

troops or bases in another country; maintenance of Afghanistan's sovereign independent and non-aligned status and cessation and noncontinuance of external intervention or interference against it. May I know whether it is a fact that there are other nations who also agree basically on these there postulates? If so, whether the Government of India proposes to convene a conference of all those nations who basically agree with these steps and work out a workable package approach to solve the Afghan problem?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** It is not just a question of calling for a conference and passing a resolution. This can be done; this has been done but with no effect. We are a little more seriously involved in this because we are in this region. We want that there should be no confrontation; there should not be further tension. First, we wanted to see that there was no further escalation of the tension. To some extent, we have been succeeding in that. Now the stage is set for making some effort to de-escalate the tension. That cannot be done by passing a resolution or gathering certain like-minded countries on this issue. That will have to be done by undertaking an effort to get the immediately concerned countries to agree on some contours of a formula, if not the formula itself in all details. That is what we are trying to do at the moment. I cannot say that we have been succeeding in this particular aspect. But I am still hopeful that the time will come when there will be success in our effort.

**SHRI CHANDRAJIT YADAV:** My question is in regard to recognition of Kampuchea. The Minister has said that it is under active consideration. Actually, he has been saying that for quite some time.

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** Do you want me to say 'very active'?

**SHRI CHANDRAJIT YADAV:** I want you to say 'yes' and not 'very

active'. You have passed all those stages. I think you must come to some conclusions. I am saying that in spite of the fact that the Government of India agrees that all those factors that are required for recognition of a country, are there, an impression is going on that in your eagerness to improve your relations with China—because China's stand is different; they do not want India to recognise Kampuchea—unnecessary delay is being made though there is almost total unanimity in this House that Kampuchea should be recognised?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** I would only request Chandrajitji not to give China the credit which it does not deserve on this issue.

**SHRI XAVIER ARAKAL:** Has it come to the notice of the Government that certain hon. Members have visited that country and have made some pronouncements there?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** Hon. Members of Parliament, he means?

**SHRI XAVIER ARAKAL:** Yes, hon. Members of Parliament. They had visited these countries and made pronouncements. Are those pronouncements conducive to better relations or worsening relations with this country?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** Sir, I must confess, I have not really applied my mind to the pronouncements made by hon. Members outside the country, but I think if they had made any statements, they were only exercising their right of free speech.

#### **Visit of Former Israeli Foreign Minister**

+

**\*62. SHRI K. MALLANNA:**

**SHRI K. PRADHANI:**

Will the Minister of **EXTERNAL AFFAIRS** be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that doubts on the controversial visit of Moshe Dayan were set at rest by the Janata

and the Bharatiya Janata Party sources who confirmed that the Israeli leader did visit New Delhi in January, 1979 and had talks with the then Prime Minister Shri Morarji Desai and the then Foreign Minister Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee spread over two days and all together lasting nearly five-hours;

(b) if so, whether the leader of Bharatiya Janata Party Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee has also commented in this regard; and

(c) if so, the details regarding the visit of Moshe Dayan the Israeli leader?

**THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO):** (a) to (c). First reports regarding a visit by Moshe Dayan to India appeared on April 27, 1979 in a New York newspaper "News and Cine India" stating that Moshe Dayan visited India in 1978. In June 1979, Israeli Radio announced that Foreign Minister Moshe Dayan visited India secretly in 1977. On 14 June, 1979, the Israeli Foreign Ministry denied this report. When these reports were brought to the attention of the then Foreign Minister Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, he instructed the then Foreign Secretary on June 18, 1979, that, if asked, we should deny this report and further that he was not aware of any such secret visit.

This matter again appeared in newspaper on April 12, 1980, when a report datelined Tel Aviv, April 11, appeared in Indian newspapers stating that Moshe Dayan secretly flew to India in 1978 and met the then Prime Minister Morarji Desai. On April 13, 1980, Shri Morarji Desai said that he had no comments to offer. On 14th April, 1980, Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee totally denied the reported visit of Moshe Dayan.

