

**SHRI RAVINDRA VARMA:** We will certainly advise the State Governments to improve the efficiency of their machinery.

**श्री रीत लाल प्रसाद वर्मा :** क्या मंत्री महोदय यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि उपदान अधिनियम के संदर्भ में पिछले 10, 15 वर्षों में जो शिकायतें आई हैं, उस दौरान सरकार ने क्या कोई विशेषज्ञों की कमेटी बनाई और इस सम्बन्ध में क्या कोई विशेष राय जानने का प्रयास किया है, यदि हाँ, तो उसमें क्या सिफारिशें हैं ?

**THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF LABOUR AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (DR. RAM KIRPAL SINHA):** Sir, this scheme has been enforced after 1971 or 1972. So there is no question of getting complaints for the last 10 years or so.

**Report on Medical Treatment of Lok Nayak J. P. Narayan during Emergency**

+

\*342. **SHRI LAXMI NARAIN NAYAK:**

**SHRDI HARI VISHNU KAMATH:**

Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE be pleased to state:

(a) whether the Commission of inquiry appointed with Dr. Nagappa Alva as its Chairman to probe into the inadequacy of medical treatment provided for Loknayak Jayaprakash Narayan during his detention in 1975 under MISA in the P. G. I. Chandigarh, has submitted its final report;

(b) if so, whether it will be laid on the Table together with a memorandum of action taken by Government thereon; and

(c) if not, reasons therefor?

**स्वास्थ्य और परिवार कल्याण मंत्री (श्री रवि राय) :** (क) जी, नहीं। अन्तिम रिपोर्ट प्रस्तुत करने से पूर्व ही आयोग ने 17 फरवरी, 1979 को त्याग पत्र दे दिया।

(ख) और (ग). ये प्रश्न नहीं उठते।

**श्री लक्ष्मी नारायण नायक :** क्या मंत्री महोदय यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि लोकनायक जयप्रकाश नारायण की नजरबन्दी के समय पोस्ट ग्रेजुएट इस्टीट्यूट चण्डीगढ़ में उनकी अपर्याप्त चिकित्सा होने के कारण जो एक जांच आयोग डा० नागप्पा अलवा की अध्यक्षता में गठित हुआ था, उसने 17 फरवरी, 1979 को अपनी रिपोर्ट देने के पहले ही जो इस्तीफा दे दिया, इसके क्या कारण हैं ? सरकार ने अब तक उसके स्थान पर दूसरा आयोग क्यों नहीं गठित किया है और अब दूसरा आयोग कब तक गठित करने जा रहे हैं ?

**श्री रवि राय :** भाल्वा जी ने व्यक्तिगत कारण बता कर अपना इस्तीफा दिया है। उसके बाद सरकार क्या करेगी यह अभी सरकार के विचाराधीन है।

**श्री लक्ष्मी नारायण नायक :** मैं यह जानना चाहता था कि एक आयोग ने इस्तीफा दे दिया तो दूसरा आयोग आप कब तक गठित कर रहे हैं ?

**श्री रवि राय :** मैंने पहले प्रश्न का नायक जी को जवाब दिया कि व्यक्तिगत कारण को लेकर भाल्वा जी ने इस्तीफा दिया है, उसके बाद सरकार क्या पग उठायेगी वह विचाराधीन है।

**श्री कंवर लाल गुप्त :** क्या मंत्री महोदय को मालूम है कि श्री जयप्रकाश नारायण की बीमारी का रिकार्ड, जो चण्डीगढ़ में था, बदल दिया गया और उसमें काफ़ी टैपरिंग हुआ, और दूसरे यह मामला कोर्ट में ले जाया गया, ये सब कारण हैं, जिनकी वजह से डा० अलवा ने इस्तीफा दिया ? क्या मंत्री महोदय उन अप्रसन्नों को कोई सजा दिलायेंगे, जिन्होंने यह टैपरिंग किया, रिकार्ड को बदला और यह कोशिश की कि सही तथ्य जनता के सामने न आयें ?

**श्री रवि राय :** मैंने पहले जिक्र किया है कि डा० अलवा ने व्यक्तिगत कारण से इस्तीफा दिया है। इसका कारण टैपरिंग या कोई दूसरा कारण नहीं है। जहाँ तक इस बात का सम्बन्ध है, कि क्या पग उठाया जाये, मैंने पहले कहा है कि यह सरकार के विचाराधीन है।

**SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA:** I have asked two parts. One part is, is it a fact that the documents have been destroyed, changed and tampered with? If yes, what action will you take against those who did this?

**श्री रवि राय :** इस बारे में सरकार क्या पग उठाने वाली है, इस पर विचार किया जा रहा है। टैपरिंग का सवाल पैदा नहीं होता है। माननीय सदस्य ने पूछा है कि क्या डा० अलवा को इस्तीफे का कारण वह है। उसके बारे में जिक्र नहीं है। इस कमीशन की रिपोर्ट बाद में क्या होगी, उसके आधार पर विचार किया जायेगा।

**SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA:** I am not asking about the Commission at all. My question is, are you aware of this fact?

