

17.07 hrs.

CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER OF
URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE

REPORTED SALE OF GIRLS FROM
KERALA IN EUROPE

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त (दिल्ली सदर) :
अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं अविलम्बनीय लोक-महत्व
के निम्नलिखित विषय की ओर वंदेशिक-कार्य
मंत्री का ध्यान दिलाता हूँ और प्रार्थना करता
हूँ कि वह इसके बारे में एक वक्तव्य दें।

बलात् भिक्षुणियाँ (नन) बनाने के लिए
केरल तथा देश के अन्य भागों से यूरोप की
लड़कियों की भारी संख्या में कथित बिक्री
और इसे रोकने के लिए सरकार द्वारा
की गई कार्यवाही।

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL
AFFAIRS (SHRI SWARAN SINGH) : Sir,
a question had been raised in this House
in 1968 in regard to the treatment meted out
to Indian girls from Kerala, working as
nurses in Federal Republic of Germany.
Inquiries were made through our Embassy
as well as the Government of Kerala.
It was found that up to 1968, about 262 girls
had gone to Federal Republic of Germany
to be trained as nurses and that they
were generally satisfied with their condi-
tions of training and living. The Govern-
ment of Kerala had then made inquiries from
the parents of the girls who had gone abroad
and found that no complaints were being
made. In pursuance of another question,
notice of which was received about a year
ago, that some girls from Kerala were being
sent abroad for initiation as nuns, after
making some payments to their parents,
inquiries were again made but nothing spec-
ific came to notice. Government view with con-
cern the latest reports and a comprehensive in-
quiry has been undertaken by our agencies in
India and abroad. The Government of Kerala
have also been requested to undertake similar
inquiries. On the basis of these inquiries,
such remedial action as may be found neces-
sary will be undertaken and the results of
the inquiries as well as the action taken will
be placed before the House in due course.

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : हमारे देश की कुछ
लड़कियाँ विदेशों को इस तरह से भेजे जाने के
समाचार से न केवल इस देश को परन्तु सारे
संसार के लोगों को जबर्दस्त धक्का लगा है।
अब इस समाचार पर कुछ पर्दा डालने की
कोशिश हो रही है। हमारे देश की लगभग दो
हजार लड़कियाँ यूरोप इस तरह से भेजी गई हैं।
जिस तरह से इनको भेजा गया है उसको बीसवीं
सदी की स्लेव ट्रेड के अलावा और कुछ संज्ञा
नहीं दी जा सकती है।

यह कहा गया है कि वे अपनी मर्जी से गई
हैं। यह भी कहा गया है कि वे हायर एजुकेशन
के लिए जाती हैं। यह भी कहा गया है कि वे
आर एंजल्ज आफ इंडिया और वे प्रिसली लिविंग
कर रही हैं। लेकिन वे गाँवों की लड़कियाँ हैं।
उनमें से शायद आधी से ज्यादा ऐसी हैं जिन्होंने
मैट्रिक भी पास नहीं किया है, जिन्होंने शहर
देखा भी नहीं है, अंग्रेजी जो जानती नहीं हैं,
इतालवी भाषा जानने का तो सवाल ही पंदा
नहीं होता है। उनकी गरीबी का नाजायज
फायदा उठा कर उनको ले जाया गया है। आधी
से ज्यादा लड़कियाँ माइनर हैं। उनको सुहावनी
तस्वीर दिखाई गई है, हवाई जहाज की सैर
करने का लालच दिया गया है। एक तरह से
उनको ट्रैप किया गया है। मैं कहूँगा कि यह
जबर्दस्त रंकट है बीसवीं सदी का रिलिजस फील्ड
में और सबसे बड़ा रंकट है। मैं कोट करना
चाहता हूँ मद्रास के एक कैथोलिक प्रीस्ट को।
रोम में जब वे शिक्षा लेने के लिए गईं तो उनकी
लड़कियों से जो बातचीत हुई, जो इम्प्रेशन उनका
बना, उन्होंने बताया है। मैं उनको कोट कर
रहा हूँ :

"To go abroad is alluring and that too
by aeroplane. Then there is always the
promise that they will return to India
after some time as full fledged nuns.
So there is no shortage of girls who are
willing to go to Rome to become nuns.
But I would like to consider the follow-
ing points concerning the girls themself-
selves. The majority of them have not
passed even SSLC. It looks to me that

[श्री कंवर लाल गुप्त]

a good many of them have not even reached maturity. I say this having in mind the importance, physically and psychologically, the stage of the attainment of maturity has for girls. Many of them come from family surroundings where they seem to have thought that going abroad would be a good solution to their problems. So, there is no wonder that the parents permitted them. If these girls had educational qualifications, if they had the age and maturity to take the decision about life and not merely be enamoured by the prospects of going abroad, and if they had an inkling of the sort of life they are to expect in that part of the world, I am perfectly sure that practically none of them would have left their homes inspite of whatever difficulties they had to put up with at home."

