

[Shri L. N. Mishra]

(2) lay on the Table a copy of Notification No. G.O.(P) No. 315 published in Kerala Gazette dated the 15th March, 1965, making certain amendment to the Kerala Public Service Commission (Consultation) Regulations, 1957, under clause (5) of article 320 of the Constitution read with clause (c) (iv) of the Proclamation dated the 24th March, 1965, issued by the Vice-President discharging the functions of the President in relation to the State of Kerala, together with an explanatory Memorandum thereto. [Placed in Library, see No. LT-4536/65].

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: May I remind the senior Minister of the assurance he gave in the last session that the report of the Central Vigilance Commission would be laid on the Table in this session, and ask whether he is going to implement that assurance?

The Minister of Home Affairs (Shri Nanda): Yes, Sir.

12.28 hrs.

DEMANDS FOR SUPPLEMENTARY GRANTS (GENERAL), 1965-66

The Minister of Finance (Shri T. T. Krishnamachari): I beg to present a statement showing Supplementary Demands for Grant in respect of Budget (General) for 1965-66.

12.28½ hrs.

EMPLOYEES' STATE INSURANCE (AMENDMENT) BILL*

The Minister of Law and Social Security (Shri A. K. Sen): I beg to

move for leave to introduce a Bill further to amend the Employees' State Insurance Act, 1948.

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That leave be granted to introduce a Bill further to amend the Employees' State Insurance Act, 1948."

The motion was adopted.

Shri A. K. Sen: I introduce the Bill.

12.28-1½ hrs.

MOTION RE: INDO-PAKISTAN AGREEMENT ON GUJARAT-WEST PAKISTAN BORDER—
Contd.

Mr. Speaker: The House will now take up further consideration of the motion moved by Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri on the 16th August, 1965, namely:—

"That the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border be taken into consideration."

The Prime Minister and Minister of Atomic Energy (Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have heard the speeches delivered by hon. Members from both sides with rapt attention and I could well understand the feelings of the hon. Members so strongly expressed and with such frankness. I fully understand it and appreciate it, especially in the context of what has recently happened in Kashmir. But I would like to deal

*Published in the Gazette of India Extraordinary, Part II, section 2, dated 18th August, 1965.

with the Kutch situation first and this agreement.

May I in the very beginning refer to the arrangements which have been made with a view to the eventual demarcation of the boundary in question? I shall not go into generalities and therefore, I propose to take up the specific points. We had already agreed to following the procedure which had been settled between the two Governments in 1959 and 1960. At first discussions at official level were envisaged and thereafter at ministers' level. In the event of the failure of these negotiations, the matter was to be referred to an impartial tribunal for a binding decision.

About the various steps relating to the future course of action, a number of points have been made. Here-again, it would be useful to take them up one by one. The first point made is that in my statements in this House, I had referred only to demarcation and not to determination. Our basic stand has all the time been that the boundary is already well established and that the only question which remains is that of demarcation. At the same time, this is a matter on which there is a difference of opinion with Pakistan, whose contention has been for several years that the boundary has yet to be determined.

To begin with, I would like to draw the attention of the hon. members to the very first statement I made on the subject on 28th April, 1965 in this House. While referring to the situation which had arisen, I had then made the following point:

"I see no reason why the simple fact of determining what was the actual boundary between the erstwhile Province of Sind and the State of Kutch and what is now the boundary between India and Pakistan cannot be settled across the table."

The question of determination arose, because although we are quite firm

that the boundary is already officially settled, Pakistan contests that position. The resulting situation, therefore, has to be resolved by negotiations and failing that, by the verdict of an impartial tribunal. In either case, there has to be a determination of the boundary, which may be achieved by negotiation, or by a decision of the tribunal. Once this has happened, the next step would be demarcation of the boundary on the ground. I need not say more on this question, because as the matter is likely to be referred to a tribunal eventually, it would not be advisable to go into further details.

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): In the cease-fire agreement, you have used the word 'determination' once in the preamble and three times in the text.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Yes, it has been used and therefore I have given the explanation. What is important is what has to be determined. It has to be determined as to where the border between Pakistan and India lay at the time of either 15th August 1947 or when Kutch ceded to India. That is the first point which has to be decided. We have to determine where the border was between Pakistan and India.

Shri Hem Barua: Determine the claim of Pakistan to 3500 square miles?

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Let us hear him.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I was coming to that. I am merely saying that "determination" in that sense is right and it has to be used here.

Shri Hem Barua: There is no mention of the word "demarcation" anywhere in the statement.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Another point was made that although I had stated clearly that we do not accept that there was any territorial dis-

[Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri]

pute, eventually we had gone back upon that position. This, of course, is not at all correct. The fact is that we took good care to state in the agreement that so far as India was concerned there was no territorial dispute since the boundary was well established. You may see the relevant portion of the agreement in which it is said: "India claims that there is no territorial dispute as there is a well established boundary running roughly along the northern edge of the Rann of Kutch as shown in the preparation maps which needs to be demarcated on the ground".

An hon. Member: What about the (b) part?

Shri Hem Barua: What about the 1959 agreement on which the cease-fire agreement is based? There it is said: "and by exchange of territorial jurisdiction if any".

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. He is trying to read that. Let us listen to him first.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंबई) : अध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इन तरह बार बार इंटरप्ट करना ठीक नहीं है, जो उन को कहना है कह लेने दायिमे । अगर आप का कोई प्वाइंट रह जाएगा तो मैं उसके लिए बाद में इजाजत दे दूंगा ।

Shri Hem Barua: We want to clarify . . .

Mr. Speaker: Not after every point, every minute.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Sir, several hon. Members have referred to the statement of Pakistan's claim in article 3 of the agreement and particularly to the question of 3500 square miles of territory. Let us read the relevant portions of the

agreement. The actual words used are:

"Pakistan claims that the border between India and Pakistan in the Rann of Kutch lies roughly along the 24th Parallel as is clear from several pre-partition and post-partition documents etc."

Shri Hem Barua: And therefore . . .

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: And, therefore, the dispute involves some 3500 square miles of territory.

Shri Hem Barua: Now it is complete.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Hon. Members will see that the basic claim of Pakistan is in regard to the alignment of border between India and Pakistan, and this claim Pakistan seeks to base on pre-partition and post-partition documents. In other words, Pakistan also clearly agrees that the question for determination is the subsisting border between India and Pakistan. That is the main point which I would like to emphasise (*Interruption*). They also accept that the question for determination is the subsisting border between India and Pakistan—in its view, however, as I said, the border runs along the 24th Parallel. I would like, however, to reiterate and re-emphasise that the text of the agreement makes it perfectly clear that both India and Pakistan are referring to the subsisting border between the two countries and both claim to have evidence in support of what they say. This position is further clarified by the contents of article 3(1) (c) of the provisions of the agreement. For instance, it is stated on behalf of both Governments that their Ministers would meet in order to agree—mark the words—on the determination of the borders. Even when referring to the Tribunal, both Governments jointly stated that the issue before

the Tribunal is the determination of the border.

Shri Hem Barua: In the light of their respective claims.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: That is true; the claims are there. These are the words actually used in the text of the agreement. It is, of course, true that where there is a dispute about the alignment of a border between one country and another, such a dispute *ipso facto* involves some territory or other. But the basic issue is the determination of the border and not one of a decision as to whether the whole or part of the territory belongs to one claimant or the other. In the history of international disputes there have been occasions when territorial claims have been made by one country upon another despite the existence of a determined and accepted boundary.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Give one or two examples or instances.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: It is in such cases that a claim can appropriately be called a territorial claim.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Certainly.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Where, however, the border is undemarcated, the position is somewhat different. The issue in that case is one of laying down the alignment of the border.

My further comment on this point is that if a territorial dispute, properly so called, were raised on a border which has already been demarcated, we would resist that claim stubbornly, even if it related to a few square yards of our territory, let alone a few thousand square miles.

Lastly, I would like to state what is to be determined by negotiations or by the verdict of the Tribunal is not of any new boundary between India and Pakistan. That is not the

claim of either of the two countries. What is to be determined is the boundary which came into being as a result of the partition of the country and the accession of the State of Kutch to India. Clearly that boundary has to be identified, which has always existed between India and Pakistan and which will now be demarcated on the grounds. This identification and this determination will proceed on the basis of evidence and not on the basis of any other extraneous considerations. I hope that these clarifications which I have put forward will, to some extent meet the points raised by hon. Members.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: "To some extent"; you are right.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I knew that if I said "fully" it would not be hundred per cent correct.

There has been reference to the Tribunal, because, ultimately, the whole matter has to be decided by the Tribunal. There has been criticism of the personnel of the Tribunal. It is said that it provides for two members to be nominated by India and Pakistan but they will not be either Indians or Pakistanis. We did consider it and we felt that in case there is an Indian and a Pakistani then they will always be, if I might say so, pressing their point of view or, to some extent, they will be fighting amongst themselves. Perhaps, they might come to an agreement but it may not be possible for these two gentlemen to be of any special help to the third man, and the result would be that the third man will become the sole arbiter, one man completely deciding our fate with regard to this vital matter. We, therefore, felt that in case there are two people from different countries representing India and Pakistan, then it is possible that they might be able to take a somewhat reasonable view of things. Naturally, it is true that both the representatives will stand for the country they represent and it would be their duty to press their claims.

[Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri]

But it is just possible that they might be somewhat more helpful, their approach might be somewhat more reasonable and they would be helpful to the third man. So, I do not think that we are going to suffer in any way because we have decided to have members of the Tribunal from outside India.

Of course, it has been stated that the Tribunal might commit fraud, or fraudulent transactions or things of that type. I would not like to take that view. After all, the Tribunal will consist of very distinguished people and it would not be advisable to charge them from now on and express our view.

Shri Hem Barua: That was not my contention when I raised the point of order. I said that according to the International Law Commission the decisions of an international tribunal can be questioned on four grounds and I mentioned those four grounds. This agreement binds us with this particular sentence, and that is why I raised the objection. I did not doubt the *bona fide* of the members and I did not doubt the *bona fide* of the Indians.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: There is no question of doubting our *bona fide*. But, after all, there are conditions and conditions and a human being is a human being. Therefore, if we take a decision on the lines I have suggested, it does not mean that we suspect the *bona fide* of our own people.

In regard to the question of patrolling I can very well understand the feelings of the hon. Members. But, as I had stated in the beginning, Pakistan's claim was undoubtedly very big and they said that they were patrolling up to Karimsahi and they asked, of course, to patrol in all that area. I would not like to say much.

Shri Indrajit Gupta made a plausible case, I think, because of a shift

in their attitude or in their policy that is taking place. Anyhow, it was plausible and I would not like to go into that. But, somehow, it did not convince me, because first that party lent its full support to this agreement and, later on, changed its attitude. I do not know what the real reasons are. I shall leave it to Shri Indrajit Gupta to decide for himself.

Shri Indrajit Gupta (Calcutta South West): I cannot understand what you are saying. The party never lent its full support.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Anyhow, we read it in the newspapers. I could not get their official resolution, of course, but I did read it in the newspapers, and it was a clear support. However, that party is absolutely free to change its opinion any time it likes.

Shri Warior (Trichur): After seeing all the bungling.

An hon. Member: You have yourself changed the opinion.

श्री रामसेवक यादव (वाराणसी): प्रधान मंत्री भी अपनी राय बदल देते हैं।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: However, about this matter, there was a good deal of discussion and, in fact, the whole thing was considerably delayed because of this particular point. It is true the British Government went into this matter in great details...

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Not you.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: And we also. They came to certain conclusions. We had also some information and on the basis of our information as well as on the basis of what they had said, we felt that—this is a small track of about 9 miles which passes through the Indian territory—it would be in consonance with the

status quo ante if we accepted this track and allowed the Pakistan police to patrol over it.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Did the Gujarat Government agree?

Shri Yajnik (Ahmedabad): Was the Gujarat Government consulted about it?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Not exactly when we signed this Agreement. But there were talks and discussions about this with the Gujarat Government officials sometime back.....

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: You trusted the British Government and not the Gujarat Government.

एक माननीय सदस्य : वह मालिक है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I personally think that this track....

