

LOK SABHA DEBATES

LOK SABHA

Thursday May 2, 1974/Vaisakha 12,
1896 (Saka)

The Lok Sabha met at Eleven of the
Clock

(MR. SPEAKER in the Chair)

RE. SUSPENSION OF QUESTION
HOUR

श्री एस० एम० बनर्जी (कानपुर) :
अध्यक्ष महोदय, जार्ज फरनांडीज गिरफ्तार
किये गए हैं।

SHRI A. K. M. ISHAQUE (Basirhat):
Let the Question Hour be over.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (ग्वालियर) :
अध्यक्ष जी, मैं नियम 388 के अन्तर्गत
..... (व्यवधान)

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA (Tumkur):
We will also raise point of order, Sir.
They must be within the rules. (In-
terruption).

MR. SPEAKER: All of you may
please sit down.

PROF. MODHU DANDAVATE
(Rajapur): Sir, let the Question Hour
be suspended, and let the House dis-
cuss the matter of the arrest of Mr.
George Fernandes. We have given for-
mal notice that the Question Hour
may be suspended and this matter may
be discussed. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE:
Have you received the notice about
suspension of the Question Hour or
not, Sir?

674 LS-1.

MR. SPEAKER: May I request all
of you to sit down?

आप सब लोग इकट्ठा क्यों बोलते हैं।

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: You
may kindly call those who have given
notice. We have given notice that the
Question Hour may be suspended.
What has happened to that?

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष
महोदय, आपको नोटिसेज दिए गए हैं, आपको
अधिकार है उनके बारे में विचार करें और
उनको रद्द कर दें लेकिन हमें पहले सुन लें।
(व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER: Will you kindly sit
down? If all of you get up and speak
simultaneously. I am not in a position
to listen to any hon. Member. You do
it everyday.

If all of you get up and speak it is
very difficult for any individual to
listen to so many people. I have not
been able to follow what is going on.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Mr. Speaker,
Sir, he has to respect the Rules of Pro-
cedure. How can you allow this
during the Question Hour? They can-
not flout the Rules. Why are they not
respecting the Rules of Procedure?
(Interruptions).

अध्यक्ष महोदय : एक दूसरे पर आवाजें
कसने से, शाउट करने से मसला हल नहीं
होगा। एक चीज आई है मेरे सामने, एक
मोशन उन्होंने भेजा है। मैं हैरान हूँ अभी
न उधर वालों को पता है क्या आना है और
न उधर वालों को पता है क्या आना है।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : आप मौका देंगे तब यह भी सुनेंगे और इनकी समझ में आ जायेगा ।

SHRI A. K. M. ISHAQUE: They cannot raise it during Question Hour.

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Unless the Rules of Procedure are respected we will not allow this. How can you allow this? They are flouting the rules in the conduct of business of the House. You please regulate the business according to rules of procedure. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: It is not in the interest of the House. After all if anything comes before the House and it is moved you have the right to oppose it. Shouting will lead us nowhere.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, नियम 32 के अनुसार पहला घण्टा सदन की बैठक का प्रश्नों, उत्तरों के लिए उपलब्ध होगा । यह नियम 32 है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : अब इस पर भी प्रश्न शुरु हो गये आप ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मैंने नियम 388 के अन्तर्गत यह प्रस्ताव दिया है कि आज प्रश्नकाल स्थगित कर दिया जाये और सदन, श्री जार्ज फ़रनांडीज की रात को तीन बजे गिरफ्तारी से उत्पन्न गम्भीर स्थिति पर चर्चा करें . . (व्यवधान) अध्यक्ष महोदय, श्री फ़रनांडीज के साथ श्री बहाभा और श्री सरकार तथा ऐक्शन कमेटी के अन्य और नेता गिरफ्तार किये गये हैं । उन नेताओं को आज 10 बजे रेल मंत्री से मिलना था । मुलाकात से पहले उन को गिरफ्तार करना रेल कर्मचारियों को हड़ताल के लिए उकसाना है । एक ओर सरकार कोशिश कर रही है कि हड़ताल न हो । सरकारी प्रचार के साधन यह बात जनता तक पहुँचा रहे हैं कि अगर हड़ताल होगी तो सारी

