

**SHRI TENNETI VISWANATHAM :** This will form a precedent.

**SHRI RANDHIR SINGH :** This is a reflection on the Speaker. I protest.

**SHRI R. D. BHANDARE (Bombay Central) :** On a point of order.

**श्री मधु लियये :** मैं उनके ऊपर असदभाव का आरोप न करते हुए यह कहूँगा कि यदि वह अपनी भूल को स्वीकारते हैं तो उससे न केवल लोकतन्त्र की मर्यादा की रक्षा होती है बल्कि उनकी अपनी प्रतिष्ठा भी उससे बढ़ जाती है।

**SHRI RANDHIR SINGH :** It is a contempt of the Speaker of Haryana. This should be expunged.

**MR. SPEAKER :** I can very well say that we can stretch it to your reference to the press report or your reference to the Institute of Constitutional Affairs, but this last line which directly reflects...

**श्री मधु लियये :** क्या रेफ्लेक्शन है ? मैं ने कहा कि असदभाव का आरोप मैं नहीं कर रहा हूँ। सुप्रीम कोर्ट के ऊपर भी आप कर सकते हैं लेकिन क्या मैं सभातति के बारे में असहमति भी प्रकट नहीं कर सकता ? मैं ने कहा कि असदभाव और मॉलिस का मैं आरोप नहीं कर रहा हूँ। आप दो स्टैंडर्ड न चलाइये।

12.15 hrs.

**MOTION OF THANKS ON THE  
PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS—Contd.**

**THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER OF FINANCE, MINISTER OF ATOMIC ENERGY AND MINISTER OF PLANNING (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) :** For the last five days or so we have had the debate on the President's Address. I am glad that several Members recognise that this Address marks the beginning of a new phase in our national life. It is reflected not

only in the Budget but in the many steps which have been taken and it will further be reflected in other steps. We have had the customary speeches from hon. Members sitting opposite in which they have set forth views, which are expected and well-known from their side. Nevertheless we have always welcomed criticism of all kinds, especially in a debate of this nature which gives us an opportunity of putting forward our own objectives and policies.

The President has beckoned to us to look ahead, to look forward. Some of our friends opposite seem to have turned a deaf ear to this call; this has not surprised us. The debate has succeeded in performing another useful function. The events of the last few months have had the effect of bringing together on the one side people who are largely in favour of progress and on the other side those who look backward... (*Interruption.*)

**श्री रवि राय (पुरी) :** क्या बिड़ला को फर्टिलाइजर फैक्टरी देना ही प्रोग्रेस है ?

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** In this house we are so absorbed in immediate problems that we tend to take for granted the large intellectual and political forces at work in the world (*Interruptions*). As you have yourself remarked, Sir, neither loud noise nor abuse is a substitute for argument. I was saying that we tend to be absorbed in day to day problems and therefore tend to take for granted the larger intellectual and political forces which are at work in the world today. While we are involved in changing the economic and social structure of our country, technology is changing and transforming the entire world. Modern communication methods are having an impact on young people everywhere including our own country, even in the remotest parts of the country. Let us not forget that what we say and do today must have meaning for young people. Our decisions must stand the test of their approval during the coming years.

I must confess my disappointment at the speech of the hon. Leader of the Opposition. Many of us had hoped that the emergence of a formal Leader of the Opposition would make a difference in the level

of the debate and would strengthen parliamentary convention and civilities. I am sorry that this hope has not been fulfilled. His speech was short on vision, short on perspective, short on facts and short on temper. Frustration breathes through every word he uttered. A sense of defeat and utter helplessness which has enveloped him and his group, I am glad to say that it is not shared by the people of this country or by any of us on this side of the House. At no time have our people felt more imbued not only with the urge for change but also with a growing feeling of their capacity to bring about this change.

Sir, recent events have brought about, as I said just now, a broad division between forward-looking people and those who wish to stay put. In fact, it was the likemindedness among the no-changers that in a way led to the events which have taken place. The debate has given further proof of such likemindedness. Prof. Ranga and Dr. Ram Subhag Singh sounded much alike except for their accent (*Interruption*) I believe that a common mint supplies both of them with the currency for their ideas and their phrases.

The hon. Member, Shri S. K. Patil, sought to resurrect Mark Twain. Mark Twain has been one of my favourite authors when I was a child and, if I may say so, it was not one of his better sayings which was quoted. Mr. Patil spoke of slogans, but few people have used more slogans. He talked also of my being a prisoner. Perhaps the hon. House has heard the story of the tiger which was put in a cage, but he took consolation in thinking that it was the whole world which was in a cage because he saw it through the bars.

Shri Patil has been a forthright and candid person. He has never hidden his true opinions, no matter how he has voted. I know that his views on nationalisation, on socialism and the privy purse are not shared by all those among whom he now sits. I hope, however, that he will vote with them as he voted with the Congress when it adopted the 10 point resolution. He spoke of privy purses with great passion. Let him convert his own followers to his point of

view, before he preaches to the rest of the House and to the the Government.

The House and the country need have no feeling that anything wrong is done either in appreciating the historic role played by the princes when our country became independent or in asking them today to move with history in the same spirit which they had then displayed. I should like to acknowledge the courage and farsightedness which a large number of princes are displaying to bring about social integration even as they helped the political integration of the country.

However, I should like to remind the House that it was no accident that the loudest acclamation during the President's Address was reserved for his mention of the ending of privy purses and the privileges.

Some hon. Members talked of inter-border disputes. I think, Shri Lakkappa mentioned it. The object of setting up Commissions is to assess facts and points of view in depth so that their recommendations can lead to decisions which have a measure of fairness. Territorial disputes have arisen between our States because of a variety of historical circumstances. The factors are not the same everywhere; but issues do not get settled unless the action taken will generally satisfy the majority or dissatisfy the least number of the people concerned. Hon. Members will recall that several recommendations made by the States Reorganisation Commission had either to be substantially modified or to be rejected. But in all such cases, the main object was to provide the maximum satisfaction to the people concerned. There was a demand also for certain basic principles to be enunciated to solve the present disputes and those that might arise in future. When this was first said, I think it was at the meeting of the National Integration Council in Srinagar. I must confess that the idea seemed attractive but on further consideration it seems somewhat naive to suggest that all human affairs can be reduced to general laws, and I think that there might be more practical wisdom in solving some of the issues, in the light of their own facts

[ Shrimati Indira Gandhi ]

and circumstances. It might be hard to evolve principles to fit all cases in a way which would satisfy everyone. Indeed, we know from experience that some solutions create more problems than they solve. I would, therefore, make a plea for us to try to isolate some of these problems rather than to generalise them.

It has been said in this House and outside that we are, or perhaps I am, planning to use the civil service for political purposes. I have denied and contradicted this on every possible occasion and I can say that my remark about committed civil servants has been twisted. I have always held the view that the duty of the civil servants is to give frank and honest advice and not to let their judgment be cramped by fear or favour. I certainly do not want civil servants who are in any way servile or politically convenient because if they were so, they would not be helpful to the Government or to the administration. However, I do think that all people who are in charge of the administration or of projects should have a commitment to the service of the people and their welfare. They should think of people as individual human beings, not merely as statistics. Therefore, when I used the word "commitment", what I meant, as I have clarified on previous occasions, is that they should be loyal to the guiding principles of our Constitution and the objectives which have been adopted by Parliament.

AN HON. MEMBER : Are they loyal ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I think it is a good question. They are not disloyal but we are all aware that previously there was not great stress laid on attitudes, because Government did not have the great problems of development and change before it. By and large I have found these qualities of courage and conviction at all levels of the civil services.

While talking of the civil service, I am aware that since Government have to assume larger responsibilities, we must constantly aim at greater efficiency, more expertise and more speedy methods of work.

SHRI RANGA (Srikakulam) : And more honest.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Reference was made by several hon. Members to an interview which I gave some months ago to a French magazine called *Elle*. Hon. members have presumably not seen the original and they have referred to a translation. The translated version has appeared in a weekly which I do not normally see and which always has a slant of its own. Only this morning I saw the original article in French, not the whole series—I believe three series have appeared and more are to come but the portion to which reference was made here. The lady who interviewed me seems to have got mixed up about certain things. Immediately before the lines which were mentioned here, she has mentioned my great reverence to Gandhiji. The words which appear afterwards which were quoted here are not in quotation marks. They are her own version of what she thought I had said. She also says that I told her that Gandhiji lived in Anand Bhavan during all his visits to Delhi. Sometimes, in these interviews, people get a little mixed up. As I said, as regards the reference to village economy, she does not claim to quote my exact words. Hon. members will appreciate that with the increasing number of journals which are cropping up all over the place, it is hardly possible to chase every wrong or twisted article. If one did that, one would not have time for anything else, specially in regard to the journals brought out by some of the hon. member, sitting opposite which seem to have made it their business to deliberately twist the meaning of whatever I say. In Gandhi Centenary Year, there was hardly a meeting where I did not refer to Gandhiji and pay tribute to the inspiration and guidance which he gave to our country in its darkest hour. In this House, I have referred to him as the greatest revolutionary of our times. It is unthinkable and in fact I did not call him reactionary. The words "reactionary and mad cap" I put these in quotation marks are presumably Shri Pilo Mody's own contribution to truth !

Acharya Kripalani has also referred to the Padma Shri award to Shri Ritwik Ghatak. Shri Ghatak is a film maker, and most Indian and foreign film critics think

He is one of the most creative of our film makers. When an artist is honoured, it is for his art—a musician for the quality of his music, an artist for the quality of his painting. Shri Ghatak, I believe, had to go through many stresses. He has publicly said, a few days ago, that he had gone through a severe mental crisis and had uttered some unfortunate words. Gandhiji's greatness cannot be sullied by such words. Hence, there should be Gandhian forgiveness in such things. We all know the humour and tolerance with which he himself dealt with such matters.

Hon. members have naturally been concerned with our economic policy. I shall not deal with this matter in details today, as it will be discussed later on when the budget and the Plan are considered. However, I should like to mention a few points which, it seems to me, are based on wrong assumptions and imperfect data.

Prof. Ranga sought to develop a thesis of his own on steel. He seems to doubt that there would be any demand for the steel which we are planning to produce. He is perhaps under the impression that recessionary trends for the demand in steel and other engineering projects still continue. There was a decline in demand for steel between 1964 and 1968; but since then there has been a steady and significant rise. It is well known that there is an acute shortage of various type of steel such as billets, sheets, plates and wire rods. We must remember that any decision on the creation of additional capacity in steel has to be taken, not with reference to today's needs, but the long-term projection of demand. It takes anything from one to seven years to plan, design and commission a steel plant and for it to attain the rated capacity. That is why we have decided on the expansion of Bokaro and Bhilai and have also initiated action for the creation of new capacities.

The House is aware how many States are demanding steel plants. Perhaps Professor Ranga would be so kind as to help us out in dissuading them. Should he agree to this, may I ask him to start with Visakhapatnam?