Shri Indrajit Gupta: Why did the Prime Minister use the words in his statement that Pakistan was said to have used the track and we had to accept it? What is the significance of these words?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: You will perhaps not like it. But I cannot go into those details.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Why not? It is very serious. Parliament is being kept in the dark.

Mr. Speaker: I cannot force him to say any particular thing. Whatever he wants to say, we have to listen and then to take a decision. Let him reply to the debate.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: This is not the way to treat Parliament. We are being kept in the dark. So many times has this blunder been committed. Parliament should be taken into confidence.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee (Calcutta Central): In the statement of the Prime Minister there was a sentence

full of great significance. Surely, we have the right to have an explanation.

Mr. Speaker: It has been asked but I cannot force him to say any particular thing.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: If it is the case that to explain this complex sentence is to divulge the material which he does not wish to put before the House, it is most ill-advised on the part of the Prime Minister to use that sentence for the consumption of the House and the people of this country. Once he has made the statement, he must explain it.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: As I said just now, on the one hand, the British Government looked into these matters and naturally they expressed their own views and we had also our own information and we felt convinced that this proposal of the patrolling on this track by the Pakistan police—it was formerly there—was legitimate... (Interruption). It was not—I am sorry...

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं प्रधान मंत्री से निवेदन करूंगा कि वह मानभाषा में बोलें। तब ऐसे शब्दों का इस्तेमाल नहीं होगा और सही सही बातें सामने आयेंगी।

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा (कोटा) : हमारे एरिया में पाकिस्तान का क्या अधिकार था ?

श्री बाबु लियये : 3 मार्च को सरदार स्वर्ण सिंह ने यह क्यों कहा कि 25 जनवरी के पहले पाकिस्तानी पुलिस या सैनिक वहां कभी नहीं घाये ? सरकार की ओर से 3 मार्च को इस मदन के सामने यह बात कही गई, लेकिन अब प्रधान मंत्री कह रहे हैं कि हम को मानना पड़ा। क्या संवेदों के कहने पर मानना पड़ा ? सरदार स्वर्ण सिंह ने साफ कहा था कि 25 जनवरी से पहले पाकिस्तानी वहां पर कभी नहीं घाए।

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा : मंत्री महोदय ने कहा था कि पाकिस्तानी पुलिस वहाँ गश्त नहीं करेगी ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मंत्री लॉग भिन्न भिन्न बात कहते हैं । एक मंत्री एक बात कहता है और दूसरा कोई और बात कहता है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: As I said, it would not be, of course, necessary to go into the details of it but we felt convinced that . . .

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Those are vital details.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: . . . in consonance with the spirit of the Agreement, that is, the *status quo ante*, it was proper and correct for us to have agreed to the fact that Pakistani patrol will take place or they will patrol on that track between Ding-Surai . . .

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: On a point of order, Sir.

श्री मधु लिमये : 3 मार्च के बयान के साथ इस को पढ़ेंगे न ? प्रधान मंत्री इस का जवाब क्यों नहीं दे रहे हैं ? उन्होंने कहा था कि पूर्व-स्थिति लाने की बात थी और 3 मार्च को कहा गया था कि 25 जनवरी से पहले पाकिस्तानी कभी उस क्षेत्र में नहीं आए थे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं ने कहा है कि अगर माननीय सदस्य कोई बात जानना चाहेंगे, तो बाद में मैं सवाल करने की इजाजत दे दूंगा । उस वक्त प्राप ने मान लिया, लेकिन अब प्राप बार बार सवाल पूछ रहे हैं ।

श्री मधु लिमये : जब सब लोग पूछ रहे हैं, तो मैं क्यों बैठूँ ?

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय वय, न देने से पहले मंत्री लोग प्रापस में फैसला कर लें ।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: On a point of order, Sir. The Prime Minister has rightly referred to the expression *status quo ante*. Now, according to him, the *status quo ante*, as revealed or disclosed to him after the last session of Parliament, showed that Pakistan was patrolling that area even sometime before January, 1965. But during the last session, he said quite a different thing. How can he reconcile what he says today with what he said during the last session of Parliament when he said that there was no Pakistani patrolling? Now he says that there has been some patrolling. In fairness to the House, I would request you, Sir, to ask the Prime Minister to place before the House all the information that he has got since the last session so that the House can judge what that information was and not blindly trust the British Government.

Mr. Speaker: There is no point of order. He might resume his seat.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Will you not come to our rescue?

Mr. Speaker: There is no point of order.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: The Agreement is being debated. Is the Government not bound to place all the relevant documents and other material before the House that it has got since the last session of Parliament?

Mr. Speaker: That is for the Prime Minister to see. There is no point of order that I can decide.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : इस का जवाब दिनाया जाये ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: This is merely a track and, as I said, the police does not stay here. Of course, the army has been withdrawn completely but the police is there—they come and go; they do not stay there . . .

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: That we know. They do not build their houses there. (Interruptions).

श्री रामसेवक यादव : 3 मार्च का क्या कहा था ?

श्री मधु लिमये : मंत्री जी का 3 मार्च का लिखित बयान पढ़ा जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय माननीय सदस्य बैठ जायें । मैं इस बात का अवसर देता हूँ कि माननीय सदस्य अपने अपने खबान जाहिर कर सकें और फिर प्राइम मिनिस्टर अपना बयान दे सकें । मैं उनको यह कौसे कह सकता हूँ कि कता बात कहो और कता बात न कहो । वह जो कुछ मुताबिक समझे, वही बात उन्होंने कहनी है । जब माननीय सदस्य भाषण देते हैं, तो क्या मैं उन को मजबूर कर सकता हूँ कि वह कता बात कहें ?

श्री रामसेवक यादव अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बहुत महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है । प्रधान मंत्री जी बयान दे रहे हैं, लेकिन जब खबान का बयान नहीं मिलता है, तो बहस का क्या अर्थ होगा ?

श्री श्रीकार लाल बेरवा : हम में और उन में खबान खानमान का अन्तर है । उन को खबान में खता है ।

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): He makes a statement which, on the face of it, appears to be so absurd that everybody laughs. Can you not take any objection to that?

Mr. Speaker: What can I do?

13.08 hrs.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I shall state the fact; it is for the hon. Members to take it or interpret it in the light they think proper. There is no police post or anything of the kind there. It was asked whether we could go to that area. I would only say that we are entitled to inspect

867 (A1) LSD-7.

that line and even go over to Kanjarkot. This point is also quite clear. There is nothing like no-man's land.

An hon. Member: Can we go to Ding-Surai?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Ding and Surai are in Pakistan.

Shri S. M. Banerjee rose—

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपका मैंने कहा है कि इस तरह से नहीं आर कर सकते हैं । इनको खत्म कर लेने दीजिये, आपका मोका दे दूंगा ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I would only say that the Kutch Agreement has to be considered as a separate and independent question altogether. I do realise that the Kashmir situation has created special difficulties for us. Yet I would not like that we should mix it up with Kashmir because I have always said that this Kutch Agreement is a separate Agreement by itself. To suggest that we will agree to arbitration or to reference to a tribunal in regard to other disputes also is not correct or will not be correct. Mr. Trivedi said and I have made it absolutely clear that this stands by itself and has nothing to do with other border disputes.

श्री बृहराज सिंह (बरेली) इन्होंने कहा था कि बात नहीं करेगे जब तक कञ्जरकोट खाली न हो जाय । इस पर टिप्पणी इनको क्या पारंटी है ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I think that the basic point has been met and I personally think that what we have done is good for our country and also good from the international point of view. Of course, Kanjarkot, Biar Bet and other points have been vacated. We have now complete civilian control over the Rann of Kutch. There is absolutely no doubt.

श्री हुकम चन्द कच्छवाय : कञ्जरकोट जा सकते हैं क्या ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : जो हां जा सकते हैं, कंजरकोट, बियारबेट आदि सब जगह जा सकते हैं ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : कंजरकोट, बियारबेट, सरदार चौकी पर आपकी पुनिम होगी क्या ?

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: It is true that I had in mind that, if possible, we should avoid a major conflict or war. I do not deny that fact. It is a basic principle which India has accepted and adopted. May I, in this connection, quote what the Constitution says? Article 51 says that the State shall endeavour to promote international peace and security and also foster respect for international law, etc., and encourage settlement of international disputes by arbitration . . . (Interruptions).

Shri Hem Barua: We are concerned not merely with Art. 51 but also with Art. 253 of the Constitution.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): The sovereignty of the country is not arbitrable.

श्री रामसेवक यादव अपनी भूमि दे कर नहीं करेंगे ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: It is also in the Directive Principles. I really cannot understand why there should be opposition to this basic principle which has always been upheld by this House and by the whole country . . . (Interruptions.)

Shri Hem Barua: He calls this tribunal as arbitration. We do not subscribe to the view that the tribunal has an arbitrator's powers. By citing the Constitutional provision, the Prime Minister is saying the same thing which Pakistan has been saying.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Why should we deny that? It is entirely

a different matter. On particular matters we may consider the whole question on its merits. This Directive Principle does not advise or direct us to go in for arbitration every time. I merely said that on this basic question. After all, we have adopted a policy, we have adopted an attitude, and I think it is something good. (Interruptions.)

Shri Harish Chandra Mathur (Ja-lore): This thing cannot be tolerated any more. How can we go on ilke this?

Shri Hem Barua: This is democracy and we have a right to put questions. My hon. friend is an ex-bureaucrat and that is why he says this.

Mr. Speaker: Why is Mr. Hem Barua interrupting so much? I have requested him to wait and allow the Prime Minister to continue. Let him finish and then I shall allow one or two Members to speak.

श्री रामसेवक यादव माथर नाट्य को प्रधान मंत्री बना दिया जाय ।

कुछ माननीय सदस्य आप बैठ जाइये ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव आप बैठ जाइये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय आइंर, आइंर ।

श्री बृजराज सिंह : एक स्पष्टीकरण में चाहता हूं । आर्बिट्रेशन होने जा रहा है या ट्रिब्यूनल के हवाले कर रहे हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : एक के बाद दूसरा खड़ा हो कर बोलता जा रहा है । इस तरह में कैसे काम चल सकता है ।

श्री बड़े (छारगोन) अब तक मैं चुप बैठा रहा हूं और मैं बोलना नहीं हूं । लेकिन . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय मैं बार बार कह रहा हूं कि बैठे . . .

श्री बड़े : मैं शान्ति से बैठा रहा हूं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय प्राप अब भी बैठ जायें ।

श्री बड़े : यह हस्ता वरीं हो रहा है, इसको प्राप देखें । यह इसलिए हो रहा है कि दिव्यनय प्रौर श्राविद्वेशन

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किनी शिमिपिनन को मानेंगे या नहीं ?

श्री बड़े यह वाकिफानन के हरु में जाता है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इनने मीनिपर मैम्बर को जब इनती वार कहा जाता है लेकिन वह भी मानने को तैयार नहीं होता है तो अफ सोम होता है । एरु के बाद दूनरा बोचना होना जा रहा है । कोई कुछ परवाह ही नहीं करता है कि उनको क्या कहा जा रहा है ।

श्री बड़े : हमारे दिन बर रह है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सब कारंवाइ मैं बन्द कर देता हूं प्रौर प्राप बोले चले जाइये ।

श्री रामसेवक घाबर इन समयोते के विरोध मरुका इस मदन को स्थगित कर दिया जाए ना प्रच्छा है ।

श्री राधेलाल व्यास (उज्जैन) : कम में कम उनको स्थगित कर दिया जाए तो प्रच्छा होगा, मदन को तो नहीं ।

श्री तुकम चन्द कछवाय : प्रापको निकाला जाना चाहिये यहां से । अध्यक्ष महोदय, इनको ये शब्द वापिन लेने चाहियें ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय प्राप बैठें तभी मैं उनको कुछ कह सकता हूं । कई वार मैं कह चुका हूं लेकिन प्राप मानने को ही तैयार नहीं है :

मैं ने प्राप में कहा (Interruptions.) फिर प्राप खड़े हैं । कोई हरु भी होगा प्राप को । मैं ने प्राप से मौ दफे कहा कि प्राप प्राइम मिनिस्टर साहब को मुन लें । उन के

वाद प्रगर प्राप को कुछ कहना होगा तो मैं इजाजत दूंगा । यहां पर कोई प्राइंती बिहेवियर तो होना चाहिये तभी तो डिबेट हो सकता है । फिजिकल वाउडम कैसे कर सकते हैं ।

एक माननीय सदस्य इन लोगों का मदन से निकाला जाये ।

श्री तुकम चन्द कछवाय : अध्यक्ष महोदय माननीय सदस्य ने जो कहा कि हम लोगों को मदन से निकाल दिया जाये तो क्या हम प्रकार कहना ठीक है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय प्राप बैठ जाइये । प्राप लोगों ने इनती बातें कही, प्रगर दूमरे माननीय सदस्य कुछ कह दें तो मैं क्या करूँ ।

श्री तुकम चन्द कछवाय : हम इन बदामन करने के लिये तैयार नहीं हैं । यह शब्द यहां नहीं कं जाने चाहिये ।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I shall not take much time of the House. But I would clearly and categorically like to tell the House that we stick to this agreement and we do not want to deviate from it.

