

helpless what to do at that moment, because he worked himself up to such an extent that he would not listen at all. I knew he was excited on this particular subject, but everybody is. There ought to be some limit to which we can control ourselves. How many times did I ask him? It was not the first time. When he goes out, he challenges the Chair in such a manner that I feel that I have been insulted.

12.20 hrs.

SUSPENSION OF MEMBER  
(Shri Hem Barua)

The Minister of Communications and Parliamentary Affairs (Shri Satya Narayan Sinha): In view of the fact that Shri Hem Barua, while going out, made certain remarks which were derogatory to the Chair, I propose that he should be suspended from the House for one week.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Sir, I submit that the motion is not in order. He said: "In view of the fact that . . ." What did he say—"derogatory remarks"?

Shri Satya Narayan Sinha: I said: "derogatory to the Chair".

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: As far as I know, if I heard him aright, he only said—you may discount his voice and tone, but the words were perhaps these—"Why do you take the trouble of asking me to go out when I am going out myself".

श्री रामसेवक यादव (बाराबंकी) :  
इस प्रस्ताव को सदन की राय के लिए रखने  
के पहले . . .

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I shall place it before the House.

इस पर डिबेट तो नहीं हो सकती। जब मोशन  
आया है तो मुझे रखना पड़ेगा :

श्री रामसेवक यादव : इस में एक संशोधन  
तो स्वीकार किया जा सकता है।

श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय (देवास) :  
यह सजा बहुत लम्बी है। तीन दिन से ज्यादा  
की सजा न दें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मेरे सामने जो मोशन  
आया है उस को मुझे रखना है।

श्री रामसेवक यादव : मोशन आया है  
तो उस में संशोधन तो हो सकता है।

Mr. Speaker: I have to put the motion as it comes before me.

संशोधन बाद में देखेंगे। पहले यह तो देखें  
कि यह पास होता है या नहीं होता या क्या  
होता है।

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Sir, on a point of order. May I request you to guide us in this matter? You have just now ruled that the motion moved by the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs is not subject or liable to amendment. Under what rule is that motion not subject to amendment?

Mr. Speaker: A motion for suspension of a member from the service of the House has to be put by the Speaker forthwith and, as such, no amendment can be moved to that motion. Now the question is:

"That Shri Hem Barua, a Member of this House, and named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for one week."

The Lok Sabha divided.

\*Shri Koya (Kozhikode): Sir, my vote has not been properly recorded.

Mr. Speaker: It will be noted.

\*\*Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya (Raiganj): One should be added to 'Ayes' because my vote has not been correctly recorded.

\*Shri Koya voted for "Noes."

\*\*Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya voted for "Ayes."

## Division 14 ]

## AYES

[ 12.27 hrs

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Alagesan, Shri  
 Alva, Shri A. S.  
 Anjanappa, Shri  
 Arunachalam, Shri  
 Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha  
 Bakliwal, Shri  
 Basappa, Shri  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhagwati, Shri  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Borooah, Shri P. C.  
 Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Brij Basi Lal, Shri  
 Brij Raj Singh, Shri  
 Chakraverti, Shri P. R.  
 Chandriki, Shri  
 Chaturvedi, Shri S. N.  
 Chaudhry, Shri Chandramani Lal  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavda, Shrimati Joraben  
 Chuni Lal, Shri  
 Daffe, Shri  
 Daljit Singh, Shri  
 Das, Dr. M. M.  
 Dass, Shri C.  
 Desai, Shri Morarji  
 Deshmukh, Shri Shivaji Rao S.]  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. N.  
 Dorai, Shri Kasinatha  
 Dubey, Shri R. G.  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gaekwad, Shri Fatehsinhrao  
 Gahmati, Shri  
 Ganapati, Ram, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shri V. B.  
 Ganga Devi, Shrimati  
 Ghosh, Shri Atulya  
 Gowdh, Shri  
 Guha Shri A. C.  
 Gupta, Shri Shiv Charan  
 Hansda Shri Subodh  
 Harvani, Shri Ansar  
 Hazarika, Shri J. N.  
 Himatsingka, Shri  
 Iqbal Singh, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri M. L.  
 Jamunadevi, Shrimati  
 Jedhe, Shri  
 Joshi, Shrimati Subhdra  
 Joytishi, Shri J. P.  
 Kabir, Shri Humayun  
 Kadadi, Shri  
 Kajrolkar, Shri  
 Kannamwar, Shrimati Tat  
 Kanungo, Shri  
 Kappen, Shri

