

## [श्री बास्मीकी]

मैं ने पहले भी कहा था कि सी ब्ली व डबस्यू डी व में सप्लाई झादि में आक्शन या जो ठें। दिये जाते हैं उनमें कुन्न भ्रष्टाचार न हर आता है । मैं यह कहना चाहना हूं कि जब हम दुनिया के सामने ऊंचे उठना चाहने हैं तो हमारा नैतिक स्तर उठना चाहिये और हमारे देश में जो काम हों उन में नैतिकना दिखायी दे । भ्रष्टाचार चाहे वह खोटे कर्मचारियों में हो या बड़े कर्मचारियों में हो उनको रोकने नहां प्रत्न किया जाना चाहिये।

ग्रन्त में मैं फिर कहना चाहता हूं कि
मुझे ग्राजा है कि ग्राप बल लगाकर हाउमिंग
मिनिस्टर्स कानफरेंग में जो प्रस्ताव पास हुग्रा
है उसके ग्रनुपार भंगियों की ग्रावास समस्या
की ग्रोर विशेष प्यान देंगे ग्रीर इस काम के
लिये बारह चौदह करोड़ रुपया खास तौर पर
में भलग रखेंगे। नभी उनके लिये काम
हो सफेगा। मैं ग्राचा करता हूं कि ग्राप
राज्य सरकारों को भी हिलावे की कोशिश
करेंगे कि वे भी भंगियों के लिये कुन्न कार्य
करें। ग्रीर इस कार्य वे नजी ग्रासके।

में इन शब्दों के साथ मंत्री जी को जन्यवाद देता हूं कि उनकी दक्षाा और वानरङ्गा से इस मंत्रालय का महत्व बहुत बढ़ा है और आशा है कि धीरे थेंद्र वह अध्याचार का भी उन्मूलन कर सकेंगे। में ने हाउसिंग मिनिस्टर्ग कानफरेंस में कहा था कि ईमान इस मंत्रालय में शैतान बन गया है। लेकिन श्राशा है कि मंत्री जी की सद् कोशिशों से जीतान का रूप बदल कर फिर देवता का रूप हो जायेगा। और इसमें ईमान तथा मत्यता का समावेश हो सकेगा। इस के लिये यह मंत्रालय नामवरी हासिल करेगा।

इन शब्दों के साथ मैं झाप को धन्यवाद देना हूं।

सरवार प्र० ति० सहगत (अंजगीर): माननीय उपाष्यक्ष महोदय, वर्क्स, हाउसिंग सीर सप्लाई थे संशालय की जो डिमाइंस हाउस थे सामने रखी गयी है उनका समर्वत करते हुए मैं संशालय से इस बात की प्रार्थना करूंगा कि ४० मैं कड़ा जो कि हमें लोन दिया जाना है उसको कम में कम यदि वह बड़ावेंगे सीर ३० में ५५ मैं कड़ा पर ने जावेंगे नो ज्यादा ग्रन्था होगा।

**उपाप्यक्ष महोदय**ः बाह्यः सीमवार को मही । श्रद नान श्राफिशियत्र बिजनेस नेंगे।

COMMITTEE ON PRIVATE MEM-BERS' BILLS AND RESOLUTIONS

EIGHTEENTH REPORT

Sardar A. S. Salgal (Janjgir): Sir, I beg to move:

"That this House agrees with the Eighteenth Report of the Committee on Private Members' Bills and Resolutions presented to the House on the 26th March, 1958."

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The question is:

"That this House agrees with the Eighteenth Report of the Committee on Private Members' Bills and Resolutions presented to the House on the 26th March, 1958."

The motion was adopted.

RESOLUTION RE:
RESETTLEMENT OF EAST PAKISTAN DISPLACED PERSONS—contd.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The House will now resume further discussion of the Resolution moved by Shri Tangamani on the 14th March, 1958 regarding resettlement of East Pakistan displaced persons.

Out of 2 hours allotted for the discussion of the resolution, one minute

has already been taken up and one hour and 59 minutes are left for its further discussion today.

Shri Tangamani may continue his speech.

(Madurai): Shri Tengamani other day I had occasion only to mention the resolution to the House.

In bringing forward this resolution, I have got a limited purpose to serve. This resolution is worded in a very mild form. All that is required is that a committee of Members of both Houses of Parliament may be appointed to consider all questions relating to the rehabilitation of refugees from East Pakistan, and the purpose is formulate a comprehensive plan for their speedy resettlement in gainful employment.

Enough has been said about the conditions of these refugees from East Pakistan, whether they are in camps or in the colonies. I will not give many instances of the way which the rehabilitation work has not proceeded successfully. I shall endeavour to convince this House that unless this resolution is taken up seriously here and now, certain untoward things are likely to happen. when the Government and the people of this country are very busy carrying out the Second Five Plan, and when the Government have also told us that the Plan is in danger and that the core of the Plan must be carried out, such issues like the rehabilitation of the refugees should not stand in the way.

I learn from some of my colleagues that till 1955 the Members from West Bengal and Assam used to assemble in Calcutta, and the hon. Minister used to hold two hours and three hours of discussion each day about the problems that were facing the East Pakistan refugees. I do not know why that practice has been discontinued.

Now, the only avenue that we have is the consulative committee meetings and from newspaper reports we find that certain meetings of some M.Ps. do take place and after that a meeting of the State Ministers and the Central Government Minister is also convened.

Pakistan Displaced Persons

I will bring to the notice of House that on the 30th and 31st October last, there was such a conference in Darjeeling. At that conference some suggestion was thrown out by the hon. Minister that there may be restriction on the help that is going to be given to the refugees who likely to come from East Pakistan.

I would remind the hon. House also that there was an adjournment motion tabled by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty and Shri Bimal Ghose, and hon. Prime Minister was very much agitated over it. The Prime Minister stated that we could not for all time give an assurance to these refugees, but then Shri Bimal Ghose pointed out how solemn promises and assurances had been given to these refugees as early as 1947.

Having said this, I will briefly relate also the various circumstances which led to the coming in of these refugees both from East Pakistan and West Pakistan.

In 1947, after the partition, people had to pay a heavy price, and particularly the people from the Punjab and the people from had to bear the brunt of the burden. From the Punjab the number of refugees that have come in, according to the figures which are supplied to us by the Government in the report for the year 1957-58, is 47 lakhs. Fortyseven lakhs of refugees have come from West Pakistan.

So far as West Pakistan was concerned, it is admitted on all hands that it was more in the nature of a twoway traffic. There was an exodus of people from India, and there was also an exodus of people from West Pakistan. According to the figures supplied by the Government of Punjab, the

Persons

#### [Shri Tangamani]

refugees who left India have left behind them properties worth about Rs. 250 crores. So, they could be easily settled here, but it was a different case in the case of the East Pakistan refugees.

Till 1950 about a million refugees came from East Pakistan. From 1950 it has been on the increase. Now, the latest figure which is accepted both by this Government and the West Bengal Government is 41 lakhs. So, four million refugees have come from East Pakistan.

Generally, the charge is always levelled that these refugees from East Pakistan would always like to stay in Bengal alone, but the figures and the facts do not prove that contention. I find that out of these 41 lakhs refugees only 31:6 lakhs are how settled in West Bengal, and more than a million are now settled outside West Bengal.

Now, according to the figures which are known to the Government, and which have been supplied by the West Bengal Government, 4:87 lakhs are now settled in Assam, 3.74 in Tripura, 0.67 in Bihar, 0.16 in U.P., 0.12 in Orissa, 0.02 in Manipur, 0.01 Madhya Pradesh and 0.04 in Andamans. So, the charge that these people are all only settled in West Bengal and that they would like to stay in West Bengal alone is not borne out by the figures which I have now supplied.

The other point that is made out is that these refugees are now becoming a burden and that they are now becoming a problem. I will only refer to what one of the hon. Members of this House, Shri A. C. Guha said about this in his article which was published in The Statesman of Calcutta on 7th January, 1958. I am quoting, this is what he says:

"The refugees have also added to the wealth of West Bengal.

Jute production has been increased by about two hundred per cent. during the past ten years. Report of the Jute Enquiry Com- .. mittee repeatedly mentions share of the East Bengal refugees in production of Jute. Of all the north-eastern States of India, only in West Bengal has rice production increased during the past eight years, and that too, by about 9 per cent. This is mainly attributable to the energetic efforts of the East Bengal refugees. have also added to the productivity of the cottage industries such as textiles. There is hardly justification, therefore, for the complaint that they are an unbearable burden.".

I am saying this because the nation has got a duty towards these refugees. In view of this, it is not open to anybody to say that these refugees becoming a problem or that these refugees are coming a burden. As person who is not coming from Bengal, I am really surprised how the people of Bengal are taking lying down, for I know a certain issue which has now cropped up in Madras State: hundred thousand people have come from Ceylon, and all that they are now demanding is that they must be treated as refugees, and if they are going to be treated in the same way as the East Pakistan refugees are being treated today. I will not for a moment take up the case of those Tamil Nad refugees also.

So, this is the position, and this is how slander is being thrown at those people, from responsible quarters. I find that one of the responsible Members of this House has stated: "How can India bear the responsibility for housing these refugees? It is an international problem. We cannot have one country to have the land, and another country to have the people". But that was of our own choice; they are people who were originally Indian.

I can say, particularly, in Bengal. the Bengal culture has got such deep roots that even the Muslims of East Bengal and West Bengal continue to have Bengall as their mother tongue. and they are brethren. And when the East Bengal refugees come to West Bengal so that they could live with their brothers, this is the sort of slanderous reference that is made by quite a large number οf these responsible people. I am pointing these things out so that at when the Minister speaks and refers to these matters, he may not indulge in vituperative remarks about these refugees. They are the wealth this country, and they are the people of whom the country must be rightly proud. They are the people

have paid the price of freedom.

: Reselution re:

We find in the press inside the Rajya Sabha or here, the Minister goes about saying 'We have spent so much money for these refugees'. But shall give him this simple arithmetic. He says that Rs. 128 crores have been spent on these refugees. And Rs. 128 crores for 4 million people for ten years would come to Rs. 25 a year per capita. Now, surely, Rs. 25 a year for rehabilitation per refugee is not a huge amount. If I were to into the details, I shall be able show that hardly half of this sum of Rs. 128 crores is given as grant, the major portion going towards establishment and so many other things: and even some amount has been set apart from this for the Dandakaranya scheme, with which I shall deal a little later. So, the amount that has been spent on the refugees is inadequate. That is my first charge. And even the amount that has been set apart for rehabilitating these refugees has not been properly spent. staff correspondent of The Stateman writes:

"A large percentage of the West Bengal Government's refugee relief budget remains unspent. The unspent amount according to one estimate represents 75 per cent of Pakistan Displaced Persons the total of Rs. 80 million. Des-

Reserviewent of East

the total of Rs. 80 million. Desperate attempt is being made to catch up with the programme.".

Another report says:

"Nearly half of the crop loan of Rs. 12 million out of Rs. 25 million offered by the Union Government through the Reserve Bank in 1957 has not been distributed. The Government's inadequate machinery and the usual delays account for the poor result. I take it that it will be a serious concern of the Union Government."

I have referred to the statement of the staff correspondent. I may strengthen it by another statement which has been made by one of the respected citizens of this country, namely the grand-son of Deshbandhu Chittaranjan Das, who, when tendering his resignation made a very important speech. Although it refears to particular State, we shall do well to see in how many States such things are continuing and whether it is not continuing in the Centre also. I shall not refer to what he has said about food and other things. But what he has said about the refugees makes very good reading. He has said about the refugee:

"As regards the refugee problem, the Government had not yet understood either the problem or the psychology of the refugees. But in the name of resettlement and relief of the refugees, almost Rs. 100 crores have been expended by the Government without rehabilitating even ten thousand families. In the name of relief, patronage was being granted....."

That is his language-

"to certain persons for reasons entirely different from the needs of rehabilitating and resettling refugees. In fact, the State Government could not even spend the money which the Centre was

[Shri Tangamani]

prepared to grant it, and as a result large sums had to go back unspent.".

So, he himself admits that large sums of money which had been given by the Centre to the State Government had to go back unspent. We also find that in the department there which is dealing with rehabilitation and relief, the rehabilitation department is quiet, but the relief department is very active. Such things are happening at the State level. I would like to know what the Centre has got to say about this matter also.

