

(f) The indigenous production of crude oil during these years is as under:—

Year	Qty. (Mill Tonnes)
1972	7.37
1973	7.20
1974	7.49
1975	8.25 (estimated)

The price of crude oil allowed to indigenous producers now is not linked to import parity. The value realised by the producing organisations year-wise is as under:—

O. I. L.		ONGC	
Year	Rs/ Crores	Year	Rs./crores
1972	33.96	1972-73	48.82
1973	34.52	1973-74	80.90
1974	41.64	1974-75	141.10
		(Estimated)	
1975	43.60	1975-76	170.62
(Estimated)	(Estimated)	(Estimated)	

The Assam oil Company itself refines the small quantity of crude oil produced by it. As this crude oil is not sold to any other organisations, information regarding its value is not available.

12.33 hrs.

RE QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Sir, yesterday, you had assured, if some material is placed before you, you will examine the matter and then the matter can be raised in the House. I checked the proceedings and on the basis of whatever information I had which was not raised by Shri Vajpayee on 27th when he raised the privilege issue, I submitted the material to you. My only humble submission is, let me make a submission on the basis of information that I have got which is very relevant to the privilege issue, those who have given the notices may also be allowed to make their submissions and whatever ruling you give, we will accept it.

MR SPEAKER: I asked you yesterday to send whatever fresh material you have got. But you did not send anything. Whatever I have seen, this material which you gave, I find there is no fresh matter in it because this is just the same subject on which I gave the ruling. Till yesterday morning whatever I received, I examined it. This is just another one of the same type. There is nothing fresh in that. I asked you to send fresh material if you have got any.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE. Shall I bring out the freshness of the matter. . . .

MR SPEAKER: I do not think there is any freshness in this matter.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA (Begusarai): Sir, I have a submission

to make with regard to this. I had also sent a notice this morning in continuation of the notice sent yesterday.

The point is that the hon. Prime Minister was pleased to make a statement yesterday which, to our mind, has worsened the position. The hon. Prime Minister, so far as I recollect, did say that the earlier circular was also issued by her Secretariat. Now what appears to stick to your mind is that the earlier circular was issued by her predecessor and she had only sought to revive that circular. That seems to be the impression in your mind. But yesterday the Prime Minister said—I stuck to my position because I claim to know something about this—that the earlier circular also was issued by the present Prime Minister. So, Sir, this impression that you are doing what had been done in the past is not correct. And that was what she earlier wanted to convey.

The second thing is that the hon. Prime Minister had claimed that it was of a restricted nature. Even though it was issued by her predecessor, it was restricted to China, Pakistan and Kashmir. But now it transpires that the circular issued by her Secretariat was of a general nature. This is a material difference. It was of a general character; it covered everything under the Sun, all the subjects that are being dealt with by the Government of India. So, in that respect also, it has been found to be incorrect.

Then, Mr. Speaker, you will kindly recall that the hon. Prime Minister wanted to say, and in fact she claimed, that the circular related only to statements. But now it is clearly established that it did not relate only to statements but also to supplementary questions. Mr. Speaker, you are the best judge in this matter whether a statement made by an hon. Minister is followed by supplementaries. Our rules do not permit putting of any supplementary questions after a statement is laid. So, again, the claim of the hon. Prime Minister that the circular related only

to statements is not a correct one. It also related, as the note issued by her Secretariat clearly establishes, also to questions.

SHRI VASANT SATHE (Akola): On a point of order under rule 222

MR. SPEAKER: Please wait for some time.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: After the statements are made, my point of order will become redundant.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: We never obstruct points of order. Let him raise it.

MR. SPEAKER: I do not think this is the stage for any point of order.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: You are allowing them to make statements contrary to rule 222. My point of order should be heard first. They are making statements after your ruling on the same subject, on the merits of the case, making allegations against the Prime Minister. Mr. Shyamnan-dan Mishra repeated the allegations against the Prime Minister. You have allowed him to make that statement. This is contrary to your own ruling. How can we reopen it?

MR. SPEAKER: I said that there was no fresh matter. But he says that there is a fresh matter and he has submitted a few words on that. There was no allegation in that.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Do you allow a statement to be made?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: There is no allegation. We will place all the facts and whatever ruling you give, we will abide by it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE (Betul): My respectful submission on the point is this...

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: may be permitted to make a submission. There is no question of allegation.

MR. SPEAKER: If all of you insist on points of order, I will not resist any point of order.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: My point of order is this. If they have some additional points for your consideration before a motion of privilege is to be admitted...

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Shall I make a brief submission?

I will only put the material that I had received from the Prime Minister's Secretariat.

MR. SPEAKER: I had requested you to send the material to me but you have not sent it to me.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I have already sent it

DR. KAILAS (Bombay South): He is not interested in sending

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I do not know whether you came late. I have already submitted it before 10 o'clock.

