Assam Mail Accident

4737. Shri Panna Lal:
Shri P. C. Borooah:
Shri Vishwa Nath Pandey:
Shri Ram Harkh Yadav:

Will the Minister of **Railways** be pleased to state:

(a) whether it is a fact that the 3 Up Assam Mail derailed near Uttar Parukhata on the North-East Frontier Railway on the 16th April, 1966.

(b) if so, the extent of damage to life and property involved therein;

(c) the cause of the accident; and

(d) the number of accidents found to have been caused by sabotage on North-East Frontier Railway since the beginning of 1966?

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Railways (Dr. Ram Subhag Singh): (a) The accident took place between Samuktala Road and Kamakhyaguri stations.

(b) In this accident, 29 persons sustained injuries. The cost of damage to railway property has been estimated at approximately Rs. 63,000/-.

(c) The cause of the accident is under investigation by the Additional Commissioner of Railway Safety, Calcutta.

(d) Upto 23rd April, 1966, three accidents have been found to have been caused by sabotage. Two other cases, which also appear to be due to sabotage, are still under investigation.

12.08 hrs.

CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

FAMINE CONDITIONS AND STARVATION DEATHS IN ORISSA

Mr. Speaker: We will now take up the Calling Attention Notice. Shri Madhu Limaye.

श्री किशन पटनायक (सम्बलपुर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय स्थगन प्रस्ताव कब लेंगे? क्या इसके बाद लेंगे ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं लिया जा सकता है ।

श्री बागड़ी (हिसार) : अकाल के बारे में . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर पेपर जो है उस को चलने दें ।

श्री बागड़ी : कालिंग एटेंशन से बात नहीं बनती है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं क्या करूं ।

श्री बागड़ी : जब लोग भूखों मर रहे हैं, अकाल की स्थिति है तो कामरोको प्रस्ताव के बिना बात नहीं बन सकती है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब एक कालिंग अटेंशन नोटिस किसी सब्जेक्ट पर रक्खा जाता है तो उस पर स्थगन प्रस्ताव नहीं आ सकता है ।

श्री बागड़ी : आपने कहा था कि पहले हम मन्त्री महोदय को सुनेंगे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप मुझे सुनने दीजिये बयान को । बागड़ी साहब, अब आप मुझे चलने दें । अगर सब लोग इस तरह से बोलते चले जायेंगे तो कोई चीज रेकार्ड पर नहीं जायेगी ।

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंगेर) : मैं अविलम्बनीय लोक महत्व के निम्नलिखित विषय की ओर खाद्य मन्त्री का ध्यान दिलाता हूं और प्रार्थना करता हूं कि वह इस बारे में एक वक्तव्य दें :

"उड़ीसा में अकाल की स्थिति और भूख से लोगों की मृत्यु ।"

Mr. Speaker: The hon. Minister.

The Minister of State in the Ministry of Food, Agriculture, Community Development and Cooperation (Shri Govinda Menon): *rose—*

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: (Kendrapara): Mr. Subramaniam is not present here. (*Interruption.*)

Mr. Speaker: I might explain to the House that soon after we had decided that this would be taken up, the Food Minister came to me and expressed his regrets and he said that he had already a commitment which he had not in mind when this discussion took place here....

An. hon. Member: In Delhi or outside?

Mr. Speaker: Not in Delhi.

Shri Govinda Menon: In Maharashtra.

Mr. Speaker: He had a prior commitment on account of some State business. After discussing that with me, then he had also written to me that his apology may be conveyed to the House that was because that commitment had already been made, and therefore he could not help it.

Shri P. K. Deo (Kalahandi): That shows what a sense of propriety?

Shri A. V. Raghavan (Badagara): What about the commitment he made to the House?

Mr. Speaker: That was the reason and, therefore, I said I will convey his apology to the House.

श्री बागड़ी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, प्रधान मन्त्री भी नहीं हैं जब इस विषय के ऊपर यहां चर्चा हो रही है ।

एक माननीय सदस्य : उनका जो प्रोग्राम था वह निजी था या देश का ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : निजी नहीं था ।

श्री बागड़ी : वह लोक सभा की बात नहीं है जिसके लिये वह गये हैं । उनकी पहली जिम्मेदारी लोक सभा और सदन के सामने है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह निजी काम नहीं है, वह भी स्टेट बिजिनेस है ।

श्री बागड़ी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, क्या यह स्टेट बिजिनेस है । (**व्यवधान**) ...प्रधान मन्त्री नहीं हैं...

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप की बात मैं समझ गया...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर तीन तीन आदमी एक साथ बोलेंगे तो मैं नहीं सुन सकता । अब आप बैठ जाइये ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : उनकी जगह प्रधान मन्त्री तो आ सकती थीं ।

Shri P. Venkatasubbaiah (Adoni): Can't the Minister of State answer on behalf of the Cabinet Minister? (*Interruptions.*)

The Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and Communications (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha): The Minister of State is a responsible person. On behalf of the Government, he is going to give all the information. Why should you insist.... (*Interruptions.*)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने आप से पहले भी कहा कि उन्होंने आकर मुझे यह चीज बतलाई कि उनकी क्या कठिनाई है और उनको बाहर जाना किस लिये जरूरी है । वह भी स्टेट के काम से गये हैं । कोई प्राइवेट या इंडिविजुअल काम से नहीं गये हैं ।

श्री प्र० के० देव : क्या हम जान सकते हैं कि क्या काम है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : उन्होंने मेरे सामने भी अफसोस जाहिर किया और हाउस के लिये भी चिट्ठी लिखी है । अगर आप चाहें तो जो

[अध्यक्ष महोदय]

उन्होंने लिखा है उसको मैं पढ़ देता हूं । उन्होंने इस बात के लिये अपालोजाइज भी किया है । मिनिस्टर आफ स्टेट मौजूद हैं, वह गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से जवाब देंगे ।

श्री बागड़ी : आप चिट्ठी पढ़ कर सुना दीजिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं चिट्ठी पढ़ देता हूं ।

"I had agreed today in Parliament to make a statement on the 29th, regarding the scarcity in Orissa and the reported statement of the Governor of Orissa.

As I have told you on phone, we have received a report from the Orissa Government that no statement, as mentioned in press report, was made by the Governor with the press or any representative of the press. As I explained to you in person, I have a prior commitment for 28th and 29th with the Government of Maharashtra to attend Agricultural Seminar....

....(*Interruptions*) Order, order.....

"....and to visit agricultural areas where the new strategy has been tried out. In the circumstances, I have requested my colleague, the Minister of State for Food to make the statement day after tomorrow, the 29th. I request you also to convey my apology for being unable to be present in person to make this statement."

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब तक मैं न बुलाऊं, कोई नहीं बोलेगा ।

कुछ माननीय सदस्य : अध्यक्ष महोदय, (**व्यवधान**)

Mr. Speaker: Nothing will go on record.

(*Interruptions*)*

Shri P. Venkatasubbaiah: I rise on a point of order. I want a clear ruling on this. Is the Minister of State.... (*Interruptions.*)

कुछ माननीय सदस्य : रूल कौनसा है ।

श्री मधु लिमये : नियम क्या केवल हमारे लिये है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर आप लोग शान्त रहें तो मैं रूल पूछ देता हूं ।

Under what rule does he want to raise the point of order?

Shri P. Venkatasubbaiah: I am seeking your clarification...

Mr. Speaker: Seeking clarification is not a point of order.

Shri P. Venkatasubbaiah: Is the Minister of State not entitled to make a statement?

Mr. Speaker: No clarification is needed on this. The Minister of State can make a statement on behalf of the Government; he is entitled to it. But in this case the question was this: because the Minister himself had made a commitment here, it was being desired that he ought to have been present, but under the circumstances that he has explained in his letter, I think there is sufficient excuse for him not to be present here.