उन्होंने भी कहा है कि उन में मेच्योरिटी नहीं है। 17 या 18 साल की उम्र में कहीं मेच्योरिटी आती है। इस आयु में किसी लड़की से यह आशा करना कि भगवान की तलाश में वह अपना जीवन दे देगी, बिल्कुल गलत बात होगी। तथ्य यह है कि उनकी गरीबी का नाजायज फायदा उठा कर उनको ट्रैप किया गया है। यह कहते हैं कि वे एंजल्ज आफ भारत हैं और बाहर के लोगों ने, विदेशियों ने हिन्दुस्तान की जो सेवा की है उसके बदले में अब कहीं से लोग वहाँ जा कर सेवा करें। अगर ये क्वालिफाइड होती, पढ़ी लिखी होती, एडल्ट होती, मेच्योर होती, महिलायें होती या पुरुष इससे कोई अन्तर नहीं पड़ता है, तो मैं समझ सकता था कि वे जा कर एंजल्ज आफ भारत हो सकती हैं, कुछ क्राइस्ट का पैगाम दे सकती हैं। लेकिन छोटी-छोटी लड़कियाँ हैं। आप देखें कि उन से काम क्या करवाया जा रहा है? मीनियल्ज का काम करवाया जा रहा है। यह कहा जाता है कि वहाँ नन्ज की कमी है। वहाँ नंज दो तरह की होती है। एक ले नंज और दूसरी रेग्युलर नंज। ले नंज का काम यह होता है कि सफाई बगैरह करना, नर्सिस का काम करना, इसी तरह के

दूसरे छोटे छोटे काम करना। घर की नौकरी का काम भी कई जगह उन से कराया जाता है। उस तरह का काम जो आज इटेलियन लड़कियाँ या विदेशी लड़कियाँ करने को तैयार नहीं हैं, इनसे कराया जाता है और इन कामों के लिए इनको यहाँ से ले जाया जाता है।

यह भी कहा जाता है कि वहाँ इनकी शार्टेंज है। रेग्युलर नंज तो हैं लेकिन मीनियल्ज का काम, डॉमैस्टिक काम करने वाली से नंज की कमी है। मेरी सूचना यह है कि कुछ डॉमैस्टिक हाउसिस में भी इन लड़कियों को काम करने के लिए लगाया गया है।

मैं एक पत्र पढ़ना चाहता हूँ। यह कहा गया है कि बड़े आराम से ये वहाँ हैं। एक लड़की ने अपनी बहन को एक पत्र लिखा। उस को भेजने नहीं दिया गया। वह पत्र सैंडे टाइम्स के हाथ लग गया। उसी पत्र का कुछ हिस्सा मैं आपके सामने पढ़ रहा हूँ :

"My dear younger sister,

None of you should hereafter get ready to come to Europe. After all, we are trapped. If only you see the pockets (of those priests who betrayed us) getting filled, today we are tasting those sugary words that have fallen from their mouths."

MR. SPEAKER : Please ask a question; do not indulge in debate. Do not distort the procedure all the time.

SHRI N. SREEKANTAN NAIR (Quilon): Sir, this is an important matter. We are much concerned in this issue. Of course, we are prepared to serve, we are prepared to sweep even the rooms of anybody, but not this kind of work. During all the three five year Plans, the Government has not done anything. No industries have been started. So, we are going there only to earn. (Interruption)

श्री कंवर लाल गुप्त : अध्यक्ष महोदय यह सारे देश की इज्जत का सवाल है, किसी कम्युनिटी का सवाल नहीं है। एक लड़की का 6500

रुपया यानी तीन हजार डालर उन से लिया जाता है और खर्चा केवल 1500 होता है। एक तरफ का किराया रोम का ढाई सौ रुपया स्टुडेंट का आधा कन्सेशन मिल कर होता है। अब बाकी पंसा कहा जाता है, समझ में नहीं आता है।

अब ये कहते हैं कि कुछ नहीं है। अगर कुछ नहीं है तो वैंटिकन ने यह रिस्कूमेंट बन्द क्यों किया है, उसका मतलब क्या है? साफ मतलब है कि देवर इज समर्थिग फिरसी। खुद भी इन-क्वायरी करना शुरू कर दिया है। इसका मतलब साफ है कि उन्होंने भी मान लिया है कि कुछ गड़बड़ जरूर है, यह बात मंत्री महोदय को या गवर्नमेंट को कई सालों से मालूम थी। इसके बारे में सवाल भी किए गए थे। आज सरकार कहती है कि इनक्वायरी में कुछ नहीं निकला। अब वह कम्प्रिहेंसिव इनक्वायरी करेंगी। यह बात बहुत ही शर्मनाक है। यह इनकी क्रिमिनल नैग्लिजेंस है। नेशनल कंथोलिक रिपोर्टर जो अमरीका में छपता है, उस में यह सवाल पहले पहल उठा था। उसके बाद मद्रास के एक पेपर ने निकाला। अब सब बातें रेग्युलरी निकलती आ रही हैं। लेकिन सरकार इतनी देर तक सोए क्यों रही? पहले इसने कम्प्रिहेंसिव इनक्वायरी क्यों नहीं की?

मैं यह भी जानना चाहता हूँ कि स्टडीज के लिए पासपोर्ट क्यों दिया गया? वे लड़कियाँ तो मेट्रिक भी नहीं थीं। अगर कोई दूसरा आदमी पासपोर्ट इस आधार पर लेना चाहता है तो आप कहते हैं कि भारत में एजुकेशन हो सकती है तो आप बाहर क्यों जाना चाहते हैं। लेकिन यहाँ यह सालों तक चलता रहा। आडिनरी आदमी को तो आप पासपोर्ट देते नहीं हायर एजुकेशन के लिए तो इनको आपने कैसे दे दिये?

जो रुपया आया तीन सौ पाउंड पर गल, वह कैसे आया, क्यों आया, खर्च कैसे हुआ? इस सब की इनक्वायरी सरकार ने क्यों नहीं की?

