13.05 hrs.

PUBLIC ACCOUNTS COMMITTEE HUNDRED AND THIRTY-SEVENTH REPORT

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): Sir, I beg to present the Hundred and thirty-seventh Report of the Public Accounts Committee on paragraph 43 of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor-General of India for the year 1972-73, Union Government (Civil) relating to the Department of Supply regarding Purchase of Blankets.

की भोगन्द्र झा (जयनगर) : कालिंग ग्राटेशन में जो मैटर उठाया गया, उसमें जो नाम लिया गया है ग्रीर पार्टी के बारे मे जो बात कही गई हैं. मैं चाहूंगा कि उम का जवाब है ।

MR. SPEAKER: I have passed on to the next item

13,07 hrs.

STATEMENT BY SHRI MOHAN DHARIA ON HIS RESIGNATION FROM THE COUNCIL OF MINISTERS

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Mohan Dharia, earlier I received the gist and points of your speech, but I received this statement while sitting here and I have not been able to see the statement, but you can read that.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU (Diamond Harbour): I request that the same may be circulated to Members.

MR. SPEAKER: It came to me while I was sitting here.

Mr. Mohan Dharia.

SHRI MOHAN DHARIA (Poona): Mr. Speaker, I rise to discharge a painful parliamentary duty which is cast upon me. It cannot be a pleasure to make this personal statement to explain the situation in which I resigned from the Central Council of Ministers. I am on my legs with full sense of responsibility and accountability towards this august House and to the people of the country.

• Sir, to make my statement explicit to the Hon'ble Members of this House, I reproduce from the Prime Minister's letter of March 1, 1975 received by me at 1.15 PM on March 2:

'I have been astonished to readnewspaper reports of some of your speeches and also your reply to the letter of the Maharashtra Pradesh Congress Committee. It is obvious that your views on this issue are not in conformity with the thinking of the Congress Party.

If you had any doubts was it not your duty to convey them to me? In the circumstances it is not proper for you to continue in the Council of Ministers. I am informing the President accordingly.'

After the receipt of this letter, I immediately sent my letter of resignation to Rashtrapatiji which is as follows:

'I have just received a letter from the Prime Minister, copy of which is attached herewith. Had the Prime Minister shown the courtsey of indicating me her intention, either directly or indirectly, I would have immediately and willingly tendered my resignation. This letter of mine may kindly be treated as my resignation from the Council of Ministers of the Government of India I will offer my comments in this matter either through a statement to be made in Lok Sabha or through a press conference.' [Shri Mohan Dharia]

Sir, broadly I will dwell on the points raised in the Prime Minister's letter with other related circumstances.

Sir, we are living through critical times. This nation is facing unprecedented problems; the economic, social and political situation is in a state of ferment. I am fully convinced that I have to respond to this situation in a restrained manner. I was astonished and pained to read from the letter of the Prime Minister that I have not conveyed my differences of views to her. It has also been said that I do not share the policies of the Congress Party. I have not been able to understand the basis of these conclusions. Just to put the record straight I want to state that I have used the party forums and other avenues to make my views known to the Prime Minister and other dignitaries of the party to which I have the honour to belong. As early as November 19, 1974 I had sent a letter to the Prime Minister along with my note and requested her to take up the matter at the Narora Camp with a view to evolving a time-bound programme of action. I had suggested that integrated battle on social, economic and political fronts will have to be fought if we are to succeed against the reactionary forces in the country. I have expressed these views in my statements, speeches and public utterances. My letter of February 26, 1975 to the Prime Minister further elaborates my views. I wrote this letter after I endeavoured to get an appointment since 11th February, which could not materialise. I have made all possible efforts to keep her posted with my thinking. Even on most delicate and complicated issues I have ventured to express my opinion frankly to the Prime Minister. On October 7, 1974 I personally conveyed my feeling that the continuance of persons with dubious reputation in the Ministry would erode the credibility of the Government. I had no misgiving about the effect of my suggestions and requests but in a democratic setup I thought it my duty as a colleague to suggest the way out. It is unfortunate that very often these suggestions were not given any consideration and were ignored. On the contrary it resulted in growing misunderstanding. Any democratic or other system, where corruption is protected and honesty is penalised cannot endure for long.

