

12.05 hrs.

**CALLING ATTENTION TO MAT-
TERS OF URGENT PUBLIC IM-
PORTANCE**

(i) REPORTED MOVEMENT OF CHINESE
TANKS AND ARMoured VEHICLES IN
OCCUPIED INDIAN TERRITORY IN NOR-
THERN LADAKH.

Shri P. C. Borooah (Sibsagar): Sir, under Rule 197, I beg to call the attention of the Minister of Defence to the following matter of urgent public importance and I request that he may make a statement thereon:—

“The reported movement of Chinese tanks and armoured vehicles in occupied Indian territory in Northern Ladakh and sighting of long convoys of Chinese Military vehicles in Southern Sinkiang and Qizil Jilga in occupied Aksai Chin.”

The Minister of Defence (Shri Krishna Menon): Mr. Speaker, Sir, Government have no information regarding the reported—that is, in the Press—movement of Chinese tanks and armoured vehicles in the Indian territory in Northern Ladakh, parts of which are under the occupation of the Chinese. Vehicles belonging to the Chinese have, however, been plying in Quizil Jilga area for some time. The terrain also lends itself to easy construction of tracks in this area on which vehicles can ply. These tracks have been used by vehicles for some of the posts which have been illegally set up by the Chinese.

Shri P. C. Borooah: May I know whether it is construed that the storm of allegations and charges of provocation launched by China against India in recent months was to cover their sinister design of further aggression against India?

Shri Krishna Menon: I could not follow the question.

Mr. Speaker: He wants to know whether these aggressive acts can

be construed as a design for further aggression into the Indian territory. Is that the question?

Shri P. C. Borooah: Yes, Sir.

Shri Krishna Menon: We know nothing about these tanks or anything.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Sir, the Minister has been pleased to say that the Government has no information about this particular matter, that is to say, the movement of convoys, tanks and vehicles in occupied Ladakh area. But may I ask, Sir, whether Government has received reports that China has moved not merely such convoys and vehicles to western Tibet on the edge of the occupied Ladakh area but has also flown Soviet MIG planes and jet fighters as well as Ilyushin bombers and other transport planes to western Tibet from Sinkiang on the edge of the boundary of Ladakh; and, if so, when China alongside a lying propaganda offensive is also preparing or threatening to launch a military operation....

Mr. Speaker: How long is the question?

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: My question further is, is it, Sir, in the defence interests of the country that the Minister for Defence should prepare to fly to New York at this moment of near crisis and thereby...

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. It is not relevant here.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Why not here? At this moment of near crisis the Defence Minister is flying to New York.

Mr. Speaker: What has his flying to New York to do with this?

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: He should be a whole-time Defence Minister and he should be in the country at the time of crisis.

Mr. Speaker: That is a wider question and cannot be discussed here. Has he any question to put or not?

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: My first question may be answered, my question about MIG fighters in western Tibet on the edge of Ladakh border.

The Prime Minister and Minister of External Affairs and Minister of Atomic Energy (Shri Jawaharlal Nehru): We have no information about these various statements that the hon. Member has made, about MIG fighters and tanks in western Tibet. Naturally, it is not easy to get information from there. Anyhow, I think much of this information that sometimes appears in the Press, we have found, has little justification or basis.

Shri Nath Pai (Rajapur): Is it a fact that the Chinese defence forces or, rather, aggressive forces are logistically so placed that they have a definite advantage over us and they are in a position to haul their lighter weapons from their bases in Sinkiang through the Aksai Chin road; and, if so, do we take note of the fact which is emerging from their latest note, an increasingly menacing note which has appeared, where they accuse "India is determined to encroach on Chinese territory and to this end does not scruple to provoke even if bloody conflict...." In the face of the combination of these two facts—their superior advantage over us and their new menacing tone, what do we propose to do?

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. There is one thing that I must bring to the notice of hon. Members. Calling Attention Notice is on a matter of urgent public importance. There is one thing to which the whole attention is to be directed. But hon. Members open out the whole controversy of the border.

Shri Nath Pai: It is strictly relevant. With the increasing forces that they have got whether they can bring equipment with ease....

Mr. Speaker: The matter that we have before us is:

"the reported movement of Chinese tanks and armoured vehicles in occupied Indian territory in Northern Ladakh and sighting of long convoys of Chinese military vehicles in Southern Sinkiang and Qizil Jilga in occupied Aksai Chin."

Shri Nath Pai: May I ask in all humility: is it not most logical if we ask that if they are not already placed there whether they can place them there with considerable speed?

