have

realised that a little severance will keep in reviving and maintaining and continuing the undertaking, many of them have agreed — without much prodding either — so that an industrial undertaking remains. at least the major portion of the working class is continued with jobs. Unfortunately, we cannot expent this from this Government. The public sector in this country is being steadily dismantled with complete subservience to the World Trade Organisation under the GATT and the World Bank and the I.M.F. Today this country's economic sovereignty depends not on the efforts, not on the sweat and toil of the Indian workers or the Indian people but on the smile on the face of Mr. Camdessus or on the smile of Mr. Preston. This is the lot of this country today. They have become the arbiters of our fate, the arbiters of this country. If they are happy, then we survive!

We cannot accept that position. Here we have a section of the Opposition which has also been openly advocating the same policy. But to show its supposed difference, it has started recently to refer to Swadeshi more as a fig leaf than as a real difference in the policy.

In this context, we feel more amused when this humble self's name is taken as a great protagonist of this industrial policy. Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar, during his speech, referred to me and my Party on several occasions. I must deal with the deliberate misrepresentation of facts and of deliberate calumny on his part against me and my Party. He has suggested a new name for our Party. It is nothing but a deliberate insult and I strongly repudiate the insinuations which are wholly motivated. If renaming has to be done, I should have thought that the Congress should be renamed as 'Congress (Incapacitated)' or rather, it would be 'Congress (Vanishing)' ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI P.C. CHACKO (Trichur) : The C.P.M. has already vanished. ..*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur) : The renaming as I said would be more appropriate. He has suggested that in the likelihood of Dr. Manmohan Singh being sent on U.N. Assignment this humble self may be considered to be the Finance Minister of this country. I am not sure — it was not a compliment - but I am sure if I were the Finance Minister the the country would not have been in this mess. There would have been no declaration of war against the common people and working class of this country and the country's sovereignty would not have been compromised as it is today. But I would never be a Finance Miniter or any Minister of a servile Government as this ...*(Interruptions)* But you have thought of me. *(Interruptions)* My party represents the common and the struggling people of this country.

We represent the teeming millions; not the millionaires as Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar's party does. Sometimes I feel very amused, that when the Prime Minister, the Finance Minister and celebrated Members like Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar project that the Left Front Government is following the same policy.

Obviously, the intention is very clear. They want to gain some credibility. They want to show that their policies and programmes are also progressive. They want to gain credibility by referring to the Left Front Government in West Bengal as their supporter. They want to cash in on the charismatic ability and the mass support of the tallest Indian political leader, Shri Jyoti Basu and of the party which is based on a popular support.

West Bengal is not an independent State. We are not constitutionally permitted to have a separate economic and industrial policy of our own. We do not decide either the economic or the industrial policy of this country. We have no authority to decide our Export-Import policy, our banking policy, our credit policy, our currency policy and as to the structure of the customs and central excise duties. We cannot decide what will be the amount of money supply in the country. How can we have a separate independent industrial and economic policy, unless we are able to control that? Whatever is the industrial policy of the country, it is imposed on others. We have been in the forefront in opposing and in identifying anti-people aspects of this policy and I challenge anybody in this House to show that anything has been done in West Bengal during the last three years which is inconsistent with the stand taken by our Party as well as the policies and programmes of our Party.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, no other State in this country which has been victimised and discriminated against and denied her entitlements for decades together as my State has been. No other State in India was made to lose its locational advantage by the introduction of the freight equalisation policy. No State has openly been discriminated against and deprived of by the misuse of the licensing policy in this country as my State has been. As we believe in India's unity and balanced development, my Party had never objected to the freight equalisation policy or the licensing policy. This is because we believe in proper and planned development of the country. But when it was found that they were being continued for years and years together and were being used for the purpose of depriving and denying our legitimate rights not only of West Bengal but also of the entire eastern India and North-Eastern India, we have to raise our objection to that. West Bengal Assembly unanimously passed a resolution asking

the Central Government to withdraw the freight equalisation policy to which Mr. Mani Shanker Aiyer's party was a supporter. We had asked for withdrawal of the licensing policy - because what is the result of it today? If we think of the industrial map of India, possibly, you can hardly see such an unbalanced development in any country. Why is North-Eastern India shouting and clamouring in anguish today? What is their standard of living? What is their per capita income as compared to other parts of the country? What is the position in Assam, Orissa, Bihar and West Bengal?

West Bengal, at one time, was at the top of the industrial map of India. How were we made to lose that position? That was our natural position.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, the position is very clear today. Under the pressures of the IMF and the World Bank and not on the basis of the Resolution of the West Bengal Assembly that the licensing system has gone

Sir, kindly allow me; we have been abused so much that I have to answer them.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Your party has got 38 minutes only.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : But there are not many speakers.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR (Mayiladuturai) : I would plead that he be given the opportunity. We must hear the views of the alternative Finance Minister!

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : I want to speak about your Finance Minister's views.

What more examples of victimisation can we give? Haldia Petrochemical Project was formulated by the Left Front Government of West Bengal. It was sent to Delhi in 1978 for approval. It took only eleven years; then when Mr. Rajiv Gandhi wanted to lay the foundation-stone only just before the election, hoping it will help his party which did not, even then the licence did not come until the Janata Dal Government came here. Only a Letter of Intent was issued; otherwise, he could not go and lay the foundation-stone. Bokreshwar Thermal Power Project took twelve years to get the approval of the Central Electricity Authority. These are some of the instances which should go immediately to the Guinness' Book of World Records.

What is the investment made by the financial institutions of this country in eastern India? Mr. Panigrahi, so also in your Orissa State. What is the amount, what is the credit deposit ratio so far as different States in this country are concerned? Where is the balanced development in this country? Who was operating licensing procedure? Who were in

control of the banking operations in this country? Who could allow the investments to be made by the banks? They were selecting and the most important traditional industries were in West Bengal like engineering, jute, tea etc. But all the profits were being ploughed elsewhere. And I can name areas where industrialists were forced to invest just to make the powers that be happy without any infrastructural facilities. An industrialist knows that if he has to go to the Government for licence for setting up an industry, for import and export, for so many other benefits, to the banking institutions for finance, no industrialist will annoy the Government that is holding the levers of power and precisely that is what has happened. I can give instances, I can give the names of the industrialists who were asked not to invest there, who were persuaded by saying why are you going to West Bengal or Bihar or Orissa or Assam. And as I said, Assam is being thought up now because it has now become the domicile of Dr. Manmohan Singh. This is how you are going to run this country. And what has happened today? Now the licensing system has gone. As I said, it is not because we wanted it, not because a Resolution was passed by all Parties, but because the IMF wanted it, the World Bank dictated it. Therefore, the entrepreneurs do not have to come to Delhi for their approval and now they are clever people. They know which will be the best place for location of their industries. I tell them, 'you have become free now, decide for yourselves; look also at West Bengal'.

Sir, with humility, I must say that today West Bengal has the highest power generation in the country. We are, Sir, exporting power to Orissa, Bihar. We were jeered, we were taunted when there were problems of power generation. Now, we have increased the power generation because we have made investments there.

Parliament cannot function because power is not available in Delhi. My daughter in Greater Kailash. There also, load-shedding is there for three to four hours every day. But that does not come in the national news. Earlier, it used to come in national broadcast when we had power problem.

We are the highest rice producing State in the country. I am sure you will be happy over this as you believe in India's unity and integrity, although you are in wrong company! The annual rate of growth of foodgrains production has been the highest in West Bengal which is 5.9 per cent against the All India annual rate of growth of 2.8 per cent. The purchasing power of the rural people is the highest today in West Bengal. We have implemented land reforms and the people today are producing out of their own commitment and involvement. We have been getting a commission from the Government of India. Small-

scale industries are the highest in our State. In cottage industry, handloom sector and fish production, we have got prizes for the last eight years. We have made our investment in human resources. Female literacy has the highest growth rate in West Bengal. That is why, UNESCO has given us the prize. We have sincerely implemented panchayat system which you talk of now for public consumption. We have implemented it from 1978. We have not only a vibrant political administration but also a vibrant economy in our State. Now the entrepreneurs want to see where they can have their best return. All over India, everybody admits that the highest concentration of skilled labour is in West Bengal. I am not parochial, but I must try to meet these charges made on the floor of the Indian Parliament. They are trying to abuse our State which after years of discrimination and deprivation, is trying to come up in the industrial ladder of India because of her own merit and you are trying to abuse it and to belittle it. You are trying to insult the people of West Bengal for your narrow political purpose instead of applauding it.

I throw a challenge here in Parliament of India to prove in what way we have given up our principle of self-reliance. I am happy that I could enter into MOUs on my one visit to Singapore where your incompetent Ministers could not do it. All NRIs are investing in infrastructure development in my State. Shall I throw them away?

SHRI P.C. CHACKO : No.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Is Shri Chandan Basu a foreigner? That is why, you are facing such a problem.

Therefore, I throw a challenge here. The Government of West Bengal has set up a task force for reviving each and every sick industry including Central sick industry because the Government is not doing this and we cannot allow the unit to be closed down in my State. We are trying to find out means of how to do it. We are talking to the workers and the unions and the Government and, if necessary, we have to take the help of some of our entrepreneurs here. We have made it very clear that at this stage we cannot depend on old technology. Technology is developing. One paper industry in our State is in doldrums. It is 60 years' old concern. There has been no modernisation. It cannot run with 60 years' old machine. Now we are trying to get the help of modern technology and if some body comes with a modern technology here, we shall certainly welcome them. We are doing it.

15.00 hrs.

We cannot run a paper industry with sixty year-old machines, with old technology. We have not given

our Governmental help. The West Bengal Government has not rendered any help in setting up units for consumer durables—not for tomato ketchup, not for potato chips, not even for tantalised fried chicken. They are being allowed into India by you. We cannot stop them from entering India. The Government of West Bengal has not given any facilities to them. Then, you are saying: "Well, Coca Cola has gone to West Bengal, and, therefore, I am following your policy." How can I stop them? Can I beat them away? You are allowing them. What is the \$ 20 billion foreign exchange reserve? What is the percentage of Portfolio Investment? Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar has himself said that less than Rs. 10,000 crore is the FDI. When the balance is Portfolio Investment, are you able to do that? Is is our policy? Can we decided that policy? Can a State Government decide that policy? What you are not appreciating is this. Why should the people go to West Bengal to invest? It is because you have denied all the facilities, opportunities to them. You do not like West Bengal prosper industrially. This is the supposed crime of my Party and my Chief Minister! I am nobody. I am too humble for him. Therefore, on the floor of this House, I would like to say that this totally exposed Government is alienated from the people. I do not have to say that they are alienated from the people. The people of Maharashtra, the people of Gujarat, the people of Karnataka, the people of Andhra Pradesh, the people of Bihar have shown and every body has shown that you are totally alienated from the people. They have put you into the right position. You are waiting for the final funeral exercises. You are telling us about our national priorities. You are teaching us about our commitment to the principle of self-reliance. You are talking about one thing, that is, that we are supposedly surrendering the rights of the working-class. We have opposed the exit Policy. We are opposing it.

15.03 hrs. •

[Shrimati Malini Bhattacharya in the Chair]

Therefore, the time has come when this bluff must be curbed.

Sir, a foreign journalist, after the Budget presentation, rang me up saying: "I want to talk to you". I asked: "Why? I am not known to you". He said: " You are the only person whose name has been, apart from the obeisance to the Prime Minister, mentioned by Dr. Manmohan Singh, the Finance Minister". It is becoming a joke. Well, if you want to get the credit and get an image of progressivism, try to emulate us but not at the expense of this country.

Madam, what we have been saying is that we are not keen about providing our limited resources,

so far as the State Governments are concerned, for investment in service sector, nor in the Portfolio Investment. What we have been demanding is this? Whichever foreigner we are talking to for direct investment, which will expand the productive sectors of our economy, we want that the foreign investment should only be in the arenas of infrastructure and most modern technology which we want to have for the development of the country as a whole. The trouble is that some of them, some people here think West Bengal is not a part of India as if West Bengal's development will not be India's development. We do not look at that point of view. We consider that Maharashtra's development is our country's development. Recently, I have had the occasion of going abroad, not for my seeking, not on my knees because they invited us to find out what is happening in West Bengal. The Hanovar Fair is the largest industrial fair. They invited me to speak on West Bengal's potential.

And I took advantage of telling people that this is West Bengal. They invited the West Bengal Government to open a stall there. This is the recognition of the West Bengal's inherent strength, West Bengal's inherent merit. Why are you grudging about it?

