

portfolio here, and create complications for the projects. The point here is...  
(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Put the question.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : Now the question is : in part (b) of the answer it is said that the forest officer sent by the Bangalore institute has himself pleaded for the clearance of the project. (*Interruptions*) Part (b) of the answer says that the forest officer sent by the Bangalore institute has recommended the clearance of the project. So, would Central Government agree not to trifle with the details, and clear the project immediately ?

[*Translation*]

SHRI BHAJAN LAL : Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member without going deep into any subject gets easily provoked. He has mentioned Haryana here, what can I say about that. He is perhaps suffering from Haryana-phobia, of which I am not aware. I can only say this ...  
(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : You should not speak like this.

SHRI BHAJAN LAL : He has rightly said that the foundation stone of the project was laid by Pandit Jawahar Lal Nehru in 1956 and it was completed in 1966. So far as the question of the time gap between 1966 to date is concerned, the right canal had long back been dug but for the left canal they sent the scheme to us between 1982 and 1984-85. I do not know how he said that the Congress Party was in power during that period. I want to ask him what did the other Government do which also remained in power in between ? However, I can say that after receiving the reply from the State Government we shall decide the issue within a week.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : What happened in between can also be replied to by the hon. Minister because in the Janata regime also he was a Chief Minister.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : Next question No. 329-Mr. Kali Prasad Pandey is not here. Question 330-Mrs. Usha Chowdhury is not present. Now question 331. Mr. Kollandaivelu.

#### Forest clearance for welfare projects in States

\*331. SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : Will the Minister of ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS be pleased to state :

(a) the names of States which have applied for forest clearance for various welfare projects to be implemented in those States;

(b) whether Union Government have cleared those proposals; and

(c) if not, the reasons therefor ?

[*Translation*]

THE MINISTER OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI BHAJAN LAL) : (a) All the State Governments except Jammu & Kashmir, have sent proposals for diversion of forest lands for various projects. The Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980 does not extend to Jammu & Kashmir.

(b) and (c) Of 2265 proposals received till 31.10.1986, Government of India have approved 1075 proposals and rejected 382. Twenty-eight proposals were withdrawn by the State Governments. 734 proposals are closed in the Ministry on account of non submission of essential information asked for from the State Governments. Only 46 proposals are pending with the Government of India. Decisions on closed cases will be taken on receipt of required information from the State Governments. Of the 46 pending cases, in 31 cases information has been sought

from the State Government less than three weeks ago and hence the cases are treated as pending. Seven cases are under the consideration of the Advisory Committee. The balance of eight cases are ready for issue of orders.

[*Translation*]

SHRI BHAJAN LAL : Mr. Speaker, Sir, barring Jammu and Kashmir, all the State Governments have sent their proposals for diversion of forest lands for various projects. The Forest (Conservation) Act, 1980 does not extend to Jammu and Kashmir.

[*English*]

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : Sir, I want an answer in English.

MR. SPEAKER : He cannot.

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I am unable to get the correct answer.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : He cannot. Mr. Kolandaivelu, if he cannot answer in English.....

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : The other Minister is also here...

MR. SPEAKER : No; it is not possible.

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : My question is in English.

MR. SPEAKER : Does not matter.  
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I want an answer in English. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Order...Order please. What is this ?

[*Translation*]

Why are you disturbing ? Please be seated.

[*English*]

It is my job. It is not your job.  
(*Interruptions*)

MR. KOLANDAIVELU, you must understand..... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : He always does the same thing when the question of Hindi comes.

MR. SPEAKER : That is my job which you want to do.

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : That is very bad.

MR. SPEAKER : Presently, you are interrupting. You are making it difficult for me to do my job.

[*English*]

Please.....will you take your seat ?

[*Translation*]

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : We are ready to bear anything but we cannot bear the opposition of Hindi.

MR. SPEAKER : Either you come here.....(*Interruptions*).....You are not letting me hear.

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : Sir, it is the question of protecting Hindi.

MR. SPEAKER : On the issue of the protectors of Hindi like you, I shall come to it later.

[English]

MR. RAI, it is my job to do it (*Interruptions*) Mr. Kolandaivelu, the point is ; you are free to ask any question in English or Hindi. The Minister is also free to answer that in Hindi or English. So, there is no question about it. There is no question; not at all. (*Interruptions*) It is a complete freedom both for you as well as for him. There is no discrimination. No...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : The question is in English. I want the answer in English only.

MR. SPEAKER : Does not matter.

Will you please adhere to the principle ? It is my ruling and I do according to what the rules you have laid down. I do not discriminate; I do not differentiate; nothing doing. No.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I want an answer in English.

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot.