स्टडी के वास्ते स्टुडेंट कंसेशन कैसे दिया गया? वह रुपया किस के पास गया? बापको सुन कर आश्चर्य होगा कि वे स्कालरशिप पर गई लेकिन जब वे इटली में पहुँची तो वहाँ की पुलिस ने उनके नाम के आगे लिख दिया एज रिजिजस। दे वर मार्कड एज रिजिजस। कोई पढ़ाई वगैरह नहीं हुई। जो नन बनने के लिए गई उनको आपने स्कालरशिप के बहाने पढ़ाई का सर्तिफिकेट दे कर भेज दिया। यह क्यों और कैसे हुआ?

अपनी मर्जी से लड़कियाँ गयीं या जबर्दस्ती उनको लालच दे कर ले जाया गया। यह भी देखने वाली बात है। उड़ीसा, मध्य प्रदेश वगैरह में कानून है। आगे इस प्रकार की घटनाओं पर काबू पाया जा सके ओह इस चीज को रेग्युलेट किया जा सके और पता लगाया जा सके कि कोई लड़की गरीबी की वजह से जा रही है या कनवर्शन हो रहा है, जबर्दस्ती हो रहा है या वालंटरी हो रहा है और इन सब के बारे में क्या आप कोई सेंट्रल लेजिस्लेशन बनायेंगे?

क्रिस्चियन मिशनरीज का जो रोल रहा है, उन में से कुछ लोगों का तो हाईली ऑब्जर्वेशनबिल रहा है। 14 फारेन क्रिस्चियन मिशनरीज एन्टी-नेशनल एक्टिविटीज की वजह से देश से निकाले गये हैं। हमारे यहाँ 6,326 फारेन क्रिस्चियन मिशनरीज हैं और इन पर 200 करोड़ रुपया सालाना खर्च करते हैं। क्रिस्चियन मिशनरीज को इंडियनाइज करने के लिए उन की जगह पर हिन्दुस्तानी लोग हों, उस के लिए सरकार क्या कर रही है?

मंत्री महोदय ने कहा है कि वह इनक्वायरी करेंगे। यह इनक्वायरी केरल गवर्नमेंट नहीं कर सकती है और वैंटिकन नहीं कर सकता है। मैं मांग करता हूँ कि सी० बी० आई० के जरिये यह इनक्वायरी होनी चाहिये और हमारे मिशनरिज के साथ, एक-एक लड़की के साथ बातचीत कर के, उन के को-आपरेशन से, यह पता लगाया जाये

[श्री कंवर लाल गुप्त]

कि इस में जबर्दस्ती हुई है या नहीं।

क्या यह सही है कि

* * *

कुछ लोग उस में गिरफ्तार भी हुए हैं।
(अवधान) यह अखबारों में निकला है।

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA (Barh): This is not Proper. Mr Gupta must talk with a certain restraint. (Interruptions)

SHRI VASUDEVAN NAIR (Peermade): This kind of thing should not go on record. He is speaking non-sense. We have got some self-respect. He should withdraw it. (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I am not going to allow this. (Interruptions)

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: If anybody thinks that I am casting any aspersion on ladies, I am prepared to withdraw it. I have absolutely no such intention.

MR. SPEAKER: As I said this morning, this will be only a fact finding statement by the Minister, because we are not very certain about the whole position. Our own daughters are involved in this. We are not sure of any position. Even if there are remote reflections, I do not think it is desirable unless we are sure of the position. You should be very much restrained in your observation. I am not going to allow that observation to be on the record.

श्री कंवर लाल गुप्त: आखिर में मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि प्राइम मिनिस्टर से क्या बात हुई है और उन्होंने क्या कहा है।

श्री जगन्नाथ राव जोशी (धोपाल): अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने स्वयं 1968 में यह सवाल किया था और सरकार की तरफ से बताया गया था कि दि इनफॉर्मेशन इज बियंग क्लेक्टिड। लेकिन सरकार द्वारा दी गई आज की इनफॉर्मेशन में भी बिल्कुल डेफिनेटेस नहीं है।

MR. SPEAKER: I think we should observe full restraint in this discussion.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH: I am fully conscious of the delicate nature of this question and it is for this reason that I will try to confine myself to the specific questions that have been put. In fairness to the House, I must give this information that it was for the first time in the Sunday Times of London on August 23, 1970 that reports to this effect appeared. This has been quoted by my friend, Mr. Kanwar Lal Gupta, in which it was mentioned that they had uncovered cases of at least three girls in the Italian Convents who had suffered nervous breakdown because of home sickness, etc.

In the newspaper of 25th August, 1970 that is, two days later, denials have appeared of the contentions made in the Sunday Times from various quarters, including the Vatican, the Archbishop of Trevarum, the Archbishop of Ernakulam and others... (Interruption).

It is stated that the story in the Sunday Times owes its origin to two feuding members of the clergy in Kerala, Father Sebastian Valiyal of Palai and father Cyriac Puttempera. The former accused the latter of procuring girls for convents in Europe. After 18 months of investigation the Vatican is reported to have issued a statement last July clearing Father Puthenpara of the charge. In this background we have to view whatever might appear in the newspapers with a certain degree of caution.

Coming to the specific question that he has put, he asked, that if we knew for several years why we did not make inquiries earlier. Inquiries were made earlier and I have stated in my reply that nothing fishy was discovered.

The second question he asked was why was a passport for study issued. The House is, no doubt, aware that the present rules for issuing passports are very liberal and it is only in very exceptional cases, laid down by the Act of Parliament, that we can refuse the issue of a passport.

The third question was whether any money has passed. I have said that because this

matter has been raised here, it has also appeared in the foreign press and the honour of our womanhood is involved, we will make all possible inquiries. But let us not make it religious issue.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA : Who is making it a religious issue ?

