

[Shri B. R. Bhagat]

making further amendments to the Customs and Central Excise Duties Export Draw-back (General) Rules, 1960:

- (I) G.S.R. No. 1896 dated the 14th December, 1963.
- (II) G.S.R. No. 1959 dated the 28th December, 1963.

[Placed in Library, See No. LT-2266/64].

- (iii) a copy of the Central Board of Excise and Customs (Regulation of Transaction of Business) Rules, 1964 published in Notification No. G.S.R. 34 dated the 1st January, 1964, under section 4 of the Central Boards of Revenue Act, 1963.

[Placed in Library, See No. LT-2267/64].

NOTIFICATIONS UNDER CENTRAL BOARDS OF REVENUE ACT, WEALTH TAX ACT AND INCOME-TAX ACT

The Deputy Minister in the Ministry of Finance (Shrimati Tarkeshwari Sinha): I beg to lay on the Table a copy each of the following Notifications:—

- (i) The Central Board of Direct Taxes (Regulation of Transaction of Business) Rules, 1964 published in Notification No. G.S.R. 31 dated the 1st January, 1964, under section 4 of the Central Boards of Revenue Act, 1964. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-2268/64].
- (ii) The Wealth-tax (Exemption of Heirloom Jewellery of Rulers) Amendment Rules 1964 published in Notification No. G.S.R. 38 dated the 1st January, 1964, under sub-section (4) of section 46 of the Wealth Tax Act, 1957. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-2269/64].
- (iii) The Income-tax (Amendment) Rules, 1964 published in Notification No. S.O. 107

dated the 1st January, 1964, under section 296 of the Income tax Act, 1961. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-2269/64].

12 03 hrs.

MOTION RE: COMMUNAL DISTURBANCES IN EAST PAKISTAN AND WEST BENGAL—contd.

Mr. Speaker: Further consideration of the following motion moved by Shri Nanda on the 11th February 1964, namely:—

“That the situation arising out of the communal disturbances in East Pakistan resulting in heavy loss of life and property of the members of minority community and their influx to India and consequential disturbances in West Bengal, be taken into consideration”.

along with the substitute motions moved thereon.

The hon. Minister may continue his speech.

The Minister of Home Affairs (Shri Nanda): I shall resume the thread of my speech. I may reiterate my deep realisation of the gravity of the situation and the issues which emerge from it. May I confess, as I said last evening, that I feel a sense of awe—I feel awed—by the immensity of the problems, their urgency also and their baffling character? There are many questions, inter-related, complex questions, and I believe that in those questions is wrapped in considerable measure the destiny of this country. This tangled skein has to be unravelled some day, I hope it will be soon. On how it is done will, I believe, rest to a considerable extent, the future of India, and to an extent also the course of world events. Therefore, when we deal with these questions—say something about them make our suggestions, take a particular line—we have to be aware of this, that the course we take will

deeply affect our position, externally, and internally—our economic progress, our political structure, all these things.

I made a statement yesterday.

In that statement I have given a very frank, straight presentation of the facts relating to the situation. I am conscious of the fact that the speeches which were made, by and large, for the most part, were also based on an objective view of the facts of the situation and their implications. It was clear that the Members realised also that these things were a matter of deep national concern. We take these matters in that sense. I am glad that without any exception, all the Members of the House shared that concern.

Very large national interests are involved, and therefore no lesser interest should be allowed to creep in, to come in the way, and I feel again and state my appreciation of the course of discussion in the House, that this was also the approach of the Members. Their advice is valuable, their advice as the nation's representatives will be very useful to us.

What is the main question? The question is just one question, the question of minorities here and in the other country, in India and in Pakistan. If it were just that simple question, possibly we would not have been faced with the awful developments which somehow, keep on occurring because it is mixed up with other things, other motives, and that is what brings about motives, and that is what brings about the trouble.

Our approach is very clear and straightforward. We have a certain view of our responsibilities towards our minorities. There are several minorities in this country in small and large numbers, but we regard them all as part of the same texture of the nation. They are a part of us, all of us are one in the unity of the nation and integrity. I want to emphasize

that. And whatever the numbers, there should not be any handicap for a minority. Therefore, provisions have been made and sought to be made that weaker sections will be given special consideration. So, it is not a question of treating them differently in a way which will be to their prejudice. Their rights, their privileges, are all the same, culturally, economically, politically, in every way. They are indistinguishable from the rest of the mass of the nation. That is our stand, and we want to maintain that.

I am aware of the fact that there has been religious strife in this country, and this virus has been handed down to us from the past. All of us know that recently another thing happened, namely the partition, which has left its scars. It cannot be effaced completely immediately, and the consequences are still haunting us, but on our side there is the greatest effort, endeavour, to see that all that taint of communalism is wiped out completely. This has been our effort all along, and it will be so.

The question of religion, somehow, is imported into these things. I have deep appreciation of religious life, but I am also very emphatic that while there should be no encroachment on any religion, there should be no fanaticism, there should be no politics introduced into religion, and because the question of the national structure is involved, nothing should be done which will affect its stability. I am aware of the fact that there are individuals in various communities who, possibly, may not come up 100 per cent to those standards of patriotism. There may be small groups also. If it is a Muslim whose heart is not wholly with us, I will tell him that he betrays his community and the nation. He is doing no good to his community. Similarly if there is a Hindu who by anything he does or speaks or by the influence that he produces, if he creates tensions in this

[Shri Nanda]

country, whatever may be the provocation for him, he is an enemy of the country, of the majority community also. Because, if disorders occurring in this country are not checked, quelled and eliminated what happens? It is our duty to see that they are put down. Today, it may be communal disorder between one community and another. Tomorrow it will be one caste and another or on economic and political issues. Where is the end? Therefore, we will not tolerate such disorders. If we did, it will be the break-down of the nation. We cannot afford it, whatever may be the provocations from any side. No reason can be strong and good enough to put up with any communal hatred spreading and leading to disturbances and exposing to danger in life and property of anybody in this country. Our officers know this. At the least sign of trouble they have to act strongly and if they do not do so quickly and strongly, we pay for it; there will be more destruction, more loss of life.

In the course of speeches there was some mention here of some people who by their attitude or action create trouble for us. I have already mentioned our own countrymen. Then there are people from other countries e.g. Pakistan. We have a generous attitude towards them. Now, there are Pakistani nationals going about here; they take up various employments and pursue their avocations. Actually nobody knows if it is a Pakistani or Indian; that is how we are going on. But they provoke trouble in this country sometimes and certainly we have to deal with them. For instance, in Calcutta some persons are employed in port trust and I was told that some of them signed some kind of application or some declaration saying: "we are not secure here" and they resigned. Let them resign and go.

I said yesterday when we started this motion, that I rose with a heavy

heart because at that time I felt depressed. Apart from the information and reports which I have to read, hour to hour, about happenings across the border, there were those harrowing experiences narrated here about what the minority in East Pakistan has to go through. I really felt very sad. The speeches of the hon. Members gave me a great deal of encouragement. One thing which arose prominently in the course of the speeches was the insistence and the emphasis of the Members on the integrity of the nation. I mean in the sense that we all feel our full responsibility towards the minority in this country. It was stressed again and again that whatever may be the provocation, that is not going to affect in the least degree our determination to protect the minority and give them full security. That was very encouraging and I feel very glad that that has happened. This is the nation's pledge to the minorities and this will be observed.

Then, may I also refer to another experience of the same kind? When I was in Calcutta, I had met some representatives of various parties there. Shri N. C. Chatterjee does not seem to be present here. He led them; he came on behalf of about more than a dozen parties. Their representatives were there. They had passed a resolution and each one of them spoke and each one of them prefaced his remarks with this: that while we are going to ask for certain measures for the help of the minority community in East Pakistan, we are, all of us—and that included, I believe, the Jan Sangh also, and I mention "also" because there was something else said about the Jan Sangh to which I shall refer immediately—are bound to see that the Muslims in India are fully protected; that is, all of them expressed themselves that whatever report or news comes about the atrocities perpetrated on the Hindus in East Pakistan, we have said that that can never be, in any sense, in the remotest

sense, any kind of justification for any tension being created in our country which might have any consequences to the detriment of the minority community in India. They said that that.

Then the question was raised about the Jan Sangh in the meeting which I had with them, with all the party representatives the next day. The previous meeting was on the same night when we reached there. It is true that the representative of the Jan Sangh said—he complained against me—“Why did I say that the life of every single Muslim is sacred and we will all go out to protect them, and why I did not say Hindus also?” Certainly, every citizen . . .

Shri Bade (Khargone): Why not every citizen be protected?

Shri Nanda: I said that also. I explained to him. It was part of what I had said. It was a part that was repeated. I mentioned that it is the entire responsibility of every member of the community, of every person in this country. But I referred specially again to the Muslims, because that was the context there. Then I explained that, and that was very clear to all those people present there. There was no kind of misgiving or misunderstanding about that.

I may also pay my thanks to the members of the Jan Sangh who were present. They had thought of a haral the next day or later, but they withdrew that.