अर्थ-व्यवस्था अस्तव्यस्त हो जायगी, उस के गम्भीर परिणाम होंगे । लेकिन दूसरी ओर कल रात में कर्मचारियों के नेताओं को एम० आई० एस० ए० में गिरफ्तार किया गया है । एक तो यह एम० आई० एस० ए० का दुरुपयोग है और दूसरे आज रेल मंत्री से जो बातचीत होने वाली थी उस बातचीत को भंग करने की कोशिश है । मैं समझता हूँ यह गम्भीर मामला है, आप इस पर हमें तत्काल बहम करने का मौका दें । इसीलिए मैंने आप से इजाजत मांगी है ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं जानता हूँ कि यह एक असाधारण तरीका है । लेकिन असाधारण परिस्थिति में हमें असाधारण तरीका अपनाना पड़ा । आप हमें इजाजत दें, प्रश्नकाल स्थगित कर दिया जाय और इस पर तुरन्त बहम हो । (व्यवधान) ।

I move:

"That this House do suspend rule 32 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, in so far as it provides for the first hour of the sitting being made available for the asking and answering of questions, in its application to the motions for discussion on the situation arising out of arrest of Shri George Fernandes and other leaders of Railway employees".

MR. SPEAKER: May I request all of you to sit down. This is a motion under rule 388 and a similar one is suggested by Prof. Madhu Dandavate. The first is moved. I think both are identical. It comes to like this that rule 32 be suspended and question hour dispensed with and the following motion may be discussed. The motion is:

"Grave situation arising out of the arrest of Shri George Fernandes, Convener of the National Coordination Committee for Railwaymen's Struggle and other members of the

Committee who were scheduled to meet the Railway Minister today for further talks."

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE: आज 10 बजे बात करने का टाइम था Where is the Home Minister . जो गिरफ्तार करते हैं ?

MR. SPEAKER: He is not expected to be here.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI K. RAGHU RAMAIAH): We see no justification for the suspension of the rule. We uphold it.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, the Members of the ruling party are making it appear as if it is an issue of one single individual, Shri George Fernandes. We are not concerned with an individual. He is the convener of the National Coordination Committee for Railwaymen's Struggle. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: Now, I will put before the House this motion of Shri Vajpayee and Shri Dandavate.

श्री रामावतार झास्त्री (पटना) : श्री जार्ज फरनाडीज को रात को गिरफ्तार करने की क्या जरूरत पड़ गई ?

SHRI SEZHIYAN (Kumbakonam): Sir, there is a motion moved by Mr. Vajpayee and this motion is before the House. So, Sir, you may seek the opinion of the Members on the Motion which is already before the House. Mr. George Fernandes's arrest is a very serious situation. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: The question of debate will come only after this Motion is put before the House.

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Akola): This motion is out of order. Under what rule is it being moved? Under what rule are you allowing it. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER: If hon. Members go on like this, there will be no motion before the House. Let there be some motion put to the House. Now, I am putting the motion to the House.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: I have moved the motion and it has been objected to by the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. Before the House takes a decision, the Members should be given an opportunity to express their views.

