

LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Wednesday, December 16, 1992/
Agrahayana 25, 1914 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at seven minutes past
Eleven of the Clock

[MR. SPEAKER in the Chair]

OBITUARY REFERENCE

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Hon. Member, I have to inform the House of the sad demise of our former colleague, Shri G.S. Nihal Singh Wala.

Shri G.S. Nihal Singh Wala was first elected to Fourth Lok Sabha from Ferozepur constituency of Punjab in a bye-election in November, 1969. He remained its Member till its dissolution on 27th December, 1970. He was elected again in 1980 from Sangrur constituency in Punjab to serve the Seventh Lok Sabha during 1980-84. Earlier, he had also been a member of Punjab Legislative Assembly during 1954-57, 1962-67, 1967-69 and 1972-77. He served as the Chief Parliamentary Secretary in Punjab during 1967-69 and 1972-77.

An agriculturist by profession, Shri Nihal Singh Wala was a well known political and social worker. As a seasoned and active parliamentarian, he raised in the House various issues connected with the problems faced by the people of Punjab

Shri Nihal Singh Wala passed away at Chandigarh on 1st December, 1992 at the

age of 68 following a cardiac arrest.

We deeply mourn the loss of this friend and I am sure the House will join me in conveying our condolences to the bereaved family.

The House may now stand in silence for a short while as a mark of respect to the deceased.

11.07 hrs

The Members then stood in silence
for a short while

RE. KAR SEVA IN AYODHYA ON 6.12
1992 AND CONSEQUENT
DEVELOPMENTS IN THE COUNTRY

[Translation]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: (South Delhi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, democracy has been murdered. (Interruptions) Three State Governments have been dismissed, let us condole this act. (Interruptions) The way the Governments of Uttar Pradesh, Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Himachal Pradesh were dismissed and democracy murdered, we must express our condolence on it.

[English]

SHRI ANBARASU ERA (Madras Central): You have betrayed the Parliament and you have betrayed the Supreme Court. (Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh):
Mr. Speaker, Sir.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): Has the Question Hour been suspended. Under which rule the business of the House is being conducted?

[English]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Now this is Question Hour. You have to suspend the Question Hour first. You have not suspended the Question Hour. We have given notice.

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN (Rosera): We have given notice under Rule 388. You have not suspended the Question Hour. If he has given notice, then you allow him. (Interruptions).

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have to plead whatever other friends are saying. It is precisely that which I am submitting to you. I have given notice under the proper Rules of the Rules of Conduct and Procedure of the House. I have given notice for suspension of question hour. The notice for suspension of question hour arises from the dissolution of the three State Governments. This is the submission I wish to make and this is precisely the difficulty. I am speaking on a motion of suspension of question hour. (Interruptions)

[Translation]

DR. LAXMINARAYAN PANDEYA: (Mandsaur): Question Hour should be suspended. A notice to this effect has already been given. (Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: I am on a point of order. (Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am precisely on that very subject, on this subject of suspension of question hour. (Interruptions)

On the One hand, when we discussed earlier and when Shri Atalji wanted to say

what we have to say, similar kind of barracki was witnessed throughout the day. The State Governments have been dismissed and the dismissal is born purely out of political malice of the lowest kind, a political malice born out of political inactivity of the majority. (Interruptions).

[Translation]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: (Lucknow): Mr. Speaker, Sir, we want to cooperate with you in this matter. We are throttled both inside and outside the House. The Parliament would not be allowed to run.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: This House is meant for discussing what is happening in the country. I am inclined to allow you to discuss these matters. I am inclined even to suspend the question hour and allow you to the discussion. You please take up the discussion. I would request each one of you to express your views in a manner which would be useful to the entire country as such. That is all.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: I have given a notice under Rule 388.

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ram Vilas Paswan ji, I have said that I am inclined to allow you to discuss the situation which is developing in the country. It covers everything. If you have given a notice for suspension of the Question Hour, if Shri Jaswant Singh ji has given and if others have given, that means all of you have agreed that the matter is so important that it should be taken up in the first hour itself. I am inclined to allow it. You can take up the discussion.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOUDHURY (Katwa): What is the Motion about?