Sir, to me democracy does not mean a mere tool to acquire political power and to hold it. It is a system meant to involve people in determining and running the course of country's administration with a view to achieving the objectives of the Constitution and the struggle for freedom in which the nation joined. The adminiswhole tration is expected to absorb certain ethical norms and should be responsive to the people's urges and their grievances. It is essential for the survival of this system. In any slowing down of these basic values, the democratic system loses not only its vigour but also its face. To adopt a callous attitude towards rising doubts in the public mind is easy but to ignore them is very dangerous. With understanding I had no this other option but to raise my voice at times even at the risk of being misunderstood. It may be easy to suppress the dissenting voice but surely it does not help the democratic functioning. In democracy we derive our strength and authority from the people. If this very source dries up. its decay is inevitable. The strength of this system is directly linked with the people's confidence in the honesty and integrity of those who are at the helm of affairs and also with their spontaneous conviction in the purposefulness of the functioning of the system. If this faith dwindles there will be nothing left except frustration and despair which ultimately leads to chaos and anarchy.

After 1967 we witnessed such a spectacle when in many places uncertain situations occurred. The conculsion in the Congress Party in 1969 was the result of this situation. As a humble worker of the party, I also

Statement by PHALGUNA 14, 1896 (SAKA) Statement by 245 Shri Mohan Dharia

contributed my mite to restore the faith of the people in the Congress and also in the very structure of parliamentary democracy. Under the able leadership of Shrimati Indira Gandhi the faith was restored and people extended their unfinching support which was reflected in the Lok Sabha election results of 1971 and Assembly elections of 1972. The period between 1969 and 1971 was one of making promises and giving assurances to the people in the new situation. In my view the period starting from the year 1971 should have been marked by the determination of the Congress and the administration to enter upon an era of performance, not only convincing to us, but to the people. The Congress election manifestoes of 1971 and 1972 and the resolutions of the party and the utterances of the Prime Minister are the charter of action on issues like poverty, unemployment, rising prices, non-availability of essential articles of mass consumption and the need for massive distribution system, elimination of social and economic disparities. growing curbing of monopolistic trends, removal of regional and other imbalances by paying special attention to economically backward areas and weaker sections of our population. eradication of black money and corruption, implementation of land reforms. changes in educational system, the overhauling of the administrative apparatus and the urgent task of electoral reforms. These programmes were projected to get the willing cooperation of the people to tackle these problems. These commitments to the people were made with the full knowledge of the hurdles that were bound to come in the way of implementing these programmes. Sir, if these very programmes are taken up by other political forces or individuals, how can we go back on our own assertions and reject a meaningful dialogue for the implementation of these policies and programmes? In my view such a dialogue is the essence of parliamentary democracy.

Parliamentary democracy hinges on very delicate balance. If we have

246 Shri Mohan Dharia

to run this system, we have not only to give opportunity to the opposition to criticise and attack us but we will have to instil a feeling in them to be co-partners in the nation-puilding activities. To-day we are too much engrossed with the problems of a small section of our people. The elitist politics of today is more concerned with the niceties of political manoeuvres and the whole energy is being frittered away in gaining a point over adversaries. We must remember that we are the representatives of a poor nation. Seventy per cent of our people are illiterate. The number of illiterates has steadily gone up during the last 27 years of our freedom.