Karuthiruman, Shri  
 Keishing, Shri Rishang  
 Khadilkar, Shri  
 Khan, Shri Osman Ali  
 Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand  
 Kindar Lal, Shri  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Koujalgi, Shri H. V.  
 Kripa Shankar, Shri I  
 Krishnamachari, Shri T.T.  
 Lahtan Chaudhri, Shri  
 Lakhan Das, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri, N. R.  
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Maniyangadan, Shri  
 Mantri, Shri D. D.  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Mathur, Shri Harish Chandra  
 Mathur, Shri Shiv Charan  
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari  
 Mehta, Shri Jashvant  
 Menon, Shri P. G.  
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
 Mishra, Shri M. P.  
 Misra, Dr. U.  
 Misra, Shri Shyam Dhar  
 Morarka, Shri  
 More, Shri K. I.  
 More, Shri S. S.  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Musafir Shri G. S.  
 Muthiah, Shri  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Naskar, Shri P. S.  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Nesamony, Shri  
 Niranjan Lal, Shri  
 Paliwal, Shri  
 Pande, Shri K. N.  
 Pandey, Shri R. S.  
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath  
 Pandit, Shrimati Vijay Lakshmi  
 Panna Lal, Shri  
 Paranasivan, Shri  
 Patel, Shri Chhotubhai  
 Patel, Shri Man Sinh P.  
 Patel, Shri P. R.  
 Patel, Shri Rajeshwar  
 Patil, Shri D. S.  
 Patil, Shri S. K.  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Patnaik, Shri B. C.  
 Pattabhi Raman, Shri C. R.

Prabhakar, Shri Naval  
 Pratap Singh, Shri  
 Raghunath Singh, Shri  
 Raghuramaiah, Shri  
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodra Bai  
 Raja, Shri C. R.  
 Rajdeo Singh, Shri  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Raju, Dr. D. S.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramakrishnan, Shri P.R.  
 Ramannathan Chettiar, Shri  
 Ramdhani Das, Shri  
 Ramshekhhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rane, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganatha  
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy  
 Rao, Shri Ramapathi  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala  
 Reddiar, Shri  
 Reddy, Shri Ramakrishna  
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda  
 Sahu, Shri Rameshwar  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Samanta, Shri S. C.  
 Sanji Rupji, Shri  
 Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri A. K.  
 Sen, Shri P. G.  
 Shah, Shri Manabendra  
 Shah, Shrimati Jayaben  
 Sham Nath, Shri  
 Shankaraiya, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri D. C.  
 Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shivananjappa, Shri  
 Shree Narayan Das, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan  
 Shyam Kumari Devi, Shrimati  
 Siddananjappa, Shri  
 Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Singh, Shri D. N.  
 Singh, Shri S. T.  
 Sinha, Shrimati Ramdulari  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Naryan  
 Sinha, Shrimati Tarakeshwari  
 Snatak, Shri Nardeo  
 Soundaram Ramachandran,  
 Shrimati  
 Subbaraman, Shri  
 Subramoniam, Shri C.  
 Subramanyam, Shri T.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Swell, Shri  
 Thimmaiah, Shri  
 Thomas, Shri A. M.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.

Tiway, Shri K. N.  
Tiway, Shri R. S.  
Tripathi, Shri Krishna Deb  
Tula Ram, Shri  
Tyagi, Shri  
Ukey, Shri

Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt  
Vaishya, Shri M. B.  
Varma, Shri Ravindra  
Veerappa, Shri  
Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.