MR. SPEAKER: It is about the situation in the country.

SHRIBASUDEB ACHARIA: Under what
are you allowing it? (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Let me know one thing
from you.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: It is precisely
point that I wish to make a submission
out. (*Interruptions*)

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Who is going to
move that Motion? We want to know what is
the Motion about (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: There is one thing. I am
allowing Shri Jaswant Singh ji to speak. I
would request the Members to allow the
other Members also the express their views
later on.

MR. SPEAKER: Let me know one thing
from you: Do you want to discuss it or not?
I have made the ambit of the discussion quite
all-pervasive. I have said that it is about the
situation in the country. I am allowing it.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): How do
you consider it? What is the rule under which
you allow it? (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, I am on
the point of making my submission as to why
we felt it necessary to move it. I have to place
my view points before the House.

SHRI INDRAJI GUPTA (Midnapore):
Sir, you have allowed Shri Jaswant Singh to
speak. But it must be under some rule. You
have suspended to Rules also. Shri Jaswant
Singh, have you moved for suspension of the
Question Hour?

MR. SPEAKER: I have agreed to what
you asked for.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Yes, I have
moved for suspension of the Question Hour.
I am making a submission as to why I have
moved for suspension of the Question Hour.
There is a procedure even for suspension of
the Question Hour.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, while
accepting this good gesture, I have to place
my view: points why I have moved the Motion
for suspension of the Question Hour. I have
to explain my views. That is what I am telling.
(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I agree with you.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: You cannot
suspend all the Rules like that.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: I am on a point
of order.

MR. SPEAKER: Please understand it. If
you have marked my words very carefully,
you would have understood that I am not
restricting the discussion to what he has said
in his notice. There is a notice for suspension
of the Question Hour by Shri Jaswant Singh,
by Shri Ram Vilas Paswan-ji and others also.
And the matters contained in those notices
are different. I am saying that the entire
situation in the country should be discussed.
It contains everything. I am allowing Shri
Jaswant Singh to speak.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, the
Members have a right to know what is the
Motion that is before the House.
(*Interruptions*)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: I am on a point
of order.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRIBASUDEB ACHARIA: How? What
is the Motion about?

MR. SPEAKER: First of all, you please
sit down. I know that you are a very
knowledgeable and you know everything. I
know that the good of the country is at your
heart. But unfortunately you do not have all
the information which is given to me through
the notices. I am clubbing all the notices
together. I am allowing the Members to
discuss these matters. I was told in the
Business Advisory Committee meeting that

you all were interested in discussing the matter. Now, if we have found a solution to this problem, I think you should not get up and you should not ask for this thing and that thing. If it has to be in the form of a rule, I can do that. I have done that. I have applied my mind. Please allow the discussion to go on .

SHRI BUTA SINGH (Jalore): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to seek a clarification from the Chair.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes.

SHRIBUTA SINGH: Sir, in your wisdom, you have rightly allowed the suspension of the Question Hour. Shri Indrajit Gupta has asked. "Have you suspended all the rules?" I am on a very limited question. Is Shri Jaswant Singh going to initiate the debate? Or, is he going to discuss his own notice and then, afterwards, you will not allow the debate?

MR. SPEAKER: The Speaker has the inherent powers. If the rules apply, the Speaker will use the rules and allow the discussion. If the rules do not apply, if the rules are not available, the Speaker will use them. I have asked Shri Jaswant Singh ji to initiate the debate.

SHRI TARIT BARAN TOPDAR (Barrackpore): What is the subject? (Interruptions)

SHRI ANIL BASU (Arambagh): Is it a Zero Hour discussion? (Interruptions)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: I am on a point of order. (Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD (Saharanapur): Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is true that you have suspended the Question Hour. But various Members have demanded different matters to be discussed. On which subject you are going to hold a discussion. (Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. If I am asking Mr. Jaswant Singh to speak, I have said that what is to be discussed. If you have marked my words very carefully, you would have come to know what I am suggesting for discussion. I am asking, requesting Mr. Jaswant Singh and his party members also not to disturb other Members after he makes a statement. This is a kind of courtesy which should be shown to the House. With that caution, I am allowing Mr. Jaswant Singh.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir. (Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD: I have no objection to your allowing him. However, the question is that various Members have given their notice to suspend Question Hour and want to hold discussion on various issues. It is all right that you accepted Shri Jaswant Singh's notice but you may kindly tell us the issue on which you want to hold a discussion.