So, this is our approach. I have mentioned that. This is embodied also in that document or agreement which is styled as the Nehru-Liaquat Pact. On our side we are carrying it out completely and fully. It is not being carried out on the other side. It is being violated day after day.

Let us see what has happened in West Bengal. Did anything happen in West Bengal on the 3rd January? It was all quite peaceful there; absolute peace, reigned in that State and in that city, but on 3rd January

trouble started in Khulna and Jessore. It was not spontaneous. It was not as if there was some local cause, something which arose there inside that area. It was not that. It was generated; all the trouble in that part of East Pakistan was induced by responsible people in Pakistan. The ostensible cause was some kind of a protest being staged there in relation to the Hazratbal incident. The Hazratbal incident till that day had not led to any kind of communal discord in Jammu and Kashmir. There was complete communal amity and harmony in Jammu and Kashmir. If there had to be any communal discord, it should have been there, but it was not there. Yet, the leaders of Pakistan and the Press in Pakistan exploited that in a blatant fashion for the purpose of inflaming communal passions. I do not under-rate the intelligence of the leaders of Pakistan. When they were making those speeches and their Press was writing all these glaring headlines, was it that they did not know what the consequences would be?

Shri S. M. Banerjee (Kanpur): Our Government kept mum.

Shri Nanda: I may not go further and say that all this was deliberately done by them. It was there and the consequences were inevitable in the situation in which particularly the people are living in East Pakistan, where the minorities are exposed to risk from day to day. Was it that there was an ulterior design in all that? Maybe. This was what the Press and the leaders there did.

But when the trouble started later on as a consequence of that in West Bengal; what did we do? How was our Press behaving? They were requested to take a sober line about both the happenings about West Bengal and Calcutta and also about what was happening in East Pakistan, and give unvarnished accounts. They accepted the advice. So far as the facts about Calcutta and West Bengal are con-

[Shri Nanda]

cerned, they were given in a bald fashion; the truth of it was there. There was no effort to minimise it. The figures of casualties were also given; usually they are not given. Figures of casualties—how many Muslims and how many Hindus—were also given. So far as what was happening in East Pakistan was concerned, the advice was to see that it does not immediately have any kind of provocative effect. There is no attempt to suppress anything. But sometimes it happens that when you break a news, with human beings, it is sometimes better not to do that in that sudden way, because immediately the effect may be very bad. So, the whole effort was that it might not create immediate consequences of an untoward nature. The idea was that headings, photographs and pictures should not be of a provocative kind. Most of the papers abided by that advice; some possibly did not do it.

What did Pakistan do? It chose this moment to go to the Security Council. It was not content with creating trouble here in East Pakistan and therefore in Calcutta. It went further. Our main insistence was just this: There may have been occasions in the past for going to the Security Council and there may be occasions in future also. But this was not the time to go there, because if all that is happening in East Pakistan we bring it out—it would be risky. We made all the arrangements throughout the country. We took precautions in all parts of the country. We alerted the States and the whole organisation of administrative set-up, the police and the security, so that nothing untoward may happen. We did all that. But still there were grave risks and we did not want to be exposed to those risks of troubles being created and that leading to further reactions and repercussions. That was what we had in our mind. That was not heeded.

Well, at any rate, I am glad that we have succeeded in keeping our country calm and restrained. No trouble has arisen here. That is the difference between Pakistan and India. Some hon. Member there said that some deaths have taken place here and some deaths have taken place there. But in respect of deaths also there is no comparison. The figures have been mounting up there. Of course, even the loss of a single life is very bad, it causes agony and distress. But you have to compare the figures also.

The main thing is the approach, the attitude in Pakistan. Why is it that the trouble spread from Khulna and Jessore to Dacca and Narayanganj and then into the interior? We did not allow it to spread. That is where the test comes. Troubles can start, disturbances can start and something may be happening or simmering underground which we may not be able to deal with at once. But the question is, what happens afterwards. It takes two or three days to see that these troubles are quenched. But there it is allowed to spread. The other difference is in what the leaders do. What do our leaders do? What does our Government do? What do the representatives of public opinion do? How do they behave? What happens there? That is the contrast. Therefore, let not any kind of wrong impression be created that there are communal troubles here also and these are to be equated with the troubles there. They cannot be equated.

I would like to say something about the events in West Bengal—they were mentioned—and more especially in Calcutta. One or two misstatements of fact I would like first to clear. There was some mention of the police having left Bengal and gone to Bhuvanagar. I was rather surprised to

hear that. I have made enquiries. No such thing happened. There was no police force taken from Bengal or anywhere to assist in the arrangements in Bhubaneswar. That did not happen.

Then, Sir the main question about West Bengal, which I feel I will have to deal with, is that an impression is being sought to be created that there was a complete breakdown of the administrative apparatus. That was the charge that some hon. Members made. Then, also, it is linked up with my going there, with my visit to that place. Various interpretations were put on that. I shall state my assessment of the situation a little later, but so far as the role of the Government of West Bengal is concerned I must put the record straight.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy (Kendrapara): You made them straight when you were there?

Shri Nanda: I shall tell you what little thing I had to do. What could I do? What could a single individual do in that state? I can tell you ultimately, if order came, if order was restored, it was neither by myself nor the Chief Minister nor the police nor the army, it was the will of the people of Calcutta that prevailed ultimately and the other things were just a little bit of stimulus towards that situation. I have sat with the Chief Minister for hours now. For two or three days I was with him. He has certain faults which I will disclose here. He did not sleep at all. He had practically very little sleep for two or three days. He was working round the clock. He would not allow any kind of rest for himself. He was so much perturbed with any little sign of anything happening. He was alarmed whenever any news came.

Of course, the army was called in and the police battalions were called in and they were air-lifted because there was no time. We did not want any delay to be caused in our preparation for meeting any eventuality.

The moment he saw trouble, he wanted to deal with it. Another person in his position might have said "All right, I will deal with it as it comes and face the consequences". But he was not of that type. He took abundant precautions. As one of the precautions, he asked me to visit Calcutta. I went there as it was my duty to do so. I was by his side and I saw that he was always thinking of taking every possible precaution and it is there that he exposed himself to some misunderstanding.

I moved about in Calcutta practically the whole day and I saw what was happening there. I met the people who were affected and they told me their views about the role of the police. It is true that some of the members of the police did not behave properly and did not give enough protection. But there were many affected people who have nothing but admiration for the police. But the Chief Minister was always thinking only of the failures. Possibly, he wanted to do things quickly, speedily, properly and effectively. So he only saw where the weakness was, where the default was. I put it to him that there is so much good that is happening, the police are doing their work exceedingly well; if some are not doing their work well let them suffer and pay for it.

The police is the sheet anchor of law and order in any State in normal times. Although the police force as a whole functioned well, there were some human failures. It is said that to some extent it was due to the fact that there were certain refugees in the police and they were affected by the tale of woe that the police heard from people coming from the other side. Whatever may be said about those particular police officials, by and large, they functioned well.

A reference was made to connivance in this connection. I may say here that I have studied the situation very closely. It was said that petrol and

[Shri Nanda]

trucks and all that were unmistakable signs of the disturbances being organised. I could also see that there was some organisation; but I went deeper into it. I found there were gangs of hooligans who organised the disturbance. That was the only organisation. They were after loot. Maybe the *basti* owners had some greed of their own and they incited or helped them, but they were the only people who did it. I know there were some instances where about 500 or more people went to some Hindu factory owners and demanded Rs. 500 or 1,000 failing which they threatened to burn their factories. It was nothing but hooliganism. They rounded up the hooligans. They issued an ordinance which protected the rights of the persons affected to their homes and hearths from which they were displaced for the moment. They took all those steps.

The Chief Minister of West Bengal does not require any certificate from me. Only, I am giving my own testimony. Many people were involved in the disturbances including some political parties. A mention was made about the Congress Party in this connection. May I put it to the hon. Members that there may be within the Congress also some black sheep but in some parties the black sheep outnumber the others?

Shri Tyagi (Dehra Dun): Did the people respond well to the appeal?

Shri Nanda: I am talking of the political parties in which the black sheep outnumber the others, whereas there may be an individual member here and there in the Congress also.

Shri Tyagi: I hope you do not mean me.

Shri Nanda: I may also add that taking advantage of the experience of those days the West Bengal Government has strengthened its arrangements. It has added to its police strength and procured more vehicles

for greater mobility. So, all the necessary steps have been taken. That was done while the trouble was on. All these things were thought of and done.

Some questions have been raised about what lay behind these happenings. A part of it is very clear, namely, the sequence of events of the causation which began with Hazratbal and then advantage was taken of it in Pakistan. From that the chain of events starts. It was asked here whether right on the spot the Deputy High Commissioner of Pakistan moved about. He did move about. That is true. It was not so much during the days when the trouble was on. But he is free to move about.

There was mention of what was supposed to be a fact that some arms were discovered in places of worship.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): Quite correct.

Shri Nanda: I have got all the enquiries made. It has been ascertained that it was in one place and it was one revolver and one countrymade gun. That is all.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: They are arms.