अध्यक्ष महोदय : इस पर डिस्कशन करना है, तो आप सीधे ही कीजिए ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष जी, आप हमारा इरादा समझ लीजिए । हम यह चाहते हैं कि श्री जार्ज फरनाडीज को तुरन्त छोड़ा जाए । और दूसरे जो नेता गिरफ्तार किये गये हैं, उन को भी छोड़ा जाए ताकि वे भी रेलवे मिनिस्टर साहब से जो बातचीत होने वाली है, उस में भाग ले सकें और ऐसा रास्ता निकले जिस से रेल में हड़ताल न हो । इसीलिए हम यह मोशन लाए हैं । हम कोई हाउस के काम में गड़बड़ी पैदा नहीं करना चाहते हैं और हम प्रश्न-काल को टालना भी नहीं चाहते हैं लेकिन अगर यहाँ पर कोई हो, और सरकार की तरफ से कोई बोलने वाला हो और अगर हमारे सामने सरकार बैठी हो, तो उन में से कोई खड़ा हो कर कहे कि हम उन को रिहा कर रहे हैं ।

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: (Diamond Harbour): The point is that we are making an untiring effort to see that the railway strike is averted. (Interruptions). The Railway Minister had given a categorical assurance that he had an open mind, and we have been making our best effort to see that

[Jyotirmoy Bosu]

the railway strike does not take place. But in the meantime, on the strength of the secret circular issued by the Home Ministry, they have cast a big net to arrest all the leaders and railway workers. This morning at three 'O' clock at dawn stealthily, Government have arrested the chief leader Shri George Fernandes and so many others like Mr. Barua Shri Sarkar, Shri Chaudhury and so many others. Even the police came to our party office at dawn in search of some people.

We want to know whether Government are anxious to come to a settlement the dispute and end the strike or they want to go. (Interruptions). My demand is that all these arrested persons should be released at once, and negotiations should be resumed so that the railway strike could be averted which will mean something great for the workers and for millions of people.

SHRI PRIYA RAJAN DAS MUNSI: My only submission is that on the earlier occasions whenever such serious situations had arisen in our country, we have seen that you have allowed the seriousness of the situation to be discussed here.

My submission is that the Members should raise this issue after the Question Hour in a manner whereby the entire House's attention can be drawn to it, and not in the way in which they have raised it. I agree that the working people in the railways are in trouble, and negotiations are going on, and the entire House wants that a satisfactory settlement or outcome should be there. But I know the leader, and I would like to explain very clearly that the leader Mr. Fernandes is not taking the country among the lines on which the country can survive. He is deliberately creating a situation which is against the people and against the nation. So, I can quite see and appreciate the stand of the Government. Parliament has no time to waste on him by adjourning the business. They

are free to discuss the matter with the Railway Minister. This cannot be raised here in this manner (Interruptions). I say it because I believe it. They are creating panic and they are all trying to sabotage the nation. They are no friends of the nation. (Interruptions).

अध्यक्ष महोदय : सही क्वेश्चन्स हो जाने वाले थे लेकिन आधा घण्टा ऐसे ही जाया हो गया है। यह बीच में क्या अर्जाब सी चीज ला कर खड़ी कर दी।

श्री सतपाल कपूर (पटियाला) : यह हो क्वेश्चन-आवर है, इसमें यह चीज कहाँ से आ गई। आप उन को भलाऊ कर देते हैं। ... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : ये नई नई चीज रोज ले आते हैं।

श्री स० म० बनर्जी : एक दिन क्वेश्चन्स नहीं होंगे तो क्या नुकसान हो जाएगा।

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: This is the obituary of democracy.

MR. SPEAKER: Order, order. **Shri Shyamnandan Mishra.**

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): My submission is that first the point of procedure must be quite clear to the hon. members. We quite appreciate the agitation on the other side of the House....

SHR A. K. M. ISHAQUE: We have no agitation whatsoever. Please do not mislead.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Why do you interrupt me? (Interruptions).

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: You are taking away our question hour. That is why we are interrupting.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: The Question hour is a very potent instrument in the hands of members. We would not lightly take a step to suspend the Question Hour. Therefore, we share the view that it should not ordinarily be suspended. But here is an extraordinary situation. (*Interruptions*). Just now I am only pleading for the consideration of the chair, that is, the point of procedure involved. What procedure have we to follow in this matter? Only shouting from each side is not going to solve the problem. This has to be sorted out in the proper procedural manner. But we are not doing it in the manner we should.

