

2900 was allowed instead of the scale of Rs. 1400-2600 earlier sanctioned on the basis of the recommendations of the Fourth Pay Commission.

(b) Yes, Sir.

(c) As the considerations on the basis of which the recommendation of the Fourth Pay Commission in regard to the pay-scale of Assistants/Stenographers Grade 'C' was modified are not relevant in the case of Upper Division Clerks, the demand was not found acceptable and there is no proposal to revise the pay scale of UDC

STATEMENT CORRECTING REPLY TO
UNSTARRED QUESTION NO. 794 DATED
29-7-1991 REGARDING UNAUTHORISED
OCCUPATION OF LAND IN DURGA
PARK, DELHI

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT
(SHRI M. ARUNACHALAM): In reply to the
question cited as subject, against the words-
"Delhi Development Authority has re-
ported that Durga Park is an authorised
colony"

it may read as under:-

"Delhi Development Authority has re-
ported that Durga Park is an unauthor-
ised colony"

The mistake had occurred due to typo-
graphical error and could not be detected
earlier due to over-sight.

Inconvenience caused to the Sabha is
regretted.

12.00 hrs.

STATEMENT BY MINISTER

Cauvery Water Dispute

[English]

THE MINISTER OF WATER RE-
SOURCES (SHRI VIDYACHARAN
SHUKLA): After the Cauvery Water Dis-

putes Tribunal pronounced its Interim Order dated 25.6.1991, various representations were received by the Government on the question whether the Government should or should not publish the Order by notifying it in the official Gazette, in order to make it effective. In the replies to questions raised in Parliament on this issue, Government had clarified on 26.7.1991 in the Rajya Sabha that the Order would be effective from the date of its pronouncement by the Tribunal and that, in order to be effective, it does not have to be published in the Gazette.

In the meanwhile, the Government of Karnataka promulgated an Ordinance on 25.7.1991 in respect of the use of Cauvery waters in Karnataka. Since the legal position on various questions arising out of the said Ordinance and the interim Order of the Tribunal needed clarifications, the President of India referred the matter to the Supreme Court for its opinion under Clause (1) of article 143 of the Constitution. The Supreme Court pronounced its opinion on 22.11.1991 as follows:-

"The Karnataka Cauvery Basin Irriga-
tion Protection Ordinance, 1991 passed
by the Governor of Karnataka on 25th
July, 1991 (now the Act) is beyond the
legislative competence of the State and
is, therefore, *ultra vires* the Constitu-
tion".

"The Order of the Tribunal dated June
25, 1991 constitutes report and deci-
sion within the meaning of Section 5 (2)
of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act,
1956."

"The said Order is, therefore, required
to be published by the Central Govern-
ment in the official Gazette under Sec-
tion 6 of the Act in order to make it
effective".

"A Water Disputes Tribunal constituted
under the Act is competent to grant any
interim relief to the parties to the dispute
when a reference for such relief is made
by the Central Government".

"Whether the Tribunal has power to grant interim relief when no reference is made by the Central Government for such relief is a question which does not arise in the facts and circumstances under which the reference is made. Hence, we do not deem it necessary to answer the same".

I had made a statement in Parliament on 25.11.1991 that the Government had accepted the advisory opinion of the Supreme Court and had decided to initiate such action as may be necessary.

The matter has been examined further—particularly in the light of the pronouncement of the Supreme Court that the interim order of the Tribunal is required to be notified by the Government, in order to become binding and effective.

Section 5 (3) of the Inter-State Water Disputes Act provides for referring the matter again to the Tribunal for its guidance and explanation within a period of three months. That period expired on 24.9.1991. None of the States which are parties to the dispute before the Tribunal made any further reference to the Tribunal seeking guidance or explanation under Section 5 (3) of the Act, before 24.9.1991.

Government have also reviewed the position in respect of the availability of waters in the river Cauvery during this year. Compared to the water available during the past many years, the situation is quite favourable this year and no difficulties in making the waters available as provided for in the interim order of the Cauvery Water Disputes Tribunal are anticipated during this year.

The Government have now notified the Interim Order of the Cauvery Water Disputes Tribunal. The notification was made yesterday.

Government of Karnataka have made an application to the Cauvery Water Disputes Tribunal on 25.11.1991 with reference

to the difficulties that may arise if adequate quantities of water are not available in the river in any particular year. Government of Tamil Nadu have also submitted their counter statement. The Order of the Tribunal in this regard will also be taken into account by the Government for appropriate steps to be taken.

The Government will make every endeavour to act in the best interests of all concerned and to uphold the sanctity of the legal process. I would also like to assure the House that Government will strive to secure the most beneficial use of the Cauvery Waters and in fair proportions amongst all concerned.

(Interruptions)

SHRI P.G.NARAYAN (Gobichettipalayam): Sir, I must thank the Government, particularly the Prime Minister, for having taken timely action in notifying the Interim Award of the Cauvery Water Disputes Tribunal...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR (Mangalore): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have no other go but to say that the hon. Prime Minister has

.....**.....

...*(Interruptions)*. Now this has become a political issue. They have sacrificed Bangarappa. I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether they would dismiss the Government of Karnataka headed by Bangarappa and allow somebody else to head the Government...

