

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : You called me. Let me finish.

MR. SPEAKER : I have told you it cannot be brought up without my permission here.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : Please allow me to finish.

MR. SPEAKER : It is not on the agenda. How can I allow you ? Anything that is not on the agenda, I cannot permit.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : I was submitting before you.....

MR. SPEAKER : Are you on a point of order?

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : I am not on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER : Then, kindly sit down. Mr. Sondhi, you have set up a very bad precedent.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : It was not a rehearsal. You really called me.

MR. SPEAKER : I did not know what you were going to say. When I learnt it, I asked you to sit down.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : You called me.

MR. SPEAKER . Yes, and now I ask you to resume your seat.

12.23 hrs.

RE. MEETING OF CERTAIN OFFICERS
WITH SHRI T. T. KRISHNAMACHARI
—contd.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंगेर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, कल आप ने कहा था कि मैंने और डा० राम सुभग सिंह ने जो प्रस्ताव दिया है विशेषाधिकार के भंग के बारे में उस के बारे में आप व्यवस्था देंगे। अब मैं यह जानना चाहता हूँ कि यहाँ पर पी०सी० सेठी साहब ने कहा था कि टी०टी० कृष्णमचारी से जो अफसर लोग मिले थे उनके साथ उन्होंने बजट सम्बन्धी या कर योजना के बारे में कोई बातचीत नहीं की। लेकिन सुरेन्द्र नाथ द्विवेदी साहब ने कहा था कि उन की जानकारी के अनुसार इस तरह

की बातचीत हुई है और फाइल में नोटिंग भी है। उस के बाद प्रधान मंत्री जी ने कहा कि वह आप को फाइल दिखाएंगी तो क्या सदन के समाने यह मामला आएगा या नहीं कि जो बात हुई थी उस के बारे में कोई नोटिंग है या नहीं? अगर नोटिंग है तो चर्चा का विषय क्या था और इस को साबित करने के लिए क्या यह मामला आप विशेषाधिकार समिति के पास भेजेंगे जिससे कि विशेषाधिकार समिति इन अफसरों को बुला सके, उन को शपथ दिला सके और शपथ देने के बाद उन से पूछ सके कि असल में कृष्णमचारी के साथ क्या बातें हुई हैं? यह माननीय सदस्य हैं, सेठी साहब भी माननीय सदस्य हैं, मंत्री भी हैं तो इसलिए सदन को अन्धकार में न रखा जाय और सारे तथ्यों के बारे में यहाँ खुलासा हो जाय। मैंने यह सुना है कि प्रधान मंत्री ने स्वयं कबूल किया है कि नोटिंग है लेकिन वह बखशी साहब का नहीं है, गोविंदन नायर साहब का है। अब मुझे पता नहीं कि पहले कोई नोटिंग था बाद में वह खत्म किया गया और गोविंदन नायर का नोट आया। इस का पता कैसे चलेगा? इस का खुलासा होना चाहिए। अगर प्रिविलेजज कमेटी में मामला जाता है तो चारों अफसरों को बुलाया जा सकता और है उसका खुलासा हो सकता है। अगर सुरेन्द्र नाथ द्विवेदी जी की बात सही नहीं निकलती है तो मुझे पूरा विश्वास है कि वह मान लेंगे। लेकिन अगर उन की बात सही निकलती है तो फिर मंत्री महोदय को भी माफी मांगनी चाहिए। इसलिए मेरी आप से प्रार्थना है कि आप इस मामले का खुलासा करें और इस को विशेषाधिकार समिति के पास भेज दें।

SHRI S. S. KOTHARI (Mandsaur) : Shri T. T. Krishnamachari's ideas on taxation are obsolete. The Prime Minister must consult some greater people. Otherwise, I do not know what will be the fate of the Indian economy.

DR. RAM SUBHAG SINGH (Buxar) : It was stated earlier that they went with the approval of the Prime Minister whereas the Prime Minister said: they asked me whether they could go there or not and I said that they could go. On behalf of the Government side it was stated that no notes had been left whereas later on it was admitted that notes were left by these officers. This is a matter which must be referred to the privileges Committee.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA (Contai) : May I say with reference to the statement made by the Deputy Minister of this House, Raja Bhanu Prakash Singh.....

MR. SPEAKER : That is a different matter.

SHRI K. NARAYANA RAO (Bobbili) : On a point of order. The other day in the proceedings there was reference to secret official documents. If we allow Members of Parliament.....(Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER : This is not a District Court; this is Parliament.

MR. SPEAKER : It is not a question which involves legalities; it is a question of fact.