MR. SPEAKER: It is there. But you have quoted only a few lines. You were having a big one and flaunting it yesterday. I asked you to send it to me.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: If you kindly permit me two minutes, I will clarify the point and then you decide and give your ruling.

MR. SPEAKER: Is there anything new? I do not find anything new.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: The House has also a right to know.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I wish to point out to you that I am not bringing before the House the material that has already been brought forward by Shri Atal Bihari Vajpayee. I am trying to put forward some new material. Yesterday it was brought to the notice of the House that on 20th

November 1974 during the Question-Hour I raised the issue that some circular has been sent by the hon. Prime Minister to the Ministers regarding briefs to the questions to be submitted. She wrote a letter to you on the 28th of November. But I insisted that since I had raised the issue on the floor of the House, the Prime Minister should make a statement on the floor of the House. She made a statement on the floor of the House on the 4th December and she said, 'Before I came to office some circulars have gone from our office regarding questions relating to Kashmir, Pakistan and China. However, I have not sent any circular at all.' Therefore, she did not mention that some circular had already gone regarding statements. (Interruptions) Let me complete. I have got your letter. On 24th December 1974 the *Hindustan Times* carried to the front page a news report. They quoted the Prime Minister's Secretariat (Interruptions).

Let me complete... (Interruptions).

SHRI VASANT SATHE: What are you allowing him?

श्री मधु लिमये (बांका) : इसमें नया क्या है—हम लोग संक्षेप में बतलायेंगे ।

MR. SPEAKER: Order please. I am not able to listen when there is so much noise. I am not able to follow you.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: Let him refer to the new material.

MR. SPEAKER: The material you gave is not new.

(Interruptions.)

MR. SPEAKER: Everything was before me when I gave the ruling. You wanted two minutes. They are over now. Please sit down. When I ask you to discontinue, you must discontinue.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: wanted un-interrupted two minutes. want your ruling.

MR. SPEAKER: I have given my ruling. I request you to please sit down. You are just interrupting. I am not calling you now.
(Interruptions)

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, क्या अब आप मुझे सुनेंगे ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किस बात पर ?

श्री मधु लिमये : मैंने सेशन से पहले इसके बारे में एक नोटिस दिया है। मैं प्रिन्टेड डिबेट से दो वाक्य आपकी खिदमत में रखना चाहता हूँ . . .

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किस बात पर ?

श्री मधु लिमये : इसी पर।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : उस का जवाब मैंने दे दिया है।

श्री मधु लिमये : क्या आप मुझको दो मिनट नहीं सुनेंगे ? आपने श्याम बाबू को सुना, अटल जी को सुना, इनको सुना . . .

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी (ग्वालियर) : मुझे सुनना बाकी है।

श्री मधु लिमये : अगर आपका यह निर्णय है कि मधु लिमये को नहीं सुनना है तो कह दीजिये, मुझे कोई शक नहीं है। लेकिन ऐसा कह दीजिये।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप दो मिनट में कह कर खत्म कीजिये।

श्री बलरत्न साठे : तब आप सबको सुनिये, दूसरा कोई काम नहीं होना चाहिये, इस पर चर्चा होने दीजिये।

अब दूसरा कोई काम नहीं होने का है ? . . . (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : माननीय मधु लिमये जी, आप दो मिनट में खत्म कीजिये।

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय सबसे पहला मुद्दा मेरा यह है कि क्या प्रधान मंत्री ने गलत बयानी की ? उन्होंने 4 दिसम्बर को कहा यह प्रिन्टेड डिबेट है

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह सब धा चुका है इसको रिपीट करने की जरूरत नहीं है।

श्री मधु लिमये : "No circular has gone from the Prime Minister's Secretariat in my time. But, this was before my time,"

पहले तो यह कहा है कि मेरे कार्यकाल में कोई सर्कुलर नहीं गया। 28 नवम्बर, को आपको चिट्ठी लिखी, प्रधान मंत्री क्या कर्ती है :

"However, circulars were issued many years ago, before I assumed office, that replies to questions pertaining to China, Pakistan and Kashmir should be shown to the Prime Minister in advance. I thought that I would put the records straight."

अध्यक्ष महोदय, रेकार्ड स्ट्रेट करने के लिये इस तरह की गलत बयानी की गई है। प्रागे चल कर प्राइम मिनिस्टर सेक्रेटरिएट के श्री बोरी ने ऐडमिट किया है कि इन्हीं के कार्यकाल में हमारा सर्कुलर गया है। अब पहली गलत बयानी तो यह हुई जो कहा गया कि सर्कुलर नहीं भेजा गया। अब कहती हैं कि सर्कुलर भेजा गया, लेकिन वह स्टेटमेंट के बारे में है क्वेश्चन के बारे में नहीं है। लेकिन पहले सर्कुलर की जिसमें चर्चा की गई है उसमें कहा गया है :

"questions relating to China, Pakistan and Kashmir."

