

hon. Finance Minister had said that it was easy to fix prices but it was very difficult for Government to see that things were sold at the prices fixed. That would amount to a confession on the part of the Government that they are unable to control the prices. The hon. Minister said that there were other methods. I would like to know what other methods he has under contemplation, which may be very effective in pegging down the prices.

**Shri Morarji Desai:** I said that other methods had to be found.

#### SHORT NOTICE QUESTION

#### Use of Staff Cars for Presidential Election purposes

**S.N.Q. 5. Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Will the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs be pleased to state:

(a) whether any transport of the Department of Parliamentary Affairs was sent to the Railway stations and to the Airports to bring Congress Party Members for voting in the Presidential elections that took place on the 6th May, 1967;

(b) whether the log books of the Department record the time and hour of the transport and whether the Minister will lay on the Table copies of the entries in the log book; and

(c) whether any officer or member of the staff of the Department of Parliamentary Affairs was deputed to attend some Congress M.Ps. at the stations on that day?

The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and Communications (**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh**): (a) to (c). The staff car of the Department of Parliamentary Affairs was not utilized to transport any Member of Parliament for voting in the Presidential elections that took place on 6th May, 1967. An officer of the Department was, however, asked to see that necessary arrangements were made for the hospitalization of **Shri C. D. Gautam** who was ailing from multiple fractures.

That Officer travelled by the staff car from Parliament House to Willingdon Hospital and thereafter to the Railway Station to see that the Member was given medical attendance at the Railway Station. A copy of the entry in the log book relating to the travel of the officer from Parliament House to the Willingdon Hospital and the Railway Station and back is placed on the Table of the House. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-495/67].

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** May I know whether it is not a fact that another member of the staff, **Mr. Bakshi**, was also sent to the railway station to receive Congress MPs coming for voting?

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** It is not a fact.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** May I know whether any staff car was sent to the Palam airport to bring some Members of the Congress Party for voting on the 6th May?

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** That is a white lie. That is not a fact.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** What is a black lie?

**Shri Tenneti Viswanatham:** It is un-Parliamentary.

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** Lie is not parliamentary. He should withdraw it.

**Mr. Speaker:** It will be corrected as "it is not true".

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy:** He must withdraw it, or it should be expunged.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** I am prepared to withdraw it if it is unparliamentary, but he should be prepared not to state things which have no relationship with any truth.

श्री मधु लिम्बे : किन्तु परन्तु का सवाल नहीं है। क्या मंत्री महोदय इसको वापस लेते हैं ?

Mr. Speaker: It may not be true, but to say it is not true is equally emphatic, instead of saying it is a white lie.

Mr. Ram Subhag Singh: I am guided by you.

Mr. Speaker: I am glad you are guided by me.

Mr. Surendranath Dwivedy: Has he withdrawn it.

Mr. Speaker: Yes.

श्री मधु लिम्बे : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि राष्ट्रपति के चुनाव के दौरान में केन्द्र सरकार ने अपने दूरों को अपने नुमायंदों को मतदाताओं पर प्रभाव डालने के लिए या उस से अनुचित ढंग से वोट दिलवाने के लिए सरकारी खर्च से कितनी जगहों पर भेजा था। क्या मंत्री महोदय इस का ब्यौरा सदन के सामने रखेंगे।

श्री रामसुभग सिंह : श्रीमन् माननीय सदस्य श्री मधु लिम्बे का मैं बड़ा आदर करता हूँ।

श्री मधु लिम्बे : मंत्री महोदय प्रश्न का उत्तर दें।

श्री राम सुभग सिंह : वह बहुत गूढ़ गूढ़ विषयों का अच्छा अध्ययन करते हैं। वर उन के अध्ययनमें एक बहुत बड़ी कमी है। उन को मालूम होना चाहिए कि कांग्रेस संसदीय दल के मुख्य सचेतक का एक पद है और संसदीय-कार्य मंत्री का दूसरा पद है। मुख्य सचेतक की अपनी कुछ हैसियत होती है। इन दोनों पदोंमें जो फर्क है उस का अनुमान कर के ही माननीय सदस्य को जवाब चाहिए। मैं बिल्कुल स्पष्ट रूप से कहना

चाहता हूँ कि सरकार का एक पैसा भी राष्ट्रपति के चुनाव में हमारी धीर से खर्च नहीं किया गया और न ही सरकारी 'खर्च' पर एक भी आदमी कहीं भेजा गया।

श्री राम सेवक यादव : एक पैसा नहीं उस से कहीं ज्यादा खर्च हुआ होगा।

श्री राम सुभग सिंह : श्री यादव के मिनिस्टर लोग जैसे करते हैं वैसे हम नहीं करते हैं।

श्री श्री टेलीफोन का खर्च होगा वह मेरा व्यक्तिगत होगा।

श्री मधु लिम्बे : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे प्रश्न का जवाब नहीं दिया गया है। मैंने श्री राम सुभग सिंह के बारे में व्यक्तिगत रूप से नहीं पूछा है। मैंने कुल सरकार के बारे में पूछा है।

श्री राम सुभग सिंह : मैं सरकार के बारे में ही कह रहा हूँ।

श्री बलराम मधोक : मंत्री महोदय ने कहा है कि वह मुख्य सचेतक भी हैं और मिनिस्टर आफ पार्लियामटरी एफेयर्स भी हैं। एक मंत्री के नाते उन को जो स्थान मिलता है जो प्रतिष्ठा और ताकत मिलती है, यदि वह उच्च का उपयोग चुनाव में प्रभाव डालने के लिए करते हूँ तो क्या यह उन की आफिशियल ताकत का दुरुपयोग नहीं है? वह केवल मुख्य सचेतक रहे मिनिस्टर न रहें या वह मिनिस्टर रहे और मुख्य सचेतक न रहें। जब प्रधान मंत्री कुछ करती हैं तो वह व्यक्तिगत नहीं है। इस नाते उन्होंने जो कुछ किया है क्या वह सरकारी शक्ति का दुरुपयोग नहीं है।

