

Calcutta, Manipur, Nagaland, Gauhati and Shillong during June-1973.

- (2) Report of Study Tour of Study Group II of the Committee to Himachal Pradesh during June-July, 1973.

12.04. hrs.

PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY MEMBER

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): Under Rule 357, I wish to make the following personal explanation :

An utterance of an hon. member, Shri B. P. Maurya has seriously disturbed me. *The Economic Times*, Bombay, dated 22nd November, carried an elaborate report on the 'No Confidence Motion' and in that it states:

"Mr. B. P. Maurya, a Congress Member, charged Mr. Jyotirmoy Bosu was in the pay-roll of one Mr. Singma."

My attention was drawn to this slander by a University teacher who came to interview me. Thereafter, I went through the debates carefully and I found that Shri B. P. Maurya had made the following statement :

"He is already on the pay-roll of Shri Singma. If it comes to me I can prove that. There is a limit to each and everything."

I wish to categorically state that what Shri Maurya has stated is totally false, baseless and fabricated. I have never heard or known any person under the above mentioned name (Singma); not to speak of deriving any benefit from him.

Shri Maurya has stated, "if it comes to me I can prove."

Now, it has become incumbent upon him to prove and establish on the floor of this House as to what has stated is correct. As far as I am concerned, if Shri Maurya is able to prove what he has stated, I shall take any punishment that the House will decide to bestow upon me. On the other hand, I expect Shri Maurya will come forward with a similar assurance, that is, to prove or resign.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): What has he to say?

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Jyotirmoy Bosu made a Personal Explanation.

There is a procedure that there is no debate on that.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur): Sir, there is a procedure in the House. May I invite your kind attention to three cases where (1) Shri Arjun Singh Bhaduria made certain charges; (2) certain charges were made by Shri Prakash Vir Shastri against late Prof. Humayun Kabir and (3) about the leader of the S.S.P.

Sardar Hukam Singh was in the Chair at that time. He agreed to give opportunities. He also said that he would decide the issue and, if anybody was wrong, he would ask him to apologise.

In the larger interest of upholding the banner of parliamentary democracy, I would request you to ask Shri Maurya either to prove it or to tender an unconditional apology—if I have said anything wrong, I must apologise—or, this matter should be referred to the Privileges Committee. Let the decision of the Privileges Committee be binding on both of them.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE (Calcutta—North-East): Shri Maurya is present here. It is not that he is taken by surprise. He is sitting here; he is smiling. He should apologise.

MR. SPEAKER: Normally, we do not have any debate on that.

श्री बी. पी. माँच (हापड़) : आदणीय अध्यक्ष महादय, मैं स्वयं प्रॉफेसर हीरेन मुखर्जी, जिनका मैं अपना बहुत ही आदर्श मान कर चलता हूँ इस सदन में, उन्हीं के कथन को ले कर चलना चाहता हूँ। 21 और 22 नवम्बर की डिबेट का अगर आप सामने रखें क्या क्या श्री ज्योतिर्मय बसु, नें इस सदन में कहा है, अगर उस को कहा जाय तो फिर से इस पीवच सदन का वातावरण दूषित हो जाएगा, मैं उस को दोहरा कर के अपनी जवान को गंदा नहीं करना चाहता। सिर्फ उन से यही निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि जब कलकत्ते में जायें तो बहुत ही आदर दिखाने हैं, वह बहुत ही सम्मान करते हैं और हर तरह का आराम देने हैं . . .

अध्यक्ष महादय : किस को देते हैं ?

श्री बी. पी. माँच : कोई भी सदन के सदस्य जायें वह बड़ा सत्कार करते हैं। हर तरह का आराम देने के साधन भी हैं। सदन के बाहर वह इतने अच्छे रहते हैं पर सदन में क्या हो जाता है। यह जो मैंने कहा, अव्वल तो मैंने लफज (Singma) नहीं कहा।

The tape record is there. I said, "You are in the pay-roll of some one." You can take out the tape record. It is there.

दूसरे यह उस उत्तीर्जित भावना में हैं जब इन्होंने राज्य सभा के एक सदस्य के बारे में कहा कि बीटकट चलते हैं। उन्होंने अपने पत्र में स्वयं लिखा है, कि आवेश में आ कर कहा है . . .