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOUDHURY (Katwa) : They thought that West Bengal is in the West. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : That is why, I had to tell the Governor of the Reserve Bank a few weeks before that it was thought that the Eastern border of Maharashtra was the Eastern frontier of the country. That is why, this imbalance has been there in our economy. We want that everybody should feel happy. Every true Indian should feel happy that West Bengal industrially develops. What we are trying to do is not to surrender the way you are surrendering. We have not at all surrendered any of our principles or policies or the interests of the working class, or the interest of the common people by the reason of whatever investments we are having in our State. Today, when we were talking of the newsprint shortage, I had thought that everybody would feel happy. I say that on the 3rd of June next, our Chief Minister will lay the foundation stone of the most modern newsprint factory which is being set up by an NRI. I heard only chuckles as if a newsprint factory in West Bengal is something not wanted by us. We are going to have it whether you like it or not, Mr. Santosh Mohan Dev and Mr. Mani Shankar Aiyar.

Now the entrepreneurs are free to decide about it. They have been able to get rid of your shackles, albeit due to the World Bank's diktat. Now they are free entrepreneurs and they are clever people. They

know where they can work, where there is skilled labour, where there is power, where there is responsible trade unionism, where there is a stability to political administration. There is no musical chair in Chief Ministership. That is why, they are coming because of my inherent strength.

It is my great fortune that I have been able to render a very-very small, insignificant role in this along with all our colleagues and friends. Whatever you may do by abusing us or by trying to bracket me with your infamous Finance Minister, you cannot get the vote in this country—parlay in West Bengal.

There are several Members to speak from my Party. Therefore, I do not wish to take more time of the House. The time has come for the people to know that we cannot be sitting here like ducks to be subjected to all sorts of disgusting perorations.

That is why, this Government which is trying to take credit for its so-called brilliant economic policy and industrial policy, has brought this country to such a situation where our future is at stake. We shall go on fighting against this. We shall go on fighting against this anti-people policy. Now the people are ready to give their verdict and both this Government and this Opposition should go lock, stock and barrel. And the future is for the Left, progressive, democratic, secular party that is going to come.

With this, I oppose this Motion of Thanks.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF STEEL (SHRI SONTOSH MOHAN DEV) : Madam, I must congratulate him. It was a very good speech. Nobody is against him. He has done wonderfully well. This was his farewell speech because it is the decision of the Politbureau that no MP will be deputed for two terms. This is his last speech, therefore, he should speak further. This is the policy of the Politbureau. ...*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY (Allahabad) : Mr. Chairman, Madam, I am grateful to you for allowing me to speak. While expressing due regards to the Hon. President, I would like to say that we strongly oppose the Address delivered by him because listening to it, we felt that it was a pack of untruthfulness or a reverie or some official document making fun of the agonies of the poor, starving and hardworking people reeling under the burden of the new economic system. I fail to understand as to why the Hon. President is made to utter with such untruthfulness? The Government has presented a rosy picture of its faulty policies before the country through this Address and has attempted to earn laurels but such a picture neither stop the bewailing of starving children of the poor nor can this

untruthfulness presented in a flowery language make housewives cheerful who have been badly hit by the price rise nor can it bring any respite to the farmers working in their fields in the scorching heat. Though this pack of untruthfulness has attempted to hide the agonised cries of our countrymen who are victims of sheer chaos yet incidently this Address has not succeeded in it. It is just like trying to put an expensive silky carpet over filthy and marshy place and spraying perfume over it in an attempt to hide its existence, but after a while, perfume evaporates and then the foul smell starts emanating from it and the slime starts oozing out from all directions. Similarly, this official document has attempted to camouflage the plight of the people, chaos prevailing in the country and the country's downward trek towards economic slavery under the carpet of corruption and falsehood but even then, the Address has not succeeded in it. The whole country is aware of this and this is the reason why today every congressman has to face its voters' wrath ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI MANI SHANKER AIYAR : I would like to know whether the word 'untruthfulness' can be used here?

MR. CHAIRMAN : The word 'untruthfulness' is alright.

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY : No matter how many achievements of the Government have been highlighted and how details about economic reforms have been given in this Address, yet the painful shrieks of the hearts of the poor who have been hit by price-rise, tension, unemployment, etc., have pierced that bright picture. Today, the country as well as the Members of both the Houses are privy to it. The tentacles of economic slavery has shaken the entire country in the name of new economic reforms and that is why most of the public is losing faith in these leaders. One by one, the Congressmen are losing ground in Gujarat, Maharashtra, Karnataka, Bihar and other states. But they have not made any efforts to have an introspection to realise their mistakes. This Government is suffering from an intoxication of two kinds. First, they have a lust for power and secondly, a crave to indulge in corruption. In other words, a bad man is in a bad company. They are indulging in these malpractices with gay abandon. They do not see any need to dispense with such dissoluteness. Just like an inebriated person stumbles on, without bothering to see where he is going eventually collapses near a heap of garbage or a drain. By the time he comes round, he realizes what he has lost. The present Government is going through the same phase. They have become so much steeped in corruption and lust for power that they are completely oblivious of the bemoaning of the poor and the imminent assault on our

economic freedom. They do not have time to think that their tendency to indulge in corruption is pushing India towards ruin and destruction. The Address delivered by the Hon. President mentions one more thing that "the projections made have been fulfilled." If your projections include increase in the corruption in the country, the miserable condition of farmers, the starving of the poor children, the perpetration of atrocities on women, the exodus of youth from this country or their taking to anti-social or terrorist activities due to unemployment etc., then, please do not try to work towards realizing such projections ; reconsider your projections and try to put the country on the right path.

The Ayodhya issue has been taken up here in detail. I do not want to waste more time on it by going into the details but the reality remains that the Government have yet to resolve the Mandir-Masjid dispute. This is a very big political failure. The Mandir-Masjid issue has been smouldering and can any time turn into an inferno if neglected by the Hon. Prime Minister. We had a similar experience in the past which keeps warning us that any kind of negligence can lead to a large scale blood-shed. But it is being evaded, sometimes in the name of being subjudice and sometimes some other excuse is given. It is a very serious problem but its solution is being procrastinated. This Address does not mention any suggestion which would indicate as to how such issue would be resolved which is breeding communalism and polluting minds in the name of Mandir and Masjid. No efforts have been made to resolve it.

In regard to Kashmir, it is maintained that elections would be held by July but I would like to know what political process has been initiated there? It is mentioned time and again but have the Government prepared any political ground there? Have the efforts been made to take the local people in confidence? Whenever you talk of initiating a political process there, the militants activities get speeded up in that State and the external assistance gets increased. The local public is being sandwiched between the security forces and the militants. Have the efforts been made to ease their pain? The adoption of mere evasive tactics and maintaining silence cannot solve any problem. First of all, you should find ways and means to rid Kashmir of militancy but unfortunately the different Ministers are given these portfolios at short intervals and we find these Ministers at logger heads with each other creating such terror that the local public again finds itself insecure. The people who have been appointed to improve the situation are themselves embroiled in personal feuds. In such a situation, how then will they improve the circumstances in Kashmir? Today,

nobody is seriously thinking of solving the problems of that part of our country, which once was considered heaven on earth.

Nobody is making efforts to salvage it from terrorism. Serious attention is not being paid to the situation prevailing in Chrar-e-sharif. Are you blind to the fact that local residents will be scared and start fleeing once again? In such a situation, who will vote them and how the elections will be held? I urge upon you to convene an all-party leaders' meeting and considering it as a national problem, extirpate terrorism there and prepare ground for initiating a political process after winning the confidence of the local people. Then alone can elections be held there and self-confidence restored in the local residents.

Tall claims are made about the development of science and technology. There have, of course, been great achievements in this area. Our scientists deserve congratulations for this. Why is the actual money allocation made to this area being repeatedly reduced? This practice should be done away with if we have to compete in the race of the development of the world. On the one hand, the Government signs the GATT agreement and invite multinational Companies, investment in order to participate in the world competition and on the other hand they do not have adequate funds for science and technology—the basic foundation of development. The Government do not take steps for encouraging the scientists. They will come to know about the reality once they listen to their tale of plights. The scientists bring honour to the country by making new inventions and discoveries. Is it a matter to be ignored? The Hon. Prime Minister has no time for this. Our former Prime Ministers used to encourage the scientists. It is not proper to ignore them like that.

Time and again tall claims are made about the success of our economic policy and it is said that when the present Government took over, the foreign exchange reserve was for only two weeks. We agree that foreign exchange reserves have inflated. Repeated, claims are made about bringing down inflation from 10% to 7% and then from 7% to 6%. The Government talks in terms of percentage fluctuations. The Hon. Finance Minister should survey the market to ascertain the factual position of inflation. The price of a commodity once raised does never come down. He should see the people reeling under the pressure of price rise. He should ask a daily bread earner what inflation means to him. The number of loaves of bread has decreased in his dinner plate today. He has not tasted costly pulses for months together. Pulses have become a special dish meant for a change of taste occasionally. His children do not get vegetables and other nutritive

diet. If this is the improvement due to economic reforms, then under such a situation, how will the nation progress? The rate of inflation is not showing a downward trend. The Government is inviting the MNCs. It claims that it will give employment to the unemployed. There is the computer boom here. The MNCs are not willing to help us by entering into the production. They are only interested in our vast market potential for their trade. But we need employment opportunities for our unemployed people.

The Government talks of providing employment to the unemployed youth. What arrangements have been made for the purpose? It is retrenching the work force of sick industries. The MNCs are ravaging the small scale industries, handicraft industries and traditional crafts. On the one hand, the Government is not generating employment opportunities and on the other hand, it is retrenching these workers who are already employed. How will it help? How long will it dance to the tune of the foreign powers and the World Bank?

The foremost aim before the Government is to uphold the morale of the country's youth. This could be achieved by giving them employment and making arrangements for their proper education. We cannot strengthen the youth power unless their participation and contribution in the service of the country by utilising their calibre in the real sense is ensured.

Yesterday, Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar talked much about self-reliance in his speech. Where is the self-reliance discernible? They talk of fulfilling the dreams of Gandhiji and Dr. Ambedkar but I cannot understand how and in which manner is this being achieved. In order to provide employment to the people what employment opportunities are being generated and what type of job-oriented education is being imparted?

He has talked about making employment opportunities available through the Prime Minister's Rozgar Yojna and claimed to allocate Rs. one lakh or whatever funds are available under this Yojna for self-employment schemes. Has any youth been getting employment under this Yojna? Who will buy his indigenous made goods in comparison to the MNCs goods? Earlier the consumers used to buy, with respect, the indigenous handicrafts goods produced by our youth who were engaged in manufacturing of soaps, cream, earthenwares, sculptures, baskets, twines etc. but who will buy these goods once the MNCs take over. These items will not find any room in the market. How can, then, such people earn their livelihood? The Government claims that it has started giving assistance through the banks and provision for disbursement of loans

has also been made in the Prime Minister's Rozgar Yojna. It talks of equality but in Uttar Pradesh loan facilities are not extended to the unmarried girls. They have not been getting married due to their inability to give dowry or because they are physically handicapped. An announcement was made about this Yojna from the ramparts of Red Fort and they earned applause. Why do not they try to see its practical face? Nobody is going to benefit from these schemes unless they are practically enforced. Today it is very difficult to get a loan from a bank and the country's poor, illiterate farmers do not get an inkling of the fact that loans have been disbursed against their names to other persons or it has been grabbed by the bank employees themselves. The farmer comes to know about it only when his property is attached. This is why I said that unless corruption is eradicated and the schemes implemented in letter and spirit, these will remain buried in the files and will be seen on newspapers only. Further the real beneficiary in whose name the scheme is launched will nowhere be visible.

Corruption has become a sign of courtesy. There is corruption everywhere. One's work will be done smoothly and conveniently if one greases the palm of the concerned authorities with all humility. Otherwise the work will not be done notwithstanding the merit or need of the person. Therefore, I say that the Government cannot mitigate the sufferings of the poor unless these basic evils are removed, even if it blows its own trumpet with regard to these schemes. In order to mitigate the sufferings of the poor, we will have to go and see for ourselves the rural areas and apprehend the ground realities, meet the rural people and solve their problems as their sympathiser.

All the Public Sector Undertakings have been declared sick and referred to the BFIR. The operating agency of the BFIR gives the report and recommend that a particular sick industry can be revived. The sick industries submit their revival packages also but no assistance is given to them. 'Bharat Pumps and Compressors Ltd' and 'Triveni Structure Ltd' are internationally recognised industrial units. Their export items were received well abroad and this is why, despite being sick for two years, these have received the export orders of Rs. 2 crores. They don't have the working capital. In this connection, when we contact the Hon. Industries Minister, he says he is helpless because Manmohan Singhji does not recognise it. When contacted, Manmohan Singhji says that he does not keep any file pending with him and returns every file within 14 days. When we go to the Commerce Minister, he asks us to meet the Industries Minister. A strangely intricate system exists there where nobody is going to listen to one's complaints. We keep on moving from one Ministry to

another and later come to know that these companies are losing their existence. The scheme of voluntary retirement has been enforced. The workers are being retrenched forcibly. When the country's sick industries obtain export orders and the working capital is not given to them, then, they are forced to close down. The Government should reform this system. It is not ready to give the working capital to these industries because it cannot deviate from its faulty system. The sick industries have export orders in their hands and they are waiting for Government's assistance. By the time their revival package is implemented they will themselves become extinct as they will not be able to go in for production due to paucity of funds. Therefore, instead of helping them out the Government is letting them to die their own death. That sick industry is making efforts to stand on its own feet but the Government is trying to push it down with its negligent attitude.