Now the procedure the House can adopt is something like this. You have been good enough to accord your consent to the moving of the motion. The motion has been moved. Now the only question is whether the motion should be put to vote straightway or members on this side of the House should be allowed to persuade the entire House to see the reason for taking an unusual step of this kind. Should it be straightway put to vote? This is the universal feeling that a strike would be calamitous and every effort must be made to avert it. That is the universal feeling. But the matter must be done in a proper way. If that is so, the submission from this side of the House is that this is an extremely provocative step. The Government is trying to precipitate a show-down whereas we all want that the strike should be averted.

Therefore, this is a fit subject which must be thrown open for discussion and this side of the House must be permitted to persuade the entire House to see the justification for such a motion.

MR. SPEAKER: May I give you one advice? आपका क्वेश्चन आवर जो एक चष्टे का होता है, उसमें से आधा चष्टा तो ऐसे ही चला गया है और अगर इसी तरह

से चलता रहा तो बाकी भी डिफिक्ट हो जाएगा ।

श्री एस० एम० बनर्जी : अगर एक दिन क्वेश्चन आवर नहीं होगा, तो क्या नुकसान हो जाएगा ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप को क्वेश्चन-आवर लेना है, तो कुछ तो हिस्सा उसका कर लीजिए । आधा चष्टा तो ऐसे ही जाया हो गया है ।

ऐसे मोशन का फायदा ही क्या है क्योंकि इस तरह से न तो क्वेश्चन आवर ही हुआ और न आप की बात ही हुई । आधा चष्टा ऐसे ही चला गया है ।

श्री एस० एम० बनर्जी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं अपने दोस्तों से हाथ जोड़ कर कहता हूँ

SHRI K. LAKKAPPA: Why do you allow the Question Hour to be converted into a debating hour? Are you going to suspend the Question Hour everyday and convert it into a debating hour? Kindly give a ruling on this. Every day they will convert this into a debating hour.

श्री एस० एम० बनर्जी : मैं निवेदन करना चाहता हूँ कि क्वेश्चन आवर बहुत इम्पोर्टेंट है इसमें कोई शक नहीं है । हम भी चाहते हैं कि क्वेश्चन आवर हो । लेकिन आप देखें कि आप तकरीबन-तकरीबन सारी चीजों पर सम्झौता होने की बात थी । रात डेढ़ दो बजे तक लोगों ने मेहनत की कि किसी तरह सम्झौता हो जाए और हड़ताल टल जाए । मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि हम कोई खानदानी हड़तालिये नहीं हैं—(अव्यवधान) हम लोग समझ गये थे कि सम्झौता होने जा रहा है । दस बजे सम्झौते की बात चल रही थी । जब कि हमारे साथी मौजूद थे

और बातचीत कर रहे थे तो आज ही श्री जार्ज फरनेण्डीज को और हमारे दूसरे साथी पी० एन० बरुआ को, एन सरकार को तथा श्री चौधरी को गिरफ्तार कर लिया गया। जब सभ्यता की बात चल रही थी तब ऐसा किया गया। मुझे मालूम हुआ है कि उत्तर प्रदेश गवर्नमेंट को यहां से दिल्ली एडमिनिस्ट्रेशन का बार्नेट गया और वहां पर श्री जार्ज फरनेण्डीज को गिरफ्तार कर लिया गया तीन बजे सुबह। बरुआ साहब को यहां से गिरफ्तार किया गया। सरकार को यहां से किया गया। रेल मंत्री से जब पूछा जाता है तो वह जवाब देते हैं उनको मालूम नहीं है। दोक्षित जी कहां दिखाई नहीं देते हैं। ब्रेश्वन आवर इम्पर्टेंट जरूर है लेकिन देश की पूरी इकोनोमी के जब खतरे में पड़ जाने की बात हो तो वह उससे भी इम्पर्टेंट है। अगर सभ्यता नहीं हुआ तो मैं आपको यकीन दिलाता हूँ कि हड़ताल होगी और जम करहोगी। सारे इम्प्लायोज हड़ताल करेंगे फिर चाहे दोक्षित जी दोवार बन कर उनके सामने आ कर खड़े भी क्यों न हो जाएँ चाहे कुछ कर लें, हड़ताल होगी।