MR. SPEAKER: Had you listened to me, you would have come to know about it.

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD: How can you allow when no Resolution has been introduced in the House. You suspended the Question Hour.

MR. SPEAKER: I tell you, please sit down. Please listen carefully. I repeat so that nobody will have any doubt any more. If I go on speaking and you do not listen to me, your doubts will not be cleared. We are discussing the situation prevailing in the country.

[English]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Midnapore): Mr. Speaker, Sir, excuse my ignorance. Once you said that you are allowing Mr. Jaswant Singh to make a statement. Very good, I have no objection. Earlier you said

that you are asking him to initiate the debate. We should know what specific motion the debate is going to be on. What will be the fate of that motion, we do not know. And also, Sir, the Question Hour has not been suspended.

MR. SPEAKER: I have suspended the Question Hour.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: How? The House has to do it.

MR. SPEAKER: I will read out the rules.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: You can move for it. But the House has to do it. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: If you do not want a discussion, I will retire from the House.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD: I have given notice. Many other Members have also given notice. The question is which Resolution is to be adopted?

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: I will read out the rules.

(Interruptions)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): But that should be under some rules. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Let there not be a battle between the Speaker and the Members. I will read out the rules. This is Rule Number 32. When I come to the House, I do glance at the rules and come to the House. The Rule says.

"Unless the Speaker otherwise directs, the first hour of every sitting shall be available for the asking and answering of questions."

It is for the Speaker to direct. It is not for the House to direct. Supposing the Speaker is not willing to do it, the Speaker will collect

the sense of the House. I am doing it. Please understand it. If you do not want a discussion, well, you say that you do not want a discussion.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: I have one submission to make. We want a discussion. Will it be under Rule 184 or Rule 193? Let us know this. What is the text of the Motion?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Why are you feeling confused?

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD: I along with many others have given notice the question is who will initiate the debate. We had given notice for the suspension of Question Hour and you suspended it. But who will initiate the debate for the suspension of the Question Hour.

MR. SPEAKER: Look, I am repeating it again

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI BUTA SINGH (Jalore): Mr. Speaker, Sir, in the normal course if the Speaker has decided in his own wisdom to suspend the Question Hour, then the Speaker is well within his right to use Rule Number 32. Unfortunately, today the Speaker is acting on the notice of two hon. Members, namely...

MR. SPEAKER: I have got many notices and not just two. There are many who have given notices to me. You know very well that in the Business Advisory Committee we decided that we want to discuss this matter.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Even then the Chair may be pleased to make a motion before the House. The Chair must bring a

motion before the House (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: I have six notices.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: The Chair must make complete proposal of the motion before the House so that Mr. Jaswant Singh can initiate the discussion. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: For God's sake, please understand what I am clearly saying. I am saying that the discussion on the present situation will take place. It is an omnibus resolution, it covers everything. You please understand the nuances of the words. It covers everything. It is not restricted to anything. It should not take so much of time for our learned hon. Members to understand what I am trying to convey.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI RASHEED MASOOD: Mr. Speaker, Sir, you have suspended the Question Hour- it is all right. But who will initiate the debate to be taken up and under which Rule will it be initiated?

[*English*]

SHRI E. AHAMED (Manjeri): Mr. Speaker, Sir, there is another important issue and that is about the demolition of the mosque. Why do you not allow a discussion on that?

MR. SPEAKER: I will allow you later on. That is covered in this. You will speak on that.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the present performance...

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Jaswant Singh, please allow me to repeat that after you speak, the House will need the courtesy of you and your Members to allow others to speak.

SHRI SOBHANADREWARA RAO VADDE (Vijayawada) : This government

has already been fooled. The nation is fooled.