I do not think it lies in the mouth of the Minister or any other Member here to say that these people are used by politicals, for here a person who belongs to the Congress Party who has made this statement; this is the sort of allegation that a Congress Minister has made when he tendered his resignation. So, no political party is indeed making capital out of this. I do not think particularly in Calcutta the Opposition parties will need any of these refugees for their demonstration, and the Calcutta results show that a majority of non-Congress candidates has been returned both to the Assembly and to Parliament. Of course, it may be a political point. Now, righly, the people Bengal feel-and I want the people of India also, who are non-Bengalis to know this-that because the refugees are not supporting the ruling party whether it be in the elections or elsewhere, a certain step-motherly treatment is being afforded to them. I am making this charge with all responsibility. That can be contradicted. Let them contradict it. Not only is there inadequate provision for the refugees, but a certain kind of treatment is afforded to these refugees for reasons best known to the Minister himself.

I now come to the Dandakaranya scheme about which so much has been heard in this House. The size of this area is nearly three times that of West Bengal. A new State can be created here. If a new State is going to be created where we are going to put in people from all parts of India, I can very well understand. But here is an area which is three times the size of the West Bengal State. And we are going to spend Rs. 11 crores on this. For the year 1958-59, about Rs. 2 crores have been set apart. But this is what the commissioner who has toured that area for four months says:

"During the first year, probably we will be able to resettle about three thousand families, during the second year about five thousand families, and during the third year about nine thousand families, not only the families of the refugees but also the families of the inhabitants in that particular area."

And here is something which will make good reading.

"There was no trace of black water fever anywhere"

In the Dandakaranya forests which comprise of parts of Madhya Pradesh, Orissa and Andhra Pradesh. Now, Dandakaranya is a name which is well known in the Ramayana also. But it is a name which is frightening also. It was in that place that we had the Tadaka and her brothers and all those people with whom Ramachandra had to go and fight.

The Minister of Rehabilitation and Minority Affairs (Shri Mehr Chand Khanna): We had also a Shabari there.

Shri Tangamani: That is true. But only one Shabari was there, and not many.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: But how many Tadakas were there?

Shri Tangamani: The commissioner says:

"There was no trace of black water fever anywhere. The only possible danger was from wild animals. To safeguard against that it was proposed to appoint official shikaris,"

This is not a laughing matter. I remember I was in Malaya when the Tamil labour there was being utilised by the Japanese for putting up a railway track.

Out of 300,000 people sent there, 100,000 people died of malaria and other infectious diseases. Today are we going to send all these refugees to those places so that they can be eaten away by these wild animals? They say it is a malaria-infected area and experiments have been going on whether this malaria can be controlled. If the policy of dealing with these refugees is by just seeing how many Bengali refugees are cantankerous people, collect them, take them to Dandakaranya and let them meet their natural death. I can understand. Not only myself, but my party also believes that this Dandakaranya scheme is a waste. If we want to have a Dandakarnya scheme, let it not be for the refugees; let it be for really settling people who have not got work. So many people can be settled there; not only refugees Displaced persons from different parts of the country can be settled there, but let refugees be not poor dumped there. That is my humble submission, because I feel it is high time the House knew the full implications of Dandakaranya. Dandakaranya is now more or less going to be a graveyard for these East Pakistan refugees. That is the strength of feeling, not only amongst the Bengalis, but amongst others also.

About West Bengal itself, they say that West Bengal has now reached the saturation point. It has now become more or less a common phraseology. I would like the hon. Minister to refer to the official statement published by the Government. They themselves admit that in those four districts where these people are resettled, there is as much 200,000 acres of land which can be reclaimed. According to the Dutt Mazumdar Committee report which was published on the very day of the Dericeling Conference, in these four districts, 2 lakhs acres are there. When so much money is going to be spent on Dandakaranya, at least a portion can be spent on reclaiming this land and at least 100,000 refugees can be settled. We find that the West Bengal Government says that the saturation point has been reached.

As I said, there are about 3 million people who are still in West Bengal. This is what the West Bengal Government says:

"4 million people come from East Pakistan, while 7 to 8 million Hindus are still in East Pakistan."

Of the 4 million people who have come here, nearly a million of them say, "We do not want a penny from the Government. All that we want is security. We are going to stay here. We will starve and we will not get a penny from this Government." In that way, 1 million people have really seen to their own resettlement. Has the Government got to say any good words about these 1 million people? Out of the 3 million, we find that half a million are now drifting here and there. According to the Government, 300,000 people are in the camps. For how many years will they be in camps?

I have known several instances. They will be told that this camp is going to be converted into a colony. But ultimately they will be told, "We are not going to convert this camp into a colony; you must go to Dandakaranya." In the West Bengal Assembly, there was a non-official resolution which was passed unanimously that before the Dandakaranya scheme is put into operation, all the parties will sit together and a scheme must be evolved, because after all, the people in West Bengal are going to be settled in Dandakaranya. So, they have suggested that there must be a conference. I would like to know whether such a conference has taken place.

What is the record of the various colonies? I would really request the hon. Prime Minister to visit some of these colonies, the names of which I have got. There was a one-page article in the Statesman recently about

### [Shri Tangamani]

the Salanpur colony very near Chittaranjan. Rs. 20 lakhs have been spent and 90 families were settled there against the advice of the agricultural expert that this land could not be reolaimed at all. Let anybody take a trip to Salanpur colony: We find that only 2 families are staying there. Why did they desert it?

Shri Kistaiya (Bastar-Reserved-Sch. Tribes): There is no quorum.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The bell is being rung. Now there is quorum. The hon. Member may continue.

Shri Tangamani: I can give several instances. Salanpur is one. There is another colony, Bandhab Nagar colony where 213 families were settled and ultimately they were told that it belonged to the Defence Ministry. 84 families were removed and 129 families are there. They have been there for several years. Then there is the New Barrackpore Camp colony. They were in that colony for several years and ultimately they were told that that was not going to be converted into a colony. In Banhooghly in 24 Parganas, there is a scheme for settling 100 families. They have been waiting in the camp for 21 years, but now they are asked to go somewhere. Many of them happen to be transport workers. You can well understand their resentment. In Bankura and other places, the subsistence allowance of Rs. 25 as been stopped.

I am only mentioning some instances o show that desertions come not only rom outside West Bengal, but also rom the colonies in West Bengal. Why lo they desert those colonies? It is recause of the unbearable conditions now prevailing in those colonies. There was a scheme that those who have made certain advances—I believe there is a Bengali word for it Bainanamas—will be settled there. But what do we find? The Government says that only 1,000 people have applied. I know that Shrimati Renu Chakravartty herself has submitted a list of

1,000 people. According to our party, 100,000 people are now ready to execute bainanamas but neither the Central Government nor the State Government is willing to settle them.

About the various colonies outside, whether in Orissa, Bihar or Assam, I would like to mention what Mr. Guha says about them:

"The refugees are now a national problem and not a West Bengal problem. It is not impossible to rehabilitate more refugees. No desertions are taking place from Terai in U.P. Bettiah in Bihar and Andamans. But desertions from the colonies in Bihar, West Bengal and Orissa are attributable to bad rehabilitation arrangements."

This is what a Congress Member says. Because of the bad arrangements, desertions are taking place. Even those who want to be in Bengal, are deserting the colony which has been set up in Bengal. How fallacious is the argument that these people would always like to be in Bengal. I ask in all seriousness; Suppose there is a person from Tamil Nad who says, "I would prefer to be in Tamil Nad". What is wrong in that, unless you are able to show that he will be settled in some other place where the Tamil culture will be continued? So, if the Bengalies say that they would like to be in Bengal, it is no crime at all. So, that is not a good argument. So far as our party is concerned, we are not opposed to going outside West Bengal. But very bad conditions, misfeasance and nonfeasance have resulted in these desertions. So, my only request is that the problem is of such a nature that it is a national problem; it is a human problem and it must be treated above party considerations. Under the circumstances, it is better that a sub-committee of both the Houses of Parliament is set up. We may leave the things into their hands, so that at least we will be doing justice to the refugees.

If any points are raised, I will certainly deal with them in the course of my reply.

With these words, I commend my Resolution to the House.

15 hrs.

Resolution Deputy-Speaker: Mr. moved:

"This House is of opinion that a Committee of Members of both the Houses be appointed to consider all questions relating to the rehabilitation of refugees from East Pakistan with a view to formulating a comprehensive plan for their speedy resettlement in gainful employment".

There are certain amendments.

Shri Bibhuti Mishra (Bagaha): move:

"That for the original Resolution, the following be substituted, namely,---

"This House is of opinion that work so far done by the Government with regard to the resettlement of displaced persons from East Pakistan entifiely satisfactory.

This House further urges different parties that they should actively cooperate with them in the resettlement work through their thought, speech. and action".

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Basirhat): That is official!

Shri B. Das Gupta (Purulia): I beg to move:

"That in the resolution.--

after the words 'the House' the words 'and a member from the West Bengal Assembly' be inserted."

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Amendment No. 2 tabled by Shri Panigrahi is out of order. Amendment No. 1 is all right.

Persons Shri Panigrahi (Puri): I beg ŧα move:

Resettlement of East

Pakistan Displaced

"That in the Resolution,-

add at the end-

"That Committee should visit the different existing transit and resettlement camps located in States of Eastern region for resettling East Pakistan refugees for making an on-the spot study into the working of these camps and the actual difficulties faced by the refugees'."

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: I beg to move:

"That in the Resolution,-

add at the end-

'and to make on-the-spot study of the conditions in the refugee colonies prevailing both inside West Bengal as well as in States outside Bengal especially in the States of Assam, Bihar, Orissa, Tripura and other States where million East Pakistan refugees have been sent'."

Shri V. P. Nayar (Quilon): I move amendments Nos. 7 and 8.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Amendment No. 8 is out of order.

Shri V. P. Nayar: Why?

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: It says "and also assess the real effect of rehabilitation on the refugees from West Pakistan".

This is beyond the scope of Resolution.

Shri V. P. Nayar: I beg to move:

"That in the Resolution.-

add at the end-

The Committee should also investigate into the working of specific Refugee Rehabilitation Schemes like the Fridahad Development Scheme, in order

#### [Shri V. P. Nayar]

to avoid the mistakes, if any, in such schemes in the schemes proposed for the rehabilitation of refugees from East Pakistan'."

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The original Resolution as well as the amendments are now before the House. In all, we have fixed 2 hours for this Resolution. Half an hour has been taken by the Mover himself. Then he has just given an indication that he will reply to points.

Shri Tangamani: About 10 minutes.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: At least that much time would have to be given to the Minister also.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: About half an hour.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: That means that 50 minutes will be left for other Members. I have got about 10 names here.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Some of us who have not sent the names will also speak.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I have noted the name of the hon lady Member here.

Shri V. P. Nayar: Mine also.

Sardar A. S. Saigal (Janjgir): 1 want to speak on the Resolution.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Would five minutes to each hon. Member be enough?

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: In five minutes, we will not be able to speak all we want.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: No Member shall have more than 10 minutes.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: The Minister may finish in 15 minutes.

Shri Panigrahl: I will be failing in my duty really if I do not appreciate at least to a certain extent, the expenditure that has been incurred so far as the rehabilitation of the refugees is concerned. But I would just like to make certain observations confining myself mainly to the colonies which have been constructed in Orissa, and what the Public Accounts Committee has to say about them.

Persons

The Rehabilitation Ministry calculated the average expenditure on the maintenance of each East Bengal refugee family at Rs. 125 per month. It has worked the average expenditure of a family in India at Rs. 105 per month. From this, the Ministry has concluded that the Government are spending too much on the rehabilitation of East Bengal refugees in comparison with the expenditure of an average family in India in a month. They have taken pride in this. But I would like to submit that most of the money being spent on rehabilitation of refugees from East Bengal is not well spent.

According to the Rehabilitation Ministry, the total refugee population in camps in Orissa on 31-1-58 was 3,700. In reply to one of my questions, the hon. Minister, Shri Mehr Chand Khanna, said on 5-9-57, that he rould not say what was the total number of refugees, but still he said they would be about 12,000 in Orissa, out of which 4,000 were in camps and the rest were "in some sort of colonies". Really, I think he did not mean it seriously. I think the words "some sort of colonies" are really justified because the colonies which have been constructed in Orissa are not colonies, they are some sort of colonies.