(Interruptions). I would like to know from the Minister whether they would ask Bangarappa to resign and ask somebody else to head the Government there...*(Interruptions)*. This is nothing but a political issue. I would like to bring to the notice of the hon. Minister that the people of Karnataka will never forget this and will never forgive the Government of India...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down now...
(Interruptions)

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

MR. SPEAKER: This is not correct. When others have sat down, you should also sit down.

Please read the statement made by the Minister very carefully and then please bolm the opinion. Do not jump to conclusions...

(Interruptions)

SHRIV. DHANANJAYA KUMAR: Sir, in 1987, in a similar case of Rave-Beas, the final Award has been passed but the Central Government has not issued the notification so far. What was the urgency for issuing the notification in this case....*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: We are not only the politicians sitting in the House, we should act as statesmen also. Please sit down now...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Will you please take your seat now?...

(Interruptions)

SHRI K.V.THANGKABALU (Dharmapuri): On a point of order, Sir... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: No, there is no point of order. Madam, Bibhu Kumari Devi, you can make your submission...

(Interruptions)

SHRI K.V.THANGKABALU: Sir, I would request you to expunge the remarks made by Shri Dhananjaya Kumar. He has taken the names of

.....*

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: No, there is no point of order. You just sit down...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will take care of those things. You leave it to me. Don't worry about all those things. Please sit down.

SHRI K.V.THANGKABALU: Please allow me one minute, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: You do not need any minute now. Let the lady Member do it now. Bechivalrous to her.

12.09 hrs.

SHRIMATI BIBHU KUMARI DEVI (Tripura East): Mr. Speaker, Sir, national newspapers have reported large number of deaths in Tripura due to starvation. I am distressed in particular about dates of children, women and old people due to malnutrition and other associated diseases.

I would like to know from the hon. Minister as to what steps have been taken to help the State in this hour of need.

Secondly, the number of camps that have been organised to feed the distressed people should be checked. I want to know whether any Central medical team with medicines has been sent to the affected areas of Tripura Specially in the interior areas to provide immediate assistance to save valuable lives. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: You read the statement carefully.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: That is what I am saying. Read it.

(Interruptions)

SHRIMATI BIBHU KUMARI DEVI: In 1971 the State had fed nearly 20 lakh refugees from Bangladesh every day...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI M.V. CHANDRASHEKARA MURTHY (Kanakapura): Sir, please ask them to sit down. Is it so serious because a few people died in Tripura? (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please read it carefully.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: What is it that you want now? I will allow. Are you clear in your mind about what you want?

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. KRISHAN RAO (Chikballapur): It is a burning problem. We want some assurance from this Government. The issue should be settled amicably. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. SREENIVASA PRASAD (Chamarajanagar): Sir, we want some assurance. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI BIBHU KUMARI DEVI: Sir, it is hurting me that the hon. Member considered Tripura problem to be a very minor compared to Cauvery. Poor people including women and children are dying and the hon. Member should not speak so lightly.

Adivasi people are dying. The House should be concerned about the backward and poor people. It is these advise people who have always been tortured. We want the State Government to be helped by the Central Government. I think the House should think of the poor people who are dying. Nobody is there to speak on their behalf.

We fed 20 lakhs of people every day in 1971 when there was war. Since 1977 we have been feeding the refugees from Bangladesh in the camps. The Union Government is helping the State Government. We have no camps.

The money lenders are taking advantage of the extreme economic situation by taking away the ration cards of the Adivasis. These money lenders are also alienating

tribal lands because of this starvation and near-famine conditions which are causing extreme economic pressure, on the poor Adivasis.

I, therefore, hope that the Government will provide all possible assistance to the citizens of Tripura at this hour of need. The House should also discuss this issue.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes, you have made your point.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You sit down. You made it amply clear...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not helping your own cause I am allowing one Member to speak. You please sit down and let him speak.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI M.V. CHANDRASHEKARA MURTHY: Sir, we made it quite clear at the beginning of the Question hour also. We are interested in resolving this issue amicably and negotiable. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. DHANANJAYA KUMAR (Mangalore): Ask Mr. Bangarappa to resign. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. KRISHNA RAO: Why are you mentioning the political aspect? Please do not tell all those things (*Interruptions*)

SHRI M.V. CHANDRASHEKARA MURTHY: Any type of dispute between neighbouring States cannot be resolved by Courts of law or by Tribunal. The Government should use its good office to get the problem solved. As we have pointed out earlier, the Members of Parliament from Karnataka and also a delegation of the Legislators from Karnataka have represented to the hon. Prime Minister. We have full faith and confidence in the Prime Minister and

we want him to see that the interests of both the States are safeguarded.