Madam Chairperson, the management of the Unions and workers of these sick industries are making concerted efforts to revive these industries but the Government is least concerned because it has to work according to its old and hackneyed system. There will be a long queue of unemployed people once these companies are closed down. Allahabad is just one example but this is happening in the whole country, be it the indigenous cotton mill or any public undertaking. Therefore, we should be pragmatic and building castles in the air would not do. The Government has already lost a lot of ground and the structure of the dune on which it is standing upon can anytime fall apart. Before losing the whole ground, it should try to understand the problems of the people and take measures to save this country from the economic subservience, otherwise the whole country will turn its back on it, like the people of South and other parts. The Government is confined to this Parliament House only. Outside, they have no foothold among the people and yet they ignore it. During the previous elections they had asked for the popular vote on the basis of economic policies and the people rejected them.

There is rampant inflation with ever increasing prices. What relief are they going to give to the people. Our Hon. Minister of Agriculture makes tall claims about increase in crop production but the fact remains that the farmer is not getting the fertilizers at reasonable rates. His crop is destroyed by floods and the Centre says that it has sent the amount of assistance to the State Government. The latter says that it is short of funds and thus the farmer is not compensated for this loss. They claim themselves to be the saviours of the farmers. Why is not the Agriculture policy being implemented? Why is it not being considered if it is lying on the table. The farmers do not get loans on time. Seeds which he needs at the time of sowing season are made

available to him after four months. This is the way they are running the system.

Madam Chairperson, population control is the most important problem of this country. This is not discussed anywhere. The population increase counteracts our whole development. Corruption is, of course, a great problem but population increase is the primary problem. In the Question Hour today morning I noticed during a reply to a particular question, the Members of the treasury benches bursting into laughter. When the Government is not serious about such a serious issue, then it does not matter if it is not mentioned. In case of such an eventuality, the onus will be put on the women. They will be subjected to all kinds of population control experiments as if they are solely responsible for population explosion. There was no mention of population control. How can we control it when we cross one crore mark by 2000. The Government should have a clear mind about the fact that procrastination is no solution to a problem.

It was said that the health facilities will be extended to all. But in villages, doctors are not available in the hospitals and if there is one, there are no medicines. The patients die for want of medicines in villages which are not connected with the link roads. Doctors are not ready to offer their services in rural areas. Medical and hospital facilities are restricted to the official records alone. All the facilities are available to the elite class of the society and the real citizens of the country, the farmers are deprived of these. This is the root cause of all the evils. Contrary to the claims of eradication of malaria, it has taken the shape of a serious epidemic.

SHRI KRISHAN DUTT SULTANPURI (Shimla) : It has spread in Gujarat.

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY : Gujarat is very much a part of our country. It is this parochial attitude which is hindering a solution to the Kashmir problem. In a democracy, any party can form the Government. A responsible Member like him should not have talked like that. Programmes on nutritious diet are being run in villages. Very good schemes like Integrated Child Development and Anganwadi have been launched but only partially. Raw stirabout is distributed among the children in the name of nutritive diet but no fuel is provided to cook that. As a result, the stirabout gets decomposed and degenerated in the Anganwadi Centre itself. Another item of nutrition, some American 'Panjiri' meant to be given to the children either becomes a feed for the cattle or is sold in the market and the trader earns money by preparing sweets out of that as there are no arrangements for storage and maintenance of 'Panjiri' in Anganwadi centres. How will our posterity contribute to national development and become healthy citizens of the country if we do not take care of their childhood?

Under Integrated Child Development scheme, polio and tetanus vaccines are administered in the villages. All are aware that these vaccines need to be placed under a specified temperature but no refrigerators are made available therefor. As a result, the vaccines are rendered ineffective by degeneration and when there are administered, their effect is found adverse which sometimes claims the lives of many innocent children.

Tall slogans of 'Education for all' are raised but there are no schools in every village. The funds earmarked for development should be diverted to the villages so that the real citizens of the country can benefit.

The Hon. Members will be shocked once I start narrating the story of atrocities perpetrated on the women.

Whenever a woman becomes the victim of any atrocity. The Government pays Rs. 50 thousand as cost of her modesty. Today the poor female workers tie their infant with a cot or a tree and then go for their work. They work even in the advance stage of pregnancy. Sometimes they give birth to their new child on the roadsides. After two or three hours of the delivery they resume their work because if they do not do so their children and their families will face starvation. But the Government makes here tall claims that it has done so much for the welfare of women. The Government claims that it has provided maternity facility and other facilities for them. But this is all on papers only. The rich people have laid down carpets and costly tiles in their bathrooms. I do not have any objection to that, but what I would like to ask is as to why there is no arrangement of providing even a curtain for the women in urban slum areas and rural areas. There is no arrangement of any Sulabh Souchalaya for them. Even today the women living in slum-clusters have to wait till the day light is over to ease themselves. They ease themselves on the road sides in the night and they have to hide their faces whenever any vehicle passes through the road. Their sordid tale does not end there. The municipal authorities take away them if they are found easing themselves on the road sides or on the ground. Is it the Women Development Programme of the Government?

The anti-dowry Act was enacted, but even today girls are being burnt to death for a petty amount. A women's Commission was also appointed but this Commission has also become the victim of highhandedness of the Government. Why it has not been given full power, so that it may do something concrete for the welfare of women? A World Conference on Women is going to be held in Beijing. Even today the women workers give birth to their

children on road sides and there is no facility for their bath and toilet in our country. What we will tell there?

When poor women fail to earn their bread, they resort to flesh-trade. When a needy woman goes to a capitalist for job, she is not given any work to do rather she uses her body for the advertisement of his products and sells them at high prices. The farmers work round the clock in their fields. The poor women work round the clock in textile mills and in building construction, but they do not have any clothes to wear or house to live in. This is the situation of our country. If a country like ours lives in villages, its citizens must be given their fundamental rights. 48 years have passed since the Independence. High Sounding Declarations are made during elections only. There is nothing new in it.

Many programmes have been formulated for the women. The Mahila Samridhi Yojana is reported to have been launched. We have been provided very fascinating figures. But we do not know as to where the Mahila Samridhi Yojana is being implemented. We visit villages very frequently, yet we do not know as to where it has been implemented. The National Women Funds have been set up to provide loan to women collectively. But I do not know as to where this scheme is being implemented. When we tried to know about it, we were told that this scheme is going on in full swing. But it is not known as to where it is being implemented.

The Government has provided reservation facility and made good announcement for the development of minorities. But so far as I know no Budget has been provided for the Minority Commission. Mere announcement has been made. Similar is the condition of our weavers. There is no improvement in their condition. They are on the verge of starvation. The Government does not have time to look into their pitiable condition. Child labours are being exploited. Even six or seven year old children are working in carpet industry and in some other industry. If they are removed from their job, their family will starve. This is the irony of this country.

Madam, Chairman, it is very unfortunate that a six year old boy is the bread earner of a family. Once I visited a place and asked a small boy working there as to what would he do with the money he earns. He replied that his father was sick and his mother had gone out in search of work but she did not get any job. He added that he would buy medicine for his father and meet household expenses. This is the picture of the childhood of our country. I do not know whether the Government is moved by it or not but I am really moved. I would like to know from the Government whether the gap between the rich and the poor will be bridged or not,

whether there will be any decline in the cases of atrocities committed on women or not and whether women will get equal rights with men or not?

Madam Chairman, despite being a fascinating document I cannot support the President's Address. Many misleading and baseless statements have been made in this Address. I would like to tell the Government that such misleading statements will not be able to create any good impression about the Government. The Government should introspect and try to understand as to where it has done wrong. The poor and downtrodden are being neglected. If the Government does not realise its wrong-doings in time, the people will through it out. The common people of this country will ask for an explanation from the Government because it is leading the country towards an economic slavery. This country has got independence after great sacrifices and it is, now struggling for the development. Today the people are rejecting this Government but the Government is trying to save itself through horse-trading. But the present Government cannot rule the people of the country like this for a long time. Therefore, it should give up its illusive reforms and think about the welfare of the people.

It should come out of the clutches of inflation, the World Bank and the IMF only then this country will make progress and the farmers, women and youths will have a smile on their faces. The Government should rise above the political consideration and think about unrest and terrorism prevailing in the country. I would like to urge upon the BJP members that they should not try to divide the country on the basis of religion. The issue of temple and mosque is not above the human beings. The explosives it has amassed are not in the interest of the country.

(Interruptions)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : It is wrong. An Hon. member is speaking and you are interrupting her. Please let her speak.

SHRIMATI SAROJ DUBEY : Madam Chairman, I would like to submit that this country is the biggest temple and all the citizens of mother India are its worshippers. You should not try to create hatred among the people. We have the freedom of religion in our country. Let all religious sects practise their own religions freely. Then alone the country can prosper and become strong. Therefore, let the farmers and the poor have a smile on their faces only then this country can make progress.

With these words I express my respect to the Hon. President but oppose his Address.

[English]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Midnapore) : Madam Chairperson, I must congratulate Shrimati Saroj Dubey for her speech. She has brought out very vividly some aspects, some grassroot aspects I should say, of the condition of the poor people in our country especially in the rural areas and of the women. In my opinion, we are living basically in an anti-feminist society.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Thank you, Sir.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : It is not due primarily to the New Economic Policy of the Finance Minister. It is a social problem, which has been there long before Shri Manmohan Singh appeared on the scene and will continue, I am afraid, for a long time to come. Still I am hopeful, though I may not live to see it, that under the new Panchyati Raj system, when it really gets firmly established and starts working everywhere, the provision for one-third of all the Panchayat posts and seats to be occupied by women, which I welcome very much, will bring about what might be almost a revolutionary change in our society. Otherwise you heard just now what a pathetic condition the poor women in this country are living now. If they are able to get into the Panchayats in large numbers which, I know, is being resisted by men as far as possible they would not like it to happen—then they may be able gradually to assert themselves. I remember Choudhury Charan Singh in this House, in several speeches he made, he was not a man with whose philosophy or politics I agree entirely, but one point he went on repeating several times that 'you spend so many crores of rupees on so many big projects and plans, can't you at least at least arrange that in every village there will be one place which will be screened off or fenced off where the women of our villages can go and relieve themselves in private without having to squat on the roadside, that too having to wait till the day light hours are over?' She is quite right. This is the most humiliating and a disgraceful thing. After all these years we are not able to provide even that.

Anyway, Madam, this Address of the Rashtrapatiji, for whom personally I have the highest regard, was delivered on the 13th of February. Today is the 26th of April when this Motion of Thanks to the President's Address has at last been delivered here by my friend Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar. So, the President, who is a poor person I should say, has very little to do with all the stuff that is written here. This is meant to be every year a compendium of achievements on which the Government would like to congratulate itself. But this year particularly because as it happens, by February the 13th, when this Address was delivered, all the results of the Assembly elections were also not known, they came a bit later on.

And, perhaps, if the date of the Address had been later, it would have had to take account of the fact that the biggest single factor which has emerged from these elections is the debacle of the Congress Party in State after State. I think, now they are out of power in 11 States in this country. There is no Congress Ministry left there. But that is not the main point. The point is why this has happened. What are the two or three main factors which led the people in such large numbers to vote against this Congress Party? And I think it is much more than their understanding of the intricacies of this new economic policy which are not intelligible to very many people in this country who are not very well educated and who do not know very much about economics and to whom all these things about, all these intricate international financial doings and all that do not mean very much. But what does mean everything to them is the question of inflation which has reached unmanageable proportions not only for the poorer people but for even ordinary middle-class people finding it impossible to survive now. There is no such thing as food security left in this country. There was a time even under the British rule when we used to say that if the poor people were deprived of everything, at least, they would have their *dal roti*.

[Translation]

They will have their dal roti.

