

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप का निर्णय है कि हर एक पार्टी से एक एक व्यक्ति को बुलाया जायेगा। आप ने एक दल के दो व्यक्तियों को बुलाया है, लेकिन हमें नहीं बुलाया है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या श्री बड़े आप की पार्टी के नहीं हैं ?

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : श्री यशपाल सिंह ने भी सवाल पूछा है और डा० मोहिया ने भी पूछा है। ये दोनों एक ही दल के व्यक्ति हैं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : श्री यशपाल सिंह बिल्कुल अलाहिदा व्यक्ति हैं।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप ऐसा कह कर इसको टाल नहीं सकते हैं।

12.44 hrs.

STATEMENT RE: CIRCUMSTANCES
OF SHRI LAL BAHADUR
SHASTRI'S DEATH

The Minister of External Affairs (Shri Swaran Singh): With your permission, Sir, I might lay this copy of the statement on the Table of the House—it is a two-page long statement.

Mr. Speaker: All right.

Shri Swaran Singh: Sir, I beg to lay on the Table a statement on the circumstances under which Shri Lal Bahadur Shastri died.

Some hon. Members: It is an important statement. It may be read.

Mr. Speaker: We have already taken too long. The statement will be circulated among Members and if hon. Members want something on that they can give notice of it.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Sir, I rise on a point of information. You are aware, and the

House is aware, that at the time of this tragic event in distant Tashkent, there were press reports which were clear and incomplete. May I know whether the statement includes facts regarding the failure to provide an attendant or a nurse just outside the bed room of the heart patient and, secondly, whether the doctor had an oxygen tube or an oxygen cylinder ready with him. I want to know whether all these things are included in the statement. If they are not included in it, then he should make a supplementary statement.

Mr. Speaker: First the statement might be read. Afterwards, these questions will arise.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: If the statement contains all the information, I have nothing more to say. If it does not contain them, he should make a supplementary statement.

Mr. Speaker: First the statement might be read by the Members.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: It should be circulated.

Mr. Speaker: Yes.

Shri Bade rose—

Mr. Speaker: Let the Members go through the statement. Then they will know what it contains.

Shri Bade (Khargone): Then, will we be allowed to ask questions?

Mr. Speaker: I will see.

Shri Bhagwat Jha Azad (Bhagalpur): I submit that this statement should be read in the House. We want to know how the late Prime Minister died. It is not an ordinary matter. As it is a very important matter, the statement should be read in the House.

Mr. Speaker: The statement shall be circulated. Then, if it is the desire of hon. Members, I will allow them to ask questions.

Shri Bhagwat Jha Asad: It should be read in the House

श्री हुकम चन्द कच्छबाय : (देवास)

जब सारा हाउस चाहता है कि इस वक्तव्य को पढ़ा जाये, तो फिर आपको क्या प्राप्ति है ।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: We will sit half an hour longer to make up for it.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब तीन चार माननीय सदस्य एक ही वक्त बोलना शुरू कर दें, तो मैं कैसे समझ सकता हूँ कि मैं क्या करूँ और क्या न करूँ ? मैंने मेम्बर साहबान को बार-बार दरखवास्त की है कि तीन चार माननीय सदस्य एक ही वक्त बोलना शुरू न कर दें ।

Is it the desire of the House that the statement should be read?

Several hon. Members: Yes.

Mr. Speaker: All right. Let it be read.

Shri Swaran Singh: Sir, the Government would like to take this opportunity of making a statement on the death of Prime Minister Shastri.

2. The late Prime Minister was accommodated in a villa specially provided for his use by the U.S.S.R. Government. With him in the villa were the following members of his personal staff:

- (a) Dr. R. N. Chugh—Medical Officer.
- (b) Shri R. Kapur—Security—Officer.
- (c) Shri J. N. Sahai—Private Secretary.
- (d) Shri M. M. N. Sharma—Personal Assistant.
- (e) Shri Ram Nath—Personal Attendant.

