

that. If there is any kind of inconvenience caused to Nepalese traders, it is the same sort of inconvenience as may be caused to Indian traders in the same area...

**SHRI RANGA :** The question is whether any effort is being made to remove those inconveniences.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** When anything is brought to our notice, certainly we look into it, but there is no difficulty in the amount of space available. We learn from the Port Commissioner's report that Nepalese cargo of about 26,000 bales of jute has been lying in the port area outside the Nepalese sheds and sometimes this causes difficulties to others. Having a special jetty or a free port would mean that a lot of area would be rendered useless for Indian cargo without specially helping the Nepalese in any way.

**SHRI D. N. PATODIA :** May I know whether in accordance with the Algiers Charter India is meeting all the requirements needed to be given to land-locked countries?

**SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH :** The facilities that Nepal is getting under the bilateral arrangement are far in excess of what she would be getting under any international convention or agreement.

**SHRI D. N. PATODIA :** In that case, is it true that the demand for free port facility is being pressed now in view of the Algiers Charter?

**SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH :** As I said, this demand for a free port has come from Nepal over and over again, but they themselves are not clear about the demand and they are not clear as to what they want. Again, as I said, their trade is of a very small order and that does not justify a free port.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** May I add, Sir, that these warehouses are rent-free. Any other facility which may be found necessary can certainly be considered. We can discuss these matters between us because our relations are very friendly.

**SHRI BEDABRATA BARUA :** In view of our very delicate relationship with Nepal I do not like to mention where they get their jute from because Nepal does not herself grow any jute. Is it a fact that a lot of Nepal's trade is processed through India? Nepal's trade with China is processed through India. May I know whether that matter has been taken up at UNCTAD? May I also know whether Nepal has requested that type of facility also in relation to trade with Pakistan?

**SHRI SURENDRA PAL SINGH :** I have no knowledge.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** It might have been mentioned as part of the questions raised about land-locked countries.

**SHRI HEM BARUA :** Sir, there is flourishing smuggling in this part of the country. Chinese goods are smuggled to India through Nepal. Then, you know, there is an extensive market for Chinese goods in Eastern India at present smuggled to Nepal. Then, paddy is being smuggled from Calcutta to Nepal and from Nepal to China. Is it the reason or is it a fact that because of this smuggling the Government are unwilling to give additional port facilities to Nepal at present?

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** No, Sir. I have already explained our views regarding additional port facilities. As far as smuggling is concerned, naturally, it is a matter of concern to us and we have mentioned it to them separately.

CORPORATION FOR A.I.R.

+

\*719. **SHRI PREM CHAND VERMA :**  
**SHRI S. C. SAMANTA :**

Will the Minister of INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING be pleased to state :

(a) whether it is a fact that the Informal Consultative Committee of the Information and Broadcasting Ministry was of the firm opinion that A.I.R.

should not be converted into a Public Corporation;

(b) whether it is also a fact that the Consultative Committee recommended that the Director-General of the Corporation should be a publicman of high stature;

(c) whether Government have considered these recommendations and formulated any plan for a new set-up of the A.I.R.; and

(d) if so, the broad details of the proposed set-up?

**THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRIMATI NANDINI SATPATHY)** : (a) The members of the Informal Consultative Committee of the Information and Broadcasting Ministry have generally expressed the view that A.I.R. should not be converted into a public Corporation.

(b) One of the members of the Consultative Committee felt that the Director General of All India Radio should be selected from among eminent public men in the country.

(c) and (d). The views expressed by the members of Consultative Committee are being kept in view while examining the question of the conversion of A.I.R. into an autonomous Corporation on which a decision is expected to be taken shortly.

**SHRI S. M. BANERJEE** : Sir, in her reply the hon. Deputy Minister said that the "Informal Consultative Committee" generally expressed the view. For your information and for the information of the hon. Prime Minister, if she hears me...

**AN HON. MEMBER** : Sir, is it a point of order?

**MR. SPEAKER** : It is not a point of order. He is giving some information to the Speaker.

**SHRI S. M. BANERJEE** : Sir, all Opposition Parties right from the Swatantra Party to the PSP and other small units boycotted this committee on

various grounds. She now says "the Informal Consultative Committee".