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I am sorry. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Kolandaivelu, please listen. It is not for you alone; it is for all, for everybody; for everybody in the House, if he may like to speak in English, he is free.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Mr. Kolandaivelu, listen to the translation. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It is not your job. You keep silent. It is his right to have differences; it is my right to give the ruling. (*Interruptions*)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : What for are you quarrelling ?

[English]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Translation will be available here.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI RAJIV GANDHI) : If I may just comment for the hon. members, Sir, it is equally difficult for one of our Ministers who perhaps does not know English so well to answer a question in English. So, if we go by this sort of precedent then it will be very difficult to answer questions properly. So, I beg to say that we should stick to the procedure that has been established.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It is *vice versa*; it is both ways. Now I have my Ministers who cannot speak in Hindi.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : The English translation is better than Hindi.

(*Interruptions*)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Will you please keep silent ?

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I want your protection.....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : You put your question.

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I will put my question in English and I want an answer in English. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : He cannot do it. I have given my ruling and you know the rules. Don't try to violate them.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : You are doing a very wrong thing.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : Will you please understand this ? It is both ways.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Is this a talking shop here ? Will you keep silent ? The question is that it must be understood. Mr. Saifuddin, I am saying something which is simple and straightway; it is as good for you as for any other one. So, it might put other members into difficulties as the Prime Minister did point out; and it should be as the norms we have; our norms are very good and they are working perfectly all right and they are going to be adhered to; and I am not going to budge an inch from them, whatever you may say.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : I will ask my question in Tamil then.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order !

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : All the languages are recognised; all the 14 languages are recognised. Then I will put my question in Tamil. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : There is no problem. He can ask his question in Tamil. There is a translation in Hindi and English. (*Interruptions*)

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : All right, all right. As there is a solution for every problem I do not mind if you raise any subject which I can settle and I will always settle according to the rules.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Will you please keep silent ?

If you give me a notice, I will get the answers. You put the question in Tamil. I will get the answers; as it is.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH) : Under the rules it is decided.

MR. SPEAKER : It is always so. You see, 24 hours notice is to be given if anybody has to put a question in a regional language. That is there.

S. BUTA SINGH : Not for Question Hour.

PROF. N. G. RANGA : Whether it is Question Hour or any time.

MR. SPEAKER : If that is so, I will go according to what the rules are. So simple it is. I am not going to budge an inch.

PROF. N. G. RANGA : We have to give notice.

MR. SPEAKER : I will go according to what the rules are. But I am not going to break any rule at any cost, whatever it may be. That is simple. Put the question in English now.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : You change the rules. (*Interruptions*)

All the languages have equal right.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : That is not the way.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Acharia, you are supposed to be a leader, You must know what you are talking about.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : He should be allowed to put a question in his language.

MR. SPEAKER : You must be knowing what you say. Have you really studied some rules ?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA : You change the rules.

MR. SPEAKER : That is something else. That is not practicable now. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Why to divide more and more ?

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : You please tell me. Supposing I am getting an answer in English I put my supplementary; otherwise I will not.

MR. SPEAKER : That is your choice. I cannot help it. There is no question. There is no binding. There cannot be any binding.

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : You are denying my right. You are denying my right.

MR. SPEAKER : I am not denying any right. I am doing... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : The other Minister is here. He may be able to tell me in English.

MR. SPEAKER : No. No. question. I will not make... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I will not impose anything, I will impose what is enshrined in the rules.

SHRI P. KOLANDAIVELU : This is discrimination over the language. this is discrimination.....*(Interruption)*

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing doing. Whatever the hon. Member is saying..... *(Interruptions)*

Shri Narsing Suryawansi. Absent.

SHRI C. Janga Reddy. Absent

Dr. A. K. Patel.

DR. A. K. PATEL : Question No. 333.

*(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENTS OF OCEAN DEVELOPMENT, ATOMIC ENERGY, ELECTRONICS AND SPACE (SHRI K. R. NARAYANAN): Give me one minute. The answer got misplaced, I have got it here. Sorry.

AN HON. MEMBER : He is looking for Hindi copy.

AN HON. MEMBER : He is searching for the Hindi translation.

**Comparative operational cost of NPP nuclear power plants and hydel plants**

+

\*333. DR. A. K. PATEL :

SHRI C. JANGA REDDY :

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state :

(a) the capital cost and also the operational cost per KW of nuclear power stations at Tarapur, Rajasthan, Kalpakam and the estimated ones of Narora;

(b) how do these compare with those of the thermal and hydel power stations; and

(c) whether Government propose to review the policy of setting up more nuclear power plants in view of steep rise in capital as well as operational costs of nuclear power stations vis-a-vis thermal and hydel power stations ?