Vidyalankar, Shri A. N.  
Vijaya Ananda, Maharajkumar  
Virbhadra Singh, Shri  
Wasnik, Shri Balkrishna  
Yadav, Shri Ram Harkh

## NOES

Alvares, Shri  
Aney, Dr. M. S.  
Bade, Shri  
Bagri, Shri  
Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
Basant Kunwari, Shrimati  
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
Bhattacharya, Shri Dinen  
Chakravartty, Shrimati Renu  
Daji, Shri  
Dharmalingam, Shri  
Gupta, Shri Inderjit  
Jha, Shri Yogendra  
Kachhavaia, Shri Hukam Chand

Kakkar, Shri Gauri Shanker  
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu  
Kandappan, Shri S.  
Kapoor Singh, Shri  
Lohia, Dr. Ram Marohar  
Mate, Shri  
Maurya, Shri  
Murmu, Shri Sarkar  
Omkar Singh, Shri  
Pandey, Shri Sarjoo  
Pattanyak, Shri Kishan  
Pottekkatt, Shri  
Sen, Dr. Ranen  
Sezhiyan, Shri

Sharma, Shri A. P.  
Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
Shinkre, Shri  
Singh, Shri A. P.  
Singh, Shri J. B.  
Singh, Shri Y. D.  
Sivasankaran, Shri  
Swamy, Shri Sivamurthi  
Vishram Pr sad, Shri  
Warior, Shri  
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak  
Yajnik, Shri  
Yudhvir Singh, Shri

**Mr. Speaker:** The result of the division, as indicated by the machine, is: Ayes 193; Noes 42.

*The motion was adopted.*

श्री रामसेवक यादव : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ कि श्री चपल कान्त भट्टाचार्य को एक सप्ताह के लिये सदन की सेवा से मुअत्तिल कर दिया जाए ।

**Mr. Speaker:** The difficulty is that a motion cannot come without the Speaker having named a Member. The wording of the motion is: such and such member of the House, named by the Speaker, be suspended from the service of the House for such and such period. So, how could this motion come?

**Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath:** Then, may I request you to name him?

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया (फर्रुखाबाद): मेरा एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।

**Mr. Speaker:** I might be allowed to proceed further.

**Shri Koya:** I just want to know whether it is in order for Shri C. K.

Bhattacharyya to say that an hon. Member is playing to the gallery. I want your ruling on that.

**Mr. Speaker:** It has been done so many times in this House. I would certainly advise hon. Members not to impute motives to other hon. Members.

**Shri Rangya (Chittoor):** In regard to this specific incident, should you not say that it is unparliamentary and, therefore, it will be expunged?

**Mr. Speaker:** I have given the ruling that it is not desirable for any member to impute motives to others. In this case, it was not desirable for Shri Bhattacharyya to use such expression or impute motives.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barrackpore):** May I point out to you another occasion when I was accused. At that time, Shri Jain was the Rehabilitation Minister and we had a sharp exchange of words. Then Shri Jain said that I was trying to make propaganda. At that time, Shri Ananthasayanam Ayyangar, who was in the Chair, told him that it was improper to make such references and that he should withdraw those words. Shri Jain was good enough to withdraw

[Shrimati Renu Chakravartty]

those words and apologise for using such an expression. It is all in the record. So, I think it is only right and proper that Shri Bhattacharyya should also regret for using such words and withdraw them.

**Shri Shivaji Rao S. Deshmukh** (Parbhani): Sir, I rise on a point of order. On an earlier occasion, referring to our late Prime Minister, Shri Ranga said that he is playing to the gallery. Naturally, those remarks were made with a view to impute motives to the late Prime Minister. That should also be looked into.

**Mr. Speaker:** I cannot rake up old records. Sometimes it is done. Though it might have been tolerated at that time, it is not desirable. I say it is improper. It should not be done. Mr. Bhattacharyya ought not to have done that. I say that. Mr. Banerjee.

**Shri Alvares** (Panjim): Mr. Bhattacharyya may be asked to withdraw his remarks. (*Interruption*).

**Shri Ranga:** How are we to proceed otherwise? This remains on record. Why did we abstain on the earlier voting? If you want us to co-operate, then the Treasury Benches, the ruling Party, should co-operate with the Opposition. Surely, I would like to appeal to them. Do they approve of that remark? If they do not approve of that remark, it should be withdrawn. My hon. friend is a learned gentleman and he should spontaneously get up and withdraw it. (*Interruption*).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. I would advise Mr. Bhattacharyya that he should be sorry for that. He should withdraw it.

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya:** Sir, I certainly submit with the utmost respect to what you say. But references have been made . . .

**Mr. Speaker:** It would be better now to do it so that it might be a good precedent for the future.

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya:** That is what I submit. I respectfully submit to what you say and withdraw what what you suggest to me to withdraw . . . (*Interruptions*).