**MR. SPEAKER** : Still there is a Committee.

**SHRI S. M. BANERJEE** : It will be a Congress Committee.

**SHRI RANGA** : Let her say "Informal Consultative Congress Committee".

**MR. SPEAKER** : So many people cannot speak at the same time.

**SHRI S. M. BANERJEE** : Sir, I am on my legs.

**SHRI S. KANDAPPAN** : This is a Congress Consultative Committee.

**SHRI S. M. BANERJEE** : If she had mentioned the Congress Consultative Committee, I would have agreed to it, but the entire Opposition has boycotted this. This is very unfair to describe it like that.

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी** : एक पहलू और है। यह जो कमेटीयां हैं यह कोई निर्णय नहीं लेती हैं। इन कमेटीयों के निर्णय लिखे नहीं जाते। किस सदस्य ने क्या कहा यह लिखा नहीं जाता। इसलिए यह बिल्कुल गलत जवाब दिया गया है। कमेटी की बैठकों का कोई रिकार्ड नहीं रहता।

**MR. SPEAKER** : It is very clear. The point is that the Consultative Committee is there. The Opposition groups are not functioning in it.

**SHRI RANGA** : Therefore, how can it be a Consultative Committee? It can only be a Congress Committee.

**MR. SPEAKER** : You may not agree with it. The Ministry may not accept its recommendation. Whether they have accepted its recommendation or not in spite of the Opposition not being in the Committee, we will find out through supplementaries. That is exactly the information we will get during the Question Hour.

**SHRI S. KANDAPPAN** : If all kinds of informal things are admitted on the question paper, I am afraid, anything might be taken up.

**MR. SPEAKER :** You may ask that question.

**श्री प्रेम चन्द वर्मा :** मैं मन्त्री महोदय से जानना चाहता हूँ कि क्या यह सही है कि चन्दा कमेटी ने ए० आई० आर० को पब्लिक कारपोरेशन में तब्दील करने के बारे में जो सिफारिशों की हैं वे एक दूसरे से विपरीत हैं, अगर इन पर अमल किया जाए तो इसका सारा ढांचा एक तमाशा बन कर रह जाएगा ? अगर हाँ, तो उसकी मोटी मोटी सिफारिशें कौनसी हैं, इस पर मन्त्री महोदय रोशनी डालेंगे ?

**THE MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI K. K. SHAH) :** There are about 21 recommendations of the Chanda Committee which have a bearing on the All India Radio being converted into an autonomous corporation. These are under consideration and when the final decision is taken I will place it before the House.

**श्री प्रेम चन्द वर्मा :** क्या सरकार ए० आई० आर० के मौजूदा सेट-अप और पब्लिक कारपोरेशन के दमियान रास्ता निकाल कर ऐसी योजना पर विचार कर रही है जिससे ए० आई० आर० की सेवाओं से और बेहतर सेवाएँ राष्ट्र के लिए दी जा सकें ? अगर हाँ, तो उसका व्योरा क्या है, अगर नहीं तो सरकार कौनसी और किस योजना पर विचार कर रही है और जिस योजना पर विचार हो रहा है उसमें किन किन बातों पर अधिक महत्व दिया जाएगा और इसका अंतिम निर्णय कब तक हो जाएगा ?

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** All these questions which have been referred to are under consideration.

**SHRI S. C. SAMANTA :** Is it not a fact that the Chanda Committee submitted its recommendations long before? I would like to know why Government is delaying in the matter and whether in the mean time opinions of State Governments have been elicited; if so, what are the reactions of the different State Governments.

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I have been informally consulting not only the Chief Ministers but even the Leaders of the Opposition parties. I have talked to some of the friends—though they may not agree with me; that is a different thing—because I want to take advantage of the benefit of the advice of the entire House before taking a decision. Therefore even that objection that was raised here, I am trying to meet by consulting them individually and informally.

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह प्रश्न (क) के जवाब में जो कुछ कहा गया है वह तथ्यों के विपरीत है। विभिन्न मंत्रालयों के साथ जो सलाहकार समितियाँ जुड़ी हुई हैं उन का निर्णय औपचारिक रूप से कहीं भी लिखा नहीं जाता, न सदन में उन निर्णयों को उद्धृत किया जा सकता है। विरोधी दल मांग कर रहे हैं कि यह निर्णय लिए जायें लेकिन संसदीय-कार्य मंत्री या प्रधान मंत्री ने यह मांग स्वीकार नहीं की है। मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि जिस बैठक का हवाला दिया गया है वह बैठक किस तारीख की हुई, उस में कौन कौन से सदस्य उपस्थित थे, उन सदस्यों की अलग अलग राय क्या थी और क्या मंत्री महोदय वह सारी सामग्री सदन की मेज पर रखेंगे ?