About two thirds of our people are living below the poverty line. Out of 120 million people, who live in urban areas, nearly 30 millions have filthy slums or foot-paths and hume pipes as their dwelling places. Lakhs of our younger people, both educated and uneducated, are deprived of any opportunity to participate in the production processes and are denied to earn a dignified living. They have at present neither a feeling of particpation in nation-building activities nor can they look forward with hope for a fuller and richer life for tomorrow. This situation has caused enormous social tensions and strains. Even before the present movement led by Shri Jayaprakash Nərayan there were sporadic acts of violence and unrest at many places. If these problems remain, agitations are bound to grow, It is nothing but an expression of the surging albeit suppressed feelings of young men. If we have to remedy the situation, our emphasis should be on solving the problems. Over-politicalisation of the issues will further complicate them. Instead of having a solution, if we get involved in acrimonious debates, we may be driven away from the objective. It is for this reason that I ventured to suggest a policy of national dialogue and consensus on burning problems. I fail to understand how this aproach goes

247 Statement by Shri Mohan Dharia [Shri Mohan Dharia]

against the accepted policies of the Government, the Party or the basic tenets of parliamentary democracy.

Sir, the Prime Minister in her letter has made a reference to my reply to the President of the Maharashtra Fradesh Congress Committee. I shall not like to go into the political considerations of the letter and the reply thereto. But it will not be out of place if I quote from the letter which is relevant to this point.

"It calls for a very serious dialogue. This view of mine is also consistent with the philosophy of our party. While addressing the Congress Parliamentary Party meeting on February 15, 1975 (the very day you released the letter to Press) our Prime Minister advised the party members to have a dialogue with opposition Members with a view to avoiding acrimonious debate and confrontations. In the Presidential Address delivered by Rashtrapatiji only day before yesterday, i.e., on 17th he said:

I appeal to all sections of the people to ponder seriously over these fundamental issues, offer positive and constructive suggestions and criticisms and co-operate with the Government in working out national solutions. This is the democratic way. Any other way will lead only to chaos and disillusionment.'

The policy enunciated by Rashtrapatiji is the well considered policy of the Central Government and the Congress Party and I have committed no offence in making that demand in the Congress Camps and even outside. I would like to reiterate that whatever I have said is absolutely in the interests of the country, demogracy, our Porty and the Prime Minister. If it is a crime, I openly confess that I have committed the crime and in the interests of the country and democracy, whenevery necessary, at any cost or sacrifice, I shall fearlessly and repeatedly commit the same."

If a suggestion is made by the President and the same view is expressed by the Prime Minister I have every right to feel that my plea for a national dialogue with opposition parties including persons of the stature of Shri Jayaprakash Narayan is neither against the accepted policies of the Party nor aimed against parliamentary democracy. It is all the more necessary in meeting the present situation which is facing the nation. In a period of growing distrust and discord. it is the duty of parliamentary institulions to be the radiating points to generate mutual co-operation and goodwill in the minds of the people. To have conciliation and compromise for implementing national objectives is not a crime. In my speeches or in my stand on public issues I have not given any quarter to the reactionary and obscurantist forces nor have I ever pleaded for any clemency to those who stand in the way of achieving our national objectives I have been of the view that the cooperation of all such parties and people should be sought who are willing to contribute in the implementation of the policies in the interest of the comon man. I did try to lift these issues and objectives from the parrow confines of political labels, debasingly used to control the levers of power.

I am constrained to mention that some friends who claim to help us in accelerating the process of implementation of policies have thought it proper to use it for their own political ends. When they find my views inconvenient, they do not besitate to indulge in the worst type of personal vilification. It will be i_{cl} their cwn interest if my friends in the CPI realise, even at this stage, that any attempt to trade in the difficulties of the Congress Party and to aspire to

21 9 Shri Mohan Dharia

share power through political machinations will prove disastrous. It is a and spectacle that the CPI can conveniently ignore policy deviation; but has developed a tendency to make a big issue of certain trivial matters, which really do not count in the larger perspective in achieving our goal.

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA (Jainagar): Mr. Speaker, Sir ...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. no (Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER: Do not interrupt him. He is not yielding.

मान इतावट न कारए ।

SHRI MOHAN DHARIA; I am not yielding.

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA: If he is accusing the Communist Party, you must allow us to explain the position

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai); I agree with him that there should be a discussion of his statement.