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order.

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya:** But the references have been made by Shrimati Renu Chakravartty and Mr. Ranga . . .

**Mr. Speaker:** Let it be done in clear terms so that I can enforce it in future on every occasion.

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya:** I do it with the utmost respect and without any mental or verbal reservation. When Shrimati Renu Chakravartty referred to some precedent and Mr. S. S. Deshmukh also referred to some precedent, I would request you to consult the records and find out what had happened on these occasions.

**Mr. Speaker:** I have already . . .

**An hon. Member:** He should be named.

**Mr. Speaker:** There is no occasion for naming him.

I have already said that this phrase has been used earlier many a time and notice has not been taken. I had said that just a little while ago. (*Interruption*). Would he allow me to finish? But in order to lay down good tradition, I have advised Mr. Bhattacharyya to withdraw these words because it would be a good precedent which I can enforce in future also. So, I ask him to withdraw those words.

**Some hon. Members:** He has withdrawn them.

**Mr. Speaker:** Has he withdrawn them?

**Shri C. K. Bhattacharyya:** I have already done it unreservedly.

डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया : अध्यक्ष महोदय . . .

**Shri Alvares:** Sir, I rise on a point of order.

**Mr. Speaker:** He has withdrawn it unreservedly. Mr. Banerjee.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur):** From the various replies given by the hon. Minister for Defence Production and the Prime Minister, it appears . . .

**Shri Alvares:** I rise on a point of order.

**डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा एक व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। मैं कितनी ही बार खड़ा हुआ लेकिन खड़ा ही रह गया जबकि दूसरे लोग अपनी बात कहते रहे। अब क्या जो आप से दब कर रहे वह दब कर ही रह जायगा? यहां पर इस सारे सदन में स्पीकर से सब से ज्यादा दब कर मैं ही रहता हूँ अगर आप अब मुझे इजाजत दें तो मैं अपनी बात रखूँ वरना जैसी आप की इच्छा और मैं उस हालत में बैठे जाता हूँ।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप का प्वाएंट आफ़ आर्डर है क्या क्योंकि अभी तो हाउस का एक टिप्पिशन हुआ है ?

**डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया :** मुझे आप से निवेदन करना है कि यह रोज रोज़ की चखचख चल रही है और जब श्री च० का० भट्टाचार्य ने कहा कि वह मुझे और मेरे जैसे लोगों को हमेशा न सिर्फ कांग्रेस वाले बल्कि उधर वाले भी कहा करते हैं तो हमारा भी कुछ हक है कहने का कि यह बुरी चीज़ है और इस लोक सभा को अच्छे तरीक़ से चलना चाहिए (इंटरप्शंस) प्रश्नोत्तर काल, ध्याना-वर्षण काल और काम रोकने काल, यह तीनों ऐसे ही चके हैं कि या तो उन के नियम ख़राब हैं या नियम अच्छे होते हुए उन का यहां पर पालन इस प्रकार से होता है कि लोकसभा में शमन नहीं होना दमन हो जाता है। लोकसभा में चीजों को अच्छे तरीक़े से लाकर शान्ति नहीं रहती बल्कि दबाये जाया करते हैं मामले और ज़हां पर दबेगा वहां पर ज़रूर कुछ-न-कुछ

ख़राब चीज़ होकर रहेगी इतना नहीं दबाया जाय। जैसा मैंने एक दफ़े कहा था आध घंटे के लिए, तीन घंटे के लिए एक छोटा काम रोकने प्रस्ताव दे दिया करें जिसमें इस सवाल पर आदमी अपनी बात कह दे तो ऐसी कोई अनुचित चीज़ नहीं होगी और इसीलिए . . .

**उपाध्यक्ष महोदय :** आप ने अपनी बात आज फिर कह दी। पहले भी कई दफ़े आपने यही कहा है।

**डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया:** लेकिन आपने उस पर कोई एक्शन तो नहीं लिया।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मैंने आप से हमेशा कहा है कि आप चाहते हैं कि जिन तरीकों के जरिए हम लोकसभा को चला रहे हैं वे दुरुस्त नहीं हैं और उन में संशोधन करने की ज़रूरत है। पार्लियामेंट के क़ायदे बदले जायें और उसको और तरीक़े से चलाया जाय।

**डा० राम मनोहर लोहिया :** नियमों को दूसरे तरीक़े से लागू करें। आप खुद भी नियमों को दूसरे तरीक़े से लागू करें।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मैंने आप की बात सुन ली। Mr. Banerjee.

