

12.36 hrs.

*[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER in the Chair]*

## PRESENTATION OF PETITIONS

*[Translation]*

SHRI RADHA MOHAN SINGH (Motihari) : Sir, I beg to present the following petitions :

- (i) Petition signed by Shri Birendera Kumar, President Wax Manufacturers Association, Calcutta regarding reduction in transfer prices of both the slack waxes of Haldia and Barauni Units of Indian Oil Corporation Limited; and
- (ii) Petition signed by Shri Rai Shia Ranjan Sharma of Agarwa, Motihari, District East Champaran, Bihar requesting to prevent migration of people from District Champaran and to ensure proper implementation of Poverty Alleviation Programmes of Central Government for reaching to the intended beneficiaries in East Champaran District of Bihar.

12.37 hrs.

## MOTION FOR ELECTION TO THE COMMITTEE

## Public Accounts Committee

*[Translation]*

DR. MURLI MANOHAR JOSHI : Sir, I beg to move the motion :

"That this House do recommend to Rajya Sabha that Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate two members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on Public Accounts of this House for the unexpired portion of the term of the Committee vice Shri N. Giri Prasad died and Shrimati Kamla Sinha appointed as Minister and do communicate to this House the names of two members so nominated by Rajya Sabha."

*[English]*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : The question is :

"That this House do recommend to Rajya Sabha that Rajya Sabha do agree to nominate two members from Rajya Sabha to associate with the Committee on

Public Accounts of this House for the unexpired portion of the term of the Committee vice Shri N. Giri Prasad died and Shrimati Kamla Sinha appointed as Minister and do communicate to this House the names of two members so nominated by Rajya Sabha."

*The motion was adopted.*

*[Translation]*

KUMARI UMA BHARATI (Khajuraho) : Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, before the matters under 377 are taken up, I would like to raise a very serious objection. The Minister of Defence, Shri Mulayam Singh Yadav had given a very objectionable remarks regarding Indian women and thus he does not have the right to sit in this august House in these circumstances. Personally I have always held him in high esteem. However, while referring to Ms. Mayawati, he said, "Is Mayawati an attractive women who would have been raped," Does that mean that in the opinion of the Defence Minister, all the beautiful women are worthy of being raped? This is not only an insult of Mayawati but also an insult to all the Indian women. Hence, through you, I request the House to pass a Resolution condemning the Minister of Defence, Shri Mulayam Singh Yadav. Either he should apologise for his statement or a Resolution condemning him should be passed in the House.

SHRIMATI BHAVNABEN DEVRAJ BHAI CHIKHALIA (Junagarh) : He should apologise to the women Members of the House.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : Members of various political parties are present in the House and if they have any respect for the Indian women, they should pass the Resolution of condemnation. Sir, I used to respect him. Either he should refute it or apologise.

THE MINISTER OF DEFENCE (SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV) : Please discuss it with me later on.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : Please sit down. You have made your point.

*(Interruptions)**[English]*

SHRI P.R. DASMUNSI (Howrah) : Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, on substantial things, reference should not be taken up in this way . . . *(Interruptions).*

[Shri P.R. Dhasmunsi]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Now, I am on Matters Under Rule 377. Please sit down

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI P.R. DASMUNSI : Sir, I will not take more than half a minute.

On such serious matters what my hon. colleague is stating, I do not like to make any comment. If there is any substance you find out. But it pains me to hear all these things in this House. But since you allowed Umaji, I would like to submit before you one thing. The Defence Minister is present in the House.

There is a serious resentment going on for the last two days in the police forces and in the Armed Forces on the Fifth Pay Commission's recommendations. I find total silence on the part of the Government. If the Government does not react to it immediately, I think, it will be an enormous . . . *(Interruptions)*.

*[Translation]*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ (South Delhi) : Why are you diverting attention from such a serious matter ? . . . *(Interruptions)* This is a separate matter. Let it be taken up to its logical conclusion . . . *(Interruptions)*.

SHRI P.R. DASMUNSI : What is all this ?

*[English]*

I have taken his permission and not yours.

*[Translation]*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : Why are you switching on to another subject ? . . . *(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Mulayam Singhji wants to say something.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI P.R. DASMUNSI : Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, this is not the right way . . . *(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : It is over. It is all right.

*[English]*

SHRI P.R. DASMUNSI : Sir, I think, I do not have to take the permission of Shrimati Sushma Swaraj. I have

to take only your permission . . . *(Interruptions)*.

*[Translation]*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Your point has also been recorded.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let him reply now.

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI P.R. DASMUNSI : Mr. Deputy-Speaker, will take the decision in the matter . . . *(Interruptions)*. What is my fault ?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I have allowed both of you to speak.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Both of you have said something. That is all.