But, in view of the statement made by the hon. Minister of Water Resources, we feel that he should have been present here at this time. It involves four crores of Kannadigas. It is life and death question for them. The Government have scant respect towards Karnataka. The Ministers are not even prepared to be present here. (*Interruptions*) Even now, knowing the entity of the issue, the Government should not take it so lightly. We want a firm assurance from the Government that they are prepared to call both the States concerned and resolve this issue amicably. It involves four crores of Kannadigas and it is a question of life and death for them. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI OSCAR FERNANDES (Udupi): Sir, the hon. Minister of Water Resources has made a statement on Cauvery issue. He has also said that the Government has notified it. I would appeal to the Government and our Prime Minister to use his good offices to bring both the States to a negotiating table and settle the issue amicably. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Fernands, if you read the Statement carefully and last two paragraphs specially, you will find a reply to your query.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I do not want any applause; it is not a question of just clapping and applauding; it is a matter which has to be dealt with by all of us in a statesmanly manner, and it should not create any problem as we have in the Northern States here. So, let us be careful. I would request the Member from Karnataka to go out and read the Statement carefully and then if they want to make statements, let them make.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI HARI KISHORE SINGH (Shoehorn): Sir, my humble request is, kindly fix up a date for this. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You are all interested in setting the dispute, not raking it up, that you have, I suppose. Please sit down.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Unnikrishnan.

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRISHNAN (Badagara): Sir, I am grateful to you for this opportunity. Today the President of the leading Opposition Party in this House has started what they call Bharat Ekata Yatra. (*Interruptions*). I am referring to what I heard from one of your spokesmen in his speech in Kerala the other day. I leave it to you. (*Interruptions*).

Sir, the Prime Minister has been generous enough to call all the Party Leaders yesterday, but the Leader of the Opposition had to leave for the reason best known to him and probably for the right reason. But, Sir, what is amazing is that some of the organisers of this Yatra have claimed that they are going to have 40,000 armed guards or whatever it is, and give them training. If they are not armed, what is the training they are going to give.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you later.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRISHNAN: No amount of shouting can cow me down. (*Interruptions*) It is a matter of concern that the party and groups allied to it are deliberately creating a situation in the country where national unity would be imperilled and minority rights threatened. As I have pointed out, it is a very serious situation, they want to abrogate Article 370 of the Constitution which links the State of Jammu and Kashmir with the rest of the Union. Already the secessionist movements pose a threat in the States of Punjab, Jammu and Kashmir and North-East. In this context, the B.J.P. and their allies are trying, by parading themselves as nationalists, to promote national-disintegration by organis-

ing this Yatra. In effect, they are trying to spread a communal wave and fanning the flames of communalism and trying to throttle the secular foundations of our Republic. The B.J.P. President has already made clear what his intentions are. (*Interruptions*).

All of us are trying to fight the menace of secessionist. Another form of secessionist is introduced in the name of majority community... (*Interruptions*).

Sir, this is a national menace and if this Yatra is allowed to go on and these elements are allowed to spread the communal poison, it will have a direct impact on the unity and integrity of this country.

Therefore, Sir, I want to invite the attention of the Home Minister and request him to tell us what information he has, not merely about the Yatra, but about the training of the armed guards. (*Interruptions*). Don't think that I will be cowed down by you.

Therefore, Sir, it is for the House to respond, it is for the Home Minister to respond.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV (Ajamgarh): Sir, I have also written to you. (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Vajpayeeji.

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow): Mr. Speaker, Sir, we do not understand the reason of hue and cry over the Ekta Yatra of Dr. Joshi, the President of Bhartiya Janata Party. It would have been better if the hon. friend had ascertained the facts before stating anything here. No weapons are being carried with that Yatra. It is neither possible nor it is conducive to do so. One should not just believe in rumours and repeat the same in the House. On the basis of rumours no allegation should be made. Government should not be asked to allow discussion on it. We are ready for the discussion on the Ekta Yatra. But why are all the

parties described making over this Yatra. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI VILAS MUTTEMWAR (Chimpur): What is the need of this Yatra?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Every party implements its programmes. There is no reason to be excited over the Bhartiya Janata Party's national unity and integration programme.

SHRI VILAS MUTTEMWAR: This is just a Vibhahjan Yatra.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Is it wrong to say that the entire country from Kashmir to Kanya Kumari is one? Is uttering is VANDE MATRAM wrong? Is it wrong to repeat the resolution that India can not be allowed to be divided further at any cost? Our Yatra is not against any class or community. I do not see any reason that it would create tension in any sphere. The Ayodhya issue has been mentioned by my hon. colleagues must realise that this Yatra is for the unity and not for any controversy. (*Interruptions*) Now they do not allow me to speak.

No riot had even occurred during Shri Advani's Yatra.... (*Interruptions*) But Shri Joshi's Yatra is different from the controversial issue of Ayodhya which has unfortunately divided the people of the country on the line of religion. But the same cannot be said about Kashmir issue. The issue of the country's unity and integrity is not related to any particular community only. Is it objectionable to say that Kashmir is an integral part of India? Mr. Speaker, Sir, who has stopped them to take out any such Yatra, they too used to take out 'Sadbhavana Yatra'. For them it is 'Sadbhavana' but if we do so, it becomes 'durbhavana'. This double-standard is not possible.

