

16.08 hrs.

SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (NAGALAND), 1974-75

THE MINISTER OF FINANCE (SHRI C. SUBRAMANIAM): Sir, I beg to present a statement showing Supplementary Demands for Grants in respect of the State of Nagaland for the year 1974-75.

DISCUSSION RE. ATTEMPT ON THE LIFE OF SHRI A. N. RAY, CHIEF JUSTICE OF SUPREME COURT OF INDIA—contd.

16.08½ hrs.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur): Sir, I have only three or four questions. First is, Sir, I am told that the traffic constable who has been suspended was not on duty at all. A wrong man has been suspended. His name is Waheed Khan. This is one thing. I would like to know whether it is true or not. Secondly, Sir, I am told that the Chief Justice of the Supreme Court, according to the protocol which is observed, is no less than at least a Cabinet Minister. But, he had no gunman. He had no protection. Now, he has been given so much protection that it is impossible for him to talk to his own relations. Sir, I would like to know whether it is a fact that the Chief Justice of this country....

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I hope you would not bring in bed rooms and all that.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: I am not talking of bed rooms. This is not the age. The question is, whether he is entitled to a gunman and if so, whether the gunman was there who could have possibly shot at the man who ran away and police could not chase him only because he did not run with chappals and he left his chappals. If he had run with chap-

pals, the police would have caught him. This is a sad commentary on the police that they cannot possibly arrest this man who ran without chappals.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Chappals are meant to be thrown at a person and not to run on.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Betul): The saddest commentary is that the man ran faster than the police.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Burdwan): Sir, the one was without chappals and the other was wearing heavy boots.

SHRI S M BANERJEE: The third thing I would like to know is about this. Generally what happens when such a dignitary goes out is that if it is not so hot, always the windows are up. In this case, all the glass windows were down. Who did it, whether Chief Justice Ray's son or driver? That was why somebody could throw something into the car. During these three days the police have investigated only one thing. The greatest revelation is that the two hand grenades were covered with only Bengali newspapers. I was surprised at this. Without entering into politics, I would like to say this. This is a serious thing. Let the police take action. In the heart of the city under the nose of authority, two grenades were thrown at the Chief Justice. Also it is a sad commentary on our Defence that they did not explode. This is another thing that needs looking into as to why both did not explode.

The fourth thing is that in the ordnance depots in respect of such things, the instructions are that they should be broken to pieces and then sold in auction. Shri Raghu Ramaiah was Defence Minister. He knows.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Minister of Defence Production.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: Whether it is in Kanpur or in any of the units...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am afraid you are begging the question.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: It was stopped during Shri Krishna Menon's time. Now it should be stopped. Otherwise, other men can have it.

These are three or four questions which I hope the hon. Minister will reply to.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: With the consent of hon. Members, shall I call the hon. Home Minister?

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Yes.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY): As rightly observed by you, Sir, the discussion was not confined to the matter at issue but went far beyond into other matters not strictly pertaining to it. I should like to take the cue from you and not make a long speech but finish it in a few minutes.

This attack on the learned Chief Justice of India is a matter for universal condemnation. I am sorry that during the debate in some of the speeches, though apparently there was condemnation of the attack, there was an under-current, a tone, which detracted from the severity of the crime. This, in my opinion, is unfortunate.

My submission to the hon. Members opposite who have raised the issue is this. There was security for not only the Chief Justice of India but also other Judges of the Supreme Court, with a complement of about one hundred constables and four other constables at the residence. But for some years it was on the advice of the Supreme Court itself that the personal security guard for the Chief Justice and other Judges was not given. Now the personal security staff of the Chief Justice of India has been increased, but not to the extent Shri S. M. Banerjee humbly made it out to be.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: There should be somebody there. Why should he always go with his son, without a gunman?

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: One other matter which caused me sorrow was the attempt by Mr. Samar Guha and Mr. Bosu; in the words of Mr. Bosu 'It was a planted operation, from the mouth of some other person 'it was a stage-managed affair', and from the mouth of Samar Guha 'these things are purposely done to divert the attention of the people from the burning problems of the day'. I am only sorry; I should like to say that these are in the realm of fantasy or they are freaks of their own imagination.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA (Contai): My imagination will be cleared if you kindly tell us: what is the Research and Analysis Wing, what is its objective and what is its function and programme and how much money is allocated to its budget

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: As usual Shri Bosu went off the rails. He talked about matters which are neither directly nor indirectly connected in any way with the matter under discussion. You are aware of the persistent efforts made by Opposition friends on the floor of Parliament and a section of the Press at character assassination and the increasing attempts that are being made here and outside to shatter the confidence and the credibility of the people in the efficacy of parliamentary system of democracy and our ability to improve the lot of our people. It is a matter which everyone of us should consider. This is in my opinion contributing greatly to this kind of hatred and is leading to an atmosphere of violence. It may be partly true; there may be frustration among educated youth because they are not getting adequate opportunities of employment. It is not a new phenomenon. It should be the effort of every one of us, especially Members

[Shri K. Brahmananda Reddy]

of Parliament to find out ways and means to see how best these educated people could be better employed. Instead they are creating this kind of atmosphere and a feeling in the minds of impressionable young men of disappointment and disenchantment in the present day Government and its policies and programmes and that is certainly another contributory factor in my opinion which is spreading this cult of hatred.