Shri Nanda: That is our information. There was no Chinese stamp on them though the Chinese are capable of doing anything. This is one part of the story.

There is another one and the bigger one and the more important one. The main question before us was: What do we do about the minorities in East Pakistan?

Shri Nath Pai (Rajapur): Please answer more about the movements of the Deputy High Commissioner. You said that he is free to move about. But is he free to take photographs, make tape recordings, spread rumours and incite the minorities?

Shri Nanda: No.

Shri Nath Pai: Did you enquire if he did it?

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: Did you take any steps?

Shri Tyagi: Did our High Commissioner move in the area on the Pakistan side?

Shri Nanda: Yes; he also moved in Dacca.

Shri Hem Barua (Gauhati): May I submit for your information that yesterday the hon. Home Minister said that our diplomatic personnel in Pakistan were not allowed to move about in the riot-affected areas?

Mr. Speaker: That was after the riots.

Shri Hem Barua: Yes, Sir; that is what we are interested in. Their diplomatic personnel move about here all right in the troubled areas of Calcutta even without our permission.

Shri Nanda: This is a big question and, I think, hon. Members should think of this because this is really what should occupy our minds, that is, the problem of the minorities in East Pakistan. This has engaged and exercised the feelings and the minds of hon. Members.

Shri Hem Barua: That is true; but at the same time we must not allow the diplomatic personnel of Pakistan to create mischief in our country.

Shri Nanda: I agree with the hon. Member. About the plight of the minority community in East Pakistan there are deep feelings. Feelings of sorrow, distress and anxiety about them were expressed in this House. Those feelings are shared by us. There is our natural impulse that we should try to do everything possible to relieve the sufferings of those people. No stone should be left unturned. Whatever may be the legal and the other aspects of it, we are answerable to man and God. If we can do anything at all possible to help them, we should not deny that help.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: Do not leave them to God.

Shri Nanda: Before I enter further into this question I must invite attention to certain basic issues and to certain limitations of what can be done by us. However regrettable it might have been, the fact of partition is there. A part of India was carved out and it became the sovereign country of Pakistan. Both countries have a majority and a minority community. Pakistan has its majority and minority; so have we and the minority become the nationals of that country, that is, the Mussalmans of India and the Hindus of Pakistan. That was the basis of the Partition. Now, it is clearly understood that the Muslims of India are going to be protected fully. The entire responsibility for their security is ours for giving them full equal rights with all members of other communities. Similarly it was expected that the Hindus will occupy the same position. In fact, that was the basis of the Nehru-Liaquat Ali Pact.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Not just expected. You gave the pledge, didn't you.

Shri Nanda: Am I trying in any way, to deny that or to minimise that or to dilute our pledges or our responsibility?

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: We hope not.

Shri Nanda: No; not at all. The question is, what can be done? It was expected that the Hindus in East Pakistan will live with equal rights, equal status and equal security and safety. If Pakistan fails to discharge its responsibilities, those Hindus in East Pakistan do not cease to be the nationals of Pakistan. That one thing must be very clear. However much we may grieve over their fate, that fact cannot be ignored that they are the responsibility of Pakistan. Pakistan is failing in its responsibility and on human considerations we have to do something about it because, as I said, we cannot take purely the legal and constitutional view. We cannot shut our eyes to the fact that they are the

[Shri Nanda]

people who were part of ourselves, with whom we have ties of blood and who are our relations and friends, these who live there. We cannot turn our face against their sufferings, the torture of their bodies and spirit and all that they are undergoing there. We cannot do that. Therefore, instinctively our hearts turn to them and it is a question of the human impulse. We want to do our best. We cannot help doing that. But there it is. We want to give them whatever succour we might like to send them. We are faced with the situation that there is 'compassion'. That is a word which separates us from them; they are on the other side of the barrier and we hear their cries for help. But our hands cannot reach there. What else can we do? That is the question. There is the human obligation. Somebody has taken objection to the word 'compassion'. That is a word which has been used in the Nehru-Liaquat Ali Pact. The human obligation is there. We emphasise the responsibility of Pakistan to look after their protection, relief and rehabilitation and it is for them to take back those people who have been affected and who are in camps to their homes and give them relief and rehabilitation. We welcome that. We will be very happy if they do that. If they do not do that, if they are not able to give them the new start, if they do not feel secure, if they find it impossible to breathe the air of security in their country and they feel that they must leave it, then we cannot bar their way. We have no heart to tell them, "You go on staying there and be butchered." We cannot say that. We have no heart to say that. We cannot just see that they are perishing in the flames of communal fire and let them perish. No. It will be inhuman to do so.

Then, there were certain provisions in the Nehru-Liaquat Ali Pact. How to deal with the situation? Somehow they are not in operation now because that country does not respect those provisions at all.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Is it a dead letter or has it been abrogated?

Shri Nanda: I am reminded of a saying in Persian:

"न जाणु मादन, न राहे रफ्तन"

I will explain what it means. It means: No room to stay, no outlet for escape. Now that is their position and to the extent it is possible for us to enable them to come away, when they find that they are in complete peril, in an extreme state of insecurity, we have to see that they can come across. And this is what has been done, what we have tried to do. Mr. Chatterjee, representing a number of parties, who met me and the Chief Minister of West Bengal in Calcutta with the resolution, made this representation. They said, "We know that it is not possible, it is not proper, it is not feasible to put forward the idea of exchange of population." They said that. It was very reassuring to learn from them that the exchange of population idea is something which is unthinkable with all the horrible consequences of it. They said, "Let us discard it completely." They said that. It was very good. Then, what they said was, "We may not ask for that. But can't we ask for something which you can do? That is, there are those migration restrictions. Why not relax them?" We said, "We will try to ease the conditions." And then we have tried to do that. But let me again emphasise this one fact that although they will come and we will give them the certificates and they will enter our country—we will provide for relief and rehabilitation also—it is not a cheering prospect for them who come from there. It is not we can easily reproduce the conditions in which they live there, the environment in which they have been living there. It is uprooting and, therefore, nobody would like to come and nobody would like them just to take it lightly and come because here, in spite of all that we can do, all that we can provide, things will be hard and it is not going to be easy to settle down with normal life. Therefore, when

the question is raised by Pakistan that we are facilitating their entry and inviting them, how can we invite them, what can we do to invite them, the millions of people to come here? It is not possible. But it is only those who find it impossible to stay there. We have not got much land which can be given to them. There is the difficulty in finding more land for settling new persons in the country. But whatever we have, we will share with them. There is no escape from that. That is what we are trying to do and that is what the Chief Ministers of various States who came agreed to do. They also fully entered into the spirit of the situation and they tried to help . . .

Shri P. R. Patel (Patan): Why don't you ask Pakistan for more land for these people?

Shri Nanda: We can also go further and try to secure land from other areas also.

Shri Tyagi: After all, they are Pakistan citizens. They are coming here. We have given them protection. Why can't we ask the Pakistan Government to give us some extra land for them?

Shri Nanda: The hon. Member can make that suggestion to Pakistan. I cannot.

Then, about the question of liberalising the migration restrictions, there were some points made that it was not enough. I would like to state that when you take the earlier relaxations made, the various categories which had been made earlier for the purpose of granting of migration certificates and the new relaxations that we add to them, then practically all the needs of the situation are met. It is not because they are not able to obtain migration certificates that the trouble arises for them. It is because of some harassments that are still there. They are being subjected to harassments. They are not allowing them to stay there. Even in the camps they have been subjected to

severe ordeals and hardships; neither food nor medicine nor any kind of other needs are being provided. Therefore, there is nothing for them either to stay in camps or to go back. That was the situation there. Now, we have learnt that income-tax clearance certificates and some municipal certificates are required from those coming at the border. What have they got? They have left everything, and still income-tax clearance certificates are required from them. That may be a normal obligation, but here when the people are fleeing because of insecurity, why is this being done?

I said that so far as migration certificates are concerned, they would apply to the new categories plus the old. The question was raised: 'You have said about girls of marriageable age. But why not women?' Here it is: 'Unattached women and widows with no livelihood in Pakistan'. That is also one of the categories.

Shri Tridib Kumar Chaudhuri (Berhampur): The hon. Minister has allowed girls of marriageable age to come away. But what about young married women? He is preventing them. If a woman is married, she is not allowed to come.

Shri Nanda: If they come as part of a family, that is one thing. If there is a woman who has lost her husband she can also come. So, both ways, it has been provided for.

Shrimati Renuka Ray (Malda): But why this categorisation?

Shri Badrudduja (Murshidabad): In all humility, may I request the Home Minister to relate something of the terrible happenings which have affected the lives, liberty, honour and properties of West Bengal Muslims? He has referred to the tortures and killings on the other side. But I may request him to make some reference to the terrible sufferings that have taken place in West Bengal.

Shri Tyagi: They have killed a few Hindus also.

Shrimati Renu Chakravartty (Barrackpore): Suppose the entire family is not able to come over because of various reasons. Why is it not possible for the married women of that family to be given migration certificates so that they can come over?