I was just looking into the speech which the hon. Minister made in the Rajya Sabha. There he tried to find out the cause of these desertions in political factors. But he has misjudged the situation. I can tell him for his information what the Public Accounts Committee has reported after visiting all the colonies in Orless in different districts, and what opinion they have formed. That Committee does not belong to say

one political party; it was a Committee of the Orissa Assembly and it consisted of members from all the political parties. They have given figures. They are as follows:

In the district of Cuttack, the number of families sent for rehabilitation was 1501 and the number of families who deserted from the camps was 942; in the district of Balasore, the number of families sent for rehabilitation was 341 and the number families deserted was 199; in the district of Sambalpur; the respective figures are 229 and 162; in Ganjan 69 and 46: in Bolangir 26 families were sent for rehabilitation and there were 26 descritions; in Kalahandi, 121 families were sent for rehabilitation and desertions were 100, in Phulbani, 34 were sent for rehabilitation out of which 30 deserted; in Sundergarh, 260 families were sent for rehabilitation and the desertion was complete-260; in Keonjhar, the respective figures are 257 and 253; in Mayurbhanj, they are 101 and 57; in Bhusandpurwhich has now prominently featured and about which the hon. Minister has very good words to say-473 families were sent for rehabilitation and 307 deserted the camp. What arrangements did Government make in the colony so that they deserted?

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: To which year's report is the hon. Member referring?.

Shri Panigrahi: 1955-1956 Report.

Shri V. P. Navar: Those deserted are deserted!

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: To which year's desertions does it relate?

Shri Panigrahi: 1955-56. That ic from the P.A.C. report from 1951 to 1956.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: He wants to say that it was not in his time, but in the time of his predeces-

Shri Fanigrahi: The reason why I these figures of desertion is that

you can just compare and find out that the desertions in those colonies situated in the coastal districts are less than in those colonies situated in the hilly and jungle areas. In the latter, the desertions are more. The district of Sundergarh is a hilly and jungle area. So also the districts of Mayurbhanj, Bolangir. Keonjhar, Kalahandi and Phulbani are situated in Northern Orissa and they are in hilly areas. So naturally, when we have the Dandakaranya project, we must take this factor into consideration, because the refugees have got this mentality. It has been shown by the figures of desertion that they like to be settled in the coastal areas rather than in the hilly areas because they do not like the climate in the hilly areas; may be that they do not like them for the lack of amenities in those camps and colonies. When we are going to undertake such a big project in Dandakaranya which costs Rs. 11 crores, let us see that here again it does not prove to be a costly thing for the whole of the nation. This factor must be taken into consideration.

Persons

I do not sav that Dandakaranya should not be developed. I shall plead for it. It must be developed, but we must take into consideration the mentality and psychology of the refugees who have already gone to such areas. If we are not going to learn anything from our experience, then we may not learn anything. If we are going to learn from our experience during the last so many years, with regard to the resettlement of refugees in colonies, we must take this factor into consideration.

The sub-committee of the Orissa Public Accounts Committee visited almost all the camps. The hon. Minister told us that he himself visited the Charbatia camp and found the conditions very satisfactory. But I would just refer to what the Orisea Public Accounts Committee found. The sub-committee of the Public Accounts Committee visited the different colonies and submitted a report

### [Shri Panigrahi]

to the main committee. This is what they say:

"The sub-committee saw that the quarters allotted to the refugees are situated at such low level that during rains, some portions of the colony become waterlogged for days together and even rain water flows to the rooms. Conditions of the latrines were insanitary. The site is quite unsuitable and unhealthy. The subcommittee are strongly of the view that it should be abandoned and a new colony set up at a suitable site."

About the Idga colony also the committee was of the same opinion. They say:---

"The conditions of houses in Idga colony have deteriorated. There were no facilities for imparting primary education to the refugee children."

There are no social amenities provided for the refugees living there. Again, the sub-committee say:-

"The pitiable condition of quarters allotted to the refugees was discussed. The Under-Secretary, Relief and Rehabilitation Department, explained that according to the instructions of Government of India, the various colonies will be remodelled if displaced persons show a tendency to settle there permanently."

It shows that the tendency is lacking in all aspects. The tendency is lacking so far as the Government of India is concerned and I do not know whether the tendency is lacking on the part of the State Government

So, I think the refugee colonies should be visited by a committee of our House so that we can see the real conditions of the refugees there. And we can ask the refugees to setthe in those parts.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Shri Bibhuti Mishra. Even those hon. Members who have given their names should give some indication when they want to speak by standing in their seats. Unless a Member stands I will not be

able to call him.

Resettlement of Eust Pakistan Displaced Persons

बी बिमृति विश्व (बगहा) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, जो रिजोल्युशन श्री तंगामणि ने उपस्थित किया, उसके स्थान पर मैं न निम्नलिखित रेजोल्युशन को मुख करने का नोटिस दिया है:---

"This House is of opinion that work so far done by the Government with regard to the resettlement of displaced persons from East Pakistan is entirely satisfactory.

This House further urges different parties that they should actively co-operate with them in the resettlement work through their thought, speech and action."

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, जब में ने श्री तंगामणि के रंजोल्यशन को देखा तो में शे बहुत ग्राव्चय हमा । मझे पता नहीं कि वह किस प्रयोजन को सिद्ध करने के लिय कमेटी बनाना चाहते है। उपाध्यक्ष महोदय , ग्राज से पांच बरस पहले जब भी इस हाउस में रिफ्यजीम की बात ब्राती थी तो में खमाल करता था कि उनकी जो शिकायतें है वे वाजिब है धीर उनको जिन तकलीकों का मामना करना पड़ रहा है, वे दूर की जानी चाहिये। हो सकता है उस वक्त उनको तकलीकों रही हों और यह भी हो सकता है गवनंमेंट ने गलती की हो। लेकिन में बापको बतलाना चाहता हूं कि मेरे जिले में कई हजार रिफ्युजीस को रखा गया है और उनके लिये जो कुछ सरकार ने किया है वह प्रशंसनीय है। धाज जिस तरह की बातें उन वैश्विस पर बैठे हुए माननीय सबस्य करत है या इन बैंची पर बैठे हुए करते हैं बीर कहते हैं कि उनको बड़ी मारी अक्बीय

है, वे में समझता हूं बिल्कुल निर्मुल है। अब बे लीय इस तरह की बातें करते हैं तो मुझे े ऐसा लगता है कि सत्य से ये सोग बहुत दूर हैं। मेरे जिसे बेतिया में २१,००० रिपयुजीयों की सरकार विभिन्न जगहों पर जमीनें दे कर बसा रही है और उनको जो जमीने दी जा रही हैं ने बैस्ट लैंडस है। हमारे इलाके में वर्गीदार उसकी कहते थे जोकि मालगबारी वसल किया करते थे धीर पंजाब में जमीदार उसको कहते हैं जो जमीन को जीतते हैं। भव तो ये सब जमींदार सत्म हो गये हैं। बाब सरकार उन को जी जिरात जमीन है उसको सरीद करनै: इन रिक्यजियों को वहां बसा रही है। जिन चीनी मिलों ने अपने गम्ने की पैदाबार के लिये जिस जमीन को अपने पास रखा हथा था, उस जिरात जमीन को सरकार ले करने इन लोगों को दे रही है। सरकार उन को बैल देती है , घर बना देती है, वे लोग खेती बाड़ी ठोक तरह से कर सकें, इस के लिये भरकार उनको पैमा देती है। इस से और अधिक सरकार क्या कर सक्ती है, मेरी समझ में नहीं घाया है।

में अपने जिले की ही बात करता है। वहां पर २१,००० रिफ्युजी ४.६०० परिवार है। इस माल के ग्रन्त तक मरकार २००० परविशों को बसा देगी। हमारे बिहार के जो चीफ मिनिस्टर गाहव है बेवहां जाते है भ्रीर उनका हाल चाल पूछने रहा है। पिछले महीने भी यह वहां गए थे भीर उन्होंने चार ोज नक उस इलाके का दीरा किया । उन्होंने रिपवजीयों की तक-लीफों के बारे में पछता हु की और उनको दूर करने की कोशिश की। में भ्राप की बतलाना चाहता है कि जहां पर इन रिपयजीयों की बसाया जा रहा है। यहां के जो पराने मजदूर है वे वेकार हो रहे दें। इस रे बावजद भी इन लोगों को हमारी सरकार तथा केन्द्रीय सरकार वहां बसा रही है सीर पैसे. वंज **इत्यादी की मदद दे रही है।** उपाध्यक्ष महीदय, में आप की क्तलाना चाहता है कि बाब में भीता हमारे यहां बाये थे, उस बनत

भगर प्राप उनकी हालत की देखने तथा इनके स्वास्थ्य को देखने तो भाषको पता चलता कि कितने लीन और विन ये उस बक्त वे भौर चल तक नहीं सकते थे लेकिन ग्रगर ग्राप माज चल कर देखें तो माप को पता चलेगा कि ये कितने हट्टे कटटे हो गये हैं , कितना इनका स्वास्थ्य मुघर गया है। में अपने विरोधी भाइयों को चलेंज करता है कि वे मेरे साथ हवाई जहाज में चल कर देखें कल ही कि इनका भाज कैसा स्वास्थ्य है ( (interruptions) ) में कहता हं कि बाज ही बाप मेरे साथ चलें....

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : उन को ग्राप जवाब न दें, श्राप प्रपनी बात कहें।

भी विश्वति मिश्राः मैं कहता हुं कि बे गलत बात कहाँ हैं घीर में चैलेंज करता है। में ग्रपनी सारी जिन्दगी की कमाई दांव पर लगा सकता हं ग्रगर मेरी बात झुठी ठहर जाए । लेकिन इनको मोचना चाहिये और गलत बान नहीं कहनी चाहिये। ग्रगर मेरी बात सब निकले तो इन लोगों को सजा होनी चाहिये।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : आप गुम्मा न मानिये भीर मुझ को ग्राप एड्रेस करे।

श्री विश्वति विश्व : में नान-वायलेंस को मानने बाला है। मैं सच कहता है और झठी बात को मूनकर मझे तकलीक होती है। मैं वहीं का रहने वाला हं ग्रीर में जानता हं किये झुठ कहैं। ईं.....

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय : किमी मैम्बर के लिये यह न कहें कि वह झुठ कहता है। इतिला गलत हो सकती है, उन का धन्भव गलत हो सकता है। ग्राप इस तरह से कह सकते ぎ し

श्री बिनुति मिश्राः ये वहां गरे नेहीं हैं, इनको मालुम नहीं है....