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI (Gauhati): I entirely agree with Mr. Mishraji that this House should go according to the procedure. Therefore, the question arises whether under rule 388 you have the power to suspend the question hour under rule 32. Rule 388 says that any Member may with the consent of the Speaker move that any rule may be suspended in its application to a particular motion before the House. If there is a motion before the House, there are certain rules under which the motion is discussed and if the House feels that any rule regarding the discussion of that particular motion could be suspended. Rule 388 is applicable to such things; it is not applicable now when there is no motion before the House..

SOME HON. MEMBERS: There is a motion before the House.

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI: For instance there are certain rules about time-limits for giving

motions. Suppose the House feels that in a particularly important matter a particular rule should be waived.

MR. SPEAKER: I allowed him to move it. Please resume your seat.

SHRI DINESH CHANDRA GO-SWAMI: Rule 388 does not permit the suspension of rule 32.

MR. SPEAKER: May I inform the hon. Members that the motion is already there and Mr. Vajpayee was allowed to move it. In my opinion no useful purpose will be served if you go on like this and take the whole question hour. I shall put it to vote now.

Let the Lobbies be cleared.

MR. SPEAKER: The Lobbies have been cleared.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BOSU: Sir, can I move an amendment.

MR. SPEAKER: No. Not at this time.

श्री मधु लिमये (बांका): मेरा बॉटिंग प्रोसीजर के बारे में प्वाइंट ऑफ आर्डर है।

MR. SPEAKER: During the Division, I do not know how you can do it. The Division is already in process.

श्री मधु लिमये : मैं पहले से खड़ा था, आपने मुझ को देखा नहीं। बॉटिंग के पहले से मैं खड़ा था प्वाइंट ऑफ आर्डर पर। आपने मुझे सुना नहीं, देखा नहीं। इस में मेरा दोष नहीं है।

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not introduce this new practice when the Division is already in process.

I am not able to listen. Please sit down. Mr. Madhu Limaye, is it only on voting?

श्री मधु लिमये : बोटिंग के बारे में मेरा प्वाइंट ऑफ ऑर्डर है। मैं पहले से खड़ा था। मैं अर्ज करना चाहता था कि वाजपेयी जी का जो प्रस्ताव है उस पर वोट लेने के पहले एए एक मिनट आप हम लोगों को सुनिये।

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. When Mr. Vajpayee moved his motion, I listened to Mr. Mishra, Mr. Sezhiyan, Mr. Jyotirmoy Bosu, Mr. Dandavate and Mr. Banerjee. I gave time to them and two Members from this side also. I gave chance to everybody.

श्री मधु लिमये : पार्टी का सवाल नहीं है। हम लोगों को नहीं सुना। मैं सदन को कुछ जानकारी देना चाहता था।

MR. SPEAKER: The question is: "That this House do suspend rule 32 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha, in so far as it provides for the first hour of the sitting being made available for the asking and answering of questions, in its application to the motions for discussion on the situation arising out of arrest of Shri George Fernandes and other leaders of Railway employees".

The Lok Sabha divided

Division No. 15]

[11.42 hrs.

AYES

Bade, Shri R. V.
Balakrishnan, Shri K.
Banerjee, Shri S. M.
Berwa, Shri Onkar Lal
Bhargavi Thankappan, Shrimati
Bhattacharyya, Shri Jagdish
Bhattacharyya, Shri S. P.
Bos, Shri Jyotirmoy
Chandrappan, Shri C. K.