Shri Nanda: There is another clause where the Deputy High Commissioner has got discretion, and such cases could be covered under that clause.

Shrimati Renuka Ray: Why should there be any clauses? Why should it not be possible for everyone to come over? Why should there be clauses like this? And why should there be separate categories?

Mr. Speaker: Because everything cannot be written in one clause, therefore, there are two clauses.

Shrimati Renuka Ray: Why these clauses? The migration certificates should be open to all.

Shri Tridib Kumar Chaudhuri: I would like to know whether Government would be prepared to sit with all the West Bengal Members and see if they can revise the migration conditions, after the debate is over. They cannot do it offhand. But will the hon. Minister be prepared to sit with all the West Bengal members, irrespective of party affiliations, and seek their suggestions and consider if the migration conditions could be revised?

Shri Atulya Ghosh (Asansol): Why only West Bengal Members? This has nothing to do with West Bengal. Something is happening in East Pakistan, and the Government of India have to tackle it. It has nothing to do with West Bengal only. West Bengal will share its responsibility with other States.

Shri Hem Barua: The hon. Minister has offered certain facilities to refugees coming from East Pakistan with migration certificates. I am just interested in knowing whether he is going to allow facilities to those

people who have come as refugees to our country, because of insecurity there, without migration certificates.

Shri Nanda: May I proceed and answer this as well as the other questions? The larger proportion of those who have entered India from East Pakistan, I believe, so far as West Bengal is concerned, consists of those who have come without any migration papers, and we have accepted them, and we are going to accept them, certificate or no certificate.

Shri Swell (Assam—Autonomous Districts): About 50,000 tribal refugees have come to Garo Hills. What about those people?

Mr. Speaker: The hon. Minister is not giving way. So, no hon. Member should try to interrupt now.

Shri Swell: The whole thing has been related only about West Bengal. What about those in the Garo Hills area?

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. The hon. Minister is not giving way. So, no Member should interrupt him.

Shri Nanda: I have tried to meet both the needs of the situation, so far as Government are concerned. If there is any aspect which requires any further consideration, certainly we can meet and discuss it. I believe the things as they are, make full provision for all contingencies. If there is anything more, we can discuss it. So, I shall leave it at that. There are about 46,000 people who have entered Assam. . . .

Shri Swell: 50,000 people, and more are coming every day.

Shri Nanda: And more are coming every day. Although we have no dearth of man-power here, certainly, we have to prepare to receive these others also. Also, on this side, in West Bengal, I think the number has reached 22,000 or so.

Now, this is what we can do on our side: we can make arrangements for their relief, we can receive them and make it easier for them, so far as we are concerned, so that they can have the migration certificates, and we may simplify whatever the procedures are and make them quicker. All this is being done, and then, we can take them to wherever they can be re-settled. This is a difficult task, a very very difficult task, but we shall try to do that.

Then, there are one or two other points.

Shri Nath Pai: May we know what the orders are when news comes of riots in Bengal?....

Mr. Speaker: The hon. Member may resume his seat. The hon. Minister is not giving way.

Shri Nath Pai: This is very important. I think the hon. Minister is giving way.

Mr. Speaker: He is not.

Shri Nanda: I am standing. So, how am I giving way? The hon. Member may ask his question afterwards. I also feel some kind of a sense of uneasiness about the time that is being taken by me, because you have got other work also on the Order Paper.

There are just one or two points about the future. Apart from this, how do we tackle and solve this problem? Everybody thought that enough was not being done on that score. I looked expectantly, anxiously and eagerly for some kind of a very positive and constructive suggestion, but after having scanned all the things that came out, I found that they reduced themselves to just one suggestion,

namely, take things to the UNO. We have already got something at the UNO. It is said, take things to the UNO. We are doing whatever we can to put out our case. But, is there anything else that could be done? I believe still that although the UNO may not be the remedy, yet, the nations are. The facts of the situation here and in East Pakistan, the failure there, and our effort to do our best and our having succeeded in doing that etc. must be brought to the notice of the people in the world, because that will create a world opinion, and we would like to do it, and we are proceeding to do it.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: But your 'proceeding' is weak.

Shri Nanda: There is one more thing which I would stress at the end, and that is that we shall be concretely assisted in successfully performing that duty and carrying out that task if in this country we maintain total peace and total tranquillity.

Shri Tyagi: Beware of your British friends; the British power will go against you.

Shri Nanda: If we are able to demonstrate that whatever happens there, on our side, there is complete and full determination to do our part, and that irrespective of any provocation we will maintain peace, then our voice will be heard very much better than it could otherwise be. Therefore, that is the positive thing that we shall create the conditions here which will enable us to raise our voice everywhere in the world.

An hon. Member wanted me to tell him what happened to the Muslims there. We have not hidden any fact. We have not hidden their sufferings. Whatever happened in West Bengal was in the papers. And more than anybody else, the West Bengal Chief

[Shri Nanda]

Minister was giving out every day everything that happened there, and all the occurrences there.

Shri Badrudduja: There have been more harrowing tales. There have been more terrible sufferings. There have been more serious developments. The press has suppressed them. The press has poisoned the atmosphere. Papers like the *Ananda Bazar Patrika*, *Jugantar* and others have suppressed those things. They have maximised the sufferings there and minimised the sufferings of the West Bengal Muslims who have been tortured with every refinement of cruelty.

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. I have asked other hon. Members not to interrupt the hon. Minister, and certainly, the hon. Member is also included among them.

Shri Badrudduja: I wanted only a clarification.

Shri Nanda: Everything that was known to us was recorded by us and has been made known. It may be that there may be an isolated occurrence somewhere which might not have come to our notice.

I would then ask the hon. Members to look at the efforts that are being made for the relief and rehabilitation of these persons. How much money is being spent on relief both in rural areas and in Calcutta? Every possible consideration is being given. I can say this with authority that everything possible is being done.

13.00 hrs.

I must make one thing clear. There was some insinuation that some Muslims were responsible for the occurrences in West Bengal.

An Hon. Member: Yes.

Shri Nanda: It is not so.

Shri Surendranath Dwivedy: It is not the Muslim community—they behaved very nicely—but it is the Pak agents.

Shri Nanda: They may have a finger in every ugly pie. That is not any defence of that statement. But I am talking of the Muslims. Actually when things were taking place, some of them possibly may have become aggressive.

Shri Hem Barua: They put up a pitched battle.

Shri Nanda: The genesis of the trouble was not that. It was not done by the Muslims there.

The hon. Member mentioned the press, the *Ananda Bazar Patrika*, *Jugantar* and *Basumati*. I have my own grouse against these papers. I went there at the instance of the Chief Minister. Then they start saying that we have gone there to take over Calcutta. We have seen all kinds of things. Sometimes, I was also asked, why not take these newspapers to task, why not do something about them? Well, we have democratic traditions in which we function. We give the fullest latitude to the press. We give them advice. We make appeals to them. But sometimes if it becomes necessary, and some national interest is endangered, then something may be done about them also. But we give them the fullest latitude, as far as possible. They said I had gone there in order to suppress the Government of West Bengal and take over. These are all fantastic things which were being spread there. They had absolutely no meaning at all.

I would not like to take more time. I am very grateful to you and the House for affording me an opportunity and privilege to explain all the facts of the situation and the implications.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: On a small point of clarification.

Mr. Speaker: I will begin from one side. Questions should be only by way of clarification. I would not allow any speech. Shri S. M. Banerjee.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: I will not make any speech. Why should you think that I am always wrong?

Yesterday, the hon. Minister was pressed by many Members to announce the names of those who were apprehended in connection with the theft of the sacred relic from the Hazratbal shrine. I want to know why he does not mention the names.

Mr. Speaker: That is not relevant here.

Shri S. M. Banerjee: Then what is relevant? The whole trouble started because of the theft.

Mr. Speaker: I have said it is not relevant here. On a different occasion during the day, he can ask that question.

Shri Nath Pai: The hon. Minister was talking about liberalisation of the certificates to be given to intending refugees from East Pakistan. May I know what are the permanent orders to the Indian border posts? When news comes from East Pakistan that that State is once again engulfed in a flame of communal frenzy, are the orders to these posts to insist on these certificates or are there to be no requirement of certificates being produced and all of them would be allowed to come in? What is the true position.

Also . . .

Mr. Speaker: Only one question.

Shri Nath Pai: The affected people could not reach Dacca because it was surrounded by riot-affected areas. That being so, how could they proceed to our High Commission to get permission?

Mr. Speaker: He is making a speech.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: May I request the hon. Minister to throw light on an obscure point? When the situation was so serious in Calcutta, why was it that neither the Minister of State nor a senior officer of the Home Ministry was sent out there as a representative of the Central Government—as it was their duty to do—but the Chairman of the State Trading Corporation was left in charge of the situation?

Shri Hem Barua: Is it a fact that some of the Muslims in Calcutta put up a pitched battle, which they ought to have done—it is good that they did it because that is a demonstration of the democratic character of our State . . .

Mr. Speaker: I cannot allow any speech or comment. If he has a short question, he may put it.