This villa was about 250 yards from the Intourist Hotel where the other members of the Indian Delegation were lodged. The room adjoining the Prime Minister's suit was allotted

to the Medical Officer and the Security Officer. Other members of the party occupied the remaining accommodation in the villa.

3. Apart from the two telephones for internal and international calls fitted in the P.Ms' suite, there was also a third telephone with a buzzer which could be activated by simply lifting the receiver. This instrument was available for the P.Ms' use to call any member of his personal staff or the doctor in case of need.

4. On 10-1-1966, the late Prime Minister returned to his villa a little after 10 P.M. after attending a Reception given by Mr. Kosygin, Chairman of the USSR Council of Ministers. He retired immediately to his suite and was served dinner there by Shri Ram Nath, his personal attendant at about 10:30 P.M. A little later, the P.M. allowed himself to be photographed by two Indian newsreel cameramen from outside his window. Thereafter, he spoke on the telephone with Delhi to members of his family. At 30 minutes past midnight, the P.M. asked Shri Ram Nath to go and have his food. Shri Ram Nath then put out the lights and went to the adjoining room where he and other members of the staff were attending to the packing of their luggage.

5. At about 1.20 A.M. while P.M.'s personal staff were packing the baggage for the morning flight (11th January) they saw the late P.M. at the door of their room. The P.M. paused a while and asked for the doctor. Shri Kapur and Shri Sharma hurried forward and escorted the P.M. to his room and Shri Sahai woke up Dr. Chugh who immediately rushed to the P.M.'s room. Dr. Chugh started examining the P.M., and while doing so, he asked Shri Sahai, P.S. to P.M., to call local doctors also. This was done immediately through the Soviet Security Officer on duty. By 1:32 A.M. the P.M. had lost consciousness, the pulse had disappeared, the heart tone could no longer be

[Shri Swaran Singh]

heard, and breathing had stopped. Efforts by Dr. Chugh to revive the P.M. through an intramuscular injection, artificial respiration and massage proved fruitless. The team of Soviet doctors who arrived on the scene within minutes at the personal bidding of Mr. Kosygin were also unable to revive him. In spite of excellent medical facilities, therefore, it was not possible to save the life of the late Prime Minister.

6. A copy of the medical report of Dr. Chugh and the Soviet medical team is laid on the Table of the House. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-5449/66].

7. All during his stay in Tashkent the late Prime Minister appeared to be in good health. My colleague, the Defence Minister and I, as well as other members of the Delegation were constantly with him for long periods every day. He was cheerful and relaxed. His daily schedule of work was less strenuous than it was in Delhi, and, at no time did he either complain of being unwell, nor did he, in fact, show any signs of fatigue or strain.

8. The physical arrangements for the late Prime Minister's stay in Tashkent were made in consultation with and under the supervision of our Ambassador in Moscow. Everything that could possibly have been done for the comfort and convenience of the late P. M. was done by the Government of the U.S.S.R.

9. I take this opportunity of reiterating our thanks and appreciation to the Government of the U.S.S.R.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: On a point of clarification now, Sir. My doubts and fears have been completely borne out by the statement read out by the External Affairs Minister. It is completely silent on three matters. Firstly, knowing that he had a serious heart ailment, why was it that no nurse or attendant was kept in attendance, and made to stay on duty all the night either inside the bedroom or just

outside on the threshold of the bedroom; secondly, why was it that, when the entire Soviet team, so efficient and so hardworking, were called, they came with all the equipment necessary for the purpose including the oxygen cylinder and other things, our doctors did not have anything ready on the spot for the purpose; and, lastly, according to the papers, here the late Prime Minister used to be examined medically or had a check-up every other day or so, I am told, during the last few months, why was it that during those ten days in Tashkent there was no medical or physical check-up at all of the Prime Minister? The Minister has stated that the schedule at Tashkent was even less strenuous than in Delhi. I do not know how this is to be believed. These points should be clarified.