Some hon. Member: Shame!

श्री रामसेवक घाबर यह देश को बदकिम्मती की तारीख है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब इतना रूपाइडमेंट हां तो मैं नहीं चाहता कि इस वक्त किनी में कुछ कहूँ । मगर क्या हम तरह में फैलना .

श्री बड़े : तीन लाख पादनी प्राये

अध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री बड़े, मैं ने प्राप में कहा कि प्राप बैठ जाइये, प्राप बकील भी हैं, पुराने सदस्य भी हैं, लेकिन कोई हरु तो जानती चाहिये । मैं ने बार बार कहा

श्री बड़े देश में ऐसी परिस्थिति है ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : जब भूमि का मसाला हीना कानून का मसाला नहीं रह जाता वकील का मसाला नहीं रह जाता। सीमा हांगो है कानून की और मनचाही करने की।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सिवा इन के क्या कोई और भी तरीका है कि आप हर एक को मुनें बां कोई कुछ कहना चाहता है और तब फैसला दे।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : सरकार त्यागत्र दे।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : त्यागत्र सरकार देगी जब हांडा रहेगा। अगर हांडा नहीं रहेगा तब ही देगा। श्री कछवाय बैठ जायें, उन के हांडा से सरकार त्यागत्र नहीं देगी।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : हांडा कमो नहीं रहेगा।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बैठ जाइये।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: But I might inform the House that in view of the recent developments which have led to sharp deterioration of the relations between India and Pakistan.....

Some hon. Members: The Prime Minister is not audible. He may speak a little louder.

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: I said that because of the recent developments and the serious deterioration in the relations between India and Pakistan, our Foreign Minister has suggested to the Foreign Minister of Pakistan not to visit India on the 20th of this month.....

श्री मधु लिमये : जैसे यह फैसला किया है वैसे ही पंचों के फैसले को भी रद्द किया जाये।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : मैं सरकार को बर्खास्त देना हूँ इस बात के ऊपर।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: But as I have said just now we do not want to

get out of this agreement that will neither be honourable for us or for our country nor in any way desirable from the general, moral and.....

श्री मधु लिमये : देश पर आक्रमण हो रहा है।

श्री बजरज सिंह : वायस ग्राफ अमेरिका को जवाहर लाल जी ने रेप्यूडिएट किया था और शास्त्री जी आज कह रहे हैं कि हमारे लिए इसको रेप्यूडिएट करना आनरेबल नहीं है। जब जवाहरलाल जी ने रेप्यूडिएट किया था तब यह कैसे आनरेबल था। आप गलत बात क्यों कहते हैं। उन वक्त 17 जगहों पर दस्तखत हुए थे आज तो एक जगह पर ही दस्तखत हुए हैं।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: No, as I have said, we cannot go back on it. If I had the slightest feeling.....

श्री रामसेवक यादव : गन्ती को सुधार लेना अच्छी बात है।

श्री बड़े अध्यक्ष महोदय.
(Interruptions.)

अध्यक्ष महोदय श्री बड़े, अब आप बैठ जाइये। मैं बीस दफे कह चुका हूँ कि आप बैठ जाइये। यह सब क्या है। आखिर कोई हद होनी चाहिये। किसी वक्त तो इसे खत्म होना चाहिये।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय सरकार को भी हद होनी है जो ममनोता करनी है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय अब आप मॉरिंग बेंच बैठ जाइये।

श्री राबेलास व्यास : अध्यक्ष महोदय, कुछ मुझे भी कहने की इजाजत दीजिये।

अध्यक्ष महोदय अब आप भी बेंच जाइये।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: As I said, we do not reject the reference to the tribunal. I have no alternative, in spite of some of the Members of the

Jan Sangh strongly protesting against it..... (Interruptions.)

श्री बृज राज सिंह : अध्यक्ष महोदय गलत बयानी नहीं होती चाहिये। कोई घोषणा-जीशन के मेम्बर ही इस का विरोध नहीं कर रहे हैं। स्वयम् सरकार की तरफ के मेम्बर भी ऐसा कह रहे हैं। (Interruptions.)

श्री रामसेवक यादव : तिरफ विरोधी बात ही नहीं, सरकारी पक्ष के लोग भी इस के विरोध में हैं। (Interruptions.)

श्री जगदेव सिंह सिद्धाण्ठी (मध्य) : राष्ट्र की सेवा के हवाले कर दीं।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : हमारे हाँ नहीं, सरकारी पक्ष के लोग विरोध करने हैं।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: This is a very good exhibition of how we behave in Parliament, but anyhow, let it be there, and my hon. friends there are free to behave as they like.

श्री बड़े : मेरा प्राप्तिवेकन इस पर है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री बड़े, आप बैठ जाइये। मैं कई बफे आप से कह चुका कि इन तरह से नहीं चलना। आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री बड़े : प्रधान मंत्री कहते हैं कि हम मान हाउस में की विधि करने हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस बात में भी क्या कोई शक पैदा गया है।

श्री शौर्य (अंतर्गढ़) : इस में कोई शक नहीं कि जिन प्रकार की गलती देश के प्रधान मंत्री श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री जी ने की है अगर किसी और देश का प्रधान मंत्री वैसी गलती करता तो उसे प्रधान मंत्री पद से इस्तीफा देना पड़ता।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Before I conclude, I would like to say that I have no doubt that on the Kashmir front we have to be very alert and most vigilant.....

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय प्रधान मंत्री ने कहा कि वह गलतीने ये निकल नहीं सकते हैं। अगर वह इस्तीफा दे दे और किसी दूसरे को प्रधान मंत्री बना दें तो सामान्य से उन में निकला जा सकता है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बैठ जाइये।

श्री श्रींकार लाल बेरवा : क्या यह ऐसी बात है जिस पर मेम्बर लोग ताली बजायें।

श्री हनुमन्तैया (बंगलौर नगर) : यह बहुत ऊँची बात है।

Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri: Our Army and our police are quite clear about their serious responsibilities. As the House knows, only the other day, we had to go over to Kargil in order to prevent infiltrators from crossing our borders. We may take any further step which is necessary; I do not know; our Army will take any further step that it considers necessary in order to defend our borders.

I do hope that we will all be able to stand united to face this challenge, and ultimately truth will prevail.

Some hon. Members rose—

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप लोग बैठ जायें तो मैं कुछ कहूँ। देखिये, श्री मन्तु निमये, मैं ने आप से कहा था कि मैं आप को बच देगा अगर आप बैठ जायेंगे। लेकिन दमर्शन में इंटरप्शन होने रहे और जो आप के मन में था उसे आप पूछने रहे। मेरे कहने का कोई प्रसर नहीं हुआ। अब आप फिर खड़े हो रहे हैं। क्या अब भी चाहते हैं कि आप को इजाजत दी जाये। मैं ने ज़हर कहा था।

श्री मन्तु निमये : सभी लोग खड़े हो रहे थे तो मैं ही क्यों बच बैठता।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर आप मेरा कहना मान कर बाकायदा इंटरप्शन करने रहे हैं तो भी क्या आप का हक रह जाता है कि आप कुछ पूछ सकते हैं।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : इटरप्पणम ना जाने दी रहते हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इटरप्पणम ऐस नही जाने । अगर आप दोनों तरफ बातना चाहे तो यह नही हो सकना । मैंने दक्षिण को था कि प्रधान मंत्री को खत्म कर लेने दिया जाये, लेकिन आप ने परवाह नही की ।

Some hon. Members rose—

Mr. Speaker: Shri Banerjee might ask a question.

Shri J. B. Kripalani (Amroha): I have listened to the Prime Minister's speech without any interruption.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं आप को मीका दे दूंगा, मुझे बारी बारी में थाने दीजिये ।

श्री स० भो० बनर्जी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे दो सवाल पूछने हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं, एक के अलावा थार कुछ नहीं ।

श्री स० भो० बनर्जी : अच्छा मैं दोनों को एक में भिजा दूंगा । पहले तो श्री शास्त्री ने समझाने की कांजिश की कि स्ट्रेड्य को पेंटी और उन के बाद कहा पेट्रोलिंग । वह आया जाया करेगा जैसे कि काश्मीर में आ जा रहे हैं । यह उन का बयान था । सरदार स्वर्ण सिंह जी ने इन के बारे में कोई सफाई नहीं की थी । उन के एक मंत्री कुछ कह रहे हैं और प्रधान मंत्री जी कुछ और कह रहे हैं । मैं पुष्टता चाहता हूँ कि यह मंत्रिमंडल है या कि शिवजी का बारात है कि जिस की जो मंत्री चाहे कहे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप जो बात कह रहे हैं वही बात कहना हाउस में बिल्कुल नावाजिब होगा ।

श्री स० भो० बनर्जी : "शिवजी की बारात" कहना कोई हिन्दी में गाली नहीं है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह बात नहीं कहनी चाहिए । अगर हिन्दी का भी कोई गंध होगा तो उनके बारे में मुझे फैसला करना है उसे कहा जाना चाहिये था नहीं ।

श्री स० भो० बनर्जी : मैं क्या कहा है । मैं ने यही कहा कि यह मंत्रिमंडल है या शिव जी ही बारात है । क्या यह बुरी बात है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह बुरी बात है । आपको यह नहीं कहना चाहिये था । शिव जी की बारात, आप ही नहीं कहना चाहिए था ।

श्री स० भो० बनर्जी : मैं ने ऐसी कान सी बात कही है ।

मेरा दूसरा सवाल यह है कि वाश्मोर के मामले में प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा कि पूरा इन्तिजाम हो रहा है । मेरे पास एक सूचना आयी है । क्या यह यही है कि हमारा एक त्रिगेडियर गोली ने मार दिया गया और उसके नैक्वट आफ किन को इनफार्म किया जा रहा है, पर सदन में यह नहीं बताया गया ? अगर ऐसी गम्भीर परिस्थिति है तो सदन को बताया चाहिये था ।

Shri J. B. Kripalani: I have listened with the utmost respect to the speech of the Prime Minister. What I want to say is this, that all international agreements are subject to certain conditions, and if those conditions are not fulfilled, then those agreements can be repudiated with honour. And we have a precedent of this. We had said that there would be a plebiscite in Kashmir, and after five years we said that the conditions had changed and, therefore, that promise does not hold good now.

Shri Sham Lal Saraf (Jammu and Kashmir): It was under certain given conditions.

Shri G. N. Dixit (Etawah): There was no agreement on Kashmir about plebiscite. This a misstatement of Shri Kripalani (Interruptions.)

Shri A. C. Guha (Barasat): This is not a correct statement of fact. There the condition was that before a plebiscite was held Pakistan would vacate her intention, which she did not do.....(Interruptions).

अव्यक्त मर्हादयः ग्रामी तो मैम्बर बोल रहे हैं । उनको तो मून लीजिए।

Shri J. B. Kripalani: I submit, unfortunately, the Congress Party, though it has an overwhelming majority, is behaving like the Opposition. I am really sorry for it. They are not content with their overwhelming majority, their brute majority, but they must also interfere as the Members of the Opposition do!

I say there was a promise at least of ascertaining the opinion, impartial opinion, of the people of Kashmir. It was a promise made . . .

Mr. Speaker: Why should we go into that now? I would request Acharya Kripalani to go on to the second point.