[English]

In my part of the world, we say, *dal bhatt*. *Dal and roti* will be there always. That was the standard item which was available. Now you cannot buy *dal* for the love of Mike. Any ordinary *dal* costs Rs. 26, Rs. 28, Rs. 30, at least a kilo. How are the poor people to survive? How are the ordinary middle-class people to survive? I do not mention edible oil. I do not mention sugar. I do not mention all these other essential foodstuff commodities. The price of wheat and rice, the issue price from the Public Distribution System in many parts of the country has almost reached parity with the open market price. What is being sold through the PDS, Public Distribution System, apart from its very poor quality is hardly cheaper than what is available outside in the open market. I am not going to quote now. I got figures with me from the replies to the Questions given here. The offtake from the Public Distribution System is going down rapidly. People cannot afford to buy. The per capita consumption is going down. On the other hand, like a paradox, enormous stocks of these foodgrains are lying undisposed with the Food Corporation of India. They do not know what to do with all these stocks. Some 30 million tonnes of food is lying there unsold, undisposed of and the poorer people cannot afford to buy from the ration

shops. Is this not a serious crisis of food security? But is there any inkling of slightest hint or inkling of it in this recital of Government achievements? So inflation, unemployment, corruption—tremendous corruption—I think it is because of these factors that conditions of a near split have come in the Congress Party. It is not what I will say. The Congress Party is fighting over this. What has led to your defeat? That should be discussed, Let it, at least, be analyzed. Let it be discussed as to what are the factors which led to this terrific set back in the elections. Is there anything wrong in demanding that; if any member of the Congress Party says " Let there be an open discussion as to what were the factors responsible for our defeat." For that, why should somebody be frowned upon or victimized? Any way, I am saying that this so-called Address causes so much diverse from reality. There is no question of discussing it in such details as some Hon. Members are taking the trouble to do. At least, I do not propose to do it.

16.00 hrs.

It is no use and there has been a sad decline in parliamentary standards, I am afraid. Please do not take offence, if I say so. I have spoken about it in other places also. I have been here for a pretty long time. I can see the decline, the obvious decline in parliamentary norms and standards. The biggest example of this is here in this House. Look at the rows and rows of empty benches. We are discussing the President's Address at four o'clock which is supposed to be the peak hour and this is the condition of the House!

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA (Madhubani) : There is a whip to be absent now but to be present when the Motion is put to vote.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Look at the condition outside in the Central Hall compared with this and the same thing happens when we are discussing the Budget. It is the same thing when any major policy decision or policy discussion takes place. Nobody is interested and this is being shown on the TV to people outside.

SHRI INDER JIT (Darjeeling) : I think that it is not being shown live today; I hope, it is not.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : I hope, it is not being shown. What will happen to the credibility of this institution, please tell me. I think the Hon. Speaker in all good faith thought that by taking the televised picture of what goes on here into the homes of people, they would be much more impressed and they would think that it is a great institution. But looking at some of the scenes they must be seeing on the TV it will make anybody's hair turn!

Anyway, there has been a decline and a sad decline. I always felt that this parliamentary institution in a huge country like ours with so many different sectors, different languages, different cultures, different ethnic groups, different religions and all that, the biggest safety valve is this democratically elected Parliament in India, which gives everybody from the most backward areas, the tribal areas, the border areas, the undeveloped areas, a backward areas, forum where they can come and speak openly, vent their feelings, make their suggestions and criticise and all. But if this institution is going to lose its credibility, we are all determined to commit collective suicide. If we want to commit collective suicide then we cannot blame anybody else for it. Now everybody is worried about what is going to happen next year. Everybody is talking about it.

You cannot manage the Centre like you can manage a State. In a State you can have some coalition if you like to call it so, of various parties or you can have some regional party coming to power and then being replaced by somebody else and so on, intermittently you can have periods of President's rule. But you cannot do it here. There has to be a Government in office at the centre always. That is the Constitution of the country. You cannot have President's rule here and if you think in terms of coalitions for the Centre many people immediately pooh-pooh it saying that coalitions are no good because they will not last, they are not stable, they will collapse after a while.

So, if we are interested in saving this institution and also avoiding this collective suicide towards which we seem to be reaching headlong, I would humbly suggest that we get down to some serious thinking and serious discussion. I cannot spell out anything. It is too premature. I cannot think of what may happen one year hence. Some way will have to be found. Some golden mean will have to be found. But we will have to stand, at least try to stand, those people who are willing to stand together on certain basic fundamental principles and values and certain pluralistic values without which this country cannot survive.

It has to be pluralistic, with certain basic secular principles, because these are all under attack now. But they are mentioned very cursorily in the President's Address. I am not referring only to communal disturbances or riots, or demolition of the Babri Masjid, or threats to demolish some other place now but I am talking about the philosophy, the doctrine which challenges the whole idea of national unity, which challenges the whole idea of a pluralistic society, a composite culture, which is what this country has inherited from the past, which is its historical past and without which this country will not

survive as one entity. There are forces challenging all this now. They have to be rebuffed. They have to be rebutted. But they can only be rebutted and rebuffed by people who have firm conviction and faith in these basic values.

I only want to say a few things about one issue mainly. I am not going into the economic policies and all that. When the New Economic Policy started, there was a big discussion going on saying, all right, if foreign capital has to be allowed to come in, let us at least discuss what kind of position they will be given and whether or not, and in what kind of position they will be given and whether or not, and in what sectors or where, they should be allowed to have majority equity participation, etc. All these things have become quite unrealistic now. This morning I was reading in the newspapers that yesterday the Finance Minister had declared somewhere that if the American companies want a hundred per cent equity, it would be welcome. It is hundred per cent equity, not fifty-one per cent. If any American company wants hundred per cent equity, we shall welcome it. This is in black and white in all the newspapers today. He said this when he was speaking yesterday before some American delegation which was visiting our country. So, what is there to argue about? If we are prepared to sell out our whole company and industry and everything and give foreigners hundred per cent equity participation, well, we might as well fold up and go home. The front gate number one can be locked up. Why should we sit here? And my friends here go about saying that basically they support this economic policy of Mr. Narasimha Rao. Sometimes they talk about *Swadeshi*, sometimes they say that basically they support liberalisation, privatisation and all these basic tenets of this economic policy. Anyway, I am sure, they also support this idea of disinvestment of shares in the public sector undertakings which is going on. Thousands of crores of rupees of Government investment in public sector undertakings are being disinvested now. It is one of the forms of privatisation. But where is that money, which is coming out from the public sector undertakings, going? If it was used in order to further improve the functioning, production, working and all that of our industries, I could understand it; but it is not. It is being taken into the budget in order to make up the deficit of Manmohan Singh's Budget with this money. What is this? This is suicide.

I took the trouble of looking through the President's Addresses made in 1991, 1992, 1993 and 1994—they are all available here—to see that over these years what has been said every time regarding the problem of Kashmir.

I find from what is there that really one gets the impression that they are not serious; the Government is not at all serious about the problem of Kashmir.

On the contrary it is we who feel that it is the most grievous problem which we are facing. It is a wound in the body of India. It is a bleeding wound. I do not know how much blood we are going to give more. Thousands of precious lives, both of civilians — who are our own people; they are not foreigners; Kashmiri people are our own brothers and sisters—and also of security forces, Jawans haven been lost and continued to be lost while this bleeding goes on. You see that there is nothing in this President's Address over the last so many years which shows any sign of our concern about this except to go on repeating every year that, of course, the villain of the piece is Pakistan. Of course, it is true. We agree with that, that Pakistan is aiding and abetting and giving them arms and giving them training and encouraging the terrorists and all that. This is a fact. You see that they never forget to mention that part of it in these President's Addresses. But how are we going to deal with in our own territory, in our own country, with our own people who have been brought into confrontation with the security forces? Or let me put it the other way. Our security forces are being brought into confrontation with the civilian population. It is not a good thing. It is not good for our armed forces also. It is not their job. Their job is to defend our borders. But if every time they are brought into confrontation with the civilian population on the grounds of internal security duties, law and order duties and for carrying out house-to-house searches and interrogation and for all things, it is the worst possible thing for the discipline of our security forces. So many things are happening. Sometimes exaggerated reports may be there. But some things are happening about which the whole world is being informed, to our detriment. Human rights are being violated. All sorts of international bodies and organisations and others are out for our blood saying: 'your fellows there are ill-treating people in this way shooting people, killing people and raping women etc. etc.'

Much money is being spent. Madam, you must also be receiving these beautifully printed and bound volumes from Amnesty International sent from England with all reports and it is supposed to be fully corroborated with dates and names of religious figures and everything. It makes your blood run cold if you read all these things.

Our armed forces, as soon as possible, should be put back on what is their original job and they should not be continually brought into confrontation with civilians. It is not their job. These things are bound to happen if that is allowed to continue and there will be nothing left of the discipline of our Jawans apart from whatever suffering is being caused to the people.

Now I would like to say one more thing. I am told that in July — the Law Minister can tell us the exact date — the present period of President's rule is going to expire. It is coming out every day in the papers. I think it is 17th July. Parliament will not be in session, my friend. And you have to decide at that time whether you are going to go in for another bout of President's rule — for which this time a Motion in the House will not suffice; you will have to amend the Constitution; otherwise you cannot extend the President's rule further—or you will go in for something else which already the Government is everyday hinting that very broadly : this time we are going to go in for elections.

For the first time, in this year's Address of the President, it is said that 'the objective of revival of the democratic process is being pursued, the delimitation of constituencies is being done, the work of revision of the voters' list has been taken up by the Election Commission.' And the Chief Election Commissioner was reported a few days ago as also saying that 'yes, I am preparing for elections in Kashmir and they will have to be held as soon as possible.'

And then the new thing here is, it is very significant, a separate Department of Jammu and Kashmir Affairs has been set up under the Prime Minister. Before this, we had a Home Minister or two Home Ministers supposed to be looking after Jammu and Kashmir. That did not work out. Now, the whole thing has been put on Narasimha Rao's plate and I want to ask as to what is the improvement that has taken place after that. I would like to know about that. We expect that when the Prime Minister himself has taken charge of Jammu and Kashmir, then very top priority, importance is being given to this matter and it must be given.

I am not enamored of this President's rule at all. How many times, four times or five times, have we extended it or applied it? It has not produced any results; it is totally counter-productive and nothing has improved. Each time, we are told that this time there will be big improvement. The people are being made more hostile. They are getting more alienated and violence continues. Only the other day, on Republic Day, the poor Governor was almost blown up. What kind of security have we got on which we are spending crores of rupees? The dais from which the Governor was to stand and deliver his speech or take the salute or something, that dais was blown up by high explosive bombs planted underneath it. What kind of security arrangements have we got? Do you think that people have any faith in these things? Then you say, 'no, this may have been an inside job; somebody or the other who got into the security mechanism must have planted these explosives

there.' Anyway, General Krishna Rao had a very narrow escape. And everyday something is happening. In today's paper, Mr. Bhardwaj takes the trouble to read the paper, it was reported that yesterday there was a complete strike paralysing all Government offices and Government work in the Valley because a few employees have been accused or arrested for being in league with the insurgents, and the entire body of Government employees went on strike in protest. The whole administration was paralysed. So, when you say the conditions are returning to normalcy and all that, who is going to believe it? Can you hold elections in Kashmir without those Government employees? Where will you get all your polling officers and returning officers and all these people? Will all of them have to be sent from the rest of India? Who will man your election booths, your polling stations and all that? So, you talk glibly all the time that we must have elections every soon. I would welcome the elections if they will be held in such a way that the majority of people will participate in those elections. If they do not participate, if the majority of the people boycott those elections, it would be a farce, we will all be made to look fools. So, I am not saying that please enforce President's rule again after July. I am not in favour of it. If you are serious about the elections, then some groundwork has to be done, some preparatory measures have to be taken in all seriousness so that people there who are your voters will have some minimum feeling of confidence. Their whole experience of elections, except in 1977, is that the elections were completely rigged elections. Now, I am asking whether the Government of India and all the major political parties would be jointly prepared to give a public guarantee to the people of Kashmir that if elections are held and when they are held there will be no rigging; there will be free and fair elections.

We should take the responsibility to see to it. I do not know whether we can actually implement it or not. But at least publicly we should make commitment like that. Can we do it?

Secondly, you have got to talk to people. One of the main criticisms against the present Governor is that he does not meet people and does not talk to them. Many new forces have emerged in the Valley. If you want to go on clinging to one Shri Farooq Abdulla, I have nothing against it. He is a friend of mine. But do you think there is nobody else in the Valley, no other force? They have many people now, younger people, all popular people who have come up, who were on the side of the insurgents in the beginning, who were in the Jammu and Kashmir liberation force and who were part of the Hurriyat. But they have changed completely now. They have

been released from jail. They are now openly saying that this problem cannot be solved by the gun. It has to be solved at the negotiating table by proper discussions. When they came out of jail, they were given huge public receptions, more than Farooq Abdulla can hope to get now. I am talking of the Shabir Shahs and Yasin Maliks and all these people. They have been in Delhi recently for several days trying to meet people and talk to people and I ask the Home Minister 'Have you taken the trouble of talking to them?' At least talk to them and find out what they want and how you can try to meet them halfway. I could somewhat gather that he did not bother to meet them at all.