श्री राम सुभग सिंह : श्री मधोक को यह जानना चाहिए कि वह मंत्री का पद इस

सिए मिला कि काबेंस में अपनी एक हेलिकप्टर और प्रविष्टा है। मैं समझता हूँ कि मंत्री के जाने मुझे कोई प्रविष्टा नहीं मिली है और मैं ही इस के उपयोग का प्रश्न उत्पन्न होगा।

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** The hon. Member has stated that the car was not used, only one officer was sent. I would like to know whether it is a fact that some of the Congress Members who wanted to come by plane wrote a letter to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs in his capacity of Mukhya Sachetak that conveyance should be provided to them? I want to know how many white elephants were brought for voting.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** I am prepared to reply to that. Nobody wrote to me that he should be provided plane facilities, nor was there anybody acting as an elephant in the way Mr. Banerjee acts.

**Shri Hem Barua:** The hon. Minister has admitted that conveyance was provided to an hon. Member of the Congress Party to come and participate in the Presidential election, because he was ailing. May I know whether the gentleman concerned asked for this conveyance from the Minister concerned, or it was provided on his own account, and if he was a member of any opposition party, would he have been provided with the same kind of facilities?

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** Mr. Hem Barua was once ill in hospital, and I do not know whether he remembers it or not, but one of my colleagues not only went to see him as Minister but also sent him books he required. I myself paid visits to persons about whom I came to know that they were ill in hospital.

**Shri Hem Barua:** I am grateful. The Prime Minister sent me some books to read.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** Therefore, the hon. Member must know that nobody wanted or wants anything from anybody. I consider—I am prepared to be guided by only opposition members if you don't think it worthwhile—that if any Member of Parliament is ill, he should be looked up.

**Shri Tenneti Visvanatham:** The hon. Minister has said that he sent his staff car for the Presidential election. We were not even given travelling allowance. We came on our own.

**Shri M. R. Krishna:** All of us.

**Shri Tenneti Visvanatham:** I said we; it includes you. Was it not possible for the hon. Minister to find a private car for the other gentleman. The second point is that the charge is not that he misused, but that he used the staff car.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** Actually I must state it categorically that even that ailing member, who had got so many fractures, on his body, was not transported by this staff car. He had managed his own transport, and I am not going to be as dishonest as the member....

**An hon. Member:** .... suggests. (Interruptions).

**Mr. Speaker:** He means, as the member suggests. His point was that he is not as dishonest as the member suggested.

**Shri Hem Barua:** He did not say that. He said "as the member" and stopped there. He should have concluded the sentence.

**Shri Tenneti Visvanatham:** I did not hear what he said.

**Mr. Speaker:** He says that he is not as dishonest as the member suggests.

**Shri Tenneti Visvanatham:** I have not suggested any dishonesty.

**Mr. Speaker:** Then it is all right.

**Shri Tenneti Viswanatham:** I have only suggested that he used the car, not that he misused the car.

**Shri Kandappan:** In view of the confusion created in the minds of the members as well as the people outside due to the dual role of the hon. Minister, as Minister and as Chief Whip of congress group in Parliament and also in view of the fact that any number of white caps are available in their own party, I would like to know whether the Government is prepared to appoint different dignitaries for these different posts.

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** They have these dignitaries in their parties, even in the DMK.

**Shri Kandappan:** This is no answer. This is a vital question. Is the Government prepared to consider—

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. I am sorry. I am proceeding to the next item.

**Shri Ranga:** Mr. Speaker, will the hon. Minister concerned collect the information and afterwards supply it, namely, as to how many parliamentary committees were convened two or three days before that fateful 6th, or three or four days after that, so that Members would find it convenient to go over here and draw their allowances also, and at the same time, attend their party meetings and get themselves briefed?

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** As you know, there are three financial committees and some other committees, and one of the Chairman of the three financial committees, a former leader of the Swatantra party, who has succeeded my most esteemed colleague, Feroz Ranga, had perhaps called a meeting of the PAC, but I do not know the details. I will find out the exact position and lay it on the Table of the House.

**Shri Ranga:** The hon. Minister has got into the wrong habit of saying wrong things and in the most objectionable manner. I wanted him to

collect information. Am I to understand that it was only the PAC which was convened here or were there any other committees also? I would like to have information in regard to that. (Interruption). Even on an earlier occasion, he had the temerity and the indecency to make those stupid suggestions and objectionable suggestions in regard to the question put by Shri Viswanatham. If you had not come to his rescue because of his bad English, he would, have been in the soup.

**Mr. Speaker:** The Public Accounts Committee did not meet then, because I nominated the Chairman after I was elected Speaker. I think the PAC met sometimes later. (Interruption).

**Shri Ranga:** I wanted him to take the trouble of enquiring and collecting the information and give it here.

**Dr. Ram Subhag:** I have already said I would give the information. (Interruption).

**Shri Ranga:** He behaves in such an unruly manner....

**Mr. Speaker:** He may give the information. I was only giving the information regarding Committees of the House.

**Shri Ranga:** He is behaving in an irresponsible manner. He seems to be the conscience-keeper of the whole Congress.

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. Will you kindly sit down?

**Dr. Ram Subhag Singh:** I am not going to be cowed down like that.

**Shri Ranga:** We would not allow this kind of behaviour.

**Mr. Speaker:** I was giving information regarding Committees of the House. Will you kindly sit down?

**Shri Ranga:** Why does he behave in this manner?