Shri J. B. Kripalani: I want to say that there is a precedent, that when conditions change, when circumstances change.....

Shri Muthyal Rao (Mahbubnagar): He is referring to some other matter. (Interruptions).

Shri J. B. Kripalani: If Congressmen do not want me to speak, I will sit down. If you want to hear me, then you must hear me as I heard the Prime Minister. Did I intervene even once when he spoke? I did not intervene even once. But I have made a point which I want to explain, that there are precedents not only in our history but in the world's history that as circumstances change, agreements also change. I say that the circumstances under which this agreement was made were quite different, radically different, from the circumstances that exist today on account of the betrayal by Pakistan in Kashmir.

That is all I have got to say. And we are not honour bound to carry out Kutch agreement. Kutch is not different from Kashmir. Kashmir is not different from Kutch, as my hon. friend, Shri Mathur, made out. This is not a separate thing. This is one country. These are not two countries. I want these two questions to be settled definitely and together. They have insulted us in every way. They are insulting us now, and we are not bound to carry out this agreement.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: The Prime Minister has told us that we are very alert with regard to Kashmir. May I know from him what steps we are taking in regard to the connivance of the United Nations authorities, who are functioning under Anglo-American domination, with Pakistan because that connivance is linked up with whatever happens to our detriment in our agreement over Kutch.

Some Hon. Members rose—

Mr. Speaker: I can allow only one Member from one group. I find Shri Hem Barua also standing in addition to Shri Kamath.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: I spoke on the motion.

Mr. Speaker: I can allow only one of them.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: While it was partly gratifying to hear from the Prime Minister that the Government has asked Mr. Bhutto not to take the trouble of visiting India, may I ask whether this step is not a step in the direction, welcome direction, necessary direction, desirable direction, of accepting our demand for scrapping the agreement, revoking the agreement because it is a breach of one of the conditions of the agreement itself? May I also know whether there has been any instance in our history or in the history of any other country where the parties concerned bound themselves hand foot to accept the findings or

[Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath]

the award of a tribunal, contrary to the convention of the International Law Commission to the effect that the parties can question the award on three grounds to which my colleague Shri Hem Barua referred the other day?

Mr. Speaker: Shri Brajraj Singh. I cannot allow Shri Hem Barua because I have allowed Shri Kamath. I have made that clear.

Shri Hem Barua: I am not going to put a question but only to seek a clarification.

Mr. Speaker: No, not at this moment. He should resume his seat.

Shri Hem Barua: This is what I do not understand. This is not a party matter. Every member has a right to seek a clarification from the Prime Minister.

Mr. Speaker: I cannot allow him.

Shri Hem Barua: If you put your foot down like that, I would say it is very difficult for us to function in this House. I have a very relevant question to put and seek a clarification from him. I do not understand this.

श्री बृजराज सिंह : प्रश्न पूछने के पहले मैं यह साफ कर देना चाहता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने एक बहुत बड़ी गलत चयानी उस हाउस के सामने की है कि केवल जन संघ के लोग इस समस्या को रद्द कराना चाहते हैं। मैं स्पष्ट कर देना चाहता हूँ कि माग प्रपोजीशन

अनेक माननीय सदस्य : नहीं नहीं

श्री बृजराज सिंह : श्री घाघ्रे से ज्यादा कारण के

अनेक माननीय सदस्य : नहीं नहीं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपको अपनी बात कहने का हक है उनको अपनी बात कहने का हक है

श्री बृजराज सिंह : आप बीच में बोलने को मना करते हैं, हम को आप बीच में नहीं बोलने देते ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप उनकी तरफ से क्यों बोलते हैं ।

श्री बृजराज सिंह : मुझे यह प्रश्न पूछना है कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने आरबिट्रेशन की बात कही और संविधान का हवाला दिया कि उसके अनुसार आरबिट्रेशन की गृहाण है । लेकिन यह जो इस वक्त इन्होंने ट्राइब्युनल बनाया है, यह हमारे ऊपर आरबिट्रेशन करने के लिए बैठेगा या हमारे ऊपर फैसला देने के लिए बैठेगा इसका स्पष्टीकरण इन्होंने अभी तक नहीं किया है ।

श्री मधु लिमये : 8 मई को राज्य सभा के सामने प्रधान मंत्री श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री ने पंचों के सम्बन्ध में जो बातचीत चल रही है उसको लेकर यह कहा था

एक माननीय सदस्य : जी उन्होंने कहा था वह यह दीजिये ।

श्री मधु लिमये : वह प्रॉपोजी में है इसलिए मैं नहीं पढ़ता । माननीय सदस्य खुद पढ़ लें । उस में उन्होंने यह कहा है कि पंचों के सामने जो मसला जायगा वह प्रादेशिक विवाद का नहीं होगा बल्कि प्रत्यक्ष जमीन पर केवल सीमांकन करने का जायगा । यह उनका वाक्य है पढ़ लिया जाय । अभी सत्तारूढ़ इस की बंगलौर में बैठक हुई थी लेकिन उनको हिम्मत नहीं हुई कि अपनी बैठक के सामने इस करार को रख कर उस पर स्वीकृति की महत्त्व लगायें

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य सवाल करें ।

श्री मधु लिमबे : मैं सवाल ही कर रहा हूँ। मेरी विनती है कि अगर इस पर आप वोट लेने जा रहे हैं तो कांग्रेस पार्टी के सभी सदस्यों को खुली आजादी होनी चाहिए कि वह अपनी इच्छा के अनुसार इस कगार के पक्ष या विपक्ष में वोट दें। अगर ऐसा होता है तो पता चल जायेगा कि इस सदन की मही राय क्या है। अगर इस सदन की सच्ची राय जानना चाहते हैं तो सभी लोगों को वोट करने की पूरी आजादी दी जाय।

श्री राबेनाल श्यास : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं इस पर एक प्वाएंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर उठाना चाहता हूँ। आपने केवल सवाल पूछने की माननीय सदस्यों को इजाजत दी है लेकिन सवाल पूछने की ग्राइ में भाषण हो रहे हैं तो क्या यह दुबारा भाषण का इस तरह सिलसिला शुरू करने दिया जायगा (इंटरप्शन)।

श्री हरम चन्द कछुबाय : प्वाएंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर उठा कर आप स्वयं भाषण कर रहे हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब कोई मੈम्बर बोले तो मुझे उससे निवटने दिया जाय यह तो नहीं कि आप यह काम अपने जिम्मे ले लीजिये।

श्री हरम चन्द कछुबाय : श्यास जी को अपने शब्द वापिस लेने चाहिए उन्हें इनके कहने का कोई अधिकार नहीं है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : तो मैं उधर चला जाता हूँ फिर आप आपस में फैमला कर लीजिये। श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री।

श्री राबेनाल श्यास : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे प्वाएंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर का क्या बना? मैं ने इस पर व्यवस्था मांगी थी कि जब आपने केवल सवाल पूछने की इजाजत दी है तो क्या उसकी ग्राइ में भाषण भी दिये जा सकते हैं?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इसके मसाले पूछे जा सकते हैं, भाषण नहीं किये जा सकते। ग्राइम

मिनिस्टर का जवाबी भाषण हो चुका है इसलिए अब भाषण उम पर नहीं किये जा सकते हैं।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री (बिजली) : मैं बड़ी नम्रता के साथ प्रधान मंत्री जी से दो प्रश्न पूछना चाहता हूँ। यह जो एपीएमट विदेश मंत्रालय की ओर में हिन्दी में प्रकाशित होकर सदस्यों में वितरित हुआ है मैं उसका प्रधान मंत्री जी को पढ़ कर सुनाना चाहता हूँ :-

“किस भारत और पाकिस्तान दोनों की सरकारें गुजरात/पश्चिम पाकिस्तान सीमाक्षेत्र में इस विषय में युद्ध-विग्रह करने, और 1 जनवरी 1965 की स्थिति पुनः लाने पर सहमत हो गई है कि इस में भारत-पाकिस्तान की सम्बन्धी सीमा पर वर्तमान तनाव कम करने में भी सहायता मिलेगी।” यह है वह पृष्ठभूमि जिसके कि आधार पर यह सारा एपीएमट हुआ है लेकिन इस पृष्ठभूमि को तोड़ दिया गया पाकिस्तान की ओर में कश्मीर में आक्रमण करने के बाद, तो इस के बाद भी क्या भारत सरकार इस एपीएमट पर कायम रहना चाहती है?

दूसरा प्रश्न मेरा यह है कि 1956 में छाड़बोट पर हमला होने के बाद आपने अपनी वहाँ सेना नहीं भेजी बल्कि सेंट्रल रिजर्व पुलिस को वहाँ पर भेजा। सेंट्रल रिजर्व पुलिस ने 61 से 65 तक अपना रजिस्टर मीटिंग किया। आपको हर वर्ष की तारीखें लिखी कि कंजर्वकोट के दक्षिण के उस भाग में वहाँ आपने पाकिस्तान पुलिस को गणत देने का अधिकार दिया है वहाँ बराबर हर साल बार बार, पांच बार, ती प्रौर दस दस बार यह सेंट्रल रिजर्व पुलिस गणत करनी रही तो मैं जानना चाहता हूँ कि प्रधान मंत्री जी ने संदन में विजयन छाड़बोट के मामले में इस पाकिस्तान के गणत करने के अधि-

[श्री प्रकाशचंद शास्त्र]

कार सम्बन्धी प्रस्ताव को स्वीकार करते समय क्या अपने रजिस्टर में दर्ज उन तारीखों को नहीं देखा था और यदि देखा था तो क्या पाकिस्तान की दलील उस से भी ज्यादा मजबूत थी जॉकि पाकिस्तान के उस तथ्य को स्वीकार कर लिया गया ? यह मेरे दो प्रश्न हैं ।

Dr. L. M. Singhvi (Jodhpur): May I know whether the Prime Minister was aware of the factual and legal implications of the *status quo ante bellum* as of 1st January, 1965, and if so, whether the present agreement agrees with his impressions of the *status quo ante bellum* as of 1st January, 1965? As a complementary question to this, may I know whether he is willing to say that under all circumstances, and irrespective of whatever Pakistan may do or perpetrate on us, they would still invoke the principle of the sanctity of treaties and not the complementary and necessarily adjunct principle of changed circumstances or *rebus sic stantibus* to which Acharya Kripalani has referred? May I know whether Government proposes to carry out this agreement under all circumstances irrespective of whatever Pakistan does?

श्री शीर्ष : पाकिस्तान के सिपाही जब मुराई से डींग जायेंगे तो वे कंजरकोट होकर जायेंगे, यदि यह बात सत्य है तो चूंकि कंजरकोट हिन्दुस्तान की सीमा में है तब क्या हिन्दुस्तान की पुलिस के सिपाही भी मुराई और डींग तक जा सकेंगे ?

श्री गोपी शंकर ककरुड़ (फतेहपुर)
 मैं एक प्रश्न प्रधान मंत्री जी से पूछना चाहता हूँ । जब उन्होंने अपना वक्तव्य इस सदन में दिया था उस समय उन को क्या इस बिषय की जानकारी किसी सोर्स में थी अथवा नहीं थी कि पाकिस्तान की पुलिस को वहाँ उस मुराई डींग के क्षेत्र में गश्त होती रही है और अगर इस प्रकार की जानकारी उनकी उस

समय नहीं थी तो वह कौन से महत्वपूर्ण कागजात हैं जिनके कि बारे में बार-बार कहा जाता है लेकिन वह प्रस्तुत नहीं किये जाते हैं ?

एक बात मुझे और कहनी है । श्री प्रधान मंत्री जी ने पाकिस्तान की डिमांड्स के लिए दो शब्दों का प्रयोग किया है कि वह जस्टिफाइबल और ऐडवाइजेबल है तो मैं उन से पूछूँ कि फिर क्या उसके बारे में कोई विवाद रह जाता है जब प्रधान मंत्री जी स्वयं यह स्वीकार करते हैं कि इस इलाके में पाकिस्तानी पुलिस की पैट्रोलिंग होना जस्टिफाइबल और ऐडवाइजेबल है ? उन्होंने अपने भाषण में जो इन शब्दों का प्रयोग किया है तो उस के बाद में कौन सा विवाद रह जाता है ?