If we go on like this, we will be in serious difficulties in the month of July because I find the President's rule will have completed its period. You will not be able to renew it without the constitutional amendment. Parliament will not be in session. Now you are talking about going for elections. Well, if it is possible to have elections by which the people there can freely choose their own representatives, both for the State legislature there and for the Lok Sabha here, I would welcome it personally. But how do you ensure that they will take part in these elections? Elections would be a big political game for us also as against Pakistan and as against certain foreign forces who are always saying that India does not have the courage or the honesty to take the opinion of the people of the Valley. We should show that 'No. We are prepared for it. We do not depend only on the army and the gun.'

We have been forced into a position of fighting a war which has been conducted by Pakistan, a proxy war against Mujahiddin, against the ISI of Pakistan, against the American supplies of arms and Mujahiddin who are no longer only Pakistanis but mercenaries who have been brought from other parts of the world including the veterans of the Afghan war and people from Saudi Arabia and Turkey and all that. If this goes on increasing, we will be in considerable difficulties.

What I want to say is that national interests, in my opinion, do demand that electoral process should be initiated and the Kashmiri people should be permitted freely to choose their own representatives. But first you have to create a climate of confidence. Without that, if we go in for elections, the result may be quite disastrous.

Some erosion has taken place in Article 370. Of course, these friends here are totally against Article 370. They want it to be abrogated. We think Article 370 is a bridge which connected Kashmir with India. Without that bridge, they never could have been brought into India. But if you study the Constitution

now, you will find that the position of Article 370 has been very much eroded over the years, and eroded particularly by the application of Article 249. The Law Minister should tell us whether Article 249, as interpreted by the Government, and Article 370 can co-exist. Can both of them co-exist? Is there not inevitably an erosion of Article 370? This is what the Kashmiris feel. Even Dr. Farooq Abdullah goes on shouting about it all the time. So, something has to be done about this. We have to sit round the table. These things cannot be decided by guns and bullets. We have to sit round the table coolly, dispassionately and try to come to an understanding as to how we can undo this erosion which has taken place.

Secondly, as I said, the Government and the major Parties should give jointly a guarantee to the people that elections will not be rigged, they will be free and fair.

Thirdly, you will have to agree to some amount of autonomy being given to Jammu and Kashmir. How much autonomy, what autonomy, how it is to be defined, I cannot say anything here. We have to reach some consensus on this by sitting round a table and talking about it. Some time ago, the Prime Minister told us that he was going to call a meeting of all the Parties, not only these Parties but also the political Parties which are there, functioning in the State plus the Parties which are here at the Central level for consultation, for discussion. But I do not find that anything has happened uptill now. So, conditions have to be created—also these Kashmiri Pandits have been driven out of the Valley or have run away from the Valley—in which they feel confident enough to return to their homes. Otherwise, a very dangerous doctrine is being established, namely, that Hindus and Muslims cannot live together in Kashmir. Hindus are out. Some Muslims are out also. But a theory is being propagated that Hindus and Muslims cannot live together in Kashmir. It is a dangerous doctrine. Everybody knows that there is a thing called Kashmiriath. Kashmiriath is a common culture and the consciousness of the Kashmiri people - Hindu or Muslim, does not matter. That Kashmiriath is being destroyed systematically.

THE MINISTER OF CIVIL SUPPLIES, CONSUMER AFFAIRS AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI BUTA SINGH) : There are Buddhists also.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Of course, Buddhists are there. So, the people of Ladak, the people of Jammu, the people of the Valley are all our brothers and sisters. Who are they? They are not foreigners. We cannot go on just shooting and killing them all the time. Therefore, I would suggest humbly that one of the biggest deficiencies of this President's Address

at such a crucial, critical moment is the total absence of any serious discussion on the problem of Kashmir or reference of any kind of a way of finding a solution. So, I would really suggest that the Government should tell us something. The Prime Minister is directly in charge now and he is going to reply to this discussion, I suppose. We expect to hear something from him which is not something which may give us some satisfaction but which will send some signal to the people there in that Valley. What signal is to be sent to them? Is it like : 'No, again we are going to either have rigged elections or we are going to keep the Army there to sit on your heads?' This is no signal to send, we do not want Pakistan to get mileage out of this and we do not want these so-called Human Rights Bodies all over the world to go on clamouring and shouting against India.

We have to do something positive about it; we have to take some initiative. That is the stand of my Party. That is what we have discussed. We feel very strongly about it. I do not want to take more time of the House. I dwell mainly on this issue. There are so many other issues. Naturally you do not expect me to vote in support of this Motion of Thanks. We cannot do that because it is most disappointing and a frustrating thing. It does not reflect the reality in the country at all. Therefore, we will have to oppose it. But the poor President for whom I feel very sorry because he had delivered this Address two and a half months ago. He is not to be blamed in any way. I have great honour and respect for him. This is all I wish to say at this moment.

[Translation]

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV (Azamgarh) : Madam Chairman, I agree with the Hon. Members that the Presidents' Address does not reflect the ground realities of today. It seems that the Government is not able to muster enough courage to face the reality and it tries to keep the people under an illusion.

The President's Address has become more important this year because the country is going to complete about 50 years of its Independence. A sensible nation or a sincere Government would definitely like to ask as to why the problems of the country have not been solved in such a long period? What is the reason that the poorest people of the world, the largest number of unemployed persons, uneducated and diseased persons are living in our country? Even then no attention is being paid towards them. The Government should have pondered over it as to where we are heading towards. Why there is a feeling of revolt in the minds of the people of Kashmir and why a feeling of resentment is growing in all North Eastern States? Why there is an apprehension among the people of this country that

we are heading towards a political instability? Why the people of this country are visualising a serious threat to the economic sovereignty of our country. An attempt is being made to leave the poor people of the country at the mercy of Multi National Companies. Does the Government try to think over it with cool mind? The failure of the Government is not on one front but it is rather on all fronts.

Why our social life, economic life, political life and cultural life are in danger? Why our national unity is in danger? The leaders of the ruling party have stereotyped statement that the country is facing the threat of communalism and casteism. But who is responsible for all this? Have you ever thought over such problem as to why communal forces are gaining grounds? I know very well about the danger of casteism. The leaders of the ruling party term the struggle for social justice, public awakening and social change as casteist danger.

They do not understand that the poor people of this country have been exploited and insulted a lot for thousands of years. They do not have land and wealth. They do not enjoy any respect in the society. They were earning hands of the society, but they were made untouchables in the society. Today the democracy has provided an opportunity for them. They are struggling for their self-respect, equality and rights. Today they are raising their voice against humiliation faced by them and it is being termed as casteism. Madam Chairman, I also have been in the Congress Party. But I have come to the conclusion that a strong Congress Party becomes anti-poor and the weak Congress Party becomes directionless. During this period of 50 years they have got the votes of the poor and established the rule of the rich. The feeling of revolt among such people should not be termed as casteist. You should think over the issue of Mandal Commission and reservation with cool mind. The first amendment introduced by the first Prime Minister of India Shri Jawahar Lal Nehru himself was also about reservation. The Supreme Court had given a judgement that the reservation was against the Fundamental Rights of our Constitution. It was strongly protested by the people. They said that the reservation facility given by the Britishers was being withdrawn in independent India. The Government of your Party remained sitting idle for 40 years and continued to neglect the reports of various commissions. So, the Government of your Party did not awake until the people resorted to revolt and threw you out of power. During the period of last 40 or 42 years the Government has not paid its attention towards the downtrodden, backwards and the minority people. Had it paid its attention to them, the poverty and the unemployment would have not increased to this dimension. Shri Mani Shankar

Aiyar may state that the price hike is a universal phenomenon. But I would like to submit that alongwith the hike in prices the income of the people in other countries is also increasing. Our per capita income is not even 400 dollars per annum. Where do you want to lead this country? You are not serious on all these issues. You do not want to formulate any policy, programme or fix any direction in this regard. The President's Address seems to be a beaten path. The Government prepares the draft of the Address and it is just read out. The President's Address does not reflect the Government's policies, and its views on national problems. It is totally directionless. I would like to submit that even after such a long period of Independence, the clutches of the vested interest are becoming more and more tight in our society. The grip of the vested interests is not loosening. A mutinous feeling is emerging. It is a good thing. The Government says time and again that the country is in a crisis and a national consensus is needed. A national consensus can be obtained on the question of the country's security. You try to obtain a national consensus but it proves to be a mere gimmick. We have been talking of a national consensus on the Kashmir issue for quite a long time. Meetings are held. Then the Government maintain a long silence. No action is taken. Several meetings have been held to decide on electoral reforms, several assurances have also been given in the House and efforts have been made to obtain a national consensus but the Government has kept on maintaining a silence. Four meetings were held on Patents Bill. We gave a unanimous suggestion to refer the amendments to the parliamentary committee and let the people suggest amendments. You can consider them. We told that it would be considered in this Session only in a few days but nothing materialised. The term 'national consensus' just turned into a force. The Government is not serious. They are not in favour of obtaining a national consensus and do not make any efforts for that. Only a gimmick is resorted to. If you want a national consensus on questions on which we differ on basic principles, then, we are not ready to have a discussion on that too. But would you like to have a national consensus on new economic policy? There can be no national consensus on that.

Mani Shankarji, I would like to say it to you since you have moved the Motion of Thanks on the Address of the President. I would like to quote something that was said by Gandhiji in 1933. He was a far-sighted leader. We call him 'Father of Nation' but he was a 'Man of the Age'. He had experienced dangers and had observed everything around him. He had expressed his views on our economic policies. I quote:

[English]

"America was the most industrialised country in the world and yet it had not banished poverty and degradation. That was because, it neglected the universal manpower and concentrated power in the hands of a few who amassed fortunes at the expense of many. The result was that its industrialisation had become a menace to its own poor and to the rest of the world.

In my opinion, it was so not only to the poor of America but to the rest of the world also.

"If India were to escape such a disaster, it had to intimate what was the best in America, and other Western countries and leave aside its attractive-looking but destructive economic policies."

[Translation]

These words of Gandhiji are a guideline in our national and international scenario. It should be kept in view. You should not deviate from this direction. You are working in the direction of throwing our countrymen at the mercy of the multinationals. You must stop it. Now, since we are having Pepsicola and Coca Cola, our own Thums up, Limca and Seven-up have been routed. Those factories were taken over, workers were engaged and their agencies were taken over and finally, they were finished.

Shri Indra Jit Gupta ji was just mentioning that his wife came back yesterday after shopping in the market and when both of them were having dinner at night, she told that she had bought 'Arhar' pulse for Rs. 28 per kg. which was Rs. 18 per kg. last year. I am even ready to believe that it may cost Rs. 40 a kg at some other place, when Shahjahan was imprisoned, Aurangzeb gave him only one book to read, one person to serve and one foodgrain to eat. Shahajahan chose his daughter for service, the Quran for reading and gram for eating because he thought that gram was such a meal which could be used in several ways and it is invigorating also but today gram has gone out of reach of even the middle class, not to talk of the poor people. Where are you taking this country?

Mr. Chariman, Sir, the statistics have been furnished here. Our Hon. Ministers have also been providing such statistics. Shri Mani Shankar ji has also provided in the House and our Shri Sonkar ji has provided much more data. I believe that the statistics do not match the reality. You maintain that so much capital is being invested, and so much development is taking place in the industries, the growth rate is regularly increasing, the inflation rate has been checked and so much amount is being

spent on the development of villages and employment is being provided to this number of people. But I say that there is not an iota or truth in it. I also come from a village and know the rural folks. The Hon. Prime Minister does not tire of saying that lakhs and crores of rupees are being spent on the development of villages but where is that amount in actuality?

SHRI UMRAO SINGH (Jalandhar) : You can come with us to villages, then we will show it to you.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am aware that the funds are not available to lay even brick pavement in villages. You are only ruining the villages. The villages are devoid of roads, electricity, drinking water, schools and hospitals. The people do not have places to live and there are no medicinal facilities available for the patients and there are no employment opportunities also.

AN HON. MEMBER : The 70% villages are experiencing the same kind of fate.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : This is the plight of the whole country. You look away from the reality and just ignore it. You do not see the reality. Please do not jeopardize the future on the country. So, I would like to say that I would have been happy if the poor had progressed even after 48 years of independence. Today, an urge to have a social change has arisen in the people, and they are making efforts to give it a shape. Sir, I am considered a senior Member in this Lok Sabha. I have completed four years in the present Lok Sabha. I did my level best in trying to provide employment to thousands of poor people of my area. I did not visit the office of any Minister. I only make phone-calls and talk to them and make efforts so that they could get employment. I have been able to provide employment to only four of them as Safai Karamcharis.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow) : You have done a commendable job.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : As the things stand today, one of those four employees has written to me and has expressed his gratefulness for the job he got through my efforts. He wrote that he does sanitation work wearing dirty clothes and gets Rs. 1100 per month as salary but neither he has a place to live in, nor can he send money to his parents. He has requested me to kindly get him transferred from Calcutta to Benaras or Moghul Sarai. This is the situation. Please do not conceal it. Please take note of the reality. Please do not let the situation become explosive and do not think that its solution is to go abroad and beg before the multinational corporations for their assistance and allow them to earn all kinds of profits in our country. Who opposes capital investment in India?

