

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किस बात की कोरेसपोडेंस ?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : इसी मामले को लेकर ।

MR. SPEAKER: I am not concerned. It was not there in the privilege motion. I had disallowed that a few days ago and he cannot bring an identical motion.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : तीसरी बात यह है कि आप ने प्रधान मंत्री जी को बयान देने की इजाजत दी (बयवधान) ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब मैं ने इस को डिस्एलाऊ कर दिया था तो आप फिर कैसे इस को रोज कर सकते हैं ।

It is outside that. I had not accepted it.

ऐसे गोलमोल चक्कर से यह चीज नहीं आ सकती । मैं यह मानने के लिए तैयार नहीं हूँ । कोई रीजनेबिल बात होती है, तो मैं मान लेता हूँ । आप इस को इस ढंग से जाने की कोशिश करें यह नहीं हो सकता ।

यह कौन सी बात है आज भी यह मामला आया, पहले भी आया था और फिर तीसरे दिन आप इस को लाएँ । जब मैं ने इस को डिस्एलाऊ कर दिया है तो दूसरी दफा कैसे यह आएगा । क्या मैं सब रूल्स फेंक कर क्योंकि आप ज्यादा शोर करते हैं, आप की बात तबज्जह से सुनूँ और जो रूल्स हैं उन के मुताबिक चलूँ । ऐसा नहीं हो सकता ।

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: (Rajapur): If the issue was closed, why was the Prime Minister allowed to make a statement and not I? I am on a point of order..

MR. SPEAKER: No point of order can be raised when we are not on any business. I have moved on to the next item. I cannot allow any question or any debate on the Prime Minister's statement.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): Because of her statement, our doubt is confirmed.

MR. SPEAKER: Prof. Dandavate, if you have any thing, you can write to me or see me. You cannot raise in in this manner. I tell you once for all. I am not prepared for it.

SHRI PILOO MODY (Godhra): First of all, you do not read anything. The only right we enjoy in this House is the right of speech. If you take that right away, we do not need a House and we do not need a Speaker.

MR. SPEAKER: Next item. Shri Kulkarni.

12.30 hrs.

PLANTATIONS LABOUR (AMENDMENT) BILL

(i) REPORT OF JOINT COMMITTEE

SHRI RAJA KULKARNI (Bombay-North-East): I beg to lay on the Table a copy of the Report of the Joint Committee on the Bill further to amend the Plantations Labour Act, 1951.

(ii) EVIDENCE

SHRI RAJA KULKARNI: I beg to lay on the Table the record of the Evidence tendered before the Joint Committee on the Bill further to amend the Plantations Labour Act, 1951.

12.31 hrs.

RE. QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE— contd.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA (Contaj): On a point of order, under Rule 376.

MR. SPEAKER: I have passed on to the next item. I am sorry I cannot allow it.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Has you nationalised all points of order?

MR SPEAKER: A point of order can be raised on the item on which we are at present and that is item No 8 I know rule 376 If the point of order is regarding the privilege motion or the Prime Minister's statement I have disallowed it and passed on to the next item.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: You have to hear the points of order.

MR SPEAKER: That item is already over and we have gone to the next item.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA I want to raise a point of order on the statement made by the Prime Minister

MR SPEAKER I am not prepared for that, no, please

एक ही बात को रोज-रोज नहीं उठा सकते हैं।
भाषा भी उठाए, कल भी उठाए, परसो भी उठाए यह नहीं हो सकता है।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : प्रश्न कर लेने दीजिये।

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र : लोग क्या कहेंगे आपके बारे में बाद में क्या इस पर आपने कभी सोचा है ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : कौन मा है वह रुल जिस के तहत स्टेटमेंट के बाद आप प्रश्न कर सकते हैं ? रुल यह है कि मिनिस्टर के स्टेटमेंट के बाद आप क्वेश्चन नहीं कर सकते है।

SHRI SAMAR GUHA The rules of procedure are not your personal property It is the property of the House You have to be guided by the rules of this House

MR SPEAKER I cannot allow it

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE: When the Prime Minister makes a statement, it becomes the property of the House and we can raise a point of order.

MR SPEAKER: If you see the rules, after the statement, no questions can be put.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Is that a statement of that kind?

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: According to rule 376, we have the right (Interruptions).

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Ako): Under rule 372, when a statement is made by the Minister, no questions can be asked on that (Interruptions).

