

Everywhere, there is the question of law and order.

Now, because of this President's Rule in Meghalaya, it is noted that some sort of instability has started there also. When there is tranquillity and when the State is peaceful to some extent, this promulgation will definitely bring some sort of trouble and that will definitely create problems in Meghalaya. In that respect, I appeal that the Government should consider the issue in this light and it should work for the removal of this problem.

There is only one way out and that is the revocation of the President's Rule in Meghalaya and allowing the Members of the Assembly to decide their fate in Meghalaya. Sir, this promulgation of President's Rule in Meghalaya, in my opinion, is very unfortunate, illogical and it is also against all the norms of democracy. The question of Article 356 comes when there is no way out. But in Meghalaya, that was not actually the situation. The Speaker could have very easily solved this problem. But very unfortunately he did not do so. On the fateful day, as per the report of the Governor, there were 30 Members in the Ruling Front and 26 in the Opposition. That should have been accepted by the Speaker. Later, also the verdict of the Supreme Court to uphold the votes of the four Members should also have been accepted by the Speaker. Then, this problem in Meghalaya Assembly would not have arisen at all....

MR. CHAIRMAN: You may continue next time because we have to take up the Half-an-Hour Discussion now.

SHRI KABINDRA PURKAYASTHA: I will continue next time Sir.

17.30 hrs.

HALF-AN HOUR DISCUSSION

Singing of National anthem and National Song

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: We will now take up Half-an-Hour discussion. Shri Ram Naik to speak.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM NAIK(North Bombay): Mr. Chairman, Sir, started question No. 170 regarding singing of National Anthem and National Song Jan Gan Man and Vandemataram was answered in the House on 3rd Decemberr, 1991. Since the question could not be taken up for oral answer in the House, with your permission, I am raising Half-an Hour discussion on it.

This question was raised by Shri. K. H. Muniyappa and Shri Murmtaz Ansari which was answered by the hon. Minister of Human Resource Development Shri Arujn Singh.

Naturally, no supplementary could be put on that question and therefore, I am raising discussion on it in the House.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, first of all I want to draw our attention to the importance of the outline of this question.

Parts(a) and (b) of this question were:

[English]

"(a) Wheether singing or National Anthem and National Song has been discontinued in some educational institutions in the Country;

(b) if so, the reasons therefor;"

[Translation]

The answer of these pants was as follows:

[English]

"Some reports have been received that the practice of collective singing of National Anthem every day in schools has been discontinued or limited to a few occasions in some schools. Apathy is likely to be the main reason for the discontinuance."

[Translation]

Apply has been given as the main

[Sh. Ram Naik]

reason. Part(c) and (d) of the question were:

[English]

"(c) whether the Government propose to make singing of National Anthem and National song in all schools compulsory; and

(d) if not, the reasons therefor?

[Translation]

The answer given by Hon Minister is as follows:

[English]

"The policy of the Government on the singing of National Anthem has been that there should be community singing of the National Anthem in all schools every day. Orders regarding community singing of National anthem in all schools of the country have been issued by the Government of India from time to time. Most recently, in October, 1991, the Ministry of Human Resource Development, Department of Education, addressed all the Chief Ministers and Lieutenant Governors to issue necessary directives for singing of National Anthem in schools. However, no instructions have been issued regarding the singing of National Song, that is the *Vande Matram*."

[Translation]

No instructions have been issued by the Government regarding collective singing of the National song '*Vande Matram*'. I would like to draw your attention to the facts revealed by this answer.

In my opinion, the first fact is that National Anthem '*Jan-Gan-Man*' is not sung in all the schools. The Government thinks that its main reason is apathy. It is a serious fact in itself brought to light by the Government. The second fact is that the

Government issued instructions to the states from time to time regarding singing of the National Anthem. These instructions were issued in October. What was its outcome? We do not see any good result of it.