Chatterjee, Shri Somnath
Dandavate, Prof. Madhu
Deb, Shri Dassaritha
Deshpande, Shrimati Roza
Dutta, Shri Biren
Godfrey, Shrimati M.
Guha, Shri Samar
Halder, Shri Madhuryya
Halder, Shri Krishna Chandra
Horo, Shri N. E.
Joshi, Shri Jagannathrao
Kalingarayar, Shri Mohanraj
Krishnan, Shrimati Parvathi
Limaye, Shri Madhu
Mavalankar, Shri P. G.
Mishra Shri Shyamnandan
Mukerjee Shri Samar
Nayak, Shri Baksi
Pandeya, Dr. Laxmínarain
Parmar, Shri Bhalijibhai
Patel, Shri H. M.
Saha, Shri Ajit Kumar
Saksena, Prof. S. L.
Sezhiyan, Shri
Shamim, Shri S. A.
Shastri, Shri Ramavatar
Shastri, Shri Shiv Kumar
Singh, Shri D. N.
Sinha, Shri Satyendra Narayan
Solanki, Shri Somchand
Vajyapee, Shri Atal Bihari

NOES

Achal Singh, Shri
Aga, Shri Syed Ahmed

Agrawal, Shri Shrikrishna
 Alagesan, Shri O. V.
 Anand Singh, Shri
 Arvind Netam, Shri
 Austin, Dr. Henry
 Babunath Singh, Shri
 Banamali Babu, Shri
 Banerjee, Shrimati Mukul
 Barua, Shri Bedabrata
 Barupal, Shri Panna Lal
 Basappa, Shri K.
 Basumatari, Shri D.
 Bhatia, Shri Raghunandan Lal
 Chaudhary, Shri Nitiraj Singh
 Chavan, Shri Yeshwantrao
 Chawla, Shri Amar Nath
 Daga, Shri M. C.
 Dalbir Singh, Shri
 Dalip Singh, Shri
 Damani, Shri S. R.
 Darbara Singh, Shri
 Das, Shri Anadi Charan
 Das, Shri Dharnidhar
 Daschowdhury, Shri B. K.
 Desai, Shri D. D.
 Dixit, Shri G. C.
 Engti, Shri Biren
 Ganesh, Shri K. R.
 Gangadeb, Shri P.
 Godara, Shri Mani Ram
 Gomango, Shri Giridhar
 Gopal, Shri K.
 Goswami, Shri Dinesh Chandra
 Kowda, Shri Pampan
 Hansda, Shri Subodh
 Hanumanthaiya, Shri K.
 Hashim, Shri M. M.
 Ishaque, Shri A. K. M.
 Jeyalakshmi, Shrimati V.
 Kadannappalli, Shri Ramachandran
 Kader, Shri S. A.
 Kailas, Dr.
 Kale, Shri

Kamakshalaiah, Shri D.
 Gamble, Shri N. S.
 Kamla Kumari, Kumari
 Kapur, Shri Sat Pal
 Karan Singh, Dr.
 Kaul, Shrimati Sheila
 Kedar Nath Singh, Shri
 Kishku, Shri A. K.
 Kulkarni, Shri Raja
 Lakkappa, Shri K.
 *Lakshminarayanan, Shri M. R.
 Maharaj Singh, Shri
 Majhi, Shri Gajadhar
 Majhi, Shri Kumar
 Malhotra, Shri Inder J.
 Mallanna, Shri K.
 Mallikarajun, Shri
 Mandal, Shri Jagdish Narain
 Mehta, Dr. Jivraj
 Mehta, Dr. Mahipatray
 Mishra, Shri Jagannath
 Modi, Shrikishan
 Muhommed Khuda Buksh, Shri
 Munsii, Shri Priya Ranjan Das
 Murthy, Shri B. S.
 Nahata, Shri Amrit
 Naik, Shri B. V.
 Negi, Shri Pratap Singh
 Painuli, Shri Paripoornanand
 Pandey, Shri Narsingh Narain
 Pandey, Shri Sudhakar
 Partap Singh, Shri
 Paswan, Shri Ram Bhagat
 Patil, Shri C. A.
 Patil, Shri T. A.
 Patnaik, Shri J. B.
 Purty, Shri M. S.
 Raghu Ramaiah, Shri K.
 Rai, Shrimati Sahodrabai
 Raju, Shri P. V. G.
 Ram, Shri Tulmohan
 Ram Dhan, Shri
 Ram Singh Bhai, Shri

*He voted by mistake from a wrong seat and later informed the Speaker accordingly.