**Shri Alvares:** I rise on a point of order.

**Mr. Speaker:** I might be allowed to proceed. There is no point of order. What is the point of order that Mr. Alvares wants to raise?

**Shri Alvares:** The remark of Mr. Bhattacharyya which triggered off this incident has resulted in the suspension of Mr. Hem Barua. That remark has now been withdrawn. If it had not been made, in all likelihood, that incident could not have occurred. Sir, I may quote something which, I remember, you said during the civic reception in Bombay where the Presiding Officers' Conference was held. You said that Lok Sabha will always reflect the state of conditions in the country outside. Mr. Hem Barua

[Shri Alvares]

raised the question of defence and of the necessity of being aware of it. I am sorry that Mr. Bhattacharyya could characterise that as playing to the gallery. Now that he has subsequently withdrawn that remark, I think, it will be proper for you to review the question of the suspension of Mr. Hem Barua.

**Mr. Speaker:** It cannot be done in this manner. Mr. Banerjee.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** It appears from the replies... .

**Mr. Speaker:** When a decision has been taken by the House, I might make it clear that unless the Member expresses regret, there is no question of my putting the same question to the House at any moment.

12.37 hrs.

CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER  
OF URGENT PUBLIC  
IMPORTANCE—*contd.*

(i) FIRING BY PAKISTANI TROOPS ON  
THE CHIEF MINISTER OF PUNJAB AND  
PARTY FROM ACROSS THE CEASEFIRE  
LINE—*contd.*

**Shri S. M. Banerjee** (Kanpur): Sir, I would like to know from the hon. Minister if no security could be given to the Chief Minister of Punjab though his programme was better known to the Punjab Armed Constabulary forces which were posted there. I would like to know what steps have been taken to safeguard the interests of those who are in the border area and whether they have been given adequate arms and ammunition.

**Shri A. M. Thomas:** The security was given to the Chief Minister. But, of course, this firing was quite unprovoked. There is no doubt about that. With regard to the arming of the people on the frontier, we have got the troops there and we have also got the Punjab Armed Police stationed there.

**Mr. Speaker:** That is all. We shall now take up the Privilege Motion tabled by Mr. Ram Sewak Yadav. Shri Ram Sewak Yadav.

**Some hon. Members rose—**

**Mr. Speaker:** Order, order. The Members shall resume their seats.

**श्री श्रीकारलाल बेरवा** (कोटा) : सारे नाम नोटिस में दिये हुए हैं।

**श्री गुलशन** (भटिंडा) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह पंजाब का मामला है सारे नाम उसमें दर्ज हैं और जिनके नाम दर्ज हैं उनको बुनाया जाना चाहिए।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** ठीक है पंजाब का मामला है। आप इसे और किसी शकल में फिर ले आइयेगा और मैं उस पर गौर कर लूंगा।

**श्री युद्धवीर सिंह** (महेन्द्रगढ़) : इस पर पंजाब के मेम्बरों को बुलाया जाय। जिनके नाम दर्ज हैं उनको तो बुलाया ही जाय।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** जी नहीं, अब इस पर मैं और ज्यादा वक्त नहीं दे सकता।

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय:** अध्यक्ष महोदय ने यह परम्परा चलाई है कि जिनके नाम में नोटिस आया है उन सब को सवाल पूछने का मौका दिया जायगा... .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय:** मैं कई दफे कह चुका हूँ कि जब नाम बहुत ज्यादा हों तो हर एक मेम्बर को बुलाना लाजिमी नहीं है। काफ़ी वक्त हम ने इस पर खर्च किया है। अब हम प्रीविलेज मोशन ले रहे हैं।

**श्री हुकम चन्द कछवाय:** कल राध ने एक कौन्सिल अटेंशन नोटिस पर जिसमें 34 नाम दर्ज थे उन सभी 34 के चौतीसों को मौका दिया था तो फिर आज सब को मौका क्यों नहीं दिया जाता है ?