

[Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee]
this delay? Who is responsible for this delay? He made an accusation. You said there was delay in nominating the Members. You accused the Chair.

SHRI L. N. MISHRA : I have not made any accusation.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : You said that there has been delay. You accused the Chair.

SHRI L. N. MISHRA : I have made no accusation against the Chair. There has been delayed nomination.

MR. SPEAKER : The Secretary tells me that nominations took place on the 17th and it was published on the 18th. Any way we shall look into it.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU : I want to make a submission. This is a clear case of breach of privilege. It should be referred to the Privileges Committee. How can you absolve the Minister?

MR. SPEAKER : It is a not a breach of privilege. Every thing is not a breach of privilege. One thing—it is not a breach of privilege.

The House now stands adjourned for lunch and we will re-assemble at 2 p. m.

13.24 hrs

*The Lok Sabha adjourned for Lunch
till Fourteen of the Clock.*

*The Lok Sabha then reassembled after
Lunch at Four Minutes past Fourteen
of the Clock*

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER in the Chair]

PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY
MEMBER

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (ग्वालियर):
उपस्थित महोदय, मैं घाय की इजाजत से एक
अभिनव स्पष्टीकरण देने के लिये खड़ा हुआ हूँ।
कल जब प्रधान मंत्री जी ने सदन में भाषण
किया, मैं उस समय उपस्थित नहीं था। शायद
उपस्थित भी होता तो टोका-टोकी करना ठीक

नहीं समझता। कल प्रधान मंत्री जी ने अपने
भाषण में कहा—मैं उन, के एक वाक्य को
उद्धरित करना चाहता हूँ—

“How dare he says that we are leaving
the people of Kashmir to the tender
mercies of the Pakistanis?”

मैं अपने भाषण में इस तरह का कोई वाक्य
प्रयोग में नहीं लाया। मैंने दो स्थानों पर काश्मीर
का उल्लेख किया है। एक जगह मैंने कहा था
कि शिमला समझौते के कारण...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The hon.
Member can only read it out. There can
be no debate on it now.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी मैंने क्या कहा
था, यह तो सुनना होगा।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : In the
first place, the hon. Member should have
been here and protested and that would
have gone on record. The hon. Member
had requested the Speaker, and the Speaker
had agreed. But under the rules, no de-
batable matter should be allowed and no
speech can be allowed. He can just read
out what he has given to the Speaker.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I
am reading out what I actually said
प्रधान मंत्री जी ने जो कुछ कहा है, वह मैंने
नहीं कहा है—यह मैं कैसे बता सकता हूँ, जब
तक मैं यह नहीं बताऊंगा कि मैंने क्या कहा
है।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : That is
not exactly contained in what he has given
to the Speaker. Then, it becomes a
debate...

SHRI K. MANOHARAN (Madras
North) : Let him clarify the position.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : If I allow
him, then I would be violating the rules ?...

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE :
What rule ?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The rule under which he has written to the Speaker. He can only read that out and he cannot go into the details.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Am I to read out only the portion of the Speech delivered by the Prime Minister or should I not read out from my speech also ?...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He can read out only what he has written to the Speaker.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Not exactly You have to allow me.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : No.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : It is not in the rules. There are no such rules

SHRI R. V. BADE (Khargone): Kindly read rule 353.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : You have allowed me to give my personal explanation.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The hon. Member may kindly resume his seat for a minute...

THE PRIME MINISTER, MINISTER OF ATOMIC ENERGY, MINISTER OF ELECTRONICS, MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS, MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING AND MINISTER OF SPACE (SHRIMATI INDIRA GANDHI) : May I submit, Sir, that you allow the Hon'ble Member to state what he had said, if you have no objection it is up to you, Sir,

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I think now you are prepared to waive the rules...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The hon. Member should not anticipate what I am going to say.

The rules says :

"A member may, with the permission of the Speaker, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the House, but in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward and no debate shall arise."

SHRI K. MANOHARAN : Here, there is no debate. He will only read out from his own speech.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let me finish what I was going to say. The hon. Member has written to the Speaker and his letter has been accepted and this is to be read to the House But if a debate arises from this, then...

SHRI MUKHTIAR SINGH MALIK (Rohtak) : He is only making a personal explanation.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : If he is going to start reading out what he said yesterday and what he did not say yesterday, then it becomes a kind of debate.

SHRI R. R. SHARMA (Banda) . He is only giving an explanation.

SHRI MUKHTIAR SINGH MALIK : He is only explaining the position. What does explanation mean ?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : This is the convention, that first of all, the Speaker must assure himself that no debate would arise. . .

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I met the Speaker in his Chamber and I convinced him...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : On the basis of this letter.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : On the basis of this letter, I sought his permission to offer a personal explanation. How can you prevent me from quoting from my own speech ? It was not perhaps correctly understood by the Prime Minister and that was why she had made that remark.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The hon. Member should have incorporated all that in his letter to the Speaker, but he has not done that.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : It is not needed. I have sought his permission to make a personal explanation.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I am in the hands of the House.

SHRI K. MANOHARAN : The House has already agreed.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I have to take the sense of the House. I am in the hands of the House. If the House would like me to depart from this well-laid rule, I have no objection ..

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : There is no rule...

SHRI K. MANOHARAN : You may put the question, then.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I shall take the sense of the House.

THE MINISTER OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (SHRI SWARAN SINGH) : We cannot certainly be a party to your departing from the rule, and you, Sir, are in the Chair now, and you are the best person to interpret that rule. From the letter that he has sent, it is evident that it was only a limited matter and he has quoted one sentence from the Prime Minister's speech. While making his personal explanation, he cannot go over the whole speech.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I am not going over the whole of my speech.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : He says that he has not said that. He can say that he had not said that. What more does he want now ?

