

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** My question was whether the majority of the Chief Ministers did not agree because of the three reasons I stated, and I want an answer to that.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** There is no majority or minority in this matter; these are all unanimous decisions.

**Shri Nath Pai (Rajapur):** I do not want to ask a question, but I want your guidance on one matter.

The Chief Ministers' conference took place ten days ago. Their decisions were announced the next day in the newspapers. Is it satisfactory for the Minister to come to Parliament only when there is a call attention notice on the subject? On a previous occasion, we were assured that as soon as the decisions were taken, we would be informed. Government have been repeatedly told that on such matters Parliament should be the first forum where they should come out with the decisions taken, but with mulish obduracy they continue to defy us. I would request you to persuade them that this is not fair to Parliament.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** I am sorry. I owe an explanation to the House. The discussions took place at the Chief Ministers' conference. After that, they had to be processed before being finalised as decisions to be announced. I was hoping to announce it as soon as it was finalised.....

**Shrimati Benu Chakravarty (Barrackpore):** It came out in the papers the next day.

**Shri C. Subramaniam:** Meanwhile, the call attention notice came.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** We knew from the papers that certain decisions were taken at the Chief Ministers' conference. Unfortunately, the name of the Prime Minister was brought in there, that it was at his instance and advice that it has been decided to say nothing in Parliament about these. I

wrote to you a letter saying that Parliament is being treated with contempt. You were good enough to club my name along with others in this call attention notice. But I want to know whether there is any truth in that report.

**Shri Nath Pai:** We want a pronouncement from you.

**Mr. Speaker:** It is not possible to preclude all possibilities of any officials or Ministers making any statement at any time outside Parliament. There might be occasions when this has to be done and it might be done. But it is desired, and it has been observed here so many times, that when such an important decision is taken, Parliament should be the first body to be informed about it.

12.09 hrs.

RE. CALLING ATTENTION NOTICES  
PROCEDURE

**Mr. Speaker:** Shri S. M. Banerjee has written to me that there was a call attention notice to be taken up at 5 P.M. yesterday. There was then an objection taken that there was no quorum and so that could not be answered.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur):** That was answered in part.

**Mr. Speaker:** Then that part would remain. If there is something else, that might be given in writing. The Minister might just place it on the Table of the House.

As regards these call attention notices, according to our rules, it is only one notice that can be taken up in one sitting. But to avoid being caught in that rule, I have been trying to clear arrears by putting some notice at 5 P.M., even though the sitting has not finished. I am doing so because on the first day I got about 70 notices, and I thought there were

some important ones. Therefore, I have been trying to clear them. If the Members send in a notice, I give an opportunity for it to be answered, and then the Members themselves in the Opposition, some one else, raise this objection that there is no quorum, then the House is not to blame in that respect. Therefore, they have to suffer. That cannot be answered now.

**Shri S. M. Banerjee:** May I make a submission about your ruling? The thing happened yesterday. Just at 5 O' Clock the Minister was to reply. I put the motion, and the motion was being replied to, and one line came as reply. I want your guidance. Supposing something remains when we are discussing an important Bill or any such thing, and somebody raises the quorum question, is it not the practice that anything that is left today will come up tomorrow?

**Mr. Speaker:** Not these notices that are after the sitting. These notices cannot come up, and the only thing I can do is that the written answer might be placed on the Table of the House.

**Shri Nath Pai (Rajapur):** While accepting your ruling for future guidance, may I point out that the notice was held over all these days not because of our failure.

**Mr. Speaker:** I am trying to get the answer. This morning also I have taken steps. I am doing that.

**Shri Nath Pai:** I am very grateful.

**Mr. Speaker:** Actually I am taking steps to see that so much delay should not take place, and when that is received, I will find out the reason why it has happened.

**Shri Nath Pai:** May I respectfully point out my predicament, because when we filed this thing, we wanted to bring certain matters to the notice of the Minister. The Minister stopped with this delightful sentence. How am I to raise the question?

**Mr. Speaker:** We have a federal set-up, and sometimes the States do not send the replies within the time that we need here. Matters are important, but as soon as that reply is received, I will go into the delay as well, why it has happened.

**Shri Nath Pai:** This was not a State matter, may I point out for your information? This is a purely Union matter.

**Mr. Speaker:** Information has to be received from the States, and not directly. This has been the reply sent to me that the information is being collected. I am sorry.

**Shri Nath Pai:** All right. May I know what is the meaning of this? This is from the official proceedings of the House, yesterday:

"The Minister of Labour and Employment (Shri Sanjivayya): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, in the Mormugoa Port (Goa) the winchmen of M/s Shantilal Kushaldas and Bros.—a stevedoring firm—went on strike on the 11th November, 19"

The sentence is not complete. I want to ask a couple of questions. The first is, it is not only unfair to us, but unfair to the dignity of the House.

**Mr. Speaker:** In the Calling Attention proceedings?

**Shri Nath Pai:** Yes.

**Mr. Speaker:** What can I do? The written answer would be placed on the Table of the House.

**Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barrackpore):** Usually, it is an unwritten convention that after 5 O'Clock, when you permit something, we do not raise this question of quorum all the time, because if that is done, every time, we will find that inconvenient Calling Attention Notices will be allowed to become dead letters.