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): When the Prime Minister does not get provoked, why is the CPI getting provoked?

MR SPEAKER: No interruptions please.

भ्राप शांति से सूनिए ।

After all, all others are listening. This is very wrong. Listen to him. Let him finish.

ग्राप भी सुनिए, बह भी तुन रहे हैं कांग्रेस वाले ।

SHRI BHOGENDRA JHA: He does not belong to the CPI; he belongs to the Congress.

SHRI MOHAN DHARIA: They seem to be engaged in exaggerating differences on unreal and imaginary issues and thus indulging in a sinister design to farnish the image of the Cong-

Statement by PHALGUNA 14, 1896 (SAKA) Statement by 250 Shri Mohan Dharia

ress Party and its honest and tried workers and 'eaders. With all the camouflage, they cannot conceal their real face from the people. It is bound to be exposed and in the process they will lose all that they think they have acquired by taking unprincipled positions.

Sir, ever since I joined the Council of Ministers, 1 have sincerely tried to fulfil the task entrusted to me. There is no denying the fact that on many occasions I differed with my leaders and with my senior colleagues as happens in democratic system. However, I may assure this August House that I have never deviated from my commitments to the country and to the people, whom I have the honour to represent. Here I am making a mention of my own constituency the Poona City Parliamentary Constitu-I presented my views and ency suggestions in writing to the Prime Minister at the time of the mid-term appraisal of the Fourth Five Year Plan. Soon after 1972 General Elections I submitted a note on timebound action programme for the Central and State Governments and the Congress Party with a view to fulfilling the commitments made to the people. I also submitted a note on the involvement of the people in the process of planning. In September. 1972. I submitted a paper "Rising prices, essential articles and commodities of mass consumption and their distribution." I insisted on serious discussions and decision. I felt that the Government has a moral responsibility to make available the essential articles and commodities at reasonable prices to the common man which is all represented in my report on this subject. I submitted by Report in December, 1973. I am r.ot aware of what has happened to my own report which is considered to be one of the important reports.

SHRI NOORUL HUDA (Cachar): We raised this matter on the floor of the House.

SHRI MOHAN DHARIA: At the Bidhan Nagar (Calcutta) plenary session of the AICC, a categorical assurance was given to the educated youth that a programme to generate half-amillion additional jobs for the educated unemployed will be taken up every year. I was put in charge of the cell created in the Planning Commission for this purpose. I made all possible efforts to formulate and implement this programme. To my great regret, no provision has been made for new schemes in the budget for the year 1975-76. I also draw the attention of the leadership to the assurance to implement programmes like Environmental Improvement Schemes, Housing for Weaker Sections and housesites for the landless and to provide adequate amounts for their implementation as envisaged in the Narcra programme. Unfortunately there is no adequate provision for the same. It is regrettable that my efforts in this direction not only failed but were not taken in the right spirit.

In this grave situation the parliamentary institutions seem to be satisfied with routine functioning and shadow-boxing. Challenges are urgent, situation serious and stakes are very high. We cannot affort to be complacent. The younger people are restless. They want to discover their own destiny. The protont challenges can be an opportunity, provided there is cohesive effort to mobilise the youth for the socialist advance. This opportunity can be availed if these parliamentary institutions become the true symbol of their hopes and aspirations.

Sir, may I place on record my feelings of gratitude to you, to the Chairman of the Raiya Sabha, to the Prime Minister, my colleagues in the Government and in Parliament and also to the members of my staff and also the staff of Parliament for their kind-cooperation and affection which they extended in abundance during the tenure of my office.