Some hon. Members: No, no.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह बात नहीं है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बयान भी सुनना चाहते हैं या नहीं ?

श्री मधु लिमये : आपने कहा सब को सुनेंगे, मैं बैठ गया ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप काल अटेंशन के बारे में कुछ कहना चाहते हैं क्या ?

श्री मधु लिमये : वही चीज कह रहा हूं । एक बात मैं कहना चाहता हूं ।

*Not recorded.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: He has already called the attention of the Minister to this. He has already read it out.

Mr. Speaker: Then I shall call the Minister to make the statement.

श्री मधु लिमये : आप इसके बारे में सुन रहे थे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं, अब काफी हो गया ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द (करनाल) : मेरा निवेदन सुन लें । आपने कहा था कि . . .

श्री मधु लिमये : जो पत्र आपने पढ़ कर सुनाया उससे साबित होता है कि किसी महत्वपूर्ण काम के लिए मन्त्री महोदय नहीं गये हैं । एक तो परिसम्वाद है, दूसरी चीज बिल्कुल हवाई है कि खाद्य के सघन पैदावार की योजना । इस वक्त भूखमरी और अकाल की स्थिति है । मन्त्री महोदय अगर अकालग्रस्त क्षेत्र का दौरा करने के लिये जाते तो सदन इस बात को मान लेता लेकिन मैं आपकी मार्फत सदन से जानना चाहता हूं कि जो स्पष्टीकरण मन्त्री महोदय ने दिया है क्या उसको हम मानने वाले हैं ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : आपने जो पत्र पढ़कर सुनाया है उसके अंग्रेजी पाठ का जो अनुवाद हिन्दी में आया है उसमें स्पष्ट कहा गया है कि यह व्यक्तिगत कार्यक्रम बनाया हुआ है । यह बड़ा स्पष्ट है । मैं नहीं जानता कि यह झूठ बोल रहे हैं या पत्र के अन्दर क्या है । इसमें यह शब्द बतलाया गया है कि मैं व्यक्तिगत काम के लिये जा रहा हूं । क्या इस तरह से वह पैदावार बढ़ाने जा रहे हैं और जो कमी है है वह पूरी करने जा रहे हैं । अध्यक्ष महोदय, जहां पर आज भुखमरी का प्रश्न है अगर वहां का भी वह दौरा करेंगे तो क्या उनके दौरे से फसल पैदा हो जायेगी ।

श्री बागड़ी : भूखमरी का सवाल कई दिनों से चल रहा है और बड़ा महत्वपूर्ण है । उस दिन भी सदन में इस बात पर काफी चर्चा हुई थी । जब आपने आदेश दिया तब पहले तो मन्त्री ने टालने की कोशिश की लेकिन जब आपने ज्यादा जोर दिया तब उन्होंने आज के लिये उसे स्वीकार किया । एक तरफ उन्होंने आपको और सदन को स्वीकृति दी और दूसरी तरफ बाहर के कार्यक्रम के लिये स्वीकृति दी । अगर दूसरे राज्य में या इस देश में कोई जरूरी कार्यक्रम था तो उसके लिये राज्य मन्त्री महोदय जा सकते थे । सदन के अन्दर काम के महत्व को देखते हुए वहां पर उद्घाटन आदि के वास्ते राज्य मन्त्री जा सकते थे । वहां पर सवाल इस देश में भुखमरी का है । इससे देश में खलबली मच सकती है । यहां पर सिर्फ उड़ीसा का ही सवाल नहीं है, पंजाब, राजस्थान और महाराष्ट्र सभी जगह की स्थिति ऐसी है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बस अब आप बैठ जाइए ।

श्री बागड़ी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, उनकी गैर हाजिरी से . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं, इस तरह तो नहीं हो सकता ।

श्री बागड़ी : और इससे साफ होता है, इस बात के ऊपर सारे देश को शंका है कि बहस भी नहीं स्वीकार की जाती थी उनकी तरफ से और वह जवाब देने के मौके पर गैर हाजिर हुए इसका मतलब है कि सरकार के जो खाद्य मन्त्री हैं वह भुखमरी का पूरा जवाब नहीं दे सकते

Shri P. K. Deo: We record our strong protest at the improper and irresponsible behaviour of the Food Minister at this juncture.

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आपको पता होगा कि भूतपूर्व प्रधान मन्त्री शास्त्री जी सदन छोड़ कर किसी बात से बाहर चले गए थे और यह उनकी आवश्यकता पड़ी थी तो आपने आदेश दिया

[श्री हकमचन्द कछवाय]

था कि जब सदन चलता हो तब सभी मन्त्रियों को यहां उपस्थित रहना चाहिए । तो जब सदन चल रहा हो तो उस समय यहां से कोई भी मन्त्री जाये यह सदन का अपमाम है ।

श्री ओंकार लाल बेरवा (कोटा) मुझे मौका नहीं मिलेगा ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब हर एक को मौका नहीं मिल सकता ।

श्री ओंकार लाल बेरवा : आपने कहा कि बैठ जाओ, मैं बैठ गया ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बैठने के लिए कहा इसके माने यह तो नहीं हुए कि आपको मौका दिया जाय ।

श्री ओंकार लाल बेरवा : तीन खड़े थे, आपने छः को बुला लिया और मुझे मौका नहीं देंगे ? यह कृषि मन्त्री . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बैठ जाइए । इससे ज्यादा और कुछ नहीं हो सकता कि उन्होंने माफी भी मांगी है और चिट्ठी भी लिख कर भेजी है . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . नहीं मैं इसको काफी समझता हूं । अब मिनिस्टर स्टेटमेंट देंगे ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : अध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बैठ जाइए ।

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द : क्या करें बैठ कर ? . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . चला जाता हूं ।

(*Shri Rameshwaranand then left the House*)

Shri P. G. Menon: It is a fact that scarcity conditions prevail in certain parts of Orissa.

श्री **प्रकाशवीर शास्त्री** (बिजनौर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप स्वयं व्यवस्था दे चुके हैं . . . (**व्यवधान**) आपने यह निश्चय किया था कि शनिवार के दिन इसी लिए छुट्टी रखी जायगी । . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप बैठें ।

Shri Govinda Menon: It is a fact that scarcity conditions prevail in certain parts of Orissa. A Central Team under the leadership of an Adviser of the Planning Commission visited Orissa in February, 1966 and reported amongst other things that the real problem was to set up relief works which would increase the purchasing power of the villagers so that they could buy the foodgrains which were available at reasonable prices in the fair price shops. The State Government has already set up 6,744 relief works, and according to the latest figures available, about 3,80,000 persons are working on these works. The position is that even in this difficult year, the availability of foodgrains within the State is such as to provide food to the people at a reasonable level.

श्री किशन पटनायक : फिगर्स बताइए, फिगर्स ? सुब्रह्मण्यम् साहब ने वादा किया था कि फिगर्स बतायेंगे अभी तक नहीं बताया । दो महीने हो गए हैं खाली यह कहने से क्या सन्तोष हो जायगा हम लोगों को ? कितना अनाज है इस वक्त उड़ीसा में, फिगर के साथ बताइए ।

श्री बागड़ी : अध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब दरमियान में इस तरह कैसे सुन सकते हैं ?

श्री बागड़ी : यह नामुकम्मिल जवाब दिया है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब उनका जवाब आ जाने दीजिए । उसके बाद जो कहना हो कहिएगा ।

Shri Govinda Menon: The figures are also here. The stock available with the State Government out of internal procurement was more than 1 lakh tonnes by the middle of April. Out of this, 15,000 tonnes have been

rushed by special trains to the affected areas.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: When?

Shri Govinda Menon: There is no necessity, therefore, for supply of any rice from the Centre, and there has been no demand from Orissa for the supply of rice. The Centre has been allotting wheat to Orissa and the allotment of wheat has been increased substantially this year. Against a total quantity of 67,300 tonnes supplied in 1965, allotments so far up to the end of April 1966 have been 53,700 tonnes. The allotment for May has been increased to 22,200 tonnes.