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : You are making it a religious issue; the Jana Sangh is making it a religious issue.

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK (South Delhi) : Your communal feeling comes out every time.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA : I have never raised any communal issue. This is a national issue. You are making it a communal issue.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : Shri Kanwar Lal Gupta should have been sobered by the reaction that he created among Kerala Members. The Jana Sangh should be sober enough... (Interruption). I do not give way..... (Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : Whatever Shri Kanwar Lal Gupta has said, he never made it a communal issue. It is only in the Communal mind of the Minister. His words are casting an aspersion... (Interruption)

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I will not give way...(Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK :not only on Shri Kanwar Lal Gupta but on the whole party. He should withdraw his words(Interruption)

SHRI JAGANNATH RAO JOSHI : The country's honour is involved...(Interruption)

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I do not give way...(Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : Look at the record. What did Shri Kanwar Lal Gupta say which had a ny communal taint ? you find that out.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I Will find out. You put a supplementary question... (Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : It is very wrong and very unfair on your part.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : The other question that he asked was about the money part. I have said that on that I have no information but we will make inquiries. if it is proved, it is very serious.

Fourthly, he said whether they have gone there on their own accord, according to the inquiries made so far, they were grown up girls and there is nothing to show that any coercion, inducement or force was used.

The fifth question was the general question about the foreign Christian missionaries. This is a question which does not arise out of this. I do not see why season and out of season he should raise an issue which has been discussed on several occasions and about which our position has been made clear.

As to what should be the agency of inquiry, no agency is barred. We will surely use all our resources of investigation in order to arrive at the truth. But I would again appeal to hon. Members if I have offended them, it was not my intention that while making such statements or putting these questions one should be very cautious of the religious susceptibilities of all people, particularly so of the Christian minorities. It is very wrong for anybody to import a taint in this and thus worsen the situation. That is not proper..... (Interruption)

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA : On a point of order, Sir.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDI (Kendrapara) : May I request you to stop anybody from putting questions on this matter since the whole atmosphere is vitiated by the sort of problems raised in this question ? The country was exercised by the problem but the twist given to the problem, I do not think, adds to the prestige of this nation. I would request you to stop further questions.. (Interruption)

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैंने सवाल पूछा था कि कोई सेंट्रल एक्ट बनाया जायगा जिस से यह रेगुलेट हो ?

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : This is a suggestion for action which I am not prepared to answer in response to a Call Attention Notice.

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : सी० बी० आई० एन्वयरी क्यों नहीं कराना चाहते ? आखिर कौन जिम्मेदारों लेगा ? यह एक सवाल का जवाब नहीं देते । कौन एजेंसी जिम्मेदार होगी ? सी० बी० आई० से एन्वयरी करायेंगे या किस से करायेंगे ?

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA : Sir, the hon. Minister himself has said in his reply that in the reports it has been mentioned that there was a rivalry between two persons of high position in churches and that is why this kind of controversy arose. But, at the same time, the hon. Minister has himself said that when the question was raised two years back, an inquiry was conducted and nothing was found out.

I would like to know from the hon. Minister whether, at that time, he was satisfied about this international exchange of missionary personnel that was taking place in a normal course for the purpose of teaching or educational purpose or nursing purpose, coming here from abroad or going abroad from here. If the hon. Minister was satisfied, why did he not clarify this position when he assured the House that the information was being collected ?

Then, the hon. Minister, unfortunately, wants to take advantage and wants to do propaganda only on the basis of communalism. The whole question was not asked on the basis of communalism. All this has been reported in a paper coming from abroad. If the hon. Minister does not know, let me inform him that two years back, when he said that the information was being collected—I do not know what kind of information Department you have—a paper from America, in Kansas, published all these reports and, later on,

those reports appeared in one of the Christian magazines coming out from Tamil Nadu. The Government of India did not know about it. As usual, the Government of India does not know anything. The left hand does not know what the right hand is doing. This information was coming out in our papers, in the magazines published by the Christian missionaries and Christian institutions. This is most unfortunate that the hon. Minister has introduced in this matter the question of majority and minority.....

SOME HON. MEMBERS : Shame, shame !

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA : I would like to tell the hon. Minister that the Vatican sitting thousand of miles from here is much more concerned about those girls in the Christian institutions than this wretched Government of India. It does not know anything. They call for information from abroad. Nothing is known to the Government of India. Let us accept this fact that there is a lot of concern to the Vatican and to the Christian missionaries. All this information has been given in the *Sunday Times* by one of the Christian missionaries. Their concern is more about this matter than that of the Government of India who are sleeping over it and doing nothing about it till the whole world knows about it.

SHRI N. SREEKANTAN NAIR : What is the question that you want to ask ?
(*Interruption*)

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA : Let the hon. Member allow me to complete my question and he will know what I am asking about. I am first charging the Government of India who are responsible for inaction on the reports appearing about our girls. I have myself said that if it is a normal exchange of personnel for the purpose of teaching or educational purpose or nursing purpose that is taking place, we cannot have any objection. We should not have any objection. But the only question that has to be demarcated is this—though the hon. Minister is not prepared to reply. He is only giving a communal twist.