SHRI K. S. CHAVDA (Patan) : Everybody is paid by some one.

श्री बी. पी. माँच : 22 तारीख को जो कुछ उन्होंने कहा है वह बहुत ही भद्दे रूप में कहा है। उसी क्रिया की यह प्रतिक्रिया है। उन को भावना का अगर इस से ठेस पहुंची है तो इसे मैं वापस लेता हूँ। लेकिन उन से प्रार्थना करता हूँ कि शीशे के महल में रहने वाले दूसरों पर पत्थर नहीं फेंका करते। यदि वह चाहते हैं कि भविष्य में ऐसे शब्द उन के लिए न कहे जायें तो इस सदन में वह भाषा सोच समझ कर बोलें।

50 LSS/73—7

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE : On a point of order in relation to this. What Mr. Maurya has said, in spite of whatever professions he made about his respect for me, seems to indicate that, in spite of his intending to withdraw the purport of what has been reported and repeated here in this House, he sticks by a certain allegation; he has said that he is on the pay-roll of somebody else. What is the convention in this House if such allegations are made and left unproved? The Mudgal case reminds us that something alleged and proved against a Member leads to the Member losing his seat. Here is a Member who challenges the other Member. He is prepared to give up his seat. But the other Member merely says, 'I stick to my old allegation, but I withdraw what I have said' I am not going to be a member of this House to stomach this kind of statement, unless you intervene and put a stop to this kind of practice. Let us have some conventions properly established about the *bona fides* of the members of this House. We have a duty by the country. (Interruptions)

SHRI VIKRAM MAHAJAN (Kangra) : He has already withdrawn. The matter should stop here and it should not be pursued. The matter should end here.

MR. SPEAKER : I would appeal to both sides . . .

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Akola) : He made all sorts of allegations. Did any of the members ask him to prove that ? (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Do whatever you like. When the Speaker is standing, do you not extend the courtesy of sitting down ?

AN HON. MEMBER : Mr. Pilloo Mody has come.

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Mody will carry our good wishes to Islamabad when he goes there. Now Mr. Maurya has taken back these words. Sometimes it is the result of great anger that prevails in the House. They

[Mr. Speaker]  
say, 'You do this ? You do that ? You were this ; you were that'. And none is anything. Kindly do not use such language in future towards each other. He has said 'some one'. He has taken back that word, not stigma, Singma . . .

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE : What do you make of it ?

MR. SPEAKER : Please let me know what I should make out of it.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE : After all, what remains on the record of this House—and it will remain unless steps are taken to remove that out . . .

MR. SPEAKER : Please do not get angry. Two members have suggested—one from that side and one from this side—that it should be dropped now after he has withdrawn that word and given his explanation, though with a little excitement. Now I have said that the House agrees that we drop it.

Now, if you do not agree to it, let me know what I should do.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE : I would like to make a submission. My submission is just this.

We here, Members of Parliament, representing our people with a certain kind of character and solemnity attaching to the job, cannot sit together if we feel that we have amongst us people who say about each other and are prepared to stand by their statement that 'X' is in somebody's pay or 'Y' is in somebody's pay or 'Z' is in somebody's pay, it remains and it sticks to my memory. But, as a Member of Parliament, and all these hon. gentlemen representing people to continue to be Members of Parliament, knowing all the time that allegations are left in mid-air, hanging indefinitely and nothing can be done—is that the way in which the Members of Parliament discharge their duty to the country ? Are we going to be in this House on this kind of understanding that we might all be

cheats more or less ? I do not understand. Some norms have got to be worked out and applied. If you do not propose to do so, we shall have to think how to behave in this Parliament.

SHRI K. NARAYANA RAO (Bobilli) : Not a debate, Sir. We have been side-trooking the issue. Mr. Bosu quoted the *Economic Times* and has also stated that he has verified the records. After verification he has stated that Mr. Maurya has stated that he is on the pay-roll of Singma. My point is this . . .

MR. SPEAKER : My fear is that your legal acumen may complicate the matter.