उपाध्यक्ष सहोदम : में यह कहता हूं कि किमी मैम्बर के लिये यह कहना कि वह

# [उपाध्क महोदय]

झूठ कहता है, मुनासिब नहीं है। कोई भें झूठ नहीं कहेगा ।

श्री विश्रति मित्र : ये दूसरों की कही हुई बात पर विश्वास करते हैं या ग्रखबारों में पढ़कर ग्रौर उसी के ग्राधार पर यहां बात करते हैं। इन्होंने कहीं पर पढ़ लिया श्रौर उसके बाद प्रस्ताव रख दिया। वास्त-विकता से इनको कोई काम नही है। इनको यह देखना चाहिये कि जो बात ये कह रहे हैं वह सच है या नहीं। हमने शपथ ली विधान के प्रति । विधान में सच्चाई, फ़ेटरनिटी इत्यादि की बात कही गई है। इन सब बातों को ध्यान में रखते हुए हमको भ्रपनी बात हाउस में कहनी चाहिये ग्रौर पूरे इत्मिनान के साथ कहनी चाहिये। हमें यह देख लेना चाहिये कि जो बात हम कह रहे हैं वह गलत है या सही है। यह पालियामेंट ३६-३७ करोड़ जनता का फोरम है भ्रौर यहां पर गलत बात नहीं होनी चाहिये।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं यह कह रहा था कि बेतिया कैम्प में ४६०० परिवार हैं जिन में से करीब दो हजार परिवार इस साल के अन्त तक बसा दिये जायेंगे और बाकी परिवारों को सरकार जमीनें दे रही है। जमींदारों से जमीन ली जा रही है, चीनी मिलों से जमीन लो जा रही है श्रौर उसका भाव तय होना है। एक पक्ष एक बात कहता है ग्रौर दूसरा पन दुसरी। क्योंकि यह जमीन लेने का मामला है, इसलिये देरी लगती ही है। बाकी जो वाने-एग्रीकलचरिस्ट परिवार हैं उनको भी सरकार बसाने का प्रयत्न कर रही है। कोई १६०० के करीब वहां पर नान-एग्रीकलचरिस्ट परिवार है। मैं श्रापको बतलाना चाहता हूं के मेरे जिले में कोई डेट सौ के करीब लेक्स हैं ग्रीर हमारे इलाके में इनको मनीवड़ कहते है। वहां पर बहुत मछिलयां मिलती हैं। यह सारे का सारा काम रिफ्यूजीज को दे दिया गया है । हमारे यहां के जो मल्लाह हैं

वे पटना तक डा० श्रीकृष्ण सिंह जी को मिलने के लिये गये थे ग्रीर उन से उन्होंने कहा था कि हमारी रोजी जा रही है। लेकिन इसके बावजूद भी उनको यह काम दे दिया गया है। ग्रब वे मछिलयां पकड़ी हैं ग्रीर ग्रपनी ग्राजीविका चलाते हैं।

मेरा अन्दाजा है कि एक-एक परिवार को चार-चार या पांच-पांच एकड़ ज़मीन दी जा रही है। उनको सरकार की तरफ से बैल भी दिये जाते हैं, पैसा भी दिया जाता है स्रौर घर भी दिया जाता है भीर वे खेती करते हैं भीर श्रपनी श्राजीविका चलात हैं। मैं श्रापको बतलाता हुं कि हमारे यहां एक लाल स्रैया फार्म है जो किसी जमाने में श्रंग्रेज के पास था। उस वक्त बेतिया राज था । उस जमीन को बड़े बड़े लोगों ने लेने की बड़ी कोशिश की लेकिन नहीं मिली। उसका मुकदमा चल रहा है। लेकिन इस मुकदमे की परवा न करी हुए भी सरकार ने इसको िप्युर्जायों को दे दिया है ग्रौर वहां पर इन को बसा दिया गया है इसके बावजद भी यदि यहां पर कहा जाय कि उनके लिये कुछ नहीं किया गया है तो मैं समझता हं यह ठीक नहीं है।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं ग्रापको बतलाना चाहता हूं कि पिछले चुनाव के दिनों में कुछ लोग कलकत्ते से वहां ग्राये थे ग्रौर जो लोग वहां पर ग्रा कर बसे हुए हैं उनको उन्होंने भड़काया था। इस का नतोजा एक रोज़ यह हुम्रा कि एक गाड़ी का चलना बन्द हो गया क्योंकि सारी गाडी इनसे भर गई थी। यह वाका बेतिया स्टेशन का है। वहां पर बाद में जा कर किसी तरह से ला एण्ड ग्रार्डर मेनटेन हमा। चनाव में जब इंटिरेस्टिड पार्टियां हार गई तो वे फिर कलकत्ता चले गये। इसके बाद यह हुम्रा कि कहा गया कि इनको यहां बसाया जाये ग्रौर वहां बसाया जाये। इनका ख्याल यह है कि ग्रगर इनको हम ग्रपने साथ रख सकेंगे तो हम ग्रपने राजनीतिक प्रयोजन सिद्ध कर सकेंगे ग्रौर इस वास्ते ये

कोग इनको भड़कात रहुँ हैं। मैं रिप्यूजीज़ को अपना माई मानता हूं और हमारे जो लोग है वे सब उनको अपना माई मानते हैं। इनके अति सब की सहानुभूति है। हमारे यहां पिन्चमी पाकिस्तान से भी रिप्यूजी आकर बते हुए हैं और जिस तरह से हम रहाँ हैं उसी तरह से वे रहते हैं। वे लोग यह नहीं समझते हैं कि हम फ़ॉटियर से आये हैं या सिष से आये हैं। वे हम में भूल मिल गये हैं। जैसे हम भोग है वैसे ही ये लोग हैं।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, ये लोग जो हैं ये इनको यहां नहीं रहने देत हैं और कहते हैं कि क्लाइमेट सूट नहीं करती है भीर यह दिक्कत है भीर बह दिक्कत है। मैं भ्राप को बतलाना चाहता हं कि मेरा घर स्टेशन में २४ मील दूर है भीर बहां ने गरमील की दूरी पर दो बंगाली परि-बार पिछ रे मी सालों से धाकर बसे हए हैं। भ्रम में बैतिया मोतीहारी की बात कर रहा है जिस तरह की बंगाल की क्लाइमेट है, उसी तरह की हमारे यहां है ? जिस तरह वहां पर मलेरिया होता है। उसी तरह से हमारे यहां मलेरिया का प्रकोप होता है। लेकिन भ्रब तो मलेरिया पर काब पा लिया गया है। वे हमारी बोली बोलते हैं ग्रीर हम उन की। हमारे खान पान में कोई फर्क नहीं है । 🛮 लेकिन ग्रब पता नहीं इन के दिमाग यें क्या बात है कि हमारे रिफ्युजी भाई कहने लग गये हैं कि क्लाइमेट सूट नहीं करती है। बात एक है भौर वह यह है कि ये लोग पोलिटिकल गेन प्राप्त करना चाहते हैं। प्राज से छ: बरस पहले में सोचतायाकि रिपयुजीयों को तकलीफ है हमारे जिले में सरकार उनके लिये बहुत कुछ कर रही है धौर उन की बहुत सी तकलीफेंदूर हो गई हैं।

मैं एक बात भीर बतलाना चाहता हूं जनका पहले जो कमाडेंट था वह बिहारी था।

उपाध्यक्ष सहोदय : इस बात को बतला कर बाप साम कर दें। भी विमूति मिथा: भाप मुझे इसके सिये दो तीन मिनट का समय दें तो मैं सत्म कर दूंगा।

मैं बतनाऊं कि हमारे बेतिया कैम्प एक बंगाली जगह एक बिहारी माई रहताथा। लेकिन इन सोगों ने उसके क्षिलाफ़ बहुत शोर भीर हल्ला मनाया भीर कहा कि उनकी भाषा कोई नहीं समझता है तो उस के बाद बिहार सरकार ने एक बंगाली कमाडेंट रक्ला। लेकिन मैं प्राप को बतलाना बाहता हं कि उस के खिलाफ़ भी इन रिफ्युबीब लोगों ने बहुत फ़िलदयिस्ट चार्जेब लगाये 🖁 भीर कहा है कि वह नौजवान जो कि काम करने वाला आदमी है उसको वहां पर नहीं रहना चाहिये। वह बंगाली भाई भी इन लोगों से ऊब चुका है। उसके लिये भी यह लोग भाहते हैं कि वह वहां पर न रहे।

दूसरी बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि उन्होंने जो एक कमेटी मुकर्र करने का प्रस्ताव किया है मैं उस कमेटी के प्रस्ताव का विरोध करता हुं। बेतिया कैम्प की जो हालत है उसको देखते हुए मैं ने यह प्रस्ताव रक्ता है भीर उसमें निचला पोर्शन रक्खा है। मैं कमेटी का विरोध करता हूं भीर मैं यह चाहता हूं कि चारीं तरफ़ से देश की जितनी पार्टियां है, कम्युनिस्ट्स, सोशलिस्टस, जनसंघ धौर स्वतंत्र घादि जितनी भी इस देश में पार्टियां हैं वे सब सकिया रूप से सरकार की पून:स्थापना के कार्य सें पूरी मदद करे। ऐसा मैं इस लिये कहता हूं कि तूलसीदास जी जब रामायण लिखने लगे तो उन्होंने सोचा कि यह ग्रच्छा कार्य है भीर उस श्भ कार्य में उन्होंने संत ग्रीर ग्रसंत सब से मदद लेने की भावना प्रकट की है। उन्होंने इस संबंध में कहा है:

"बंदौ संत श्रसंत <mark>के च</mark>रना"

हमारी सरकार पुन: स्थापना का पवित्र कार्य कर रही है और इसी लिये मैं ने अपने प्रस्ताव के समर्थन में जो नीचे का हिस्सा रक्खा अभी विभृति मिश्री

है वह इसीक्षिये रक्का है कि सरकार यह पूजय कार्य कर रही है और इस में सब की सहायता अपेक्षित है और सब से सहायता करने की अपील की गई है। सरकार ने इसके संबंध में जो भव तक कार्य किया है भीर कर रही हैं बह प्रशंसनीय है।

मैं यह कहे बरीर नहीं रह सकता कि हमारे कम्युनिस्ट्स भाई पोलिटिक्ल ध्येय की सामने रस कर सारी बातें करते हैं भीर काम करते है, ह्यमैनेटेरियन बात को नहीं रखते हैं। मैं उन को चैलेंज करता हूं कि कल ही वह हवाई जहाज किराये का करके बेतिया सैम्प में जाकर देखें कि उन रेपाजीज को सरकार ने कितनी सहलियों प्रदान की हई है।

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, I have only got ten minutes and I know I will not be able to cover the entire field which is very necessary to give a fitting reply to the Minister who takes of course half an hour or one hour in various digressions. I have read his speech in the Rajya Sabha and I am convinced of one thing. If anybody is a political manoeuvrer, it is our Minister of Rehabilitation. That, I feel, is his record right from the days when he was in certain other Ministries and certain other parts of India, till today. (An Hon. Member: Certain other parties too). It was surprising that a man who says that he knows the suffering of the refugees speaks in a daunting tone like this about the East Pakistan and West Pakistan refugees. It is a tone that is exactly reflecting what was stated by a Pakistani Minister in East Pakistan in-I think-the Abu Hussain Sircar Ministry in East Pakistan. What was their contention? They tried to cover up their squeezing by saying that they were treating the minorities so very well but they wanted to take these doles being given across the border and that was why all that was happening. It is exactly the same thing that the Minister of Rehabilitation of the Indian Union

.;

has stated in the other House. He

the number has gone down to 500 because people in East Pakistan now know that by coming to India they are not going to get Rs. 5,000 or possibly five acres of land plus a house-building loan, plus a loan for bullocks plus a loan for maintenance, and then having stayed here they cannot possibly do what they want to because there is no ques-Even the mental reservation is there that whenever 'we' take this loan..."—the word 'we' meaning Shri Bhupesh Gupta and his Party-"....this is more a grant and there is no question of repayment."

Does he mean to say that the people from East Pakistan come away here because of the paltry loans which he gives and does not give or because of that they give up their lands, their homes, their families and everything and come over here to rot in those tents for years and years and are victimised by the policy or no policy of the Minister of Rehabilitation here and the various Ministers of Rehabilitation at the States? I do not want to raise this question of the various Ministers. But the present Minister on various occasions has tried to shift the responsibility. When we raise the question of desertions or the reports made by very high power committee or the reports made by his predecessors he says: "Is that in my time?" If we raise the question of certain rehabilitation schemes of the State Government or of the machinery of the Central Government, he says: "Well. That is the State Government. What can I do?" When we say that these things are decided by him, he says: "I am doing everything possible but what can we do?"

The funniest thing is that it is very difficult to catch Mr. Khanna because off the record he says something.... (Interruptions.) It is good that the House knows about it. He turns round to me and says to me: "If you say that, I shall openly deny it. I know many people openly stated, just now in this House also, that we were liars. Let the people judge who the liars are. Even a Minister in the State of West Bengal who has just resigned has given his ideas as to the way this Ministry functions. How has it functioned especially in relation to Betiah Camp. We have stated not on one or two occasions but on many occasions that we had nothing to do, the Communist Party had nothing to do about the working of that camp and they did not ask them to come away. He knows it very well. have myself personally had a talk with Mr. Khanna about this. I felt sorry that I intervened at that time because I never knew that such a dishonesty would be played ..... (Interruptions.)