In addition to the normal allotment of wheat the Central Government has allotted 2,000 tonnes of wheat to the Orissa Government for free distribution amongst the old, infirm and others who are unable to work. A further quantity of 3,000 tonnes is also being allotted for this purpose. In addition, the State Government has also allotted 10 quintals of rice to each Block Headquarters for free distribution to old and infirm people and to young children, who cannot earn wages by working at these scarcity relief works. Orissa has also been allotted 3,600 tonnes of milk powder for the vulnerable population—that is expectant and nursing mothers and children in the age group of 0-14. A further quantity of milk powder may be allotted to Orissa when more milk powder becomes available. 1,000 tonnes has already been despatched from the ports. 175 tonnes of biscuits and a quantity of about a million multi-vitamin tablets have also been allotted.

Regarding financial assistance for scarcity relief a sum of Rs. 45 lakhs was sanctioned for the year 1965-66. For the year 1966-67 a ways and means advance of Rs. 1 crore has been made to the State Government for procurement of foodgrains. Another sum of Rs. 1 crore has been sanctioned as a loan to enable the State Government to set up more relief works.

A team of officers led by the Adviser, Planning Commission, will be visiting the affected areas in the State early in May to make a fresh assessment of the conditions prevailing in that area to determine what further Central assistance would be needed and to suggest what further steps are to be taken.

Regarding the statement attributed to the Governor of Orissa that he had seen two children abandoned by their parents and had received reports about parents selling their children, enquiries made of the Orissa Government indicate that no such statement was made by the Governor to the Press. The Governor, in the course of his tour, visited the orphanage at village Bhela in Kalahandi District, where the inmates consisted of two orphans and 68 other children left there by their parents temporarily, who had gone to work either on relief works or to obtain gratuitous relief.

Orissa Government were requested for a report regarding the allegations regarding starvation deaths. Orissa Government have reported that specific allegations about death due to starvation were received in respect of 19 persons in the districts of Kalahandi, Bolongir, Dhankanal, Sambalpur and Cuttack. All these cases were enquired into by the Orissa Government and the reports were found to be incorrect.

Shri P. K. Deo: It is all wrong.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, पहले व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब आप सवाल पूछिए, उसका जवाब आयेगा ।

श्री मधु लिमये : इनके बयान के बारे में है । जो ध्यान आकर्षण का नोटिस है उसका विषय है : उड़ीसा में अकाल की स्थिति और

[श्री मधु लिमय]

भूख से लोगों की मत्यु । अब लोगों की मत्यु के बारे में केवल उड़ीसा सरकार ने जो खंडन किया है उसी को उन्होंने बताया । स्वयं कोई जांच उन्होंने नहीं की है जबकि अध्यक्ष महोदय, . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जांच उन्हें उड़ीसा गवर्नमेंट से करनी थी, वह उन्होंने करवायी है ।

श्री मधु लिमये : नहीं यह बात नहीं है । उड़ीसा सरकार का जो कहना है वह तो सभी लोगों को मालूम हुआ है अखबार पढ़कर . . . (**व्यवधान**) . . . अच्छा मैं सवाल पूछता हूं अगर आप इसको नहीं मान रहे हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय, यहां डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया ने सवाल उठाया था कि भूख से मौत की क्या परिभाषा है, क्या व्याख्या है । उसके बारे में आपने अपना कोई फैसला नहीं दिया न सरकार ने इसके बारे में अपनी कोई व्याख्या बतायी । लेकिन अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं इस बात पर आपका ध्यान दिलाना चाहता हूं कि उड़ीसा विधान सभा में यह सवाल उठा था और उस पर सभापति जी ने कहा कि मैं अपना निर्णय सोच-विचार कर दूंगा । वह लम्बा नहीं है, एक ही वाक्य में मैं पढ़ कर सुना देता हूं । यह टाइम्स आफ इंडिया बम्बई संस्करण, 11 अप्रैल, 1966 में है । उसमें कहा था :

"Death due to superimposed ailments caused by malnutrition and under-nourishment is death due to starvation, according to a ruling given in the Orissa Assembly yesterday. The Speaker of the Assembly, Mr. Gadadhar Dutt, gave this ruling after hearing the health Minister, Dr. Jagannatha Rao, in the House on a point of order raised by Mr. Bishnuprasad Misra (Swat.) who wanted to know the definition of 'starvation death' ".

"According to him, the nine deaths which took place in a village in Kalahandi District were starvation deaths."

अब अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप हमेशा इस बात का खयाल रखते हैं कि संसद् की इज्जत और प्रतिष्ठा बढ़े । हम लोग भी खयाल रखते हैं । अगर यह फैसला जो उड़ीसा असेम्बली में हुआ अगर यह फैसला इस सदन में होता तो सारे देश के सामने संसद् की प्रतिष्ठा और इज्जत ऊंचे उठती । अभी भी मैं एक निवेदन आप से करूंगा कि आप भी सोच विचार कर के इस सभापति जी के निर्णय को दुहरा दें । फिर मैं सरकार से निवेदन करूंगा कि क्या सरकार भी गम्भीरता के साथ उनकी जो जिम्मेदारी संविधान की निर्देशक धारा 47 के अन्दर है उस पर गौर कर के उड़ीसा के अन्दर और समूचे देश में जो भुखमरी की स्थिति है उसको मद्दे नजर रखते हुए क्या अपनी ओर से भुखमरी को और भूख से मौत की व्याख्या या परिभाषा बनायेगी और साथ साथ ऐलान करेगी कि जहां जहां भूख से ऐसी मौतें होने का खतरा है हम पूरी जिम्मेदारी ले लेंगे और इन मौतों को रोकने के लिए प्रयास करेंगे ।

Mr. Speaker: Only the latter portion, whether Government can define what starvation death is.

Shri Ranga (Chittoor): Do you accept that ruling or not?

Mr. Speaker: This is not my job.

Shri Ranga: I am not asking you to give any ruling here, but I am asking the Government... (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: Not so many at a time.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: The ruling has a very great relevance because the Deputy Minister in Orissa admitted that there had been as many as nine deaths, he had verified himself, on account of malnutrition and superimposed illness. When the question arose, the Chair there ruled that

it amounted to death on account of starvation. How can they now say there is no death by starvation?

Mr. Speaker: I am asked to give a ruling, or to follow that. I am not here required to give such rulings as to what deaths are starvation deaths. It is not my job. I consider that that is out of my scope to declare here what deaths are starvation deaths. The question has come, let the Government say what they want.

श्री मधु लिमये : मैं ने यह मांग नहीं की है कि अभी आप फैसला दें । यह भी नहीं कि जो सभापति का फैसला है बस वह आप दुहरा दें । हो सकता है कि आप उससे भी ज्यादा बढ़िया और व्यापक फैसला दे दें । अभी या देर बाद या कभी भी आप यह फैसला करें कि "स्टारवेशन डेथ"

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने कहा कि मैं इसका फैसला नहीं दे सकता कि कौन सी स्टारवेशन डटस हैं ? यह मेरे हाथ में नहीं है ।

श्री मधु लिमये : जी आपके हाथ में है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जी नहीं ।

श्री मधु लिमये : फिर यह बहस कैसे चलेगी ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बहस चले या न चले लेकिन मैं इसका फैसला नहीं दे सकता ।

श्री बागड़ी : इस सवाल के बारे में मैं कुछ थोड़ा सा अर्ज कर दूं ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जी नहीं मैं इस तरीके से इजाजत नहीं दे सकता ।

Shri Govinda Menon: I do not want to enter issue with the hon. Members on the question as to what the correct definition of starvation death is. The question raised in the call attention notice is regarding famine conditions and starvation deaths in Orissa. Regarding famine conditions, the hon. Members and the Government are not at issue. I stated in the very first sentence that it is a fact that there are scarcity or famine conditions in Orissa, and detailed some of the steps which are being taken by the Government. (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: They should listen to the answer. This should not go on continuously.

