

(Part II—Proceedings other than Questions and Answers)
OFFICIAL REPORT

2237

2238

HOUSE OF THE PEOPLE

Friday, 20th June, 1952.

The House met at a Quarter Past
Eight of the Clock.

[Mr. SPEAKER in the Chair]

QUESTIONS AND ANSWERS

(See Part I)

9-15 A.M.

TRANSLATION OF HINDI SPEECHES

Mr. Speaker: I have to make certain announcements to the House. I have to inform hon. Members that the Joint Committee of the Houses of Parliament appointed to consider and report on the question of payment of salaries and allowances to Members of Parliament will also consider and report to Parliament what abbreviations should be used for Members of the House of the People and of the Council of States.

A mild dissatisfaction was expressed that some of the Members of the Council of States did not like the appellation "M.C.", and that point will have to be considered as both the Houses together from the Parliament. That is why a reference is made. So, the Committee would make its recommendation.

A request was made, I think, in the beginning of this week by Mr. Pocker for the supply of translations in the case of proceedings (questions and answers or speeches) in Hindi. With a view to meeting genuine requests made for having information, I got the question examined. It is not possible to give full translations of all questions and answers or of speeches, but it is possible to meet wishes of
79 PSD

Members, who really want these translations. That is, a summary of the questions and answers or of the speeches, provided they are not more than one or two, could be given—not the full speeches or replies, as they are in the original, but just a summary for the information of Members. This, I thought fit to do, because the translations and then the printing and publication of the proceedings take an unduly long time and it will practically be useless to tell them that they would have these translations in due course. This is just to meet the urgent, *bona fide* need of a Member, who is interested in a particular question and wants to know what answer the Minister has given or what points the Minister has made. So, as an experimental measure, I restrict the supply in the first instance to answers given or speeches made by the Ministers. Then, by its very nature, it will be still more restricted: in case a Member wants any such translation he shall inform the Secretary before the House rises—not by rising in the House but immediately by passing a note that "I want translation of such and such a specific question" or a particular part (not the whole) of the speech of a particular Minister on a particular question. Then a summary will be made and that will be made available the next day. If a larger number of requests like that come in, naturally this question would have to be revised again—as to whether it should be continued. So, that is the present arrangement. It would have to be seen how it works, how the staff is able to cope with it, what amount of work we get, and then we shall see whether any change is necessary. I may also say that if such requests come from day to day it will not be possible to continue this arrangement. That is about the translations.

Shri Sarangadhar Das (Dhenkanal—West Cuttack): Sir, may I make a submission? Would you also concede the necessity of giving a translation in Hindi of the answers in English

[Shri Sarangadhar Das]

that the Minister give, or of any discussion in English, because there are scores of Members in this Parliament who are only Hindi-Speaking?

Mr. Speaker: If the request is going to be multiplied, then perhaps I might have to withdraw even the little experiment I am trying to make! Let it be restricted at present only to genuine cases, and let us not raise any theoretical or academic points. Let us see how we proceed. If we cope with this genuine demand, then certainly we should make an attempt, because we want those who do not understand, to understand the thing—that is the chief point; and also in view of the rather unfortunate language controversy which, sometimes of late, has led to feelings—I need not say without proper cause, because proprieties should be judged by each Member on his own.

BUSINESS OF THE HOUSE

Mr. Speaker: Hon. Members are aware that on the 1st and 2nd July, 1952 in addition to Demands for Grants under the control of the Ministry of Finance, Demands for Grants relating to Planning and Health will also be discussed and submitted to the vote of the House.

In order to give maximum time for discussion, the Question Hours on 1st and 2nd July will be dispensed with and the following time-table will be observed in connection with discussion of the Demands for Grants under Health, Planning and Finance:—

Ministry	Dat and Time
1. Health	Tuesday, the 1st July, 1952 (From 8-15 A.M. to 11-30 A.M. including reply to the debate by the Health Minister).
2. Planning	Tuesday, the 1st July, 1952 (From 1-3 A.M. to 1 P.M.) and Wednesday, the 2nd July, 1952 (From 8-15 A.M. to 10 A.M.) inclusive of the reply.
3. Finance	Wednesday, the 2nd July 1952 (From 10 A.M. to 1 P.M.) and Thursday, the 3rd July, 1952 (Finance Minister will reply to the Debate at 9-15 A.M.)

Shri B. Das (Jajpur-Keonjhar): May I submit that the Finance Ministry is controlling Ministry over all the Ministries? If it is discussed within just three hours the Finance Ministry will go scot-free.

Mr. Speaker: What I have notified is the general consensus of agreement among the parties, and it is quite possible to differ as regards each of the items. There may be as many views as there are Members. We have to carry on the discussion. I had, therefore, suggested originally that instead of trying to cover the whole ground in this one year only, certain departments or certain Demands be taken up and they may be discussed at sufficient length. But it was the idea, more particularly of the newcomers, that they may survey the whole field at least once, for the first time, and that from next year they would try to take up only particular Demands, as they expect that by that time, they will get much more conversant with the business of the Government. That is why we are doing this. But it is a matter of agreement among the parties.

TRANSLATION OF HINDI SPEECHES

Mr. Speaker: One thing I missed to mention about the translations, and that is that, when copies of summaries are supplied it has to be remembered that, those will be the summaries of uncorrected speeches and therefore one cannot, theoretically, give guarantee that they represent correctly the Minister's statements, though for all practical purposes they can be taken as such. Some of the Members seem to be in doubt about this. The difficulty is that when the speeches are recorded here, they are sent to the Ministers as well as Members for correction, and if we are to give the translations the very next day, necessarily they are translations or summaries of uncorrected speeches. It may be that a certain Member may like to correct what he has stated—that means, wrongly reported and not re-writing the whole speech, not in that sense. Therefore, that is one safeguard, which I should keep from the very beginning before the Members that, in case of any difference, later on, between what was supplied and what is actually the speech as corrected, no point of order or otherwise can or should be raised by any Member that the translation or the summary of the speech was this, while the speech as such was this and therefore the hon. Member was misled.

In order to make that point very clear, I am stating this.

Shri Kandasamy (Tiruchengode): On a point of information, I want to put a question in Tamil and I do not know Hindi and English well. How can I do that?