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I would quest the hon. Member to remain more temperate and more mild. It should at least appear that one is trying to convince the other and gives one's viewpoint. We should not go so far as to say words that would not be advisable to say. We can say the same thing-and the hon. lady Member can say it-more forcefully some other words. (Interruptions.)

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Sir, I have come to the end of my patience. For the last three years, if you read my speeches, it will be known that I had given him a great leeway which no other Minister got. We were begging him to look into the matters and we waited because he was a person from West Pakistan who has really suffered. We were willing, more than willing and we gave him opportunities of really proving his words. But unfortunately I have to say frankly that personally I have given up all hopes about the Central Minister of Rehabilitation doing justice and course I never had any hopes regarding the State Minister.

I only want to say this, on this particular occasion. He knows perfeetly well that it was Shri Jogendranath Mandal and his nephew asked . them to come away. Acres 1 . Sec.

It had nothing to do with the Communist Party of India. When we saw the sufferings of those people, I personally-may be, many of the people in our party did not agree with mewent and saw him, begged him to do something about it and change certain things, and also persuaded the refugees to go back. It is not very easy to do that, but we did it. But I am sorry he used-as you have asked me, Sir, to use the word 'untrue' I shall use that-untrue statements in the Upper House in order to fulfil his own political ends.

Palcietan Displaced Persons

Sir, I just want to say-because I have not got much time-that the Rehabilitation Ministry has no policy at all. It is no question of money. We have got money and the Government of India has sanctioned required money, but there must be a policy. I myself have stated again and again that, if it is a matter of principle, I would like a Bengali to go to the farthest end from Kanyakumari right up to Assam and right up to Punjab. We Bengalis have done it; we have gone to every part of India.

But, why is it that today we cannot do it? Sir. within ten minutes 1 : innot take colony after colony. The non. Minister says that water is flowing in the Bushundipur Camp whereas the refugees say that there is no water. Take the case of camps in Assam or in other parts of India; I have got all the material but I cannot go into them in detail. These matters have to be looked into. because the Minister gives a completely different picture from what is given by the refugees. That is why my carnest suggestion is-we are not prepared to listen to the Minister or to the refugees this time-that Members from all parts of this House should go and decide for themselves. Let them see the conditions, let them hear the whole story, let them hear the official version, let them also hear the version of the refugees and then come to some conclusion as to what should be done for the refugees.

### [Shrimati Renu Chakravartty]

There is no doubt about it rehabilitation is not there. You can fling as many figures as you like at me, but rehabilitation is far far from the refugees of East Pakistan. With regard to the question of land it has been stated that there is no more land in Bengal. Just now an official record has been quoted to show that two lakhs acres of sub-marginal land is available there. Let us give 50 per cent of it-I am all for it-to the refugees. Let us develop that land and give it to them. The cost per acre will be less than what you are going to spend on reclaiming Dandakaranya. Let us take the rehabilitation site in Vishnupur and all those areas in Bankura. I can give camp after camp. There are bighas of land around these places. Let us reclaim all those land and give it to these refugees: it will be cheaper and better. If it comes to the question of binanames, only two years ago I myself gave 1000 binanames of Palla Camp. What has happened? Nothing at all; they have just been thrown over board.

I would like to make one concrete suggestion. Let us not allow the ceiling price of land to be raised to a flood figure, but let us take the average figure taking into consideration the land transfers in a particular area of Bengal during the last five years. That cannot be done because it will be easier for our officers in the administrative departments to sit in their chairs and say that Rs. 1565 should be the maximum for land purchased in urban areas or rural areas. But that is not a real figure. My friend has already quoted figures to show how in this new Barrackpore Colony there are people who have been living there for the last 4 to 5 years, to start with in tents and now in little shacks. The landlords are willing to give them the land at reasonable rates, but uptill now that has not been settled. Now they have been told that there is a transit camp and they have to go outside Bengal.

There are so many other cases. If you take the case of regularisation of colonies, according to the figures that have been given to me there were 135 colonies for regularisation and after three years 61 colonies out of these have been regularised in full and 18 in part; God only knows when the rest are going to be regularised.

Resettlement of East

Pakieten Diso Persons

If you take the question of industries, the policy has been changing After 21 years not a every time. single spinning mill has come up. After these excise duties, God only knows what is going to happen. No industries are coming up. That is why I say there is absolutely no policy at all.

I do not want to mention anything about corruption; that has been dealt adequately by the resigning judicial Minister in West Bengal. I only want to repeat that there is no policy whatever. The attitude of the Minister. I should say, is one of raising provincialism. Even the speaker over there said about the opinion in this House. They have created an opinion that Bengalis are a peculiar, preverted race and they do not want to go anywhere else; if they do want to go, the only reason why they do not go out is because the Communist Party of India is preventing them from doing

If that is so, Sir, I should only like to say this, that on the goodwill and on the good actions does a Government flourish. By just throwing untrue statements the starvation sufferings of the people cannot lulled. Time will see that it will be the Communist Party of India and other opposition parties who will be able to challenge the might of the Congress only on this problem refugee rehabilitation.

Shri Jaganatha Rao (Koraput): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, this resolution says that a Committee of Members of both the Houses of Parliament be appointed to go into the question of rehabilitation of the ing Committee attached to the Rehabilitation Ministry here. I also understand that in West Bengal there is a similar Committee attached to the State Government.

Shri V. P. Nayar: There is no Standing Committee; it is only an Advisory Committee.

Shri Jaganatha Rao: I stand corrected, Sir; there is an Advisory Committee in the West Bengal Assembly. I only wanted to say that there is already a Committee in the State and there is a Committee here also. Over and above these two Committees, there is also the Public Accounts Committee. I wonder what useful purpose would be served by the appointment of another Committee. The reasons advanced by the hon, speakers in support of the resolution are not at all convincing.

I agree with my hon, friend Shri Tangamani that refugee problem is a national problem. It is too late in the day for anyone to think that the refugees are not Indians. They are Indians and their problem has to be fought out on a national basis. That is why oll the Chief Ministers of States met at Darjeeling, and they voluntarily agreed to allot the surplus lands in their States for the settlement of these refugees.

But the real difficulty is this. Most of the refugees—about 80 per cent of them—from East Pakistan are agriculturists, unlike the refugees from West Pakistan. Therefore, land has to be found for them. The question is, where to find so much land? If waste land is there, how can they cultivate it? Therefore, land has to be reclaimed and holdings have to be prepared. Then, houses have also to be built for them. The area will have to be made habitable for these refugees to go and settle down. So, there is bound to be some delay.

12.

The resolution also speaks of a plan to formulate a comprehensive plan for the speedy resettlement in gainful employment of these refugees. Speedy resettlement and finding some employment for them are problems which the Government has to face. I sympathise with the plight of the refugees. But the difficulty is in settling them at proper places so that they can get proper employment according to their previous trades and professions.

With regard to the trouble in Bettia in Bihar and Charbatia in Orissa, I do not attribute it to the Communists but the inspiration came from outsiders—it may be somebody else.

An Hon. Member: Are they Congressmen?

An Hon. Member: Are they fore-igners?

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Not the refugees.

Shri Jaganatha Rao: The inspiration did not come from the refugees themselves; some outside agency inspired them to create this trouble. I do not attribute it to the hon. Members there or to their Party. I only want to ask, can this problem be solved by raising difficulties and troubles in the way of Government? Therefore, it is the duty of every Member of this House to see that a constructive policy is suggested. If the policy of the Government or the implementation of the policy of the Government is defective, certainly any constructive suggestion from any Member of the House would be welcome. I appeal to my hon, friends to give constructive suggestions if they feel that any policy or any matter in the implementation of the policy or the Government is defective anywhere. The real difficulty, as I said, of the East Bengal refugees is there. Naturally, I do appreciate their feeling that they want to be settled neurabout Bengal, because they find the atmosphere homely. But is it possible? We find from various reports that the West Bengal Government is unable to

### [Shri Jaganatha Rao]

provide, or make any provision, for all the refugees. According to the statement read by Sl.ri Tangamani. about 30 lakhs of persons have already been rehabilitated in West Bengal. Now, the question is only about a lakh and odd people, who have to be resettled. So we have to view this problem sympathetically and also in a constructive way. But no useful purpose would be served by showing any outpourings of feelings or temper.

We know from history that colonisation took place in every country, from one place to the other, where there was pressure on land Where is the cultivable land available here for the refugees? We have to go to fresh fields elsewhere. So, we have to view this problem carefully, in a spirit of equanimity, and not be led away by emotions or prejudices.

Regarding Dandakaranya, I would like to say this much. I come from that area. It is part of the district of Koraput in Orissa. But they say it is infested with malaria and blackwater. Well, my hon. friends are seeing me here. I am healthy, and I am healthier than those hop. Members. I can assure them that there is no malaria there. There is no blackwater there. I would request them to come to that area, visit it with the hon. Minister, and satisfy themselves that that area is really suitable.

An Hon. Member: There are wild animals

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: It is not that they do not want it, but they feel that the refugees may not find it suitable.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: They are afraid of the wild animals.

Shri Jaganatha Rae: It is an unfounded fear when they think that when they come there they will become victims of malaria and blackwater. It is not so. I would request them earnestly to come and visit that place, I understand that the Speaker

1.5

of the West Bengal Assembly toured that area. I read his statement published in the Statesman. He quite appreciated the area and said that it is worthwhile trying.

Persons

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: He will settle there?

Shri Jaganatha Rao: I request the . hon. Members to ask the refugees to go and settle there.

Shri Panigrahi: What about Dutta's report?

Shri Jaganatha Rao; Mr. Dutta does not want that scheme for some other reasons

Shri Panigrahi: What other reasons?

Shri Jaganatha Rao: Need I tell them the reasons just now? Of course, as it is, it is not possible for the refugees to go and settle there. That is why the policy of the Government. as read from the reports, is to reclaim the area, repair the holdings, lay down roads, construct houses and make the whole area habitable. That is the position. That is going to be done. I have seen the latest report from Mr. Fletcher published in the Statesman a few days ago. It clearly shows that that is the policy. But the steps taken would be rather slow, for, they have to prepare all these things, namely, excavate the tanks and encourage pisciculture, because the East Bengal refugees are fond of fish. The Government is alive to the needs of the refugees and so all this takes a little time.

I would only appeal to the hon. Members to have a little patience and join hands with the Government in solving this problem peacefully and to the satisfaction of the refugees.

Shri Framathanath Baneriee (Contai): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, I thank my friend Shri Tangamani and other friends also outside West Bengal who have spoken about the refugee problem, the problem of refugees from East Bengal. Bengal, in spite of its



beautiful situation and climate is an ill-fated province. It was twice partitioned. It was first partitioned during the days of Lord Curzon. He partitioned Bengal in order to keep the Bengali people down and crush the political unity and the strength of the Bengali people. Bengal was partitioned then and the British said that it was a settled fact.

Then, the whole of Bengal, under the leadership of Sir Surendranath, the father of politics in India roared against the partition and started the Swadeshi movement. I mention this movement because it later led to the movement of Independence. After Independence, India was again partitioned. The intense fervour, enthusiasm and patriotism shown by Bengal gave a death-blow to the cloth business of the British, The British Cabinet was compelled to annual partition, and the prophecy of Sir Surendranath that the settled fact must be unsettled came true,

But the movement did not stop there. It went on, and after the Swadeshi movement, a revolutionary movement was started, and the middle class intelligentsia of Bengal and even of India joined this revolutionary movement, especially the intelligentsia of Maharashtra, Punjab and Madras. But this revolutionary movement could not attract the mind of the masses. It was Mahatmaji who started the non-violent, non-cooperation movement and the Indian masses came under the orbit of that movement. The atmosphere of India was charged with patriotic fervour. The second world war roused hopes in the minds of the people that this opportunity must be availed of and British rule must be terminated. Subhas Chandra, the illustrious son of Bengal, begged Mahatmaii with folded hands to start the non-violent non-cooperation movement as he started in 1922. But Mahatmaji told him that he could not take the opportunity of the adversity of the British and he did not start the movement.

1.

Resettlement of East Pakistan Displaced Persons

Subhas Chandra went away. History is known to you; he organised the Indian soldiers of Burma deserted by the British, and formed an army, and with the help of Japan, began to proceed towards India and came up to Konima and planted the national flag there. But owing to adverse or unforeseen circumstances, he had to retreat. But then, the patriotic fire which was kindled in the hearts of Indian soldiers proved fruitful in gaining Independence.