Based upon information which the Government was in possession of, Prime Minister, Smt. Indira Gandhi stated on May 10 that Moshe Dayan had visited India secretly during the

Janata rule. Thereafter in various statements made by the leader of the Janata and the Bharatiya Janata Party, including Shri Morarji Desai and Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, they have admitted that a secret visit by Moshe Dayan did take place. According to Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, the visit took place in 1978. On the same day, Shri Morarji Desai told newsmen in Bombay that he and Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee had met Moshe Dayan in early 1978. Dr. Subramaniam Swamy in a statement made at Bhopal confirmed Moshe Dayan's visit and said that it had taken place around January 1979.

According to Government's information Moshe Dayan visited India in August 1977 evidently at the instance of Shri Morarji Desai and Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee, inasmuch as he landed in Bombay and was flown to New Delhi by an IAF aircraft. Shri Desai and Shri Vajpayee met Moshe Dayan at 1, Akbar Road in the evening of August 15, 1977. Moshe Dayan left for Bombay, again by an IAF aircraft, at 12.45 hours on August 16, 1977.

While we have complete information about Moshe Dayan's visit to Delhi in August 1977, the statements of the leaders of the Janata and the Bharatiya Janata Party point to the possibility of more visits than one—viz. one in 1977, another in 1978 and perhaps a third in 1979.

**SHRI K. MALLANNA:** I thought it was only one visit to India in 1978, but the statement of the hon. Minister discloses three visit according to the leaders of the opposition.

The secret and controversial visit of Moshe Dayan was leaked out by a US weekly, *News and Cine India* under the headline "India declines to back in Middle East". Then it was published in Israeli papers. The spokesman of the External Affairs Ministry was not responsive. There are controversial versions regarding this visit. The then External Affairs Minister in the Janata rule denied the fact, and described the Israeli newspaper report

as absurd. The then Prime Minister of the Janata Party said he had no comments. In the meanwhile, Dr. Subramaniam Swamy intervenes and exposes both the Prime Minister and the External Affairs Minister. Then the truth came out in different ways.

MR. SPEAKER: You put the question.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: Then the External Affairs Minister said that Mr. Dayan had visited India on his way back from Nepal. The version of the then Prime Minister gave details in his press conference. General Dayan had in the beginning of 1978 sent him a message...

MR. SPEAKER: I will disallow it.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: These are very important facts... through a person working in India that he wanted to meet him in connection with Indo-Israeli peace.

MR. SPEAKER: You have to put the question.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: I will put the question. This is very important because there were no diplomatic relations between the two countries, and we do not know who the middleman is, whether he is a businessman who is connected with Kantj Desai.

MR. SPEAKER: I am not going to allow this. This is too much. I disallow this question. Mr. Pradhani.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: I am putting the question.

MR. SPEAKER: You are not putting the question, and you are taking all the time.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: In the circumstances, is it not fact that India's credibility has been lost and suspicion has been aroused among the people of India and other countries, especially the Arab countries? Is it not a fact that it amounts to a breach of trust,

having met the Foreign Minister of a country with which our relations are not cordial?

MR. SPEAKER: This could have been done without all those preliminary remarks. Nothing more than that. You are going out of the way.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: To the pointed question put by the hon. Member, my answer is in the affirmative, that our image has suffered.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: Second supplementary.

MR. SPEAKER: No, I am not going to allow.

SHRI K. MALLANNA: Is it a fact that the Janata Party and the Israeli Government entered into a secret pact or secret agreement and if so, what are the details? Is it also a fact that because of the secret agreement, an impression has been created that they have deviated from the foreign policies of non-alignment and by the time it was to be implemented, the effect was that Libya had stopped oil supplies and the Gulf countries reacted sharply and our relationship with the Arab countries was strained.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: I am not aware of any secret agreement having been concluded. If there had been any secret agreement, it is so secret that we do not know anything about it. That is all I can say.