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I am prepared to keep the minutes of that meeting on the Table of the House. This meeting was held on 22nd December, 1967. The Members who gave their opinions, their names are : Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya, Shri Prem Chand Varma, (*Interruption*) I am only giving information. Shri K. K. Chatterji, Shri P. C. Mitra, Shri Ram Dhan, Shri B. B. Tiwary, Smt. Paranjpye and Maulana Ishaq Sambhali.

**SHRI RANGA :** Who is he ?

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** He is from the Opposition.

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी :** मेरे सवाल का जवाब नहीं आया। इन सदस्यों ने कमेटी में क्या कहा, वह सदन की मेज पर रखिए ।

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I will lay it.

**SHRI S. KANDAPPAN :** I should express my sense of regret and strong protest against the way in which the Government carries on the affairs of the Consultative Committee. Since the beginning of this year, we have been clamouring that the Informal Consultative Committees should have been treated in a better way, that there should be a record of all that and that it should be paid some serious attention. But the Government has not accepted our demand. Now, they come to say that the Informal Consultative Committee of a handful of Members from the Congress Party have come to a decision and have come to the rescue of the Government and they put the Chanda Committee Report in cold storage. The Report of the Chanda Committee was submitted a few years back. Since then, I do not know what the Government is doing. When the Chanda Committee was appointed, they had gone into all the pros and cons of the A.I.R. *vis-a-vis* the working of the Corporation and all that. Probably, they had contacted all the men of importance and they formulated their decisions on the basis of consultations and contacts with the various people and all that. Now, after a decision has been arrived at and when the Report is before the Government, I would like to know what is it that hampers the Government from making up its mind to implement the recommendations of the Chanda Committee.

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I am obliged to my hon. friend for asking this question. Now, before we take a decision, as I said, we try to consult all sections of the House and even if my hon. friend does not agree that the Consultative Committee represents all the parties which he has a right to say, I am consulting them outside and those who are sitting in the Consultative Committee.... (Interruption) You will have the chance to have a discussion. The implications are being examined by Finance and after they are examined, we will come before the House.

**SHRI S. R. DAMANI :** May I know what would be the implications if the

A.I.R. is converted into an autonomous body like the B.B.C. ?

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** That is also being examined.

**श्री रबि राय :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, पिछले सत्र में इस पर चर्चा हुई थी तो मन्त्री महोदय ने कहा था कि चन्दा कमेटी पर जल्दी कार्यवाही करेंगे, मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि मन्त्री महोदय जो कहते हैं कि विरोधी पार्टियों के साथ बात करते हैं तो वे किन-किन लोगों के साथ बात कर चुके हैं, किन सिफारिशों को करने जा रहे हैं, कब कारपोरेशन बनाने जा रहे हैं और किस समय के अन्दर इन सारी बातों को सदन के सामने रख रहे हैं ?

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** So far as the consultations are concerned, they are with friends but ultimately the responsibility will be ours. I do not want to put anybody into a difficult position. I want to take advantage of their advice but I do not want to shirk the responsibility. So far as the decision is concerned, we are trying our best to expedite it.

**श्री रबि राय :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे सवाल का जवाब नहीं मिला। किन किन विरोधी दलों के नेताओं के साथ उनकी बात चीत हो चुकी है, यह नहीं बताया और इधर-उधर के जवाब दे दिए।

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I have talked to some. It is not desirable that I should give any names here.

**MR. SPEAKER :** He is not prepared to give the names.

**SHRI HEM BARUA :** He does not remember the names.

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I remember them.

**SHRI CHENGALRAYA NAIDU :** In view of the fact that all our Stations are functioning as relay stations—when ever you tune Hyderabad or Vijayawada, it is only relayed from Madras—what is the use of having any Corporation ?

**MR. SPEAKER :** That is not Chanda Committee's Report.

**SHRI NATH PAI :** I would not add to what has already been submitted about our assessment of the working of the Informal Consultative Committees. I think, these Committees are a cruel and a gigantic farce. But this is not the time for it; we are pursuing that with the Speaker in a separate way.