Mr. Speaker: Dr. Swell. Which party does he belong to? I am sorry I do not remember.

Shri Swell (Assam—Autonomous Districts): I did not join in the shouting. I did not interrupt the Prime Minister. I may be given a chance to put a question.

Mr. Speaker: He might put.

Shri Swell: It seems that between April last and now we discovered that Pakistan had been patrolling the nine-mile track between Ding and Surai which goes to show that we do not have any proper knowledge of what is going on within our own country. How do we propose to sustain our contention that the 3,500 square miles of territory which Pakistan now claims really belongs to us? Secondly, we have left everything to the tribunal. Now, if an unexpected thing happens, namely that the tribunal decides that this 3,500 square miles of territory belongs to Pakistan, will the Government willingly and happily hand over this territory to Pakistan?

Shri Hem Barua: You have deviated from your own ruling. Just now two Members belonging to the same party put two questions.

Mr. Speaker: Which party?

Shri Hem Barua: Dr. Singhvi and Shri Kakkar.

Mr. Speaker: If that has been done, it might be in ignorance. I did not know that. It has not been done, I suppose. श्री गुलशन ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द (करनाल) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे एक प्रश्न पूछ लेने दिया जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं स्वामी जी, जब मैं प्रोरो को इजाजत नहीं दे रहा तब मैं आप को कैसे इजाजत दे सकता हूँ ? मैं न एक पार्टी से एक ही आदमी को सवाल पूछने की इजाजत दे रहा हूँ ।

श्री गुलशन (भटिंडा) : प्रधान मंत्री जी ने हाल ही में बतलाया है कि रन ऑफ कच्छ में पाकिस्तान की पुलिस आती जाती रही है और हम भी कभी-कभी आते जाते रहे तो यह बात मुझे कुछ समझ में नहीं आती कि दो देशों की पुलिस वहाँ टकटकी हो जाये ? वहाँ क्या कोई क्लब था या क्या था यह मेरी समझ में नहीं आता ।

दूसरी बात प्रधान मंत्री जी ने यह कही है कि कश्मीर और रन ऑफ कच्छ का जो अगड़ा है वह अलहदा है तो उन दिनों जब कारगिल की चौकी को हमारी सरकार ने छोड़ा और अब प्रधान मंत्री श्री कह रहे हैं कि पाकिस्तान के साथ जो मुद्दाहिदा हुआ है वह छोड़ा नहीं जा सकता तो मैं पूछना चाहता हूँ कि क्या कारगिल की चौकी जो हमने छोड़ी थी वह भी हमने वापिस ले ली ? पाकिस्तान ने कश्मीर पर हमला किया । प्रधान मंत्री के कहने के मताबिक दोनों देशों के विदेश मंत्रियों की जो बातचीत होती थी वह भी अब छोड़ दी है तो मैं समझना हूँ कि यह समझौते

की एक कड़ी टूटी है और दूसरी भी टूटने वाली है तो फिर यह समझौता कैसे रह गया ?

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मुझे एक प्रश्न पूछने दिया जाय ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं स्वामी जी, आप बैठ जाइये । जब मैं ने बाकी पार्टियों को इसकी इजाजत नहीं दी और हर एक पार्टी से केवल एक को बुलाया तो फिर आप को कैसे बुला सकता हूँ ?

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : इसमें पार्टी का प्रश्न नहीं है मुझे एक मिनट सवाल कर लेने दिया जाय ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : स्वामी जी, एक मिनट या दो मिनट की बात नहीं है । एक पार्टी से केवल एक मيمबर को सवाल पूछने की इजाजत दी गई है । आपकी पार्टी के जो मीड्य हैं वे बोल चुके हैं इसलिए मैं आपकी सवाल पूछने की इजाजत नहीं दे सकता ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : मुझे केवल एक मिनट में एक सवाल कर लेने दिया जाये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जी नहीं, आप बैठ जाइये ।

कुछ सवालों के जवाब तो प्रधान मंत्री दे चुके हैं । जिन सवालों के बारे में वह समझते हैं कि उनका जवाब नहीं दिया गया है, या वह पानिमी की और बजाहन करना चाहते हैं, उन के जवाब वह दे ।

श्री प्रकाशचौर शास्त्री : ऐसा कहने की आवश्यकता नहीं है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर उन्होंने यह कह दिया है कि हमारी पानिमी यह है और हमारा फैसला यह है, तो क्या वह बार-बार उन्हीं बातों को दोहराने चले जायें ?

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अध्यक्ष महोदय, प्राप जैसे गवर्नमेंट के हिर्नपी है, वैसे ही प्राप हमारे अधिकारों के भी रक्षक हैं। प्राप अपनी ओर से प्रधान मंत्री जी को यह राय देते हैं कि जिन बातों के जवाब प्रा चुके हैं, उन को न कहें। माननीय सदस्यों ने जो प्रश्न किये हैं, वे प्रायः वे हैं, जिन के उत्तर नहीं प्राये हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर उन के उत्तर नहीं प्राए हैं, तो मैं ने कहा है कि उन के उत्तर दिये जायें, लेकिन क्या मैं उन को कहूँ कि जिन प्रश्नों के जवाब प्रा चुके हैं, वह उन को भी दोहराते चले जायें और फिर सारी स्पीच हो ? यह बड़ी अजीब बात है, जो माननीय सदस्य मूर्ख बना रहे हैं।

श्री राजेश्वरानन्द : प्राप को पढ़ाने की प्रावश्यकता क्या पड़नी है ? उन्होंने जो उत्तर देना है, वह तो देना ही है। (Interruptions.)

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : माननीय स्पीकर महोदय, जो दो तीन मवाल खाम हुए हैं, उन के जवाब में दूंगा।

एक तो इस बारे में पूछा गया कि दग एपीमेंट में तनाव को मिटाने का जिक्र है। यह ठीक है कि उस वकत तनाव की जो बात थी, वह इस लिए थी कि तमाम बाईरों पर पाकिस्तान की फौजें थीं और इस के मुकाबले में हमारी फौजें भी खड़ी थीं। जब यह समझीता हुआ, तब उस से यह आशा की गई थी कि अगर हम दोनों तरफ से फौजें हटावेंगे, तो उम में तनाव या टेंशन कम होगा।

श्री राजेश्वरानन्द : क्या वह कम हो गया ? (Interruptions.)

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : दोनों तरफ से जो हमारी फौजें खड़ी थीं, खास तौर पर उन के बारे में वह बात थी। और कुछ हद तक ऐसा हुआ भी। जब यह समझीता हुआ, तो उस के बाद दोनों तरफ से फौजें हटीं।

कम से कम उन प्राफ कच्छ में वे नहीं रहीं और कुछ सरहदों में भी,—पता नहीं कहा,—लेकिन वे अपनी अपनी सरहदों पर चली गईं। छाड़बेट की जो बात है, वह पहले भी . . . (Interruptions.)

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अध्यक्ष महोदय, व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है।

श्री राम संवक दाबव : उम में पूरी सीमा का जिक्र है।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अगर प्रधान मंत्री जान-बूझ कर सदन को गलत सूचना दें, तो हम प्राप से अनुरोध कर सकते हैं कि प्राप प्रधान मंत्री जी को कहें। इस में शब्द है "भारत-पाकिस्तान की समूचा सीमा।"

श्री रामसंवक दाबव : "एन्टायर बाइर"।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : प्रधान मंत्री जी केवल कच्छ की चर्चा कर रहे हैं। एपीमेंट "भारत-पाकिस्तान की समूचा सीमा" पर तनाव कम करने के लिए हुआ है।

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : मैं कह रहा हूँ कि पूरे बाइर पर उन की जो फौजें थी और हमारी जो फौजें उन के मुकाबले में थी उन की बात थी। सब जगह की बात थी। (Interruptions.) मैं वही बात कह रहा हूँ जो उममें लिखा हुआ है, वही है। पूरे बाइर पर, तमाम बाइर पर। (Interruptions.)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्यों ने मवाल किये हैं, लेकिन वे उन के जवाब नहीं सुनना चाहते हैं। (Interruptions.)

श्री हुकम शर्मा कल्लवाय : काश्मीर में क्या हुआ ? वहां पर उन की फौजें बिल्कुल नहीं हटीं।

श्री लालबहादुर शास्त्री : इस का काश्मीर से बिल्कुल कोई मतलब नहीं है। इस से तमाम

बाइजें की बात थी। काश्मीर की बात नहीं थी। इस में खिद करने की क्या बात है ? इस में और बाइजें की बात थी।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : क्या समझीते में लिखा हुआ है कि "काश्मीर को छोड़ कर" ?
 (Interruptions).

श्री मधु लिमये : इस करार में लिखा हुआ है कि तनाव कम होना चाहिए। क्या काश्मीर में तनाव कम हुआ ?

(Interruptions).

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या माननीय सदस्य चाहते हैं कि मैं बहम को यही पर खत्म कर दूँ और प्राइम मिनिस्टर जवाब न दें ?

एक माननीय सदस्य : वह जवाब प्रवण्य दें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : लेकिन उन को जवाब देने का मौका तो दिया जाये। वह जो भी जवाब देना चाहते हैं, उस का उन को अधिकार है। मैं कंस उन को बन्द कर दूँ ?
 (Interruptions).

धरमाननीय सदस्य नहीं सुनेंगे। तो मुझे प्राइम मिनिस्टर को कहना पड़ेगा कि वह यही खत्म कर दें और वॉटिंग को लिया जाये।

श्री बड़े : हम प्राण की गाइडेस चाहते हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : प्राण तो किसी बात को मानने के लिए नैयाग नहीं है। गाइडेस कड़ा में प्राण ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : जहाँ तक एग्सीमेट वर्गमेंट की बात है, ये सब बातें हर बन्द नहीं की जाती और यह जरूरी नहीं होता कि गवर्नमेंट अपनी पार्लिमी और अपनी नॉति का एग्नान करती रहे। आखिर एक माका देखा जाता है, स्थिति देखी जाती है, मिट्टाएगन देखी जाती है और फिर उस के

धनुसार फैसला करते हैं। मैं आज उस का कोई ऐलान इस हाउस के सामने कर दूँ, यह न ठीक है, न मुनासिब है। जो कुछ मैं ने कहा है, सिधवी साहब की बात उसी में धा जाती है।

श्री हरि बिष्णु कामत : टिब्यूनल के बारे में ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : और देशों का मैं इस वक्त प्राण के सामने कुछ नहीं कह सकता, लेकिन एक यह प्रिसिपल है, एक उमूल है—यूनाइटेड नेशन्ज का भी है—कि जहाँ तक हो सके, धरग सम्भव है, तो धरग कुछ बातें पीसफुल, शान्तिमय, तरीके से, नेगोशिएशनज से, मीडिएशन से, धरग बिट्रेगन से तय हो सके, तो अच्छी बात है। लेकिन हमारे यहाँ की सिट्टाएगन कुछ दूसरी है, क्योंकि यह बंटा मुल्क है और उस में बाउंडरीज की डिमार-केशन होने वाली है। और जहाँ बाउंडरी की डिमारकेशन नहीं हुई, उस के बारे में हम पाकिस्तान से मिले भी हैं। 1959 और 1960 में बात हुई और उस में यह तय हुआ कि हम अपने डिस्पूट्स या डिफ़ीकरटीज को प्रापम में बातचीत कर के तय करें और धरग उस से काम नहीं बना, तब हम टिब्यूनल की बात भी सोच सकते हैं।

श्री हरि बिष्णु कामत : मेरा प्रश्न था उस संत के बारे में जिसको प्राण ने मज्जूर किया है—

"will not be questioned on any ground whatsoever"

ऐसी मिसाल कहीं भी नहीं मिलती

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : वह ठीक है। "बाइडिंग" पहले भी प्राया हुआ है। जो एग्सीमेट है, उस में प्राया हुआ है कि जो उस का फैसला है, वह बाइडिंग है। यह उस में है।

श्री हरि बिष्णु कामत : किस में ?