SHRI P.M.SAYEED (Lakshdeep): We did not carry weapons with us but you did (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I was willing to participate in the yesterday's

meeting. Advani ji was to go to Madurai so he was in a hurry. Had I got invitation, I would have certainly participated in that meeting. *(Interruptions)* Later on it was known that the invitation letter was despatched from the Prime-Minister's House. But anyway I did not get that. *(Interruptions)* Had I been invited earlier, I would have very much participated and put forward our party's views in that meeting. But by convenging meeting at the last moment it was wrong to expect from any party that it will cancel its prescheduled programme. *(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

SHRI K.P.UNNIKRISHNAN: Dr. Joshi wrote to the Prime Minister on th 6th.

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Is Dr. Joshi's invitation to the Prime Minister to come to Srinagar along with members of other parties on the 26th January to hoist National flag after attention the Republic day ceremony in Delhi objectionable? To isolate the BJP the Prime Minister *(Interruptions)* If other parties think that the is on one side and all those parties are on other side BJP a distinct party, we do not care for that. But we cannot compromise on the issue of the country's unity and integrity, one may look at our slogans....

[*English*]

SHRI SRIKANT JENA (Cuttack): Are you going to have a full scale debate on that? *(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Our slogans unite the people. They do not divide them. I have no objection to full scale dealeate *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat. Listen to me what I say Loknathji, why are you standing? What is this, the question are being raised and answered by themselves

from different seats. I think this issue has diverted the attention of the people of the country as well as this House. An hon. Member has made his submission on this. And now when Shri Vajpayee is delivering his speech, other hon. Members are interrupting him. I will give chance to you all. But let a party finish its turn. Please do not rise to speak. Give your name if any of you want to speak on this.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to request you to allow the hon. Members to speak first because we will be their target. Hence, I would like to speak later on.

MR. SPEAKER: i will give you chance to clarify if I find any allegation in their speeches.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: For taking political mileage and creating misunderstanding this discussion will be central upon us. So please either allow me or allow any of my colleagues to speak later on. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I will give you chance if it is required.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to suggest to hold a full-fledged discussion on this in the Zero-Hour...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat. The same will happen even if a detailed discussion is held.

SHRI CHANDRAJEET YADAV: How can a detailed discussion take place on this?

MR. SPEAKER: Chandrajeet ji, please sit down. Time is being provided to you to express your views on whatever is taking pace here. You may express just your views, it is not a question-answer session. However if discussion is held in detail, then he who begins it will certainly reply to the necessary questions.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: That is what is happening here. We are only publishing it. We are giving coverage to Ekta Yatra. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You do not want any discussion?

(*Interruptions*)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: No, no, do not speak in this way. First of all, take your seats please.

(*Interruptions*)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: I can close the discussion after Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee speaks. Don't you want to take your seats?

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA (Cuttack): I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order. There is no point of order in zero hour. Please understand. Please take your seat.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat. How can you have the cake and eat it too? Either you can have the discussion or you do not have the discussion. Please let me complete. Not like this. It is not the BJP or the Congress Party who started the discussion. It was one of the Members who started the discussion and you wanted to say something and, at the same time, you say that this is the publicity given to it. How can you have the cake and eat it too?

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: The BJP wants to take the entire time of the House for their

party affairs. It is for the benefit of a particular political party.

MR. SPEAKER: I do not know what is for the benefit and what is not for the benefit.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order in zero hour.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: The Prime Minister is calling an All-Party meeting.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: They are supporting the Ekta Yatra. They are a party to the Ekta Yatra. (*Interruptions*)

[Translation]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, he has not raised the publicity issue of the Ekta Yatra. (*Interruptions*)

Mr. Speaker, Sir, there is an alliance between the Congress and the BJP. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Vajpayee ji, please speak. Jena ji please keep silence if you do not want to speak. (*Interruptions*)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not want to speak, I will not insist that you should speak.

(*Interruptions*)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit silently.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Will they hoist flag in Kashmir. (*Interruptions*) After reaching Kashmir they will certainly seek the military protection. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: First, you please sit down. I shall give chance to you also.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: Is it for the first time that the Prime Minister is going to unfurl the national flag? Is not Kashmir a part of India? Why are we discussing this Ekta Yatra here? What is the fun of it? This is not the way.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: Thy want to take the entire time of the House for the benefit of the Party. *(Interruptions)*

[*Translations*]

MR. SPEAKER: Paswanji, when I am on my legs, you should take your seat.

(Interruptions)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, they me wasting time of the House *(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: We are interested in starvation deaths. We are not interested in whatever they do.

SHRI LOKANATH CHOUDHURY (Jagatsinghpur): It is for the Government to give a reply when we raise any matter and not for Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee to give a reply. *(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Paswanji, please sit down.

[*English*]

You please sit down. Don't shout like that. Shri Srikanta Jena, you are the Whip of your Party. You should decide what to do. Now please let me know whether your Party

wants to participate or not.

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: We are interested to discuss about the starvation deaths. We are not interested to discuss about a particular party's programme in this House.

MR. SPEAKER: I take it that you do not want to speak.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

SHRI DEVENDRA PRASAD YADAV: Mr. Speaker, Sir, there is an issue of the farmers before us. We want to discuss on the issue. *(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: It is not a party office. This is the House. I submit before you, never allow a party's programme to be discussed in this august House.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Srikanta Jena, I will go out and then you will have no opportunity to speak. Not like this.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: You, please sit down, Lodha ji you also resume your seat. Please do not speak together.