[*Translation*]

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I would like to thank you that you allowed the discussion. Earlier also I wanted to have a debate on it. This House is for discussion. But you must be remembering that the House was not allowed to run after the unfortunate incident that took place in Ayodhya on 6th December. I do not want to raise that matter again. You had allowed me to speak but the hon. Members of this House did not allow me to speak. The House had to be adjourned. It is good that you allowed a debate on it today. (*Interruptions*) Mr. Speaker, Sir, I cannot speak in this manner.

MR. SPEAKER: I allowed a discussion that day also. Today also I allow a discussion.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I had urged you that day and repeat the same today that if you want meaningful discussion the leader of opposition on whom a number of allegations have been made should be brought to the House. Otherwise, the discussion cannot be meaningful. (*Interruptions*) I am not demanding the release of Shri Advani. Advani ji has been arrested on the basis of a number of baseless charges and put behind the bars. We want that he should be shifted to Tihar Jail and brought to the House. Does the Government want to suppress his voice by putting him behind the bars? (*Interruptions*) Mr. Speaker, Sir, no discussion would be meaningful without Shri Advani. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA (South Delhi): Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Advani should be brought to the House. No discussion would be meaningful without his presence. The discussion would be held only after bringing him to the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAJVEER SINGH (Aonia): The discussion would be incomplete and meaningless without Shri Advani. His point of view should also be taken into

consideration. He should be called to the House. Views of both sides should be taken into consideration. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMADAN LAL KHURANA: We want that Shri Advani should be shifted to Tihar Jail and brought to the House by the evening. Only then the discussion should be held. Till then the House should be adjourned. Discussion can be held only in the evening. It is very necessary to call Advani ji to the House and hear him (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Speaker Sir, I wish to remind you and I wish to remind this Assembly that when the House was adjourned the last time and on the occasion when you conferred with all of us to say that if the House be adjourned we had three options, you put the options to us and said let there be a discussion. Like my senior leader Atal Bihari Vajpayeeji has mentioned just now, we were for discussion, we are for But the discussion has to be held as a discussion today. The Treasury Benches cannot hold a pistol to my temple and then say let there be a discussion ..(*Interruptions*). They want to hear. (*Interruptions*).. They are dismissing BJP Governments. They have wholesale dismissed BJP Governments...(*Interruptions*).. It is this Government that has dismissed the three duly constitutionally elected State Governments; a step borne out of political malice of the lowest kind..(*Interruptions*).. A step borne out of continued political dissections within the ruling party. You have taken a step. You have tried to find an answer to the issues confronting the country, by tried to find an answer to the dissensions within the Treasury, within the Cabinet, within the Cabinet by dismissing BJP Governments. This will not serve. When we said we want a discussion, you point three options to us. If this kind of behavior that you have the leader of the Opposition behind bars, (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR

(mayildautrai); The traitors should be arrested..(*Interruptions*)

AN HON. MEMBER: Killers should be hanged. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI E. AHAMED (Manjeri): He was the leader of demolition in Ayodhya.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: How can we have a discussion, Sir? They want to have a discussion on their terms; they want to have a discussion on their conditions. They want to place a political pistol all postal to my temple and then say, discuss now. They have dismissed three duly elected State Governments. Every time that I say anything, the House rises in uproar. Hon. Member sitting here are suggesting that Advaniji not only be arrested, but he be hanged. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRIISHNAN (Badagara): Not one hon. Member has said this. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI BALRAJ PASSI (Nainital): The persons having the mentality of disite grating the country...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: Shri Mani Shankar Aiyar has demanded to hang Shri Advani. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MANI SHANKAR AIYAR: Don't speak wrong. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SATYANARAYAN JAITYA (Ujjain): Shri Mumtaj Ansari has asked to hang Shri Advani. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: We earnestly believe Sir that this is the forum for discussing the issues that confront the nation. But the issues that confront the nation cannot be twisted out of shape, the issue that confront the nation cannot be put across as matter of