Shri Hem Barua: My question is whether they put up a pitched battle.

Shri Swell: Apropos of reports of firing on the evacuees entering Garo Hills and reports of deaths, may I know whether any instruction has been given to the border security force to give protection to these evacuees entering India when they were fired upon by Pakistan personnel?

Shri Hem Barua: Killing children and injuring women.

श्री मुजफ्फर हुसैन (मुरादाबाद) में दरियाफ्त करना चाहता हूँ कि कलकत्ते में क्या हुआ। पाकिस्तान का तो बहुत कुछ रोना मेम्बरान ने रोया है जाहिर है। मैं तो वह जानना चाहता हूँ जो कि कलकत्ते में हुआ। और जो कुछ आपने अपनी मौजूदगी में देखा उसका भी आपने कुछ इजहार ख्याल नहीं फरमाया मैं पुछना चाहता हूँ कि आपने सामने क्या हुआ और आपने अपनी आँखों के

[श्री मुजफ्फर हुसैन]

सामने क्या देखा? आपने कितने लोगों को मुसमानों पर मजालिम करते हुए देखा ?

Shri Muhammad Ismail (Manjeri): When the hon. Home Minister was in Calcutta during those terrible happenings, the extent of the plight and sufferings of the people was explained to him. There has been a systematic policy working there of producing scorched earth . . .

Mr. Speaker: He is also making a speech.

Shri Muhammad Ismail: Hundreds of villages have been demolished and the people affected have all come to Calcutta or rushed to some other place, having no other place to go to. It was promised . . .

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. He is making a speech which I have not allowed to any Member.

Shri Muhammad Ismail: I am speaking of the necessity for immediate relief which has to be given to these people. It was promised . . .

Mr. Speaker: Order, order. Only one question is allowed. I cannot allow a speech.

Shri Muhammad Ismail: I want to know whether arrangements for at least temporary measures have been completed so that the people affected might go back to places wherein were their original homes. The complaint is that there has not been . . .

Mr. Speaker: No further question.

Shri Nanda: Taking the last question first, as I repeatedly stated, there has not been any kind of attempt to under-estimate, under-rate or minimise the sufferings and losses to the Muslim community. Now, if the hon. Member wants us to publish a brochure on that, and if it will be of any help, let it be done. But there has been no effort of that kind, deliberately to suppress the facts. I

have seen houses burnt, I have seen arson before my eyes. What does the hon. Member want us to do? These things have occurred. There were a number of cases of deaths, a number of houses and property were lost—all these things are there. But why are we trying to emphasise that again and again? Those facts are there. I have said that. Before my eyes, efforts at relief and rehabilitation were started. There were some difficulties on the first day; on the second day, things were very much better. 90 per cent of the people displaced and affected in rural areas are back to their own places. So also is the case with a very large number of people in Calcutta. That Ordinance was passed in two or three days in order that they might be able to go back and live in their own houses. Loans have been given, corrugated sheets have been provided; whatever else by way of materials and other facilities is possible is being given. This is a poor nation. It is doing its best to give relief and rehabilitate the affected people.

The second thing was about an officer having been sent there from here. That officer there has a background and experience of this kind. He proved very valuable there.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: What is his background?

Mr. Speaker: That should be enough.

Shri Nanda: We would not pick out a person if he is not useful for us. In those conditions, naturally we thought of the best person.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: That means they have no competent officer in the Home Ministry itself. It is a serious reflection on the officers of the Home Ministry.

Shri Nanda: He has had Home Ministry experience, and he was available to us.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: Are there no senior officers in the Ministry available?

Shri Nanda: Those people who want to come in are not being detained or deterred by the lack of migration certificates. They are coming in without migration papers, they are allowed to come in, and therefore the difficulty is not on that account at all. Therefore, that is not the trouble.

Mr. Speaker: On what has not been answered, I cannot allow further questions.

Now I shall put Shri Kamath's substitute motion. First I may ascertain from the House that the House agrees that it should be put straightaway.

Hon. Members: Yes.

Mr. Speaker: The question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the situation arising out of the communal disturbances in East Pakistan resulting in heavy loss of life and property of the members of minority community and their influx to India and consequential disturbances in West-Bengal, regrets the inadequacy of the measures adopted by the Government of India to deal with the unprecedented situation created by the communal holocaust in East Pakistan." (1)

Those in favour may say "Aye".

Some Hon. Members: Aye.

Mr. Speaker: Those against may say "No".

Some Hon. Members: No.

Mr. Speaker: The Noes have it.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: The Ayes have it.

Mr. Speaker: Let the lobbies be cleared.

The party whips might take care to see that if any of their Members are out, they might be brought in, because I would not allow the gates to be opened till all the substitute motions have been put one after the other. The gates shall remain closed. Once they have been shut, they would not be opened till all these motions have been put to the House and disposed of.

Thee question is:

That for the original motion, the following be substituted, namely:—

"This House, having considered the situation arising out of the communal disturbances in East Pakistan resulting in heavy loss of life and property of the members of minority community and their influx to India and consequential disturbances in West Bengal, regrets the inadequacy of the measures adopted by the Government of India to deal with the unprecedented situation created by the communal holocaust in East Pakistan." (1)

The Lok Sabha divided:

Shri Yajnik (Ahmedabad): I am sorry there has been some mistake. I have not abstained, but I have voted in favour of the motion.

Mr. Speaker: One thing that I might just suggest to the House is that now that we have been here for two years working on this, if the machine fails, of course that should be corrected, but if it is still a failure on our part, the statement of the Member would be recorded that it has not been correctly recorded, but in the announcement of the result, I would not take it into account unless the result is going to be affected.

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath: You have done that before.

Shri Yajnik: I voted for "Aye", yet it appears here as abstention.

श्री विश्वामप्रसाद (लालगंज) : बिना
आदमी के वह मशीन चल रही है।
हालांकि वहां कोई आदमी नहीं है लेकिन
बोर्ड पर एक लाल निशान ऐड हो गया है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य शायद
अपनी जगह से बैठे हुए वायर्स पुल कर रहे
होंगे।

Division No. 1]

I have to add one to the Ayes for
Shri Yajnik. It has been ascertained
that there was one "No" there with-
out any Member, and one has to be
deducted from the Noes.

Ayes: 35; *Noes:* 194.

Shri Tyagi: This one abstention has
gone to that side, not from 195.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ऐबमेंटी भी हो,
रेकार्ड में तो आ गया।

[13.17 hrs.]

AYES

Alva, Shri Joachim
Alyares, Shri
Bade, Shri
Barua, Shri Hem
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Bhawani, Shri Lakhmu
Beel, Shri P. H.
Chatterjee, Shri H. P.
Chatterjee, Shri N. C.
Chaudhuri, Shri Tridib Kumar
Dwivedy, Shri Surendranath
Gokaran Prasad, Shri

Gupta, Shri Kashi Ram
Jha, Shri Yogendra
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishnu
Kapur Singh, Shri
Kobor, Shri
Krishnapal Singh, Shri
Mate, Shri
Mohan Swarup, Shri
Nath Pai, Shri
Pattnayak, Shri Kishen
Ranga, Shri
Reddy, Shri Narasimha

Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir
Singh, Dr. B. N.
Singh, Shri Y. D.
Singhvi Dr. L. M.
Trivedi, Shri U. M.
Utiya, Shri
Verma, Shri S. L.
Vijaya Raje, Shrimati
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak
Yainik, Shri
Yaspal Singh, Shri

NOES

Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Anjanappa, Shri
Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
Barkataki Shrimati Renuka
Barupal, Shri P. L.
Basappa, Shri
Bastmatari, Shri
Haswant, Shri
Besra, Shri
Bhagar, Shri B. R.
Bhanja Deo, Shri L. N.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bis t, Shri J. B. S.
Borooah, Shri P. C.
Brajeshwar Prasad Shri
Brij Basi Lal, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P. R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandrasekhar, Shrimati
Chandriki, Shri

Chattar Singh, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S. N.
Chaudhuri, Shri D. S.
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavda, Shrimati
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Dr. M. M.
Das, Shri B. K.
Das, Shri N. T.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dasappa, Shri
Dass, Shri G.
Deshmukh, Shri Shivaji Rao S.
Dey, Shri S. K.
Dhaon, Shri
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dighe, Shri
Dinesh Singh, Shri
Dubey, Shri K. G.
Elavaperumal, Shri
Ganapati Ram, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V. B.
Ghosh, Shri Atulya
Hajarnavia, Shri
Hansda, Shri Subodh

Hem Raj Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jamunadevi, Shrimati
Joshi, Shri A. C.
Joshi, Shrimati Subhadra
Jyotishi, Shri J. P.
Kamble, Shri
Kappen, Shri
Karuthiruman, Shri
Kayal, Shri P. N.
Kedarja, Shri C. M.
Khadiolkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P. N.
Khan, Shri Osman Ali
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Ch...
Kindar Lal, Shri
Koujalgi, Shri H. V.
Kripa Shankar, Shri
Krishna, Shri M. R.
Krishnamachari, Shri T. T.
Kureel, Shri B. N.
Lakhan Das, Shri
Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati

Lalit Sen, Shri	Pand , Shri	Samanta, Shri S. C.
Laskar, Shri N. R.	Pandey, Shri R. S.	Samnani, shri
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati	Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath	Sarma, shri A. T.
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri	Panna Lal, Shri	Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.	Paramasivan, shri	Sen, Shri P. G.
Mahtab, Shri	Patel, Shri N. N.	Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini	Patel, Shri P. R.	Shankaraiya, Shri
Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati	Patel, Shri Rajeshwar	Sharma, Shri A. P.
Malaichami, Shri	Patil, Shri S. B.	Sharma, Shri D. C.
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra	Patil, Shri T. A.	Shashi Ranjan, Shri
Manaan, Shri	Patnaik, Shri B. C.	Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
Manda', Shri Yamuna Prasad	Pattabhi Raman, Shri C. R.	Shinde, Shri
Maniyangadan, Shri	Pillai, Shri Natraja	Shree Narayan Das, Shri
Mantri, Shri	Prabhakar, Shri Naval	Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
Marandi, Shri	Pratap Singh, Shri	Shyamkumari Devi, Shrimat
Masuriya Din, Shri	Raghunath Singh, Shri	Siddananappa, Shri
Matcharaju, Shri	Rai, Shrimati Sahodrabai	Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Mehdi, Shri S. A.	Raja, Shri C. R.	Singh, Shri R. P.
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari	Rajaram, Shri	Singha, Shri G. K.
Mehta, Shri J. R.	Rajdeo Singh, Shri	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt	Raju, Dr. D. S.	Sinha, Shrimai Tarkeshwari
Minimata, Shri	Raju, Shri D. P.	Sinhanan Singh, Shri
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti	Ram Sewak, Shri	Sivapraghassan, Shri K.
Mohiuddin, Shri	Ram Singb, Shri	Sonsvane, Shri
Mohsin, Shri	Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.	Subramaniam, Shri C.
Morarka, Shri	Ramaswamy, Shri S. V.	Sumat Prasad, Shri
More, Shri K. L.	Ramdhani Das, Shri	Swaran Singh, Shri
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda	Rane, Shri	Tiwary, Shi D. N.
Murli Manohar, Shri	Rao, Dr. K. L.	Tiwary, Shri R. S.
Murthy, Shri B. S.	Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy	Tyagi, Shri
Musafir, Shri G. S.	Rao, Shri Muthyal	Uikey, Shri
Muthiah, Shri	Rao, Shri Rameshwar	Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Muzaffar Hussain, Shri	Rawandale, Shri	Valvi, Shri
Naidu, Shri V. G.	Ray, Shrimati Renuka	Varma, Shri Ravindra
Nallakoya, Shri	Reddi, B. Gopala	Verma, Shri Balgovind
Nanda, Shri	Reddiar, Shri	Virbhadra Singh, Shri
Nayak, Shri Mohan	Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda	Vyas, Shri Redheial
Nayar, Dr. Sushila	Roy, Shri Bishwanath	Wadiwa, Shri
Nigam, Shrimati Savitri	Saha, Dr. S. K.	Yadab, Shri N. P.
Niranjan Lal, Shri	Saigal, Shri A. S.	Yadava, Shri B. P.
Oza, Shri		
Paliwal, Shri		

श्री किशन पटनायक (सम्बलपुर) :

अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह सस्तीच्यूट मोशन अभी तक अंग्रेजी में है। हम ने हिन्दी में अपना प्रस्ताव दिया था। उस हमारे हिन्दी प्रस्ताव का अंग्रेजी में जो तर्जुमा हुआ है वह ठीक तरीके से नहीं हुआ है...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप अपना हिन्दी का प्रस्ताव पढ़ दीजिये।

श्री किशन पटनायक : हमने जो प्रस्ताव दिया है वह इस प्रकार है :—

“हिन्दी-पाक मामले में और दोनों देशों के अल्पसंख्यकों के बारे में

नेतृत्व विहीन हो कर भारत सरकार पूर्व बंगाल के अल्पसंख्यकों की सुरक्षा के लिए जरूरी प्रयत्न नहीं कर पाई, जिस से न सिर्फ मनुष्य धर्म का नाश हुआ है बल्कि हिन्दुस्तान के अल्पसंख्यकों को भी जब तब खतरा हुआ है, और पाकिस्तान के मोर्चे पर तनाव जारी रखते हुए देश पर दो-सामना वाले युद्ध का खतरा डाल दिया है।”

Mr. Speaker: Do they want that to be put to vote?

Shri Ram Sewak Padav (Bara Banki): Yes, Sir.

Mr. Speaker: There ought to be some seriousness. I have no objection and they have also the right to demand a division on each one of these motions. I can only appeal to them. Now, the question is:

“हिन्दी-पाक मामले में और दोनों देशों के अल्पसंख्यकों के बारे में नेतृत्व दिहीन हो कर भारत सरकार पूर्व बंगाल के अल्प-

संख्यकों की सुरक्षा के लिए जरूरी प्रयत्न नहीं कर पाई, जिससे न सिर्फ मनुष्य धर्म का नाश हुआ है बल्कि हिन्दुस्तान के अल्पसंख्यकों को भी जब तब खतरा हुआ है, और पाकिस्तान के मोर्चे पर तनाव जारी रखते हुए देश पर दो-सामना वाले युद्ध का खतरा डाल दिया है।” (२)

*The Lok Sabha divided: Ayes 20;
Noes 197.*

Division No. 2]

13.21 hrs.

AYES

Alvares, Shri
Barua, Shri Hem
Bheel, Shri P. H.
Dwivedy, Shri Surendranath
Gokaran Prasad, Shri
Jha, Shri Yogendra
Kamath, Shri Hari Vishau

Kapur Singh, Shri
Kohor, Shri
Krishnapal Singh, Shri
Mate, Shri
Mohan Swarup, Shri
Nath Pai, Shri
Ranga, Shri

Reddy, Shri Narasimha
Shastry, Shri Praksah Vir
Sighvi, Dr. L. M.
Verma, Shri S. L.
Vishram Prasad, Shri
Yadav, Shri Ram Sewak

N OES

Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Anjanappa, Shri
Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
Barkataki, Shrimati Renuka
Barman, Shri P. C.
Basappa, Shri
Basumateri, Shri
Baswant, Shri
Besra, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B. R.
Bhanja Deo, Shri L. N.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bhat, Shri J.B.S.
Borooh, Shri P. C.
Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
Brij Bai Lal, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P. R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotena
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandrasekhar, Shrimati

Chandriki, Shri
Chattar Singh, Shri
Charurvedi, Shri S. N.
Chaudhuri, Shri D. S.
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavda, Shrimati
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Dr. M. M.
Das, Shri B. K.
Das, Shri N. T.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dasappa, Shri
Dass, Shri G.
Deshmukh, Shri Shivaji Rao S.
Dey, Shri S. K.
Dhaon, Shri
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dighe, Shri
Dinesh Singh, Shri
Dubey, Shri R. G.
Elayaperumal, Shri
Ganapati Ram, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V. B.
Ghosh. Shri Atulya

Hajarnavis, Shri
Hansda, Shri Subodh
Hem Raj, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jamunadevi, Shrimati
Joshi, Shri A. C.
Joshi, Shrimati Subhadra
Jyotishi, Shri J. P.
Kamble, Shri
Kappen, Shri
Karuthjuman, Shri
Kayal, Shri P. N.
Kedaris, Shri C. M.
Khadilkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P. N.
Khan, Shri Osman Ali
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
Kindar Lal, Shri
Koujalgi, Shri H. V.
Kripa Shankar, Shri
Krishna, Shri M. R.
Krishnamachari, Shri T. T.
Kureel, Shri B. N.

Lakhan Das, Shri
 Lakshmi Kantamma, Shrimati
 Lalit Sen, Shri
 Laskar, Shri N. R.
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
 Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
 Mahtab, Shri
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
 Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
 Malaichami, Shri
 Mallick, Shri Ramachandra
 Manasa, Shri
 Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
 Maniyangadan, Shri
 Mantri, Shri
 Marandi, Shri
 Masuriya Din, Shri
 Matcharaju, Shri
 Mehdi, Shri S. A.
 Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
 Mehta, Shri J. R.
 Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
 Minimata, Shrimati
 Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
 Mohanty, Shri G.
 Mohiuddin, Shri
 Mohsin, Shri
 Morarka, Shri
 More, Shri K. L.
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda
 Murli Manohar, Shri
 Murthy, Shri B. S.
 Musafir, Shri G. S.
 Muthiah, Shri
 Naidu, Shri V. G.
 Nallakoya, Shri
 Nanda, Shri
 Nayak, Shri Mohan
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila
 Nigam, Shrimati Savitri
 Niranjana Lal, Shri

Oza, Shri
 Paliwal, Shri
 Pande, Shri K. N.
 Pandey, Shri R. S.
 Pandey Shri Vishwa Nath
 Panna Lal, Shri
 Paramasivan, Shri
 Patel, Shri N. N.
 Patel, Shri P. R.
 Patel, Shri Rajeshwar
 Patil, Shri S. B.
 Patil, Shri T. A.
 Patnaik, Shri B. C.
 Pattabhi Ramana, Shri
 Pillai, Shri Nataraja
 Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh, Shri
 Raghunath Singh, Shri
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodrabai
 Raja, Shri C. R.
 Rajdeo Singh, Shri
 Raju, Dr. D. S.
 Raju, Shri D. B.
 Ram Sewak, Shri
 Ram Singh, Shri
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.
 Ramaswamy, Shri S. V.
 Ramdhani Das, Shri
 Rane, Shri
 Rao, Dr. K. L.
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
 Rao, Shri Muthyal
 Rao, Shri Rameshwar
 Rawandale, Shri
 Ray, Shrimati Renuka
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
 Reddiar, Shri
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath
 Saha, Dr. S. K.
 Saigal, Shri A. S.
 Samanta, Shri S. C.