श्री श्यामनन्दन मिश्र : हमें अपना राइट एस्ट करेगे। हमारा मोशन है।

MR SPEAKER No, I am not prepared for that

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE: We must have the same right as the Prime Minister (Interruptions)

MR SPEAKER. I am very clear in my mind I will not allow any questions If you want to obstruct, that is a different matter As a matter of fact, when the same question was raised by Shri Vajpayee last week, when he wanted to ask questions, I disallowed it So, there is no question of allowing one member, when I have disallowed in the case of another member It cannot be done When I have disallowed in another case earlier, how can I allow it in this case? I cannot accept that position No I cannot do it

इस में सुनने की कोई वान नहीं है। चाहे इस में सारा दिन खल जाए। जो बात ठीक नहीं है वह नहीं करूंगा ?

The Prime Minister has got the prerogative and she has used that prerogative

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I am seeking your ruling on a procedural point. When Shri Vajpayee raised the question you said that the matter is closed Yet, the

Prime Minister was allowed to make a statement. I should enjoy the same rights as the Prime Minister.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अगर आप यह कहेंगे कि नहीं चलने देंगे तो आपका हाउस है न चलने दें ।

श्री इयासनन्दन मिश्र : बल्लभ चीज, नहीं चलने देंगे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : बेयर की रूलिंग मंजूर नहीं है इसलिए नहीं चलने देंगे तो यह कौन की बात हुई ।

श्री इयासनन्दन मिश्र : गलत चीज नहीं बर्नने देंगे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जो गलत चीज । जो मैंने सुना था उस दिन सुन लिया था । उसके बाद मैंने डिसएलाउ किया है । मैं दुबारा नहीं सुन सकता हूँ ।

श्री इयासनन्दन मिश्र : हम लोग नौकर नहीं है । जिस को नौकरी रखनी हो वह रखे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जब आप ऐसी बात कह रहे हैं जो मैं बड़ी दिनचरपी से आपका बेहरा देख रहा हूँ कभी हेरानी से आपका बेहरा देख रहा हूँ ।

No point of order except on the item on which we are. We have finished item 8.

उस दिन यह मसला उठा और माननीय सदस्य बोलिं। मैंने बात खत्म कर दी । फिर अगले दिन आप इस तरह उठकर कहते हैं कि हम कार्यवाही नहीं चलने देंगे ।

मैं आपको बता दूँ कि जो बात उस दिन डिस्पोज-आफ हो गई, उसको दोबारा नहीं लाया जा सकता है । क्लर्क के मुताबिक मैं उसको एलाउ नहीं कर सकता हूँ प्राक्कम 8 में इन्होंने रेडर ओवर रिजर्व है, अब प्रश्न उस पर पाइन्ट ऑफ ऑर्डर रख करना चाहते हैं तो कीजिये ।

Under the rules, I cannot allow it. It cannot be done like that. I do not accept it. Please sit down.

Order, please. Kindly do not disturb the House. All of you may please sit down. I want to proceed with the business. The members should not shout at each other. Kindly sit down. I have been allowing you, I have been listening to you, but I have made it very clear that the subject which was disposed of on that day, cannot come up again. Therefore, I cannot allow that. By this attitude I cannot be cowed down.

The matter was disposed of. That is not before the House now. I am not allowing any gentleman to speak anything.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: What is the ruling about the point of order I have raised?

MR. SPEAKER: I have repeatedly said that this matter was raised the other day by Mr. Vajpayee and I listened to him and after that, I had disallowed it. He was given full chance to say. I am sorry I cannot allow the subject to be re-introduced again.

SHRI PILOO MODY: In the last two weeks, legislation has proceeded quite smoothly. In the last two weeks the Opposition gave you no trouble.

MR. SPEAKER: I have not allowed any Member.

I tell you the Opposition in this country gets the maximum opportunity for expression of its views in spite of its size. Nowhere in the world you get so much time. It is a wrong propaganda that you are making that you are being stifled. It is an absolutely wrong propaganda. Nobody is going to believe it. You cannot say Committee and let us have their verdict as to what chances and opportunities you get in this Parliament. But you are not at all appreciating as to how many chances

[Mr. Speaker]

you are given and how much latitude you get. But the more you get the more unreasonable you are. You are simply exploiting that latitude. I will ask anybody to judge. Compared to any country in the world, the Opposition gets the maximum accommodation in this country.

Please sit down. I am not prepared to listen to you. There is a limit to it. You try to exploit this latitude.

(Interruptions)

SHRI PILOO MODY: On whose training and bidding are these people shouting? Will you please answer that question?