और दूसरे पक्ष में अध्यक्ष महोदय, सप्लीमेंटरीज कहा गया है।

[श्री मधु लिमये]

अब आप रूल 50 देखिये, मैं आपकी रूलिंग चाहता हूँ। भले ही आप हमारे खिलाफ रूलिंग दें, हमने आपकी रूलिंग को चैलेंज नहीं किया है।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : यह तो पहले घायी हुई है इसमें नयी बात कौन सी है।

श्री मधु लिमये . अध्यक्ष महोदय, स्टेटमेंट के बारे में रूल है 372, सूप्रीमोटी स्टेटमेंट दिया जा सकता है। उसमें कहा गया :

"No question shall be asked".

एक स्टेटमेंट किया जाता है काल एंटेनशन के जवाब में। . . . (व्यवधान)। . .

अब आप रूल 197 देख लीजिये उसमें सप्लीमेंटरी शब्द नहीं है उसमें क्वेश्चन्स है।

. . . . (व्यवधान) अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरी दिक्कत यह है कि यह सुनना ही नहीं चाहते। आप तर्कों को तर्कों से मिटा दीजिये। अगर मैं गलत बात कह रहा हूँ तो मास्टर साहब विद्वान हैं, कानून के पंडित हैं, चेयरमैन भी करते हैं मेरे तर्कों को काटे।

अध्यक्ष महोदय 197 में गया है।

"There shall be no debate on such statement at the time it is made."

यह कहा जाता है कि क्वेश्चन पूछा जा सकता है सप्लीमेंटरी नहीं।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : किस बात पर ?

श्री मधु लिमये काल एंटेनशन की बात मैं कह रहा हूँ। अध्यक्ष महोदय 372 पर कोई क्वेश्चन नहीं होता है। 197 पर क्वेश्चन होता है सप्लीमेंटरी नहीं। अब प्रिक्टिस कुछ मोडिफ़ाई हुई है, मैं भी जानता हूँ पांच, दस मिनट की स्पीचें भी अलाउड हैं। अब 199 क्या है ? 199 में रिजाइन करने वाला मिनिस्टर

ब्यान देता है। उस पर भी डिबेट नहीं है। श्री अब रूल 50 देखिये :

"Any member when called by the Speaker may ask a supplementary question for the purpose of further elucidating any matter or fact regarding which an answer has been given."

खुद बीरी साहब कह रहे हैं कि पार्लियामेंटरी प्रिक्टिस में स्टेटमेंट का विशेष पानी है। तो सप्लीमेंटरी क्वेश्चन, का भी विशेष पानी है। इसलिए अध्यक्ष महोदय सप्लीमेंटरी क्वेश्चन यह शब्द इस पूरी किताब में केवल रूल 50 में आता है और यही रूल शोट मोटिस क्वेश्चन के लिये भी आता है तो बीरी साहब कहते हैं कि यह स्टेटमेंट के बारे में था। मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि सप्लीमेंटरी क्वेश्चन के बारे में था। तो यह दूसरी बात गलत ब्यानी है। (व्यवधान)

वह कहती हैं कि मैंने कोई नया मर्कुलर नहीं दिया। और परसों हमारे प्रश्न के उत्तर में कहा था कि मर्कुलर दिया, और 4 दिसम्बर, को मैंने डिनार्ड किया ही नहीं। यह तीसरी गलत ब्यानी है। और कल इसी गलत ब्यानी को दोहराया। चौथी गलत ब्यानी के रूप में।

तो जब यह चार गलत ब्यानी हो जाती है कोई रिपेट नहीं है कोई ऐपोनाजी नहीं है तो क्या प्रिविलेज का सवाल नहीं बनता ? पहले दिन कहती हमारी गनती हुई। आप इन बातों पर अपनी स्पष्ट रूलिंग दीजिये।

THE MINISTER OF WORKS AND HOUSING AND PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI K. RAGHU RAMAIAH): I would like to place on record that circular relates not only to the Lok Sabha but also to the Rajya Sabha.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: What of that?

SHRI K. RAGHU RAMAIAH: First of all, under the rules of practice of Rajya Sabha, it is permissible for the members to put questions after a Minister makes a statement. Secondly, even in this House, even in regard to a statement the Prime Minister made the other day, a question was allowed. So it is not as if questions are not asked after statements. Hon. members should know that when the Prime Minister issues a circular, it is meant for not only proceedings of the Lok Sabha but also for proceedings of the Rajya Sabha. It is for both Houses.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : अध्यक्ष महोदय ; आप मुझे सुनिये ।

MR. SPEAKER: Kindly do not prolong it now. Yesterday we spent a lot of time; I do not want to repeat it today.