Samnani, Shri
 Sarma, Shri A. T.
 Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
 Sen, Shri P. G.
 Shankuntala Devi, Shrimati
 Shankaraiya, Shri
 Sharma, Shri A. P.
 Sharma, Shri D. C.
 Shashi Ranjan, Shri
 Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
 Shinde, Shri
 Shinkre, Shri M. P.
 Shree Narayan Das, Shri
 Shyamkali Devi, Shrimati
 Siddananappa, Shri
 Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
 Singh, Shri R. P.
 Singha, Shri G. K.
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
 Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
 Sinhasan Singh, Shri
 Sivapraghassan, Shri K.
 Sonavane, Shri
 Subramaniam, Shri C.
 Sumat Prasad, Shri
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
 Swaran Singh, Shri
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.
 Tiwary, Shri R. S.
 Tyagi, Shri
 Ukey, Shri
 Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
 Valvi, Shri
 Varma, Shri Ravindra
 Verma, Shri Balgovind
 Virbhadra Singh, Shri
 Vyas, Shri Radhelal
 Wadiwa, Shri
 Yadab, Shri N. P.
 Yadava, Shri B. P.

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Speaker: I shall now put to vote Shri Mukerjee's motion to the vote of the House. The question is:

"This House, having considered the situation arising out of the communal disturbances in East Pakistan resulting in heavy loss of life and property of the members of minority community and their influx to India and consequential disturbances in West Bengal, is of opinion that the Government of India has failed to—

(a) take adequately strong measures to compel the Pakis-

tan Government to respect the rights of the minority community in East Pakistan;

(b) liberalise adequately the migration facilities to enable all those to come over from East Pakistan who want to;

(c) rehabilitate about 1½ million refugees who had earlier come over from East Pakistan, thereby making them a prey to frustration and discontent;

(d) curb reactionary communal forces in India who, by

[Mr. Speaker]

advocating a policy of retaliation against the Muslim minority in India as a reply to Pakistani oppression of Hindus, strike at the root of India's secular and democratic principles; and

(e) ensure timely and effective protection by the West Bengal State administration of lives and property of the Muslim minority in Calcutta and other places, thus necessitating deployment of the army there." (3).

The Lok Sabha divided: Ayes 12;
Noes 195.

Division No. 3]

[13.24 hrs.

AYES

Chakravarti, Shrimati Renu
Chatterjee, Shri H. P.
Chatterjee, Shri N. C.
Gopalan, Shri A. K.

Gupta, Shri Indrajit
Manoharan, Shri
Mukerjee, Shri H. N.
Nambiar, Shri

Roy, Dr. Saradish
Sen, Dr. Ranen
Utiya, Shri
Warior, Shri

NOES

Abdul Wahid Shri T
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati
Anjanappa, Shri
Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
Bal Krishna Singh, Shri
Barkataki, Shrimati Renuka
Barman, Shri P. C.
Barupal, Shri P. L.
Basappa, Shri
Basumatari,
Baswant, Shri
Besra, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B. R.
Bhanja Deo, Shri L. N.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bist, Shri J. B. S.
Borooh, Shri P. C.
Brajeswar Prasad, Shri
Brij Basi Lal, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P. R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandrasekhar, Shrimati
Chandriki, Shri
Chattar Singh, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S. N.
Chaudhuri, Shri D. S.
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Chavda, Shrimati
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Dr. M. M.
Das, Shri B. K.
Das, Shri N. T.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dasappa, Shri
Dass, Shri G.
Deshmukh, Shri Shivaji Rao S.

Dey, Shri S. K.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dighe, Shri
Dinesh Singh, Shri
Dubey, Shri R. G.
Elayaperumal, Shri
Ganapati Ram, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V. B.
Ghosh, Shri Atulya
Hajarnavis, Shri
Hanada, Shri
Hem Raj, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jamunadevi, Shrimati
Joshi, Shri A. C.
Joshi, Shrimati Subhadra
Jyotishi, Shri J. P.
Kamble, Shri
Kappen, Shri
Karuthiruman, Shri
Kayal, Shri P. N.
Kedaria, Shri C. M.
Khadilkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P. N.
Khan, Shri Osman, Ali
Khan, Shri Shahnewaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
Kindar Lal, Shri
Koujalgi, Shri H. V.
Kripa Shankar, Shri
Krishna, Shri M. R.
Krishnamachari, Shri T. T.
Kureel, Shri B. N.
Lakhan Das, Shri
Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati
Lalit Sen, Shri
Laskar, Shri N. R.
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati

Mahadeo, Prasad Shri
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
Mahtab, Shri
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
Malaiichami, Shri
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
Manaan, Shri
Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
Mantri, Shri
Marandi, Shri
Masava Din, Shri
Matchara, Shri
Mehdi, Shri S. A.
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
Mehta, Shri J. R.
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
Minimata, Shrimati
Mishra, Shri Bibhuti
Mohanty, Shri G.
Mohiuddin, Shri
Mobsin, Shri
Morarka, Shri
More, Shri K. L.
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda
Murli Manohar, Shri
Mhony Shri B. S.
Musafir, Shri G. S.
Muthiah, Shri
Naidu, Shri V. G.
Nallakoya, Shri
Nanda, Shri
Nayak, Shri Mohan
Nayar, Dr. Sushila
Nigam Shrimati Savitri
Niranjan Lal, Shri
Oza, Shri
Paliwal, Shri
Pande, Shri K. N.

NOES—contd

y, Shri R. S.	Rane, Shri	Shyamkumari Devi, Shrimati
Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath	Rao, Dr. K. L.	Siddananjappa, Shri
Panna Lal, Shri	Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy	Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
Paramasivan, Shri	Rao, Shri Muthyal	Singha, Shri G. K.
Patel, Shri N. N.	Rao, Shri Rameshwar	Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
Patel, Shri P. R.	Rawandale, Shri	Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
Patel, Shri Rajeshwar	Ray, Shrimati Renuka	Sinhasan Singh, Shri
Patil, Shri S. B.	Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala	Sivapraghassan, Shri K.
Patil, Shri T. A.	Reddiar, Shri	Sonavane, Shri
Patnaik, Shri B. C.	ReJdy, Shrimati Yashoda	Subramaniam, Shri C.
Pattabhi Raman, Shri C. R.	oy, Shri Bishwanath	Sumat Prasad, s
Pillai, Shri Nataraja	Saha, Dr. S. K.	Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
Prabhakar, Shri Naval	Saigal, Shri A. S.	Swaran Singh, Shri
Pratap Singh, Shri	Samanta, Shri S. C.	Tiwary, Shri D. N.
Raghunath Singh, Shri	Sammani, Shri	Tiwary, Shri R. S.
Raghuramaiah, Shri	Sarma, Shri A. T. J	Tyagi, Shri
Rai, Shrimati Sahodrabai	Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati	Uikey, Shri
Raja, Shri G. R.	Sen, Shri P. G.	Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
Rajdeo Singh, Shri	Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati	Valvi, Shri
Raju, Dr. D. S.	Shankaraiya, Shri	Varma, Shri Ravindra
Raju, Shri D. B.	Sharma, Shri A. P.	Verma, Shri Balgovind
Ram Sewak, Shri	Sharma, Shri D. C.	Virbhadra Singh, Shri
Ram Singh, Shri	Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur	Vyas, Shri Radhelal
Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.	Shinde, Shri	Wadiwa, Shri
Ramaswamy, Shri S. V.	Shinkre, Shri M. P.	Yadaba, Shri N. P.
Ramdhani Das, Shri	Shree Narayan Das, Shri	Yadava, Shri B. P.

The motion was negatived.

Shrimati Renuka Ray: Sir, In view of the hon. Minister's assurance, I withdraw my amendment.

Mr. Speaker: Has the hon. Member leave of the House to withdraw her substitute motion?

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

Shri Tridib Kumar Chaudhuri: Sir, I do not press my motion.

Mr. Speaker: Has the hon. Member leave of the House to withdraw his substitute motion?

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

Mr. Speaker: Shri Brij Raj Singh is not here.