SHRI K. PRADHANI: It has been stated in the reply that Moshe Dayan arrived in New Delhi by an IAF aircraft. There are press reports to the effect that RAW men received him at Bombay and the CBI Chief escorted him to New Delhi on one occasion. From this, I presume that this is an official secret visit. May I know from the Minister whether there is any record or whether any information is available from the RAW or CBI in this regard?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** It would not be proper for me to divulge all the sources of our information while answering questions. I have placed before the House the full information in the form it is needed and in the form it is relevant to answer the question.

**SHRI JAGDISH TYTLER:** What the Foreign Minister has just stated has exposed the credibility of Shri Vajpayee, who was the then Foreign Minister. It also shows the damage that our country might have suffered. There are a few questions which I would like the Foreign Minister to reply on the basis of records available, if any.

(a) What are the circumstances which led to the secret visit to India by Moshe Dayan?

This is a very specific question.

(b) Was there any political compulsion,—mind you, when I say political compulsion, it is not our own country's compulsion, but the compulsion of the party which was then in power—which made the then Prime Minister and his Minister of External Affairs to engage in bilateral discussions with Mr. Dayan, particularly in the context of our relations with Israel which has neither been warm nor formal?

(c) Whether the approval of his secret visit coupled with the VIP treatment accorded was a fore-runner for recognition of Israel or anything else from which secretly they may have been benefited; and

(d) If so, at what level the diplomatic relations had been settled?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** From the records available in the External Affairs Ministry, I am afraid I would not be able to answer any of these questions. Whatever was available, I have already included in the original answer. When I said that there were certain reports emanating from certain sources about his visit; after receiving those reports, they were brought to the notice of the then Foreign Minister, who said that he did not know and he also instructed the

External Affairs Ministry to say that they too did not know. Beyond that, we have nothing to base any answer on.

**SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD:** Since no record is available in the Ministry about the discussion, may I know whether the Government has asked the ex-Foreign Minister and the Ex-Prime Minister as to what they discussed, whether they discussed any love affairs or any matter of national interest? To put it on the record, as to what they discussed, we must ask them.

**MR. SPEAKER:** How did you come to that conclusion?

**SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD:** I am only giving a few probabilities. Did they discuss any matter which they thought it best for India or any matter of Israel national interest or any matter of United States national interest? Did they discuss love, their own, individual or collective? Did they write anything on record or not?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** In the absence of records, Mr. Bhagwat Jha Azad's guess is as good as anybody else's. What I would like to say is, when we have a discussion officially with foreign dignitaries every word is recorded because our memories cannot be depended upon for all time. If there had been a meeting, say, 10 years ago with the then Foreign Minister or the then Prime Minister, we would certainly have records of those talks and we could glean from them what exactly had happened to the largest extent possible. But in this case, it so happened that we have not a scrap of paper, not a word anywhere in the External Affairs Ministry from which we could even try to reconstruct anything.

**SHRI RAM JETHMALANI:** Will the hon. Minister be pleased to tell us (a) whether after the Chinese invasion, the Government of Israel made a gift to this country of a ship-

load of arms which Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru gratefully accepted.....  
(Interruptions)

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: Let him put a relevant question. All\*....  
(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Sir, you protect me against this.

MR. SPEAKER: Does it have any connection with the question?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Yes. I will tell you how it arises... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You are not going to be judge. I will judge it.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Let the Minister reply. Why should they shout?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: It shows that secret meetings are a recognised part of international diplomacy. It shows that those who talk of these meetings in public are guilty of violating the Official Secrets Act and are guilty of acting again to the interest of the nation.

MR. SPEAKER: You put a question. (Interruption)

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: They go on talking of Mr. Vajpayee's veracity. But when somebody talks of their lack of complete veracity and honesty, this is the kind of disturbance they make.

Let me put the question. Is it a fact that in the wake of the Chinese invasion, the Government of Israel made a gift to this country of a shipload of arms...

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: How is it relevant?

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: You will know it.

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: Don't shout here. This is not a court. Don't talk\*... and ask irrelevant questions here.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Please use parliamentary language. I am not speaking \*..... You are speaking\* .....

MR. SPEAKER: You put your question now.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: He should withdraw that\* ..... word\* .....