आपने मुझे उस दिन कहा था कि वह मैं सारे जो इस के संबंधित पेपर्स हैं उन को देखूँ और प्राइम मिनिस्टर ने भी उस दिन कहा था कि जो उनके पास पेपर्स हैं वह मेरे सामने रखेंगी । तो बखशी के बारे में जो बखशी की तरफ से लिखा आया है इस में है कि मैंने उन के अंडर काम किया था, जब वह यहां आए काल करने गया और कोई बातचीत किसी रिश्तेदारी के बारे में हुई या और हुई और 26 को उन का बर्यडे था कृष्णमचारी का तो मैं उन के पास गया और ग्रीटिंग्स कर के वापस आया । न मैंने नोट लिया और न उन से बात हुई । . . . (व्यवधान)

गोविंदन नायर के बारे में मैंने पेपर देखे हैं । यह एक टाइपड पेपर है । उस पर किसी के कोई दस्तखत नहीं हैं, कोई बात नहीं है और उस पर नोट लिखा हुआ है कि कोआप-

रेटिव किस तरह काम करेंगे, अनएम्प्लायमेंट के बारे में किस तरह चलेगा और कुछ ओल्ड एज पेंशन के बारे में.... (व्यवधान)....अनला-फुल जो पेंशन्स का है इस का फंड कैसे कायम हो सकता है, क्या तजवीजें हैं—(व्यवधान) और इस के बारे में कहा गया कि गवर्नमेंट की तरफ से इतनी कंटीब्यूशन आनी चाहिए, फ्लां सोर्स से इतनी आनी चाहिए ताकि ओल्ड एज पेंशन को जारी किया जाय । इट इज ए कमेंडेबल स्कीम, दिस ऐंड दैट ।.... (व्यवधान) . . . —

If you want to hear me I can tell you that there is nothing about new taxation, nothing about budget; nor is it signed by anybody. It is just a typed note.

SHRI S. S. KOTHARI : Anything about expenditure tax?

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing about that. I have carefully gone into this once, twice, thrice.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : Better lay that paper on the Table of the House and circulate it.

MR. SPEAKER : Circulate it on whose behalf ? There is none to sign it. So, under these circumstances, I do not think there is any question of privilege.

As for the other matter, I have gone through the note passed on by Dr. Ram Subhag Singh about the contradictions. About this, the question is between directive and approval. The officers came and said we want to call upon him. "Can we go ?" And she says "You may, but I do not treat it as a directive." One may treat it as approval or treat it as permission or anything. I do not find there is any material on which we can base anything. We cannot hairsplit on the wording as to what is permission what is approval and what is directive. I do not think this question is worth going in for a privilege motion. I therefore think there is no privilege.

SHRI KANWAR LAL GUPTA (Delhi Sadar) : I want to raise a point of order.

श्री अब्दुलगनी डार (गुड़गांव) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जिस वक्त आपने अपना स्टेटमेंट दिया, मैं उस वक्त कलैरीफिकेशन के लिये प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर रोज करना चाहता था लेकिन बदकिस्मती से मैं आपकी आई कैंच नहीं कर सका। मेरा प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर यह है कि यह बात मानी गई थी.....

— [شہری عبدالغنی دار (گڑگانو)]
ادھیہکس مہودے، جس وقت آپ نے اپنا
سٹیٹمنٹ دیا، میں اس وقت کلیئر-
یفیکیشن کے لئے پوائنٹ آف آرڈر ریز
کرنا چاہتا تھا، لیکن بد قسمتی سے
میں آپ کی آئی کیچ نہیں کر سکا۔ میرا
پوائنٹ آف آرڈر یہ ہے کہ یہ بات
مانی گئی تھی

MR. SPEAKER : If you want a ruling, I have already given my ruling. I do not think there is anything more to be done.

SHRI ABDUL GHANI DAR : I am not challenging your ruling.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आपकी रूलिंग पर प्वाइन्ट आफ आर्डर नहीं उठा रहा हूँ लेकिन मैं एक बात पुछना चाहता हूँ।

SHRI ABDUL GHANI DAR : I do not challenge your ruling. Your ruling is a ruling. I am only raising this question. The State Minister has said that nationalisation of banking, social welfare and works and housing were the subjects discussed with him. Here, some hon. Members have raised the question as to why the Secretaries of these departments had not gone there, and why only the Secretaries in the Finance Ministry went. The Prime Minister, while making her statement, could not make this point clear as to why the Finance Secretaries alone went. (Interruption)

SHRI KRISHNA KUMAR CHATTERJI (Howrah) : Sir, he cannot go on speaking on the Speaker's ruling. (Interruption). Are you allowing discussion after your ruling, Sir? (Interruption)