Shri Bade: It may be put to vote.

Mr. Speaker: It has to be put to vote once it has been moved, as the hon. Mover is not here. The question is:

"This House, having considered the situation arising out of the communal disturbances in East

Pakistan resulting in heavy loss of life and property of the members of minority community and their influx to India and consequential disturbances in West Bengal, is of opinion that the Government of India has utterly failed to—

(a) take effective steps to fulfil the solemn assurances given to the minority in East Pakistan at the time of Pakistan that the life, property and honour of Hindus left there will be protected and they will be ensured equal treatment;

(b) ensure safe transit to the intending Hindu emigrant to India;

(c) remove all restriction on the entry of Hindus from East Pakistan to West Bengal;

(d) educate and mobilise the world opinion against the persistent genocide of Hindu minority in East Pakistan, whose number has been reduced from 16 million to 9 million;

[Mr. Speaker]

(e) take reciprocal action against the closure of India's Deputy High Commissioner's Office at Rajshahi;

(f) abrogate agreement to transfer Beruwari to Pakistan which amounts to destruction and sure death of ten thousand Hindus of that area;

(g) curb the activities of pro-Pakistan elements in Calcutta and other neighbouring areas in West Bengal who instigated communal riots there; and

(h) get rid of the Pakistani Nationals serving in Dockyard and other key services of West Bengal."

The Lok Sabha divided: Ayes 8; Noes 196.

Division No. 4]

AYES

[13.38 hrs.]

Bade, Shri
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Bhawani, Shri Lakhmu]

Bheel, Shri P. H.
Gokaran Prasad, Shri]
Reddy, Shri Nerasimha

Trivedi, Shri U. M.
Verma, Shri S. L.

NOES

Abdul Wahid, Shri T.
Achal Singh, Shri
Achuthan, Shri
Akkamma Devi, Shrimati]
Anjanappa, Shri
Azad, Shri Bhagwat Jha
Barkataki, Shrimati Renuka
Barman, Shri P. C.
Barupal, Shri P. L.
Basappa, Shri
Basumatari, Shri
Baswant Shri
Besra, Shri
Bhagat, Shri B. R.
Bhanja Deo, Shri L. N.
Bhatkar, Shri
Bist, Shri J. B. S.
Borooh, Shri P. C.
Brajeshwar Prasad, Shri
Brij Basi Lal, Shri
Chakraverti, Shri P. R.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna
Chandrabhan Singh, Shri
Chandrasekhar, Shrimati
Chandriki, Shri
Chattar Singh, Shri
Chaturvedi, Shri S. N.
Chaudhuri, Shri D. S.
Chaudhuri, Shri Sachindra
Daljit Singh, Shri
Das, Dr. M. M.
Das, Shri B. K.
Das, Shri N. T.
Das, Shri Sudhansu
Dasappa, Shri
Das, Shri G.
Deshmukh, Shri Shivaji Rao S.

Dey, Shri S. K.
Dhaon, Shri
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri
Dighe, Shri
Dinesh Singh, Shri
Dubey, Shri R. G.
Elayaperumal, Shri
Ganspati Ram, Shri
Gandhi, Shri V. B.
Ghosh, Shri Atulya
Hajarnavis, Shri
Hansda, Shri Subodh
Hem Raj, Shri
Iqbal Singh, Shri
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas
Jomunadevi, Shrimati
Joshi, Shri A. C.
Jgshi, Shrimati Subhadra
Jyotishi, Shri J. P.
Kamble, Shri
Kappen, Shri
Karuthiruman, Shri
Kayal, Shri P. N.
Kedaria, Shri C. M.
Khadiilkar, Shri
Khan, Dr. P. N.
Khan, Shri Osman Ali
Khan, Shri Shah Nawaz
Khanna, Shri Mehr Chand
Kindar Lal, Shri
Koujalgi, Shri H. V.
Kripa Shanker, Shri
Krishna, Shri M. R.
Krishnamachari, Shri T. T.
Kureel, Shri B. N.
Lakhan Das, Shri
Lakshminathanamma, Shrimati]

Lalit Sen, Shri
Laskar, Shri N. R.
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
Mahadeo Prasad, Shri
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
Mahtab, Shri
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
Maimoona Sultan, Shrimati
Malajchami, Shri
Mallick, Shri Rama Chandra
Manaen, Shri
Mandal, Shri Yamuna Prasad
Maniyangadan, Shri
Mantri, Shri
Marandi, Shri
Masuriya Din, Shri
Matcharaju, Shri
Mehdi, Shri S. A.
Mehrotra, Shri Braj Bihari
Mehta, Shri J. R.
Mengi, Shri Gopal Datt
Minimata, Shrimati
Mtshra, Shri Bibhuti
Mohac'y, Shri G.
Mohiuddin, Shri
Mohsin, Shri
Morarka, Shri
More, Shri K. L.
Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda
Murli Manohar, Shri
Murthy, Shri B. S.
Musafir, Shri G. S.
Muthiah, Shri
Neidu, Shri V. G.
Nallakoya, Shri
Nanda, Shri
Nayak, Shri Mohan

NOES—contd.

Nayar, Dr. Sushila
 Ntgam, Shrimati Savitri
 Niranjan Lal, Shri
 Oza, Shri
 Paliwal, Shri
 Pande, Shri K. N.
 Pandey, Shri R. S.
 Pandey, Shri Vishwa Nath
 Panna Lal, Shri
 Paremasivan, Shri
 Patel, Shri N. N.
 Patel, Shri P. R.
 Patel, Shri Rajeshwar
 Patil, Shri S. B.
 Patil, Shri T. A.
 Patnaik, Shri B. C.
 Pattabhi Ramana, Shri C. R.
 Pallai, Shri Nataraja
 Prabhakar, Shri Naval
 Pratap Singh, Shri
 Raghunath Singh, Shri
 Raghuramaiah, Shri
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodrabai
 Raja, Shri G. R.
 Rajdeo Singh, Shri
 Raju, Dr. D. S.
 Raju, Shri D. B.
 Ram Sewak, Shri
 Ram Singh, Shri

Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.
 Ramaswamy, Shri S. V.
 Ramdhan Das, Shri
 Rane, Shri
 Rao, Dr. K. L.
 Rao, Shri Krishnamoorthy
 Rao, Shri Muthyal
 Rao, Shri Rameshwar
 Rawandale, Shri
 Ray, Shrimati Renuka
 Reddi, Dr. B. Gopala
 Reddjar, Shri
 Reddy, Shrimati Yashoda
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath
 Saha, Dr. S. K.
 Saigal, Shri A. S.
 Samanta, Shri S. C.
 Samnani, Shri
 Sarma, Shri A. T.
 Satyabhama Devi, Shrimati
 Sen, Shri P. G.
 Shakuntala Devi, Shrimati
 Shankaraiya, Shri
 Sharma, Shri A. P.
 Sharma, Shri D. C.
 Shastri, Shri Lal Bahadur
 Shinde, Shri
 Shinkre, Shri M. P.

Shyamkumari Devi, Shrimati
 Shree Narayan Das, Shri
 Siddananjappa, Shri
 Sidheshwar Prasad, Shri
 Singh, Shri R. P.
 Singha, Shri G. K.
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan
 Sinha, Shrimati Tarkeshwari
 Sindhuan Singh, Shri
 Sivapraghasan Shri K.
 Sonavane, Shri
 Subramaniam, Shri C.
 Sumat Prasad, Shri
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
 Swaran Singh, Shri
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.
 Tiwary, Shri R. S.
 Tyagi, Shri
 Uikay, Shri
 Upadhyaya, Shri Shiva Dutt
 Valvi, Shri
 Varma, Shri Ravindra
 Verma, Shri Balgovind
 Virbhadra Singh, Shri
 Vyas, Shri Radhelal
 Wadiwa, Shri
 Yadab, Shri N. P.
 Yadava, Shri B. P.

The motion was negatived.

Mr. Speaker: I need not put the original motion. We take up the next item of business.

13.28 hrs.

MOTION ON ADDRESS BY THE VICE-PRESIDENT DISCHARGING THE FUNCTIONS OF THE PRESIDENT.

Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri (Ghatal): I beg to move:

“That an Address be presented to the Vice-President discharging the functions of the President in the following terms:—

“That the Members of Lok Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the Vice-President discharging the functions of the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on the 10th February, 1964.”

Shri Hari Vishnu Kamath (Hoshangabad): What is the allocation of time for the debate?

Mr. Speaker: We will see to it later on.

Shri Sachindra Chaudhuri: While moving this motion, I wish to add my personal gratitude for the gracious Address that the Vice-President has been pleased to deliver.

Sir, I wish to add my own personal thanks also to the Vice-President for the gracious way in which it has been his pleasure to review the happenings of the last year and to invite us to our duties in Parliament. The speech has been distinguished for its clarity and its succinctness, and it is an entirely objective approach to the problems which are before us. There has been a warning that we have passed through difficult times and further difficulties are ahead of us. Equally, there has been a quiet optimism of the performances of this country and this Government. He has