India is a vast country and you have opened the floodgates of its market potential without any terms and conditions. There is an open invitation to MNCs for entering into the Indian market, exploiting its resources, plundering its wealth and destroying it. You should remember the warning of Gandhiji. I hope that the words of Gandhiji will stir the conscience of the Congressmen about the jeopardy involved in it.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, India cannot be enslaved politically today with the invasion of colonialism or economic imperialism. But there is an undaunted endeavour of making it economically subservient. We have failed at every international front. International capitalism is not willing to establish a system based on uniformity, justice or any rules and regulations. It wants to make its advent on its own conditions to plunder this country. Therefore, I want to warn you and the Government against its dangers.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, Atal ji raised the question of newspapers today morning. There was a 46 per cent hike in the prices of newsprint during the last few days. Consequently, the newspaper industry is on the brim of extirpation. In Uttar Pradesh, the prices of language newspapers have risen from Rs. 2 to Rs. 3. The hawkers are on a strike for the past month and a half there. Not a single newspaper is available there. The hawkers demand that their commission be enhanced consequent upon the 50 per cent increase in the prices of newspapers. On the other hand, the newspaper owners say that the prices of newsprint have touched such exorbitant heights that the newspaper price hike is inadequate to meet their financial requirements and as such they cannot afford to enhance the commission. Whimsical prices are charged for medicines, vegetables and other essential commodities. A poor man can hardly afford to make a livelihood. Are you concerned about it? Contrary to it, you are propounding the open market policy. When we say like that you will advance the examples of Russia and China to counter our plea. We are not willing to look at Russia and China but at India from the Indian perspective so that our country and our people do not get entangled in this impregnable vicious circle. Mr. Chairman, Sir, to my mind the Government has turned totally insensitive and nothing that we say moves it. There is a constant endeavour to avoid things. Just now Indrajit ji was analysing the reason behind all that and concluded that their hearts are lacking in compassion and sympathy for the poor and for the country. No pains, no gains. Otherwise, they should have thought of doing something to solve this greatest problem of the country today. The rural womenfolk may go out into the fields in the morning or wait for the dusk to descend to excrete their nightsoil, the poor may loiter in wilderness, the morale of our youth may be

lowered and they may fall a pray to drugs or become victims of miseries, the Government cares two hoots for them. I would like to draw your attention to an imminent danger which I term as a national problem. The basic amenities the poor should have been getting today after this long spell of poverty, unemployment, and inflation are not made available to him. His cup of patience is ready to overflow and his desperation knows no bounds.

Who will take the advantage of this situation? It had hardly mattered if tired and fed up with ever increasing poverty, unemployment and dismay people looked at Atalji as their saviour, but, unfortunately, they are taking refuge in BJP. The threat of communalism to the country's national unity was never so grave as it is today and the Congress is also responsible for it. There is no propaganda to counter communalism, no fight against it. The Babari Masjid issue is discussed time and again because it has acquired the dimensions of a historic event. There were different types of security forces and the police at the disposal of the Government but it lacked the proper will to protect it. At times, the people suspect that probably it was in connivance with the Prime Minister that the mosque was demolished. I do not subscribe to this view but I am aware that the close aides of the Prime Minister might have advised him to let the mosque be demolished so that the apple of discord is removed once for all and the Prime Minister would have concurred to it.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : At that time, one of his principal advisers was Shre Kumaramangalam, the then Minister, who was around him.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : That is your internal matter. You know it better. You need not tell this to me.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : I was just giving clarification to your point that Shri Kumaramangalam was around him at that time.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : Mr. Chairman, Sir, I was saying that corruption is increasingly permeating into our Government and administration today. Mani Shankar ji, you have not only been a great admirer of Rajiv ji but his devotee also and there is nothing had in it. You do honestly recognise his contribution. I would like to remind you that eight years ago when Rajiv ji was the Prime Minister, he, in a speech in his constituency had stated that only 10 or 15 paise out of a rupee allocated by the Centre for the development purposes reached the poor and rest 85 to 90 paise was pocketed by the middlemen. You may also recall that in Bombay he had stated that the Congress Party will launch a campaign against the corrupt, the brokers and the contractors. Where does the Congress of the day stand? Corruption is sky rocketing in the country.

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : I had been his devotee and will continue to be one but I would like to give an important clarification. Rajiv ji, had, of course, said that out of one rupee 85 paise do not reach the poor. He made this statement on the basis of a report of the Planning Commission which said that 85 paise was being spent on administrative expenditure and corruption money emanates from the 15 paise fund only. I gave this clarification to allay your misapprehension.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN : That debate is over. You please wind up now.

[Translation]

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : I do not get trapped in any debate. Mr. Chairman, Sir, I say that there is rampant corruption in the Government and in administration and that is the greatest tragedy of the people of this country.

17.00 hrs.

What did you do after Rajiv ji said so? The country witnessed many great scandals, the Bank scam, the sugar muddle besides other scandals that took place behind the curtain but the Congress Party and the Congress Government is learning no lessons.

Another matter of grave concern for us is the criminalisation of politics today. Being a responsible national party running the administration of the country, you must be equally concerned. Why does there exist a draconian law like TADA on the country's statute if you have any concern? This is what the Human Rights Commission constituted by this Government and headed by the former justice of the High Court says. In his letters to each and every Member of Parliament, he has stated that it is a black law and requested them to withdraw their support to it after May this year. Despite this, you are regularly interpreting that law with the help of which thousands of innocent people have been put behind the bars particularly those belonging to a particular community. Atal ji was right in what he said here, he named certain castes.

But I would like to point out that the TADA is being used as a weapon deliberately against the Muslims. I have requested many State Chief Ministers not to use it against innocent persons and demanded its repeal. But in spite of promises given time and again, its misuse continues. I want that the Government should repeal this Act and it should not make any excuse. It should rather be done away with lock, stock and barrel. The Government can find its suitable replacement. I do not say that there should be no law for a traitor, but it could be replaced by another law because this law has earned

a lot of criticism and also lost the confidence of the people. Therefore, I request the Government to learn a lesson from it.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, today the prices, poverty and unemployment are on the increase. The resentment and unrest among youth due to the increasing unemployment has reached an explosive stage. The mover of this motion might be knowing that when unemployment touched 11 per cent in Europe, the European Union was very much concerned and it set up a commission to find out its reasons. The report of this commission was received 6 months back. It has been stated therein that the present economic policies are strengthening big and multinational companies only. This is the reason behind the rise in unemployment. The commission states that the industries which generated more employment have been ruined. Although the nation becomes rich through entry of Multi National Companies, yet that wealth remain centre to handfuls of the rich persons. These companies enhance the salaries of only those persons who are already working there. Further, they are given other facilities and allowances also which hinders creation of more employment. I fail to understand why the Government does not want to learn a lesson from the experiences of the European Union and rectify its mistakes. This Government is blindly leading the country towards that very direction. I warn the Government not to create any explosive situation in the country. Otherwise more and more youth will become unemployed and there will be unrest in the society. As a result, the evil forces will raise their ugly heads and the country will have to face this embarrassment. The national unity will also be in jeopardy.

The main reason behind the unsavoury developments in Kashmir is that the unrest among youths has reached the explosive stage there. Moreover corruption and unemployment has also increased. Nobody cares for the problems of the craftsmen. The administration was allowed to function arbitrarily and the Union Government thought that it would tackle the problems with the help of the army. But the Government has hurt the sentiments of the citizens there and they have gone astray. This is the reason behind the revolt raised by the youth against the country. In such a situation, a stage also comes when one even goes to the extent of committing suicide. I want that the Government should not lead the nation to the path of suicide.

I, therefore, request the Government to think over these points seriously. I do not want to take much time of this House, but I would like to state that the ruling party is not discharging responsibilities entrusted to it by the people in our democratic set up. I request that it should deliver the goods at least

for the sake of the country and its future. It should think over it seriously. Here we do not make our points with the aim to criticise the Government.

To conclude, I would like to state that the country is heading toward a social transition. The nation has entered into a new era. The struggle for social justice is not a struggle for spreading casteism. The fight for social justice is intended to fulfil the goal of freedom struggle of the nation. Mahatma Gandhi had stated that our freedom will be a true freedom only when there will be no poverty and scarcity, destitution. Today, three-fourth population of the country is poor. The Government should try to remove their miseries. These people are the real master of this country. India is not made up of soil, mountains, land or sea only. The citizens of this country make India. Therefore, the Government should pay its attention to their welfare. It should fulfil its responsibility. Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee is the Leader of Opposition here. He told that consensus can be reached between the Government and the Opposition on various issues. He has suggested that we should sit together and try to reach a national consensus. But I would like to point out that there cannot be agreement on certain issues like combating communalism.

Shri Atal ji holds the Congress responsible for this. He states if the Congress can join hands with the Muslim League, why his party cannot have alliance with the Shiv Sena. If the Congress has committed wrong, will the B.J.P. also commit another wrong? Is it in national interest? Would it not push the country into religious hysteria. The B.J.P. is trying to foment religious hysteria through an organised policy in the country. It should eschew it. As a result thereof, the nation will disintegrate and become weak.

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) BHUWAN CHANDRA KHANDURI (Garhwal) : But it will not spread casteism.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV : We are removing casteism in the country. Swami Ram Krishna Paramhans had once said, when a small thorn pierces the foot, a bigger thorn is needed to take it out. Casteism has been rampant here for thousands of years. This casteism had made the toilers poor, untouchable, downtrodden and Shudras and today, the same has pierced the hearts of the people of mother India. Today 85 per cent people constitute dalits, backward classes, minorities and the neglected lot. This casteism is like that bigger thorn, which once taken out will get India rid of casteism. Thus, India will become a strong nation. With these words, I oppose the Motion of Thanks.

[English]

PROF. K.V. THOMAS (Ernakulam) : Sir, usually in the afternoon the attendance in this House is thin

and after a heavy lunch, the Members feel sleepy. But today we have been fortunate to hear the electrifying speeches starting from Shri Somnath Chatterjee to Shri Chandra Jeet Yadav.

Sir, these speeches carried messages which can be future lights for the political thinking in our country.

Sir, when I heard the reverberating rhetoric of Barrister, Comrade Shri Somnath Chatterjee, I found two things viz., (1) the rhetoric of Barrister and (2) the usual anti-Congressism of the Communists.

After forty eight years of Independence and after so many experiments both in the Centre and in the States, I think all the major political parties have to think alike about the future of this country. Shri Indrajit Gupta has expressed his apprehension of what will happen in the next general elections.

Sir, Congress is a mass movement which has been with the people of this country for the last 110 years and this organisation has seen many ups and downs. But time has always proved that Congress is the only movement which can take this nation from progress to progress.

Sir, I was pained to note when Shri Somnath Chatterjee said that after a few years, Congress might be seen only on the sign boards. But I would like to point out to Shri Somnath Chatterjee and other Comrades that the undivided Communism and today's divided Communism has got its roots in Kerala and West Bengal only. If our Communist friends start travelling from Cape Comorin to Kashmir, after Kerala if they find out a red flag, it can be only in the railway platforms of Andhra Pradesh, Tamil Nadu and Maharashtra until they reach again Calcutta to see a red flag. So their apprehension of vanishing nature of Congress is all a joke.

Sir, I am also pained that our Communist friends do not understand the reality of the political situation in this country. Very often this can come to them very late.

17.14 hrs.

(Shri Sharad Dighe in the Chair)

When I was a young boy studying in the primary school in my small fishermen village, on August 15th, we hoisted the national flag. We had got big rallies holding the tricolour flags. In those days, I had seen the Communists hoisting the black flags. It took them ten years - that is in 1957 - to accept that this nation has become independent.

Today, Shri Somnath Chatterjee was telling about the developments that have taken place in West Bengal. We are also glad and happy that West Bengal is moving ahead. It is a part of this country. But I have seen how our Communist friends have opposed any progressive measure that was started in this country.

Ten years back, in my village two farmers were brutally murdered because they started with tilling machines. At that time they opposed the rilling machines.

Again, Sir, when I was a student in the college, about 35 years back, I had seen my professors coming in rickshaws pulled by men and after one or two years in the college I found my professors coming in cycle rickshaws, later cycle rickshaws were replaced by auto rickshaws. In all these times, our Communist friends led rallies and agitations against changing the pulling rickshaws by cycle rickshaws and cycle rickshaws by auto rickshaws. Recently I had seen, when the computer came, there was a tough opposition against the use of computer and in the open platforms our Communist friends in Kerala opposed to the introduction of computer but secretly in AKG Centre, Trivandrum, they had a computer and in Ernakulam ENIN centre, they had a computer. So, our good Communist friends cannot understand what is happening around them. They realise it only later, after ten years or after 15 years. Now the West Bengal Government is inviting the multinationals. They are inviting the big industrial houses. But, Sir, during my younger days, I had seen in my village our Communist friends leading rallies, shouting slogans against Tatas and Birlas. Now, Tatas and Birlas are the VIPs invited in many of the Communist offices. So, I am happy because they have changed their mood.