(Interruptions)

[*English*]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: I am not interested in this discussion.

MR. SPEAKER: You may not be interested but the House is interested. Yes, I am allowing you, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, please continue.

(Interruptions)

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to know whether you are allowing a discussion on it or not...*(Interruptions)*... I have no objection if there is no discussion on it in the House.

MR. SPEAKER: I will just consult.

...*(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI GHULAM NABIAZAD): We are not for any discussion as far as this particular subject is concerned.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The Minister wants to make a statement.

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: As far as this subject is concerned, we are not for any discussion. I do not know what Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee is talking. I am just mentioning about the discussion. We are not for any discussion.

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA (South Delhi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, please allow a discussion on it...*(Interruptions)*...

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMAR-MANGALAM): Sir, I think this is the Zero Hour. We should put the Record straight. At the moment there is no discussion going on.

This is the Zero Hour. When the matter was raised by the hon. Member Shri K.P. Unnikrishnan, it was responded to by Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee and in the process there is no question of any discussion going on. I said that there are certain points of reference to the Government for which we are willing to clarify and answer because he mentioned specifically that he had not received any invitation. The Leaders of the Parties were invited. Shri Lal K. Advani was invited in his capacity as the Leader of the BJP Legislature Party in Parliament. He found it difficult to attend the meeting. Yesterday, the Prime Minister had told him, if he knew that he could not attend the meeting as he had to catch the flight, he could have asked somebody else to attend the meeting. Very sweetly, the prime Minister said that he could have asked Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee to come. Those who were not present asked the other party leaders to come. He could have come if he wanted to come. But, for him to say now that he was waiting for the invitation is externally unfair. *(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to say something about it. Please listen to me.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: But your party does not want it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV: I have written to you on a different subject...*(Interruptions)*...

[*Translation*]

Sir, please listen to me first. I have also given a notice.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Let me straight the matter.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: If the House distress a discussion on this subject, we are ready. If it is not to be discussed... (Interruptions)...

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have also written on the same subject, but the point is different. Please listen to me... (Interruptions)...

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down first.

[English]

SHRI LOKANATH CHOUDHURY: I am standing for a long time. I want to make a submission to you to help you.

MR. SPEAKER: After I sit down, you can make your submission. I will allow you to make your submission.

...(Interruptions)...

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

[Translation]

All of you are speaking together and I am all alone to speak with you all.

[English]

You should have some sympathy for the Pressing Officer. You are a very forceful speaking. I am very much impressed by your speeches. Let me have my say first.

...(Interruptions)...

MR. SPEAKER: There is a difference of opinion on this point. I will call the leaders and I will discuss with them. If you want a discussion, I will allow the discussion; if you do not want a discussion, then I will not allow the discussion.

(Interruptions)

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV: That is not the point, Sir.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, my suggestion is that Shri K.P. Unnikrishnan has put a point... (Interruptions)... I want to submit only this that either you expunge the whole proceedings on the Ekta Yatra or listen to me also.... (Interruptions)...

[English]

SHRI A. CHARLES (Trivandrum): Sir, on this point, there should not be any discussion.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Please listen to our party's view also in two lines. (Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: You just follow the procedure. You should not get up and say that is good or that is bad.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I will talk to you. You cannot have the cake and eat it too. Shri Jena said that he is not for a discussion. Then what can I do?

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): Sir, you have called two leaders.

MR. SPEAKER: What is your point of view? Are you ready for a point of view and not for a discussion?

(Interruptions)

SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA (Andaman and Nicobar Islands): Sir, since this point has been raised during the Zero Hour, we also would like to clarify our position.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: If you are expressing

your point of view and if you are not for a discussion, then I will allow others also to express their point of view.

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Sir, I have to submit only two points in this matter... (*Interruptions*)...

[*English*]

SHRI LOKANATH CHOUDHURY (Jagatsinghpur): Sir, I want to make a submission...

MR. SPEAKER: After him, I will allow Shri Lokanath.

SHRI VJAY NAVAL PATIL (Erandol): Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order in Zero Hour. At this time, as you know, everything is out of order.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Why don't you explain to your Members?

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: The B.J.P. had given a call for the Ekta Yatra. I think either the Government of India and the Prime Minister should have taken it seriously before or he should not have taken it seriously. Having called a meeting of all the party leaders, the Prime Minister intentionally gave much importance to the opinions of our colleagues and then he did not take any firm decision on it. It is my charge on Government... (*Interruptions*)...

[*English*]

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: This is totally in contradiction with the views of your Party President. Yesterday, your Party President had appreciated the move of the Prime Minister but you are saying like this. It is quite

contradictory with the view of your Party President. He has gone on record to say that the Prime Minister had made good efforts. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI CHHEDI PASWAN (Sasaram): Mr. Speaker, Sir, for what we are here?

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I want to submit only one thing that the purpose of the Ekta Yatra... (*Interruptions*)... What is the purpose of the Yatra? I never doubt Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee's intention. But I do not know the purpose of this Yatra. I know only this that it has created fear among the people.