Regarding the recommendation, an impression is being given that the so-called process of consultation is being resorted to till the Government finds enough people to say 'no' to creation of an autonomous body. As my friend, Mr. Kandappan, pointed out, every possible witness was examined by the Committee, and this is one of the unanimous recommendations of the Committee. May I point out as a member of the Committee that some of us had refused to work on it till an understanding, not an assurance, was given by the then Minister of Information and Broadcasting that the recommendations which were unanimous would be accepted—she is smiling in acquiescence. This was the understanding. No assurance was given, but the then Minister of Information and Broadcasting indicated to those of us to overcome our reluctance to join the Committee that the unanimous recommendations would be implemented. Now we are baffled as to what is holding up the Government from implementing this unanimous recommendation.

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** I am glad my hon. friend, Mr. Nath Pai, has said this. Even assuming for the sake of argument that we are taking time to bring round the other members of the Opposition, don't you think that it is a good effort? If I can persuade them, don't you think that it is desirable?

**SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR CHATTERJI :** Is it the contention of the hon. members on the other side that because the hon. members on the other side were not available for consultation in the Informal Consultative Committee,

the Congress members, who gave their advice on the Chanda Committee's Report, are at fault. We have given our considered opinion and we want to ask the hon. Minister whether he is delaying taking a decision only because certain hon. members on the other side refused to give the cooperation which was sought from them.

**SHRI K. K. SHAH :** One of the reasons is that the evidence which was available to my hon. friend, Mr. Nath Pai, is not available to me; otherwise, it would have helped me in consideration . . . . (Interruptions)

**SHRI RANGA :** I think, I would have to request you to take some interest in regard to the way in which our Parliament has to work and make itself more effective so far as its impact on this Ministry is concerned. There had been the tradition here of having Parliamentary Committees, but later on your predecessor agreed to the Government's suggestion that they might be Informal Consultative Committees, and after some time, in the light of our working, we found that they were not satisfactory. Therefore, we had some discussion with the Ministers concerned and in the end, we sent that unanimous Memorandum signed by all the leaders of all the Opposition parties to the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs, but he was not prepared to agree with us. Thereafter, we sent an appeal to the Prime Minister. The Prime Minister has made herself responsible in placing in the President's speech an appeal to the Opposition members to co-operate with them on such issues on which they would like to seek their co-operation. Now . . .

**MR. SPEAKER :** It is a question which has been pending for one year.

**SHRI RANGA :** It has been pending, Sir. I am drawing your attention to this because you have a role to play as Speaker in order to enable us to play our role as effectively and as democratically as we possibly can. Here were our friends, Shri Nath Pai and others, who were unwilling to co-ope-

rate and join that committee. But an understanding was reached between them and the then Minister in charge...

MR. SPEAKER : That is what Shri Nath Pai has said.

SHRI RANGA : I am drawing your attention to that. An understanding was reached between them and the then Minister that wherever there were unanimous recommendations on which ever aspect of that particular subject was concerned, they would be implemented implicitly. Now, here is this Minister who comes and says 'I do not have the evidence, I must be able to come to an independent judgment, whatever may be the view of the committee and however unanimous it might have been; I have not got that evidence before me; therefore, I am now going to enlighten myself, educate myself and reach an independent view and then go to the Cabinet; we are all powerful; we would only consult you.'

AN HON. MEMBER : He did not say all that.

SHRI RANGA : He is bringing the whole of parliamentary life into contempt, if I may say so, by this kind of attitude. This is not the first time that he is doing such a thing.

I am not referring to Dr. Ram Subhag Singh now. In his personal talks he is very pleasant but whenever he comes into the House he loses complete control over himself because he is aware of his own Ministership. I have already drawn your attention to it. I am now publicly drawing the attention of the Prime Minister to this failure of hers namely that till now we have not had any reasoned statement from her as to why she agrees or does not agree with the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and to what extent she is prepared to accede to the request or appeal made by the Leaders of the Opposition.

In these circumstances, does it not seem to be hypocritical on the part of Government as a whole to plead before the country that they are trying to seek the co-operation of the Opposition? That is why we have said...

MR. SPEAKER : I agree that it is a very important issue but it is the Question Hour now.

SHRI RANGA : ...that even on a parliamentary basis we have lost confidence in this Government and its professions and we are not willing to cooperate with it.