Then, the soldiers of Burma came back to India and the soldiers and the police of India caught the infection of patriotism. There were signs rebellion in the army and the police. and the British, though they won the second world war, came to understand that it was sheer impossibility to rule such a vast empire with British soldiers and police.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: 'It is quite interesting and useful too, but we are dealing with refugee rehabilitation.

Shri Pramathanath Baneriee: I say these things because when Independence was gained, India was partitioned, and especially Bengal was again partitioned. This was the parting kick of British diplomacy at the time of Independence, meaning thereby that Bengal should remain weak, that India should be a place where the people could be kept weak and under constant anxiety and helplessness, and under foreign favour and help,

The Bengali Hindus are our brethren and it is very difficult to tell them to go out of Bengal to settle, because we know that we want hearths and homes and society and it is very difficult to find a suitable society outside Bengal. But still we shall have to be practical and face facts.

You know, Sir, that West Bengal is an overpopulated province. Paddy land is so scarce, specially I know of the district of Midnapore, that it is very difficult to get paddy land. Therefore the cultivators in my area have gone away from the district and

an Displaced
Persons

[Shri Pramathanath Banerjee] have found some land in Orissa where they are getting some uncultivable land and have cultivated the uncultivable land. They have settled there.

Therefore if Government proposes to find out such a place-I do not know how Dandakaranya is and whether there is enough paddy land where Bengali people, who depend solely on rice, can settle there with safety and be in good health-and if this proposal is not made only for the East Bengal refugees but is kept open for all Bengalis, who are landless and who may go and settle there, I think many poor cultivators of Bengal will go and settle there. They will have their hearth and home there. To go out of Bengal is not a new thing for us. I think in ancient times there was an exodus from Bengal to Gujerat and in Bengal also there is always an exodus from one district to another. I think we shall not be lagging behind but we think that the place, which the Government select, should be suitable for Bengalis regarding the atmosphere in which they are being brought up.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The hon. Member's time is up.

Shri Pramathanath Banerjee: Just a few words more.

The difficulties of West Bengal are known to all. West Bengal young men do not find employment. They do not find any service in the Government because all the services in Government are kept separate for East Bengal refugees. Also, the advantages and amenities, which East Bengal refugees are getting, are denied to the poor West Bengal people. We see that the sons and daughters of East Bengal servicemen, who are having a job in Government offices, are getting free education. They are getting money for their books and are getting other amenities while the poor people of West Bengal are not getting such amenities.

In the case of service also, the age limit for East Bengal people has been extended even up to 35 and 40 years. People of East Bengal are getting loans for business and for house building. People of West Bengal are not getting these things. I say this because this sort of treatment to the East and West Bengal people is creating a sort of disturbance in the minds of the people of East and West Bengal.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I now call the hon. Minister.

An Hon. Member: There are still five minutes.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I am helpless. The House has given its consent to two hours. I cannot help it.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: We are continuing till five o'clock.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Two hours were allotted for this Resolution.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I have been reading this Resolution over and over again very carefully. According to me this Resolution could be divided into three parts—one is the formulation of a comprehensive plan, secondly the object is for speedy rehabilitation or resettlement in gainful employment and the third part of the Resolution is that this plan should be formulated by hon. Members of both the Houses of Parliament.

As far as the Resolution is concerned, I can have no quarrel with it because in the solution of this problemeven my friend from the south has started taking interest and giving mea sermon as to what the difficulties of the refugees are and what pains and sufferings they have gone into. I can only thank him as a refugee myself. I know what a refugee has gone through and what he has suffered, but still late in the year 1958 if an hon. Member from the South comes forward. and tells us something for their good. I as a refugee first and a Minister later, I wish to offer him my grateful: thanks.

With a view to formulating a plan, what to say of formulating a comprehensive plan-the first thing is the plan and then a comprehensive planone thing that is a prerequisite in my view is that we should see what the problem is and what the size of the problem is. Unless the problem is of a definite nature and the problem can be limited or can be contained, no plan can be formulated, what to say of a comprehensive plan.

lesolution re:

I have listened to the speech of the hon. Mover of the Resolution with very great interest. What did he tell us?

"While in 1950 the number of displaced persons, who had come from East Pakistan into India was about a million (These are his words) during the last seven years the number is 4.2 millions."

It means that there has been a flow of migrants from East Pakistan into India. This flow at times has been much and at times small, depending upon the political and communal climate in Pakistan.

When I took over as the minister of this department about three years ago and I went to Calcutta, at that time the main problem with which my Ministry was faced was not that of rehabilitation nor that of the formulation of a plan, but the mass suffering humanity that was being thrown out of East Pakistan into the borders of India.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: There is a wholesale deportation.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: In 1955-56 six lakh people came, the average being round about 25,000 a month. I frankly admit that I had no idea of the problem.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Even now.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I frankly admit that even if I were to venture the formulation of a plan, I did not know what was in store for me the next day, because, till I knew what

H.J. - 198

the size of the problem was, till I knew the number of persons who had to be tackled, till I knew the number of persons who had to be provided relief and rehabilitation, it becomes well nigh impossible to prepare a plan, what to say of a comprehensive plan.

16 hrs.

The year 1957 has been a little different. The number of persons who have come from East Pakistan has gone down considerably. That given us breathing time. During this period, we have been able to go over the entire question and I certainly contradict anybody in this House who is prepared to say that the Ministry of Rehabilitation has neither a plan nor a policy. We have a plan and I will tell you what my plan is. I do not want to take much time of the House, because only two days ago, a summary of the report of this Ministry for the year 1957-58 has been circulated. (Interruption.)

Shri V. P. Nayar: First read the original; then go to the summary.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: V. P. Nayar and my hon. friend the Lady Member from Calcutta, why do you get so upset?

Shri V. P. Nayar: We are not upset.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: don't you allow me to speak? I was listening to her with patience. only one remark I wanted to make was, vanity thy name is such and such. But, I did not do that. I kept quiet.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: What vanity?

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I did not say a word. I listened to her with patience.

Shri V. P. Nayar: There is a similar word: falsehood thy name is so and SO.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: There are not synonymous at least.

Shri V. P. Nayar: I said there is a similar word; I did not say synonymous.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: My hon. -friends from East Pakistan, about whom Shri Tangamani is so worried, can be divided into two categories; those who are in West Bengal, those who are in the Eastern States or the States contiguous to West Bengal, In West Bengal, the number is round about 32 lakhs. In Assam, Tripura, Manipur, Bihar and Orissa, it is about 10 lakhs.

As far as Manipur and U.P. are concerned, our problem has been resolved. In fact, to U.P. large tributes have been paid even by the Opposition parties when a reference been made to Naini Tarai area. Similarly, as far as Andamans is concerned, we have no problem.

I will take two more States, one the State of Shri Panigrahi and the other the State of Shri Bibhuti Mishra. Shri Panigrahi is quite right. There have been large-scale desertions, I do not deny them. In the year 1958 he talks .of good old history. These desertions did take place; I do not deny them as a fact, they did take place during the years 1951, 1952 and 1953. May I humbly enquire from him whether of the displaced persons that we have sent to Charbatia camp during last one year or, may be a little more, has there been one single desertion?

Shri Tangamani: There was lathi charge. (Interruption.)

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The hon. Minister is not yielding. If he is not giving way . . .

Shri Panigrahi: The Public Accounts Committee report submitted to the House says . . .

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: That is all right. Order, order. The hon. Minister is not yielding.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: The Public Accounts Committee refers to the -old history.

Shri Tangamani: They were teargassed.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I am talking of the history which pertains to the time that Shri Panigrahi has been in this House.

I enquire, very humbly enquire, whether there has been a single desertion.

Shri Panigrahi: In 1958, there are desertions.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: Similarly, I want to find out, excepting that unfortunate incident of the desertion from Bettiah camp, has there been a single desertion from our rehabilitation colonies in Bihar.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: have to see before you can say.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I am asking: I have sent 30,000 people to Bihar during the last one year; thirty thousand is not a small number.

Some Hon. Members: There have been lathi charges. (Interruption.)

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I enquire from the hon. Lady Member . . .

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Order, order, I would request the hon. Members to desist from this lathi charge at least.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: There has been no lathi charge in Bettiah. In fact, stones have been thrown at us. There has been no lathi charge. There has not been a single desertion. What I am trying to place before the House is, we are working according to a plan. We have a policy. policy today is this: to see that a person who is sent outside West Bengal or from any other part of India for rehabilitation in any other State, is given proper rehabilitation and an economic holding.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: May we know whether, except Charbatia. there are no camps in the whole of Orissa? Mohindrapur, Bhusandipur, are these places not there?

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I am only saying that the hon. Lady Member is not properly informed.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: I do not say.....

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: All right. The hon. Member will have another chance when the Demands for Grants relating to this Ministry come up.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: If I get the time.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: Today, you have taken all your time in defending Shri Bhupesh Gupta. Was he capable of looking after himself?

Shrimati Renu Chakravartiy: I was replying to your untruths. (Interruption).

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Order, order. I cannot allow this much to go. We have to hear the hon. Minister. He as well as the House has heard those Members who wanted to speak on this. Therefore, I would request hon. Members to have patience and hear what he has to say. Then, again, the Mover has got a chance to reply. If the hon. Members have got some suggestions to make, they will pass them on to the hon. Mover.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: If you read the records here, you will find, 'I enquire from the hon. Lady Member.' The Lady Member is giving information.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Not now.

Shri V. Nayar: The hon. Minister should speak sense.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Ramachandrapur, all these are in Orissa.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: There ought to be some restraint. I request hon. Members to exercise that restraint more. I may be an unworthy occupier of this Chair.

Some Hon. Members: No. no.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: But, I have to keep the dignity of the Chair. I have requested so many times that this should be listened to at least.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: As regards the States of Bihar and Orissa, I say with a full sense of responsibility, that the displaced persons who have been taken into those States shall be rehabilitated during this year. There may be a little hard core here or there. By and large, that problem will be solved.

Persons

I come to the three States Assam, Tripura and West Bengal. It is only the other day that I circulated a brochure giving the amount of work that we have done in Tripura. It is assmall State. The refugee population in that State today is bigger than the local population itself. It is hemmed in from Pakistan from all sides. Despite all that, we have a very creditable record. This problem in these two States will also be resolved in about two years.

Then, we come to West Bengal—the most difficult problem. But, one thing must be realised. That problem if it relates to 42 lakhs of persons who are in our hands today. I can make plansfor them. I can take charge of them. I can also say that in the foreseeable future, we shall be able to rehabilitate them. But, tomorrow if, unfortunately for us, more people comefrom East Pakistan, things may be different. But, I am hoping that a contingency like that will not arise.

The population in West Bengal can be divided under three heads: those who are in camps, those who have been partially rehabilitated: those to whom we have not given any rehabilitation assistance up till now. I am generally accused that our camp population has gone up, there is a sense of bitterness and frustration and we have not been able to do much for them.

The hon. Member from Orissa referred to the paper that I had circulted. My intention in circulating that paper was that while the national income of a family of five persons is Rs. 105 and the man has to work hard for it, for the refugees whom I have-

7339

in camps, we are spending as much as Rs. 125 per month for a family inclusive of infants and children.

That is the average expenditure, but still I am not satisfied. I do not make a boast of it.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: What is the rate of T.B.?

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: The man has lost everything, and as Shri Tangamani said, what was his fault? The . only fault was his love motherland. The little that we are doing we are simply doing with a view to see that we give him something which should keep him going. I am not satisfied with that. I do not say that the Government is taking too much credit for it, but what I saying is that in spite of the difficulties which the country is faced with. in spite of the big financial drain on our resources, in spite of the loans that we have to take from foreign countries, we are spending as much as Rs. 10 crores every year only on relief. It is not a small sum of money. Do I not realise it, as Rehabilitation Minister, that if money which is spent on relief could be diverted to rehabilitation channels, the work on rehabilitation will finished, and my unfortunate brethren will be rehabilitated?

