

**Shri Mahanty:** I obey your ruling but what I am going to submit is a different matter.

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** Are we to correct the English mistakes now?

**Shri Mahanty:** Precisely. It should be done because we have a feeling on this side of the House that we are being treated like Cinderellas of the Parliament. Shall I read out the pro forma reply?

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** If that is allowed, the purpose of withholding consent will be frustrated altogether. I would request the hon. Member to be patient and come to me. We will discuss it and if I feel that there is some justification, I assure him I will bring it before the House. Now, papers to be laid on the Table.

**Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati):** Sir, I do not want to question your ruling. I am informed that it is a matter of policy and therefore, it cannot be the subject-matter of an adjournment motion. That is why I want a clarification. This being a policy matter, how can the Prime Minister make a statement on it without prior consultations with the Cabinet?

**Mr. Deputy-Speaker:** That is exactly what I say also: such clarifications can be had in my Chamber. Or, the hon. Member can write to me and certainly I will see if there is something to be done. We will set that right. That can be done but the matter cannot be discussed here, when consent has been withheld. Now, papers to be laid on the Table.

12.17 hrs.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

##### WHITE PAPER ON SINO-INDIAN RELATIONS

**The Prime Minister and Minister of External Affairs (Shri Jawaharlal Nehru):** Permit me, Sir, before I lay this paper on the Table, just to make a brief statement and to clarify some misapprehensions. I find that in newspapers, news appears which, if true,

would naturally be a matter of concern to the House. But, it is not always true. For instance, in one of today's newspapers, there is a report about something happening on the Punjab-Spiti border—that the Chinese have entered there and arrested some people and all that. I have not heard of it at all. I immediately got in touch, by telephone, with the Punjab Government. They had not heard any such thing. In fact, they said that it had not happened....

**Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara):** Does he mean to say because the Punjab Government have not heard, 'it had not happened'?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** Their report is, that, according to their information, it is not true. I cannot say more than what they have told me. They have definitely said on the telephone that there has been no violation of their territory in Spiti in that particular place.

Then again, there was another report that in Chini in Himachal Pradesh, some traders were arrested. We immediately got in touch with the Himachal Pradesh Government and we have not been able to get a detailed account. But we have had no such report from them.

Then again, there was a report in the papers about some firing by Pakistani forces somewhere in the east. Again, we have had no report. I enquired from the Defence people as they get daily reports. Till last night,—no last evening—they had no report.

**Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati):** The Assam Government has lodged a strong protest.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** It may be some trivial thing—something which is not important.

**Shri Hem Barua:** Strong protests have been lodged by the Assam Government.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** Protests may be lodged. I am merely saying that my information is that according

to our Defence Ministry's account which comes in daily, they do not think it important enough to inform me. Minor things may have happened. I just wanted to clear this up; perhaps these are doubts and apprehensions in the minds of the hon. Members.

I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the White Paper containing Notes, Memoranda and Letters exchanged and Agreements signed between the Governments of India and China, 1954-59. [Placed in Library, See No. LT-1395/59].

I had promised to do so sometime back, and we are placing these papers. They are fairly up-to-date, but they do not contain the last documents received in the course of the last week. Before that they are up-to-date and I take it that the copies of hon. Members would be available in the Notice Office or somewhere.

**Shri Vajpayee (Balrampur):** Sir, may we know whether we would be given an opportunity to discuss the White Paper?

**Shri Mahanty:** Sir, the hon. Prime Minister assured us a few days back that further developments concerning the Chinese incursions into Indian territory will be laid on the Table of the House and the House would be kept informed. There are two things that I would like to know from the hon. Prime Minister. We are not concerned with the foreign policy matter. We are concerned more with the defence matter. We want to know what steps are being taken to defend this area as we have taken in the NEFA area. We despatched Assam Rifles and military to Subansiri Division. I would like to know what steps have been taken by the Government to defend the sacrosanctity of the Indian territory in Ladakh.