What inquiry has the Government of India to conduct ? I want to know whether there have been any minor girls who have been taken

out and whether they have been taken out by their own choice. I am glad that the Vatican has taken the step of suspending this recruitment. I would like to ask the Government of India whether in the past when this thing came in their knowledge as they say it came to their knowledge, they approached the Vatican and suggested to them what should be done about it. Did they approach the Christian missionaries and Churches and tell them what exactly has happened? May I know whether the Churches at all gave this information or whether they denied the information to the Government of India? I think the Government of India did not bother. After answering this question, they slept over this question thinking that it is nothing of importance. Now all the charges are being made about minor girls going and about their nervous breakdown. I know this is an unfortunate controversy which has not brought good name to our country. All this embarrassment that has been caused to this country and the humiliation that has been caused to this country is because of the negligence and because of lack of knowledge of the Government of India. We would like to know now as to that you are going to do about this matter. What kind of inquiry? You said very vaguely that an inquiry will be conducted. What kind of inquiry you will conduct and what co-operation you seek? I would also request the Churches in India and the Vatican to co-operate with that inquiry. But what kind of inquiry you are going to conduct? Are you going to send a fact-finding mission? Are you going to get in touch with the churches here? Please give us a time limit because, as Mr. Jagannath Rao said, a question was asked and the answer was that the matter is under investigation. Are you going to tell this country as to what exactly is the position so that this kind of misunderstanding of which Mr. Dwivedy made a mention may not be created? Please, for God's sake—I would request the hon. Minister: don't destroy this country on every issue on the basis of communalism. I would charge you and your Government of dividing this country on the basis of minority and majority. It is an insult to the dignity of this country. You are playing a game. You have reduced the whole country to the problem of majority and minority. Hindus and Muslims and Chris-

tians as a pawn in your political game and we will not allow it.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH: I am really sorry the hon. Lady Member got so much excited...

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA: I am not excited.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH: I would like to assure Shrimati Tarkeshwari ji that I have the greatest regard for her. I am really sorry that knowing Shrimati Tarkeshwariji for a long time... (Interruption)

SHRI RANJEET SINGH (Khalilabad): I charge him with partiality.

MR. SPEAKER: You are charging everybody to-day unnecessarily. Please don't do it. You must have some sense of proportion.

SHRI VASUDEVAN NAIR: What is this Sir? Irresponsible allegations he is making against the Chair.

SHRI RANJEET SINGH: He has again and again stood up and he has slurred the honour of this country and you have never asked him.

MR. SPEAKER: You are the only man who is worried about it.

SHRI RANJEET SINGH: I am one of them.

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK: We are very much conscious of the dignity of the Chair. I want to make a submission. The hon. Minister deliberately introduced communal politics in this matter and you should have pulled him up. No question of communalism is involved.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA: His statement is politically motivated.

अध्यक्ष महोदय: चेयर पर बैठ कर न तो मैं आपके बारे में अपने व्यूज दे सकता हूँ न इन के बारे में दे सकता हूँ। मैं तो जो प्रोसीजर के मुताबिक ठीक है, रेलिवेन्सी है, वह देखता हूँ।

[अध्यक्ष महोदय]

लेकिन आप किसी को भी स्पेयर न करें, यह बात तो गलत है। फिर किस तरह से हाउस चलेगा।

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I do not want to say anything more on that score. But I would like to assure the Member of the Congress (Opposition) that I never clubbed their Party with the Jana Sangh in communal Politics. (Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : He is behaving in a most irresponsible way. He is unfit to be a Minister. (Interruption)

DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH (Buxar) : You were an Akali. (Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : Let his Deputy reply. He is unfit to reply to this. He is behaving in a most irresponsible way.

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : इनका शर्म आनी चाहिये, इन को हाउस से निकाल देना चाहिये। अननैसेसरी एलियेगन्ज लगा रहे हैं। शर्म आनी चाहिये, हंस रहे हैं...

MR. SPEAKER : When all of you are speaking, I am not able to listen to anybody.

श्री अगन्नाथ राव जोशी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मंत्रियों को जवाब कैसे देना चाहिये, आप को बताना होगा। इस तरह से जवाब देना बहुत गलत बात है।

DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH : What is the good of his reply? He has not got himself qualified to be a secular person from the very beginning. He was an Akali... (Interruption)

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : जब तक आप मिनिस्ट्रों को पुल नहीं करेंगे, हमारे साथ जस्टिस नहीं कर सकेंगे। आप के बार बार मना करने के बाद भी वह कम्यूनल चीज लाते हैं, पोलिटिकल मीटिंग जाहिर करते हैं। यह नेशनल ईशू है, फिर भी हंसते हैं, शर्म नहीं आती है...

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : If you don't want to hear my reply. (Interruption)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : We want reply; but we don't want your politics. You are indulging in very dirty type of politics. You should be ashamed of it.

श्री शशि भूषण (खारगोन) : एक ही बैली के चट्टे-बट्टे हैं।

श्री मनुभाई पटेल (डभोई) : अगर कोई आप को कहे कि 12 बज गये हैं तो आप को कैसा महसूस होगा? हम पोलिटिक्स नहीं लाना चाहते हैं, लेकिन ये लोग पोलिटिक्स को ला रहे हैं...

श्री स्वर्ण सिंह : आप अपनी सभ्यता का सुबूत दीजिये, मुझे क्या हर्ज है, जो चाहे कहिये...

डा० राम सुभग सिंह : जवाब देना हो तो जवाब दो, नहीं आता हो तो घर को जाओ...

SHRI J. B. KRIPALANI (Guna) : May I be permitted to say a word? (Interruption)

MR. SPEAKER : Is it on a point of order, Acharya ji?