AN HON. MEMBER : What about the steel plant for Mysore?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Do you want him to dissuade Mysore also from getting a steel plant?

From Professor Ranga to Shri Morarji Desai is an obvious transition these days, as they are close to each other, not only in their sitting but perhaps in their thinking also. Both of them made critical references to Bokaro. The reason sounded different but there is much likeness even in their reasoning.

SHRI RANGA : It is a costly luxury which you are running after.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I wonder how Shri Morarji Desai computed the capital cost of Bokaro at Rs. 2,860 per tonne. Probably, he has not been told of the extra pig iron production of about 900,000 tons. Taking this into account, the latest cost estimate would be about Rs. 2,500 per tonne. The main factors which pushed up the cost, as compared to plants such as Rourkela, are (1) devaluation because of which the cost went up by Rs. 75 crores even at the 1.7 million tonne stage; (2) considerable time spent between the completion of the Rourkela plant and Bokaro plant during which period there was considerable escalation of the cost of steel, cement, labour and so on; (3) the cost of domestic and international equipment has also risen continuously. Such overruns in costs in other projects, whether of the public sector or private Sector, due to similar factors are not unknown.

The Rourkela yield of finished steel from ingots at 1.8 million tonne stage is about 72 per cent. In Bokaro this is estimated to be 81 per cent, which gives considerable advantage to Bokaro. In other words, if the investment costs are calculated per tonne of finished steel, this factor alone would lower the cost of Bokaro by about ten per cent. Calculating in terms of finished steel the cost of Rourkela would be about Rs. 2,750 per tonne of finished steel, against Bokaro's investment cost of Rs. 3,100 per tonne of finished steel.

[ Shrimati Indira Ghandbi ]

It should also be stressed that there has been a greater element of Indianisation.. ..indianisation.

SHRI M. L. SONDHI (New Delhi) : She is adopting the Jansangh vocabulary.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : Indigenisation entails additional cost not merely in respect of steel plants but also many other projects such as power and irrigation projects.

It is understandable that Shri Morarji Desai should refer to the virtues of social control. However, his inference that the position did not significantly improve after the nationalisation of the fourteen banks is mistaken. I am deliberately not going into the matter here, because this matter will come up very soon when the Banking Bill comes up for discussion.

Hon. Members are rightly agitated over Rhodesia. The Government of India consider the decision of the break-away regime to declare itself a Republic as totally illegal. Government will continue to support all measures taken by the world community and the African States against the racist regime.

We maintain our firm belief that any constitution for this colonial territory must ensure the principle of "One man one vote" in a multi-racial society. We also hold the view that world action should be concerted towards taking effective steps to lead Rhodesia to independence based on the principle of NIBMAR—no independence before majority African rule.

The basic question before us today is what type of society we want to build. It is not merely a question of how much the national or the *per capita* income will go up but how one Indian will deal with another. Will he regard all his countrymen as equal; will he believe that some people have more rights than others; if there are differences which are not unlikely in any society, how will they be resolved—by resort to violence or through discussion and understanding ?

We have inherited certain values not only from the long past but also from our training during the independence movement under Mahatma Gandhi and Jawahar, Lal Nehru. (*Interruption*)

SHRI M. L. SONDHI : And Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : ...and Netaji Subhash Chandra Bose although there was a slight difference because at that time Netaji stood for violence, while we were pursuing the path of non-violence.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA (Delhi Sadar) : Do you disapprove of it ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I am talking about the independence struggle. There we had consciously taken the other path. I do not in any way want to lessen Netaji's image, his influence on the nation or his contribution to the freedom of our country. He holds a unique position and the entire nation has respect and admiration for him.

Let me make it very clear that our picture of India and the methods which we are pledged to pursue are certainly not those of the hon. Member opposite, Shri Vajpayee, and his party. He spoke of Indianisation. In his Address, the President has said that the problems of India require uniquely Indian solutions taking into account our way of life, our history and our tradition.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : (Balrampur) : That is Indianisation.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : If, therefore, Shri Vajpayee wants every Indian to love his country and to be patriotic, nobody can quarrel with that, and I certainly do not do so; nor is any special theory of Indianisation required. But, I think, his theory is not quite so innocent. Shri Vajpayee would not waste his energy in stating something which is so obvious. He and those of his way of thinking have a very definite purpose. Evidently, they have taken upon themselves to be the judges of who is Indian and who is not.

**SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE :** Certainly not

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** This I think is most sinister. Whenever any group sets itself up to decide who is an Indian and who is not, there is bound to be trouble. May I ask the hon. Member as to who will judge the quantum or the quality of Indianness of any individual ?

**SHRI OM PRAKASH TYAGI (Moradabad) :** Indian culture.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** Does he envisage that any tribunal would do it ?

**SHRI S. K. TAPURIAH (Pali) :** How will you decide as to who is progressive and who is reactionary ?

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** The two things are entirely different because not being progressive, does not deny anybody any right... (Interruption)

What I want to know is : Does the hon. Member envisage a tribunal to go into the matter or does he think that it is his party who should be assigned this task ? We remember vividly the havoc caused in America by some people who declared other Americans to be un-American and, in the entire world, when some Germans maintained that other Germans were un-Aryan and, therefore, un-German. These people have paraded under the banner of ultra-nationalism and have attempted and, unfortunately in some cases succeeded, in undermining the very basis of democratic society. Such assertion of ultra nationalism is a masquerade to disguise the face of reaction. And this must be unmasked. (Interruptions) If this course of Indianisation is so simple why should they argue ? (Interruptions)

**SHRI M. L. SONDHI :** Has the Prime Minister answered any specific part of the speech of Mr. Vajpayee ? What is the specific part she has answered we will be glad to know ... (Interruptions)

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** I am not yielding at all.

**MR. SPEAKER :** Will you please sit down ? She is not yielding.

**SHRI M. L. SONDHI :** Like that we can also say . (Interruptions)

We will not be cowed down like this. She must help us in understanding. I submit every responsible party in India has a right to understand the Prime Minister. I am against trading in abuses. I would be very grateful if the Prime Minister clarifies specifically where she finds what Mr. Vajpayee said must be approximately to what she says. Let us help the process of political dialogue and not impede it.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** If this task of Indianisation is so simple, why should it arouse fears in the minds of some sections of our people ? (Interruptions)

**SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE :** Because you are carrying on a deliberate propaganda to mislead a minority... (Interruptions) I am sorry to say that the Prime Minister does not stand for national integration. She wants division in the society. (Interruptions)

**SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK (South Delhi) :** She does not consider herself to be above party and the country above her party. That is what is lacking. She must put India first... (Interruptions) Therefore, I say, she should be Indianised. (Interruptions)

**श्री सुलसीदास जायब (बारामती) :** बारबार इस तरह से बीच में प्रधान मंत्री जी को क्यों टोका जाता है ?

**श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी :** बिलकुल टोका जायगा। प्राइम मिनिस्टर को हम तरह से गलत बातें नहीं बोलनी चाहिए। (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब मैंने भाषण दिया था तो प्रधान मंत्री सदन में नहीं थीं। उन्हें रहना चाहिए था। मुझे शक है कि उन्होंने भाषण पढ़ा है या नहीं पढ़ा है। मैंने जो कुछ भाषण में कहा वह उसका उत्तर नहीं दे रही हैं जेरे विमल में क्या है वह उसमें सुझने की

[ श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी ]

कोशिश कर रही हैं। यह कोई तरीका नहीं है जवाब देने का। हम जो कुछ चाहते हैं वही कहते हैं और जो कुछ हम कहते हैं वही करना भी चाहते हैं। हमारी वाणी, कर्म और वचन में कोई अन्तर नहीं है।

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : If I might quote Shakespeare, it seems the lady protesteth overmuch.

SHRI M. L. SONDHY : Who is the lady ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : If what I am saying is not correct, the hon. Members need not be bothered about it. Why are they so concerned....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : We cannot allow it to go unchallenged. If it is incorrect, it has got to be challenged here and now.

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : हम यह आशा करते हैं कि वाजपेयी जी ने जो कहा है उस का जवाब दिया जयगा। अगर जवाब आपके पास नहीं है तो कह दीजिये कि जवाब नहीं है। दरअसल आपके पास जवाब तो है ही नहीं उसका।

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : I have thought over deeply about what Mr. Vajpayee said here and what his other colleagues have said. I think, it is time that all these statement should be replied to. (*Interruptions*) I would just say that the test of any statement is not how you yourself interpret it, but what impact it has on the people about whom you make that statement. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : What do you say as to what impact it has on others ? (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : To me, every child who is born of Mother India is a good Indian. There is the law of

treason and there are competent courts to decide if anyone is guilty of treason. This cannot be left to be decided by any political group or party. No oratorical devices can hide the real intentions of those who advocate the Indianisation of their fellow countrymen.

Either Shri Vajpayee's doctrine means the obvious which, as I have said, needs no reiteration, or it is hiding something. And to find that out, Shri Vajpayee's colleague, Shri Madhok, is a better guide. (*Interruptions*) He bluntly says what he means and the House is aware of his numerous utterances on this subject.

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : Yes.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : In this House, Shri Vajpayee, I think, has acted only as a kind of a make-up man to Shri Madhok's ideas. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK : Madam Prime Minister is a make-up woman. I am a made up man. I am not a make-up man.

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : In fact Shri Vajpayee himself disclosed in his speech that he knew something about woman's hair-dressing. With his eloquence he has tried to prettify an ugly thought. Shri Vajpayee was aggrieved—he mentioned it just now that I was not present when he spoke. But I have read his speech in cold print. His true intentions...

AN HON. MEMBER : Is it too cold ?

SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI : His true intentions come out better...(*Interruptions*) When you are speaking, you are in the heat of the moment but when it is written down, it is cold. (*Interruptions*) I think his true intentions come out better when shorn of his ringing cadences. Therefore, Mr. Speaker, I am not moved by some of the rhetorical questions which he has asked as to what is wrong with humanising a human being.

SHRI M. L. SONDHY : She is not moved. She is cold. (*Interruption*)

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** We should be on guard against fine phrases which hide extremist designs, whether of the extreme right or of the extreme left.

Another spurious coin was put into circulation with the help of his considerable speaking skill. I refer to the so-called swadeshi plan which is being propagated to-day by his party. This swadeshi plan is apparently... (*Interruptions*)

I have learnt that the exercise is done by an economist who has just arrived from Harvard University. I should like hon. Members to study this document in detail.

**SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA :** Have you studied it ?

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** Then they will discover that it is a mere outline which, promises much, but tells too little about how that promise is to be fulfilled.