Shri Govinda Menon: Regarding starvation deaths, as soon as we got this call attention notice and other information, we referred the matter to the Orissa Government, and I have reported in the statement to this House what the Orissa Government has conveyed to us. I also added that the Central Government is sending in the course of a day or two a team headed by an Adviser to the Planning Commission, to report on this matter.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: You were sleeping so long.

Shri Govinda Menon: I am, therefore, not in a position to say on this occasion, with the material before the House, as to what the definition of a starvation death is.

श्री किशन पटनायक : घर में क्यों नहीं बैठते हैं ? मंत्री क्यों बने हैं ?

श्री मधु लिमये : उन्होंने अपने बयान में सभापति के निर्णय का क्यों नहीं उल्लेख किया ? मैं चाहता हूं कि प्रधान मंत्री जी सरकार की ओर से इस बारे में बोलें । वे चुप्पी न साधें और वे इस के बारे में सरकार की ओर से बोलें ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया (फर्रुखाबाद) : क्या मंत्री महोदय नई अकाल संहिता सदन के पटल पर किसी समय रखेंगे और साथ साथ बतलायेंगे कि पुरानी अकाल संहिता का जिक्र किस नोटिस से खत्म हुआ और नई किस से शुरू हुई ?

Mr. Speaker: This question has been asked again and again and the hon. Member has sent notices and other letters also. The question is whether there is a famine code. It was stated here by the Minister that one existed during the British period and that we are not following that; we have made modifications in that. If there is one, that might be placed on the Table of the House so that it might be finished once for all.

Shri Govinda Menon: This matter was explained rather at length by the hon. Minister of Food and Agriculture at the time when he was replying to the debate. Particularly referring to what the hon. Member Dr. Lohia has been saying about this matter, the hon. Minister said that the famine codes are enacted by the various State Governments. When he referred to the fact that the old famine code is not in force now, what he meant was that the conception under which the State Governments were functioning in the olden days has all disappeared and, in evidence,—

श्री किशन पटनायक : श्री सुब्रह्मण्यम ने कहा :—"The famine code has been scrapped."

श्री मधु लिमये : यह स्क्रैप्ड का मतलब क्या है ? अगर आप नहीं जानते तो आप अंग्रेजी बोलना छोड़ दें

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर, आर्डर ।

श्री मधु लिमये : आप उनसे सवाल कीजिये कि यह स्क्रैप्ड का क्या मतलब है . . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस तरह से बीच में मत टोकिये । क्या आप जवाब सुनने को तैयार नहीं हैं ?

श्री मधु लिमये : वह जवाब तो दें ।

Shri Govinda Menon: In evidence to his statement and to illustrate his statement, the hon. Minister read at length from the preamble to the Bengal Famine Manual; he referred also to the Rajasthan rules; and also referred to what Madras has been doing and he added that the Central Government also has modified its stand. Previously, for famine relief, it was directed that only non-productive works should be taken and in that case alone payments would be made. But now that rule has been changed and productive works may be taken. In the olden days, that is, during the British days, it was a question of just sustaining life, but now, because we are a welfare State, the conception of famine relief today has undergone great changes. (*Interruption*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I would only put it to the hon. Minister that he might reply to the definite demand of the Members, whether there was some Central code during the British period, or at that time also, there were only provincial codes.

Shri Govinda Menon: There were provincial codes.

Mr. Speaker: There was no Central code?

Shri Govinda Menon: That is my impression (*Interruption*).

Dr. M. S. Aney (Nagpur): There was a Central famine code. (*Interruption*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : मंत्री लोग तैयारी से नहीं होते हैं और आपस में यहां बैठे बैठे एक दूसरे से पूछते हैं ।

Mr. Speaker: What did the Minister mean when he stated that the famine code has been scrapped now. That was the hon. Member's second point. If there were only the State famine codes, then, what modifications have been made in them by the States? If the States have made any modifica-

so that the Members may know. tions, then they might be placed here.

Shri Govinda Menon: That can be done, Sir.

Mr. Speaker: That can be placed here.

डा० राम मनोरह लोहयिा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं इस समय एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न उठा रहा हूं । मैं मंत्री महोदय के खिलाफ़ विशेषाधिकार का प्रश्न उठाना चाहता हूं . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस वक्त तो सप्ली-मेंटरीज पूछे जा रहे हैं आप प्रश्न पूछ सकते हैं ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : विशेषाधिकार का प्रश्न कभी भी उठाया जा सकता है और मैं अभी उसे उठा रहा हूं .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब यह जो सप्ली-मेंटरीज चल रहे हैं इन को छोड़ कर क्या आप चाहते हैं कि मैं विशेषाधिकार का मामला लूं ?

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : इसलिए कि मंत्री महोदय ने जानबूझ कर सदन को गुमराह किया है और वह सच बात नहीं बोले हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अच्छा ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : इसलिए मैं इस वक्त आपके सामने विशेषाधिकार का सवाल उठाना चाहता हूं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं जब कौलिंग अटैंशन लिये हुए हूं तब मैं विशेषाधिकार के मामले को ले लूं ऐसा नहीं हो सकता ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : आपका नियम है । उसमें लिखा है कि विशेषाधिकार का सवाल कभी भी उठाया जा सकता है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं इस तरीके से नहीं उठाया जा सकता है कि बिजनैस एक हो रहा है उसको छोड़ कर विशेषाधिकार का प्रश्न उठावा जाय ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अपनी नियमों की किताब में देख लीजिये . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर, आर्डर । डा० साहब आप बैठिये । मैंने सुन लिया है ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : आप देख लें कि कितनी सफ़ाई से बिलकुल झूठ बोला जा रहा है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं अलहदा देखूंगा लेकिन इस तरीके से नहीं हो सकता है । आप सप्लीमेंटरी चाहें तो पूछ लें ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : मैं आप से फिर अर्ज कर रहा हूं कि आप मुझे यह विशेषाधिकार का प्रश्न उठाने दीजिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने आप से कहा है कि इस वक्त कालिंग एटेन्शन नोटिस चल रहा है, इसलिए मैं इस वक्त इसको उठाने की इजाजत कैसे दे सकता हूं ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय, दो तीन महीने से यह मामला चल रहा है और दो तीन महीने से मंत्री महोदय झूठ बोल रहे हैं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं कालिंग एटेन्शन नोटिस के सिलसिले में किये जा रहे सप्ली-मेंटरीज के बीच में विशेषाधिकार का सवाल उठाने की इजाजत नहीं दे सकता हूं ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : वह सवाल भाषण में लाया जा सकता है, सप्लीमेंटरीज में लाया जा सकता है, हर एक तरह से लाया जा सकता है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य सप्लीमेंटरीज कर लेवें मैंने उनको कई दफ़ा कहा है कि इसको सप्लीमेंटरीज के बीच में नहीं लिया जा सकता है ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आशा करता हूं कि मेरे सवाल के साथ में आप धीरज रखेंगे । उड़ीसा की भुखमरी अब गांवों को पार कर के बलागिर शहर तक पहुंच चुकी है, जहां ब्राह्मणपारा में हरि बहेरा की मौत के बाद यह तस्वीर ली गई थी ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य सवाल करें ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : कालाहांडी, बलागिर और सम्बलपुर, ये जिले खास तौर पर अकालग्रस्त इलाके हैं । क्या भारत देश के खाद्य, कृषि और सामुदायिक विकास मंत्री को यह जानकारी है कि (क) कालाहांडी, बोलनगीर और सम्बलपुर जिलों में करीब आठ या दस लाख आदमियों के घरों में इस वक्त जो खाने की सामग्री है, वह है महुए का फूल, जिसको बैल खाता है . . . .