Shri U. M. Trivedi (Mandsaur): What surprises me is this—and this is in conflict with the reports that reached us as soon as the late Prime Minister died—that the statement read out by the hon. External Affairs Minister today indicates that it is not that the Prime Minister himself gave any alarm but that the men who were packing up things noticed the Prime Minister at the window.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barackpore): No.

Mr. Speaker: The Prime Minister went out.

Shri U. M. Trivedi: That is what I am coming to. The Prime Minister himself came out at 1.20 when they were just packing up their things for proceeding to India on the morning of the 11th. This was the statement, if I remember aright. In this statement there is no indication whether the buzzer was sounded by the late Prime Minister to wake up the officer concerned who was in attendance on him. I would like to have this explanation as to whether the buzzer worked at all or not or whether the alarm was raised or not.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: He himself had to come out.

Shri Bhagwat Jha Asad: When the Government was aware of the heart trouble of the late Prime Minister, I want to know whether Government supplied any medical history to the Soviet Government, the host government, and whether in spite of supplying that no arrangements like keeping oxygen at hand and other things were made.

श्री प्रकाशश्री शास्त्री (बिजनौर) :
क्या यह सही है कि स्वर्गीय प्रधान मंत्री श्री लाल बहादुर शास्त्री अपनी ताशकंद यात्रा के दौरान जिस कमरे में सोया करते थे, अंतिम दिन जिस दिन उनका देहावसान हुआ, वह उस कमरे में न थे किसी दूसरे कमरे में उनके सोने की व्यवस्था की गई थी ?

क्या यह भी सही है कि उनका भोजन बनाने के लिए जो रसोइया यहां से गया था केवल वही उनका भोजन बनाने का काम करता था या मास्को स्थित हमारे राजदूत का रसोइया भी जो कि मौलाना आजाद का रसोइया हुआ करता था वह भी उस में सम्मिलित था ?

क्या यह भी सही है कि जिस समय डा० चुग प्रधान मंत्री के शरीर के पास पहुँचे तो उससे पहले ही उनके प्राण निकल चुके थे और डा० चुग ने उनके पास आक्सीजन न होने के कारण अपने मुँह से उनके मुँह में हवा फूँकी और उनके शव के ऊपर ही केवल इन्फेक्शन लगाये, उस समय इन्फेक्शन लगाये जबकि उनका शरीर पूरा हो चुका था ?

श्री मधु लिये (मुंबेर) : एक बात की सफाई नहीं हुई है। क्या शास्त्री जी ने शान्तिपूर्ण ढंग से नींद ले ली थी या वह अस्वस्थ थे ? उसी से उनके मन की उस वक्त जो स्थिति थी उसका पता चल जायेगा। क्या विदेश मंत्री जी के पास इस बात की

कोई जानकारी है कि उनके नौकरों ने जब बीया बुझा दिया तो उसके बाद क्या वह आराम से सोये थे या चिंतित थे और उनकी मन स्थिति शुद्ध थी ?

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): I want to know whether it is a fact that the wife of the late Shastriji, Shrimati Lalita Shastri, said that had she been there she would not have allowed Shastriji to work beyond some hour. That was being observed by Shastriji here. If this was correct, I would like to know why Dr. Chugh, who accompanied Lal Bahadur Shastriji, allowed him to work beyond those hours and whether he examined him every day. This was the third heart attack.

Shri Hem Barua rose—

Mr. Speaker: Shri Kamath has already asked questions from Shri Hem Barua's party. I shall allow only one Member from each Party.

Shri Krishnapal Singh (Jalesar): The late Prime Minister was a heart patient. Was he examined after his return from the party which he attended? I think, it was necessary that he should have been examined before he went out to attend conferences and parties and after he returned from there.