MARCH 5, 1975

In the hope of a better deal, the people have extended to the point of extravagance their support to the Congress Party. They are still ready to sacrifice and suffer for the common good. Their endurance is termendous. But they will refuse to bear up any more with a situation when promises have been forgotten and hopes shattered. I strongly ieel that such a situation should not be allowed to develop. As I see the writing on the wall. I feel it all the more intensely my national duty to raise my voice for the carrying out of our party's programmes. I have made all endeavours and strained every nerve for the common weal and shall continue to do so, regardless of risks involved. I am always prepared to pay any price for the values I have cherished and fought for. No hurdles can deter me from the charted path, hallowed by the supremo sacrifice of our martyrs. Mr. Snecker, Sir, I have seen my friends and colleagues falling without the slightest hesitation at the altar of the Motherland. I have seen those dead bodies in the pool of blood and I have taken the oath and therefore no sacrifice is supreme for me. It is all immaterial for me, whether I am a Minister or not. It is the glorious memories of their sacrifice and suffering, and not the position of power, which is the source of mv inspiration. Limitations are many and constraints are formidable, but let me assure you, Sir, that every struggle steels my determination ever more to recapture the spirit of the Freedom struggle.

I shall end by reminding the call given by Swami Vivekananda to the youth of this country. He said "you have read-भानदेवों भा गिरदेवों भा-Look upon your mother as God, Look upon your father as God". But I say, "दद्दिदेवो भव मर्खदेवो भव -- The poor, the illiterate. the ignorant, the afflicted-let these be your Gods. Know to these alone is the that service highest religion'

Sir, I would like to submit with your permission that whatever I have said is not out of any anger. It is out of my anxiety, it is out of my agony, for the progress and prosperity of my country and democracy. I am thankful to you for allowing me to lay on the Table of the House the papers, a list of which I have sent to you. I will simply read, with your permission, the list of the papers I am allowed to lay the Trable of the House:

- (i) Copy of the letter of March 1, 1975, from the Prime Minister.
- (ii) Copy of my letter written to Shri Fekhuddin Ali Ahmed, President of India (and copy endorsed to the Prime Minister) on March 2, 1975, at 1.30 p.m.
- (iii) Copy of my letter of March 2, 1975, sent to the Prime Minister, along with the copy of my letter sent to her on February 26, 1975.
- (iv) Copy of letter of February, 15, 1975, received from the President of the Maharashtra Pradesh Congress Committee.
- (v) Copy of my reply of February 19, 1975, to the President of the Maharashtra Fradesh Congress Committee.
- (vi) Copy of my note "Explosive Situation and the Way Out", on the basis of which I have made my statement at various camps and outside.
- (vii) Resume of my speech delivered in the series of lectures organised by the Harold Laski Institute of Political Science, Ahmedabad, of March 1, 1975.
- (viii) C'opy of my letter to the Prime Minister dated 19th November, 1974.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT. 9089/75].

Sir, I am grateful to your and to the whole House for giving me this patient hearing. Thank you very much.

13.40 hrs

The Lok Sabha adjourned for Lunch till Thirty Minutes past Fourteen of the Clock.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled after . Lunch at Thirty-jour Minutes past Fourteen of the Clock

[MR. DEPUTY-Speaker in the Chair'

श्री जनेक्वर मिश्र (इल हाताद) : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, हम ने नोटिम दिया है कि इस पालियामेंट के इई-गिर्द दफ़ा 144 लगी है और सारे देश में बस के प्रसिद्ध जवर्दस्ती सरकार कैंसिल कर रही है। रेल पर से टंडला में लोगों को उत र लिया गया है और लोगों को ग्राने नहीं दे रहे हैं। उसके वावजुद यहां जनता ग्रा रही है। इनको गद्दी खाली करनी पडेगी। ग्राप गह मंत्री से कहें कि वह इस ब रे में बयान दें। अगर प्रधान मंत्री को हिम्मत है तो देश भर की जनता यहां ग्रा रही है बह उस का सामना करें। (ब्धदव, न)

हम लोग रेल बजट पर वहस करने जा रहे हैं ग्रौर रेल मंत्री श्री कमलापति विपाठी यहां बैठे हुए हैं, लोगों को टुंडला स्टेशन पर उतारा जा रहा है। उनसे पूछा जाता है कि ग्राप डेमान्स्ट्रेशन में जा रहे हैं तो इजाजत नहीं मिलेगी । यह हरकत बन्द होनी चाहिए । हर बस पर 1,500 रु० लैवी ली जा रही है। <mark>म्राखिर यह सरकार जनता की है या तानाशाह</mark> सरकार है ।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not able to follow what he wants to say. If he wants to make a brief submission, let him do so in one or two sentences. He should not shout like this.