MR. SPEAKER: I do not allow this kind of thing. That is not the way the hon. Members should behave.

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: You must not allow an irrelevant question.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Ram Jethmalani, please be relevant. You please connect your question in relevance to this Question.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Unless you hear the whole question, you cannot find out what is the relevance of this question.

SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD: This is not about a shipload of arms.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: I want to know whether this acceptance of the gift was kept a closely guarded secret and whether, when it became known, every Opposition party helped to keep it a secret and Mrs. Gandhi, when asked, spoke a \*.... that she had made purchases from a company incorporated in Israel....  
(Interruptions)

SHRI BHATWAT JHA AZAD: He cannot say, \*.....

MR. SPEAKER: The word \*.... should be expunged; it is unparlia-

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

mentary. (*Interruptions*). It is irrelevant; it is unparliamentary. This has to be expunged.

AN HON. MEMBER: The whole thing should be expunged. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: She made an incorrect statement that she had made these purchases from a company incorporated in Israel.... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The Foreign Minister will answer it.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF): All that is irrelevant should be expunged. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. This is not the way. Why do you get up like this? Why don't you sit down?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO rose—

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: I have not yet finished. She made an incorrect statement that the purchases were made from a company incorporated in Israel. Even though the statement was known to be incorrect, every Member of the Opposition in this country helped to sustain that untrue statement. nobody exposed it, because national interests required it to be canceled.

I want, finally, to ask: is the hon. Minister aware that between 1950 and 1955... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF: It is not relevant I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Jethmalani, you are not putting a relevant question.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Kindly hear me, Sir. Between 1950 and 1955... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI C. K. JAFFER SHARIEF: This is irrelevant. Whatever he has said out of context of the Question should be expunged.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SHIPPING AND TRANSPORT (SHRI BUTA SINGH): On a point of order. Rule 50, part (2). May I read it, with your permission? It is very clear.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: During Question Hour, there can be no point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: I will not allow this. I will listen to him and then I will overrule. That \*..... part should be expunged. It is unparliamentary.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: I say incorrect statement. Lastly, is it or is it not true... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Why do you interrupt the hon. Member? The Minister can answer it fully.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: Is it or is it not true that secret meetings are a part—a recognised part—of international diplomacy just as Pandit Nehru, between 1950 and 1955, had a large number of secret meetings with world statesmen and ultimately brought about the independence of Austria?

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: A general question like that is not in order. What is relevant here is a particular meeting between certain persons in a particular setting. Now, the House wanted me to give the facts. I have given the facts. It is for the House... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: I am saying, there is no question of credi-

bility. It is a part, a recognised part, of international diplomacy.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: It may be their view. I have placed before the House the considered view of this Government. Now we are dealing with our friends in the Arab countries, we are dealing with the PLO. They have been our very good friends, and we would like to continue this friendship for all time to come. (*Interruptions*) In this context, this is the considered opinion of the Government. If some one does not agree with this opinion, I am not forcing him to agree.

SHRI RAM JETHMALANI: He has not answered a single question.

SHRI R. L. BHATIA: Like a coy maiden, Mr. Vajpayee invited Moshe Dayan, had a secret meeting and then denied it. In the field of diplomacy he was trying in an amateurish way his genuine non-alignment....

MR. SPEAKER: Please put your question.

SHRI R. L. BHATIA: May I ask the Minister whether it is a fact that apart from the press reports he had any written communication between Vajpayeeji and Morarji Desai and secondly whether it has affected our relations with the Arab countries.

MR. SPEAKER: It has already been answered.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: It has not affected our relations. But it is something which could affect our relations. We have tried to make amends at the earliest and I am quite sure that this exposure in this House has been in the right direction.... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I would like to make a personal explanation.

MR. SPEAKER: That I will allow.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: Though incidentally or occasionally from time to time secret meetings do take place, in history we have never known of any secret meetings between a Foreign Minister of one country with a Prime Minister and Foreign Minister of another country with which there are no diplomatic relations. This is the policy....