Ram Surat Prasad, Shri
 Ram Swarup, Shri
 Rao, Shri K. Narayana
 Rao, Shri M. S. Sanjeevi
 Rao, Shri P. Ankinedu Prasad
 Rao, Shri Pattabhi Rama
 Rathia, Shri Umed Singh
 Ravi, Shri Vayalar
 Reddy, Shri K. Kodanada Rami
 Reddy, Shri M. Ram Gopal
 Rudra Pratap Singh, Shri
 Sadhu Ram, Shri
 Salve, Shri K. P.
 Samanta, Shri S. C.
 Sanghi, Shri N. K.
 Sathe, Shri Vasant
 Shafee Shri A.
 Sharma, Shri A. P.
 Shashi Bhushan, Shri
 Shastri, Shri Sheopujan.
 Shenoy, Shri P. R.
 Shetty, Shri K. K.
 Shivnath Singh, Shri
 Shukla, Shri Vidya Charan
 Sinha, Shri Nawal Kishore
 Sohan Lal, Shri T.
 Sokhi, Shri Swaran Singh
 Surendra Pal Singh, Shri
 Swaminathan, Shri R. V.
 Swamy, Shri Sidrameshwar
 Tiwari, Shri R. G.
 Tiwari, Shri D. N.
 Tombi Singh, Shri N.
 Uikey, Shri M. G.
 Venkatasubbaiah, Shri P.
 Venkatswamy, Shri G.
 Verma, Shri Balgovind

MR. SPEAKER: The result* of the division is: Ayes. 40; Noes: 125.

The motion was negatived.

ORAL ANSWERS TO QUESTIONS

अध्यक्ष महोदय : क्वेश्चन 915—श्री प्रबोध चन्द्र ।

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय मेरा पॉइंट ऑफ़ ऑर्डर है ।

MR. SPEAKER: You cannot raise a point of order during Question Hour.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं आप को कुछ महत्वपूर्ण जानकारो देना चाहता हूँ। मेरी बात को सुननेना अच्छा है। यह देशहित में है। आप दो मिनट के लिए मेरी बात को सुन लीजिए ।

MR. SPEAKER: There is no question of any point or order now.

श्री मधु लिमये : आज आप ने बिजिनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग बुलाई है। मेरा सुझाव है कि सदन को तत्काल एजर्न कर दिया जाये। मैं मोशन मूव कर रहा हू। मेरा ससपेंशन का मोशन नहीं है। मेरा एजर्नमेंट का अलग मोशन है ।

MR. SPEAKER: That question has already been decided.

श्री मधु लिमये : मेरा मोशन है कि इस सदन की कार्यवाही को इस वक्त स्थगित कर के बिजिनेस एडवाइजरी कमेटी की मीटिंग को तत्काल बुलया जाये। मेरा मोशन ससपेंशन के बारे में नहीं है ।

MR. SPEAKER: The time for that meeting has already been fixed. There is no point of order.

Maintenance of Records by Drug Manufacturers

§915. SHRI PRABODH CHANDRA: Will the Minister of HEALTH AND FAMILY PLANNING be pleased to state:

(a) whether drug manufacturers in the country have been asked to maintain, henceforth 'cost records' of their consumption of raw materials, power and fuel and wages paid to workers; and

(b) if so, the justification for such an order?

*The following Members also recorded their votes for NOES:

Shrimati Premalabai Chavan, Sarvavashri Anantrao Patil, Chinttamani Panigrahi and B. R. Bhagat.