*[Translation]*

SHRIMATI SUSHMA SWARAJ : He has raised a separate matter . . . *(Interruptions)*.

*[English]*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please take your seats now.

*[Translation]*

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, regarding the matter raised by Uma Bharati ji, I would like to submit that Uma Bharati manages to raise quite a few points on her own.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : I used to treat you as my brother till the time you made such an objectionable and vulgar statement regarding women . . . *(Interruptions)* so long as you had not given such an objectionable statement, you were like a brother to me. It pained me when I came to know of it. If you did not make any statement, you may refute it and tell the media alongwith the proof of the cassette . . . *(Interruptions)*.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please allow her to make her point.

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : So far as the issue regarding women is concerned, Uma Bharati ji is totally unaware. However, Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, you are very much aware that we have fought for the rights of women and we respect women. We have fought all our life for the dignity and the rights of the women. She only talks about it . . . (Interruptions).

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : What does that mean ? Did you or did you not make such a statement ?

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : I have indeed said this and say so that we are in favour of giving special opportunities to a particular section, however, we are not in favour of according any privileges to them. The backward classes and minorities as also the women can be given special opportunities but not the privileges. It is laid down in our Constitution. The issue that she is raising . . . (Interruptions) The kind of stories that are published in the newspapers especially regarding yourself . . . (Interruptions).

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : What does not mean ?

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : Who is spared by the media ? Are not stories published regarding the Hon. Leader of Opposition and regarding me ? The media publishes stories regarding each and everyone. She brings a newspapers and shows it . . . (Interruptions).

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : Did you or did you not say such a thing ?

SHRI MULAYAM SINGH YADAV : They only make up such stories, get them published in the newspapers. I have no such intentions.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : He still has not given any categorical statement as to whether he spoke such words or not.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He has said that he had no such intentions and that the mediapersons exaggerate things.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : What does he mean by intentions ?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : It is a sort of denial.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : It is not the question of

intention.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : The subject is closed. Please sit down.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, Shri Mulayam Singh has lost the right to sit in the august House because sort of language he has used and then no one should have the right to use such words on the piece land of India. So far as the question of such a statement being made by him is concerned . . . (Interruptions). It is not a question of intentions . . . (Interruptions).

[English]

SHRI SONTOSH MOHAN DEV : Sir, the issue is closed now and nothing else should go on record. He has cleared it.

[Translation]

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : Your ruling won't do. Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, we seek your protection.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He has made an indirect denial.

[English]

The matter is closed now.

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Jatia ji, please resume your seat for a minute.

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : He should clarify as to whether he said it or not ? . . . (Interruptions)

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please take your seat now.

[Translation]

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : If he has said it, then a Resolution condemning him should be passed in the House.

[Translation]

KUNWAR SARVARAJ SINGH (Aonla) : Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, what wrong did the hon. Minister say ?

(Interruptions)\*

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I have allowed Shri Y.K. Alagh. Please let him move the Motion.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

KUMARI UMA BHARATI (Khajuraho) : What has been published ? . . . (Interruptions)\*.

SHRI PINAKI MISRA (Puri) : Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, Uma Bharati is telling that . . . (Interruptions)\* Can this language be Spoken in the House ?

KUMARI UMA BHARATI : Mulayam Singhji, please stand up, at least.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I would ask the hon. MPs that this matter be treated as closed.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

AN HON. MEMBER : Many things have been published in the newspapers.

12.46 hrs.

*At this stage, Kumari Uma Bharati came and stood on the floor near the Table.*

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let this matter be treated as closed.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Kumari Uma Bharati, please go to your seat.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He has denied it.

(Interruptions)

---

\*Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please go to your seat.

(Interruptions)

12.46½ hrs.

## MOTION FOR ELECTION TO COMMITTEE

### **Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology**

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY AND MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF POWER (SHRI YOGINDER K. ALAGH) : Sir, I beg to move :

"The in pursuance of Section 5(j) read with Section 6 (2) of the Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Science and Technology, Trivandrum Act, 1980, the Members of this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, two Members from among themselves to serve as Members of the Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology, Trivandrum, subject to the other provisions of the said Act."

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The question is :

"That in pursuance of Section 5(j) read with Section 6(2) of the Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Science and Technology, Trivandrum Act, 1980, the Members of this House do proceed to elect, in such manner as the Speaker may direct, two Members from among themselves to serve as Members of the Sree Chitra Tirunal Institute for Medical Sciences and Technology Trivandrum, subject to the other provisions of the said Act."

*The motion was adopted.*

12.47 hrs.

*At this stage, Kumari Uma Bharati sat on the floor near the Table*

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Please go to your seat now.

(Interruptions)