Mr. Speaker: Logic would certainly take us too far. (*Interruptions*) Order, order.

Shri Nath Pai: Let us see what the reply is.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: No reply.

Shri Krishna Menon: I can only answer for military equipment on the Indian territory. As the Prime Minister has already stated, we have no such information, as most of these reports, particularly about military equipments on the Himalayas, are not based on facts.

Shri Nath Pai: He did not answer the question. We want to be assured on this question, and that is why we have raised it; we have refrained from raising it in any other form following your guidance in this matter. If they have any advantage over us in logistics, then they can bring their dangerous weapons so quickly to that area, which is a matter of great concern to us. We would like to be assured by the Defence Minister, before he leaves the country, or the Prime Minister, that they do not enjoy any such advantage and we are being prepared for any such eventuality. That particular report may be false, but this fact cannot be ignored lightly that we are not in possession of information. Certainly, we are in possession of information of what you are doing. Do not disclose your military secrets, but what about the points which I am repeatedly seeking clarification of?

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: The hon. Member should realise that even if we have some idea about the logistic position, it is not desirable to disclose it; it does not help us. We know the fact and it may help the other party. It is well known that, to some extent, logistically, it is easier to transport things from the plateau of Tibet and then go forward into Ladakh than to transport things across the Himalayas. It is a well-known fact. But to draw inferences from that may not be justified.

Shri Hem Barua (Guahati): The way that China has been shifting up her position about the border since 1959 shows that China might not have any qualms of conscience in yielding up....

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Again I have to request that some attention at least be paid to my rulings. I have suggested only just now that direct and relevant questions should be put.

Shri Hem Barua: I am just now coming to that.

Mr. Speaker: He will come after travelling long distances.

Shri Hem Barua: No, Sir. The whole thought layer....

Mr. Speaker: Some relevant question should be put, and that too precisely.

Shri Hem Barua: I will do so.

Shri Tyagi (Dehra Dun): He is in Chinese strategy.

Shri Hem Barua: I will be quite relevant. This is very positive. China has been shifting her position along the border....

Mr. Speaker: What is the question?

Shri Hem Barua: I am coming to that. Since 1949 China has been shifting....

Mr. Speaker: I wish he came to that question directly.

Shri Hem Barua: I will come to that directly. To be very straight, whe-

ther the implementation, the unilateral implementation, of Panch Sheel ethics as the Prime Minister stated the other day, is possible against background of this sort. That is what I want to know from the Prime Minister.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: Panch Sheel is like, well, King Charles's head. It comes up again and again. Panch Sheel is civilized behaviour. Does he want us to say that we will not follow civilized behaviour because somebody else does not do so?

Shri Hem Barua: I said "unilateral implementation". Is it possible?

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: What does implementation of civilized behaviour mean? To the extent implementation of civilized behaviour is possible, we will do it, whether the other party does it or not. It has nothing to do with the defence or non-defence. Defence is looked upon from the point of view of defence.

Shri Hem Barua: It is ethically all right, but, in practice, it does not yield results.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: I am afraid, the hon. Member has not understood what Panch Sheel means.

Shri Hem Barua: I have.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: Then I would like to advise him to read it again a little more carefully. I would like to know what part of it he wants to object to. Which part does he want us not to accept?

Shri Hem Barua: What about peaceful co-existence with China? A lamb cannot co-exist with a lion until it be in the lion's belly.

Mr. Speaker: It is becoming difficult for me. Co-existence is becoming difficult even inside the House. How can I co-exist with all these things? There ought to be some limit, but I find the discussion is going on.

श्री बर्दे (बारेगाँव) : हर एक अखबार में यह समाचार प्रकाशित हुआ है कि

चाइना ने छिपछाप (Chip Chap) नदी के उस पार टैंक और मिनटरो फॉसिज इकट्ठी की हैं। इस के अनिश्चित वह हिन्दुस्तान के क्षेत्र में नहीं नई पोस्ट्स भी स्थापित कर रहा है। चाइना का यह ऐंटीट्यड देखने में क्या गायन यह नहीं समझना है कि वह इस देश पर नया आक्रमण करना चाहता है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस का जवाब तो दे दिया गया है।

श्री बड़े : इस का जवाब नहीं दिया गया है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय अभी मिनस्टर साहब ने कहा है कि हमारे पास इस बारे में झिंझा नहीं है। माननीय सदस्य उसी बात को दोहरा रहे हैं कि अखबारों में यह छूटा है।

श्री लहरी सिंह (रोहतक) : इस विषय में अखबारों में जो खबर छूरी है, क्या गवर्नमेंट ने उस का सीमा मालूम किया है कि वह कहाँ से आई है, कैसे आई है ?