convenience either of the Cabinet or of the hon. Prime Minister or of the Treasury Benches. If you put those as a convenience and if you wish to use this decision as a convenience, it will not work. The problems that confront the country far transcend the temporary difficulties of the Congress Party and the difficulties of the Congress party are not solved. *(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI RAM PARAKASH CHADHAN (Aubatga): You have issued the etre country.. *(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI A CHARLES (Trivandrum): You may answer as to why they have destroyed the Babri Masjid.. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: There were three issues. When the House Adjourned last, you put it to us that there are three possibilities. I submitted to you with utmost seriousness that this House must discuss and we must discuss. It is a matter of record that it was then a proposal from the treasury benches that the House be adjourned *sine die*. *(Interruptions)* It was a proposal. *(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD): We suggested it because the House was not allowed. I said either the House should be allowed to work or we should not sit here. We should not continue as adjournment after adjournment. So, the first thing shelled not be lost sight of the House. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: It is now confirmed that the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs having said that *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: In all fairness to Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad, it must be said that he said either let us work or let us adjourn or let us adjourn upto the 16th.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I am not saying

anything different, Sir. I am saying exactly what you say. Why did we not work then? Why were we not working? The mement my leader Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee got up then to make a statement to explain and to ask of this House and to ask of you as to what we wanted to be done and our voice also be heard, he was stopped, I can understand, they did not agree with us. In fact we do not wish to agree with them in the situation as such. There is no agreement between the Congress party and the BJP; there might be an agreement between the Congress party and the Janta Dal and the Left Front. That is a matter of their political convenience. In this kind of a political convenience - that is precisely the point that we are making - if a discussion has to be held, let there be a discussion. But in that discussion, you cannot hold a political pistol to my head and you cannot say, "I am now going to kill you. Now discuss the options of killing and not killing". That is not a discussion that is to be held. *(Interruptions)* I will submit to you, Sir, that in the situation. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOBHANADREESWAR RAO VADDE: Your party has not allowed the Speaker to make a statement on that day. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Sir, if the hon. Member Shri Jaswant Singh for when I have great regard has initiated the discussion, well, we do not have any objection to the discussion. Then it should be followed by the Members of other political parties, But, if it is culminating to their saying that unless the hon. Leader of the Opposition comes to this House then only a discussion will be there, then... *(Interruptions)*

SOME HON. MEMBERS:
Yes. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: If it is so, then I may say that it is totally unjustified and undemocratic. *(Interruptions)*

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No
No. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: It is

unjustified and undemocratic. (*Interruptions*)
If it is a discussion, we are for a discussion. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS
AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND
TECHNOLOGY (DEPARTMENT OF
ELECTRONICS AND DEPARTMENT OF
OCEAN DEVELOPMENT) (SHRI
RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM): If
they do not want to allow a discussion, let
them make it clear no... (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: Please
let Shri Advani attend the House..
(*Interruptions*) Is it unjustified to put the
demand for the presence of the Leader of the
Opposition in the House? (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI P.C. THOMAS (Muvattupuzha):
He is under judicial custody and not under
the Government's custody. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI GULAM NABI AZAD: Is there a
discussion or not? (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

If there is a discussion, then I will assure
you that from my party we will keep mum.
And we will listen each and every word of the
Opposition. But if it is not a discussion, I am
sorry, then it will be very difficult for us.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: The
House comprises of three parts namely the
leader of the House, the leader of the
opposition and the Speaker.. (*Interruptions*)
Is it unjustified to call the leader of the
opposition in the House? (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh):
Mr. Speaker, Sir, what are the conditions in
which you want this discussion to take place?
We are not holding a discussion in a vacuum.
We are holding the discussion in a particular
political situation. What are the identifiable
landmarks of that political situation?

This Government has gone and banned
organisations like the RSS and the Vishwa
Hindu Parishad. We believe the rank and file
of my party believes- that the RSS is an
organisation imbued with the highest ideas
of nationalism (*Interruptions*) It is a fact that
they have a different viewpoint. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

BALRAJ PASSI : We have won the
election not with the help of police; we have
won the election with the votes of the people.