It promises rapid acceleration of the rate of growth to over 10% per annum with full employment; the raising of the lowest 10% of the population, significantly above the poverty line; and, please note, with the immediate termination of all foreign aid. This is not all. This Santa claus also promises a programme of investment for a full nuclear arsenal as well. (*Interruptions*)

**SHRI M. L. SONDHI :** Here and now, will you admit that the nuclear non-proliferation treaty which is being ratified tomorrow will be expressly rejected by us in the national interest ? Various political parties have demanded it. Tomorrow is a crucial day to express yourself forthrightly on your nuclear policy.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** We have not signed it.

**SHRI M. L. SONDHI :** I wish, you express your strong voice against it, since it discriminates against India and endangers Indian national security.

**MR. SPEAKER :** Mr. Sondhi, please resume your seat.

**SHRI M. L. SONDHI :** Sir, I am telling her her own potentialities.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** When I saw this document the simile that came to my mind was that of the famous Indian rope trick about which so much is said and so little seen. I hope the hon. Member Shri Vajpayee will tell us how he proposes to force the community to save 50 per cent of the additional income generated. How will the rate of growth of agricultural output be increased to 6.5 per cent a year ? And, if foreign aid is to be discontinued immediately,—and even after allowance is made for some unused capacity in the machine-building industry,—how and in what concrete ways, will such a vastly expanded programme be sustained ? From where will the investment come ? I think that a sober and objective examination of this so-called Swadeshi Plan will probably bring disenchantment. May I invite the hon. Member to have his plan examined in a professional and technical manner for its internal consistency and for the soundness of its economic analysis ? One should examine the validity of its data and, what is even more important, its social and political implications for the kind of society we have been endeavouring to evolve in India. It seems to me that Shri Vajpayee's party has a different set of political and social premises in mind, premises which are outside our system and which he is not prepared to articulate. In this plan there is a monopolistic conception of social order and its inconsistency is apparent in a democratic social system. It is true that I have given a good deal of time to Shri Vajpayee's thoughts because I think that they merit it. I have tried to see through his words, behind his sweet phrases and his beautiful Hindi.

**SHRI MANOHARAN (Madras-North) :** Dangerous thoughts.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** Dangerous thoughts.

**AN HON. MEMBER :** There is open alliance on the floor of the House.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** Shri Morarjibhai has referred to my speech in Ujjain and also to what I said in the other House on the Supreme Court.



[ Shrimati Indira Gandhi ]

Sir, in Ujjain, I barely referred to the Supreme Court, except to say that the news of its judgement had come just come.

**SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK :** The Press is most unloyal to you.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** I have never wanted the Press or anybody else to be loyal to me. Loyalty should always be for a larger cause and if Mr. Madhok had taken the trouble to attend any one of my meetings, he would have found out what I said.

**SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK :** I have attended your meetings but you have not attended any one of my meetings.

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** I want to say very categorically that our reverence to the Supreme Court is total. In fact, everyone in this land should have the highest regard for the judiciary. The Constitution has clearly laid down the role of the Courts. And, all three parts of the Government,—the Legislature, the Executive, and the Judiciary,—are pledged to upholding the Constitution. But, Sir, the Constitution has also given us certain Directive Principles. In realising them, difficulties of interpretation might arise. This is not a new development. We have gone through this before. Many of our Bills on land reform and soon have met with reverses, and this was what I had referred to in Ujjain, just in one very brief sentence.

13 hrs.

But whenever any of our Acts has been struck down, we have taken the necessary remedial action within the framework of the Constitution, for every living Constitution contains within itself the capacity to respond to changing needs and to new forces of history.

As I said at the beginning of my speech, the pace of change in the entire world and in our own country is much faster now. This is something which is beyond our control. It is the technological and scientific changes which are coming about which are bringing this about. But in the last year, it did look to our people as if

the pace of change in India in some directions was slowing down. This is what had created restlessness and disturbance in the minds of many and especially of the younger generation. Now, we are again in a position to go forward. Let nothing be said which will hold back our people, which will sow doubt in their minds or deflect them from their determined path. Mistakes are sometimes made; wrong things are also being done; Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee made mention of some of them; but basically, the people are on the move. They are impatient only because they see that change can be faster; they are impatient because they see that their difficulties and their hardships can be removed. Let it be said that responsible representatives of the people acted at this difficult time with vision and courage and with faith in the people of India.

As I said, I remain deeply convinced that the democratic path is the only path for India to solve its problems. But there can be no true democracy without socialism and without secularism. There can be no true socialism without true democracy. So, let us move forward with this ideal, for only then shall we be able to reach our goal and overcome all obstacles ..  
(Interruptions)

**SHRI SAMAR GUHA (Contal) :** Perhaps without nationalism. All of them have been avoiding that word. She has been avoiding, Shri Y. B. Chavan has been avoiding it.... (Interruptions) What about inquiry into Netaji's death? So many Members have raised that point? Will she say a few words?

**SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI :** I have spoken to him already on this.

**SHRI BAKAR ALI MIRZA (Secunderabad) :** What about Telengana?

**MR. SPEAKER :** I would like to know the numbers of amendments which are being pressed, because there are about 640 of them.

**DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH (Buxar) :** I am pressing my amendment No. 493.

**SHRI RANGA :** No 52.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : 92.

MR. SPEAKER : The question is :

SHRI ANBAZHAGAN (Tiruchengode) :  
No. 630.

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam) :  
In amendment No 630, the word 'only'  
should be there after 'Hindi'.

"but regrets that while taking note of  
the manifestations of violence in the  
country, the Address:

SHRI MADHU LIMAYE (Monghyr) :  
138-139.

(a) does not refer to the situation  
in West Bengal where,  
according to the Chief Minister  
of that unfortunate State,  
there exists an "uncivilised  
and barbarous Government",  
nor contains any statement  
of intentions as to how the  
Union Government propose  
to deal with the situation  
which involves a complete-  
breakdown of the constitu-  
tional machinery and of law  
and order;

SHRI HEM BARUA (Mangaldai) : 56.

SHRI PRAKASH VIR SHASTRI  
(Hapur) : No. 495.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Alipore) :  
439.

SHRI RABI RAY (Puri) : 334, 401  
and 403.

SHRI SHIV CHANDRA JHA (Madh-  
ubani) . 303.

DR. KARNI SINGH (Bikaner) ; 425.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA : 441 and 442.

SHRI TENNETI VISWANATHAM  
(Visakhapatnam) : 516.

SHRI S. KUNDU (Balasore) : 42-50  
and 56.

MR. SPEAKER : Do hon. members  
want division on all these ? I will go seri-  
ally. First I will take up amendment Nos.  
1-30.

MR. SPEAKER : I put amendment  
Nos. 1 to 30 to the House.

*Amendment Nos. 1 to 30 were put  
and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I put amendment  
Nos. 31 and 32 to the House.

*Amendment Nos. 31 and 32 were  
put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I put amendment  
Nos. 33 to 39 and 365 to 368 to the House.

*Amendment Nos. 33 to 39 and 365 to  
368 were put and negatived.*

(b) fails to take note of the  
widespread seizure of crops  
in the State of Kerala with  
the connivance and encoura-  
gement of some of the parties  
in power, both in the past  
and at present; and

(c) ignores a factor which aggra-  
vates the violence in the  
country, namely the incite-  
ment from the highest  
quarters towards a disregard  
for the Rule of Law for the  
Fundamental Rights of the  
citizen and for the judiciary".  
(52)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 2

13.17 hrs.

AYES

Agadi, Shri S. A.  
Amat, Shri  
Anjanappa, Shri B.  
Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
Brij Bhushan Lal, Shri  
Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh

Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
 Deo, Shri P. K.  
 Desai, Shri Morarji  
 Devgun, Shri Hardayal  
 Dhrangadhra, Shri Sriraj Meghrajji  
 Ghooh, Shri Bimalkanti  
 Gowder, Shri Nanja  
 Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
 Gupta, Shri Ram Kishan  
 Jai Singh, Shri  
 Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
 Kachwal, Shri Hukam Chand  
 Karni Singh, Dr.  
 Kedaria, Shri C. M.  
 Khan, Shri H. Ajmal  
 Koushik, Shri K. M.  
 Kripalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
 Kunte, Shri Dattatraya  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
 Lobo Prabhu, Shri  
 Madhok, Shri Bal Raj  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Mehta, Shri P. M.  
 Mohamed Imam, Shri J.  
 Mohinder Kaur, Shrimati  
 Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Naghnoor, Shri M. N.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Nirlep Kaur, Shrimati  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri Bhaljibhai  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Poonacha, Shri C. M.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Rampur, Shri Mahadevappa  
 Ranga, Shri  
 Ranjeet Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri V. Narasimha  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Shah, Shri Manabendra  
 Shab, Shri T. P.  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal

Sharda Nand Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Narayan Swaroop  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
 Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 Shiv Charan Lal, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh Shri D. N.  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sondhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhakar  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Vajpayce, Shri Atal Bihari  
 Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup

## NOES

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Adichan, Shri P. C.  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Anbazhagan, Shri  
 Ankineedu, Shri  
 Anthony, Shri Frank  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Biswas, Shri J. M.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyath  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami

Buta Singh, Shri	Kinder Lal, Shri
Chakrapani, Shri C. K.	Kiruttinan, Shri
Chanda, Shri Anil K.	Kisku, Shri A. K.
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna	Kotoki, Shri Liladhar
Chandra, Shekhar Singh, Shri	Krishna, Shri S. M.
Chandrika Prasad, Shri	Krishnamoorthi, Shri V.
Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar	Krishnan, Shri G. Y.
Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.	Krishnaopa, Shri M. V.
Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh	Kureel, Shri B. N.
Chavan, Shri D. R.	Kushok Bakula, Shri
Chavan, Shri Y. B.	Lakkappa, Shri K.
Choudhary, Shri Valmiki	Lakshnikanthamma, Shrimati
Dilbir Singh, Shri	Lalit Sen, Shri
Damani, Shri S. R.	Laskar, Shri N. R.
Deiveekan, Shri	Laxmi Bai, Shrimati
Devinder Singh, Shri	Lutfal Haque, Shri
Dhandapani, Shri	Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri	Mahajan, Shri Vikram Chand
Dinesh Singh Shri	Mahato, Shri Bhajahari
Dixit, Shri G. C.	Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh
Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar	Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini
Ering, Shri D.	Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri	Mandal, Dr. P.
Gandhi, Shrimati Indira	Mane, Shri Shankarrao
Ganesh, Shri K. R.	Manoharan, Shri
Gautam, Shri C. D.	Maran, Shri Murasoli
Gavit, Shri Tukaram	Marandi, Shri
Ghosh, Shri Parimal	Master, Shri Bhola Nath
Girja Kumari, Shrimati	Meghachandra, Shri M.
Gopalan, Shri P.	Menon, Shri Govinda
Gopalan, Shrimati Suseela	Menon, Shri Vishwanatha
Govind Das, Dr.	Mishra, Shri G. S.
Gupta, Shri Indrajit	Misra, Shri S. N.
Gupta, Shri Lakhna Lal	Mohammad Yusuf, Shri
Halder, Shri K.	Muhammad Ismail, Shri M.
Hanumanthaiya, Shri	Murthy, Shri B. S.
Hem Raj, Shri	Nabata, Shri Amrit
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas	Nair, Shri Vasudevan
Jadhav, Shri V. N.	Nanda, Shri
Jagjiwan Ram, Shri	*Nayar, Dr. Sushila
Jamlr, Shri S. C.	Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila
Jamna Lal, Shri	Panigrahi, Shri Chinamrani
Janardhanan, Shri C.	Pant, Shri K. C.
Jha, Shri Bhogendra	Paokai Haokip, Shri
Kalita, Shri Dhireswar	Parmar, Shri D. R.
Kamalanathan, Shri	Partap Singh, Shri
Kamble, Shri	Parthasarathy, Shri
Kamala Kumari, Kumari	Patil, Shri Deorao
Karan Singh, Dr.	Patil Shri N. R.
Kasture, Shri A. S.	Patil, Shri S. B.
Kavade, Shri B. R.	Patil, Shri T. A.
Kesri, Shri Sita Ram	Pradhani, Shri K.
Khadilkar, Shri	Prasad, Shri Y. A.
Khan, Shri M. A.	Radhabai, Shrimati B.