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA (Pali): It will vanish soon... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: And the way both the Government and the BJP are going hand in glove with each other, I charge the Government of India for that. It is helping in creating communal atmosphere in the country... (*Interruptions*)... The way the Ayodhya dispute... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK (Buldana): If you want to maintain it, why did your party President attend the meeting?

MR. SPEAKER: Tell that in your speech.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I have to submit only one thing.... (*Interruptions*)... Sir, please ask them to sit. My point is that Kashmir is an integral part of India and no power can separate it from India. So no question arises for flag hoisting by the Prime Minister or anybody else. I request the Congress party and the Central Government to counter such communal activities. We have also started Nyay Yatra since 6th December... (*Interruptions*)... All people should join it if they have courage... (*Interruptions*)... I would like to request that it is the Congress party which allowed to unlock the temple in Ayodhya, to lay foundation and then they... (*Interruptions*)... So save the country from such controversy. the Prime

Minister should either not initiate in this regard and if he does so, he should be firm as a head of the Government of India... (*Interruptions*) It is my charge.

[*English*]

SHRI LOKANATH CHOUDHURY: This matter is raised in the Zero Hour. So there is no question of everybody putting his point of view. It is within your discretion to allow a discussion on this subject or not.

MR. SPEAKER: You convince your own Members first.

SHRI LOKANATH CHOUDHURY: So far as the subject is concerned. I think it is something which will not bring India together, but will divide India. So it is not for the integrity of the country. The slogan given that article 370 should be abrogated is definitely against the sentiment, history and heritage of India. In view of this, the Government should—though the Prime Minister had called an all-Party meeting yesterday—bring a motion, so that the whole House can condemn this Ekta Yatra which will divide India. My submission is that there should be a motion from the Government. If the Government is against this Ekta Yatra, they should make their position clear in the House. I think the whole House will stand behind the Government to restrict this and to keep India's integrity in tact.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. Mr. Joshi, why are you doing so?

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I wrote a letter to you in the morning... (*Interruptions*)...

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, what a nice publicity and he is helping in it.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I did not start it. You

have started it. This is very wrong.....

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: You have accepted it but it is a feeling of heart... (*Interruptions*)...

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Sometime human beings mistakes.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI SRIKANTA JENA: It's all due to publicity on television.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Why do you not control your own Members than?

[*Translation*]

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I had requested you in the morning through a letter.

(*Interruptions*)

Please listen to me. It would not be a good convention to allow as many as eight members of the one party to speak during the zero hour. Some arrests were made yesterday during the visit of Chinese Prime Minister to India and it was not appreciated. After all we have to follow certain rules in the House. There might be difference of opinion on certain issues in the country today because we are passing through a difficult and challenging period and in my opinion revolutionary changes in the world set up are in the offing during this decade. There might be difference of opinion about those changes.

Sir, in my letter, I had submitted that the hon. Prime Minister had convened an All

party meeting regarding Ekta Yatra and in that context... (*Interruptions*)...

MR. SPEAKER: We would discuss the issue in my chamber. It is wrong to discuss the matter in the House for which you have given a notice.

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV: I had given a notice to speak during the zero hour. I had submitted in that letter that it was clear from the Press reports that except B.J.P. all the parties are unanimous that this Ekta Yatra would provoke communalism, create tension and therefore, it should be cancelled, but even then the B.J.P. remained adamant on its decision and the Yatra has begun. I am of the opinion that this Yatra would spread communalism and weaken the country. Our past experience shows that when the B.J.P. organised the Rath Yatra it fanned communalism and tension throughout the country. Similarly, this Yatra has been deliberately organised, merely to draw political mileage and fan communal tension in the country. At an hour when our national unity and Punjab, Jammu and Kashmir and Assam are in danger, the B.J.P. is trying to provoke communal tension in an organised manner determinate to our secularism which is the basis of our national unity.

Through this House, I would like to appeal once again and submit that BJP should cancel this Ekta Yatra in the national interest as such Yatras would lead to communal tension in the country.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Paswan of the front bench has spoken. I am giving an opportunity to Mr. Paswan of the back bench. Let me see how he does.

[*Translation*]

SHRI CHHEDI PASWAN: Mr. Speaker, you are having a debate on a very cheap topic. (*Interruptions*) Please listen to me first. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You must remember that you are speaking in Parliament. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI CHHEDI PASWAN: Please listen to me first. I am astonished to know.....**

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Baseless allegations are being made against a person who is not present in the House to answer it. This should be expunged from the proceedings of House.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: Mr. Speaker, Sir, these words should not form proceedings of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: It would be very difficult if we have to expunge major portions of the proceedings of the House.

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: This is against the dignity of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: The words that are against the dignity of the House would be expunged.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SIVAJIPATNAIK (Bhubaneswar): Sir, this *yatra* of BJP is objectively aimed against the unity of our country. It has nothing to do with the unity of India. This is in reverse direction. Otherwise, there is no purpose for starting the *yatra* from Kanyakumari to Kashmir. This will pass through fourteen States. They want to divide these States on communal lines.