श्री जवाहरलाल नेहरू : माननीय सदस्य यह तो अखबार वालों को पूछें। उन के अजीब-प्रजीब ज़रिये होते हैं।

Mr. Speaker: The hon. Member's question is whether Government have cared to find out the sources of the paper from which they published that news.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: It will not be proper if we have to use our intelligence operations. It will not perhaps be liked to put the intelligence on newspapers to find out what their sources are.

Mr. Speaker: Does Shri Harish Chandra Mathur want to ask any question?

Shri Harish Chandra Mathur (Jalore): No, Sir.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara): The hon. Defence Minister says that he has no information about this reported movement, but he does not deny that the Chinese vehicles may be moving in that area. Since China in its note of the 2nd June has already hinted that there may be a border clash at any moment....

An Hon. Member: Bloody clash.

Shri Hem Barua: Bloody conflict.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: They have said....

Mr. Speaker: Quotations need not be read.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: They have accused India and have said that India is carrying on intrusion so that a border clash may be touched off at any moment which indicates that most probably China is preparing for some eventuality. In view of this, may I know whether the Government is thinking of any emergency measures not only at Defence level but at the popular level also to build up the morale of the country to meet any emergency?

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: To build up the morale of the country?

Shri Krishna Menon: At civil level also.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: I suppose the hon. Members are helping in not building it up.....(Interruption).

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: I said 'at popular level'.....(Interruption).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: I do maintain, Sir, that the kind of questions that have been asked are not helpful in building up the morale of the country....(Interruption).

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: rose—

Shri Hem Barua: On a point of order, Sir.... *(Interruption)*.

Shri Nath Pai rose—

Shri Hem Braua: On a point of order, Sir.... *(Interruption)*.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: rose—

Mr. Speaker: Order, order,

Shri Bade rose—

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Will he kindly resume his seat? Let them say one by one what they have to say. **Shri Nath Pai.**

Shri Nath Pai: Mr. Speaker, Sir.. *(Interruption)*.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Can we proceed in this manner?

Shri Nath Pai: It is indeed a great pity that every time we try to exercise our legitimate elementary duty which alone justifies our presence in this House, that is, of calling attention to what we regard as a matter of concern, the hon. Prime Minister instead of trying to guide and tell the facts is irritated. I must say this. The two recent accusations are firstly, that we are indulging in warmongering when all we say is, "Are we from the defence point of view fully prepared?" and, secondly, now comes this even worse allegation. I ask whether it is fair for him when we ask for simple information to level such a serious charge that we are interested in weakening the morale of the country. Does it lie well in the mouth of the hon. Prime Minister? *(Interruption)*.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: It is unworthy of the hon. Prime Minister, the good democrat that he is.... *(Interruption)*.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: He should not take advantage of his position.... *(Interruption)*.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Bade: He should take those words back..... *(Interruption)*.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Can we go on in this manner? Even if one is provoked and agitated, at least there must be some method in our proceedings.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: It is a serious matter, Sir, if the hon. Prime Minister says like that.... *(Interruption)*.

Mr. Speaker: How can I deal with it unless hon. Members allow me to do so? They do not allow anybody to speak. How can I deal with it if all of them stand up simultaneously and speak?

Shri Nath Pai: It pains... *(Interruption)*.

An Hon. Member: They are standing up in fours and fives.

Shri Nath Pai: I will not be bowed down like this. May I say in conclusion that it pains us to see the hon. Prime Minister losing his temper every time we try to raise a matter in the House which we regard as a legitimate one.... *(Interruption)*.

Shri Ansar Harvani rose—

Shri Nath Pai: These tactics will not bow me down.... *(Interruption)*.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. All hon. Members should help me in maintaining discipline and decorum in the House. It is very regrettable.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: We are at your service, Sir.

Shri Nath Pai: Let not Shri Harvani be more loyal than the king.... *(Interruption)*.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I will request other hon. Members to remain silent unless I require their assistance. I would ask for that assistance if I require it. They should just keep silent and listen. One hon. Member is on his legs; let us hear him.

Shri Nath Pai rose— *(Interruptions)*.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Nath Pai: This is a very serious charge, Sir. Here is a responsible journal, a national journal. Either the journals are indulging in panic-mongering, or they are discharging their duties.

Mr. Speaker: What is the journal?