श्री जनेश्वर मिश्र : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, हम ने नियम 377 के तहत ग्रध्यक्ष महोदय को नोटिस दिया था। देश भर में जहां से भी

Statement by 255 Shri Mohan Dharia

MARCH 5, 1975

256 Shri Mohan Dharia

[श्रो जनेज्बर मिश्र]

कल के प्रदर्शन के लिये बसेज ग्रा रही है उनके मालिको को बला कर प्रान्त की सरकारे, जिलो के कनेक्टर और पुलिस कप्तान यह धमकी देने है कि अगर तुम प्रदर्शन मे अपनी बस ले जाग्रोगे तो तुम्हारा चालान किया जायगा ।

म्राज सुबह खबर मिली है कि जो योई भी रेल में चन रहा है, रन महकमे का हिदायत दी गई है कि लोगा को कान मे रोका जाय। ट्डला में 8) से ज्यादा लोगों को उतार लिया गया। समद भवन के चारा तरफ दफा 144 लाग है। पटेल चौक से इधर जनता नही जा सकती है ग्रोर उधर बोट क्लब तक। ग्रगर हिम्मत है सरकार मे तो जनता का म्काबला करे ग्रौर दफा 144 हटाये ।

ओ कृष्ण चन्द्र पांडे (खलीलाबाद) उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, विरोधी दलो का एक पेशा हो गया है कि रोज सरकार के ऊपर किसी न किसी प्रकार का ग्रारोप लगाया जाय। मैं विरोधी दलों के नेताओं से ग्रपील करना चाहता ह कि बिना टिकट यात्रा बन्द करा दे। जबर्दम्ती लोगो को लाना बन्द कर दे। इन्होने बहत सी बसेज को फुकने का कार्य प्रारम्भ कर दिया है। इस पर हमे भापत्ति है। जब जनता नही माना चाहती तो हम लोग क्या करे।

SHRI SAMAR MUKHERJEE (Howrah): It has appeared in the newspapers also that Government is putting obstacles in the way of normal transport by rail ways and motor transport I want to register my protest It is an attack on the elementary democratic lights of the people

श्री राम सहाय पाण्डेय (राजनदगाव) उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, हर चीज को राजनीतिक रग देने का प्रयास नही करना चाहिए। बसेज चल रही है, रेले भी चल रही हैं। जिनको आना है आ सकते है। जब यहा पर प्रदर्शन फीका होगा ग्रीर थोडे लोग ग्रायेगे तो उसके लिए भूमिका बनायेंगे पहने से कि बसेज कैमिल हो गइ, 80 आदमी टडला से उतार दिय गये। यह सब एक भमिका है। में आप को फहना चाहत ह कि प्रदर्शन की प्रक्रिया जा भी हो णातिपूर्ण होनी चाहिए। न बसेज रत रही है और न रेले रक रही है।

Statement by

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapui) I want to surg to your notice that our Constitution guarantees free mobility for the citizens of the country I wish to say that this is not a plea or an apology, in spite of this, lakhs of people are going to come to Delhi tomorrow But it is a fact that a number of bus owners and truck owners have been forced not to give their buses and trucks to those who are coming for thy demonstration We want to lodge our protest against this attitude and we would insist that you should please give directions to the Ministers concerned not to allow this demonstration to be obstructed