SHRI MUKHTIAR SINGH MALIK : That is the only explanation that he wants to give.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Let us not lose time over this now. In the first place, the hon. Member should have been here.

It is necessary that every Member who participates in the debate should be present in the House when another Member speaks so that if the other Member says something which he says he has not said, he can protest and that could go on record.

SHRI R. V. BADE : But there was interruption.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : The hon. Member should have protested then, and that would have gone on record. It is an unusual thing that when a speech is made, the Member is not here and then he comes forward the next day and says that he never said that and, therefore, he has to offer a personal explanation. This by itself is unusual. . .

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : It is not unusual. This has been done here many times.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER . I would say this that this is an exception and it is not a precedent. If we start this convention, then every Member will say that he must be given an opportunity for personal explanation and to say that he never said this or he never said that. Then, there would be no end to it. Even so, the hon. Member went to the Speaker with this written document, and the Speaker has agreed, and I assume that he had permitted him to make a personal explanation on the basis of what he had written to him.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Will you please read out my letter to the Speaker ? Then I will be satisfied.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : Yes. He has written :

"Under Rule 357, I seek your permission to give a personal explanation in regard to the speech made by the Prime Minister. While intervening in the debate on the Simla pact, the Prime Minister said :

"How dare he says that we are leaving the people of Kashmir to the tender mercies of the Pakistanis ?"

"I never said anything like that in my speech. Either the Prime Minister did

not listen to my speech attentively or she has deliberately attributed thoughts and words which were never expressed by me.

"As I must make my position clear, I seek your permission to make a personal explanation."

The hon. Speaker has permitted it.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : I am satisfied now.

— —

14. 12 hrs.

MOTION *Re.* STATEMENT ON AGREEMENT ON BILATERAL RELATIONS BETWEEN INDIA AND PAKISTAN—*Contd.*

डा० गोविन्द दास (जबलपुर) : उपाध्यक्ष जी, मैं आज यहाँ कोई लम्बा भाषण करने के लिए नहीं खड़ा हुआ हूँ। कुछ नुक्तों को मैं उठाना चाहता हूँ और मैं चाहता हूँ जिन लोगों ने क्षिमला पेंकट के विरुद्ध कुछ कहा है या उसके विरोध में कोई प्रस्ताव आज रखे है उनको उन नुक्तों पर विचार करने की कृपा करनी चाहिए। पहली बात तो मुझे कहनी है वह यह है कि हमने एक से अधिक बार इस बात को कहा और दोहराया है कि हम किसी भी देश की भूमि का एक इन्च भी अपने देश में शामिल नहीं करना चाहते। क्या यह बात सही नहीं है? अगर यह बात सही है तो जिस भूमि को हमने जीता वह अगर हमारी भूमि नहीं थी तो हमारी उस घोषणा के अनुसार उसको वापिस करना हमारा कर्तव्य हो जाता है। जिस समय हमने यह घोषणा की थी उस समय इन विरोधियों ने इस बात को क्यों नहीं कहा कि जो भूमि हम अधिकृत कर लेंगे उसको हम वापिस नहीं करेंगे। उस समय तो कुछ नहीं कहा गया और आज जब वह भूमि वापिस की जाती है तो इस बात को कहा जाता है कि जो अधिकृत भूमि

हमारी थी उस भूमि को हमें वापिस नहीं करना चाहिए।

दूसरी बात जो मुझे यहाँ पर कहनी है वह यह है कि हम कुछ सिद्धान्तों पर महात्मा गांधी के समय से चले हैं। उन्हीं सिद्धान्तों के अनुसार यह समझीता हुआ है। उन सिद्धान्तों की कहां अबहेलना हुई है इस बात को हमारे विरोधी लोग बतलायें और कहें।

एक बात मैं मनोवैज्ञानिक कहना चाहता हूँ और वह यह है कि जिन लोगों का स्वयं का कोई चुनाव क्षेत्र नहीं है, जो लोग यहाँ पर महारानी सिधिया की कृपा से आ सके हैं..... (व्यवधान)... उन लोगों को देश के नाम पर कहने का क्या अधिकार है?... (व्यवधान)...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (ग्वालियर) : आप इन्दिरा गांधी की कृपा से भाये हैं, आप क्या बोल रहे है... (व्यवधान)... इनको लज्जा नहीं आती।... (व्यवधान)...

डा० गोविन्द दास : चुनाव में इन लोगों को जो हार हुई उसके कारण जो इनके मन में टीस थी उसको निकालने के लिए इस प्रकार की बातें कही जाती हैं। यह अपनी खोई हुई प्रतिष्ठा को फिर से प्राप्त करने के लिए है। मैं गत 49 वर्षों से इस सदन का किसी न किसी हैसियत से सदस्य रहा हूँ और मैंने इन्दिरा जी की तीन पीढ़ियों का काम स्वयं देखा है और उन तीन पीढ़ियों के साथ स्वयं काम किया है। मैं समझता हूँ मुझे इस बात का हक हासिल है कि मैं इन्दिरा जी के लिए कुछ धार्मिक कहे सकूँ। मैं समझता हूँ मेरे प्रतिरिक्त इस सदन का कोई ऐसा सदस्य नहीं है जो इस प्रकार के धार्मिक कहे करने का हक रखता हो। मैं देखता हूँ बंगला युद्ध के समय से लेकर आज तक जो बात हुई है वे केवल इसी देश के लिए नहीं, संसार के लिए एक धावर्ष के रूप में हुई हैं। हमने बंगला देश के युद्ध में इसलिए सहायता दी