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री एप्रीमेंट में ।

श्री हरि विष्णु कामत : यह कार्बिले-एनराज है ।

श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री : ठीक है, लेकिन कोई ऐसा नहीं है कि अगर एक बात हम अभी मान लेते हैं, तो हम सब बातों में उम को मान लेंगे, हर एक को स्वीकार कर लेंगे । ऐसी बात बिल्कुल नहीं है । यह एक अलग एप्रीमेंट है, जिस को हम न माना है और जैसी स्थिति आयेगी, जैसा मौका आयेगा, हम उम का मुकाबला करेंगे ।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय एक निवेदन है ।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: He says he may not accept it later on. How can he leave it at a loose end?

Shri J. B. Kripalani: May I submit that my question has not been replied to?

Mr. Speaker: What can I do?

Shri J. B. Kripalani: What is the good of asking questions, then?

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: I asked a specific question about the UN forces in Kashmir conniving with the Pakistani invaders. He did not answer that.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जिन संशोधनों को प्रेम किया जायेगा, आप उन पर अभी मत-विभाजन करावेंगे । मेरा निवेदन यह है कि यह बहुत ही महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्न है और यह हिन्दुस्तान की, जो हमारी मातृभूमि है, जमीन का प्रश्न है । मेरा निवेदन है कि इस संबंध में गुप्त मतदान प्रणाली इस्तेमाल की जाये, बिल्ट से बांट किया जाये, क्योंकि सत्तारूढ़ दल के सदस्य इस के पक्ष में भी मत दे सकते हैं और विपक्ष में भी ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ऐसा नहीं हो सकता है ।

There are eleven substitute motions.

Substitute motion Nos. 1, 2, 4, 5, 6, 11, 12 and 13 are for disapproval. I can only put No. 1 if the Opposition can agree to that, which they want me to put, because others would be barred. Therefore, any one that they like, I might put.

Shri Yashpal Singh (Kairana): No. 1 may be taken.

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : सब को एक साथ ले लिया जाए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : डिविजन चाहेंगे तो सब पर नहीं होगी ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : उम में फर्क यह हो जाता है कि कुछ मॉनलिस्ट पार्टी के सदस्य जो वाक आउट कर गए थे अपनी एग्जिप्टम मूव नहीं कर...

अध्यक्ष महोदय इजाजत दें श्री. उन्होंने मूव कर ली है ।

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : मेरा निवेदन यह है कि काश्मीर में जो कुछ हुआ है उसको देखते हुए मांग की गई है कि उम मसलाने को रद्द कर दिया जाए और कुछ दूसरे कारणों में इसको रद्द करने की मांग की गई है । मैं चाहता हूँ कि सब को एक साथ ले लिया जाए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं धन्य कर रहा हूँ कि सब को एक साथ ले लेंगे लेकिन अगर डिविजन होंगी तो मैं एक पर ही कर सकूंगा । सब पर डिविजन नहीं कर सकता हूँ । अगर आप एप्री नहीं करते हैं तो मैं नम्बर को लेता हूँ । (Interruptions).

Order, order. I will ask the officers to keep the doors shut; if the Whips of the different parties have to get in their Members they might get them now. The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

“This House, having considered the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan

border, disapproves the Agreement as it barter away the honour and sovereignty of India.” (1)

This is the substitute motion of Shri Yashpal Singh. This is for disapproval. If this one is decided, the others would be barred.

Lok Sabha divided:

Division No. 2]

AYES

[13.53 hrs.

Alvarez, Shri
Bade, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S. M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Brij Raj Singh, Shri
Chaudhuri, Shri Tridib Kumar
Gokaran Prasad, Shri
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram
Kachhavalya, Shri Hukam Chand

Kakkar, Shri, Gauri Shanker
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Lakshmi Bhawan, Shri
Maurya, Shri
Mohan Swarup, Shri
Omkar Singh, Shri
Pillai, Shri Nataraja
Rameshwaranand, Shri
Seth, Shri Bishanchander
Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir

Siddhanti, Shri Jagdev Singh
Sigh, Shri A.P.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Swell, Shri
Valvi, Shri
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yainik, Shri
Yashpal Singh, Shri
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

NOES

Abdul Rashid, Bakshi
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Alagesan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joachim
Anjanappa, Shri
Ankineedu, Shri
Anthony, Shri Frank
Arunachalam, Shri
Babunath Singh, Shri
Baddrudduja, Shri
Bakliwal, Shri
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
Barman, Shri P.C.
Barrow, Shri
Barua, Shri R.
Barupal, Shri P.L.
Basappa, Shri
Basumatari, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B.R.
Bhagavati, Shri
Bhakt Darshan, Shri
Bhanja Deo, Shri L.N.
Bhargava, Shri M.B.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
Birendra Behadur Singh, Shri
Biset, Shri J.B.S.
Boroosh, Shri P. C.
Brahm Prakash, Shri
Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri

Brij Dasi Lal, Shri
Brij Raj Singh-Kotah, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotena
Chandak, Shri
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandriki, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
Chudhuri, Shri D.S.
Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavan, Shri D.R.
Chavada, Shrimati, Johrabai
Choudhry, Shri Lahtan
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Shri B.K.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dasa, Shri C.
Desai, Shri Morarji
Deshmukh, Shrimati, Vimlabai P.
Dey, Shri S.K.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dixit, Shri G.N.
Doral, Shri Kasinatha
Dubey, Shri R.G.
Dwivedi, Shri M.T.
Ering, Shri D.
Firodia, Shri
Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
Gendhi, Shri V.B.
Gowdh, Shri Veeranna
Guha, Shri A.C.
Gupte, Shri Badshah

Hajarnavis, Shri
Hansda, Shri Subodh
Hanumanthiya, Shri
Haq, Shri M.M.
Harvani, Shri Anwar
Hazarika, Shri J.N.
Heda, Shri
Hem Raj, Shri
Himatsingka, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jagjivan Ram, Shri
Jamir, Shri S.G.
Jamunadevi, Shrimati
Jayaram, Shri
Jena, Shri
Joshi, Shri A.C.
Jyotishi, Shri J.P.
Kabir, Shri Humayun
Kadadi, Shri
Kannamwar, Shrimati, Tai
Kappen, Shri
Karni Singhji, Shri
Karuthiruman, Shri
Kedaria, Shri C.M.
Khadilkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P.N.
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
Khanna, Shri P.K.
Kandari Lal, Shri
Kotaki, Shri Liladhar
Koya, Shri
Kripa Shankar, Shri

Krishna, Shri M.R.	Paliwal, Shri	Satyanarayana, Shri
Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.	Pande, Shri K.N.	Sen, Shri A.K.
Kureel, Shri B.N.	Pandey, Shri R.S.	Sen, Shri P. G.
Lakhan Das, Shri	Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath	Shah, Shri Manubendra
Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati	Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi	Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Lalit Sen, Shri	Panna Lal, Shri	Sham Nath, Shri
Laskar, Shri N.R.	Pant, Shri K. C.	Shankaraiya, Shri
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati	Paramasivan, Shri	Sharma, Shri A. P.
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri	Parashar, Shri	Sharma Shri K.C.
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.	Patel, Shri Chhotubhai	Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Mabtab, Shri	Patel, Shri N.N.	Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini	Patel, Shri P.R.	Shastri, Shri Ramanand
Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati	Patil, Shri D.S.	Sheo Narain, Shri
Mulaichami, Shri	Patil, Shri J.S.	Shinde, Shri
Malaviya, Shri K.D.	Patil, Shri S.B.	Shree Narasan Das, Shri
Malhotra, Shri Inder J.	Patil, Shri S.K.	Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra	Patil, Shri T.A.	Shyam Kumari Devi Shrimati
Manaan, Shri	Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.	Siddananiappa, Shri
Mandal, Dr. P.	Prabhakar, Shri Naval	Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad	Pratap Singh, Shri	Singh, Shri D.N.
Maniyangadan, Shri	Puri, Shri D.D.	Singh, Shri K.K.
Mantri, Shri D.D.	Raghubath Singh, Shri	Singha, Shri G.K.
Marandi, Shri	Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai	Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
Masuriya Din, Shri	Raj Bahadur, Shri	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra	Raja, Shri C.R.	Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan	Rajdeo Singh, Shri	Sinhasan Singh, Shri
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari	Raju, Shri D.B.	Sanatak, Shri Nardeo
Mehra, Shri J. R.	Ram, Shri T.	Soy, Shri H.C.
Melkote, Dr.	Ram Sewak, Shri	Srinivasan, Dr. P.
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt	Ram Swarup, Shri	Subramaniam, Shri C.
Menon, Shri Krishna	Ramdhani Das, Shri	Subramanyam, Shri T.
Minimata, Shrimati	Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri	Sumat Prasad, Shri
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali	Rananjai Singh, Shri	Sunder Lal, Shri
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti	Rane, Shri	Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Mishra, Shri M.P.	Rao, Shri Jaganatha	Swaran Singh, Shri
Misra, Shri Bibudhendra	Rao, Dr. K.L.	Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar	Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy	Thimmaiah, Shri
Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda	Rao, Shri Muthyal	Thomas, Shri A.M.
Mohsin, Shri	Rao, Shri Thirumala	Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Moraka, Shri	Rattan Lal, Shri	Tiwary, Shri K.N.
More, Shri S.S.	Ray, Shrimati Renuka	Tiwary, Shri R. S.
Muhammad Ismail, Shri	Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala	Tula Ram, Shri
Mukane, Shri	Reddiar, Shri	Tyagi, Shri
Murli Manhor, Shri	Reddy, Shri R. Surendra	Ulkey, Shri
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sherda	Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna	Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Murli Manhor, Shri	Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda	Valahya, Shri M.B.
Murthy, Shri H.S.	Roy, Shri Bishwanath	Varma, Shri M.L.
Murtti, Shri M.S.	Sadhu Ram, Shri	Varma, Shri Ravindra
Muthiah, Shri	Saha, Dr. S. K.	Veerappa, Shri
Muzaffar Hussain, Shri	Sahu, Shri Rameshwar	Venkatasubbiah, Shri P.
Naik, Shri D.I.	Saigal, Shri A. S.	Verma, Shri algovind
Nanda, Shri	Samanta, Shri S. C.	Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Nayak, Shri Mohan	Sannani, Shri	Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar
Nayar, Dr. Sushila	Sanji, Rupli, Shri	Vyas, Shri Radhelal
Nesamony, Shri	Saraf, Shri Shamlat	Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh
Niranjan Lal, Shri	Sarma, Shri A. T.	Yadava, Shri B.P.
Oza, Shri	Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati	

Mr. Speaker: The result of the
Division is: Ayes* 31; Noes 272.

The motion was negatived.

श्री रामसेवक यादव : न प्राप्त जमीन
बचा सकने है और न जान बचा सकते है ।

*Ayes: the name of one Member could not be recorded.

Mr. Speaker: Now, substitute motion Nos. 7 and 10 are suggestions, for they are partly covered by No. 1. I will take them separately but put them both together. Substitute motion No. 7 is by Shri Brij Raj Singh, and substitute motion No. 10 is by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty.

Shri Brij Raj Singh: They cannot be put together. Sir. How can that be done?

Mr. Speaker: They can be put together if the House agrees. (*Interruption*). There is no cause for resentment. I am only saying that if the House agrees they can be put together. If it is desired that they should be put separately, certainly I shall put them separately.

Shri H. N. Mukerjee: The tenor of the two amendments is completely different and I cannot envisage their being put together.

Mr. Spaker: My intention was, if they were not being pressed, then I might put them together. But if they are pressed, I shall put them separately. I have no objection. I shall first put No. 7.

The question is:

"That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

—This House, having considered the statement laid on the

Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border, is of the opinion that—

- (a) by launching an undeclared invasion on Kashmir, Pakistan has sabotaged the very basis of the pact, namely, the imperative need to maintain Indo-Pak peace and goodwill;
- (b) the Agreement was entered into on the ground that "it would result in lessening of tensions on the Indo-Pak. border";
- (c) Pakistan has, by its own action, violated this basic postulate of the Agreement;
- (d) the pact in effect now stands annulled; and, therefore, urges upon the Government to let it be known to Pakistan that India does not hold itself committed any longer to the Agreement, and further directs the Government to call off the proposed meeting of Indo-Pak Foreign Ministers and take no further steps in pursuance of the Agreement until Pakistan demonstrates in a convincing manner its *bonafides*." (7).