[*English*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I do not wish
to go into a detailed analysis of the
grounds. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ANBARASU ERA (Madras
Central): I am on a point of order I know, they
are planning to accuse the Prime Minister
and the Congress
Government. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK (Ahmedabad):
Under which rule, he has a point of order,
Sir?

MR. SPEAKER: No point of order.
Please sit down.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: All along, the
effort has been to have a discussion, but
have it only on the terms and conditions of
the Treasury Benches, and only to hear from
us. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK

(Buldana): We wanted an unconditional discussion.

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL (Candigarh): Sir, you have given an opportunity. That opportunity must be used in a right direction. (*Interruptions*) You are raising the same point again and again.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: What did this Government do, Sir? This Government goes and bans Rashtriya Swayamsewak Sangh, and this banning is sheer mindless absurdity because in the State of Punjab that is torn just now it is the Chief Minister of Punjab who says: I cannot enforce this regulation in Punjab because in Punjab, it is the BJP and the RSS that have stood against the terrorists.

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF COMMUNICATIONS (SHRI RAJESH PILOT): Please do not misquote him. He never said that. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Incidentally, even while hon. Shri Buta Singh gets up to interrupt me, may I remind him that he does not represent Punjab, that he is returned to this House by the State of Rajasthan? It is Rajasthan, that has returned him here. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BUTA SINGH: There is a peculiar situation in Punjab. That is why he is talking that line. But there is no question of supporting the RSS or BJP even.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Should I tell you?

SHRI PAWAN KUMAR BANSAL: What happened on oth? You mention that first. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: No Lody wants Arjun Singh in Punjab they want you (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BALRAJ PASSI: You have won the election by securing only 4000 votes. You are not the real representative of the

people. We have won the mandate of the people. But you have won the election only with the help of police. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGMEET SINGH BRAR (Faridkot): I secured two and a half lakh votes. You might have obtained 4000 votes. I have secured the Akali votes too and your party has also a stronghold on that constituency. Perhaps you would have got 4000 votes but I secured two and a half lakh votes.

[*English*]

It is on record. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Speaker Sir, I just want to make two or three other submissions about the relevance of this discussion and in the context of this discussion.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI JAGMEET SINGH BRAR: You have held a joint Government in Punjab.

[*Translation*]

You and the Akalis have been associates. There was an alliance between their party and the Akali Dal. There had been a coalition Government of your party and Akali Dal. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: You were expelled from your party. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Sir, do you want a discussion?

MR. SPEAKER: You want it.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: We want a discussion but a discussion (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: If this is not a discussion, then what have we been hearing so far? That is what I wanted to clear in the beginning itself. If it is a discussion,

then I will assure the hon. Member that we will cooperate fully..(Interruptions).. If it is not a discussion, then I am very sorry. It is difficult for us to listen. (Interruptions).. I will reiterate the request to hon. Member., Jaswant Singhji. We are ready to cooperate with you fully if you initiate the discussion. (Interruptions) But it is very unfortunate and undemocratic if you say that the Parliament cannot be run without the presence of a particular Member. This is totally undemocratic and unacceptable and this cannot be done.(Interruptions)

[Translation]

TARACHAND KHANDELWA (Chandni Chowk): You Shri Advaniji in the House and only then, you will be exposed. (Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WASNIK: We would like to have a clarification from Mr. Jaswant Singh...(Interruptions).. Mr. Advani has been arrested; he has been lawfully arrested and he should be arrested. He should be kept behind bars. We do not want Mr. Advani in this House..(Interruptions).. He has demolished the mosque. He should be punished for what he has done..(Interruptions).. BJP, RSS and VHP are responsible for the situation in the country. They are responsible for the demolition of the mosque. We are not going to allow this sort of condition here. We want a discussion but an unconditional discussion.(Interruptions)

SHRI HARIN PATHAK (Ahmedabad): Whether you want Mr. Advani here or not, the nation wants him here.(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI BALRAJ PASSI: The House cannot run without the presence of Shri Advani. It will not run unless Shri Advani is brought here. First bring Shri Advani to the House, only then the House will run..(Interruptions) First bring the leader of the House here, only then we will allow the House to run.(Interruptions). Mr. Speaker,

Sir the leader of the Opposition should be brought here first..(Interruptions)

[English]

THE MINISTER OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (SHRI ARJUN SINGH): Can I make one humble request to you(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Speaker Sir. (Interruptions) *

[Translation]

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (BALRAM JAKHAR) You pises answer the questan of fr Azad tutemb what do you want to do?