Secondly, we are not immensely interested in information. Our information may be right or wrong, we come here to be corrected. I would like to know if the hon. Prime Minister is

going to afford us any opportunity to discuss this subject in the House.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** The hon. Member says I had promised to lay the developments on the Table of the House. I do not know how I can lay any development on the Table.

**Shri Mahanty:** Information about developments.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** I said that I shall keep the House informed of any developments. So far as the NEFA border is concerned, there has been no development of note which I can bring to the notice of the House; at any rate, that has not come to our knowledge yet. So far as the defence of that area is concerned, the House knows that the matter has been put in charge of our Armed Forces and the Defence Authorities.

**Shri Vajpayee:** What about Ladakh?

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** The House will not expect me to tell them exactly what steps they take; that would not be proper for them or for the House. But they are in charge and, no doubt, they will take adequate steps. They will not, I take it, just rush about up and down the border, but they will take steps at proper points which they consider right places for them to hold *(Interruption)*

**Shri Mahanty:** Sir, I rise on a point of order. We have been circulated a pamphlet by your Secretariat showing what portfolios belong to which Minister. The hon. Prime Minister is talking on food, on language, on all possible things on the face of the earth. What about the Defence Minister—we would like to know.

I am not saying this in any partisan spirit but in all seriousness. We would like to know from the Defence Minister what steps have been taken. The hon. Prime Minister says he does not know. *(Interruption)*.

**Shri Jawaharlal Nehru:** I do not understand, Sir, how the Defence Minister can scold in. I have just

[Shri Jawaharlal Nehru]

been making a brief statement. If the hon Member had addressed any question to the Defence Minister or any other Minister they would have replied. He put it straight to me, and I had to say something. I know as much as any one else does, and therefore I replied. But, no doubt, if the Defence Minister or any other Minister knows much more—anything more—he can reply, if you, Sir, permit. (Interruption)

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Order, order. There ought to be an end to this. We are not having any discussion on any particular subject. (Interruption) A paper has been laid on the Table of the House. It has to be studied. Enquiry was made whether hon Members will have an opportunity to discuss it or not. That is before the Government. The Government would consider whether they can find time or not. That would be considered and then that answer would be made. What is there now that can be immediately done to satisfy the hon Members? We have some other business before us, we should proceed with it. I would request hon Members to wait.

Shri Vajpayee: I must say, Sir, that this House is being kept in the dark about the new developments that are taking place. I do not know why the Government should shut out a discussion.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: If the hon Member has any feeling that the House is being kept in the dark, I may say straightaway that I am prepared to have any discussion at any time you, Sir, like. (Shri Braj Raj Singh: Let us have it.) If there is time

I do not want any such impression to go abroad. We have placed every single paper here except the last three or four which have come to us. After they are printed, perhaps it would be possible for us to place them before the House—of course they are being dealt with and examined at the present

moment. There is no mystery or secrecy about it. But if the House wants to know what particular steps our military or Defence Forces take, that is not a matter which is normally disclosed.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: They only want to know whether Government could find some time for a discussion.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: That is a question of time. It is your Committee, Sir, that judges it. I am prepared for it.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Basirhat): May I just submit to the Prime Minister, Sir, that besides the treaties from 1954 onwards—I presume the hon Prime Minister will also place before the House the new documents that have arrived—we would also like to have at least in the library all the documents which have been signed between Tibet, China and India prior to the successor Government which we have inherited. We would like to study them too.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: I do not quite know. They would be there in the form of printed books. There is no secrecy about them. I think the library is bound to have those books.

Mr. Deputy-Speaker: Our Secretariat shall collect them all from the books and compile them into one volume—we will try to do that.

#### AMENDMENTS TO INDIAN TELEGRAPH RULES

The Minister of Transport and Communications (Dr. P. Subbarayan): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table, under sub-section (5) of Section 7 of the Indian Telegraph Act, 1885, a copy of Notification No. G.S.R. 988, dated the 22nd August, 1959, making certain further amendments to the Indian Telegraph Rules, 1951. [Placed in Library, See No. LT-1596/59]

#### REPORT OF INDIAN DELEGATION TO WORLD HEALTH ASSEMBLY

The Minister of Health (Shri Karmarkar): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Report of the