Sir, what is the real political situation in this country? Indrajit ji has said that the President's Address was delivered on February 13. He said that had the Address been made after one month what would have been the change. Sir, this is something on which we have to think deeply. Sir, the Congress has lost elections in Andhra Pradesh. We have lost elections in Karnataka. We have lost elections in Maharashtra. We have lost elections in Gujarat. We have lost elections in other States. But instead of Congress, who has come to power? In Kerala I had seen human chain from Trivandrum to Kasargod by our Communist friends to protest against the communal and divisive tendencies in the country. When the Congress Party loses power in different States, it is not the Socialist parties which are coming to power, it is the communal forces which are coming to power. I am more pained that in the Punjab Session of the Marxist Communist Party, the stand taken by the Communist Party was that they would fight equally against the BJP and equally against the Congress. Are they so powerful? Is the party, which has got some backing in Kerala, some backing in West Bengal and some backing in Tripura, strong enough to fight against on the one side with the BJP

and on the other side with the Congress? If they are fighting against the Congress, they are helping the BJP. Let them announce that they are going to help the BJP. The Congress does not and will not have any cooperation with the BJP. We will always fight against all the communal forces even though we may lose further elections. Sir, we may lose further elections but the time will come that people will realise that there is no alternative to Congress. What had happened in Babri Masjid? Babri Masjid is not something which Shri Narasimha Rao created on a particular date. It is something which has been inherited. During the last so many years, Babri Masjid problem has been there.

It started in Panditji's time, came the Indiraji, came to Rajivji and came over to Narasimha Rao. So, something had happened, on which we are all painful. But who took advantage of it? Is it the Congress that took advantage of it? Is it the Communists that took advantage of it? If somebody has taken advantage of it, it is those people who dismantled Babri Masjid they have taken advantage of it. In Kerala, you know, on the one side, it is the Congress and on the other side, it is the Communist.

We have been fighting but that fight is in a democratic form under democratic norms. But what is happening in Bihar? How the election in Bihar has been conducted? We have seen what has happened during the recent elections in Bihar. Do you want to win the elections using the muscle power? I agree with Shri Indrajit Guptaji that a time has come when democratic forces have to sit together and face together the problems that this nation is facing now. What are the problems? Some of the friends said that those people, those Members on this side, who support the Government are having a stereotype speech. When we speak, there are certain realities which we are forced to repeat. When this Government came to power in June 1991, what was the position of this House? The Congress, even though, was a majority Party in this House, it did not have the majority. What are the problems this Government has to face? So Congress Party under the leadership of Shri Narasimha Rao, did not have a majority in the House, but being a majority Party elected by the people of this country, it has to rule this country because we had an election in 1989. We had an election in 1991 also. Even though Congress did not have the majority, we had the mandate of the people that Congress should lead this country for the next five years. We have completed four years. We are ready for the next general election. During these four years, can anybody question the Congress that we have used

our political power to capture power in the State elections? Election in Andhra Pradesh has taken place. Congress is in power at the Centre. Congress was in power at that time in Andhra Pradesh. But we did not make use of the State's power. In Karnataka, Congress was in power. Congress was in power in Delhi. But we did not make use of the power in Delhi as well as in Bangalore to capture power in Karnataka. So in all these States where the State elections took place, Congress allowed to have a democratic verdict of the people. But what is happening in Bihar? I think what has happened in Bihar should be something which all the political parties should ponder over it. Should we repeat what has happened in Bihar in Kerala also? We have to face an election within one year. Should we repeat what has happened in Bihar in the entire country when we have to face the general election in 1996? So Congress, whatever may be the setbacks of Congress, whatever may be the defects of the Congress, is a mass movement which has built up democratic norms in this country. Democracy has right now deep-rooted in this country and for that alone, at least, my friends from the other side should congratulate us.

Sir, coming back to the problems this Government faced, even though it may be a stereotype reply, there are some realities. What was the economic situation? We know we were in a debt trap. Our foreign exchange reserve was not even enough for 15-days purchase of essential commodities from abroad. We were forced to sell some of the gold and we have mortgaged the gold. From that bad political and economic situation, we have come out. We have got the largest foodgrain stock this year. This is the record foodgrain production that we have in the last two or three years. We have got a record foodgrains stocks. So, if there is any eventuality of natural calamity, we can meet the situation. This is I am submitting out of my 11 years' of Parliamentary life. In this House, we have several times discussed either on drought or on floods. But, Sir, today, we are confident even if there is a natural calamity, we will be able to feed our people. Shri Indrajit Gupta said that people are not purchasing from the PDS shops. Why? In Kerala, we have got the best PDS system in the country. In Kerala also, people are not going to the PDS shops. The reason is that in the open market, they can get foodgrains and other essential commodities at a cheaper price. Why? It is because the Government took a decision. The zonal system has been abolished.

The barriers have been taken away and the farmers can transport their foodgrains from one State to another. Earlier there was a barrier in Andhra, there was a barrier in Tamil Nadu; so the transportation was made difficult. The Government has taken away all those barriers and today we find

that in Kerala even though people are not going to PDS shops, all types of foodgrains, rice, wheat, everything is available in the open market. That is the position.

Secondly we have to go deep into the basic problems. When this nation got independence in 1947 what was our population? It was 400 million. What is the population now? It is 960 million. It has doubled. Even though our production has tripled, we find that it is difficult to cope with the population explosion. Unemployment is there. We have to find a solution to the problem of unemployment. The Congress Party has been in power for 45 years here. But what has happened in the States? In various States other parties were in power. What have they done to cope with unemployment problem? What have they done to bring down the prices of essential commodities? I think we have to be realistic. Instead of accusing the Congress Party for every debacle, take a positive attitude towards this democratic organisation. We are not a Communist Party where people do not know what is happening inside the Party. Here whatever deliberations take place are known to the people. Many of our meetings are taking place in the presence of Pressmen. We are not asking the Pressmen to go out of our party meetings. The Congress party is an open organisation.

Now coming to the bold decisions we have taken, when we took the liberalisation of the industrial policy, what was the apprehension? The apprehension was that the foreign industries will capture the Indian market. I am not an expert on Economics. But I had my personal experiences during two or three occasions.

About a month back we, some of the MPs, went to Spain. When we travelled we got about 40 to 50 dollars for our daily expenditure. With those dollars in the Frankfurt airport I asked for a pen. I found that the price of a pen there was much more than that in Delhi. Then I asked for spectacles and found that the price of spectacles also was much more than that in Delhi. I asked for a cloth. I did not purchase a cloth or a pant also because I found that its price in Delhi was much less. We did not spend a single dollar out of our pocket because everything was available here. Our market is cheaper with better quality goods.

What are we afraid of? What was the position, five years back in the corridors of power here in Udyog Bhavan? The corridors of Udyog Bhavan were the corridors of licences. It was the licence Raj, it was the permit Raj. I come from Kerala, 2,500 miles away. People from my State used to come asking for a permit or a licence. Unnecessarily people had to come. Now there is no licence, there is no permit. The progress is tremendous. This, we have to accept. All right, we have got our weaknesses. We are a majority party. We have to take many of the

decisions on consensus. So, when this Government came to power, what was the major problem? Mandal Commission I belong to a backward community. I have my own interests in the recommendations of the Mandal Commission. But the Government accepted the Mandal Commission's recommendations *in toto* without causing any fear among the other communities. There was some kind of understanding. This Delhi was burning, the streets of Delhi were burning at the time of Shri V.P. Singh's regime. What had he done? We know the situation, how Shri V.P. Singh introduced Mandal Commission Report here. We know the political scenario at that time. We faced that. Now nobody is talking about the Mandal Commission recommendations.

So, there is a basic change. Let us take the Babri Masjid. I told at the beginning itself that it was not the creation of Shri Narasimha Rao. This problem was there earlier also. But this time, unfortunately, the Babri Masjid was dismantled. Yes, we are painful about it. Something has to be done to settle this problem. Unless the Babri Masjid issue is settled, no political party in this country can survive. It is not the headache of Congress Party alone, it is not the headache of Communists alone and it is not the headache of BJP alone. BJP, after capturing so many States — they have got Maharashtra, they have got Rajasthan and they have got Gujarat — they are now thinking that in 1996 they will come over here. Okay, let that be the will of the people. But they cannot rule this country without settling the Babri Masjid issue. This is the situation. So, we have to find out solution to this burning problem of the country. It cannot be solved with any political motive. We should have an open mind. I appreciate the contributions made by Communists in solving many of the social problems of the country. I come from Kerala. I appreciate the stand they have taken and the contributions they have made in settling the Punjab issue. Many of the Communists Comrades have sacrificed their lives in Punjab. In Kerala, for settling so many social issues, Communists have made their contributions. I think Communists have to make a contribution now also. The time has come when they should decide whether they are going to fight along with Congress against the BJP and other communal forces or they are again going to use the same old slogan that they will fight against the Congress and they will fight against communalism. They have to think about it. My request to the Communists is to please think about it now.

SHRI RASA SINGH RAWAT : Do you want their friendship?

PROF. K.V. THOMAS : It is not a question of friendship or enmity, it is a question of political reality. If they are going to fight against the communal forces,

then all the democratic forces have to stand together. The people of this country are very intelligent. In all the elections, the verdict of the people has always been correct. I have no doubt about it. We have to face the elections in 1996 and the time has come for the Congress Party, for the Communists and for the Socialists to see that democracy is protected. We shall fight against these communal forces and save the country.

I am proud of my Prime Minister that during the last four years, he has led this country during the period of political turbulence and during the period of economic turbulence. So, I think, Narasimha Rao Ji, with whatever limitations he had, has led this nation from one success to another. If you go through the achievements of different Ministries, namely, of Home, Agriculture and so on, you may say it is a stereotype answer, but there are achievements.

So, I support the Motion of Thanks moved by my good friend, Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar.

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) BHUWAN CHANDRA KHANDURI (Garhwal) : Mr. Chairman Sir, the work, which should have been taken up in February (*Interruptions*)...Out of the various achievements of this Government, the one is that it is being taken up at the end of April...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : The Government had kept it pending...(*Interruptions*)

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) BHUWAN CHANDRA KHANDURI : Whatever it may be (*Interruptions*) The country will have to suffer for a long period due to the record achievements of this Government for the last four years. These things will be quoted in future that such type of things used to happen earlier. It may be the case of motion of thanks on President's Address or corruption or the administrative inefficiency the Government have made certain records and they have kept themselves in the records.

Mani Shankar Aiyar ji has tried his best in praising this Government. He is very learned and a very good orator also but at this time I felt that he did not speak whole heartedly. My humble submission to him is that, he should watch his cassette again and compare it with his previous speeches.

[*English*]

Then he will find that his heart was not in what he was saying.

[*Translation*]

It appeared that you really understand that.

[*English*]

You are trying to defend the indefensible.

[Translation]

Mani Shankar ji you have tried to project this Government as very good and powerful but the fact is that this Government which is before us, is a weak and mismanaged Government.

Due to its internal disputes its hollow foundation has also been deteriorated and now only its last rituals are to be performed. Mr. Chairman, Sir, their failures both at the national and international level are so many but the one thing which panicks me, is that party has functioned just opposite to its national character. Politics of vote bank, politics of appeasement and the infatuation of chair has been so much that they did not think about the welfare of the public and it did not even bother about it during the last four years.

I would like to speak on Uttar Pradesh and Uttarakhand later on but today it is necessary to speak on the international issues. What is the image of our country in foreign countries at present? Just now Prof. Thomas has said that out of 47 years, they have ruled for 44 years. That is correct but who is responsible for the wrong doings in the country and the poor image of the country at the international level? Today at the international level the image of our country is just like a beggar, a weak country and a country which is compelled to succumb before international institutions i.e. the World Bank of the I.M.F. You have converted the backbone of this country into a banana tree. Hon. Aiyar ji has given the high data relating to it about whom Shri Chandra Jeet Yadav had said that he was a learned man and he knew very well how to present twisted data.

[English]

Statistics are supposed to be like a lamp post. Either you can lean on it and try to justify or take support or you enlighten the people, use the light. I think you have done the former whereas I, at least, expected that you will do the latter.