श्री रघुनाथ सिंह (बाराणसी) : मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि डिफेंस मिनिस्टर और एक्सटर्नल एफेयर्स मिनिस्टर साहब जम्मू-बहादुर जी के देहान्त के बाद पहुँचे या पहले पहुँचे थे ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मिनिस्टर साहब जवाब दे दें।

श्री जे० प्र० शर्मा (बक्सर) : मैं एक छोटा सा सवाल पूछना चाहता हूँ। वह कहा गया है कि उनको दरवाजे पर आना

[श्री प्र० प्र० शर्मा]

पड़ा था। यह भी कहा गया है कि उनके पास इंटरनल टेलीफोन था, आटोमेटिक टेलीफोन था। जब आटोमेटिक टेलीफोन था तो क्या उसको भी एग्जैमिन किया गया है कि वह खराब तो नहीं हो गया था जिस की वजह से उनको दरवाजे पर घाना पड़ा ?

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): On a point of order, Sir. In my case you said that there could be only one Member from one Party who could ask a question, but here two Members of the Congress Party have put a question each.

Shri Swaran Singh: Shri Kamath has put three questions. I would say that the arrangement had been made for his personal attendant, Shri Ram Nath, to stay in the adjoining room with a buzzer connection which at once was activated as soon as the receiver was lifted and, at the same time, this buzzer also started buzzing in the doctor's room and in his assistant's room. As to whether he slept outside the room, we have seen those rooms. The rooms were cosy and small rooms, not very large-size rooms and whether it is outside the door on the one side or on the other side would not make any difference because it is not like a person sleeping outside the room as the climate there is such that no one could sleep outside.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Why had he to come out if the buzzer was working?

Shri Swaran Singh: It is a little painful for us who watched that—I and my colleague, Shri Chavan—really to be cross-examined like that. We ourselves were so moved and so anxious to find out that everything had been done or not and we were fully satisfied on that issue.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: You are satisfied, but.....

Shri Swaran Singh: The buzzer, telephone and all that were in absolute working order.

Mr. Speaker: One question that is very pertinent is whether after that it was ascertained that the buzzer was in order and whether the Prime Minister had to come out himself because the buzzer could not work.

13 hrs.

Shri Swaran Singh: It is a very important question. It was tested and it was in working order. It was for the Prime Minister to decide what he did and, knowing as we do his habits, he did not want to trouble people and he probably thought that he would...

श्री रामेश्वरानन्द (करनाल) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, क्या यह जानने का यत्न किया गया कि वह द्वार से बाहर क्यों आये ?

Shri Swaran Singh: ...go out and call somebody rather than use the buzzer. We cannot decide as to why he chose one or the other course. He could do either of the two things. In this case, he did not use the buzzer and he actually came out of the room.

About equipment, it is a technical question and the Doctor and the Health Minister have assured us that all the necessary equipment was available with the Doctor.

About the medical examination, I know it personally that Dr. Chugh used to examine him everyday and very often more than once. I can say that Dr. Chugh, apart from being a very good doctor professionally, was himself very much attached to Shastriji and he was also very careful to be present wherever the Prime Minister went. He always remained somewhere near about him in spite of the fact that Shastriji, on many occasions, insisted that these doctors are much too fussy and that they should not pester him.... (Interruption).

Mr. Speaker: Let him answer first.

Shri Swaran Singh: Dr. Chugh did examine him everyday and there was no slackness on his part. As regards Mr. Trivedi's question about the buzzer, I have already answered it.

Mr. Bhagwat Jha Azad put the question whether the history of the state of health of Shastriji was communicated to the U.S.S.R. doctors. I may say that our doctor was there and there was also a Soviet doctor who was in charge of that area. I had a personal experience myself. I myself got a little unwell and immediately not only Dr. Chugh but also the other doctor came in a matter of minutes. Dr. Chugh may have himself communicated his requirements I do not know.....

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: He says, 'may have.'