Raghu Ramalah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Reddy, Shri Eswara  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Susbila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Salve, Shri N. K. P.  
 Sambhali, Shri Ishaq  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Satya Narain Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shambhu Nath, Shri  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Yajna Datt  
 Sharma, Shri Yogendra  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramavatar  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Sheth, Shri T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shiv S. N.  
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika

Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Uikay, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Viswambharan, Shri P.  
 Viswanathan, Shri G.  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet  
 Yadav, Shri Jageshwar

MR. SPEAKER : The result \* of the division is : Ayes : 73 : Noes : 207.

*The motion was negatived*

MR. SPEAKER : I shall now put amendments 51, 53, 54 and 55 to the vote of the House.

*Amendment Nos. 51, 53, 54 and 55 were put and negatived*

MR. SPEAKER : I shall put amendment No. 56 of Shri Hem Barua to the vote of the vote of the House.

*Amendment No. 56 was put and negatived*

MR. SPEAKER : I shall put amendment Nos. 66 and 461 of Shri Yashpal Singh to the House.

*Amendment Nos. 66 and 461 were put and negatived*

\* The following members also recorded their votes :

**Ayes :** Saruashri Raghubir Singh Shastri, Kanwar Lal Gupta, J. N. Hazarika and Dr. Sushila Nayar ;

**Noes :** Sarvasbri Mohd. Shafi Quresbi, M. R. Krishna, Nambiar, and M. H. Gowda.

MR. SPEAKER : I shall put amendment No. 92 of Shri Vajpayee to the vote of the House. The Question is :

"That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:—

"but regret that in the Address no mention has been made of Government's decision to give interim relief to Central Government employes without any delay" (92)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 3

13.24 hrs.

AYES

Adichan, Shri P. C.  
 Agadi, Shri S. A.  
 Amat, Shri D.  
 Anbazhagan, Shri  
 Anirudhan, Shri K.  
 Anjanappa, Shri B.  
 Awarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
 Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
 Barua, Shri Hem  
 Basu, Dr. Maitreyee  
 Berwa, Shri Onker Lal  
 Biswas, Shri J. M.  
 Brij Bhushan Lal, Shri  
 Chakrapani, Shri C. K.  
 Chandra Shekhar Singh, Shri  
 Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
 Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.  
 Deiveekan, Shri  
 Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
 Deo, Shri P. K.  
 Devgun, Shri Hardayal  
 Dhrangadhra, Shri Sriraj Meghraj  
 Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
 Gopalan, Shri P.  
 Gopalan, Shrimati Suseela  
 Gowder, Shri Nanja  
 Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
 Guha, Shri Samar  
 Gupta, Shri Indrajit  
 Gupta, Shri Ram Kishan  
 Halder, Shri K.  
 Jai Singh, Shri  
 Janardhana, Shri C.  
 Jha, Shri Shiva Chandra  
 Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
 Joshi, Shri S. M.

Kachwai, Shri Hukam Chand  
 Kalita, Shri Dhireswar  
 Kamalanathan, Shri  
 Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
 Karni Singh, Dr.  
 Kedaria, Shri C. M.  
 Khan, Shri H. Ajmal  
 Kiruttinan, Shri  
 Koushik, Shri K. M.  
 Kirpalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
 Krishna, Shri S. M.  
 Krishnamoorthi, Shri V.  
 Kunte, Shri Dattatraya  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
 Lakkappa, Shri K.  
 Limaye, Shri Madhu  
 Lobo Prabhu, Shri  
 Madhok, Shri Bal Raj  
 Manoharan, Shri  
 Maran, Shri Murasoli  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Meghachandra, Shri M.  
 Mehta, Shri P. M.  
 Menon, Shri Vishwanatha  
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
 Misra, Shri Janeshwar  
 Misra, Shri Srinibas  
 Mohamed Imam, Shri J.  
 Mohinder Kaur, Shrimati  
 Molahu Prasad, Shri  
 Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri M.  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Naghnoor, Shri M. N.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Nair, Shri Vasudevan  
 Nambiar, Shri  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Nirlep Kaur, Shrimati  
 Padmavati Devi, Shrimati  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri Bhaljibhai  
 Paswan, Shri Ked-r  
 Patel Shri J. H.  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Patil Shri N. R.  
 Poonacha, Shri C. M.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ramamurti, Shri P.  
 Rampur, Shri Maradevappa  
 Ranga, Shri  
 Ranjeet Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri V. Narsimha  
 Ray, Shri Rabi

Reddy, Shri Esvara  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Sambhali, Shri Ishaq  
 Satya Narain Singh, Shri  
 Sen Shri Deven  
 Sezhiyan, Shri  
 Shah, Shri Manabendra  
 Shah Shri T. P.  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal  
 Sharda Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Narayan Swaroop  
 Sharma, Shri Rama Avtar  
 Sharma, Shri Yogendra  
 Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
 Shastri, Shri Ramavatar  
 Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar  
 Sheo, Narain Shri  
 Shiv Charan Lal, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh Shri D. N.  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sondhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhaker  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Vijpayee, Shri Atal Bihari  
 Venkatsubbaih, Shri P.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup  
 Viswambharan, Shri P.  
 Viswanathan, Shri G.  
 Yadav, Shri Jageshwar

*NOES*

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Ankineedu, Shri  
 Anthony, Shri Frank  
 Atam Das, Shri  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpal, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata

Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Rhanu, Prakash Singh Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Birla, Shri R. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyanath  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotana  
 Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. R.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. C.  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gowda, Shri M. H.  
 Gnpta, Shri Lakhna Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
 Jagjiwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Janna Lal, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri

Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavde, Shri B. R.  
 Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
 Khadilkar, Shri  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder, Lal Shri  
 Kisku, Shri A. K.  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 \*Kripalani, Shri J. B.  
 Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishan, Shri G. Y.  
 Krishnappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahajan Vikram Chand  
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Meena, Shri Meetha Lal  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Misra, Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Ismail, Shri  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Parmar, Shri D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram Dhan, Shri

Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayana  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shambhu Nath, Shri  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kisore  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shiv Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Ulkey, Shri M. G.



Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
Verma, Shri Balgovind  
Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
Vyasa, Ramesh Chandra  
Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

all disciplinary actions, including  
break in continuity of service and to  
re-recognise all the Unions whose  
recognition was withdrawn after the  
strike." (138)

MR. SPEAKER : The result \* of the  
division is :

That at the end of the motion, the fol-  
lowing be added, namely :--

Ayes : 127 ; Noes : 172

" but regret that in the Address there  
is no mention that the Government  
propose to take early steps to confer  
on all those who are 18 years of age  
or above the right to be registered  
as voters and to exercise their fran-  
chise." (139)

*The Motion was negatived*

MR. SPEAKER : I shall now put  
amendment Nos. 93 to 99 and 292 to 295,  
which are in the name of the same Member  
to the vote.

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

*Amendments Nos. 93 to 99 and 292 to 295  
were put and negatived.*

Division No. 4] [13.28 hrs.

MR. SPEAKER : Then, I shall put  
amendment Nos. 100 to 128 in the name  
of Shri Ramavtar Shastri to the vote.

AYES

*Amendments Nos. 100 to 128 were  
put and negatived.*

Adichan, Shri P. C.  
Agadi, Shri S. A.  
Amat, Shri D.  
Anirudhan, Shri K.  
Anjanappa, Shri B.  
Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
Barua, Shri Hem  
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
Brij Bhushan Lal, Shri  
Chakrapani, Shri C. K.  
Chandra Shekhar Singh, Shri  
Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.  
Deiveekan, Shri  
Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
Deo, Shri P. K.  
Devgun, Shri Hardayal  
Dhrangadhra, Shri Sriraj Meghrajji  
Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
Gopalan Shri P.  
Gopalan, Shrimati Suseela  
Gowda, Shri M. H.  
Gowder, Shri Nanja  
Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
Guha, Shri Samar  
Gupta, Shri Indrajit

MR. SPEAKER : Then, I shall put  
amendment No. 129 to 137 and 641 in the  
name of Shri Deven Sen to the vote.

*Amendments Nos. 129 to 137 and 641  
were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Then, I shall put  
amendment Nos. 138 and 139. These are  
Shri Madhu Limaye's amendments.

The question is :

That at the end of the motion, the fol-  
lowing be added, namely :--

" but regret that in the Address there  
is no mention that the Government  
intends to withdraw or recommend  
withdrawal of all cases against their  
employees arising out of the 19th  
September, 1968 token strike, cancel

\* The following Members also recorded their Votes :

*Ayes* : Sarvashri J. B. Kripalani, Raghuvir Singh Shastri, Tonneti Viswanatham, Nath Pal,  
Kanwar Lal Gupta, and Dhandapani ;

*Noes* : Sarvashri Pokai Haokip, Bhajahari Mahato and Shrimati Gita Kumari.