SHRI J. B. KRIPALANI : The question is whether girls of 17 and 18 years can be taken away to different countries to become nuns there. If they have got to be nuns let them be made nuns here first. I say, even a girl of 20 cannot decide. (Interruption) I am on a different question from these friends. The question is, can we allow our girls to become nuns like that (Interruption) being taken away to some foreign country and there made nuns? If they have got to be made nuns, let them be made nuns here. (Interruption)

SHRI SWARAN SINGH rose—

MR. SPEAKER : Let the answer be concrete and precise.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I trust the questions will also be concrete and precise.

SHRI HEM BARUA (Mangaldai) : I submit that this mutual recrimination in the House has become nauseating for us...

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : It is very nauseating for me.

SHRI HEM BARUA : Therefore, I would request the hon. Minister not to give any provocation, so that there might be no recrimination in the House.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I never give provocation, but if others attack me, I have to defend myself.

SHRI MANUBHAI PATEL : Let him not laugh over it.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : Two questions had been asked on earlier occasions. One was on the 4th August, 1969, and a complete reply was given. Another question had been asked in reply to which it was said that the information was being collected. That information was given and supplied to the House in fulfilment of the assurance and a copy giving the full information on all those points was given. So, it is wrong to suggest that Government had not collected the information.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA : What is that information ?

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : This was unstarred question No. 3296 dated 9th August 1968 by Shri Baburao Patel. Information was in given fulfilment of the assurance.

SOME HON. MEMBERS : What is that information ?

SHRIJMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA : What is the machinery ? He has not replied to that. We would like to know what the machinery of inquiry is, whether it is going to be the CBI or any other agency. What is the machinery that he is going to use for the inquiry and will that machinery get in touch with the Vatican and other churches in India to inquire into that, because in the past they had not done it ? Would they do it now ?

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : It is a very good suggestion, and I shall examine it. It is a good suggestion.

श्री रणधीर सिंह (रोहतक) : आदरणीय स्पीकर महोदय, तीन-चार रोज से जो अखबारों में हम पढ़ रहे हैं, उससे हमें बेहद शर्म आती है और मेरे देश का बेहद नाम बदनाम हुआ है। चाहे कोई हिन्दू लड़की हो, सिख लड़की हो, ईसाई लड़की हो या मुस्लिम लड़की हों—सब हमारी बेटियाँ हैं और बहनें हैं। मैं आप की मारफत गवर्नमेंट से पूछना चाहूँगा—पहले तो यह मालूम करो कि कहीं हिन्दुस्तान के दुश्मनों की तो इस में साजिश नहीं है। हिन्दुस्तान के जो दुश्मन हैं—उनके नाम तो क्या गिनाऊँ, दसियों दुश्मन हैं—कहीं उन्होंने तो साजिश नहीं की है कि इस तरह से हिन्दुस्तान को बदनाम किया जाय, हिन्दुस्तान में चूँकि बहुत से मजहब हैं, हिन्दू हैं, सिख हैं, ईसाई हैं, उन को डिवाइड एण्ड रूल की पालिसी के तहत आपस में लड़ाया जाय—कहीं ऐसी बात तो नहीं है ?

दूसरी बात मैं यह पूछना चाहूँगा—जिस देश में यह चीज छपी है, या जिस अखबार ने छपी है, जैसे सण्डे टाइम्स में जो इंग्लैंड का अखबार है, उस में छपी है—उन्को वेरिफाई किया है। उन लोगों से इसके बारे में मालूम किया जाय, अगर इस में कोई तन्त है तो वे उस का सुकृत दें, अगर नहीं है तो उन अखबारों के खिलाफ जिन्होंने हमारे देश को बदनाम करने की कोशिश की है, डिप्लोमेटिक लेबल पर सक्त से सक्त प्रोटेस्ट किया जाय और आप देखें कि डिप्लोमेटिक लेबल पर उससे और ज्यादा क्या किया जा सकता है, वह भी करें।

तीसरी बात—आप यह भी मालूम करें कि कहीं यह झगड़ा प्रोटेस्टेन्ट्स और कैथोलिक्स का आपस का झगड़ा तो नहीं है, धरलू झगड़ा तो नहीं है। कहीं उनके झगड़े की वजह से हमारी बहन बेटियों को खामखाह बदनाम तो नहीं किया जा रहा है। इस में केरल की ही बात नहीं है, मैं अपने केरल के एक दूसरे साथी की बात से इत्तिफाक करता हूँ, यह तो पंजाब, हरियाणा,

[श्री रणधीर सिंह]

कश्मीर, सारे हिन्दुस्तान की बेइज्जती का मामला है। मैं नहीं चाहता था कि इसको इन्टरनेशनल मामला बनाया जाय, लेकिन जो कुछ हम यहाँ पर कहते हैं उसका प्रचार बाहर भी होता है," इसलिए हमें सोच-समझ कर बात कहनी चाहिये।

आखरी बात मैं यह पूछना चाहता हूँ— इस में सिर्फ किसानों की ही बात नहीं है, अनपढ़ लोगों की बात नहीं है, अगर हिन्दुस्तान की एक भी लड़की का किस्सा है तो उस की पूरी एन्क्वायरी कराओ और जो भी जिम्मेदार हों, चाहे बिशप हों, चाहे प्रीस्ट हों या उन के एजेन्ट हों, उन के खिलाफ पूरे जोर से केस रजिस्टर किया जाय, उनको गिरफ्तार किया जाय और उनको सजा दी जाय।

आखरी सवाल यह है—आगे के लिए ऐसी चीज न हो—चाहे एक परसेन्ट हो या आधा परसेन्ट हो, तो भी इस के लिए आप गौर करें ताकि भाइन्दा इस किस्म का प्रचार हिन्दुस्तान के खिलाफ न हो, इस किस्म की मनगड़बट क्लानियाँ हमारी सरकार के खिलाफ, हमारी कौम के खिलाफ, हमारे भाइयों के खिलाफ न बनाई जा सकें। और अगर करें तो स्ट्रिक्ट ऐक्शन इस सिलसिले में लेंगे? ऐसी कोई चीज क्या आप करेंगे?