The third fact is that there is misunderstanding about National Anthem and National Song. The Government has not issued any instructions regarding singing of National Song '*Vande Mataram*'. This answer reveals these three facts.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, the main thing is that 44 years have passed since India got freedom and 41 years have passed since it became a Republic but National Anthem is not sung in all the schools. Bhagat Singh went to the gallows chanting '*Vande Matram*'. Bhagat Singh had said that he would like to be born again in this country and would like to sing '*Vande Mataram*'. Many people sacrifice their lives chanting '*Vande Mataram*'. They all voluntarily sacrificed every theirs. Those brave persons said that they would like to be born once again in this very land. Bhagat Singh showed his patriotic fervour. Do we still have the same feelings for '*Vande Mataram*'? Does the nation has same feeling on for it? How can the nation survive if we do not live in ourselves patriotic feelings? I think this discussion has given us an opportunity to ponder as to where are we going. The nation is on such cross roads that words '*Vande Mataram*' have become significant. I think that we should discuss this issue by rising above party politics and making introspection and sing '*Vande Mataram*'. We should sing '*Jan-Gan-Man*' everywhere. I would like to give some suggestion in this regard.

Not only '*Jan-Gan-Man*' and '*Vande Mataram*' should be sung in schools but we should create a feeling of respect and reverence in the heart of all country men for '*Jan-Gan-Mana*' and '*Vande Mataram*'. And if you want to create such a feeling, it should be sung properly everywhere. Mr. Chairman, Shri Sharad Digheji you belongs to Bombay. You will be surprised to know that the meetings of Municipal Corporation of

Bombay begin with singing of 'Vande Mataram' and end with 'Jan-Gan-Man'. There may be quarrel or anything else in the meeting but meetings begin with 'Vande Mataram' and end with 'Jan-Gan-Man'.

You may be knowing that Maharashtra Legislature also passed a resolution last year in this regard. Now the first sitting of the Legislative Assembly and Legislative Council begin with 'Vande Mataram' and their sittings end with 'Jan-Gan-Man'. Therefore, it is my suggestion that the Lok Sabha too should start its daily business with 'Vande Mataram' and conclude the day with the National Anthem 'Jana-Gana Mana'. Now-a-days, the Question Hour is shown on television. I feel that.

[English]

A message will be communicated.

[Translation]

When the whole country watches the hon. Member standing up and singing 'Vande Mataram'. What's more, our countrymen will also come to know about those people, if at all there are any, who hesitate to say 'Vande mataram'. Thus, my first and foremost suggestion is that singing of 'Vande Mataram' and the National anthem should be made compulsory everywhere.

'Yadyad acharati shreshtha
Tadtad acharati sarvejanab'

[English]

Let us start from ourselves.

[Translation]

Therefore, we should initiate this from here.

Secondly, we have formulated a code of conduct with regard to National anthem, National Song and National Flag, but we have not formulated any to maintain and protect their sanctity. Thus, we find that no penal action is taken against those violating

the sanctity of these National symbols. Therefore, the need of the hour is to replace the code by law, whereby penal action can be taken against those insulting the National symbols.

Thirdly, the National anthem and song are not sung in some schools. Now, there are two kinds of schools—Government aided and private which do not receive any grant from the Government. If these songs are not sung in Government aided schools, then grants given to these schools are concerned, their recognition should be withdrawn. Character building and inculcating a sense of patriotism are the primary concerns of an educational institution and by allowing them to forego the singing of the National anthem and the National song, do we want our schools to chum out traitors? Therefore, the Government should seriously consider the question of withdrawing recognition and stopping grants to such schools.

Here, it has been said that the Government anthem is mostly not sung in English medium schools. The Government should find out such schools and take stringent action against them. There should not be two opinions that 'Vande Mataram' the National song and 'Jana-Gana-Mana' the National anthem are venerable as purns. Let us take a unanimous resolve to see to it that the whole country reverberates with the rhythms and tunes of our National Song and National Anthem. I would like to get a response from the hon. Minister with regard to the role, the Government intends to play, the direction the Government intends to the entire nation in this regard. With these words, I thank you very much.

DR. LAXMINARAYAN PANDEYA
(Mandsaur): Mr. Chairman, Sir, a very important issue regarding the neglect of the National anthem and the National song has been raised here. This neglect is evident from the fact that the National anthem is not being sung in those schools, where it was once part of the daily routine. The hon. Minister himself has accepted this fact. Further, the hon. Minister has not answered

[Dr. Laxminarayan Pandeya]

as to why it has not been made compulsory. The singing of National anthem in the schools should be made mandatory, even if that requires the enactment of a law.