श्री बागड़ी : इस को मेज पर रख दिया जाये, ...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : नहीं, इसको मेज पर नहीं रखा जा सकता है ।

श्री बागड़ी : . ताकि पता चले कि देश की क्या हालत है ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : ये वज्रमूली के दाने, जिसको जंगल की चिड़ियां खाती हैं और यह इमली के बीज . . . (**व्यवधान**)

श्री रघुनाथ सिंह (बाराणसी) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, क्वैस्टन पर कोई लिमिट होनी चाहिए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या माननीय सदस्य सवाल करना चाहते हैं या नहीं ? मैं इसको इस तरह जारी रखने की इजाजत नहीं दे सकता हूं

श्री किशन पटनायक : मैं सवाल पूछ रहा हूं । आप मुझे पूछने दीजिये । मैं जानकारी मांग रहा हूं । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री चं० ला० चौधरी (महुआ) : इन फूलों को तो कहीं से भी लाया जा सकता है । यह जरूरी नहीं है कि लोग इन को खा रहे हैं । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री मधु लिमये : इन के लोग मर रहे हैं । पिछड़े दलित लोग कम से कम ये तो चुप बैठें ।

श्री बागड़ी : देश में लोग भूखे मर रहे है । कुछ तो शर्म करें । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री मधु लिमये : कुछ तो शर्म कीजिये । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री शिव नारायण (बांसी) : इलेक्शन का प्रापेगेंडा हो रहा है ।

श्रीकिशन पटनायक : इमली का बीज, जिसको न पशु खाता है, न पंछी खाता है और न मानव खाता है (**व्यवधान**) और (ख) क्या मंत्री महोदय को जानकारी है कि आठ हजार आबादी वाली डभा पंचायत में चावल की एक ही दुकान है ? मीलों से चल कर, दो दिन की मजदूरी सवा रुपया लेकर, घर में बच्चों और औरतों को छोड़ कर लोग वहां आते हैं, सवेरे से शाम तक बैठते हैं, चावल नहीं मिलता है, रात हो जाती है, तो नजदीक में शराब की दुकान भी है, वहां जा कर सवा रुपये दे कर आदमी शराब पी लेता है, वहां पर सो जाता है, घरों में औरत मर जाती है, . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय माननीय : सदस्य का सवाल कब तक जारी रहेगा ?

श्री किशन पटनायक : . . . और बच्चे अनाथ हो जाते हैं ? क्या सरकार को जानकारी है कि सर्वोदय संघ, भारत सेवक समाज और अन्य रिलीफ़ संस्थाओं के द्वारा . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब लिखना बन्द कर दिया जाये । माननीय सदस्य सवाल नहीं कर रहे हैं । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री किशन पटनायक**

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर माननीय सदस्य सवाल करना चाहते हैं, तो करें ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : मैं सवाल कर रहा हूं ।

सर्वोदय संघ, भारत सेवक समाज और अन्य रिलीफ़ संस्थाओं के द्वारा जो मुफ्त भोजन के केन्द्र और अनाथाश्रम खोले गये हैं, उन केन्द्रों में कितनी बेवा औरतें और कितने अनाथ बच्चे आ कर पड़े हैं और इन अनाथ बच्चों के मां-बाप कहां गये ? (**व्यवधान**)

श्री मधु लिमये : इनके रहते हुए भुखमरी हो रही है ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : क्या मंत्री महोदय को जानकारी है कि चूंकि वहां पर परिवार नियंत्रण का आपेरेशन करवाने के लिए तेरह रुपये का इनाम मिलता है, इसलिए पचास और साठ साल की उम्र के लोग भी तेरह रुपये के लालच में यह आपेरेशन करवा रहे हैं ? (**व्यवधान**)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य सवाल करें ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : अब मैं आखिरी सवाल पूछ रहा हूं ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब माननीय सदस्य ने मेरे कहने के बावजूद कोई सवाल नहीं पूछा और बोलते चले गये और मैंने कहा कि कुछ रिकार्ड पर न जाये, तो कई मेम्बर साहबान को बुरा लगा । लेकिन क्या यह सवाल हो रहा है ? क्या यह एंडलैसली चलता रहेगा ? हम इस हद तक पहुंच गये हैं कि मेम्बर उठें और बोलते चले जायें, मेरे कहने पर भी न मानें और सवाल भी न करें । माननीय सदस्य को स्पीच करते हुए कितने ही मिनट हो गये हैं ? अब मैं उनको और इजाजत नहीं दे सकता हूं ।

श्री बागड़ी : यह बड़ी संजीदा बात है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आपकी तरफ़ से जो बात आती है, वह संजीदा है और जो कुछ मैं कहता हूं, वह ग़लत है ।

श्री बागड़ी : यह सारे देश की बात है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं इस को एलाऊ नहीं कर सकता हूं ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : मैं आखिर में यह पूछना चाहता हूं कि . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं और इजाजत नहीं दे सकता हूं । श्री हेम बरुआ ।

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, माननीय सदस्य ने जो पूछा है, उसका जवाब तो आने दीजिये । वह बैठ गये हैं ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : जवाब तो आने दीजिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : दस मिनट लैक्चर होता रहे, तो उसका जवाब मैं क्या मांगू ?

श्री किशन पटनायक : आप के लिए लैक्चर है—लोगों के लिए अकाल है ।

Shri Raghunath Singh: He is insulting the Chair.

Mr. Speaker: There ought to be some limit to the insult that is being offered. I have been asking the Member again and again . . .

श्री बागड़ी : सवाल का जवाब तो आना चाहिए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या जवाब आये ? क्या यह तरीका है सवाल पूछने का ? क्या मुझे इस तरह इनसल्ट किया जायेगा ?

**Not recorded.

श्री बागड़ी : क्या गलत तरीका है ? उन्होंने ठीक कहा है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने इतना सब्र किया है ।

श्री मधु लिमये : माननीय सदस्य बैठ गये हैं । आप उन के प्रश्न का जवाब दिलवा दीजिये ।

श्री किशन पटनायक : मंत्री महोदय बतायें कि इन आश्रमों में कितने अनाथ बच्चे हैं ।

The Minister of State in the Departments of Parliamentary Affairs and Communications (Shri Jaganatha Rao): Sir, I move:

> "That the hon. Member, Shri Kishen Pattnayak, be suspended from the service of the House for the rest of the session."

(*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: Nothing should go on record (*Interruptions*). That question does not arise because I have not named him. Unless a Member is named first, a motion for suspension cannot be moved. (*Interruptions*).

Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad (Bhagalpur): Sir, it is not possible to sit in the House hearing all these things. So I walk out in protest.

(*Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad then left the House*)

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): The Minister should know the procedure, the rules.

Mr. Speaker: When on one side I am exercising that much of patience, there ought to be some realisation on the other side also. I regret to say that the manners adopted here are not worthy of any Member who might call himself a Member of Parliament. I might just express the displeasure of the House and of myself. This is not the method in which proceedings can be conducted. There ought to be some limit to that. I cannot just carry on this work in this manner if it is continued. I have been patient because the matter was such that it ought to have been discussed, the subject was such that it was painful for every one of us to realise these conditions. But that does not mean everything should be thrown to the wind and every decency should be ignored.

श्री बागड़ी : डिसेन्सी के खिलाफ़ क्या कहा गया है ?

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara): May I submit, Sir, that the House does not realise the seriousness of the situation? Would the Government agree and would you kindly permit having a discussion on this matter for an hour or two? It is the most unreal atmosphere that is existing. I do not approve of what the Member concerned has done, but he is exercised because of the very peculiar situation prevailing there and there is no realisation of that at the highest level of the administration. They just give the information how much foodgrains they have sent there. They are exporting rice from Orissa. People there are dying and they do not get rice. They ask the State Government to export it to other places. They are sending wheat there and we do not know how to eat it. So, people are dying. That is the reality. That is what is happening. Here there is a picture published in the Congress press, not published by any other press. A child has been sold for Re. 1. One child has been picked up who was left in the streets.