**SHRI VINODBHAI B. SHETH:** The reason given by the Minister that he has resigned on personal grounds is fishy. Chairman of 13 public sector undertakings have resigned on personal grounds. Mr. Nayak asked the Minister the real grounds for the resignation of Dr. Alva. Will the Minister let us know what is the present condition of Jayaprakash? I would like to know whether he keeps himself aware of the health condition of JP?

**MR. SPEAKER:** That does not arise from the question.

**SHRI ASOKE KRISHNA DUTT:** I am sorry to note the light manner in which this very important and serious matter is being discussed. Times without number, this House has discussed this issue. This Commission was appointed by the Government and Dr. Alva has resigned from the Chairmanship. The hon. Health Minister has just now said that he has resigned due to personal reasons. But this is a matter in which we must go deeper. We must have a clear statement from the Health Minister giving the specific reasons that have been mentioned by Dr. Alva. Our information is that he had to resign because the procedural manner in which this Commission was conducted was totally disliked by him and because he could not properly probe into the matter. A mere statement that he resigned for personal reasons is not appropriate. I would request the Minister through you to give us specific reasons as to why Dr. Alva has resigned. What has been done by the Government after his resignation to pursue this very important issue?

**SHRI RABI RAY:** As I have said earlier, he has resigned on personal grounds. There are no other reasons for his resignation. Except reiterating that, I have nothing more to say.

**SHRI ASOKE KRISHNA DUTT:** He did not answer the second part of my question. What has been done by the Government after his resignation?

**SHRI RABI RAY:** I have already said that the next decision of the Government will be made known to the House.

**SHRI ASOKE KRISHNA DUTT:** How soon?

**SHRI RABI RAY:** Very soon.

**SHRI ANNASAHEB GOTKHINDE:** This is one more infructuous attempt of appointing Commissions of Inquiry by the Government. I would like to know how much expenditure has been incurred by the Government on this Commission of Inquiry so far and whether he is going to appoint another infructuous Commission again for this.

**SHRI RABI RAY:** To reply to the first part of the question, I want notice.

जहाँ तक दूसरे सवाल का सम्बन्ध है, सरकार का विचार नहीं है।

**SHRI VASANT SATHE:** So much dust was raised in the country about the health of Loknayak. (*Interruptions*) For the first time, we are getting such a liberal opportunity to ask questions. I would like to know whether, from the enquiry made by the Commission till the date of his resignation, any material has come before the Commission to substantiate the allegations made for which the Commission was appointed.

**SHRI RABI RAY:** I have already informed the House that Dr. Alva submitted his interim Report and resigned. What steps Government would take after the resignation is under consideration? The Government is not intending to put the Interim Report on the Table of the House. Government's decision will be made known to the parliament.

**SHRI NANASAHIB BONDE:** From the answer of the Hon. Minister it

seems Dr. Alva resigned because of personal reasons. We are getting all the more doubtful about it. What are the personal reasons? Is it because of illness or because of some difficulties in his family? Some grounds must have been mentioned by him. You are not prepared to tell us what specific grounds he has given: why this hesitation to answer this question? It creates doubts in our mind about the whole problem. I want the Minister to tell us specifically what are the reasons that made him resign.

SHRI RABI RAY: Personal reasons are personal. He has written that he has resigned on personal grounds.

SHRI SHAMBHU NATH CHATURVEDI: Why is so much time being taken? Already there is a suspicion that records have been tampered with: so why give more time for tampering with the evidence that already exists? Why is an immediate decision not taken to put somebody else in the place of Dr. Alva?

SHRI RABI RAY. As and when Government decides I will come before parliament.

SHRI R. K. MHALGI: May I know from the Hon. Minister whether he himself is satisfied with the reasons given by the Doctor?

MR. SPEAKER: It is not for him.

SHRI R. K. MHALGI: In the capacity of a Minister whether he is satisfied with the reasons given by the Doctor is what I want to know.

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA: Is it a fact that he found himself incompetent to hold the enquiry because in practice he is more in politics than in medicine—he was an active Member of the Janata Party—so that he could not hold an impartial enquiry, and that is the reason why he resigned?

SHRI RABI RAY: I do not agree with the Member's contention.

### Cancellation of Trains

\*343. SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: Will the Minister of RAILWAYS be pleased to state:

(a) how many trains were cancelled and for how much period in the last 4 months on account of shortage of coal;

(b) are Government aware of the fact that Coal India Limited has repeatedly said that there is no shortage of coal but shortage of wagons;

(c) if so, what is his reaction thereto;

(d) what specific steps have been taken by Government to see that the wagons reach in time for loading coal; and

(e) when all the cancelled trains will be restored?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF RAILWAYS (SHRI SHEO NARAIN): (a) to (e). A statement is laid on the table of the House.