The Lok Sabha divided.

AYES

Division No. 3]

[18-57 hrs.

Bade, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Brij Raj, Singh Shri
Gokaran Prasad, Shri

Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shanker
Maurya, Shri
Singh, Shri A.P.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi

Swell, Shri
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yashpal Singh, Shri
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

NOES

- Abdul Rashid, Bakhshi
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Alagesan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joachim
Aney, Dr. M.S.
Anjanappa, Shri
Ankineedu, Shri
Anthony, Shri Frank
Arunachalam, Shri
Babunath Singh, Shri
Bakliwal, Shri
Hal Krishna Singh, Shri
Barman, Shri P.C.
Barua, Shri R.
Barupal, Shri P.L.
Basappa, Shri
Basumatari, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B.R.
Bhagavati, Shri
Bhakt Darshan, Shri
Bhanja Deo, Shri L.N.
Bhargava, Shri M.B.
Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
Bist, Shri J.B.S.
Borooh, Shri P.C.
Brahm Prakash, Shri
Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
Brij Basi Lal, Shri
Brij Raj Singh-Kotah, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
Chandak, Shri
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandriki, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
Chaudhuri, Shri D.S.
Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavan, Shri D.R.
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Shri B.K.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dass, Shri C.
Desai, Shri Morarji
Deshmukh, Shri Shivalji Rao S.
Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimlabai P.
Dey, Shri S.K.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dixit, Shri G.N.
Dorsi, Shri Kasinatha
Dubey, Shri R.G.
Dwijvedi, Shri M.L.
Ering, Shri D.
Firodia, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V.B.
Gowdh, Shri H.K.V.
Guha, Shri A.C.
Gupta, Shri Badahab
Hajarnavis, Shri
Hansda, Shri Subodh
Hanumanthaiya, Shri
Haq, Shri M.M.
Harvani, Shri Anasir
Hazarika, Shri J.N.
Heda, Shri
Hem Raj, Shri
Himatsingka, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jaggiwan Ram, Shri
Jamir, Shri S.E.
Jamunadevi, Shrimati
Jayaraman, Shri
Jena, Shri
Joshi, Shri A.C.
Jyotishi, Shri J.P.
Kahir, Shri Humayun
Kadadi, Shri
Kannamwar, Shrimati Tai
Kappen, Shri
Karni Singhji, Shri
Karuthiruman, Shri
Kedaria, Shri C.M.
Khadilkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P.N.
Khan, Shri Shahnaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
Khanna, Shri P.K.
Kindar Lal, Shri
Kotoki, Shri Liladhar
Koya, Shri
Kripa Shankar, Shri
Krishna, Shri M.R.
Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.
Kureel, Shri B.N.
Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri
Lakhan Das, Shri
Lakshmi Kantamma, Shrimati
Lalit Sen, Shri
Laskar, Shri N.R.
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
Mahtab, Shri
Mahishi, Dr. Serojini
Malmoona Sultan, Shrimati
Malaichami, Shri
Malaviya, Shri K.D.
Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
Manaen, Shri
Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
Maniyangadan, Shri
Mantri, Shri D.D.
Marandi, Shri
Masuriya Din, Shri
Mathur, Shri Hariish Chandra
Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
Mehta, Shri Jashvant
Melkote, Dr.
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
Menon, Shri Krishna
Minimata, Shrimati
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
Mishra, Shri M.P.
Misra, Shri Bibudhendra
Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar
Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
Mohain, Shri
Morarka, Shri
More, Shri K.L.
Muhammad Ismail, Shri
Mukane, Shri
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda
Murli Manohar, Shri
Murthy, Shri B.S.
Murti, Shri M.S.
Muthiah, Shri
Naik, Shri D.J.
Nanda, Shri
Nayak, Shri Mohan
Nayan, Dr. Sushila
Nesamony, Shri
Niranjan Lal, Shri
Oza, Shri
Paliwal Shri
Pande, Shri K.N.
Pandey, Shri R.S.
Pandey, Shri Vahwa Nath
Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi
Panna Lal, Shri
Pant, Shri K.C.
Paramasivan, Shri
Parashar, Shri
Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
Patel, Shri N.N.
Patel, Shri P.R.
Patil, Shri D.S.
Patil, Shri J.S.
Patil, Shri S.B.
Patil, Shri S.K.
Patil, Shri T.A.
Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.
Pillai, Shri Nataraja

Prabhakar, Shri Naval	Samanta, Shri S.C.	Sinhaan Singh, Shri
Pratap Singh, Shri	Samnani, Shri	Snatak, Shri Nardeo
Puri, Shri D.D.	Sanji Rupii, Shri	Soy, Shri H.C.
Raghunath Singh, Shri	Saraf, Shri Sham Lal	Srinivassan, Dr. P.
Rai, Shrimati Sahoitra Bai	Sarma, Shri A.T.	Subramaniam, Shri C.
Raj Bahadur, Shri	Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati	Subramanyam, Shri T.
Raja Shri C.R.	Satyanarayana, Shri	Sumat Prasad, Shri
Rajdeo Singh, Shri	Sen, Shri A.K.	Sunder Lal, Shri
Raju, Shri D.B.	Sen, Shri P.G.	Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Ram, Shri T.	Shah, Shri Manabendra	Swaran Singh, Shri
Ram Sewak, Shri	Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati	Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Ram Swarup, Shri	Sham Nath, Shri	Thimmaiah, Shri
Ramdhani Das, Shri	Shankaraiya, Shri	Thomas, Shri A.M.
Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri	Sharma, Shri A.P.	Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Rananjai Singh, Shri	Sharma, Shri K.C.	Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Rane, Shri	Shashi Ranjan, Shri	Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Rao, Shri Jagannatha	Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur	Tula Ram, Shri
Rao, Dr. K.L.	Shastri, Shri Ramanand	Tyagi, Shri
Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy	Sheo Narain, Shri	Uikey, Shri
Rao, Shri Muthyal	Shinde, Shri	Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Rao, Shri Thirumala	Shree Narayan Das, Shri	Vaishya, Shri M.B.
Rattan Lal, Shri	Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan	Valvi, Shri
Ray, Shrimati Renuka	Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati	Varma, Shri M.L.
Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala	Siddananajappa, Shri	Varma, Shri Ravindra
Keddy, Shri Ramakrishna	Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri	Veerappa, Shri
Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda	Singh, Shri K.K.	Venkatavubainth, Shri
Roy, Shri Bishwanath	Singha, Shri G.K.	Verma, Shri Balgovind
Sadhu Ram, Shri	Sinha, Shrimati Rumdulari	Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Saha, Dr. S.K.	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan	Vyas, Shri Radhelal
Sahu, Shri Rameshwar	Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari	Yadav, Shri Ram Harsh
Saugal, Shri A.S.		Yadava, Shri B.P.

Mr. Speaker: The result of the division is as follows:

*Ayes 17; Noes 262.

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Speaker: I shall now put substitute motion No. 10 by Shrimati Renu Chakravarty. The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border, is of the opinion that the clause for reference to arbitration be revoked, as it impinges upon our sovereign rights on the territory of Kutch and is fraught with grave dangers."(10).

The Lok Sabha divided.

Division No. 4]

AYES

[13-58 hrs.

Ancy, Dr. M.S.	Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shanker	Reddy, Shri Eswara
Badruddin, Shri	Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu	Reddy, Shri Yallamanda
Banerjee, Shri S.M.	Maurya, Shri	Seth, Shri Bishanbender
Barua, Shri Hem	Mukerjee, Shri H.N.	Singh, Shri J.B.
Basumatari, Shri	Murmu, Shri Sarker	Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Chakravarty, Shrimati Renu	Nair, Shri Vasudevan	Warrior, Shri
Elias, Shri Moham mad	Omkar Singh, Shri	Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Gupta, Shri Indrajit	Pandey, Shri Sarjoo	Yudhvir Singh, Shri
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram	Rameshwaranand, Shri	

*Ayes: the name of one member could not be recorded.

NOES

- Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
 Achal Singh, Shri
 Achuthan, Shri
 Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
 Alagesan, Shri
 Alva, Shri A.S.
 Alva, Shri Joschim
 nanappa, Shri
 Ankineedu, Shri
 Anthony, Shri Frank
 Arunachalam, Shri
 Babunath Singh, Shri
 Bakliwal, Shri
 Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
 Barman, Shri P.C.
 Barrow, Shri
 Barua, Shri R.
 Barupal, Shri P.L.
 Basappa, Shri
 Bhapat, Shri B.R.
 Bhapat, Shri
 Bhalu Darshan, Shri
 Bhanja Deo, Shri L.N.
 Bhargava, Shri M.B.
 Bhatkar, Shri
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
 Birendra Bahadur Singh, Shri
 Bist, Shri J.B.S.
 Boroah, Shri P.C.
 Brahm Prakash, Shri
 Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
 Brij Basi Lal, Shri
 Brij Raj Singh, Shri
 Chakraverti, Shri P.R.
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
 Chandak, Shri
 Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
 Chandraki, Shri
 Chaturvedi Shri S.N.
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
 Chaudhuri, Shri D.S.
 Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
 Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
 Chavan, Shri D.R.
 Chavda, Shrimati Joraben
 Daljit Singh, Shri
 Das, Shri B. K.
 Das, Shri Sudhansu
 Dass, Shri C.
 Desai, Shri Morarji
 Deshmukh, Shrimati Vimlabai P.
 Dey, Shri S.K.
 Dhulshwar Meena, Shri
 Dixit, Shri G.N.
 Dorai, Shri Kasinatha
 Dubey, Shri R.G.
 Dwivedi, Shri M.L.
 Ering, Shri D.
- Firodia, Shri
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
 Gandhi, Shri V.B.
 Gowdh, Shri
 Guha, Shri A.C.
 Gupta, Shri Badshah
 Hajarnavis, Shri
 Hansda, Shri Subodh
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri
 Haq, Shri M. M.
 Harvani, Shri Anwar
 Hazarika, Shri J.N.
 Heda, Shri
 Hem Raj, Shri
 Himatsingka, Shri
 Iqbal Singh, Shri
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
 Jagjivan Ram, Shri
 Jamir, Shri S.G.
 Janunadevi, Shrimati
 Jayaraman, Shri
 Joshi, Shri A.C.
 Jyotishi, Shri J.P.
 Kabir, Shri Humayun
 Kadadi, Shri
 Kannamwar, Shrimati Tai
 Kappen, Shri
 Karni Singhji, Shri
 Karuthiruman, Shri
 Kedaria, Shri C.M.
 Khan, Dr. P.N.
 Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
 Khanna, Shri P.K.
 Kindar Lal, Shri
 Kotaki, Shri Liladhar
 Koya, Shri
 Kripa, Shanker, Shri
 Krishna, Shri M.R.
 Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.
 Kureel, Shri B.N.
 Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri
 Lakhan Das, Shri
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati
 Lalit Sen, Shri
 Laskar, Shri N.R.
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
 Mahtab, Shri
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
 Malaichami, Shri
 Malaviya, Shri K.D.
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
 Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
 Manan, Shri
 Mandal, Dr. P.
 Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
 Maniyangaden, Shri
 Mantri, Shri D.D.
- Marandi, Shri
 Masuriya Din, Shri
 Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
 Melkote, Dr.
 Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
 Menon, Shri Krishna
 Minimata, Shrimati
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
 Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
 Mishra, Shri M.P.
 Misra, Shri Bibudhendra
 Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar
 Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
 Mohsin, Shri
 Morarka, Shri
 More, Shri K.L.
 More, Shri S.S.
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri
 Mukane, Shri
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sbarda
 Murli Manohar, Shri
 Murtly, Shri B.S.
 Murti, Shri M.S.
 Muthiah, Shri
 Muzaffar Hussain, Shri
 Naik, Shri D.J.
 Nanda, Shri
 Nayak, Shri Mohan
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila
 Nesanony, Shri
 Niranjan Lal, Shri
 Oza, Shri
 Paliwal, Shri
 Pande, Shri K.N.
 Pandey, Shri R.S.
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath
 Panna Lal, Shri
 Pant, Shri K.C.
 Paramasivan, Shri
 Parashar, Shri
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
 Patel, Shri N.N.
 Patel, Shri P.R.
 Patil, Shri D.S.
 Patil, Shri J.S.
 Patil, Shri S.B.
 Patil, Shri S.K.
 Patil, Shri T.A.
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.
 Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh, Shri
 Puri, Shri D.D.
 Raghunath Singh, Shri
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai
 Raj Bahadur, Shri
 Raja, Shri C.R.
 Rajdeo Singh, Shri
 Raju, Shri D.B.