Gradually this practice is being done away with. Earlier, the National anthem was sung in each and every school, but now this practice is no more in vogue. This neglect is largely due to indifference. This indifference is bound to grow, if serious attention is not paid towards it at this stage. It is necessary to take some concrete steps to uphold the dignity of the National anthem, otherwise we won't be able to bring about the much needed emotional integration and instill a feeling of written letters to the Chief Ministers and Lieutenant-Governors, in the month of October. Now, I have with me a copy of the December 8 issue of 'Panchajanya' in which certain things published in the November 24 issue of the 'Radiant' weekly, belonging to the Jamaat-e-Islami, have been quoted. It is vehemently critical of the Madhya Pradesh and Karnataka Governments and the Lt-Governor of Delhi for issuing circulars in this regard, for the second time. They have questioned as to where from has this 'Vande Mataram' dropped? They have precisely used these words. Some action should be taken against such anti-national write-ups. They have said very unsavoury things.

Lastly, I would like to say that the National national unity, through these soul-stirring songs.

The Government should definitely withdraw recognition of such schools, where the national anthem is neglected. Similarly, the Government should stop giving aid to the Government aided schools, neglecting the national anthem. It is a very practical suggestion. If the hon. Minister seriously ponders over it, he will realize that it is very essential to make the singing of National anthem mandatory, to instill patriotic feeling among the masses. We should have the highest regard for the National anthem. It instills in us a sense of unity and oneness.

Similarly, the singing of National anthem should be made mandatory in official functions, graced by the hon. Minister. Similarly, it should be sung on special occasions as well. Day before yesterday, I had gone to attend a function, where the hon. Vice-president was also present. Unfortunately, the National anthem was not sung there. I was very much surprised and felt that if it is ignored even in much important functions, then certainly, it would be neglected by the common man too. This indifference and neglect should be done away with, through whatever means possible. I want to submit only this much in this regard.

SHRI B.L. SHARMA PREM (East Delhi):
Sir, in this regard, I would like to ask only this much whether the National anthem or National song are sung in all the schools in Kerala? Have Muslim students refused to sing the National anthem or the National Song in any of the schools? Have there students been asked to recite verses from the Holy Koran in place of the National anthem? In this regard, Shri Ram Naik had said that recognition should be withdrawn and aid should be stopped to those schools. Where the National anthem is not sung. I would like to say that this is such an important issue that there should be no compromise on it and apart from the aforesaid measures, such schools should be closed. The hon. Minister has mentioned at the end of his reply that.

[English]

"However, no instructions have been issued regarding the singing of the National Song."

[Translation]

My question is, why no instruction has been issued regarding the singing of the National Song?

SHRI SANTOSH KUMAR GANGWAR (Bareilly): Mr. Chairman, Sir, Shri Ram Naik has brought forward a very important topic

for discussion before the House and he entire nation. I don't want to say much.

Fe years back, about 15,000 students had gathered in Jammu to tell the world about our national identity. Where is our identity, if we can't hoist our national flag on our soil?

I was reading in a newspaper that in Punjab some organisations have issued statements to the effect that the National Anthem cannot be sung there and if anybody sings the National Anthem, stern action would be taken against him. We should ponder over these matters seriously. Through you, I would like to ask from the hon. Minister whether there is a need to enact law in this regard as has been said just now. I have seen many schools where National Anthem or National Song is probably not sung nor has such practice been in vogue there. The practice of singing National Anthem is coming to an end. As he has suggested, we should think over it whether to sing National Anthem at the commencement of the proceedings of the House as also at the end of it. I would like to urge upon the hon. Minister to state categorically before the House that action would be taken against those who would violate the Government's instructions in this regard. Mere complaints will not do. Effective measures should be taken to make the people realise its importance.

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Gandhi Nagar):
Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. Education Minister and the Government to the announcement made on the subject by Dr. Rajendra Prasad, President of the Constituent Assembly. However, controversy was going on and at one stage it was proposed to pass the Resolution. But on the 24th January, 1950, when the Constitution was adopted completely, Dr. Rajendra Babu, in his capacity of as President of the constituent Assembly, had announced expressing the sentiments of the entire House which I quote:-

[English]

"The composition consisting of the words and music known as '*Jana Gana Mana*' is the National Anthem of India subject to such alterations in the words as the Government might authorise, as occasion arises"

and further he says,

"And the song '*Vande Mataram*' which has played a historic part in the struggle for Indian freedom shall be honoured equally with *Jana Gana Mana* and shall have equal status with it."