Shri Swaran Singh: But Dr. Chugh himself had all the necessary equipment which was necessary to meet an emergency in a case like this.

Another question put by Mr. Prakash Vir Shastri was whether the late Prime Minister slept in a different room than the one which he normally occupied. My reply to this is 'No'. He slept that night in the same room in which he used to sleep normally.

With regard to his kitchen arrangements, there were the Soviet workers also who looked after the arrangements because not only the Prime Minister alone but on several occasions others whom he wanted to invite had to be served. So, there were the arrangements principally organised by the U.S.S.R. Government, and very fine arrangements had been made. To supplement for the special requirements of the Prime Minister and to cater to his special tastes and the simple type of food that he generally preferred, his own personal attendant, Shri Ram Nath, who was his valet, that is, to look after his comfort, also combined in himself the functions of a cook. As to whether he himself

cooked the food or he advised others, I cannot say. But whenever we went there, he was there serving and bringing the things. There was also a cook of the Indian Embassy who was sent for because it was considered necessary that there should be an additional help to him. So there were two Indian cooks working in the kitchen besides the Soviet cooks and the Soviet workers.

As to what was the condition of the Prime Minister when Dr. Chugh had arrived at the scene, that is contained in the statement of Dr. Chugh, a copy of which is laid on the Table of the House.

Then, Mr. Madhu Limaye put the question as to whether he slept normally or whether he was worried. I would like to share the information that so far as the Tashkent Declaration is concerned, that had been finalised on the night between 9th and 10th. The Declaration was actually signed on the 10th at 4 P.M. at a ceremony where the leaders, the press people and a large number of other important dignitaries were present. Throughout that day, Shastriji was feeling very relaxed. He had a conversation with me and my colleague Shri Chavan on a number of matters. In fact, it was during these talks that he said that we had very valiantly fought for defending our country and we had to fight equally valiantly for defending peace. That day, I think, he also went to some museum and saw something. The point that I want to place before this House and the country is that throughout that day, on the 10th there was nothing that he was required to attend to or think about in relation to the Tashkent Declaration which had been finalised during the night between 9th and 10th. Others were working on it. For instance, I had to look at the draft to see that it was in accordance, with what had been agreed upon. But he himself was very relaxed and he felt happy and there was no pressure of any type on his mind. He was not at all worried. That was the specific question

Shri Maurya (Aligarh): What had he been doing after 4 P.M. on that day?

Shri Swaran Singh: If you put a question, I will answer it. Please do not do it like that. Let me finish my reply. I will answer it. There is nothing that I want to hide. As to what he was doing after signing the Agreement that day, we returned to our place and, I think, my colleague, Shri Chavan actually came in the same car with him. He had nothing particularly to do that afternoon except that he attended a reception which was attended by several people. There were our own press people; there were the Soviet hosts; there were the Pakistani leaders. There was some cultural programme also and all of us who had the honour of being with him at that time watched him and we felt that he was feeling very relaxed. He was having talks with every person, with our press people, with the foreign press people, and also with President Ayub and Prime Minister Kosygin and other Ministers, and also with the Chairman of the Council of Ministers of the Republic of Uzbekistan.

I am mentioning all these things to indicate that there was no pressure of work, there was no weight on his chest and there was no worry to him. He was feeling very relaxed before signing the Agreement and after signing the Agreement. I think, this covers all the points that have been raised.

Shri Maurya: Was he examined between 4 P.M. and 11 P.M.? (Inter-
ruption).

Mr. Speaker: There is one thing more. The hon. Minister said that our doctor had all the necessary equipment. But the particular question asked was whether he was equipped with oxygen also.

The Minister of Health and Family Planning (Dr. Sushila Nayar): They did have oxygen also.

Shri Raghunath Singh: He has not replied to my question.