Shri Nath Pai: This is the *Times of India* of Sunday. We think they are doing a very vital national service. We can only know such information as the national papers give and ask Government which have better sources for clarification. When we ask such a question if a danger is looming large on the horizon are we doing something wrong. Is it betraying the country, or helping the Prime Minister? How does he combine the two, Sir?

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: May I repeat, Sir, that I do not wish to hurt anybody. But I am surprised at the kind of questions hon Members ask. When the hon. Member talked about the lion and the lamb, it does not increase the morale of the country.

Shri Hem Barua: Since the reference is to me, may I say... (*Interruptions*).

An hon. Member: Sit down!

Mr. Speaker: Order, order.

Shri Hem Barua: You cannot cow me down. I will not be cowed down like this. (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: I would ask Mr. Hem Barua to address the Chair.

Shri Hem Barua: Why should they shout like this? They are howling. (*Interruption*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Would he resume his seat? If someone shouts he can draw my attention to it. I will ask him to keep silent. Not that he should enter into a duel with him directly and settle the matter. Shall I be a silent witness to all this? Can we carry on the proceedings of the House in this manner? I have ap-

pealed to hon. Members again and again that they should maintain at least some minimum decorum. Let us hear the hon. Member.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: The Prime Minister while replying to my question said that by putting such questions we are not building the morale of the country. It may be his opinion. He is surrendering the country to the Chinese and others. But I want to know what his answer is to the first part of my question. I asked whether they are thinking of any emergency measures at the Defence level. Is there any reply to that question, I want to know.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: May I know, Sir, if this is the proper way of putting it—that I am surrendering the country to China. I think it is a scandalous charge to make. (*Interruptions*).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. No more questions I would allow. Perhaps, hon. Members who felt agitated have satisfied themselves with these charges.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: He cannot accuse us of betrayal of this country—it is too much.

Mr. Speaker: I cannot allow every hon. Member to go on like this. I have allowed so many questions. Only one is permitted; but so many questions have been put.

Shri Hem Barua: Will you let me clarify my position? I had not completed my idea, when I was interrupted by hon. Members.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. His leader asked him to sit down, because he wanted to put a question himself. How can I help that?

Shri Hem Barua: The reference with regard to the lion and the lamb was to me....

Mr. Speaker: Order, order, now.

Shri Hem Barua: This will have a bad effect.

Mr. Speaker: What more does he want now?

Shri Hem Barua: I have to vindicate my position. When I referred to the lion and the lamb, I had my own arguments to offer.

Mr. Speaker: He may have his arguments; others also have their own arguments. The Treasury Benches have their arguments. They have expressed their opinion; he has expressed his. Where is the trouble now?

Shri Hem Barua: The Prime Minister has made certain remarks.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. He has said that reference to these things does not improve the morale of the country. Can't he hold that opinion? Why should there be a quarrel about it—calling one country as a lion and the other as a lamb, he says does not improve the morale of the country. Should I give the hon. Member opportunity to go on making a lecture?

Shri Hem Barua: I did not say one country is a lion and the other country is a lamb. May I submit that I had never completed my statement? My statement has been completely distorted.

I would be the last man to call my country a lamb. We are interested in defending the morale of this country, defending the boundaries of our country and the frontiers of this country and if a call comes tomorrow, we shall be the first to go to the battle-field with guns in our hands. But what pains us is this, that the Prime Minister has tried to distort our statement. I said that by the very policy of weakness that the Prime Minister or the Government is following towards China we are made to look like lambs....

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I would ask the hon. Member to resume his seat.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: One question.

Mr. Speaker: I have allowed them so many questions. There have been more than enough.

Shri Nath Pai: Sir, just one word.

Mr. Speaker: If they want to raise a discussion they might do it in some other manner. I have always allowed it.

Shri Nath Pai: May I say just one sentence regarding this lion and lamb? Vivekananda told the whole of India, "Ye lions, shed off the delusion that you are lambs". And there was no insult meant to India when he said so.

Shri Hem Barua: I did not want to mean any insult.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: When he said that we are surrendering to the Chinese, that was of course a mild statement to make!

Shri Hem Barua: But you provoked us.

Shri Jawaharlal Nehru: Yes, yes, we have had enough of this kind of things.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: When he talked of our not helping to build up the morale of the country, do his statements.... (Interruptions).

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Would there be an end to it? Shri Mohsin.

Shri Tyagi: I move, Sir, that the question may now be closed and we take up the next item.

(ii) REPORTED ADMONITION OF SOME
SENIOR ARMY OFFICERS POSTED IN
NEFA

Shri Mohsin (Dharwar South):
Under Rule 197, I call the attention of