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down all of you.

SHRI PILOO MODY: Did you ever think of that? What conspiracy is going on over here? Do you know of that?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I am asking for your ruling.

MR. SPEAKER: My ruling is that I have not admitted it. I have not given my consent to the privilege motion. I cannot admit a motion on an identical matter everyday.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: There is a definite point of order on account of the statement of the hon. Prime Minister. What is this?

MR. SPEAKER: No. please. I cannot admit it. You can make a submission, if you want, on the last item of Shri Raja Kulkarni.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: We do not pass on to that item.

MR. SPEAKER: We will now go to the next item. Shrimati Indra Gandhi,

I am sorry, I am not allowing anybody. I don't allow matters over which I have given my ruling.

I had clearly told you in the very beginning that this matter was raised by Mr. Vajpayee last week and he was given a chance to speak. After all, on the day it was raised, whatever be the position, he wanted to say something about it and I allowed him to say something on it. And I ruled that I cannot give my consent to this Privilege issue. After this was disposed of, then the Minister voluntarily said that he would...

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPA-YEE: Immediately when I raised the question of privilege involving Prime Minister he got up and said he would like to have time.

MR. SPEAKER: I told you that this is not a privilege matter. But independently of that, you said, he can do that; this is what you said:

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस के बाद भी आप ने प्रधानमंत्री को स्पष्टीकरण देने के लिए बुलाया। अगर मामला बिल्कुल बन्द हो गया था, तो प्रधानमंत्री का स्पष्टीकरण कैसे आया?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप ने खुद ही कहा कि वह स्पष्टीकरण दें। मैंने डिस-एलाऊ कर दिया था। मैंने कह दिया था कि मैं अपनी कानसेंट नहीं देता हूँ। आपने स्पष्टीकरण मांगा और उन्होंने आप को आबलाहूज कर दिया। मैं बीच में कहाँ आ गया?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : श्री मधु दंडवते क साथ जा कारेसपांडेस हुई है, वह मेरे सामने नहीं थी। मैंने पार्लियामेंट का उन का जवाब देखा था और मुझे लगा कि प्रधानमंत्री ने गुमराह किया उन के पास तो करेस्पोंडेस है।

13.00 hrs.

MR SPEAKER: You can show it to me. I have not got it.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Would you not kindly consider that I have given a notice yesterday evening and this notice contains fresh facts and materials? Now, if fresh facts and materials are brought to your notice, would you not kindly consider whether a breach of privilege arises or not? The hon. Prime Minister has been pleased to make a statement. Whether it was in response to a request from an hon. Member on this side or not that is immaterial. But, a statement had been made by the Prime Minister which disclosed certain things which go in variance against whatever she said and therefore..

MR SPEAKER: I have already asked Prof. Dandavate to send it on to me. How can I know what is in his hands now? I say that it was identical. But, if you think that there is a difference, then send it on to me. I can examine it. But, don't cite this without any notice to me.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : आप यह कह सकते हैं कि जो नये नोटिस आए है उन के बारे में आप विचार करेंगे, कल विचार करेंगे लेकिन आप ने तो सारे दरवाजे ही बन्द कर दिए ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : जो इस वक्त तक आए वह मैं ने सभी देखे । उन के बाद में फ्रेज चाहते हैं तो

You send that on to me, I can examine it. You can produce that and say that this is your correspondence. How can I now know that?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I can send it on to you. Unfortunately, you do not find time to go through it.

MR. SPEAKER: If there is anything which is entirely fresh and not connected with that I am prepared to examine it—but not on this already disposed of.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: The motion is against the Prime Minister—not against any other person. If you think that a fresh motion cannot be brought against the Prime Minister, then we do not go by that kind of your ruling.

MR SPEAKER: Not on identical matter.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I can place that before you.

MR SPEAKER: Please send that on to me.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: If I place the material before you very briefly you will agree that—even the Prime Minister will realise there is a contradiction between that and her statement now.

MR SPEAKER: You give it to me and I shall see to that.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, what is your ruling?

MR. SPEAKER: My ruling is this. I have already seen it. I cannot allow an identical motion. If you have some fresh facts you can send them on to me. I shall see whether there is any difference from the previous one.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I shall send you a fresh notice. I sent my notice; there are four reminders to it.

MR. SPEAKER: At 10-30 when I saw the notices that were received they were all identical.

SHRI SAMAR GUHA: Sir, I rise on a point of order.