Some hon. Members: Shame, shame.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I pointed to the statement of the Governor and they say that the Governor has not made any statement. They want to fool us. The Governor has met pressmen at Raipur and the press-

men have interviewed him. This is the report of the interview. Technically it is not a statement, but if this sort of thing continues, how can you accuse Members? I feel that he has gone beyond his limit, but the House must take cognisance of this fact. Any responsible government would have resigned . . . (*Interruption*) and they say that there is no starvation death. If they have not defined what starvation is, how can they say that there is no starvation death? That day we specifically pointed out two statements made by responsible persons. The ex-Education Minister named one, two, three villages saying, "I have verified, I have gone to the places; these people have died." This is what he says. That day we insisted that he must get these facts for us. We are not interested in other things. But he tells us, "We have asked the State Government; some complaints were made three or four months back in other districts and not in this particular place which has been mentioned; they have been found to be incorrect." Such a statement is made. By the time the Prime Minister and the Food Minister visit the areas hundreds would have died. Let them eat the vitamins; people are not interested in vitamins and milk powder. I really do not understand, when rice is available, why they are asked to send it to other States. Six millions of people are affected; they do not get a morsel of food.

श्री बागड़ी : इनको सब को निकालते चलो ।

Mr. Speaker: In spite of all that seriousness, anxiety and concern, which I share myself, should there not be some method of working?

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: To that we agree completely.

श्री मधु लिमये : स्थगन प्रस्ताव को लिया जाये ।

श्री बागड़ी : कामरोको प्रस्ताव को लिया जाय ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : काम रोको प्रस्ताव को लिया जाय, यह बहुत महत्व का विषय है ।

Shri P. K. Deo: Allow the adjournment motion.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने जब काल-एटेन्शन नोटिस एडमिट किया है और उस पर जो डिस्कशन हो रहा है, उसको आप चलने ही नहीं देते, तो मैं क्या कर सकता हूं । अगर आर्डरली मैनर में एक-एक मेम्बर सवाल करना चाहें तो इजाजत दे सकता हूं, नहीं तो इस तरह से काम नहीं चल सकता है ।

श्री बागड़ी : यह नहीं हो सकता । देश भूखा मरे और यहां पर डिगनिटी का सवाल हो । यह सरकार अगर लाखों भूखी जनता का इलाज नहीं करेगी तो यह नहीं चलेगा ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर इस तरह से यह यहां पर लिया जायगा तो मुझे अफसोस है कि उनको कोई फायदा नहीं पहुंच सकता ।

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): You should allow the adjournment motion. Why not allow the adjournment motion?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस तरह से बात करना, उसका इलाज नहीं है ।

Shri S. M. Banerjee: The Prime Minister is going to Orissa on the 13th.

Mr. Speaker: What can I do if Members do not want to listen? . . . Shri Hem Barua.

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): Although the hon. Food Minister has said in his letter to you that the Governor of Orissa has issued no statement, since it was not contradicted, the statement stands. The Governor of Orissa in his statement or rather his press interview has stated it categorically that acute famine conditions exist particularly

[Shri Hem Barua]

in the District of Kalahandi. He further says that he picked up two starving children whom he has sent to the orphanage. At the same time, it has also been said in the interview that it was reported to the Governor that parents are forced to sell their children because they cannot give them anything to eat. In that context may I know why instead of rushing to the State, the Food Minister has decided to synchronise his visit to the State with the Prime Minister's visit? Does it not show an utter lack of a sense of urgency on the part of the Food Minister?

Shri Govinda Menon *rose—*

श्री बागड़ी : ये क्या जवाब देंगे ।

श्री शिव नारायण : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मिनिस्टर अभी बोले ही नहीं कि इन्होंने बोलना शुरू कर दिया कि ये क्या जवाब देंगे, क्या यह डीसेन्सी है, इस तरह से कैसे गाड़ी चलेगी, यह क्या तरीका है ? वह इसे इलैक्शन प्रोपेगेन्डा बनाना चाहते हैं ।

Shri Govinda Menon: I wish to say that there is absolutely no conflict between hon. Members and the Government regarding scarcity and famine conditions existing in certain parts of Orissa. Now the question is whether there have been certain specific events which are referred to in the report referred to by the hon. Members. What can this Government do except to refer to the Orissa Government regarding the true facts?

Shri S. M. Banerjee: Government can direct.

Shri Ranga: Your senior could have gone there; the Prime Minister could have gone there. It is shameful that they can go about the whole of the country by aeroplanes but they do not find the time to go to Orissa. Why did they not go to Kalahandi? Are seminars more important? They are a shameless people.

Shri Govinda Menon: As soon as the allegations were received, a reference was made to the State Government to ascertain the true facts. What the facts are which were transmitted to this Government, I started them in my statement. I also said that a high-level team of officers is being sent in the next day or two. The Food Minister also said the previous day that he would also be making a visit to the famine-stricken areas.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: Dead bodies are not going to wait.

Shri Govinda Menon: I also said that all attempts are being made to provide funds to the Orissa Government for proper famine relief work. The hon. Member, Shri Dwivedy, said that rice is being taken away from Orissa. That is not correct.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: It is; it is a fact.

Shri Govinda Menon: There is ample rice there; the problem is one of money to purchase rice. It is for that purpose that relief works are being organised. Even in the Governor's statement, which was referred to, the Governor says that aid is being sought from the Central Government. We have not yet received anything, but even before that, as I said, Rs. 2 crores have been made available to the Orissa Government for the purpose. Ample quantity of wheat is being sent to Orissa. If more has to be sent, the Government will be prepared to do it. I wish to submit that there is absolutely no conflict regarding the situation in Orissa between hon. Members and the Government. The Government is equally anxious to see that famine conditions are relieved..... *(Interruption)*.

Shri Mohammad Elias (Howrah): Why is the Prime Minister not saying anything? Whenever such a situation arises, we want a statement from the Prime Minister.

Shri Ranga: What can she say when she has not gone there.

Shri Mohammad Elias: She could have sent his colleague.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं नियम 58 पर एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न उठाना चाहता हूं । हम लोगों को इस में अधिकार मिलता है स्थगन प्रस्ताव रखने का

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर पेपर पर एक रखा हुआ है परसों का । हाउस की मर्जी से, हाउस की इजाजत से इसको रखा हुआ है । मैं इसको डिसपोज आफ करना चाहता हूं ।

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : मैं विनती कर रहा हूं कि अब तक जितनी बातें मंत्री महोदय की तरफ से कही गई हैं, वे काफी हैं आपको इस स्थगन प्रस्ताव पर अपना फैसला देने के लिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह नहीं कर सकता हूं ।

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I really fail to understand what to ask of these people. Since the Minister has mentioned about the team of the Planning Commission visiting that area, may I know whether that team has submitted any scheme of report about the extent of the affected people and the loss to the people and the extent of Central aid required? I find in the statement of the interview with the Governor he says that Central help must come in a big way and Rs. 10 crores would be needed in order to give relief to the people. May I know whether by this time the Central Government has considered the necessity of giving assistance to the State and, if so, to what extent it will be given? Have they decided about this matter?

Shri Govinda Menon: Aid by way of foodgrains, that is, wheat as also money has been given. What the Governor states is that more aid is being sought. So far as I know, there is no request pending with the Central Government from the Orissa Government. But, on account of what the Central Government itself has come to know about the situation in Orissa, this team is being sent in a day or two to enable the Government to come to a decision as to what more has to be done. I can assure the House that everything necessary will be done.