I was astonished to hear Mr. Vajpayee that the earlier *yatra* of Mr. Advani did not create communal tension. But really this *yatra* created havoc in the country. (*Interruptions*) Now this *yatra* aims at dividing our country on communal lines. So, I urge upon the Government not only to take political

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

measures but also administrative measures.

The earlier yatra paid them some dividends. They think that this yatra will take them to Raj. They are not interested in the unity of the country. (*Interruptions*) They are interested in Raj even if that creates communal tension and bloodshed.

The Government should take both administrative and political measures against their move. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA (Madhubani): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I don not claim to know each and every thing, but I would like to raise this point.

MR. SPEAKER: You raise very good points, but please be brief.

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA: I would like to submit that BJP President Shri Joshi has invited the Prime Minister to participate in Ekta Yatra. Just now Shri Vajpayee has also invited all parties to take part in it... (*Interruptions*) Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to urge all political parties which have been invited by Shri Vajpayee to participate in the Ekta Yatra to cancel the proposed yatra today and jointly discuss the measures which should be taken in interest of national unity, otherwise it would fan communalism throughout the country. Though their objectives may not be bad yet the consequences would be bad. It would be like hitting a goal own side. We should sit together and discuss the measures to strengthen national unity. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow only two Members. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: You can decide who is going to speak.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please allow Mr. Manoranjan Bhakta to speak.

13.00 hrs

[*Translation*]

SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA (Andaman and Nicobar Islands): Mr. Speaker, Sir, just now Shri Unnikrishananji has raised an issue in the house. I welcome his sentiments. The present condition of the country is that the separatist and the Saboteurs are trying to divide the people in the name of caste, language and religion. At this time the Ekta Yatra will pose a danger to unity of the nation. I know that hon. Vajpayeeji is a great patriot and the views expressed by him before the house are not of his own. This is his Party's programme and he has expressed these views under compulsion. I would like to submit that we should issue an appeal to discontinue the yatra immediately for the sake of poor people, for the sake of unity and integrity of the country. It will be a great thing for the unity of the country. This is not a question of prestige of a party and also not a question of lowering the image of party. All the parties are free to carry on their political activities but for the sake of unity of the country all of us must do this work unitedly.

I would like to request that the Ekta Yatra will do a great harm to the country and its unity. Therefore, I would like to request Mr. Vajpayeeji that being a patriot he should think over it and discontinue the Ekta Yatra forthwith ... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI A. CHARLES: Sir, in your wisdom, you gave a ruling that you will call all the party leaders and discuss. This is a correct ruling with which we agree. But fortunately or unfortunately, you have allowed some Members to speak. I share the feelings of my colleague Mr. Manoranjan Bhakta.

MR. SPEAKER: Are you the leader of your party or not? I treat you as the leader of your party.

SHRI A. CHARLES: I plead with the BJP Members that a large number of people say that the B.J.P. should not continue the yatra and if they have decided to continue the yatra, I would ask you one question. Sir, are they abiding by the Constitution of this country under Article 370? they are for abrogating that Article. Before they proceed further with the yatra, they should give an unconditional statement that they respect the Constitution of India and they stand for Article 370 of the Constitution. If they go to Kashmir along with their demand for abrogating that Article, then they will ruin and divide the country. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI E. AHAMED (Manjeri): Sir, thank you very much for providing me an opportunity to express the views of the people whom I represent, namely, the minority community of this country. I may be permitted to express here the deep sense of anguish and resentment against the ekta yatra which the BJP has launched this morning. Sir, may I say that it is not ekta yatra but tootna yatra? It is not for the unity of the country but for disunity. The minority community have their apprehension, fear, consternation and a sense of insecurity of their life, honour and property. We have the bitter experience of what Mr. Advani has shown to this country by undertaking the Ayodha yatra. We know what happened to it.

Sir, here this yatra has the ulterior motive to rouse a strong sense of resentment against the minority community of this country describing them as unpatriotic and anti-national. May I say, with all humility, that nationalism and patriotism is not the monopoly of any party or any section of the people of this country? In the past, the national flag had been hoisted many a time in Kashmir. Why should these people go through Kerala? If it is only to hoist the flag, they could have undertaken the journey from Jammu to Srinagar. Why did they go to Kanyakumari and why should they pass through a State like Kerala where communal harmony has been there for decades in the past? There-

fore, on behalf of the minorities, I express my deep sense of anguish and urge upon the Government to show their secular credentials and stop this yatra forthwith.

SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM: Mr. Speaker Sir, Shri Unnikrishnan has raised this issue because he had expressed certain fears on certain information that he has received about this *Ekta Yatra* being organised by the BJP, specifically mentioning certain information to the extent that he had heard that certain people might be trained in arms. Shri Vajpayee has reacted to that and while reacting, he was very specific in stating that no such plan existed. That is a different question.