Ram, Shri T.
Ram Sewak, Shri
Ram Swarup, Shri
Ramdhani Das, Shri
Ramsbekhar Prasad Singh, Shri
Rananjai Singh, Shri
Rane, Shri
Rao, Shri Jagannatha
Rao, Dr. K.L.
Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
Rao, Shri Muthyal
Rao, Shri Thirumala
Rattan Lal, Shri
Ray, Shrimati Renuka
Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
Reddiar, Shri
Reddy, Shri Narayan
Reddy, Shri R. Surendra
Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna
Reddy, Shrimati Yasoda
Roy, Shri Bishwanath
Sadhu Ram, Shri
Saha, Dr. S.K.
Sahu, Shri Rameshwar
Saigal, Shri A.S.
Samanta, Shri S.C.
Sannani, Shri
Sanji Rupii, Shri
Saraf, Shri Sham Lal

Sarma, Shri A.T.†
Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Satynarajna, Shri,
Sen, Shri A.K.
Sen, Shri P.G.
Shah, Shri Manabendra
Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Sham Nath, Shri
Shankaraiya, Shri
Sharma, Shri A.P.
Sharma, Shri K.C.
Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Sheo Narain, Shri
Shinde, Shri
Shree Narayan Das, Shri
Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati
Siddanappa, Shri
Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Singh, Shri D.N.
Singh, Shri K.K.
Singha, Shri G.K.
Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulori
Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Sinhasan Singh, Shri
Snatak, Shri Nurdeo
Noy, Shri H.C.
Srinivasan, Dr. P.

Subramaniam, Shri C.
Subramanyam, Shri T.
Sumat Prasad, Shri
Sunder Lal, Shri
Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Swaran Singh, Shri
Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Thimmaiah, Shri
Thomas, Shri A.M
Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Tula Ram, Shri
Tyagi, Shri
Uikey, Shri
Upadhaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Vaishya, Shri M.B.
Valvi, Shri
Varma, Shri M.L.
Varma, Shri Ravindra
Veerappa, Shri
Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.
Verma, Shri Balgovind
Vaidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar
Vyas, Shri Rodhelal
Yadav, Shri Ram Hukh
Yadava, Shri B.P.

Mr. Speaker: The result of the Division is: Ayes 26; Noes 264.

The motion was negatived.

श्री मधु लिमये : मेरा बोट गलत प्रत्य
है। मैं इसके हक में बोट नहीं दे रहा हूँ।

Mr. Speaker: That would be recorded that Shri Madhu Limaye did not vote for this substitute motion.

Shri Brij Raj Singh: Then the count will be different.

Mr. Speaker: That would be taken into account. I have only to read what appears on the board.

I will now put to vote substitute motion No. 8 by Shri Oza, for approval. The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

“This House, having considered the statement laid on the Table of the House by the Prime Minister on the 16th August, 1965, on the Indo-Pakistan Agreement of June, 1965 relating to Gujarat-West Pakistan border, approves of it.” (8).

The Lok Sabha divided.

Division No. 5]

AYES

[13:59 hrs.

Abdul Rashid, Bakshi
Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Alagunan, Shri
Alva, Shri A.S.
Alva, Shri Joachim

Ananappa, Shri
Ankineedu, Shri
Anthony, Shri Frank
Arunachalam, Shri
Babunath Singh, Shri
Badrudduja, Shri
Bakliwal, Shri
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri

Barma, Shri P.C.
Barrow, Shri
Barua, Shri R.
Bharupal, Shri P.L.
Bhasappa, Shri
Bhasumtazi, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B.R.
Bhagavati, Shri

Bhakt Dashtan, Shri
 Bhanja Das, Shri L.N.
 Bhargava, Shri M.B.
 Bhatkar, Shri
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C.K.
 Birendra Bahadur Singh, Shri
 Bist, Shri J.B.S.
 Borooah, Shri P.C.
 Brahm Prakash, Shri
 Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
 Brij Basi Lal, Shri
 Brij Rai, Singh, Kotah Shri
 Chaktavertii, Shri P.R.
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
 Chanak, Shri
 Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
 Chandriki, Shri
 Chaturvedi, Shri S.N.
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal
 Chaudhuri, Shri D.S.
 Chaudhuri, Shrimati Kamala
 Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
 Chavan, Shri D.R.
 Daljit Singh, Shri
 Das, Shri B.K.
 Das, Shri Sudhansu
 Dass, Shri C.
 Desai, Shri Morarji
 Deshmukh, Shrimati, Vimlabai P.
 Dey, Shri S.K.
 Dhaon, Shri
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
 Dixit, Shri G.N.
 Dorai, Shri Kasinatha
 Dubey, Shri R.G.
 Dwivedi, Shri M.L.
 Erang, Shri J.
 Firodia, Shri
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri
 Gandhi, Shri V.B.
 Gowdh, Shri Veerama
 Guha, Shri A.C.
 Gupta, Shri Badahah
 Hajarnavis, Shri
 Hansda, Shri Subodh
 Hanumanthiyya, Shri
 Haq, Shri M.M.
 Harvani, Shri Anwar
 Hazarika, Shri J.N.
 Heda, Shri
 Hem Rai, Shri
 Himatsingka, Shri
 Iqbal Singh, Shri
 Jagivan Ram, Shri
 Jamir, Shri S.C.
 Jamunadevi, Shrimati
 Jayaraman, Shri
 Jena, Shri
 Jyotishi, Shri J.P.
 Kabir, Shri Humayun
 Kaddu, Shri
 Kannamwar, Shrimati Tai
 Kappen, Shri
 Karni Singhji, Shri

Karuthiruman, Shri
 Kedaria, Shri C.M.
 Khadikar, Shri
 Khan, Dr. P.N.
 Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
 Khanna, Shri Meht Chand
 Khanna, Shri P.K.
 Kindar Lal, Shri
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar
 Koya, Shri
 Kripa Shankar, Shri
 Krishna, Shri M.R.
 Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.
 Kureel, Shri B.N.
 Lahtan Chaudhry, Shri
 Lakhan Das, Shri
 Lakshmi Kantamma, Shrimati
 Lalit Sen, Shri
 Laskar, Shri N.R.
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
 Mahtab, Shri
 Mahishi, Dr. Surojini
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
 Malaichami, Shri
 Malaviya, Shri K.D.
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
 Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
 Manan, Shri
 Mandal, Dr. P.
 Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
 Maniyangadan, Shri
 Mantri, Shri D.D.
 Marandi, Shri
 Masuriya Din, Shri
 Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Churan
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
 Mehta, Shri J.R.
 Melkote, Dr.
 Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
 Menon, Shri Krishna
 Minimata, Shrimati
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali
 Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
 Mishra, Shri M.P.
 Misra, Shri Bibudhendra
 Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar
 Mohanty, Shri Gokulananda
 Mohan, Shri
 Morarka, Shri
 More, Shri K.L.
 More, Shri S.S.
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri
 Mukane, Shri
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharja
 Murlu Manohar, Shri
 Murthy, Shri B.S.
 Murti, Shri M.S.
 Muthiah, Shri
 Muzaffar Husain, Shri

Naik, Shri D.J.
 Nanda, Shri
 Nayak, Shri Mohan
 Nayyar, Dr. Sushila
 Nesamony, Shri
 Niranjani Lal, Shri
 Oza, Shri
 Pallwal, Shri
 Pande, Shri K.N.
 Pandey, Shri R. S.
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath
 Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi
 Pannu Lal, Shri
 Pant, Shri K.C.
 Paramasivan, Shri
 Parashar, Shri
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai
 Patel, Shri N.N.
 Patel, Shri P.R.
 Patil, Shri D.S.
 Patil, Shri J.S.
 Patil, Shri S.H.
 Patil, Shri S.K.
 Patil, Shri T.A.
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C.R.
 Pillai, Shri Nataraja
 Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh, Shri
 Puri, Shri D.D.
 Raghunath Singh, Shri
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai
 Raj, Bahadur, Shri
 Raja, Shri C.R.
 Rajdeo, Singh, Shri
 Raju, Shri D.B.
 Ram, Shri T.
 Ram Sewak, Shri
 Ram Swarup, Shri
 Ramdhani Das, Shri
 Ramshekhra Prasad Singh, Shri
 Rananjai Singh, Shri
 Rane, Shri
 Rao, Shri Jagannath
 Rao, Dr. K.L.
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
 Rao, Shri Muthyal
 Rao, Shri Thirumala
 Rattan Lal, Shri
 Ray, Shrimati Renuka
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
 Reddiar, Shri
 Reddy, Shri R. Surendra
 Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath
 Sadhu Ram, Shri
 Saha, Dr. S.K.
 Sahu, Shri Rameshwar
 Saigal, Shri A.S.
 Samanta, Shri S.C.
 Samnani, Shri
 Sanji Rupji, Shri

Saraf, Shri Sham Lal
Sarma, Shri A.T.
Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Satyanarayana, Shri
Sen, Shri A.K.
Sen, Shri P.G.
Shah, Shri Manubendra
Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Sham Nath, Shri
Shunkaraiya, Shri
Sharma, Shri A.P.
Sharma, Shri K.C.
Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Shastri, Shri Ramanand
Sheo Narain, Shri
Shinde, Shri
Shree Naryan Dax, Shri
Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan

Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati
Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Singh, Shri K.K.
Singha Shri G.K.
Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari
Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Sinhaan Singh, Shri
Snatak, Shri Nardeo
Soy, Shri, H.C.
Srinivasan, Dr. P.
Subramaniam, Shri C.
Subramanyam, Shri T.
Sumat Prasad, Shri
Sunder Lal, Shri
Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Swaran Singh, Shri
Tantia, Shri Rameshwar
Thimmaiah, Shri

Thomas, Shri A.M.
Tiwary, Shri D.N.
Tiwary, Shri K.N.
Tiwary, Shri R.S.
Tula Ram, Shri
Tyagi, Shri
Uikey, Shri
Vaishaya, Shri M.B.
Valvi, Shri
Varma, Shri M.L.
Varma, Shri Ravindra
Veerappa, Shri
Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.
Verma, Shri Balgovind
Vidyalankar, Shri A.N.
Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar
Vyas, Shri Radhey Lal
Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh
Yadava, Shri B.P.

NOES

Alvaraes, Shri
Aney, Dr. M.S.
Bade, Shri
Banerjee, Shri S.M.
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Brij Raj Singh, Shri
Gokaran Prasad, Shri
Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram
Joshi, Shri A.C.

Kachhavaia, Shri Hukam Chand
Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shankar
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Krishnapal Singh, Shri
Nair, Shri N. Sreekantan
Omkar Singh, Shri
Rameshwaranand, Shri
Seth, Shri Bishanchander
Siddananiappa, Shri
Siddhanti, Shri Jagdev Singh

Singh, Shri A.P.
Singhvi, Dr. L.M.
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi
Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Visharm Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yainik, Shri
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

Mr. Speaker: The result of the Division is:

Ages 269; Noes 28.

The motion was adopted.

श्री शिवदत्त उपाध्याय (रीवा) : मुझ से गलती हो गई ।

श्री बीर्य (अलीगढ़) : मेरा बोट नहीं आया है ।

Mr. Speaker: That would be noted down.

श्री बुद्धराज सिंह : जनता की भावना को धन्यायपूर्ण तरीके से दबाने की कोशिश की जा रही है । ऐसा प्रमत्तनाक निश्चय करने के लिये विस्कार है । (Interruptions)

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla (Mahasamund): Sir, before you proceed to the next item, I want a clarifica-

tion from you. Does shouting of slogans inside the House, when it is in session, constitute a breach of privilege of the House or is it normal conduct of a member?

Mr. Speaker: It is not normal conduct. It is very exceptionable. It is not only exceptionable, but I should say it is reprehensible.

Shri Vidya Charan Shukla: It should be condemned with all force.

Mr. Speaker: It should not be done; they can stage a walk-out, but shouting at that moment is really very objectionable.