आखिर में मैं यह कहना चाहता हूँ कि चाहे देवदासी हों या दूसरी जगह पर नन्स हों, हम तो सारे ही इस हम्माम में नंगे हैं, इसको कहने की जरूरत नहीं है, हम क्या कीचड़ उछालेंगे? हिन्दुस्तान में कोई मजहब उससे बचा हुआ नहीं है, हम अगर अच्छे हैं तो सारे ही अच्छे हैं और अगर हम में बुराईयाँ हैं तो वह हर एक में हैं। मैं चाहता हूँ कि ये जो बातें मैंने कहीं हैं उनका एक एक का जवाब मिनिस्टर साहब देंगे ताकि हाउस को और देश को तसल्ली हो सके और मुल्क की बदनामी न हो।

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I fully respect his sentiments. All these factors will be

taken into consideration in holding an inquiry in a complete manner, and action, both punitive and preventive, will be taken.

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam) : This is a very serious matter requiring a full and impartial inquiry. Whichever may be the institution involved, whatever may be the purpose, whether it be social, religious or any other, if it is proved that girls are being sold for pecuniary consideration, it is a disgrace to humanity, to India and to the world at large. Much was made about the poverty of Kerala and the illiteracy of the girls there. Kerala is, of course, poor. But people in Kerala want to overcome poverty by honest work. Nobody can deny that. I can also say that literacy rate in Kerala is the highest in India. As far women it is the most literate part of the country. The parents there are very literate. Poverty is a curse for the entire nation, it has been a conspiracy of the entire nation to keep some States in a backward condition. Therefore, we should not go into that in this way and raise such vital issues affecting the dignity and hurting the sentiments of a minority on the basis of some newspaper report. I think we should proceed with caution and circumspection in this matter. Sometimes we see in newspapers reports that some saffron-robed sadhus have kidnapped some children and sold them somewhere else. On that score, we cannot condemn all sadhus and say that all of them are bad. We cannot say that the Sadhu Samaj, with due respect to Shri Nanda is an organisation spreading the cult of kidnapping; not here, we cannot say that the entire Hindu community is indulging in the art of child-lifting. Therefore, we should take newspaper reports about such things with a pinch of salt. At the same time, I do not want to ignore them. Let us have a comprehensive, full and impartial inquiry. Let us know the facts. Let us in the meanwhile refrain from making blanket accusations against anyone or body.

Much was made about the anti-national activities of these missionaries. It may be that one or two might have done that. But on that ground, let us not make a sweeping accusation on an entire institution or community. Now the cry of 'Indianisation' has been raised. I would ask my hon. friend.

Shri Gupta, not to indulge in this. It does not behave us. I can say here that in many parts of the country, missionaries have done some good work in the fields of education, in setting up public health institutions, especially in the matter of setting up and running leprosy when caste Hindus refused to come anywhere near these leprosy patients, the missionaries came and gave them full treatment and saved many of them. These things have happened.

Therefore, because of some newspaper reports, let us not carry things too far and say that the entire community, the entire institution of missionaries should be condemned. It is not good.

I am not at the present saying that the report is true or false. Let us get the facts. Meanwhile, let us be cautious in our approach. Until we get at the facts, we should not make any accusation. When the facts, have been revealed, whomsoever is responsible for this, whether he is in Kerala or in Calcutta or anywhere else, let the law take its course. On that, there can be no two opinions.

I would ask the Minister whether the enquiry proposed will be instituted at the earliest, and finished within a certain time limit, because so much accusation was made here. The hon. lady Member also said that in 1968 the left hand did not know what the right hand did. And she was one of the right or the left hands at that time. I would like the enquiry to be very effective; to be conducted at the earliest opportunity. The results should be made available to the country and the House at the earliest. I want the Minister to assure us about it. I also want that it should not be a mere governmental enquiry. I want it to be an enquiry of an impartial, judicial character. Then only it will create confidence in the House and the country. I would like to know whether he will consider this.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : I am grateful to the hon. Member for making such valuable and constructive suggestions. The enquiry will be quite comprehensive both here and abroad.

AN HON. MEMBER : By whom ?

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : By the enquiring agencies.

AN HON. MEMBER : Judicial.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : The judiciary can only assess any evidence that is collected. If any evidence is collected, then only it is useful. Hon. Members will appreciate that normal agencies of investigation will have to do this work. Whether at the local or Central level we will employ all possible resources of the investigation and will try to arrive at the truth both here and abroad. And it is our intention to finish it as expeditiously as possible because we are equally worried about this thing. It sullies the name of the country, and we are anxious to go into it deeply. We will take action on all possible fronts and see that if such a thing comes to light, it is put down with a strong hand.

SHRI S. S. KOTHARI (Mandsaur) : Why don't you say categorically CBI ?

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : CBI is not excluded.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : At the very outset, before putting my question, I must say that every Indian Christian is a child of the soil, of this country, and is as Indian as anybody in this parliament. So, let us not impute motives. There are bad Hindus, bad Muslims and bad Christians. Sometimes even bad Hindus are wrongly elected.

AN HON. MEMBER : You are one of them ?

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : There is nothing very new in the report of the *Sunday Times*. Two months back similar reports appeared in a Madras paper called *New Leader* which represents the Catholic Church. The revelations in the paper were made by a priest himself. Similarly I understand that certain reports appeared in the Kerala newspaper *Dipika* which is also run by Catholic priests.