[Translation]

Therefore, the data given by you are not going to serve any purpose. You are saying that the economic condition is very good, tell me why the poor is becoming more poor? Why is the situation of dearthness so? If there is any shortcoming in your method of functioning and instead of removing that if you go on praising yourself, no improvement will take place. So far as the international affairs are concerned, I would like to repeat that Congress Party and the Congress Government are responsible for the worse image of our country at national and international level. Even if the small countries try to brow-beat at us in the matters relating to defence, is it your achievement? Why it is so? If you think up on

it, you will reach at some decision but this is not your habit. You impose your responsibility on others. When you do not find anything, you raise the issue of Babri Masjid after every third minute. Just now Prof. Thomas was saying that they were not in power in the States for such a long period. Therefore, the economic reforms are not going to be successful there. This Government has been in power in the Centre for 44 years out of 48 years and for a long period in the States. You have said so many things about Bihar. How long have you been in power there? You will not ponder over it as to why the condition of Bihar is like this? Your tendency has been of appeasement and to fetch the vote banks? You have been so much involved in corruption that you do not see any thing wrong. You have no concern with the interests and disinterests of the country.

Members of the ruling Party say that the Bhartiya Janta Party is communal. Even Chandrajeet ji has said that you have done such and such. Have you ever thought who is responsible for communalism? Who has spread it. Today, why the people are going towards Bhartiya Janta Party and why they are angry with you. Have you ever pondered over it? If I recount the misdeeds of this hundred years old party and the party which has brought freedom to the country, you will come to know the facts. I have already recounted these. When you go to Mizoram, you talk about Christians. You write about them in your manifesto and show them the sign of cross made in your hands. You do not have any problem in Kerala, where the Government is formed with the support of the Muslim League. Friday is declared as holiday there to appease the Muslims. Who had created Hindrawalan? Your leader Late Shri Rajiv Gandhi had called him a saint. Later on he was declared unpatritotic. When Late Shri Rajiv Gandhi visited Ayodhya, he had said that Ram Rajya will be established. If you say so it is secularism but if the Bhartiya Janta Party says, so, it is treated as communal. What sort of definition it is? How will the country be uplifted and how will it be united? At least fix some criteria and at least think about the welfare of the country. Merely by imposing responsibility on others will not serve the purpose. There are so many problems in the country, whether it may be the economic problem the administrative problem, the problem of corruption or the problem of the security of the nation. It will depend on how much fair and national attitude you possess and how far do you think about the welfare of the nation.

I do not have any doubt that there is someone among us who does not think about the welfare of the nation. But it is the responsibility of the Government which is responsible and running the administration. Hon. Mani Shankar ji has given the

data in his speech that they have done this and has compared it with the Government of V.P. Singh and Chandra Shekhar. Those Governments were not good that is why the people have given you the chair again. You have been given the responsibility for five years. Please tell what have you done during the last four years? There is no logic in it if you say that your predecessors were bad and therefore you are good. You will have to do concrete and real work. By saying merely that your predecessors were bad and you are not bad so much, will not serve the purpose. The people of the country have handed over the power to you therefore do some constructive work. Saying so will not do any thing good to the nation. You call yourself to be the national party. You are ruling, it is your responsibility to collect the good elements from every party and utilise these for the power and progress of the nation, instead of hatching conspiracy as you are involved in manipulations, corruption and do everything for chair. It will not be useful for the country. Solve the problems and think about the welfare of the nation. The issue of Kashmir has been raised. Taking data into consideration the situation of Kashmir is normal. It seems from the data given by Shri Aiyar ji that peace has been restored and a lot of progress has been made there. The progress is that you have been continuously postponing elections there for the last four years. The day you raise the issue of elections, on the very next day it is being said that terrorists will not let the elections be conducted there. India is such a big country and you even cannot control just one State.

SHRI SURYA NARAYAN YADAV (Sahasra) : Please suggest about Kashmir, what should be done there.

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) BHUWAN CHANDRA KHANDURI : I have given suggestions earlier also and today also I will give the suggestions. I would like to cite an example that terrorists have occupied Charar-e-Shariff and the Government is unable to do anything. All this has happened due to the weak policies of the Government and we are recounting its achievements. I would like to repeat the things said about Jammu and Kashmir that they could be no achievement due to the weak policy of the Government and even not a single problem has been solved so far. Unless Pakistan is given the message that if it goes on proxy war with our country it will be treated in the same manner. Unless you use your power, Pakistan is not going to understand. I am an ex-service man and if I am wrong, please recount the achievements in this field? How long this issue will be pulled on?

Therefore, in my opinion, nothing can be done without changing your policy of appeasement. Guilty persons should be punished and a clearcut policy

should be formulated. Sometimes you say that elections will be held in July but later on these are postponed and date is extended further. Unless you convince the people in this matter nothing is going to be done.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, regarding Prithvi, Agni and NPT, I would like to know the actual position. Shri Aiyar was justifying, that it is being done under a specifically formulated policy. But it is not true. Our Defence Minister says something about 'Prithvi' here and changes his version while speaking in foreign countries. I would like to know as to whether we have surrendered totally to foreigners. Some concrete steps should be taken in this regard. There is no doubt that requirement of 'Prithvi' was felt but I do not know that have this will be fulfilled. It has been said about Agni that it has been taken up to develop technology and Rajiv Gandhi was quoted for it. It may be correct in context of earlier situation. I do not know the facts about it because so many other things were said about it later on which reveals the wavering and vague policy of the Government about 'Prithvi', 'Angi' and NPT. We are shifting our policy under the pressure from foreign countries. I think that you are making mockery of it and it is not in the interest of the country.

The required attention is not being paid towards defence of the country. The Government should plan a long-term strategy for it. Today 85 per cent funds are being spent on administrative sector and every year, this issue is raised. What is your strategy? Every year you say that amount of allocation is increased but in reality rate of inflation is not added into it. You raise the allocation by 6,8 or 10 per cent where the rate of inflation is 12 per cent. Then what will be the impact of raising the funds? Every year a large number of soldiers retire from service which also affects the budget heavily. I would like to know as to whether you have thought about it and is there any specific strategy about it?

In context of corruption, I would like to say that your former senior Minister says that 80 thousand crore rupees were involved in the scams unearthed during the last four years. What more achievements you would like to tell here?

Mr. Chairman, Sir, in the end, I would like to say that issue regarding remote control for state Government of Maharashtra is being raised. Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar and other Hon. Members have also said something about it. It is happening in Maharashtra. You have been habitual of remote control and you have started this custom in this country. You have forgotten late Shri Sanjay Gandhi and even today, your remote control is in No. 10. Why are you blaming others? You also live in a glass

house. Mine is a smaller glass house and if you throw stones at my house you will suffer more loss.

In the end, I would like to say something about Uttar Pradesh. Central Government is responsible for situation prevailing there. The way Centre is implementing its policies in the state is really sad. For petty and vested interests of your party, you are supporting U.P. Government for the last one year. For this, and especially for the bad incident of Muzaffarnagar, your party's name will be written in "black letters". My other colleagues will tell about the situation prevailing in Uttar Pradesh, corruption, kidnapping, rape and illegal occupation of others's houses have become a common feature in the State. Judiciary legislation and journalism have become meaningless and even then your party is supporting the State Government. I would like to tell what has been done by your Government in Uttar Pradesh regarding Uttaranchal. CBI has submitted its report you should read it. If your Government has any morality, then it should tell why the Uttar Pradesh Government is functioning till now? I would like to tell some facts about CBI report. It says that agitators were stopped unconstitutionally at Muzaffarnagar."

[English]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR : Sir, yesterday when I attempted to quote from a Judicial Inquiry Commission's Report, I was prevented by a colleague of Maj. Gen. Khanduri from doing so. The Speaker pointed out that there had been precedents for Reports not tabled to be quoted. I have no objection to his quoting it. But I suggest that there be consistency between the Chief Whip and the followers of his Party.

MAJ. GEN. (RETD.) BHUWAN CHANDRA KHANDURI : I am thankful to Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar for educating me. It is not so. On 31st March, it was presented to the Allahabad High Court. It is a public document. But I am not reading it. I am only telling what is written in that. This is in my notice. So, the two cases are quite different. We have very good coordination.

[Translation]

It is written in the report that Lucknow was very much in the knowledge of the incident of rape that took place at Muzaffarnagar and all this was done at the behest of Lucknow. Mere constables cannot on their own, indulge in the rape of 7 women and molestation of 17 women. A meeting was held in Lucknow and DGP Lucknow was regularly informed about this incident and this all have been done at the behest of Lucknow. This report says that Government documents and police documents have been tampered with, some pages have been taken

away. This report says that police did not only perpetrate rape against those women who were on roads but against those women also who were hiding themselves in the bus. Report says that no arms were found with the agitators and several other such facts have also been written in it which should be debated in this House in detail. I would like to know the responsibility of the Government. In his Address, hon. President says about Uttaranchal that "the Government is seized of the issues that have arisen in the hill areas agitation in Uttar Pradesh and is confident that given patience and sympathetic handling by all concerned, acceptable solutions will be found." What the Central Government is doing? You are just supporting the already collapsed Government of Mulayam Singh. It will ruin your party in the state and history will not forgive you for it. Apart from it what the Central Government is doing today? You have again received the proposal but so far you have not started a dialogue with any one. During the last three years we have raised this issue time and again. This issue has been debated for 7-½ hours in this House but your Government is still not ready to talk with them. The Hon. Minister of Home Affairs invites his friends and says that dialogue is going on this issue but he has not called the representatives of public and experts of the issue. You should leave political people and talk with non-political people. Uttaranchal has elected all the four MPs from BJP and 10 out of total 19 legislators for legislative Assembly. I would like to say that you should call all the 19 representatives and talk to them. Your Government does not work at all and you keep on praising it. You say that it is working very well but what is it doing actually? Do you wish that Uttaranchal may become another Kashmir. On one hand, you talk of peace in the country and on the other hand, you are provoking another region to become tumultuous. It is an area where in every house there are two to three members working in army or paramilitary forces. Many have retired from army. What type of Government is it? I, therefore, hope that Government takes some initiative on the issue of Uttaranchal. Uttar Pradesh Government should be dismissed and immediate decisions should be taken regarding Uttaranchal, if the Government had any constitutional authority; otherwise you are creating another problem, which will be quite harmful for the country.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to raise two or three more points. We do not want that people of Uttaranchal should have a feeling of resentment, but some foreigners and their agents are creating such a situation which is very unfortunate for the country. Our Home Minister must be aware of the fact that anti-national slogans are being encouraged there and you are promoting that kind of tendency. For

how long, you will keep on doing injustice to them and provoking them. It seems that Central Government has maintained total silence on this issue. I would like to say that it is not correct and not in the interest of the country. At the most your party will get two-three more seats for supporting Mulayam Singh but you are, at the same time, provoking a large patriotic area. I, therefore, request the Government to take some steps in the interest of the country. I have said this at several occasions and I am getting tired of raising this issue and people of the region are also tired. Please do not compell us. Therefore, in view of all the issues mentioned above, I am unable to support this resolution.

*SHRI M.R. JANARDHANAN (Thrunelveli) : Hon'ble Chairman, I thank you at the outset for giving me an opportunity to participate in the discussion on Motion of Thanks to the President's Address which he gave to this august House. As a follower of our great leader Puratchi Thalaivi and on behalf of All India Anna Dravida Munetra Kazagam, I would like to put forth my views. As far as our Rashtrapatiji Shri Shankar Dayal Sharma is concerned he is known for his commitment to Gandhian ideals and freedom movement. When I heard his speech, he was making a mention of self-assistance and self-assurance. I could not get exactly the meaning of it. I could not make out anything. I am a member of this august House for the past ten years. In my experience, during these ten years I have not come across another occasion similar to this wherein the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address is taken up after about one and half months.

ONE HON'BLE MEMBER : It is not one and half months, it is two and half months.

18.00 hrs.

*SHRI M.R. JANARDHANAN : As far as this 10th Lok Sabha is concerned, it has created history of sorts in many ways. This is for the first time the President's Address has been taken up so late. My esteemed colleague Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar has moved the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address at this point of time. That way the 10th Lok Sabha is a unique one to have taken up this after such a delay. This is first time in my experience as a Parliamentarian the President's Address has been taken up after two months. Therefore, the 10th Lok Sabha is unique in every nature. The word self-assurance which I read in this book is uttered by a man who lived with Gandhiji and consigned to the flames all Videshi Goods like the Garments imported from foreign countries. When I was a student in 1946-47, the word self-sufficiency was heard all over. Now it has gone. It is now the time for the word "Self-Assurance". This is the state of the present Congress. So we can infer that the Congress of those days is not here any more. Congress is not alive, that Congress has gone. That is not my word, that is seen from the text of the speech delivered by the President to the Parliament.

MR. CHAIRMAN : Why do you not continue tomorrow?

SHRI M.R. KADAMBUR JANARTHANAM : Thank you, Sir. I will continue my speech tomorrow.

MR. CHAIRMAN : The House now stands adjourned till 11.00 a.m. tomorrow.

18.01 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Thursday, April 27, 1995/Vaisakha 7, 1917 (Saka).