But see what happens. At the end of 1954 we had about a lakh of persons in camps. In 1955 and 1956, when six lakhs people came in, as many as two lakhs went into the camps. It is all right for my friends to quote Shri A. C. Guha or anybody alse, but can I ask from anybody in this House if he would have advised me not to take charge of these unfortunate people and allow them to die on the streets of Calcutta, as I once said before?

We allowed all these people to come into our camps, and we have taken charge of them, and we are looking after them, but the camp problem has gone up 300 per cent. By taking

into two lakha more people increased camps, the problem has three-fold. Now, of the 89 **lakhs** who are on our hands outside camps, according to my statement, according to my information, nearly 50 per cent. have been rehabilitated, Quite a number of them. their own efforts, have rehabilitated themselves, but still there is a substantial proportion of the population who have been only partially habilitated.

Persons

How to tackle this problem? It is all right for Members to read from reports, I do not know where they get them from, but I would like to quote from an official document issued on the relief and rehabilitation of displaced persons in West Bengal published by the Home and Publicity Department of the Government of West Bengal. The date is October, 1957.

Shri Tangamani: There is another one, the latest. December 1.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: It gives you the figures of the number of agriculturist families that are on our hands in camps. The figure is round about 37,000 odd families, and the conclusion is:

"It will thus be seen that rehabilitation of refugees in the State has reached almost saturation point, that efforts at settlement of more displaced persons within the State may ultimately end in failure, causing needless strain on the heavily burdened economy of the State, besides recoiling unfavourably on the refugees themselves. In view of these difficulties, it was decided to take steps for rehabilitation of refugees in other States."

This is a document published by the Government of West Bengal. The hon, lady Member may dispute because when it suits her to quote Shri Siddharatha Ray, she does it, but when I quote something official, she may contradict it.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: I did not raise this point at all. That is the view of the West Bengal Government.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna:.... but I want to quote the hon, lady Member herself.

"Lok Sabha Debates, Part II, Thursday, 13th March, 1958:

"Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: "West Bengal is a State which calls for special consideration because of partition, because of the large number of refugees, because of the fact that we have very little land."

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Nobody has ever disputed that point.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I am not quoting Profulla Sen, I am not quoting Shri Siddhartha Ray, I am quoting her speech, delivered by her in the House on the 13th March. What do I do?

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: What is this? I do not follow.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I will tell you what it is.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Two lakh acres. Does he deny it?

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I have explained what my difficulties are. I have a plan. May I tell you what my policy is?

My policy is that I am not going to allow any further infiltration for purposes of relief and rehabilitation into West Bengal.

Secondly, my policy is that the camp population in West Bengal has been frozen, and there shall be no more admissions in the camps in West Bengal.

My third policy is this, that the camp population in the matter of

194 - 18 E

Persons
rehabilitation will be given the highest priority.

Resettlement of East

Pakistan Displaced

I want only to refer for a minute to the gainful employment aspect. I have not got much time, but I only want to say that I am circulating my report which should be in the hands of the hon. Members within a day or two. It will give you an idea of the number of families that have been rehabilitated, what efforts we have made to find lands outside the castern region, how many schemes for cottage, small-scale and medium-scale industries have been sanctioned and what our approach is in the matter of the opening of training and production centres.

I would not like to take much time of the House, but I shall tell you with what I am faced in Bengal. What I am faced in Bengal is this. \*Keep the door open, let everybody come in, and then we start crying that the economy of Bengal has been completely shattered". If I do not take them out, well: "people are dying in Bengal. Nobody is looking after them. This problem should be dealt with on a national basis". And when I want to deal with this problem on a national basis--I go to Bihar, I go to Orissa, I go to Mysore, I go to Rajasthan, I go to Andhra Pradesh and other States: "The culture of the Bengalis will be destroyed if these Bengalis are taken out West Bengal".

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: Our culture is not so tiny.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: You have heard all about this agitation that is going on in Calcutta.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: And in Burdwan,

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: A large number of persons have been arrested. I do not want to say where they come from, I do not want to say from whose constituency they come from. If it is enquired, I am prepared to name it, but I shall not go to that length.

Pakistan Dieplaces Persons

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Name it. Nothing to fear.

Deputy-Speaker: Mr. Shall allow two speeches to be made?

Shri V. P. Nayar: A person having no constituency can refer to others constituencies.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: your permission, I will not take more than five minutes, but I will end my speech with the authoritative statement given to me by the Bengal Government, I would not have used it, but so much has been made of the speech of Shri Siddhartha Ray, of all he has said about the refugees and the great pain that he suffered on account of the refugee cause and why he could not stay in the Government of West Bengal. Let me tell you what the Government of West Bengal has to say about these happenings that are taking place in Calcutta,

I shall place a copy of the statement on the Table of the House. I shall only read a few relevant extracts from it.

"For the last 4/5 months agitation has been brewing .....

The date is 24th March. This was given to me before I left Calcutta for Delhi on the evening of the 26th. Even 48 hours have not passed as yet (laughter).

You will not laugh when I read all this. You will get agitated.

"For the last 4/5 months....

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: The hon. Minister also provokes.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: That is quite correct, Sir. I admit Sir.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Τt does not carry much weight.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: Though she does not like me any more, she did like me once, she said so, I still have great respect for her.

"For the last 45 months an agitation has been brewing among the refugees in Camps of many districts in West Bengal. This has been engineered entirely by interested political parties and they are using the Camp refugees as their tools."

An Hon. Member: Yes.

### Shri Mehr Chand Khanna:

"The agitation is ostensibly for the remedy of many supposed The C.P.I.. grievances. P.S.P., the Forward Bloc Marxists and their refugee organisations like the U.C.R.C.....

Prabhat Kar (Hooghly): Shri Minus the Congress.

### Shri Mehr Chand Kanna:

"....(which is managed mainly by the C.P.I.) are taking a leading part in this agitation. Leaders of these political parties Conattended and sponsored ventions of refugees in many districts and have openly incited them to take recourse to 'Direct Action'. The movement started in the districts of Birbhum and Bankura and has spread to some other districts like Burdwan, Murshidabad, Howrah and Nadia. In the District Refugee Council Convention in Birbhum and in a number of meetings at Vishnupur, Bankura, Shri Ambica Chakravarty (CPI and UCRC) aided by other stalwarts of his party like Pran Krishna Chakravarty, openly incited the refugees to break law and have recourse to other kinds of disorder like surrounding of officials etc."

And further on, we find:

"Most of the demands appear to be irrational and have been put forward for severing political ends only. It has been found already that suitable agricultural

#### Resettlement of East Pakistan Displaced Persons

land is not available in this State for rehabilitation of refugee agriculturist families of the Camps. The demand for raising the Camp dole rate is unjustified. Indigent families in West Bengal, they get any relief,.... get State assistance at the rate of Rs. 4 per month only.....".

My expenditure is Rs. 25.

"....The State Government mature consideration decided .....

-and this is rather important-

"....again acceptance of certificates given by MLA's, MP's etc. as proof of refugee character, as demanded in demand No. (iv). the introduction Since Migration Certificate, there cannot be any other satisfactory proof regarding refugee character. For arrivals before the introduction of Migration Certificate. when registration was not in vogue, very liberal provision had been made for the establishment of refugee character by the production of circumstantial evidence.

In the districts the agitation has taken the shape of mass demonstration and so-called satyagraha in court buildings and wrongful restraint and confinement of Camp staff and other officers. In some districts, example, at Kuchajore in Birbhum and at Vishnupur in Bankura, the agitators became very violent and tried to loot Government Stores and destroy Government properties. The Police thus had to make a lathi charge at Kuchajore on 8th March, 1988 for the dispersal of a wrongful assembly and at Vishnupur in Bankura on March, 1958, after a violent lawful crowd had attacked and damaged the Court Buildings of the SDO, the bungalow of SDO, the Court Room and the bungalow of the Second Officer. Similarly, a crowd of refugees on attacking the Collectorate building at Burwan on 24th March, 1988 had to be dispersed by a lathi charge. In

all these cases the lathi charge was absolutely unavoidable for the protection of Government properties and lives of Government servants."

And we have been talking lathi charges.

"At Vishnupur, finding that there was no local sympathy for of the CPI the violent tactics organisers of these disturbances, the CPI tried to spread a false news.....".

-and this is very important-

"....to the effect that a girl, aged five, of the name of Lakshmi had been killed as a result of a lathi charge by the police in Basudevpur Camp No. II at Vishnupur on 19th March, 1958. The agitators knew full well that the child in question died of broncho-pneumonia on 21st March, 1958 after being treated broncho-pneumonia ween 15th March, 1958, and 21st March, 1958. In order to counter that propaganda, a post-mortem of the body of the child had to be undertaken before the Surgeon and the post-mortem established, beyond any shadow of reasonable doubt, the death of the child through broncho-pneumonia. This only shows to what pitch the false propaganda of the unscrupulous politicians can go regrading these refugee demonstrations".

I am neither adding a comma nor substracting anything. This is an official document given to me by the Government of West Bengal to be placed before this House to clarify certain issues, because as you may have seen from the proceedings, people are not allowed even to have their say in some of these legislatures. With your permission I want to place that on the Table of the House. [See Appendix II, annexure No. 53.1

I would take only two more. With your permission, I would also, . . . .

Shri Tangamani: First, he asked for two minutes. Now, it has become four minutes.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I have got some photographs in my hand. These photographs are of recent incidents.

Shri Prabhat Kar: Taken by whom?

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: By his photographer,

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: And they will show how Government buildings have been damaged. how the arms of the people have been broken and all that.

Shri V. P. Nayar: In the course of demolishing?

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: May I know whether laying of papers on the Table of the House by Ministers, is allowed while all others have to ask for prior permission?

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: If it is not laid, I do not mind. It is entirely up to you whether to permit me to lay them or not.

Shrimati Ronn Chakravartty: Then, we shall also place another document.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Ministers have that privilege. If they want to place any document on the Table of the House, they can do it without my permission. But if any private Member wants to do it, he must give notice to the Chair, so that the Chair might satisfy itself whether it is to be allowed or not. Exactly that is the rule, which the hon. Member must be aware of.

Shri V. P. Nayar: May I know whether the photographs of the buildings demolished were taken during the process of their being demolished in which case he would have found his own people?

Sardar A. S. Saigal: All this should be included in the proceedings.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: I now come to the third part of the resolution, and that is in regard to the association of Members of this House in the formulation of the comprehensive plan. Sir, I have a consultative committee attached to my Ministry. It comprises of as many as 34 Members. There is not a single Member belonging to any particular party who has been taking interest in refugee rehabilitation who is not on that committee. Shrimati Renu Chakravartty. Shri Bimal Ghose, Pandit Thakur Das Bhargava, Shri Achint Ram and Shri Ajit Singh and others are there. So. as far as association of Members of Parliament is concerned, I am taking their association at every stage, and I welcome their association at any time. But what is mostly happening is that hardly any constructive suggestions are made. Generally, individual cases are either taken up or referred to me. I would have been very happy if the hon. Mover of the resolution. had said something in his resolution making a sort of constructive suggestion saving that if such and such things are done, rehabilitation can be achieved; but not a single reference was made to that.

Shrimati Renu Chakravarity: many examples were given.

Shri Mehr Chand Khanna: So far as Shrimati Renu Chakravartty's speech is concerned—I am sorry I have to refer to her again-I listened to her with very great patience. Except that of calling me dishonest, untruthful etc. and using very strong language, I hardly found anything in her speech. (Interruptions) She did say that at the end.

I would like to make my position and that of Government absolutely clear about this resolution. I oppose this resolution, and I am not prepared to accept either the resolution or any of the amendments.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty: Then. he has to leave. (Interruptions)

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: She has come to that stage also. Why be impatient? 7349

Shri Mehr Chand Khazna: Neither am I going to accept the resolution nor am I going to accept any of the suggestions, including the one by Shri Bibhuti Mishra who has paid me a very high compliment, for which I am grateful to him. But I am not going to accept his suggestion.

And now, let me tell one thing to the lady Member from Calcutta. I am not in the habit of throwing challenges. I am an old man. I have men taken away from my roots which I had in a different part of the country for about fifty years of my life. And during the last ten years possibly I have grown much older. That is on account of the kind of work that I have had to do. But one thing I want to tell her and her party, and that is this, that if they are aiming at keeping this problem alive for any ends-certainly, they are not humanitarian-we shall see that this problem is resolved during the Plan period. That is one thing. Secondly, I also want to tell her and through her that oracle from Kerala that he may dream of having a red flag in Bengal, but I am hopeful, and I am sure, that we will have the Congress flag in Kerala.