श्री कंबर लाल गुप्त : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा कहना यह है कि उस दिन श्री द्विवेदी जी ने कहा था कि वहां पर बखशी जी का नोट था और मैं उस को माबित कर दूंगा। क्या आपने द्विवेदी जी को बुला कर इस बारे में पूछा कि आपके पास क्या सुबूत है? अन्यथा, अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह चीज साफ़ नहीं होती है, हो सकता है कि द्विवेदी जी के पास इस का कोई सुबूत हो। इस लिये मेरी प्रार्थना है कि आप द्विवेदी जी को बुला कर उन से इस के बारे में पूछिये।

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY (Kendrapara) : If this question is reopened, if you permit a debate here, then I am prepared to stand by what I have said. But now, you in your wisdom have decided that this question would not be referred to the Privileges Committee. You mentioned something about Shri Bakshi. (Interruption). And it seems, according to your statement, he has given a statement saying that "I have not recorded anything." On this basis only you are giving your finding. I do not know when the matter that was raised is so serious, whether it was proper for you to base your conclusions on the basis of the statement of the officers concerned. Of course, I am not questioning your ruling. I am only pointing out that merely because the officer concerned has denied it, or said that he has given only this statement and no other statement—I do not know whether he has said that or not, but I could imagine it from the trend of the ruling..

MR. SPEAKER : I am still prepared to revise my ruling if anything else is brought to my notice.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY : Then we shall discuss it.

MR. SPEAKER : The material led before me, the statement and the paper I got from Shri Govindan Nair and the paper sent to me by the Prime Minister I applied my mind to them not once or twice but thrice. I have gone into every word of it and I can safely say that there was nothing about budget proposals or anything which could be the subject matter of a privilege motion.

SHRIMATI SHARDA MUKERJEE (Ratnagiri) : May I point out.....

MR. SPEAKER : I am not going to allow any debate in this.

12.36 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

ANNUAL REPORT OF THE INDIAN SCHOOL OF MINES

THE MINISTER OF EDUCATION AND YOUTH SERVICES (DR. V.K.R.V. RAO) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Annual Report of the Indian School of Mines, Dhanbad for the period 1st July 1967 to 31st March 1968. [*Placed in Library. See No. LT-2237/69*]

SHRI LOBO, PRABHU (Udipi) : Sir, I want to draw your attention to one point. This Report relates to the year ending March 1968. This has come before the House after 20 months. It is as cold as mutton. So, I would like to have an assurance from the Minister that such delays will not recur.

SHRI S. K. TAPURIAH (Pali) : Sir, you should ask for his explanation for the delay .

MR. SPEAKER : Is he raising a discussion ?

SHRI RANGA (Shrikakulam) : The usual practice is that we raise such objection when papers are being laid and it is for the Chair to direct them not to cause delays. There are many instances where delay has taken place and that is why, Sir, I wrote to you a letter, drawing your attention to this.

MR. SPEAKER : The Minister should ensure that no such delay takes place.

AIRCRAFT (FIFTH AMENDMENT) RULES

THE MINISTER OF TOURISM AND CIVIL AVIATION (DR. KARAN SINGH) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Aircraft (Fifth amendment) Rules, 1969, published in Notification No. G. S. R. 2379 in Gazette of India dated the 11th October, 1969, under section 14A of the Aircraft Act, 1934 together with an explanatory note. [*Placed in Library. See No. LT-2238/69*]

REPORT AND CERTIFIED ACCOUNTS OF SHIPPING DEVELOPMENT FUND COMMITTEE

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMEN-TARY AFFAIRS AND SHIPPING AND TRANSPORT (SHRI RAGHU RAMAIAH) : I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Report and Certified Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the Shipping Development Fund Committee for the year 1967-68, together with the Audit Report thereon, under sub-section (6) of section 16 of the Merchant Shipping Act, 1958. [*Placed in Library. See No. LT-2239/69*].

NOTIFICATIONS UNDER ALL INDIA SERVICES ACT

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA) : I beg to lay on the Table:

(1) A copy each of the following Notifications under sub-section (2) of section 3 of the All India Services Act, 1951:

- (i) The Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Fourth Amendment Regulations, 1969, published in Notification No. G. S. R. 1884 in Gazette of India dated the 9th August, 1969.
- (ii) The Seventh Amendment of 1969 to the Indian Administrative Service (Pay) Rules, 1954, published in Notification No. G. S. R. 1885 in Gazette of India dated the 9th August, 1969.
- (iii) The Indian Administrative Service (Fixation of Cadre Strength) Eighth Amendment Regulations, 1959, published in Notification No. G. S. R. 2614 in Gazette of India dated the 15th November, 1969.
- (iv) The Fifteenth Amendment of 1969 to the Indian Administrative Service (Pay) Rules, 1954, published in Notification No. G.S.R. 2615 in Gazette of India dated the 15th November, 1969.