Mr. Speaker: They say, they had oxygen also.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: It is a fabrication. I am sorry to say that. No paper said that oxygen was available with our doctor at that time. It is an unabashed fabrication.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : (फर्हंखा-बाद) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप मेहरबानी करके इस पर ध्यान दीजिये कि विदेश मंत्री जी ने उत्तर नहीं दिया कि शास्त्री जी बिस्तर पर लेट ही सके थे या सो भी सके थे। अगर उन के पास इतला नहीं है तो वह कह दें कि हमारे पास इतला नहीं है। उन्होंने शास्त्री अनुमान बतलाया कि वह दिन भर जगें थे इसलिये सोये होंगे।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्या इस की भी इन्फार्मेशन कोई है कि वह रात में सो सके थे या उन्होंने कोई शिकायत की . . .

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : शिकायत नहीं। मेरा सवाल यह नहीं था।

Shri Swaran Singh: It is mentioned in the medical report of doctors including Dr. Chugh. It is mentioned there that he went to bed at about 12-30 A.M. (mid-night).

Mr. Speaker: The question is whether he could sleep or not. This is what Dr. Lohia says.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : मेरे सवाल का तो जवाब ही नहीं दिया गया।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : वह कहते हैं कि उन को पता नहीं है।

मैं आप से कहूंगा कि इस तरह ठीक नहीं है। जो कुछ जवाब वह दे सकते थे वह दे दिया। अब उसको लिए चले जाना, बहुत ज्यादा खींचना ठीक नहीं है। (व्यवधान)

Shri Raghunath Singh: My question is very simple.

Several hon. Members rose—

Mr. Speaker: I have asked the members to sit down. Whosoever speaks now will not go on record. (Interruption)*

श्री रघुनाथ सिंह : हमारा सवाल बहुत सिम्पल है कि डिफेंस मिनिस्टर साहब कब पहुँचे, लाल बहादुर शास्त्री जी के देहान्त के बाद पहुँचे या कब पहुँचे ?

Shri Swaran Singh: We reached there as soon as we received the telephonic message. Both I and my colleague, Shri Chavan, reached the spot immediately. He was absolutely unconscious at that time. The doctors said that they were still working on him. They were doing their best. You should imagine the impact that would have been on our mind rather than putting this type of question (Interruptions).

Mr. Speaker: I will request the hon. Members to sit silently.

Mr. D. N. Tiwary:

13.11 hrs.

ELECTION TO COMMITTEE

COMMITTEE ON PUBLIC UNDERTAKINGS

Shri D. N. Tiwary (Gopalganj): I beg to move:

"That the members of this House do proceed to elect in the manner required by sub-rule (3) of Rule 254 read with sub-rule (1) of Rule 312B of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, two members from among themselves to serve as members of the Committee on Public Undertakings for the unexpired term of the Committee, vice Shri Panampilli Govinda Menon ceased to be a member of

the Committee on his appointment as a Minister and Shri Harish Chandra Mathur resigned from the Committee."

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That the members of this House do proceed to elect in the manner required by sub-rule (3) of Rule 254 read with sub-rule (1) of Rule 312B of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, two members from among themselves to serve as members of the Committee on Public Undertakings for the unexpired term of the Committee, vice Shri Panampilli Govinda Menon ceased to be a member of the Committee on his appointment as a Minister and Shri Harish Chandra Mathur resigned from the Committee."

The motion was adopted.

13.13 hrs.

PATENTS BILL.

EXTENSION OF TIME FOR PRESENTATION OF REPORT OF JOINT COMMITTEE

Shri Krishnamoorthy Rao (Shimoga): I beg to move:

"That the time appointed for the presentation of the Report of the Joint Committee on the Bill to amend and consolidate the law relating to patents, be extended upto the first day of the second week of the next session."

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

"That the time appointed for the presentation of the Report of the Joint Committee on the Bill to amend and consolidate the law relating to patents, be extended upto the first day of the second week of the next session."

The motion was adopted.

*Not recorded.