- Gupta, Shri Ram Kisban  
 Jai Singh, Shri  
 Jha, Shri Shiva Chandra  
 Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
 Joshi, Shri S. M.  
 Kachwai, Shri Hukam Chand  
 Kamalanathan, Shri  
 Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
 Kedaria, Shri C. M.  
 Khan, Shri H. Ajmal  
 Kiruttinan, Shri  
 Koushik, Shri K. M.  
 Kripalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
 Krishna, Shri S. M.  
 Krishnamoorthi, Shri V.  
 Kunte, Shri Dattatraya  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
 Limaye, Shri Madhu  
 Madhok, Shri Bal Raj  
 \*Mahato, Shri Bhajahari  
 Manoharan, Shri  
 Maran, Shri Murasoli  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Meghachandra, Shri M.  
 Mehta, Shri P. M.  
 Menon, Shri Vishwanatha  
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
 Misra Shri Srinibas  
 Mohamed Imam, Shri J.  
 Mohammad Ismail, Shri  
 Mohinder Kaur, Shrimati  
 Molahu Prasad, Shri  
 Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Naghnoor, Shri M. N.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Nair, Shri Vasudevan  
 Nambiar, Shri  
 Nath Pai, Shri  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Nirlep Kaur, Shrimati  
 Padmavati Devi, Shrimati  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri Bhaljibhai  
 Paswan, Shri Kedar  
 Patel, Shri J. H.  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Patil Shri N. R.  
 Poonacha, Shri C. M.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ramamurti, Shri P.  
 Rampur, Shri Mahadevappa  
 Rang, Shri  
 Ranjeet Singh Shri  
 Rao, Shri V. Narasimha  
 Ray, Shri Rabi  
 Reddy, Shri Eswara  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Satya Narain, Singh, Shri  
 Sezhiyan, Shri  
 Shah, Shri Shantilal  
 Shah, Shri T. P.  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal  
 Sharda Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Narayan Swaroop  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Sharma, Shri Yogendra  
 Shastri, Shri Ramavatar  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh, Shri D. N.  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sondhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhakar  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Vajpayee, Shri Atal Bihari  
 Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup  
 Viswanatham, Shri Tenneti  
 Viswanathan, Shri G.  
 Yadav, Shri Jageshwar

## NOES

- Achal Singh, Shri  
 Aga, Shri, Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Anthony, Shri Frank  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Bera, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Birla, Shri R. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyannath

Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
 Chanda, Shrimati, Jyotsna  
 Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. K.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. C.  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati  
 Gupta, Shri Laxhan Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
 Jagjiwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavade, Shri B. R.  
 Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
 Khadilkar, Shri  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kisku, Shri A. K.  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Kripalani, Shri J. B.  
 Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishnan, Shri G. Y.  
 Krishnaappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Kusbok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.

Mahajan, Shri Vikram Chand  
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Misra, Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri M.  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar, Shri D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sambhali, Shri Ishaq  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati

Sen, Shri Dwaipayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shah, Shri Manabendra  
 Shambhu Nath, Shri  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Shashi Bhusban, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Sheth, Shri T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shiv Vidya Charan  
 Sidddaya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Uikay, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

MR. SPEAKER : The result\* of the divisions is. Ayes : 114; Noes : 172.

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put the other amendments Nos. 140 to 147 and 429 in the name of Mr. Limaye to the House.

*Amendments Nos. 140 to 147 and 429 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put to

the House amendments Nos. 188 to 192 in the name of Mr. Kushwah.

*Amendments Nos. 188 to 192 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now, I will put Mr. Shiva Chandra Jha's amendments.

SHRI SHIVA CHANDRA JHA : My amendment No. 303 may be put separately. The 75 monopoly houses in the country are to be nationalised.

MR. SPEAKER : The question is : That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely :-

"but regret that the Address has failed to point out the imperative need of nationalizing the 75 top monopoly houses."  
 (303).

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 5 ] AYES [ 13.32 hrs.

Adichan, Shri P. C.  
 Anirudhan, Shri K.  
 Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
 Barua, Shri Hem  
 Biswas, Shri J. M.  
 Chakrapani, Shri C. K.  
 Chandra Shekhar Singh, Shri  
 Dhandapani, Shri  
 Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
 Gopalan, Shri P.  
 Gopalan, Shrimati Susela  
 Gowda, Shri M. H.  
 Guba, Shri Samar  
 Gupta, Shri Indrajit  
 Gupta, Shri Ram Kisban  
 Halder, Shri K.  
 Janardhanan, Shri C.  
 Jha, Shri Bhogendra  
 Jha, Shri Shiva Chandra  
 Kalita, Shri Dhireswar  
 Kamalanathan, Shri  
 Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
 Krishna, Shri S. M.  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
 Lakkappa, Shri K.

\*The following Members also recorded their votes :

*Ayes* : Sarvashri Kanwar Lal Gupta, Dhandapani and Dr. Maitrayee Basu.

*Noes* : Dr. Govind Das and Shri Bhajshari Mahato.

Limaye, Shri Madhu  
 Maran, Shri Muraloli  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Meghachandra, Shri M.  
 Menon, Shri Vishwanatha  
 Misra, Shri Janeshwar  
 Misra, Shri Srinibas  
 Molahu Prasad, Shri  
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri M.  
 Nair, Shri Vaçudevan  
 Nambiar, Shri  
 Paşwan, Shri Kedar  
 Patel, Shri J. H.  
 Ramamurti, Shri P.  
 Ray, Shri Rabi  
 Reddy, Shri Eswara  
 Sambhali, Shri Ishaq  
 Satya Narain Singh Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Sharma, Shri Yogendra  
 Shastri, Shri Ramavatar  
 Viswambharan, Shri P.  
 Viswanatham, Shri Tenneti  
 Yadav, Shri Jageshwar

*NOES*

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Ankineedu, Shri  
 Anthony . Shri Frank  
 Atam Das, Shri  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B S.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyanath  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chanda, Anil K.  
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna  
 Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishana Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.

Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. R.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. C.  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gupta, Shri Lakhan Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhv, Shri V. N.  
 Jagjiwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavade, Shri B. R.  
 Khadilkar, Shri  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kisku, Shri A. K.  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Krishana, Shri M. R.  
 Krishnan,, Shri G. Y.  
 Kirshnappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kuroel, Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai Shrimati  
 Labo Prabhu, Shri  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mabejan, Shri Vikram Chand  
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Meeson, Shri Govinda  
 Miabara, Shri G. S.

Misra, Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Ismail, Shri  
 Mohammed Yusuf, Shri  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nabata, Shri Amrit  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar, Shri Bhaljibhai  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil Shri Deorao  
 Patil Shri N. R.  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji, Ram Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatagi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saieem, Shri M Yunus  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shambhu Nath Shri  
 Shankaranad, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Shashi, Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan

Sher Singh, Shri  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shri Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shiv Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwari, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Uikay, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramchandra  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet  
 Yadav, Shri Ram Sawak

MR. SPEAKER : The result \* of the division is :

Ayes : 49 : Noes : 168

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting all the other amendment ... (Interruption). If in this noise and shouting some thing goes out of my head, will you spare me for that? Now I am putting all the other amendments by Shri Shiva Chandra Jha (Nos. 296 to 302 and Nos. 304 to 326) to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 296 to 302 and 304 to 326 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendment No. 328 of Shri Manubhai Patel to the vote of the House.

*Amendment No. 328 was put and negatived.*

\* The following Members also recorded their votes for AYES :

Sarvashri B. K. Daschowdhury and Deven Sen.

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendments Nos. 330 to 344 and Nos. 392 to 404 by Shri Rabi Ray to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 330 to 344 and 392 to 404 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendments Nos. 345 to 358 by Shri Vishwanatha Menon to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 345 to 358 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendments Nos. 370 to 391, 462 and 463 by Shri Mrityunjay Prasad to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 370 to 391, 462 and 463 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendments Nos. 408 to 418, 627 and 628 by Shri Nambiar to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 408 to 418, 627 and 628 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendments Nos. 425 to 428 by Dr. Karni Singh to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 425 to 428 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I am putting amendments Nos. 438 to 440 by Shri Indrajit Gupta to the vote of the House.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : I am pressing amendment No 439 about the removal of right to property from the fundamental rights.

MR. SPEAKER : The question is :

"That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely :--

"but regret to note that the Address does not propose to take necessary steps to remove the right to property from the Fundamental Rights under the Constitution."(439)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 6 ] **AYES** [ 13.40 hrs.

Adichan, Shri P. C.  
Anbazhagan, Shri  
Anirudhan, Shri K.  
Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
Basu, Dr. Maitreyee  
Biswas, Shri J. M.  
Chakrapani, Shri C. K.  
Chandra Shekhar Singh, Shri  
Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.  
Dhandapani, Shri  
Gopalan, Shri P.  
Gopalan, Shrimati Suseela  
Gowda, Shri M. H.  
Gupta, Shri Indrajit  
Halder, Shri K.  
Janardhanan, Shri C.  
Jha, Shri Bhogendra  
Jha, Shri Shiva Chandra  
Joshi, Shri S. M.  
Kalita, Shri Dhireswar  
Kamlanathan, Shri  
Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
Kiruttinan, Shri  
Krishna, Shri S. M.  
Krishnamoorthi, Shri V.  
Limaye, Shri Madhu  
Manoharan, Shri  
Maran, Shri Murasoli  
Meghachandra, Shri M.  
Menon, Shri Vishwanatha  
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
Misra, Shri Janeshwar  
Misra, Srinibas  
Mohammad Ismail, Shri  
Molahu Prasad, Shri  
Nair, Shri Vasudeven  
Nambir, Shri  
Nihal Singh, Shri  
Paswan, Shri Kedar  
Patel, Shri J. H.  
Patil, Shri N. R.  
Ramamurti, Shri P.  
Ramji Ram, Shri  
\*Ranga, Shri  
Ray, Shri Rabi  
Reddy, Shri Eswara  
Sambhali, Shri Ishaq  
Satya Narain Singh, Shri  
Sezhiyan, Shri  
Sharma, Shri Yogendra  
Shastri, Shri Ramavatar

Vishwanathan, Shri G.  
Yadav, Shri Jageshwar

**NOES**

Achal Singh, Shri  
Aga, Shri Ahmed  
Abirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
Ankineedu, Shri  
Anthony, Shri Frank  
Atam Das, Shri  
Awadesh, Chandra Singh, Shri  
Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
Babunath Singh, Shri  
Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
Barupal, Shri P. L.  
Basumatari, Shri  
Besra, Shri S. C.  
Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
Birla, Shri R. K.  
Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
Brahmanandji, Shri Swami,  
Buta Singh, Shri  
Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna  
Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
Chavan, Shri D. R.  
Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
Dalbir Singh, Shri  
Damani, Shri S. R.  
Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
Deo, Shri P. K.  
Devinder Singh, Shri  
Dharangadhra, Shri Sriraj Meghrajji  
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
Dinesh Singh, Shri  
Dixit, Shri G. C.  
Dwivedi, Shri Nagcshwar  
Ering, Shri D.  
Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
Gautam, Shri C. D.  
Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
Girja Kumari, Shrimati

Govind Das, Dr.  
Gowder, Shri Nanja  
Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
Gupta, Shri Lakhan Lal  
Gupta, Shri Ram Kisban  
Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
Hem Raj, Shri  
Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
Jagjiwan Ram, Shri  
Jai Singh, Shri  
Jamir, Shri S. C.  
Jamna Lal, Shri  
Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
Kamble, Shri  
Kamla Kumari, Kumari  
Karan Singh, Dr.  
Karni Singh, Dr.  
Kasture, Shri A. S.  
Kavade, Shri B. R.  
Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
Khadilkar, Shri  
Khan, Shri M. A.  
Kinder Lal, Shri  
Kisku, Shri A. K.  
Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
Koushik, Shri K. M.  
Krisna, Shri M. R.  
Krishna, Shri G. Y.  
Krishnappa, Shri M. V.  
Kureel, Shri B. N.  
Kushok Bakula, Shri  
Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
Lalit Sen, Shri  
Laskar, Shri N. R.  
Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
Lobo Prabhu, Shri  
Lutfal Haque, Shri  
Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
Mahajan, Shri Vikram Chand  
Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
Mahishi, Dr. Sarojlal  
Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
Mandal, Dr. P.  
Manc, Shri Shankarrao  
Marandi, Shri  
Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
Menon, Shri Govinda  
Mishra, Shri G. S.  
Misra, Shri S. N.  
Mody, Shri Pilo  
Mohamed Imam, Shri J.  
Mohammad, Yusuf, Shri  
Muhammad Ismail, Shri M.  
Murthy, Shri B. S.  
Naik, Shri G. C.



Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhary, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar, Shri D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Ranjeet Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Rao, Shri V. Narasimha  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Biswanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shab, Shri Manabendra  
 Shah, Shri T. P.  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal  
 Shambhu Nath, Shri  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.

Sharda Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Narayan Swaroop  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Sheth, Shri T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasabib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shiv Charan Lal, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla Shiv Vidya Charan  
 Siddyya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Ukey, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ram Chandra  
 Vajpayee, Shri Atal Bibari  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

MR. SPEAKER : The result \* of the divisions is: Ayes: 53; Noes: 209.

*The motion was negatived.*

\* The following Members also recorded their votes:

*Ayes* : Shri Deiveekan;

*Noes* : Sarvshri Prakash Vir Shastri, Raghuvir Singh Shastri and Rangam

MR. SPEAKER : Now, I put Amendment Nos. 438 and 440 moved by Shri Indrajit Gupta to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 438 and 440 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I put Amendment Nos. 455, 456, 457 and 458 of Shri Janeshwar Misra to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 455 to 458 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put amendment No. 493 by Dr. Ram Subhag Singh to the vote of the House. The question is :

"That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely:-

'but regret that while expecting China to respect our right to pursue our own domestic affairs and foreign policy the Address does not make any mention of the measures to be taken to regain our territory forcibly occupied by China.'(493)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 7 ] **AYES** [ 13.43 hrs.

Agadi, Shri S. A.  
 Amat, Shri D.  
 Anjanappa, Shri B.  
 Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
 Barua, Shri Hem  
 Basu, Dr. Maitreyee  
 Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
 Brij Bhushan Lal, Shri  
 Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
 Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.  
 Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
 Deo, Shri P. K.  
 Desai, Shri Morarji  
 Dhurangadhra, Shri Sciraj Meghrajji  
 Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
 Gowder, Shri Nanja  
 Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
 Guha, Shri Samar  
 Gupta, Shri Ram Kishan  
 Jai Singh, Shri  
 Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
 Joshi, Shri S. M.  
 Kachwal, Shri Hukam Chand  
 Kameshwar Singh, Shri

Karni Singh, Dr.  
 Kedaria, Shri C. M.  
 Koushik, Shri K. M.  
 Kripalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
 Krishna, Shri S. M.  
 Kunte, Shri Dattatraya  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
 Limaye, Shri Madhu  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Mehta, Shri P. M.  
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
 Misra, Shri Janeshwar  
 Misra, Shri Srinibas  
 Mody, Shri Piloo  
 Mohinder Kaur, Shrimati  
 Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Naghnoor, Shri M. N.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Naik, Shri R. V.  
 Nath Pai, Shri  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Nihal, Singh Shri  
 Nirlep Kaur, Shrimati  
 Padmavati Devi, Shrimati  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri Bhaljibhai  
 Patel, Shri J. H.  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Poonacha, Shri C. M.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ranga, Shri  
 Rao, Shri V. Narasimha  
 Ray, Shri Rabi  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Copal  
 Shah, Shri Manabendra  
 Shah, Shri T. P.  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal  
 Sharda Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Narayan Swaroop  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
 Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 Shiv Charan Lal, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh, Shri D. N.  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sodhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhakar  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.

Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Vajpayee, Shri Atal Bihari  
 Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup  
 Viswambharan, Shri P.

*NOES*

Achal, Singh Shri  
 Adichan, Shri P. C.  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Anthony, Shri Frank  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Biswas, Shri J. M.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyanath  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chakrapani, Shri C. K.  
 Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna  
 Chandra Shekhar Singh, Shri  
 Chandrika Prakash, Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Dhavan, Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. R.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dhuleswar Meena, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. C.  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati

Gopalan, Shri P.  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gupta, Shri Indrajit  
 Gupta, Shri Lakhan Lal  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
 Jagjwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Janardhanan, Shri C.  
 Jha, Shri Bhogendra  
 Kalita, Shri Dhireswar  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavade, Shri B. R.  
 Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
 Khadilkar, Shri R. K.  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kishku, Shri A. K.  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishnan, Shri G. Y.  
 Krishnappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahato, Shri Bhajahari  
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Meghachandra, Shri M.  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Misra, Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Muhammad Ismail, Shri M.  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Nair, Shri Vasudevan  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar, Shri D. R.

Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri N. R.  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabal, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramamurti, Shri P.  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bholi  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Reddy, Shri Eswara  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sambhali, Shri Ishaq  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Satya Narain Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shambhu Nath, Shri  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Yogendra  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramavatar  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Sheth, Shri T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib

Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukle, Shri Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinhā, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavanc, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Uikay, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet  
 Yadav, Shri Jageshwar

MR. SPEAKER : The result \* of the division is : Ayes : 86; Noes : 185

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put amendment Nos. 490 to 492 by Dr. Ram Subhag Singh to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 490 to 492 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put amendment Nos. 508 to 512 by Shri Supakar to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 508 to 512 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put amendment No. 516 by Shri Tenneti Viswanatham to the vote of the House.

*Amendments No. 516 was put and negatived.*

\* The following Members also recorded their votes.

*Ayes* : Sarvasbri Raghuvir Singh Shastri, Kanwar Lal Gupta and Ranjoet Singh;

*Noes* : Shrimati Susocla Gopalan.

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put amendment Nos. 517 to 529 and 585 to 599 by Shri Tenneti Viawanatham to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 517 to 529 and 585 to 599 were put and negatived.*

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह गलत लग रहा है। मेरे अमैजमेंट नम्बर 495 का क्या हुआ ? गंगानगर के अन्दर किसानों के ऊपर जो जुल्म द्वाये गये और गोली चलाई गई उस से सम्बन्धित मेरे अमैजमेंट नम्बर 495 का क्या हुआ ? मैंने उसे प्रेस किया है उसे मूव किया है। उसे आपको हमने लिखवाया है और उसे आपने मेरे नाम से नोट भी किया है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : उसे आप ने मूव नहीं किया है।

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : यह जो प्रिटेड लिस्ट है उस में भी आ रहा है। उस दिन भी मैंने उसे मूव किया था। यह आप कैसे कह रहे हैं कि उसे मैंने मूव नहीं किया है ? उसे मैंने उस दिन भी मूव किया था और आज भी मैं उसे मूव कर रहा हूँ। इसे मूव उस दिन भी किया था और आज भी किया है और इसे आपको लिखवाया भी था।

MR. SPEAKER : I will treat it as moved :

श्री प्रकाशबीर शास्त्री : भीमन, मैं प्रस्ताव करता हूँ :

की प्रस्ताव के अन्त में यह जोड़ दिया जाये, अर्थात् :-

“परन्तु खेद व्यक्त करते हैं कि अग्निभाषण में राजस्थान के सीमावर्ती गंगानगर जिले और राज्य के दूसरे भागों में पुलिस की गोलियों से शहीद हुए व्यक्तियों एवं बच्चों पर हुए और अत्याचार का कोई उल्लेख नहीं है।” (495)

MR. SPEAKER : Now the question is :

“That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely” :-

“but regret that in the Address no mention has been made of the gross atrocities perpetrated on the people by the police through firing etc, in border district of Ganganagar and other parts of Rajasthan resulting in death of and injuries to many.” (495)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 8] *AYES* [13.48 hrs.

Agadi, Shri S. A.  
Amat, Shri D.  
Anirudhan, Shri K.  
Anjanappa, Shri B.  
Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
Barua, Shri Hem  
Barupal, Shri P. L.  
Basu, Dr. Maitreyee  
Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.  
Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
Deo, Shri P. K.  
Desai, Shri Morarji  
Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
Gowda, Shri M. H.  
Gowder, Shri Nanja  
Guha, Shri Samar  
Gupta, Shri Ram Kishan  
Jai Singh, Shri  
Jha, Shri Shiva Chandra  
Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
Joshi, Shri S. M.  
Kachwai, Shri Hukam Chand  
Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
Karni Singh, Dr.  
Kedaria, Shri C. M.  
Koushik, Shri K. M.  
Kripalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
Kriahna, Shri S. M.  
Kunte, Shri Dattatraya  
Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
Limaye, Shri Madhu  
Masuriya Din, Shri  
Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali  
Misra, Shri Srinibas  
Mody, Shri Piloo  
Mohamed Imam, Shri J.  
Mehinder Kaur, Shrimati  
Molahu Prasad, Shri

Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Naghnoor, Shri M. N.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Naik, Shri R. V.  
 Nath Pai, Shri  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Nihal Singh, Shri  
 Padmavati Devi, Shrimati  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri, D. R.  
 Paswan, Shri Kedar  
 Patel, Shri J. H.  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Poonacha, Shri C. M.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ranga, Shri  
 Ranjeet Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri V. Narasimha  
 Ray, Shri Rabi  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Shah, Shri Manohendra  
 Shah, Shri Shantilal  
 Shah, Shri T. P.  
 Sharda Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
 Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 Shiv Charan Lal, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh, Shri D. N.  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sondhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhakar  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra

**NOES**

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Ankineedu, Shri  
 Anthony, Shri Frank  
 Atam Das, Shri  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar

Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyannath  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
 Chanda, Shrimati Jyotsna  
 Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. R.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. C.  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gupta, Shri Lakhlan Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
 Jagjiwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavade, Shri B. R.  
 Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
 Khadiikar, Shri  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kisku, Shri A. K.  
 Koreki, Shri Lihdar

Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishnan, Shri G. Y.  
 Krishnappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahajan, Vikram Chand  
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Misra Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Ismail, Shri  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar, Shri D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana

Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddy, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Shushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishawnath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayana  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Sheth, Shri T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarshnam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Uikey, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

MR. SPEAKER : *The result \* of the  
 division is : Ayes 83; Noes 165*

*The motion was negatived.*

\* The following Members also recorded their Votes :

**AYES :** Sarvashri Raghuvir Singh Shastri, Teneti Viswanatham, Kanwar Lal Gupta, Atal Bihari Vajpayee and P. Venkatasubbaiah.