MR. SPEAKER: That is a statement of fact. You please put your question. ... (*Interruptions*) Please don't interrupt him.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: Evidence points out that this was a move to support the Sadat-Israeli plot to finish off the Arab countries. May I know whether the government and the Minister will look into this and particularly, the Minister will look into this and satisfy himself that the pro-Israeli lobby in this country and particularly, in his Ministry which was involved of which I can give evidence, will be kept in check, if not totally smashed? We do not want the Minister to be vindictive but we want the Minister to keep this pro-Israeli lobby in his Ministry and elsewhere under check so that it will not jeopardise our relations with the Arabs.

SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO: I do not know of any lobby pro this or pro that in the Ministry. They are all officials of the Ministry. They work wherever they are asked to work and on whichever desk they are asked to work and to whichever country they are asked to go, they go as Ambassadors or other functionaries. But about the angle which the hon. Member has posed here, I would only say that I am not aware of any such thing, but I cannot ignore it if any such thing comes to my notice.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, सवाल-जवाब के दौरान कई बार मेरा नाम लिया गया है। (व्यवधान) मे यह स्पष्ट करना चाहूंगा कि श्री मोशे दयन किसी निमंत्रण पर भारत नहीं आये। वह अपनी इच्छा से आये थे, भेस बदल कर आये थे। (व्यवधान) उनकी यात्रा

क गुप्त यात्रा थी। अन्तर्राष्ट्रीय कूटनीति में ऐसी गुप्त यात्रायें होती हैं—पहले भी हो चुकी हैं। अध्यक्ष महोदय, विदेश मंत्री के नाते मैं बहुत सी बातें जानता हूँ, मगर देश-हित सर्वोपरि है। नंदादेवी में न्यूक्लियर डिवाइस, प्लैटोनियम पावर-पैक, रखा गया, जनता सरकार को इसका पता था। हमने इसकी पुष्टि तब तक नहीं की, जब तक यह मामला सदन में नहीं उठा। लेकिन हमने उसका राजनैतिक लाभ उठाने की कोशिश नहीं की। मोशे दयान की गुप्त यात्रा से घरबों के साथ भारत के सम्बन्धों को नुकसान नहीं हुआ। (व्यवधान) मैं सवाल नहीं कर रहा हूँ। मैं पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन दे रहा हूँ। (Interruptions) I am on a Personal explanation. I am entitled to offer an explanation. ... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Order, order. I have to decide it.... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: You may ask for Personal Explanation.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: I rise on a point of order. I am giving you an instance. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Why don't all of you sit? This is not the way. Under Rule 357, 'A Member may, with the permission of the Speaker, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the House'...

You come with your Personal Explanation and I will give you the permission.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: When Shri Lalit Narain Mishra asked for permission to give his Personal Explanation, instantly, he was allowed. (Interruptions).

SHRI ATAL BEHARI VAJPAYEE: All right. I will not give personal explanation now. But, will you allow me to put a Supplementary?

मैं व्यक्तिगत स्पष्टीकरण बाद में दूंगा। अगर आप की इजाजत हो तो एक सवाल पूछूँ।

क्या यह सच नहीं है कि मोशे दयान की गुप्त यात्रा से भारत की प्रतिष्ठा को धक्का नहीं लगा .... (व्यवधान)

एक माननीय सदस्य: धक्का लगा।

MR. SPEAKER: Why don't you maintain decorum in the House. This is not the way.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपयी: धक्का इनको लग रहा है। धक्का तब लगा जब प्रधान मंत्री ने कूट नीति के सारे नियमों को ताक पर रख कर गुप्त यात्रा को सार्वजनिक यात्रा बना दिया। क्या मंत्री महोदय चाहेंगे, विदेश मंत्री के नाते बहुत सी जो गुप्त बातें मैं जानता हूँ, क्या उन का रहस्योद्घाटन किया जाना वह पसंद करेंगे?