[Translation]

The word "apprise" is written there. The announcement was welcomed and the controversy whether the National Anthem should be *Vande Mataram* or *Jana Gana Mana* was thus resolved by the Constituent Assembly. It termed the one as National Anthem and the other as National Song. It was announced by the President that both shall have equal status. I think that Legislative Assembly of Maharashtra and similar Legislatures, where proceedings are commenced with the one and concluded with other, also honour the announcement of giving equal status to both in this manner. Therefore, the answer was given to the question on that day. Accordingly, in the beginning, the Government of India has announced it again as a matter of its policy. It is our policy and we would also like that the National Anthem may be sung in all the schools collectively. I consider it appropriate and welcome it. But as he states in his last sentence.

[English]

However, no instructions have been issued regarding the singing of the National Song."

[Translation]

Gives an impression as if we are not keeping in view the announcement made by the Constituent Assembly. I submit that it may be kept in mind.

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI ARJUN SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am very grateful to the hon. Member that he has drawn the attention of the House to this important issue. Had it come up during the Question Hour on that day, many points would be clarified. But the question did not come up for reply and the hon. Member has raised this question here through this procedure. I thank him very much for it.

Shri Advaniji has mentioned here about the assurance given in the Constituent Assembly. There can't be two opinions in stating that the song of *Vande Mataram* and the inspiration received from it has been unique and inspiring aspects of Indian freedom struggle. That is why to sing the *Vande Mataram* is always proper and appropriate. We should sing the *Vande Mataram* wherever possible. As far as the House is concerned, only the hon. Speaker can consider the suggestion made by the hon. Member. We would welcome the decision taken by him in this regard.

There is some confusion in defining the National Song and the National Anthem. It is clear in English but in Hindi—(Interruptions)

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI: There will be difference of languages. ... (Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK: He has termed the National Anthem as 'Rashtra Gan' and the National Song as 'Rashtria Geet'. (Interruptions)

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: Many many thanks. This is the question. It has created some confusion. The nation has been clearly defined in the Constitution. I would like to tell the hon. Member that a law has already been enacted in this regard. The law is enforced in cases where there is dishonour to the National Anthem or any other thing is said against it. The law is there and it is in existence. The law can be and will be enforced only when such a situation arises. I would like to assure the House in this respect.

As far as the National Song is concerned, no law is there since it has no compulsory

aspect. Some people don't consider it and they do not sing it. But I fully agree to the sentiments expressed in the House. As hon. Dr. Rajendra Prasad had announced at that time that the honour and status of *Vande Mataram* have been associated with the sentiments which were the source of inspiration for all the freedom fighters of the country for which they laid down their lives and attained independence. In this way the National Song should be honoured but we can't enforce it through law. So far as their sentiments about schools, as to how did it happen, are concerned, I don't want to go into it as it does not relate to a particular person or a particular Government. Also we don't want to blame anybody. The problem is that whatever national feeling should have been there over the years is not there. If we could inculcate such national feeling among people in proper way and are able to display such feeling in the country, everything will be alright. That feeling is hurt sometimes. How to keep this feeling unhurt is the question. All the political parties should make joint efforts to create an atmosphere in the country in which the society itself may boycott those who do not honour National Anthem or National Song. We should not depend upon laws only.

This matter has been brought to my notice by many people. Earlier also, the Central Government had written to the State Governments from time to time. When the matter was brought to my notice about the deteriorating situation, I had again written to the Chief Minister. I take pleasure in informing the House that all the States have accepted its importance, priority and essentiality without any exception. All the Chief Ministers have issued directions once again that the National Anthem must be sung in all the schools.

I expect that the determination of all the hon. Chief Ministers would enable the States to make the singing of the National Anthem compulsory as we all desire. I think that there is no need to speak more on the subject. I have all regards to the point raised by Shri Advaniji and we would try to proceed in that direction. But I want to make it clear

that we can't take any legal action in this matter. We can secure the National Song its due place only by further strengthening the national feeling among the people. Ours is the same objective, the same effort and the same resolution. We can achieve success in this direction only by our joint efforts in inculcating a national feeling among the countrymen and only then nobody will have any complaint.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House now stands adjourned to meet again tomorrow.

17.58hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Tuesday, December 10, 1991/Agrahayan 19, 1913(Saka)