**NOES :** Sarvashri Ankinoodu and V. B. Tarodekar.

MR. SPEAKER. Now I will put amendment No. 530 standing in the name of Shrimati Sharda Mukerjee to the vote of the House.

*Amendment No. 530 was put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I will put amendments Nos. 531 to 536 and 636 to 638 standing in the name of Shri Shinkre to the vote of the house.

*Amendments Nos. 531 to 536 and 636 to 638 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I will put amendments No. 551 to 569 standing in the name of Shri M. Mohammad Ismail to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 551 to 569 were put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I will put amendment No. 629 standing in the name of Shri K. Anbazhagan to the vote of the House.

*Amendment No. 629 was put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now the question is :

"That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely :-

"but regret that there is no mention in the Address of the demand for removal of the chapter in the Constitution giving official status to Hindi only and for suitable amendments to the Constitution in order to remove the present discrimination against and the additional burden on the non-Hindi speaking people, especially in the South." (630)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 9] *AYES* [13.50 hrs.

Anbazhagan, Shri  
Anthony, Shri Frank  
Basu, Dr. Maitreyee  
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
Deiveekan, Shri  
Dhandapani, Shri  
Kamalanathan, Shri

Khan, Shri H. Ajmal  
Kiruttinan, Shri  
Krishna, Shri S. M.  
Krishnamoorthi Shri V.  
Mancharan, Shri  
Maran, Shri Murasoli  
Nambiar, Shri  
Patil, Shri N. R.  
Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
Ramamurti, Shri P.  
Sezhayan, Shri  
Viswanatham, Shri Tenneti.

*NOES*

Achal Singh, Shri  
Aga, Shri Ahmed  
Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
Ankineedu, Shri  
Atam Das, Shri  
Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
Babunath Singh, Shri  
Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
Barupal, Shri P. L.  
Bera, Shri S. C.  
Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
Bha'tacharyya, Shri C. K.  
Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
Buta Singh, Shri  
Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
Chatterjee, Shri Krishna Kumar  
Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
Chavan, Shri D. R.  
Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
Dalbir Singh, Shri  
Damani, Shri S. R.  
Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
Devinder Singh, Shri  
Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
Dinesh Singh, Shri  
Dixit, Shri K. P. C  
Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
Ering, Shri D.  
Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
Gandhi Shrimati Indira



Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gowder, Shri Nanja  
 Gupta, Shri Lakhan Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Kachwai, Shri Hukam Chand  
 Kalita, Shri Dhireswar  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
 Khadiikar, Shri R. K.  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kisku, Shri A. K.  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishanan, Shri G. Y.  
 Krishanappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahajan, Shri Vikram Chand  
 Mahato, Shri Bhajabari  
 Mahids, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Mishra, Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri

Parmar, Shri D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Shushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayana  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shabb, Shri T. P.  
 Shambhu Nath, Shri  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharde Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Shashi Bhusan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Seth, Shri T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shiv Charan Lal, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan

Siddhaya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Uikey, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 Verma, Shri Balgovind  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

Mr. SPEAKER : *The result \* of the division is :*

*AYES : 20; Noes 178.*

*The motion was negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I will put amendment No. 631 standing in the name of Shri K. Anbazhagan to the vote of the House.

*Amendment No. 631 was put and negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : Now I will put amendments Nos. 639 and 640 standing in the name of Shri Jagoshwar Yadav to the vote of the House.

*Amendments Nos. 639 and 640 were put and negatived.*

SHRI SAMAR GUHA : Sir, what happened to my amendment No. 441 regarding an inquiry about Netaji's death ?

MR. SPEAKER : I do not find your name here.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA : Sir, the conscience of the people demands an inquiry into Netaji's death. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, please.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA : Sir, my amendment should be put to vote by Division. For the last three years millions of people from the platforms of innumerable meetings have demanded fresh enquiry on Netaji.

MR. SPEAKER : You want division on it ?

SHRI SAMAR GUHA : Yes, Sir. 400 Members of Parliament demanded fresh enquiry on Netaji. Meeting of all the parties was convened by the Home Minister, in which both the Old Congress and the New Congress were represented. They unanimously demanded a fresh enquiry. The Prime Minister owes it to the nation and the nation should know what their attitude is about Netaji enquiry. You say, you show so much reverence to Netaji, but why should you not agree to have an enquiry as demanded by so many hon. Members ?

MR. SPEAKER : All right.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA : I move :

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely :—

“ but regret that there is no mention in the Address that the Government still hesitate to accept the national demand voiced by the majority of the members of Parliament and millions of our country men regarding a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in the year 1945.” (441)

MR. SPEAKER : I will put amendment No. 441 to vote.

\* The following Members also recorded their votes :

*AYES :* Shri B. K. Daschoudhary;

*NOES :* Sarvashri Raghuvir Singh Shastri and B. R. Kavade.

The question is :

That at the end of the motion, the following be added, namely :—

“ but regret that there is no motion in the Address that the Government still hesitate to accept the national demand voiced by the majority of the members of Parliament and millions of our countrymen regarding a fresh enquiry into the circumstances leading to disappearance of Netaji Subhas Chandra Bose in the year 1945.” (441)

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 10] *AYES* [13.54 hrs.

Agadi, Shri S. A.  
 Amat, Shri D.  
 Anbazhagan, Shri  
 Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
 Banerjee, Shri S. M.  
 Barua, Shri Hem  
 Basu, Dr. Maitreyee  
 Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyanaath  
 Brij Bhushan Lal, Shri  
 Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
 Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.  
 Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
 Deo, Shri P. K.  
 Dhrangadhra, Shri Sriraj Meghrajji  
 Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
 Gowda, Shri M. H.  
 Gowder, Shri Nanja  
 Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
 Guha, Shri Samar  
 Gupta, Shri i Indrajit  
 Gupta, Shri Ram Kishan  
 Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
 Joshi, Shri S. M.  
 Kachwai, Shri Hukam Chand  
 Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
 Kodaria, Shri C. M.  
 Khan, Shri H Ajmal  
 Kripalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
 Krishna, Shri S. M.  
 Kunte, Shri Dattatraya  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh.  
 Limaye, Shri Madhu  
 Maran, Shri Murasoli  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Mehta, Shri P. M.  
 Mirza, Shri Bakar Ali

Misra, Shri Srinibas  
 Mody, Shri Pilo  
 Mohinder Kaur, Shrimati  
 Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Nagnhoor, Shri M. N.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Nath Pai, Shri  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Nihal Singh, Shri  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri Phalajibhai  
 Patel, Shri J. H.  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Poonacha, Shri C. M.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ranga, Shri  
 Ray, Shri Rabi  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Sezhiyan, Shri  
 Shah, Shri T. P.  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal  
 Sharda Nand, Shri  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Shastri, Shri Prakash Vir  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh, Shri D. N.  
 Sondhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhaker  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapur'ah, Shri S. K.  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Vajpayee, Shri Atal Bihari  
 Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup  
 Viswanatham, Shri Tenneti  
 Viswanathan, Shri G.

*NOES*

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Ankhineedu, Shri  
 Atom Das, Shri  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpai, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri

- Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhanadre, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Bohra, Shri Onkarlal  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
 Chanda. Shrimati Jyotsna  
 Chandrika Prasad Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavan. Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki  
 Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. R.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dixit, Shri G. C.  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nagashwar  
 Ering Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri R. K.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gupta, Shri Lakhan Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jadhav, Shri V. N.  
 Jagjiwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavade, Shri B. R.  
 Kesri Shri Sitaram  
 Khadilkar, Shri R. K.  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishna Shri G. Y.  
 Krishnappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel, Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai Shrimati  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahajan, Shri Vikram Chand  
 Mahato, Shri Bhajahari  
 Mahida Shri Nerendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Misra, Shri S. N.  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Murthy, Shri B. S.  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Palchaudhuri, Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintaman  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokai Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar, Shri, D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
 Qureshi Shri, Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajni Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Dr. K. L.  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri

Saba, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankata Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Dwaipayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Shastri, Shri Ramanand  
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Sheth, Shri, T. M.  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad, Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 TaroJekar, Shri V. B.  
 Thakur, Shri P. R.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tula Ram Shri  
 Ukey, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 Verma, Shri Prem Chand  
 Vyas Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

MR. SPEAKER : The result \* of the division is :

Ayes : 80; Noes : 166.

*The motion was negatived*

MR. SPEAKER : I will now put the motion moved by Shri K. Hanumanthaiya

and seconded by Shrimati Savitri Shyam on the 25th February, 1970. The question is :

“ That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms :-

“That the Members of Lok Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on the 20th February, 1970.”

*The Lok Sabha divided :*

Division No. 11] *AYES* [13.56 hrs.

Achal Singh, Shri  
 Aga, Shri Ahmed  
 Ahirwar, Shri Nathu Ram  
 Ankineelu, Shri  
 Atam Das, Shri  
 Awadesh Chandra Singh, Shri  
 †Ayarwal, Shri Ram Singh  
 Babunath Singh, Shri  
 Bajpal, Shri Vidya Dhar  
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata  
 Barupal, Shri P. L.  
 Basumatari, Shri  
 Besra, Shri S. C.  
 Bhagat, Shri B. R.  
 Bhakt Darshan, Shri  
 Bhandare, Shri R. D.  
 Bhanu Prakash Singh, Shri  
 Bhattacharyya, Shri C. K.  
 Bist, Shri J. B. S.  
 Bhora, Shri Onkarlal  
 Bose, Shri Amiyanath  
 Brahmanandji, Shri Swami  
 Buta Singh, Shri  
 Chanda, Shri Anil K.  
 Chanda Shrimati Jyotsna  
 Chandrika Prasad, Shri  
 Chatterji, Shri Krishna Kumar  
 Chaturvedi, Shri R. L.  
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh  
 Chavan, Shri D. R.  
 Chavan, Shri Y. B.  
 Choudhary, Shri Valmiki

\*The following Members also recored their votes :

*AYES* : Sarvashri Raghuvir Singh Shastri, S. Kundu, Kiruttiman and Shrimati Nirlap Kaur;

*NOES* : Shri Shambhu Nath.