श्री हरुम चन्द कछव(य (मुरेना) मेरी जानकारी है कि राजस्थान, गजरात, मध्य प्रदेश, महाराष्ट्र ग्रीर ग्रामपाम के जो जिले है वहा से काफी बसो के परमिट नही दिये गये है। वहा के ग्राधिकारियों द्वारा कहा जाता है कि हमें दिल्ली से आदेश है कि किसी को परमिट न दिया जाय। इतना ही नही 6 राज्यो की पुलिस दिल्ली मे बलाई गई है और दिल्ली के ग्रासपास मडको पर खडी हई है और बसो को रोक रहे है।

मेरा दूसरा कहना यह है कि पार्लियामेट के ग्रन्दर डी० ग्राई० जी०, पुलिस ग्रौर एस॰ पी० साहब ने लोक सभा का निरीक्षण किया है, तो यह क्या लोक सभा के महासचिव से पूछ कर किया है। लोक सभा में आने वाले जो विजिटर्स है ग्रीर सवाददाता है. उन्हे लोक सभा देखने के लिए मना किया जा

257 Statement by PHALGUNA 14, 1896 (SAKA) Gujarat Budget, Shri Mohan Dharia 1975-76

रहा है श्रीर हम पास उनके लिए मांगते हैं, तो पास नहीं दिये जाते हैं श्रीर तमाम गैलरीज खाली पड़ी हैं। हमारे जो संवाददाता हैं श्रीर दूसरे विजिटर्स हैं उनको लोक सभा देखने के लिए पास नहीं दिये जा रहे हैं।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have expressed your feelings you have registered your protest. This side also has had their say. So, the matter should end there. We cannot go on wrangling over the same thing. The purpose is served.

भी हुकम खन्द कछवाय : लोगों को पास नहीं दिये जा रहे हैं। पास देने के लिए मना किया जा रहा है। हम पूछना चाहते हैं कि क्यों मना किया जा रहा है। लोग लोक-सभा देखना चाहते है ग्रौर यह जनता की लोक सभा है। (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The House cannot be run in this manner. I have given you enough opportunity.

अंहुकम चन्द कछवाधः लोक सभा के पास देना बन्द कर दिया है।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER. They have made certain allegations. I allowed them to give expression to it. You have repudiated it. You say, this is baseless, there is nothing like that. The matter should end there. What else do you want? Let us get on with the business of the House.

श्वीभनी मकल बनर्जी (नई दिल्ली) : जनमंघ के ग्रानरेबिल मेम्बर ने जो ग्रभी प्रोटेस्ट किया है, उसके जारे में मैं रह कहंगी कि उनका 1 नारीख से जलसा चल रहा है ग्रीर उनके काफ़ी लोग ग्रा चके है ग्रौर किसी को रोका नहीं जा रहा है।

दूसरी बात यह है कि श्री जनेक्वर मिश्र ने जो पालियामेंट के झासपास दफ़ा 144 67 LS--9. 1975-76 लगाने की बात कही है, तो दफ़ा 144 तो ग्राधिवेशन चलते समय संसद भवन के ग्रास-पास हमेशा ही लाग होती है, यह कोई नई

बात नहीं है। इसमे इन (Interruptions).

258

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order, please. I am not going to listen anything further on this. Nothing more will go on record.

SHRI HUKAM CHAND KACHWAL!

14.43 hrs.

GUJARAT BUDGET, 1975-76

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Now, before we take up the presentation of the estimated receipts and expenditure of the State of Gujarat for the year 1975-76, I have a note from Mr. Mavalankar saying that he wishes to raise a point of order. I do not know what is the point of order.

Mr Mavalankar.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): It is good that you are listening to the point of order before giving your ruling.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Of course. I think, it is the right of every Member to raise a point of order and it is the duty of the Chair to listen and to give a ruling.

SHRI P. G. MAVALANKAR (Ahmedabad): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, I am grateful to you for permitting me to raise a point of order on the Gujarat Budget and the Supplementary Demands for Gants for Grants for Gujarat to be presented to this House by the Minister of State in the Ministry of Finance, Mr. Pranab Kumar Mukherjee

My point of order is this. Gujarat continues to be under the President's

*Not recorded.