**Mr. Speaker:** If it comes from the Opposition itself, what should I do?

श्री प्रकाशवीर शास्त्री (बिजनौर) :

\*\*

**Mr. Speaker:** This will not go on record. The same treatment would be meted out to every hon. Member.

श्री प्रकाशवीर शास्त्री : उस का उत्तर तो आना चाहिए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : उत्तर इस तरीके से नहीं आ सकता और मैं इस तरह से उसे उठाने की इजाजत नहीं दे सकता हूँ ।

श्री यशपाल सिंह (कैराना) : मेरी अर्ज यह है कि हाउस में कोरम की जब कमी पड़ती है तो मेजारिटी पार्टी की तरफ से पड़ती है जबकि नुकसान हमारा होता है। कसूर उनका है लेकिन सफ़र हम लोग किया करते हैं। आखिर इस का इलाज क्या है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप ही की तरफ से उधर कोरम का सवाल उठाया जाता है तो उस पर हम क्या कर सकते हैं। इसका इलाज तो यही है कि आप कोरम का सवाल न उठायें।

Papers to be laid....(Interruptions.)  
I cannot allow this to go on. I am asking the hon. Member to resume his seat.

श्री बागड़ी (हिसार) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं किसी नोटिस की बाबत कुछ अर्ज नहीं करना चाहता

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मेरे मना करने के बावजूद वह खड़े होकर बोले जा रहे हैं इसलिए जो भी वे कह रहे हैं वह रेकार्ड पर नहीं जायेगा ।

श्री बागड़ी : मैं केवल आप से एक निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ\*\*

श्री बागड़ी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आप से एक निवेदन और करना चाहता हूँ . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह नहीं हो सकता कि आप बगैर मेरी इजाजत के इस तरह से बोलते रहें ।

श्री बागड़ी : केरल के अन्दर आज ईसानों को केवल तीन आउंस चावल . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं बिलकुल नहीं सुनना चाहता । माननीय सदस्य अपनी जगह पर बैठ जायें ।

पेपर्स टु बी लेड और दो टेबुल ।

श्री बागड़ी : यह तो मेरे साथ बहुत ज्यादाती हो रही है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ज्यादाती तो माननीय सदस्य मेरे साथ कर रहे हैं कि मेरे मना करने के बावजूद बोले ही चले जा रहे हैं ।

श्री बागड़ी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आखिर को यह लोक-सभा है, जनता की प्रतिनिधि सभा है तो क्या इस लोक सभा में भूखों की बात नहीं कहने दी जायेगी। इसी लोक सभा में बड़ों की बात तो आ जाती है लेकिन गरीबों की रोटी का और उनकी भूख का सवाल यहाँ पर उठाने नहीं दिया जाता है। केरल में लोग भूखों मर रहे हैं। यह लोक-सभा आखिर जनता की आवाज को रखने के लिए बनी है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य बैठ जायें, बहुत हो चुका ।

श्री बागड़ी : भूखों की बात रेकार्ड से खारिज न की जाये। यह बहुत जरूरी बात है . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब चूँकि वह शीशी माननीय सदस्य के हाथ में है इसलिए वह बात जरूरी हो गई है। जब नाम्बियार साहब उस

शीशी को लिये हुए थे और उन्होंने वही बात पेश करनी चाही थी तो उस वक्त यह बात जरूरी नहीं थी लेकिन चूंकि अब बागड़ी साहब के हाथ में आ गई है इसलिए उसकी खसूसियत हो गई ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** खसूसियत शीशी की नहीं बल्कि भूख की है जिसकी कि तरफ मैं . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** बहुत कह गये अब और कुछ नहीं हो सकता ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** सवाल तो यह है . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** माननीय सदस्य अब बैठेंगे भी या अपना भाषण जारी ही रखेंगे ?

**श्री बागड़ी :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं भाषण जारी नहीं कर रहा हूं बल्कि मैं . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** फिर बैठ जाइये । पेपर्स टु बी लेड अन दी टेबुल ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** मेरा आप से इतना ही निवेदन है कि उसे रेकाड से खारिज न किया जाये और उसे रहने दिया जाये ।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** अगर अब भी माननीय सदस्य न बैठेंगे तो मुझे ऐक्शन लेना पड़ेगा ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** ऐक्शन तो जरूर ही आप लोजियेगा । आप हमेशा कोशिश करते हैं कि ऐक्शन हो ।

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मेरी तो कोशिश रहती है कि ऐक्शन न लेना पड़े । मैं हर मुमकिन कोशिश करता हूं कि मुझे ऐक्शन लेने की नौबत पेश न आये ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस तरह से तो यह लोक सभा . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** अब मैं मेम्बर साहब से कहूंगा कि वह बाकी दिन के लिए हाउस से बाहर चले जायें ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** मैंने कौन सा ऐसा गुनाह कर दिया जो मुझे चले जाने के लिए कहा जा रहा है ?

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** अब आप बाहर चले जायें ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** मैं यहां पर भूखों की बात कहना . . .

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** मैं ने मेम्बर साहब से कहा है कि वह बाकी दिन के लिए हाउस के बाहर चले जायें ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** मेरा निवेदन यह है कि प्रधान मंत्री ने उन्हें

**अध्यक्ष महोदय :** चूंकि माननीय सदस्य अभी भी बाहर नहीं जा रहे हैं इसलिए मैं उनका नाम पुकार कर कहता हूं कि श्री बागड़ी इस सदन से बाकी दिन के लिए बाहर चले जायें ।

**श्री बागड़ी :** अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह तो बहुत ज्यादाती है ।

*Shri Bagri then left the House.*

12.19 hrs.

#### PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

#### REPORTS OF INDIAN PRODUCTIVITY TEAMS

**The Minister of Heavy Engineering in the Ministry of Industry and Supply (Shri T. N. Singh):** I beg to lay on the Table a copy each of the following Reports:—

- (i) Report of Indian Productivity Team on Techniques of International Trade in West Germany, U.S.A. and Japan. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-3476/64].
- (ii) Report of Indian Productivity Team on Materials Handling in West Germany, Britain and U.S.A. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-3477/64].