† Wrongly vote for *AYES*

- Dalbir Singh, Shri  
 Damani, Shri S. R.  
 Devinder Singh, Shri  
 Dhuleshwar Meena, Shri  
 Dinesh Singh, Shri  
 Dwivedi, Shri Nageshwar  
 Ering, Shri D.  
 Gajraj Singh Rao, Shri  
 Gandhi, Shrimati Indira  
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.  
 Gautam, Shri C. D.  
 Gavit, Shri Tukaram  
 Ghosh, Shri Parimal  
 Girja Kumari, Shrimati  
 Govind Das, Dr.  
 Gupta, Shri Lakhan Lal  
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri  
 Hem Raj, Shri  
 Jadhav, Shri Tulshidas  
 Jugjiwan Ram, Shri  
 Jamir, Shri S. C.  
 Jamna Lal, Shri  
 Kamble, Shri  
 \*Kameshwar Singh, Shri  
 Kamala Kumari, Kumari  
 Karan Singh, Dr.  
 Kasture, Shri A. S.  
 Kavade, Shri B. R.  
 Kesri, Shri Sitaram  
 Khadilkar, Shri  
 Khan, Shri M. A.  
 Kinder Lal, Shri  
 Kisku, Shri A. K.  
 Kotoki, Shri Liladhar  
 Krishna, Shri M. R.  
 Krishnan Shri G. Y.  
 Krishnappa, Shri M. V.  
 Kureel Shri B. N.  
 Kushok Bakula, Shri  
 Lakshmikanthamma, Shrimati  
 Lalit Sen, Shri  
 Laskar, Shri N. R.  
 Laxmi Bai, Shrimati  
 Lutfal Haque, Shri  
 Mahadeva Prasad, Dr.  
 Mahajan, Shri Vikram Chand  
 Mahato, Shri Bhajahari  
 Mahida, Shri Narendra Singh  
 Mahishi, Dr. Sarojini  
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.  
 Mandal, Dr. P.  
 Mane, Shri Shankarrao  
 Marandi, Shri  
 Master, Shri Bhola Nath  
 Menon, Shri Govinda  
 Mishra, Shri G. S.  
 Mohammad Yusuf, Shri  
 Nahata, Shri Amrit  
 Nanda, Shri  
 Nirlep Kaur, Shrimati  
 Palchaudhuri Shrimati Ila  
 Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani  
 Pant, Shri K. C.  
 Paokal Haokip, Shri  
 Parmar Shri, D. R.  
 Partap Singh, Shri  
 Parthasarathy, Shri  
 Patel, Shri Manubhai  
 Patil, Shri Deorao  
 Patil, Shri T. A.  
 Pradhani, Shri K.  
 Prasad, Shri Y. A.  
 Qureshi, Shri Mohd. Shaffi  
 Radhabai, Shrimati B.  
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri  
 Raj Deo Singh, Shri  
 Rajani Devi, Shrimati  
 Ram, Shri T.  
 Ram Dhan, Shri  
 Ram Sewak, Shri  
 Ram Swarup, Shri  
 Ramji Ram, Shri  
 Ramshekhar Prasad Singh, Shri  
 Rana, Shri M. B.  
 Randhir Singh, Shri  
 Rao, Shri Jaganath  
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana  
 Rao, Shri Thirumala  
 Rao, Dr. V. K. R. V.  
 Raut, Shri Bhola  
 Reddi, Shri G. S.  
 Rohatgi, Shrimati Sushila  
 Roy, Shri Bishwanath  
 Roy, Shrimati Uma  
 Sadhu Ram, Shri  
 Saha, Dr. S. K.  
 Saigal, Shri A. S.  
 Saleem, Shri M. Yunus  
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.  
 Sankara Prasad, Dr.  
 Sant Bux Singh, Shri  
 Sapre, Shrimati Tara  
 Savitri Shyam, Shrimati  
 Sen, Shri Uwalpayan  
 Sethi, Shri P. C.  
 \*Shah, Shri T. P.  
 Shankaranand, Shri B.  
 \*Sharda Nand, Shri

Sharma, Shri Naval Kishore  
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri  
 Sher Singh, Shri  
 Shinde, Shri Annasahib  
 Shiv Chandika Prasad, Shri  
 Shukla, Shri S. N.  
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan  
 Siddayya, Shri  
 Siddheshwar Prasad Shri  
 Sinha, Shri Mudrika  
 Sinha, Shri R. K.  
 Snatak, Shri Nar Deo  
 Sonar, Dr. A. G.  
 Sonavane, Shri  
 Sudarsanam, Shri M.  
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri  
 Sursingh, Shri  
 Swaran Singh, Shri  
 Tarodekar, Shri V. B.  
 Tiwary, Shri D. N.  
 Tiwary, Shri K. N.  
 Tula Ram, Shri  
 Uikey, Shri M. G.  
 Ulaka, Shri Ramachandra  
 \*Vijpayee, Shri Atal Bihari  
 Verma Shri Balgovind  
 Verma Shri Prem Chand  
 Vishwanatham, Shri Tenneti  
 Vyas, Shri Ramesh Chandra  
 Yadav, Shri Chandra Jeet

## NOES

Agadi, Shri S. A.  
 Amat, Shri D.  
 Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal  
 Brij Bhushan Lal Shri  
 Chauhan, Shri Bharat Singh  
 Deo, Shri K. P. Singh  
 Deo, Shri P. K.  
 Desai, Shri Morarji  
 Dhrangadhra, Shri Sriraj Meghrajji  
 Ghosh, Shri Bimalkanti  
 Gowda, Shri M. H.  
 Gowder, Shri Nanja  
 Goyal, Shri Shri Chand  
 Gupta, Shri Ram Kishan  
 Joshi, Shri Jagannath Rao  
 Kachwai, Shri Hukam Chand

Kedaria, Shri C. M.  
 Koushik, Shri K. M.  
 Kripalani, Shrimati Sucheta  
 Kushwah, Shri Yashwant Singh  
 Limaye, Shri Madhu  
 Lobo Prabhu, Shri  
 Masuriya Din, Shri  
 Mehta, Shri P. M.  
 Mody, Shri Pилоo  
 Mohamed Imam, Shri J.  
 Mohinder Kaur, Shrimati  
 Molahu Prasad Shri  
 Mrityunjay Prasad, Shri  
 Mukerjee, Shrimati Sharda  
 Murti, Shri M. S.  
 Naik, Shri G. C.  
 Nayar, Dr. Sushila  
 Padnavati Devi, Shrimati  
 Pandey, Shri K. N.  
 Parmar, Shri Bhaljibhai  
 Patel, Shri J. H.  
 Raju, Shri D. B.  
 Ram Subhag Singh, Dr.  
 Ramamoorthy, Shri S. P.  
 Ranga, Shri  
 Ray, Shri Rabi  
 Reddy, Shri R. D.  
 Saboo, Shri Shri Gopal  
 Shalwale, Shri Ram Gopal  
 Sharma, Shri Beni Shanker  
 Sharma, Shri Ram Avtar  
 Sheo Narain, Shri  
 †Sheth, Shri T. M.  
 Shivappa, Shri N.  
 Singh, Shri D. N.  
 †Sinha, Shri Satya Narayan  
 Somani, Shri N. K.  
 Sondhi, Shri M. L.  
 Supakar, Shri Sradhakar  
 Suraj Bhan, Shri  
 Tapuriah, Shri S. K.  
 Tyagi, Shri Om Prakash  
 Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.  
 Vidyarthi, Shri Ram Swarup

MR. SPEAKER : The result † of the  
 division is Ayes; 170; Noes : 60.

*The motion was adopted.*

\*Wrongly voted for AYES.

†Wrongly voted for NOES.

† The following Members also recorded their votes.

AYES : Saravshri S. N. Misra, G. C. Dixit, V. N. Jadhav, Shambhu Nath,  
 Ramanand Shastri, P. R. Thakur, Satya Narayan Sinha, and T. M. Sheth;

NOES : Saravshri Kanwar Lal Gupta, Ranjeet Singh, B. Anjanappa, M. N. Naghnor,  
 Kameshwar Singh, T. P. Shah, Ram Singh Ayarwal, Sharda Nand, and  
 Atal Bihari Vajpayee.

MR SPEAKER : We adjourn for lunch and we will meet at 3 P. M.

13.57 hrs.

*The Lok Sabha adjourned for Lunch till Fifteen of the Clock.*

*The Lok Sabha re-assembled after Lunch at three minutes past Fifteen of the Clock.*

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER in the Chair]

### RAILWAY BUDGET 1970-71 GENERAL DISCUSSION

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : Now, the House will take up general discussion of the railway budget. But before we do so, the hon. Minister wants to make some announcement.

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI NANDA) : I owe it to the House at the outset to present the facts about the financial situation of the railways in precise and clear terms to facilitate a realistic discussion of the problems of the railway system, and what may be expected of it in the coming years, especially the remaining period of the Fourth Five Year Plan.

I shall first set out briefly the position of the current year namely 1969-70 as it has emerged on the basis of the revised estimates of the traffic receipts, the working expenses, the dividend to the general revenues and other transactions. The revised figure for the net railway revenue for the current year is Rs. 145.88 crores. The corresponding amount of dividend to general revenues is Rs. 158.43 crores. There would thus be a shortfall of Rs. 12.55 crores in respect of the year 1969-70. The revised estimate of expenditure incurred on the non-remunerative activities, services and works charged to the Development Fund comes up to Rs. 20 crores, and no appropriation could be made out of the revenues of the year for transfer to the Development Fund. In addition, the railways have to pay Rs. 1.64 crores as interest on the loans taken from general revenues. This means in all a deficit to the extent of Rs. 34.19 crores in the year 1969-70 alone for meeting the dividend

liability. Development Fund Works and interest on borrowings. As the available balances in the revenue reserve fund and the development fund were only Rs. 2.84 crores and Rs. 1.26 crores respectively, the railways had to borrow from the general revenues Rs. 30.09 crores for meeting this deficit of Rs. 34.19 crores. Calculated on the same basis, the total deficit for the preceding five financial years commencing from 1964-65 and the current year works out to Rs. 165.87 crores. The railways had since 1st April, 1964 not only depleted the entire balance of Rs. 110.48 crores accumulated by them in earlier years in the revenue reserve fund and the development fund but also become indebted to the general revenues to the extent of Rs. 55.39 crores. On the same lines, the budget estimates for the year 1970-71 disclose a total deficit of Rs. 40.97 crores, if no additional resources are to be derived from increases in freights and fares.

The increases visualised in the budget proposals are expected to yield Rs. 39 crores. Even if we had all that accretion to the revenue, there would still be a deficit of nearly Rs. 1.97 crores.

Coming now to the Fourth Plan for the railways, the railways are expected to contribute Rs. 525 crores towards depreciation reserve fund, the entire amount to be spent during the Plan in replacing worn-out equipment, track and other assets. Excluding this Rs. 525 crores, the Plan outlay envisaged is Rs. 1000 crores, towards which the general revenues are required to contribute Rs. 585 crores and the railways Rs. 415 crores generated from their own earnings.

The Plan expenditure, excluding depreciation and investment in 1969-70, the first year of the Fourth Plan, was Rs. 160 crores. Against this, the actual expenditure expected to be incurred is Rs. 153.75 crores to which the railways will be contributing only Rs. 10.03 crores. Similarly, the Plan expenditure envisaged next year excluding depreciation is Rs. 180 crores towards which the railways would have contributed only Rs. 44.96 crores, even if all the proposals for increases in fares and freights had been accepted; with the reduction which I now propose, the railways' contribution towards