श्री ओंकार लाल बेरवा : अगर अखबार इस सरकार की फेवर में लिखते हैं तब तो सरकार कहती है कि सच बात है और जब इसके खिलाफ लिखते हैं तब कहा जाता है कि गलत लिख दिया गया है । मैं प्रमाण देना चाहता हूं । ये अखबार हैं और इनको आप देख लें । इन में कहा गया है कि चार करोड़ बाईस लाख आदमी भूख के शिकार हैं । तीन चार प्रदेशों में हैं । राजस्थान है, उड़ीसा है, बिहार है, मध्य प्रदेश है । 47 आदमी भूख के कारण मर चुके हैं । यह बहुत ही शर्म की बात ह । मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि क्या सरकार मरने वालों की संख्या जांच पड़ताल करके टेबल पर रखेगी और हाउस को बतायेगी कि कितने आदमी मरे हैं ?

Shri Govinda Menon: The motion is with respect to famine conditions in Orissa. I have not got....

श्री ओंकार लाल बेरवा : मरने के बारे में ।

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Govinda Menon: I have not got with me now facts with respect to other States. Regarding the conditions in Orissa, all information avail-

[Shri Govinda Menon]

able with the Government has been given in the statement made by me. I do not want to controvert anything said by the hon. Members on the floor of the House. But, this Government has to receive reports from the State Government also. We will make enquiries as to what the real conditions are in these famine stricken districts, and all that is humanly possible will be done to relieve the situation.

श्री ओंकार लाल बेरवा : कितने दिनों में मरने वालों की संख्या टेबल पर रखेंगे ?

श्री बागड़ी : सारे देश में भुखमरी है, अकाल की स्थिति है । राजस्थान में, पंजाब में, उड़ीसा में, हिसार में, भिवानी में, महाराष्ट्र में है । लेकिन खाद्य मंत्री ने सदन में बार बार भुखमरी के बजाय कम खाने की बात कही है । मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि अगर कम खाने की जगह भुखमरी शब्द आ जाये, इस शब्द का प्रयोग हो जाये तो फिर उससे सरकार की जिम्मेवारी किस हद तक बढ़ जायेगी, क्या बढ़ जायेगी ?

Shri Govinda Menon: Sir, I have not made any reference to the starvation deaths or mal-nutrition deaths or anything like that. I said that there have been allegations before the Orissa Government and in the public with respect to certain deaths. We caused an inquiry to be made through the Orissa Government and the report that has been received is that these allegations are incorrect. But, team is going withir the next day or two and it will be open, particularly to hon. Members coming from Orissa, to place before the team the real facts and, if the facts warrant further steps to be taken by the Central Government, those steps will be taken.

श्री बागड़ी : इन्होंने नहीं कहा है । लेकिन खाद्य मंत्री ने यहां इस सदन में कहा है और मैं उसका हवाला दे कर सवाल कर रहा हूं । कम खाना और भुखमरी, इन दोनों में कम खाने को उन्होंने माना है । कम खाने के बजाय अगर स्टार्वेशन को मान लिया जाये तो मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि सरकार की क्या कानूनी जिम्मेदारी बढ़ेगी ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री देव ।

Shri P. K. Deo: In spite of the fact that as early as last November I brought it to the notice of this House, while initiating the debate on the drought conditions, that these things are going to happen, no action has been taken. As a result, what has happened is none but the man-made famine, due to the corrupt and callous government and their officials. All these things have been brought to the notice of the Government. Even though the Governor might have denied the fact that he did take up any abandoned children, here are the photographs which have been shown by my hon. friend, Shri Dwivedy. Children are being sold for one rupee and another picture of a child. after having been picked up from Khariar basaar. My hon. friend, Shri Kishen Pattnayak has also shown us these photographs. Sir, I would request you to see that these are sent to medical experts to enquire or examine whether they are due to starvation. Otherwise, how are those deaths taking place? Besides that, there is a statement by a reputed social worker, Shrimati Rama Devi, which has been published in the *Praja Tantra* of Dr. Mahatab, in the *Jana Sakti* of Shri Biren Mitra, where it has been stated that people have been eating roots and leaves of peepul and fig trees, people who have been engaged in relief work are hardly getting 50 paise per day, most of the work which has been provided under that scheme is entrusted to the contractors who are favourites and pillars of the Congress Party, most of the money, to the extent of 63 per cent, goes to the pockets of these contractors and so on. In view of all

these facts, may I know why no action was taken all these months by the Minister of Famine and Genocide?

Shri Govinda Menon: Sir, I can understand the anxiety of the hon. Member, coming as he does from Kalahandi, regarding the famine conditions there. Therefore, if he is prone to exaggerate a bit, I think I should tolerate it. We are equally anxious about the conditions there. We agree that there are famine conditions in that particular district and certain steps are being taken. Regarding the sale of children and all that, the information we have got is that nothing like that has taken place. The hon. Member has shown two photographs. That can be looked into by the team going there. I can understand the meaning of a photo. If the child is being passed on by the mother to another person, it may be taken, if necessary, as....

Shri P. K. Deo: Sir, he is adding insult to injury. Let him verify the facts. Why is he attributing motives? After verification he can say it is all false or it is all nonsense.

Shri Govinda Menon: If the photographs will show that children were being sold for one rupee..... (*interruptions*). No insult is meant. Everything possible would be done.

Shri P. K. Deo: Sir, since all these facts have been corroborated, the adjournment motion should be allowed and there should be a regular discussion.

Mr. Speaker: He has asked his question and the answer has come. Now he should resume his seat.

Shri P. K. Deo: If you ask me to sit down, I will bow to your order. But I still feel.....

Mr. Speaker: No he had his say. Now Shri Kashi Ram Gupta.

Shri P. K. Deo: Sir, you are trying to gog me it is mockery of democracy and not a regular discussion that is going on here. I cannot be a silent spectator here. As a protest, I am withdrawing from the House.

(*Shri P. K. Deo then left the House*).

श्री काशीराम गुप्त (अलवर) : परसों के हिन्दुस्तान टाइम्स में उड़ीसा विधान सभा के एक सदस्य ने यह समाचार दिया था कि वहां पर 17 आदमियों की मौतें भुखमरी से हुई हैं। मैं जानना चाहता हूं कि मंत्री महोदय जो टीम भेज रहे हैं उसको वह यह हिदायत देंगे कि इन 17 आदमियों की भुखमरी के कारण जो मौत हुई है इसकी जांच वह टीम उन विधान सभा के सदस्य के साथ मिल कर करे ? साथ ही क्या उस टीम को हिदायत आप दे रहे हैं कि वहां पर जो लोगों की क्रय-शक्ति घट गई है, उनके पास पैसा नहीं है और बिना पैसे के वे अन्न ले नहीं सकते हैं, उसकी जांच कर के बताये कि कितने अंशों में ऐसे लोग वहां हैं जो अपने बच्चों को बेच रहे हैं पैसे की खातिर और भूख से मरने से बचने की खातिर ? क्या वह स्थिति को देख कर तीन चार दिन के अन्दर रिपोर्ट सदन में रखेंगे और उसका उपाय शीघ्र से शीघ्र करेंगे ।

Shri Govinda Menon: Some of the objects of sending the team are exactly what has been referred to by the hon. Member. The real conditions there will be looked into and further steps by way of assistance to the affected people will be decided upon after getting the report.

श्री काशीराम गुप्त : मेरा प्रश्न यह था कि जो 17 आदमियों के मरने की खबर समाचारपत्रों में छपी है उसके बारे में वे बतलायें, क्या इस प्रकार की हिदायत दी जायेगी ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह कह रहे हैं कि कमेटी जा कर तहकीकात करेगी । (**व्यवधान**)

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : यह क्षेत्र अकाल और बेकारी से घिरा हुआ है । बेकारी को ध्यान में रखते हुए फैमिली प्लैनिंग केन्द्रों में जा कर लोग आपरेशन करवाते हैं और वहां पर उन के क्यू लगे होते हैं । वे ऐसे ऐसे लोग होते हैं जो 60-60 और 70-70 वर्ष के होते हैं । उन को उसके लिये 13 रु० मिलते हैं ।

दूसरी बात मैं कहना चाहता हूं कि इस अकालग्रस्त क्षेत्र में लोगों को जितना अन्न दिया जाता है एक हफ्ते में, वह बहुत कम है । यह उड़ीसा सरकार ने भी माना है । क्या सरकार ने इसके बारे में कोई खोज की है ?