[English]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Mr. Speaker Sir, for every sentence that I have to say and for every submission that I have to make, if successive members of this discordant Cabinet are to stand up..(Interruptions)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: I would again submit only one point I want just one word reply from the hon. Member whether the discussion has started or not. This is my simple pointed question. The hon. Member may reply whether the discussion has started or not.(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): He started the discussion with a preface. He said discussion would start. Then, so far he has spoken with such a preface.(Interruptions)

SHRI MADAN LAL KHURANA: The discussion will start with Shri Advani's presence here.

[Translation]

The Detailed discussion will be held only when Shir Advaniji is here.

[English]

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: If this is

the line of their Party, I must say that it is most unfortunate. Parliament cannot be held up for one particular person or one particular individual. I am very sorry to say it.

[*Translation*]

SHRIMADAN LAL KHURANA: What do you mean by democracy..(*Interruptions*) Is it a democracy? (*Interruptions*)

AN HON. MEMBER: This is the murder of democracy.

[*English*]

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: This is most undemocratic. Is this not an undemocratic attitude to say that Parliament should not go on because of just one person? (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (DEPARTMENT OF ELECTRONICS AND DEPARTMENT OF OCEAN DEVELOPMENT): (SHRI RANGARAJAN KUMARAMANGALAM): No more duplicity Sir! Let them be honest at least! Let them not behave as their usual selves with duplicity! (*Interruptions*)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: I have to make just three points. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh): I am on a point of order. Through my point of order I would like to know whether the discussion has been started with the speech being delivered by Shri Jaswant Singh or as Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee and Shri Khurana has stated that the discussion would not be held without the presence of Shri Advani. In the circumstances, I would like to know whether the discussion would continue after the speech of Shri Jaswant Singh or they would not hear others speeches. This matter should be made clear. Whether they would hear other's also or not, if other hon. Members too

will be heard, then only the debate is meaningful and if they do not want to hear others, there is no use of their speeches. You must clarify it. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: The points could easily be made. You wanted the discussion. But every submission I make and every sentence I speak is met by one or the other member of the Cabinet. This discordant and divided Cabinet is to stand up and seek clarification..(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Please tell us whether they will hear the other hon. Members to or not..(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: They should hear others also.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, we are ready to hear them. But our reverend leader Shri Vajpayee has stated that the discussion will not be held without the presence of Shri Advani. Shri Khurana too spoke in the same way. If they too are ready to hear other hon. Members, I have nothing to speak. We want discussion. They too should participate in hearing our speeches. They should listen to others also. It should not be so that after the speech of Shri Jaswant Singh is over, uproar is started. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to make a submission to you..(*Interruptions*)

AN HON. MEMBER: Mr. Speaker, Sir, he has no right to speak. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to submit to you that under the rules you have got certain powers. Some powers are linked with your post and you can use these powers. If the Government

has some difficulties in releasing Shri Advani, you can rescue Government from those difficulties by instructing it to bring Shri Advani in the House and enable him to participate in the discussion. Shri Narasimha Rao is not in a position to give such a decision because Shri Arjun Singh will not allow him to take such a decision but you have powers, you should use your discretionary powers and direct the Government to bring Shri Advani in the House so that the House may function. Even if he is brought under detention but he must be brought in the House. (Interruptions)

If you cannot do so tell us frankly that you are helpless. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: No.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Heaven will not fall if Shri Advani comes and attends the House. Why is the Government afraid of one person when it has got a comfortable majority in the House. (Interruptions)

SHRI MUKUL BALKRISHNA WANIK: Shri Advani is not simply a person but is a ** The case of a ** is being supported in the House (Interruptions)

SHRIMATI VIJAYARAJE SCINDIA (Guna): Mr. Speaker, Sir, if Shri Advani is a ...**.. then no one is a patriot in the House. (Interruptions)

SHRI RAM NAIK (Bombay North): Mr. Speaker, we cannot simply tolerate branding of Shri Advani as... * .. in the House (Interruptions)

Shri Wasnik has termed Shri Advaniji as..**.. so he must tender an apology for it in the House. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: He has said so or not, but you are bringing it on the record by repeating it again and again.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (Chittorgarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, so far as the question of the arrest of Shri Advani is concerned. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I suspended the Question Hour and allowed discussion on receiving the notice from you to this effect. Now are you going to have a discussion or not?