श्री पी० बी० नरसिंह राव: भारत की प्रतिष्ठा को तो उसी वक्त धक्का लगा जब कि पहली रिपोर्ट न्यूयार्क के किसी अखबार में निकल चुकी थी। अब रही यह बात कि अटल जी धमकी यह दे रहे हैं कि उन के पास बहुत बड़ा मसाला मौजूद है, वह कुछ उस का भण्डाफोड़ करना चाहते हैं.... (व्यवधान).....

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: rose. .... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The Minister is replying—not you.

श्री पी० बी० नरसिंह राव: उनके औचित्य के बारे में वह समझें, सोचें, जो चाहें कहें।

SHRI CHANDRAJEET YADAV: It is now an established fact that Moshe Dayan visited this country; also he came in an IAF plane. It means this was arranged by the Government of India. Also the meeting took place at the official residence of the Prime Minister. (Interruptions). Since this meeting took place at the official residence of the Prime Minister, this creates a suspicion. This shows that it was a political mission. And the government of India was a party to it. It provided him with a plane and he met at the official residence of the Prime Minister. But no record was kept. This country's relationship with the other countries politically and, in fact, this country's credibility, as the Minister has said, has gone down. Now our image has been tarnished. Will the Minister be pleased to state whether he would get into touch with the Israeli Government, by whatever method he wants because they have their Consulate in Bombay and because a serious matter is involved in it as no record has been kept about that meeting, to find out what was



that secret meeting about, what took place there and what was the matter discussed in that meeting?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** We will find out but not by the method suggested by the hon'ble Member.

**SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA:** Mr. Vajpayee just now in the question that he asked prefixed it by saying that Moshe Dayan came here without any invitation from the government and he came on his own. In the Statesman Mr. Vajpayee is quoted as saying—I do not know whether it is correct or not—that Moshe Dayan came to India on his own initiative incognito and without any prior knowledge of the External Affairs Ministry. Now what I want to know is because the hon'ble Minister in his main reply said that the records of the Ministry do offer a basis for conjecturing or surmising that visits were made not once but three times, viz., 1977, 1978 and 1979.

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** I did not say that. What I said was that while we have complete information about Moshe Dayan's visit to Delhi in August 1977 the statements of the leaders of Janata and BJP have given different dates and I have no reason to dis-believe their memory. Therefore, it points to the possibility of more visits than one.

**SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA:** Sir, I had not completed my question. I want to know from whatever the evidence that is in the possession of the Ministry does it substantiate Mr. Vajpayee's or other Janata government ministers' contention that Moshe Dayan's visit was not known before hand to the Government of India. That they had not invited him. That he came on his own that he came incognito and no arrangements were made from the government side. What does your record show?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** I want to draw the distinction of govern-

ment as such in some other Ministry and the Ministry of External Affairs. So far as the Ministry of External Affairs is concerned I have already submitted that beyond that particular aspect where the then Foreign Minister was asked by the Ministry about these reports emanating from different sources and the instructions which he gave beyond that the Ministry does not possess any evidence or record of any kind, but it is obvious that as Moshe Dayan came by our own IAF aircraft and naturally his coming here was overseen by the functionaries of the Government of India, I cannot say that the Government as such can plead ignorance.

**SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU:** Sir, this sort of secret visits are not unknown to us. Mrs. Gandhi went to meet Mr. Kissinger in Teheran in 1974. Will the hon'ble Minister kindly tell us since the matter has come on the floor of this House as to what specific proposals came from Moshe Dayan; and secondly what exactly the then government and the Prime Minister told Moshe Dayan in reply?

**SHRI P. V. NARASIMHA RAO:** I have no information on that. No records are available. In the absence of records I cannot imagine things and tell the House. I have said in so many words that no record on that aspect or of any kind is available.

#### **WRITTEN ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS**

##### **Bangladesh Intrusion into Indian Territory**

**\*63. SHRI AJOY BISWAS:**

Will the Minister of **EXTERNAL AFFAIRS** be pleased to state:

(a) how many times the Bangladesh nationals have intruded into the Muhuri Charland of Belonia Sub-Division in Tripura this year; and

(b) whether the Bangladesh Government have given any compensation to the affected people?