

coal and, their ash-content is never more than 17 to 18% as against ours.

SHRI H. N. BAHUGUNA : If you equalise, why don't you pool the coking coal also so that the private sector may earn the profit and the public sector may make losses only.

SHRI N.K.P. SALVE : It is entirely a different question. It is outside the scope of the question as such. Question No. 45 relates to the capacity. He is telling as to why I am not making the Tatas to pool the resources with mine. I submit I will need notice for that.

MR. SPEAKER : If there is any implied allegation against any person, then, I shall go through the record.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : No allegation against anyone.

MR. SPEAKER : Then it is all right. Because it was brought to my notice, I will see.

SHRI H. N. BAHUGUNA : Nobody has made any allegation.

MR. SPEAKER : Q. No. 46.

Supply of Critical Equipment for  
Talcher Heavy Water Plant

+  
\*46. PROF. AJIT KUMAR MEHTA:  
SHRI RASHEED MASOOD :

Will the PRIME MINISTER be pleased to state :

(a) whether the Talcher heavy water plant for which the design and much of the critical equipment was supplied by a West German firm has been found unviable because of its unworkable and defective design and whether it cannot produce heavy water ;

(b) if so, the details thereof ; and

(c) the expenditure incurred on the plant so far and the action taken by Government in the matter ?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY, ATOMIC ENERGY, SPACE, ELECTRONICS AND OCEAN DEVELOPMENT (SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL) : (a) No, Sir. Certain technical deficiencies have been identified during the limited commissioning trials of the plant and these are being rectified.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) The expenditure incurred on the Plant so far, inclusive of interest on the deferred payment arrangement is around Rs. 62 crores.

प्रो० अजित कुमार मेहता : अध्यक्ष जी, प्रश्न के उत्तर में मंत्री जी ने कहा है कि संयंत्र को चालू करने के लिए परीक्षणों के दौरान कुछ टेक्नीकल कमियों का पता चला है तथा उन कमियों को दूर किया जा रहा है। मैं यहाँ पर संयंत्र के प्लांट्स वर्क्स मैनेजर का गोपनीय पत्र उद्धृत कर रहा हूँ—

To quote the confidential report of the Talcher Plants Works Manager (HWP/Tal/55100/387) ;

“Deposit formation test has been done in four different conditions, which showed deposit formation with liquid cycle running above 65 degrees C. using Steam at atmospheric pressures and also with passing unsaturated syn-gas even at ambient temperature...”

इसमें आगे लिखा है—

“The plant cannot be commissioned without major modifications. Since the nature and extent of modifications required to solve all the problems are not clear...”

MR. SPEAKER : Are you putting a supplementary ? You are reading from the report.

SHRI H. N. BAHUGUNA : He is putting a supplementary after refreshing his memory.

PROF. AJIT KUMAR MEHTA : I am quoting from the confidential letter of the Talcher Plant's Works Manager.

MR. SPEAKER : You put the supplementary, Supplementary is a supplementary. If you go on reading, then it will be a reading supplementary.

PROF. MADAU DANDAVATE : Accept this as a complementary.

MR. SPEAKER : Let it not be complimentary.

प्रो० अजित कुमार मेहता : यह संयंत्र बाइ-थर्मल अमोनिया हाइड्रोजन ऐक्सचेंज पर आधारित है। इस आधार पर संसार में आज तक कहीं भारी पानी का उत्पादन नहीं किया गया है और न कहीं किया जा रहा है। इसके बारे में प्लांट्स मैनेजर का कहना है कि बिना मेजर चेंज किए हुए संभव नहीं है कि इससे उत्पादन हो सके। एटॉमिक एनर्जी डिपार्टमेंट ने एक समझौता किया जिसके कोलेबोरेशन में इस संयंत्र का निर्माण हुआ है। ... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मुझे लगता है, प्रश्न में आप खो गये हैं।

..... (व्यवधान)

प्रो० अजित कुमार मेहता : दूसरा समझौता किया जिसके अनुसार "उधे-धम्भ" की जिम्मेदारी एक अक्टूबर 1984 को समाप्त हो रही है। इनके पास अपना कोई डिजाइन नहीं है और न ही कोई ऐसा

आधार है कि कैसे इस संयंत्र को मोडीफाइ किया जाए ? ऐसी परिस्थिति में एक अक्टूबर 1984 के बाद क्या कार्यवाही करने जा रहे हैं ?