तीसरी बात मैं यह कहना चाहता हूं कि जिन क्षेत्रों में अकाल है वहां हरिजन और आदिवासी लोग हैं जो अकाल के भय से काफी संख्या में अपने क्षेत्रों को खाली कर के दूसरे गांवों को जा रहे हैं । क्या सरकार ने यह खोज की है कि ऐसे कितने लोग हैं ?

Shri Govinda Menon: No reports of migration of people as such have been received by the Government. If the hon. Member conveys that information to the Government, that will also be looked into.

श्री बागड़ी : क्या आप अपनी बात कुछ नहीं करेंगे ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : उन्होंने कहा है कि उसकी तहकीकात करवायेंगे । अगर आप के पास कोई इन्फार्मेशन हो तो आप उन को दे दें ।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : मैं ने उन लोगों के बारे में पूछा था जो 70, 80 साल के बूढ़े हैं और फैमिली प्लैनिंग केन्द्र में जा कर केवल पैसे पाने के लिये आपरेशन करवाते हैं । उस के बारे में सरकार ने कोई जानकारी नहीं दी ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह इसमें नहीं आता है ।

Dr. Ranen Sen (Calcutta East): When there was the food movement in West Bengal, I remember, Mr. Kishen Pattnayak had raised the question of famine conditions in Orissa in this House. Orissa has been linked up with West Bengal. Rice is being exported to West Bengal from Orissa. Now, the Minister has himself admitted today that there are famine conditions in certain areas of Orissa. When the question was raised in this House in connection with the West Bengal food movement, did not the Government of India or the Government of Orissa know that the food situation was bad at least in certain parts of Orissa? As a result of this situation now, Orissa and West Bengal have been linked up both being scarcity areas. What scheme is the Central Government going to have to stave off this crisis in both the States?

Shri Govinda Menon: The statement made by the hon. Member is not completely correct. Previously, Orissa and West Bengal used to form one rice zone. But that has now been scrapped and both West Bengal and Orissa are separate State zones. Therefore, there is no free flow of rice as such.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: It is now not only West Bengal but Kerala also.

Shri Govinda Menon: There is no free flow of rice from Orissa to West Bengal. What is done is, if there is excess rice available in Orissa, it is procured on the Central Government account. But since these reports regarding scarcity conditions in Orissa have been received, no procurement on Central account is being made in Orissa and there is no transfer of rice from Orissa to other States.

Shri Buta Singh (Moga): In view of the concern and the interest taken by both the sides of the House, I want to know why the Government don't propose to associate the Members of this House with the fact-finding group that they are going to send to the Orissa State.

Shri Govinda Menon: The official group is going and I would request the hon. Members.....

Shri Buta Singh: Nobody is going to read the report of the official group. If the statement of the hon. Minister could not satisfy this House, does he suppose to make us believe that the official report will be true?

Shri Govinda Menon: The official group is going and I would request the hon. Members of this House who have any direct information about conditions in Orissa to place that before it. (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Buta Singh: Why does he want us to read the report of their officers which are never true?

Shri Govinda Menon: I would request the hon. Members of this House who have direct information about conditions in Orissa to place that evidence before it. (*Interruptions*).

Dr. Ranen Sen: What is wrong in that suggestion?

Shri Ranga: I thought my hon. friend the Minister gave the impression to the House to understand that they were sending some officers in order to find out what more can be done and has to be done. We did not understand, in the beginning, that he was sending a fact-finding commission from here presided over by the Member of the Planning Commission even while all these terrible conditions are prevailing. What is it that they have in their mind? Now, he asks the Members of this House to place their facts before that commission. Are they to proceed to Orissa in order to place their facts before that commission? Is that an investigation commission or is that a fact-finding commission or only a commission to go there and tell the people, "This is what we have done; this is not enough and that so much more has to be done in such and such direction." What is it that he has got in mind?

Shri Govinda Menon: This team is to report upon the real conditions, the extent of the difficulties of the people in those areas and what further has to be done.

Shri Ranga: When my hon. friend, Shri P. K. Deo, placed certain facts, and also Mr. Dwivedy, the Minister had the courage to try to explain these things by introducing his conception of what mother does for a starving child and so on . . . (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Govinda Menon: All that I wanted to say was that it is not under contemplation of Government to send a Parliamentary Committee to that area now.

Some hon. Members: Why not?

Shri Govinda Menon: This will suffice. I meant no insult to any Member. If that impression has been conveyed, I am very sorry. All that I meant was that a picture cannot convey the question as to whether the sale was for one rupee or two rupees.... (*Interruptions*).

Shri Hem Barua: May I say something to you?

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Already so much time has been spent.

Shri P. H. Bheel (Dohad): In view of the famine conditions in Orissa, Government has opened certain relief works. May I know what daily minimum wages are being paid to the workers there?

Shri Govinda Menon: The wages paid are 80 to 90 per cent of the normal wages.... (*Interruptions*).

Dr. Ranen Sen: What is the normal wage?

Shri Govinda Menon: I will give that information a few minutes later. (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: He is going to supply it immediately.

श्री बागड़ी : फिर वह क्यों आये थे अगर इत्तला ले कर नहीं आये । यह क्या बात है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह थोड़ी देर में इत्तला देते हैं ।

Shri Kapur Singh (Ludhiana): The Minister has just informed the House that no rice is moved away from this area since reports were received of scarcity conditions....

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: It is wrong.

Shri Kapur Singh: But the general impression is that, while we are fully aware that Orissa is a surplus rice area and that it is their staple and customary food, the Government have been moving rice from this area and on receiving reports of scarcity conditions, they have sent wheat and vitamin pills instead. Will the Government let us know for what reasons they have taken this perverted action?

Shri Govinda Menon: Sir, that is not the position. The Orissa Government made an assessment of the rice situation in Orissa and according to the judgment of the Orissa Government, whatever was available was being given to the central pool. That is the position.

Shri Ranga *rose—*

Shri Kapur Singh: He is evading the question, Sir.

Mr. Speaker: During the questions also a demand was made that a discussion should be there, that the House was wanting a discussion. Now I have also received notices from some Members that discussion on this subject should be held. I will consult the Leader of the House and then inform the House.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: The leader is here.

Mr. Speaker: Is he going to give his reaction jut now?

Shri Satya Narayan Sinha: The Food Minister is coming. I will consult him, Sir.

श्री बागड़ी : यह बहस तो पहले से मंजूर है । केवल समय की बात है ।

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: Sir, let him agree for the discussion—We shall fix a date after consulting the Food Minister. Is he agreeable for discussion?

Mr. Speaker: He says, when he is making the statement he will reply to this.

Now, Business before the House—Papers laid on the Table.

Shri Hem Barua: In your wisdom, Sir, will you ask the Honourable Prime Minister to send a delegation of Members of Parliament to that place?

Mr. Speaker: The Prime Minister has also heard that demand from Members. It is for her to decide.

Papers laid on the Table.

13.22 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

AMENDMENTS TO KERALA LAND ASSIGNMETS RULES ETC.

The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Food, Agriculture, Community Development and Co-operation (Shri Shyam Dhar Misra): Sir, I beg to lay on the Table—

(1) A copy each of the following Notifications making certain amendments to the Kerala Land Assignments Rules, 1964, under sub-section (3) of section 7 of the Kerala Government Land Assignment Act, 1960, read with clause (c) (iv) of the Proclamation dated the 24th March, 1965, issued by the Vice-President, discharging