(Interruptions)

** Expunged as ordered by the Chair. [English]

SHRI ARJUN SINGH: You are being betrayed. Now it is your turn. (Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Are you going to discuss it or no?

SHRI BALRAM JAKHAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, why do you trust them and lose your credibility. When they were trusted in the past the country had to suffer. Do you want to suffer? Please, do not trust them.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I just made a humble submission to you.

MR. SPEAKER: You are prompting me to speak. Listen, it is our duty to safeguard all the institutions.

MR. SPEAKER: It is the interest of all of us that everything should be done as per the law. I am of the view that every party and the hon. Member of the House should be honourably treated as per the provisions of law. You are asking me to bring Shri Advani to the House. Once in the past also a similar case was raised in the House regarding bringing in the House of S. Atnder Pal Singh. At that time the court left the issue at the discretion of the Hon. Speaker. The then hon. Speaker suggested that the Government can bring him to the House if it wishes so. If Shri Advaniji is prepared to be released on bail then it is O.K. otherwise not.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I would like to tell you one more thing. Shri Advani is the leader of the opposition of the House. Please keep in mind one thing that when the leader of the House was asked to speak he was not allowed to speak by the Hon. Members. He had to issue the statement outside. Despite repeated pleas the Hon. Prime Minister was not allowed to make the statement in the House. If Shri Advani, the leader of the opposition refuses to be released on bail, then what should be done, I have already heard.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: We are also pleading the same thing. You have earlier said that this House was for safeguarding all the institutions; we also want to safeguard and protect all the institutions.

You were just now talking about Shri Advani, the leader of the opposition.

MR. SPEAKER: Listen, I respect all the hon. Members. However, it must not happen that without caring for the rules and law of the land we may do whatever we like. This definitely should not happen.

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): Sir, I am on a point of order. Sir, a suggestion is being made to bring Mr. Advani to the House from judicial custody by your decision. If Mr. Advani wanted to come before this House and address the House, he should have applied for bail. (Interruptions)

The very fact that he has not applied for bail shows that he does not want to come out of the jail custody; he wants to continue there. (Interruptions). It is his decision. You cannot force him. He has not expressed any intention to participate in the proceedings of the House. If he had done that, he would have moved for bail.

Now to put the onus on the Speaker that in spite of his non-application for bail, he should be brought here, it will be against the judicial order; it cannot be permitted. (Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: For me to put the onus of any action to be taken by the hon. Speaker, it is not anybody's function.

[Translation]

You cited an example of the ruling of a former Hon. Speaker. However, I would like to submit that in the present changed scenario a fresh ruling could be given by you. There is no such precedent in the history of the Constitution of India. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: First let the whole House do whatever is appropriate under the rules and if the need arises then I will take it up. You simply want to shift the responsibility on to others.

(Interruptions)

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: This Government and the treasury benches are afraid of bringing Shri Advani to the House. This Government is using force, against him. But his Government did nothing when temples were demolished in Pakistan and Bangladesh. This Government did not do anything when the Counsel General in Karachi was attached and his house was looted. We are urging you to get Shri Advaniji released. The whole House, wants to have a debate. We also want a discussion for fruitful debate and in view of the prevailing political conditions and the sensitivity of the issue. (Interruptions)

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Bareilly): They really do not want to have a debate on it, but will simply deceive you, like they did earlier on the issue of 'Karseva' (Interruptions)

12.09 hrs.

At this stage Shri Madan Lal Khurana and a few other hon. Members came near to the Table of the House and stood there.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 4 .P.M.