In this case I do not believe that the People of Kerala the fathers and mothers of these

girls; our daughters, with their political consciousness can sell their daughters for money. There may be one or two who can sell their daughters and sell the country also to some other country.

In the newspaper it has come out that the Archbishop of Delhi, Mr. Angelo Fernandes, met Mrs. Gandhi on Tuesday and informed her about the steps being taken to ensure the welfare of Indian girls who have gone abroad for religious training or service. I would like to know what assurance was given to Mrs. Gandhi, the Prime Minister of the country, by the Archbishop about the safety of these girls who have gone abroad.

They are in many countries. For instance; they are in Britain, France, Switzerland, Spain, USA and Italy. Even the National Secular Society, a free-thinking humanist organisation in London, has asked the British Home Secretary to order an enquiry into the allegations that some British Convents had bought Indian girls. The society has said that officials from India or any other country involved should be given facilities to interview their nationals in British Convents, as this would allow them to find out whether the nuns came in by false inducements and are being held against their will.

That is very necessary, whether by the CBI or any other agency. The question is this. If these girls have gone there out of religious fervour and out of their religious sentiments, and have gone voluntarily, that is a different matter. But we have to see if there are certain agencies, which make recruitment like this. Some agencies are being accused of making money, and so this is a matter which is very serious. Have the Government enquired to get these malpractices removed? From the statement it appears that they did make some enquiries but they could not come to any conclusion. In the statement it has been said that "inquiries were again made but nothing specific came to notice." I would like to know whether the Government has drawn the attention of the top catholic church hierarchy to the situation? What steps are proposed to be taken to assure the country that our nationals are properly treated if their services are found to be unavoidable by those in Europe?

Whatever be the country to which they had gone—whether Switzerland, Great Britain, West Germany or any other country—our agencies are there, and our ambassadors are there, and our diplomats are there. They can possibly take up the issue with the highest church hierarchy in the country concerned and with the Archbishops and tell them definitely that there is a sentiment inside our country and if these girls have gone there, they should be treated well. If they are kept as domestic servants and so on, that should be enquired into and investigated into properly. I would request the Government to make such enquiries, and the enquiry report should be laid on the Table of the House. There should be an enquiry both by the Government and those agencies. This matter will have to be taken up with the Archbishop, and I would like to know what assurance were given by the Archbishop who is reported to have recently met the Prime Minister of the country, Shrimati Indira Gandhi.

SHRI SWARAN SINGH: I might inform the hon. House that Pro-Nuncio His Excellency the Most Reverend Magr Marie-Joseph Lemieux was called to the Foreign Office also, and we explained the whole position to him. He said that a great deal of importance is bestowed in selecting the girls and their training is also supervised. He also mentioned that the Holy See was now seized of the matter and had ordered a full enquiry, the intention being that if there was anything which was not, being done in the right way, it should be immediately corrected. We ourselves are holding enquiries. It is not only the police enquiry, but we are in touch with the church; I am sure that they will also fully co-operate in this enquiry; If anything comes out of the enquiry, I can say that the church leaders also will be with us in suppressing any malpractices. There is no difference of opinion on that score, and I would appeal to the hon. House that now that the matter is being enquired into by the Government agency both inside the country and also abroad, because the church is also seized of the matter, we should permit that the enquiry should be held in the proper atmosphere, and I can assure the House that we will go deeply into the matter.

SHRI S. S. KOTHARI : Those girls who have gone there should be repatriated. Will the Minister see to it that they are repatriated? (*Interruption*)

SHRI SWARAN SINGH : Those girls who are ready to come back will be given full facilities to return.

SHRI S. S. KOTHARI : We want them to come back.

MR. SPEAKER : Now, the half-an-hour discussion is there. Should we postpone it?

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY : We can have it tomorrow, because this subject has intervened today.

MR. SPEAKER : I am told it can come up only on Monday, because we have already another debate for tomorrow.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY : We have three days for half-hour discussion. I do not want to bar the other things which have already been balloted. Since we could not take up the half-hour discussion today, because of this intervention, we can as well take it up tomorrow.

SHRI HEM BARUA : That is also my submission. (*Interruption*)

SHRI HEM BARUA : It is in my name and I have been kicked like a football all these days. It has been postponed from one day to another and then to another and so on. I do not have any objection to its postponement provided you give an assurance that it will be taken up tomorrow.

MR. SPEAKER : There is another debate tomorrow. Are you prepared to continue today?

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY : Tomorrow you can take up this discussion at 4.30 for half an hour.

MR. SPEAKER : I will look into it and try to accommodate it. But I do not commit myself because I have to see the whole programme for tomorrow. Are you prepared to continue today?

SHRI HEM BARUA : Yes, Sir. Naxalite activities are mounting up in this country. They are spreading all over the country from West Bengal.

MR. SPEAKER : I am Sorry, Mr Dwivedy. There is no other alternative. We are having the same attendance as we have for half-hour discussions.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY : I was only pleading that the House is tired. Will it not be better for us to have this half-hour discussion tomorrow from the official time? It was to come up today at 5.30 but because some other discussion was continuing, this could not be taken up. Can it not be taken up from 4.30 to 5 tomorrow?

MR. SPEAKER : I have already said that I will have to look into the programme for tomorrow because there are other matters also which are pending. Either you should agree that that I may look into it or you have it just now.

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : We leave it to you.

18.09 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Thursday, August 27, 1970/Bhadra 5, 1892 (Saka).