It is very difficult just now to say whether the event at Samastipur and later at Allahabad and recently in Delhi, here, are sporadic or a link-up or a political conspiracy or the influence of agencies either outside or inside. This is a matter which investigation alone can reveal and I do not want to hazard at this stage any guess or make any complaint against any particular individual or individuals. Therefore, I do not like to go into the merits of the other portions of the speech of Mr. Guha where he has tried to say that J. P. is a gift of God. I have no quarrel with him. The matter of praise is his own concern.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: It is the concern of the people. That is why millions and millions of people are hearing him.

SHRI K. BRAHAMANANDA REDDY: Mr. Guha must be modest enough to feel that he does not represent millions and millions of people. The point I wish to make is that in fact it is not as if in a democracy there is no scope for demonstration, there is no scope for criticism of the policies and programmes of Government or the actions of Government. Certainly there is ample scope and it should be done, we want it to be done, but by taking it to a realm of pure imagination and then casting all manner of doubts about the functioning of the system, I think they are in a way destroying the very foundations

of our system here, the system of democracy that is prevailing here.

My submission is this that this is the result of increasing recourse to extra-Parliamentary methods and mass agitations with violence. One may profess nonviolence, peaceful methods and all that, many have said so before and many say so even now, but it is obvious to anyone, even to a man in the street that these things certainly lead to violence which is undesirable and that it should be condemned by every section of the House if they believe in democracy. (*Interruptions*).

For instance, if any accident or anything happens on the road, immediately, and sometimes even before the accident has happened probably, some stories are invented to say that so and so is responsible. Some things have been said about Ramanathan's case, but it has now been investigated and the culprit and the driver have been found out. In the case of Mr. Chopra who unfortunately met with an accident, in a very accidental way I should say, also it has been said that this was done by design, by calculation etc. What does this mean? After all, people in this country die either on the roads or elsewhere, but if some unfortunate accident happens and immediately you connect it with some political motive and invent a story and put it across and then try to divert people's attention and mislead the people....

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Gwalior): The Home Minister referred to the accident which led to the death of the Customs Commissioner, Mr. Chopra. Has the investigation been completed?

SHRI K. BRAHAMANANDA REDDY: Not yet.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: Then how can you say it was an accident?

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: Ramanathan's case has been in-

investigated and it is in the final stages, where on account of a broken piece of the wind-screen the matter came to light. Mr. Chopra's case is being investigated. Why not wait till the result of the investigation is known? Within a few hours after an offence is committed, you come out with some story which will give a different impression to the public. The humble request I want to make to hon. Members is that in matters where a crime is involved, allow some time and wait till the investigations are completed. Something has been said about hand-grenades.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र (इलाहाबाद) : कील निकाल कर कागज में लपेटी गई थी—ये इस बात को कबूल करने है, उस के बाद भी कहते हैं कि मीरियस बम था।

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: Live handgrenades were thrown, but provisionally the fuse of the detonator did not ignite. It was a providential escape.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : आप ने जूडीशियरी को टेरोराइज करने के लिए ऐसा किया है— यह हम लोगों का आप पर चार्ज है।

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: Some conclusions were attempted to be drawn from the fact that two detonators were thrown and none of them exploded; therefore, they were planted there.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : मीसा को कन्टीन्यु कराने के लिए, जूडीशियरी को टेरोराइज करने के लिए इन लोगों ने ऐसा किया है।

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: I am not very much surprised at the sudden ejaculations of my friend Shri Janeswar Mishra.

AN HON. MEMBER: Ajnaneswar.

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: I do not want to say that.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Ejaculations too!

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: So far as Samastipur incident is concerned, it was a difficult job. The CBI have undertaken a very difficult task, I hope they are in the final stages of their investigation and probably they will take further steps to put the matter before a court of law. Even about this attack on the Chief Justice, police have got some useful clues and they are working on them. I hope ere long it will be possible for the police to book the real culprit.

SHRI S M. BANERJEE: After how many incidents?

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: I welcome your rumour, but there is a place for it. So far as the constable is concerned, it is the constable on duty who has been suspended, not an old man who was brought and suspended.

SHRI S M. BANERJEE: A man who was not on duty has been suspended.

SHRI K. BRAHMANANDA REDDY: If all of us want this cult of hatred or atmosphere of hatred not to spread in this country leading to sporadic violence or conspiracies, it should be our effort to create more confidence in the functioning of our system and in the fact that we will be able to deliver the goods through this system.

16.30 hrs.

STATUTORY RESOLUTION RE. DISAPPROVAL OF THE PRESS COUNCIL (SECOND AMENDMENT) ORDINANCE 1974 AND PRESS COUNCIL (AMENDMENT) BILL.—*contd.*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We resume discussion on the Statutory Resolution of Dr. Laxminarayan Pandeya to disapprove the Press Council (Second Amendment) Ordinance and the Bill of Shri Gujral. Dr. Pandeya is to continue his speech.