SHRI K. NARAYANA RAO : My point is this. Mr. Bosu has misled the entire House by stating that he verified the records and found that Mr. Maurya stated that he was on the pay-roll of Sigma, but, according to Mr. Maurya's version, he has not used any particular name but that he only said that he was on the pay-roll of someone. Therefore, there is a discrepancy. First of all you must check it.

MR. SPEAKER : I am not going to do it when he has withdrawn it. I am not going to do it.

SHRI K. NARAYANA RAO : He has misquoted the proceedings of the House.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU : Another insinuation. Sir, this is another serious charge on me that I have misquoted the proceedings and misled the House. Let us get hold of the debates.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA : May I seek one clarification ?

I seek clarification with regard to two points. The first is that generally we find that when such words are uttered by any hon. Member on this side, the Chair does not permit them to go on record. Then how did this thing go on record ? That is a matter of mystery to us because generally we find that not a single word of the type uttered by us goes on record.

Secondly . . .

MR. SPEAKER : I have to see how many were recorded and bring it to your notice. I will find out in how many cases they were recorded and will bring it to your notice; will you be satisfied ?

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA : Generally speaking, we have found you extremely alert in this matter.

MR. SPEAKER : I shall lay it on the Table. You do not know. Sometimes even while I see the agenda, there is a slip and a volley and burst goes out in the meanwhile. Sometimes, when I am listening to one gentleman may be Speaker or the Chairman there comes a volley or burst from the other unnoticed by the Chair.

In how many cases it found its way on the record on that side and in how many cases it found its way into the record on this side, shall I find out and let you know ? Now, I will request you to kindly drop it.

One thing, I must say. Prof. Mukerjee has suggested something. I greatly admire him for many reasons. But, in this particular case, he has made one suggestion which is worth considering. And, I am very confident that all of us will sit sometime together and see what type of norms we should adopt towards each other.

SHRI DINEN BHATTACHARYYA (Serampore): Before the U. P. elections.

MR. SPEAKER : I think it is much better we do it after that. You will never observe them so long as they are there ! We might sit together as groups of people some time. We must have certain norms. It is not like laying the eggs to be eaten, but as permanent, standing directions or rules which should be observed by both sides.

12.21 hrs.

#### RE : QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

डा. लक्ष्मीनारायण पांडेय (मंडसौर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं ने आप को एक विशेषाधिकार के उल्लंघन की सूचना दी है।

लोक सभा के 14 दिसम्बर के बुलीटिन में कहा गया है कि मुझे "13 दिसम्बर, 1973 को 09.15 बजे ग्राम हरसाला (इन्दौर जिला) में गिरफ्तार किया गया था, उसी दिन मजिस्ट्रेट के समक्ष पेश किया गया"। मंरा निबंदन है कि यह सूचना गलत है, क्योंकि पुलिस ने मुझे मजिस्ट्रेट के सामने पेश नहीं किया।

इस के अतिरिक्त टी. आई. निरपाल सिंह ने मुझे गिरफ्तार करते समय लोक सभा के प्रति बड़े अपमानजनक शब्द कहे। मैं चाहता हूँ कि आप मुझे इस विषय को सदन के सामने रखने की अनुमति दें।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप इतने टची न हों। कायदा यह है कि मरे पास गिरफ्तारी की इत्तिला आये। वह आ गई।

श्री ज्योतिर्मय बसु (डायमंड हार्बर) : लोकन उन को गाली दी गई।  
Members of Parliament cannot be arrested just like that.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (ग्वालियर)  
लोकन अगर इत्तिला गलत आये, तो ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय सदस्य मुझ से मिले और कहा कि मैं एक प्रिविलेज मांशन लाना चाहता हूँ। मैं ने पूछा कि किस लिए, तो उन्होंने बताया कि जब उन्होंने पुलिसमैन को कहा कि मैं लोक सभा में जाना चाहता हूँ, तो पुलिसमैन ने कहा कि आप को लोक सभा ही ले जा रहे हैं। इस में कौन सी गाली है ? मैं ने माननीय सदस्य से पूछा कि जब लोक सभा की मीटिंग हो रही है, तो वह वहां क्या करने गये थे।

डा. लक्ष्मीनारायण पांडेय : उन्होंने मुझे गिरफ्तार करते हुए कहा कि आप को लोक