श्री शिवराज वी० पाटिल : इनका सवाल इतना मिक्स हो गया है कि मैं कुछ सुन सका हूँ और कुछ नहीं सुन सका। हम लोगों ने उसको कमीशन करने का काम शुरू किया है और अक्टूबर 1984 के बाद उससे हैवी वाटर प्रोड्यूस करेंगे और उसका उपयोग करेंगे। ... (व्यवधान)

प्रो० अजित कुमार मेहता : उस कारखाने से अभी तक एक बूंद भी हैवी वाटर प्रोड्यूस नहीं हुआ है। उसका डिजाइन भी डिफेक्टिव साबित हो चुका है। इस बारे में मैंने गोपनीय पत्र का भी उल्लेख किया है। किस आधार पर आप कमीशन करने जा रहे हैं ?

श्री शिवराज वी० पाटिल : मैंने अभी इस ग्रागस्ट हाऊस में खड़े होकर यह कहा है कि 1984 के बाद हम हैवी वाटर निकालकर उसका उपयोग करेंगे। पूरी जिम्मेदारी के साथ करेंगे। जो लोग इसमें जानकारी रखते हैं, उनके साथ डिसकशन करने के बाद ही मैं कह रहा हूँ। कौन-सा गोपनीय लैटर इन्होंने पढ़ा है, उसका मुझे पता नहीं है। ... (व्यवधान)

प्रो० अजित कुमार मेहता : मैंने जो अभी थोड़ी देर पहले गोपनीय पत्र का उल्लेख किया है, क्या वह गलत है ?  
..... (व्यवधान)

श्री शिवराज वी० पाटिल : मैं, सम्माननीय सदस्य को इसकी जो टेक्नीकल बातें

है, वह पूरी तरह से अपने चेम्बर में, अपने टैक्नीशियंस के साथ सम्झा दूंगा। मैं यह बता देना चाहता हूँ कि जो टैक्नोलॉजी हमारी है, उसके आधार पर हेवी वाटर प्रोड्यूस कर सकते हैं। ऐसा हमारे टैक्नोलॉजिस्ट्स का कहना है। इसीलिए हमारा पूरा विश्वास है। ..... (व्यवधान)

**Dr. SUBRAMANIAM SWAMY :** Sir, I would like to know from the Minister when the Talcher Heavy Water Plant begins to work, whether we will be self-sufficient in respect of heavy water. If not, what would be the shortfall from self-sufficiency ?

**SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL :** After commissioning that plant we will be able to produce heavy water but the heavy water produced from Talcher plant by itself will be able to meet some of our demands. We have other plants where we are producing heavy water and we do feel that the capacity established for producing heavy water will be able to meet our demands.

**SHRI NIREN GHOSH :** Sir, a few days ago it appeared in the press that Atomic Energy Department with the installation of power plants are suddenly lagging behind the schedule and there is a tremendous escalation of costs. Now, about this Talcher Plant, the Atomic Energy Department and its Technicians are holding the view that they will be able to produce heavy water as per schedule. But other technical experts definitely hold a view that the plant will start production two years behind the schedule and the question arises—keeping in view the atomic power plants and the escalation costs whether it is at all beneficial to the country because it is for producing power of a large capacity. There is also a view that there is a danger to the environment. I want to know whether these atomic power plants are white elephant.

**MR. SPEAKER :** This point has been discussed time and again and they have

replied to this point. You are just repeating that question.

**SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL :** Sir, it should be borne in mind that the technology which is required for producing power from atom is not easily available in the world. When it was applicable we had it. But when it became not possible for us to get it from outside, we tried to depend on our own capability to produce that technology and use that technology and fortunately for us our scientists and technologists have been able to produce the technology and give it to us and help us to produce power from atomic energy plants. Now, in regard to escalations and the delay, they are the results of some unexpected situation that developed because of the sudden non-availability of technology and therefore the requirement depends on our capability. But now we have come to a position where it will be possible for us to get the technology of the sorts which are required for producing atomic energy. Now, as far as the possibility of this kind of technology and this kind of power is concerned, we do feel that it would be possible for us to use it in such a fashion as not to cause any danger in any environmental conditions to the human beings in our country. As far as the cost is concerned, we do feel that it is possible for us to produce it with cost benefit.

**SHRI M. RAM GOPAL REDDY :** Sir, a little while ago, Mr. Bahuguna had mentioned the names of Tatas and Birlas. Kindly go through the records and if you find it is objectionable, you kindly expunge it. (Interruptions)

**SHRI K. LAKKAPPA :** He made allegations against the Minister. Sir, you go through the record and expunge the relevant portion from the records.

**MR. SPEAKER :** I have already gone on record about that.

**SHRI H. N. BAHUGUNA :** Sir, let me whether he is speaking on behalf of Tatas or on his own behalf. (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. RAM GOPAL REDDY :** Sir, just now, the hon. Member belonging to CPM, has mentioned that it is a white elephant. Sir, the atomic energy programme was started by late Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru and now it is effectively being used. I want to know from the hon. Minister whether he is going to dismiss this idea and say that it is not a white elephant. If at all there is any white elephant in this country, it is the Opposition Party which should not waste the time of this August House.

*(Interruptions)*

**SHRI SHIVRAJ V. PATIL :** We do not subscribe to the idea that atomic energy programme is a white elephant.

**MR. SPEAKER :** He would like to call it a 'red elephant'.

**Joint Meeting of Members of  
Extended Group on SCs/STs**

+

\*47. **SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN :**

**SHRI N. E. HORO**

Will the Minister of HOME AFFAIRS be pleased to state :

(a) whether a joint meeting of members of the extended Group on Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes constituted by the Planning Commission has taken place to discuss the Seventh Plan Strategy for the development of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes ;

(b) whether the performance made during the Sixth Five Year Plan has also been reviewed ;

(c) if so, whether Government are satisfied with the performance ; and

(d) if not, what active steps are being contemplated in this regard to raise the standard of the Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes in the country ?

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE  
MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI  
P. VENKATASUBBAIAH) :** (a) There are two Working Groups set up for the finalisation of the Seventh Plan strategy for the development of (1) the Scheduled Castes and (2) the Scheduled Tribes each of the Working has met thrice so far

(b) In these meetings of the Working Groups, whose main function is to evolve the strategy for the development of SC and STs during the Seventh Plan, a broad review of the implementation of the Special Component Plan for Scheduled Castes and of the Tribal Sub Plan for Scheduled Tribes has been made.

(c) and (d) The States and UTs implementing SCP and TSP have been able, by and large, to cover a very large number of Scheduled Castes and Scheduled Tribes families with programmes relating to economic and educational development with due emphasis on the infrastructure development. Continuous efforts are being made for further improvement in strategy and in the quality of implementation. The Working Groups are expected to make specific recommendations in this regard.

**SHRI G. Y. KRISHNAN :** Mr. Speaker, Sir, the answer is not specific to part (c) of the question, whether Government is satisfied with the implementation of the programme in the 6th Plan. May I know what are the specific recommendations arrived at till now for the 7th Plan ?

**SHRI P. VENKATASUBBAIAH :** So far as the 6th Plan is concerned, the Government feels that, more or less, achievement has been made and implementation has been done by the various State Government with the assistance of the Central Plan.

So far as the 7th Plan is concerned, two Working Groups have been set up for finalisation of the 7th Plan strategy. One of the Group is for the development of the scheduled castes and the other is for the development of scheduled tribes.