Some Hon. Members: Bravol (Inter-ruptions).

Shri Sadhan Gupta (Calcutta-East): It is someone's paradise!

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Parties may have their own aspirations. I have nothing to do with that.

An Hon. Member: Forget Kerala. (interruptions).

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Tangamani: Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, when I introduced my Resolution, I did not want to attack the Government politically. All that I wanted was to know whether Government would come out of their comflacent attitude and really face the constructive suggestions which had been made in my speech. If the hon. Minister had carefully gone through my speech, he would have noticed

that there were reasons for a Member from Madras raising it in the year 1958.

He referred to the Relief and Rehabilitation of displaced persons in West Bengal which was published in October 1957 by the Government of West Bengal. But I have got a later edition of the same publication dated December 11, 1957. I will certainly request him to go through that. There they make it very clear that more than one-fourth of the Bengal refugees have settled themselves without the help of either the Government of Bengal or the Government of India. Out of the nearly 20 lakh people, they have succeeded in settling 50 per cent. only; 50 per cent. are still at large; 300,000 are still in camps.

A statement is made by a State Government, of West Bengal, which is published that after ten years of partition-according to the Minister after 1955-56, there has not been much influx-2 million people were there even in 1955-56, and are not resettled even after 1958. Now, if the Minister comes forward with a complacent statement in the light of this, any honest citizen who reads it will feel sorry for the Minister. I am very very sorry for the Minister. He now places before us a statement from the Government of West Bengal which is, again, an indictment of the Government of West Bengal. He wants to tell the House that the Government of West Bengal is a party Government, it is not a Government which is a government of the people. It is not doing justice or honour to the Government of West Bengal.

I am really surprised that coming as it did from a person from the South, he did not treat my Resolution with more respect. I thought he would meet my points and not engage in this cheap demagogy—it was nothing but demagogy. I may mention with humility that I know how 300,000 Tamil workers who were employed in the construction of the railway line from Singapore to Bangkok were forced to do that work and they

### [Shri Tangamani]

caught malaria infection and 100,000 were killed. I know it from my own experience. I also know that there are 100,000 Tamilians from Ceylon whose condition is worse than that of the refugees. Those people from Madras have been telling us that the Tamil M.Ps., to whatever party they belong, are not fighting the case of the Tamilians, as the people of West Bengal are doing in respect of refugees from East Pakistan. 190,000 people are in the streets.

But what I find from the report of the West Bengal Government is that 4 million refugees are still at large. I really respect my hon friend, Shri Bibhuti Mishra; I have great respect for him as an elder. I respect him for his views. From the Betla camp—there was a qualification also—there was desertion! there was no desertion from the colonies. As a person who has come from the South, I am grateful to the people of Bihar for having really settled more than \$6,000 people, and I wish other States would follow suit.

But I have got instances here of people who have been settled in Orissa, people who have been settled in Assam who, because of the strange conditions in which they had been settled, are now forced out of those places. The refugees from Bengal who are settled in Assam are being sent out of Assam; the refugees who are settled in Orissa are now out of Orissa. And when they want to settle down in West Bengal, we are told that these Bengali people want to settle in Bengal itself! I do not know what is this strange logic

Then, in the speech he made I could not find much point. I generally expected more authentic materials. Of course, the materials that I have placed before the House are not demagogic. I have made a very earnest study of the problem and I can always substantiate every little point that I raised from authentic reports, the reports supplied by the Ministry of

Rehabilitation as also by the West Bengal Government.

The hon. Minister said that a threetier policy is going to be followed. I may tell him and the House that if this three-tier policy is nothing but a continuation of the policy started in 1950, then, even the end of the Third Five Year Plan is not going to see the settlement of refugees, and the refugee problem will be hanging fire. If the Government is going to take up that issue as a political issue and if they think that they are going to damn the Communist party or any other opposition party on this issue, I am inclined to say that he is living in a strange place. That does not conform to facts.

If you take a person from Kerala and put him in a place where there is scarcity of water, he would like to run away from that place because he is used to having a bath twice a day. That is the position in Madras State also. It may be my fault that I do not know East Bengal. But, I never thought that there is a ban on any person who has not been to East Bengal to speak about the persons of East Bengal. I can tell you that there are people who had plenty of water to drink, plenty of water to take bath-thousands of such families-settled in Sealdah camps where they have to queue up for water to drink. Is it their fault?

There was an interesting article which I read in the London Economist which said that the East Bengal refugees who were agricultural people living such clean lives are now being transferred from misery to misery. If this is the sort of treatment which the hon. Minister is going to give these refugees who are moving from misery to misery, I can only say, I am very sorry for the refugees, I am very sorry that the fate of the refugees is left in the hands of such people.

Then, about the points that have been raised by Shri Jaganatha Rao, I will read out for the information of the hon. Member what Mr. A. L. Fletcher says. He says "Intensive programme of malaria eradication is in progress." It is admitted that it is a malaria infected area. Now, there is intensive programme of malaria eradication in progress. And the first settlement, may we hope, will be free from malaria. They are going to settle young men from the ages of 16 to 45. Let us not play with the lives of young men. I will request the Government through this hon. House not to play with the lives of young men Let us not send them to Dandakaranya so that it is an easy way of disposing of these refugees.

The hon. Minister himself admitted that so far as East Pakistan refugees are concerned, it is a continuing problem. Is he giving a solution which is really suitable for a continuing problem? It is now more or less well known that there was no two-way traffic here. After the Nehru-Liaquat Pact, the refugees who left this country, nearly a million Muslim refugees who went to East Pakistan, were able to return and they have come back and found their place. But, this one-way traffic has continued; and any slight disturbance in the relationship between Pakistan and India affects these refugées, whether they are in this country or whether they are people in Pakistan. It is a continuing problem.

Actually, it is not within the scope of this Resolution to say anything about the West Pakistan refugees.

Probably, friends from West Pakistan will be able to tell us in the course Division No. 5]

of the discussion how the West Pakistan refugees had been resettled. We may have something to learn from them also. My purpose in bringing forward this Resolution is to see that it is taken as a national issue. Soon after Independence people were really anxious to help the refugees. More than ten years have passed. Because of the time, it may not be possible for all of us remember the sufferings of these refugees. Today 1947 is being repeated in this country—in 1958. I certainly want the House to bear with me when I say that if we betray them now, betray the refugees who have come from East Pakistan, we will not be really doing justice to those heroic people who stood by us when the country attained freedom. request that this Resolution may be passed.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Is there any particular amendment that should be put separately? No. Then, I shall put all the amendments together to the vote of the House.

All the amendments were put and negatived.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: I shall now put the Resolution to the vote of the House:

"This House is of opinion that a Committee of Members of both the Houses be appointed to consider all questions relating to the rehabilitation of refugees from East Pakistan with a view to formulating a comprehensive plan for their speedy resettlement in gainful employment."

The Lok Sabha divided: Ayes 24; Noes 76.

[16.46 hrs.

### AYES

Banerjee, Shri Pramathanath Benerjee, Shri S. M. Bhadeurse, Shri Askin Singh Brei Ani Singh, Shri Challesterity, Shriemti Remi Chendburl, Shri T. K. Chaven, Shel D. R. Defrutt, theil.

Daults, Shri P. S. Ghowi, Shri Gupta, Shri Sadhan Kar, Shri Prabbat Kodiyan, Shri Kumbhar, Shri Mahagoankar, Shri, Mulhi, Shrt R. C

Matera, Shri Mezon, Shri Nerayanankutty Nayar, Shri V. P. Panigrahi, Shri Petel Shri P.R. Sonule, Shri H. N. Tangamani Shri Valvi, Shri

### 20 MARCH 1860 Imposition of positions on periods who had held the office of Governor

#### NOES

Acher, Shri Berman, Shri Baseppa, Shri Bhagat, Shri B. R. Bharpava, Pandit Thakur Das Bidari, Shri Brajeshwar Presed, Shri Chandak, Shri Chandra Shanker, Shri Chaturvedi, Shri Chuni Lal, Shri Deo, Shri Shanker Deshmuch, Shri K. G. Gandhi, Shri Peroze Gandbi, Shri M. M. Geunder, Shri K. Perisawami Haneda, Shri Subodh Jhulan Sinha, Shri Jogendra Singh, Sardar Joshi, Shri A. C. Jyotishi, Pandit J. P. Kelike Singh, Shri Kedaria, Shri C. M. Keabeve, Shri Khimji, Shri Kistaiya, Shri

7355

Rureci, Shri B. N. Mefide Ahmed, Shrimeti Maiti, Shri N. B. Melaviya, Pandit Govind Malviya, Shri Motilat Manta, a. Stri Mandal, Dr. Pashupati Mandal, Shri J. Methur, Shri Harish Chandra Mehta, Shrimati Krishna Mishra, Shri Bibhuti Miara, Shri R. D. Missa, Shri R. R. Mohiuddin, Shri Morarka, Shri Munisamy, Shri N. B. Murmu, Shri Paike Narayanasemy, Spri R. Nesker, Shri P. S. Nayar, Dr. Sushila Nehru, Shrimati Uma Neswi, Shri Pehadia, Shri Presad, Shri Mahades Ram Shanker Lal Shri Rampure, Shri

Rane, Shri Reo, Shri Jaganatha Raut, Shri Rhola Ray, Shrimati Renuka Runtesung Suiss, Shei Seigel, Sarder A. S. Samanta, Shri S. C. Samantsinhar, Dr. Sambandam, Shri Sanganna, Shri Satyabhama Dovi, Shrimati Selku, Shri Shapma, Shri R. C. Shestri, Shri Lai Bahadur Siddhananjappa, Snri Sinha, Shri Gajandra Prasad Sinbasan Sinah, Shri Snatak, Shri Nardeo Songwane, Shri Tahir, Shri Mohammed Thicumals Rao, Shri Uike, Shri Vedakumari, Kumari M. Wadiwa, Shri

The Resolution was negatived.

RESOLUTION RE: IMPOSITION OF RESTRICTION ON PERSONS WHO HAD HELD THE OFFICE OF GOVERNOR

भी मोतीकाल मासवीय (सजुराहो-रिक्कत-धनुपूषित बातियां) : उपाध्यक्ष, महोवय, मैं यह संकल्प इस सदन के सम्मुख रक्षता हुं:---

"इस समा की यह राय है कि ऐसे
व्यक्तियों को बिन्होंने किसी राज्य
के राज्य-पाल अथवा कार्यवाहक
राज्यपाल के रूप में कार्य किया हो,
वाम के लिए किसी व्यवसाय अपवा
पद पर कार्य करने से रोकने के लिए
खबित कार्यवाही करनी वाहिये।"

जपाष्यक्ष महोदय, इस संकल्प को इस सथन में जाने की भावस्थकता इसलिए पूर्व: कि क्रांमान समय में जो मूत-पूर्व राज्यपाल हैं वे प्रपने सिद्धान्तों भीर भावशों से गिरते चले जा रहे हैं जिससे राष्ट्रीय जनजीवन पर बुरा प्रमाय पड़ रहा है। जो व्यक्ति संविधान के संरक्षक के रूप में काम कर चुका हो, राज्यपाल रह चुका हो भीर वही व्यक्ति राज्यपाल न रहने पर ऐसा कार्य करे जो जनहित के विश्व जाता हो तो इससे यह भतीत होता है कि वह जसका जो भावणें है जससे गिर रहा है। जनके सामने हमेशा यह भावशें रहना चाहिए जिससे "बहुजन हिताय" हो, भिक्तां को लोगों का हिए हो भीर हम लोक कंत्याजकारी राज्य की स्थापना कर सकें जैसा कि हमने भपने संविधान में कहा है। लेकिन देखने में यह भावां है कि वे ऐसा नहीं कर रहे हैं।

एक बात इस तिमतिने में मैं भावने सामने रकना चाहता हूं । जब बर्किस क्नैसिट्ट एक्ट क्या या उसमें बहु बात क्निहित की कि जो सोग क्ने हुए के