I would like to point out that there are reasons why people are a little upset and perturbed over this *Yatra*. It is not a simple *Ekta Yatra* where all parties and all the people are involved in this exercise. If it were so, I can understand it. But that is not their intention. In interviews, the President of the BJP has gone on record to say very categorically what is the objective of this *Yatra*. He has also said in categorical terms that in his feeling, nationalism is synonymous with Hinduism. He has gone further to say that he would like to create an India which is free from appeasement, an India whose polity is based on Ram. So, it is not that this *Ekta Yatra* is totally secular in character. There is such a feeling. This may be wrong reporting which I have seen in the interview that has appeared in the *Hindustan Times* on 8 December. It was a huge interview, covering one full page, where he has come out clearly as to what is the campaign that they are going to conduct. If the campaign was for pure nationalism and unity, then there should be no problem in allowing every body and inviting everybody to participate. On the contrary, yesterday, Shri Advani made it a point to make it clear that his policies vary from ours and that his ideas vary from ours and all the other parties, insofar as what he considers is for the unity of the nation and in the interests of the nation. So, it is very clear that they are going on a political campaign. One would understand it, if the political campaign

was really in the interest of uniting the country. The fears that have been expressed by the House are that this would divide the people, create communal feelings and passions. That is why, an appeal has come from my friends who are on this side. They have to understand and reality this. We have also heard Shri Ahmed, the hon. Member from the Muslim League. Definitely he was feeling quite perturbed and he spoke in anguish. My request to Shri Vajpayee is that he should realise that the *Yatra* is not being looked upon by the minorities as well as a number of people, especially those who have a secular background, as a *Yatra* which is really in the interest of the nation. If the BJP is really interested in the unity of the nation, it should actually withdraw the *Yatra* and think of a move by which all of us, irrespective of our political colour can work together. Let us be very clear on one thing. When we talk of nationalism and integrity of our nation, we should rise above parties and be non-partisan and really work to strengthen the unity of the country.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Allow me to speak Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: Is it necessary?

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Allegations have been made against us so clarification will have to be given. I am saying two or three things...

[*English*]

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRISHNAN: Will you extend the same courtesy to everybody?

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: This allegation is baseless that there is some nexus between BJP and Congress. As a member of the main opposition party, I am

carrying out my responsibilities. It has also been alleged that the Ram Temple in Ayodhya was opened as a consequence of nexus between the two parties. It was not the decision of the Government but of the court to open the lock of the temple. It has also been said that the demand to abrogate Article 370 is against patriotism.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Why are you going into detail? What is the link between Article 370 and the *Yatra*?

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: No, They have said...

MR. SPEAKER: It is not a detailed discussion.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, when Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru was alive and was our Prime Minister then I had moved a resolution in this House for abrogating the Article 370. That was discussed in the House and Communist Members had also supported it. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI A. CHARLES: Sir, they have no respect for the Constitution of India.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: No, I am not yielding.

[*Translation*]

Mr. Speaker Sir, Pandit Nehru had said that Article 370 was losing its relevance and one day it would not have any relevance at all. He did not say that Article 370 would continue for ever nor did he say that on the basis of Article 370 Kashmir was a part of India. Today, these things are being said. There may be difference of opinion, whether the demand to abrogate Article 370 should be raised at this time or not. This may be your opinion. But in our opinion by keeping Article 370 in statute book for so many years we had raised a psychological wall between Kashmir and rest of the country. We have seen

its result so you please do not object to the authenticity of this question. We are ready to hold discussion on Article 370. Now, it is said that the *Yatra* should be suspended. Mr. Speaker Sir, Shri Ram Vilas Paswan can go on a *Nayag Yatra*...

MR. SPEAKER: We are discussing the law and order situation and can also discuss it.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: But I am to give a personal clarification. Our friend Shri Rangrajan has said...

[English]

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE (Panskura): Sir, he has referred to the Communist Members. So, I have a right to reply.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: If, by doing so, every Member is given permission, then how this House will run?

(Interruptions)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I was not waiting for any invitation for tomorrow's meeting but I received a phone call and Mr. Azad, who is sitting here, told me that I had been invited for the meeting so he asked me if I would be coming or not. I said that I had not received the invitation. Then I went to see the hon. Vice President since that appointment was already fixed. Therefore, I was not waiting for the invitation.

Mr. Speaker Sir, I would like to suggest that let us all go together to Srinagar on 26th January to hoist the flag. After completing the programme here in Delhi on 26th January, all the leaders of the political parties can go to Srinagar. The Government can make this programme. We want to go and if you accompany us then we will be glad.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Now papers to be laid.

13.04 hrs

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Annual Report and Annual Accounts of the National Capital Region Planning Board for the year 1990-91

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI SHEILA KAUL): I beg to lay on the table a copy each of the following papers (Hindi and English versions) under section 26 of the National Capital Region Planning Board Act, 1985:-

- (1) Annual Report of the National Capital Region Planning Board for the year 1990-91.
- (2) Annual Accounts of the National Capital Region Planning Board for the year 1990-91 together with Audit Report [Placed in Library See No. LT-918/91]

Annual Report and review on the Working of the Working of the National Co-operative Consumers federation of India Limited, New Delhi

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF CIVIL SUPPLIES AND PUBLIC DISTRIBUTION (SHRI KMALUD-DIN AHMED): I beg to lay on the Table-

- (1) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the National Co-operative Consumers, federation of India Limited, New Delhi, for the year 1990-91 along with Audited Accounts.
- (2) A copy of the review (Hindi and