MR. SPEAKER : It is a very important issue, no doubt, but we have already lost about 25 minutes on this question. My point is that it should be discussed separately. I agree that it is very important. If the Prime Minister wants to say anything, she may do so.

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER OF ATOMIC ENERGY, MINISTER OF PLANNING AND MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) : During the Question Hour ?

MR. SPEAKER : There is no question now to answer. She may think about it and then say.

SHRI HEM BARUA : May I submit that it is not loss of time, but there has been a very fruitful discussion ?

MR. SPEAKER : As regards the point made by Shri Nath Pai and Shri Ranga, she may think about it and do something.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND COMMUNICATIONS (DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH) : Since my name has been mentioned...

SHRI RANGA : It is not for the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs to say anything now. The ball has gone out of his court and it is now in the Prime Minister's court. We have written a letter to her already and she has yet to reply to it...

MR. SPEAKER : That is a separate issue.

SHRI RANGA : She has not the courtesy even to give us a reply. I do not know whether the Government is vacant in its mind or the Prime Minister is vacant in her mind.

**श्री एस० एम० जोशी :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे मित्र श्री नाथ पाई ने अभी सदन को कहा कि जब वह उस कमेटी में काम करते थे...

**MR. SPEAKER :** We have also heard it. So, he need not repeat it.

**श्री एस० एम० जोशी :** मैं आगे पूछता हूँ कि ऐसी कोई अंडरस्टैंडिंग हुई थी, इनफॉर्मल अंडरस्टैंडिंग हुई थी कि जब सर्वसम्मति से कोई राय दी जायगी तो उसके ऊपर अमल किया जायगा ? मैं आपके द्वारा प्रधान मंत्री जी जो उस वक्त इस मुहकमे की मंत्री थीं उनसे जानना चाहूँगा कि क्या इनफॉर्मल अंडरस्टैंडिंग इस तरीके की हो चुकी थी या नहीं ?

**श्रीमती इन्दिरा गांधी :** कोई अंडरस्टैंडिंग खास तो नहीं हुई थी ।

**श्री मधु लिमये :** कभी तो सच बोलो ।

**SHRI NATH PAI :** I would not accuse her. I just want to put the record straight. If the Prime Minister wants to take today the position that there was no understanding, I am afraid that this is a departure from what exactly had transpired. We can summon the then chairman in this regard. The then chairman of the committee Shri Chanda called on us and said 'I had a talk with Mrs. Gandhi. Mrs. Gandhi also feels that the unanimous recommendations should be implemented.'

**AN HON. MEMBER :** That was the assurance by the then Information and Broadcasting Minister.

**SHRI NATH PAI :** I am telling you exactly what had happened. She said this in her informal talks 'Come along, join it, first start the work, let us see what recommendations you make'. This was repeatedly told to us. If she wants to change her attitude now, and talk differently, she is free to do so.

**MR. SPEAKER :** She has denied it already.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** The point was that we would give the most serious consideration and respect to what they said.

**SHRI HEM BARUA :** May I seek a clarification from you ?...

**MR. SPEAKER :** Next question.

**H.A.L. AGREEMENT WITH DUNLOP COVENTRY, LTD.**

\*720. **DR. RANEN SEN :** Will the Minister of DEFENCE be pleased to state :

(a) whether the Hindustan Aeronautics Ltd., Bangalore, has entered into an agreement with Dunlop Coventry Ltd. of Britain for the manufacture in India of aviation products designed and developed by the latter;

(b) if so, what are the products proposed to be manufactured in India; and

(c) the terms of the agreement ?

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF DEFENCE (SHRI L. N. MISHRA) :** (a) and (b). Yes Sir; HAL have entered into a licence agreement with Dunlop Rubber Company of U.K. for the manufacture in India of aircraft wheels and brakes and related equipment.

(c) In accordance with normal commercial practice it will not be advisable to disclose the terms of the agreement.

**DR. RANEN SEN :** The hon. Minister has said that it will not be in the public interest to divulge the terms of the agreement. Some of the terms are reported in a newspaper published in England. It is already known to the British public and to a section of the Indian public also. These terms are very derogatory to HAL and to India. One is that HAL or the Government of India would not through any other agency make without instruction and help from the Dunlop Coventry Company any of these particular items covered by the terms. I would like to know what stands in the way of the Government of India in publishing these terms and laying them on the Table.

**SHRI L. N. MISHRA :** About the particular items of the agreement to which the hon. Member has referred, I