आप तो बोल चुके है । तो आबको मैंने डिस्पोज आफ कर दिया न है ।

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : ससद् कार्य मंत्री ने जो कुछ कहा है उसके बाद भी इस सवाल का जवाब नहीं मिला जब मंत्री ने 4 दिसम्बर को कहा कि उनके कार्यकाल में कोई सर्कुलर नहीं निकला तो बाद में उन्होंने कैमे मना किया कि सर्कुलर निकला ? कम से कम 4 दिसम्बर का उनका बयान गलत था यह उन्हें मान लेना चाहिये ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैं आपसे कहना चाहता हूँ कि पहले मैंने इसमें कोई नई बात तो पायी नहीं ।

Do not start quarrelling with each other. After all, we have to proceed in this House.

SHRI SHYAMNANDAN MISHRA: Peacefully.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE: On 4 December she said:

"No circular has gone from the Prime Minister's Secretariat in my time, neither verabily nor orally".

अब इसमें क्वेश्चन कहा से आ गया ?

अध्यक्ष महोदय : मैंने हमसे कोई नई चीज नहीं पायी है । मैंने अच्छी तरह से कल इसको देखा । और आज फिर से आये । मुझे में कोई नयी चीज नजर नहीं आयी । उन्होंने कहा हैवश्चन के बारे में ।

दूसरे जो उन्होंने स्टेटमेंट किया सर्कुलर का, यह यह कौन नहीं जानता है कि मिनिस्टर्स के जो ब्रीफ होने हैं उसमें प्रोबेबिल सप्लीमेंटरीज के भी स्टेटमेंट्स होते हैं । मैं भी मिनिस्टर रहा हूँ और माननीय म्याम नन्दन जी आप भी रह हैं । आप क्वीर ब्रीफ के आया करते थे जब मिनिस्टर थे ?

श्री श्याम नन्दन मिश्र : इसीलिये तो कह रहे हैं, यह जो कह रहे हैं, इन्होंने ब्रीफ के बारे में कहा है कि मिनिस्टरान उनको सबमिट करे ।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : स्टेटमेंट्स धार प्रेबिल सप्लीमेंटरीज के स्टेटमेंट्स भी होते है ।

दूसरी बात यह पैदा हो सकती है कि प्रधान मंत्री को कौन सो छिपाने वाली बात थी ? उनका यह प्रोपेर्टिव है, उनको कोई ऐमा तो है नहीं कि डर हो । यह बात कल तय हो चुकी है । प्रधान मंत्री को किम बात का डर है ? उनको अख्तियार है मिनिस्टर्स के स्टेटमेंट्स को देख सकता है । अगर पहले मैं वैश्चन्स का कहा तो दूसरे में स्टेटमेंट का कहा उन्होंने । स्टेटमेंट्स में जो सप्लीमेंटरीजा आते हैं को नहीं जानता है कि मिनिटर्स कः पास ब्राफ होता है, प्रोबेबिल सप्लीमेंटरीज पूछ जाते है उनको ब्रीफ का स्टेटमेंट्स होता है । इसमें क्या आसमान टूट गया ।

SHRI MADHU LIMAYE: She tries to conceal everything.

MR. SPEAKER: I am sorry, I cannot give my consent.

SHRI N. K. P. SALVE: We take this as your ruling.

MR. SPEAKER: Papers to be laid on the Table.

12.59 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

STATEMENT RE. SUPPLYING OF ESSENTIAL DRUGS AND MEDICINES TO GENERAL PUBLIC AND REPORT OF COMMITTEE ON DRUGS AND PHARMACEUTICALS INDUSTRY THEREON.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PETROLEUM AND CHEMICALS (SHRI K. R. GANESH): I beg to lay on the Table—

- (1) Statement regarding report of the Committee on Drugs and Pharmaceuticals Industry on measures for providing essential drugs and common household remedies to the general public, especially in rural areas.
- (2) A copy of the Report of the Committee on Drugs and Pharmaceuticals Industry on "Measures for providing essential drugs and common household remedies to the general public, especially in rural areas."
- (3) A statement (Hindi and English versions) explaining reasons for not laying simultaneously the Hindi version of the Report. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-9074/75.]

COMPANIES (PARTICULARS OF EMPLOYEES) RULES, 1975

THE DEPUTY MINISTER IN THE MINISTRY OF LAW, JUSTICE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI BEDABRATA BARUA): I beg to lay on the

Table a copy of the Companies (Particulars of Employees) Rules, 1975 (Hindi and English versions) published in Notification No. G.S.R. 41(E) in Gazette of India dated the 1st February, 1975, under subsection (3) of section 642 of the Companies Act, 1956. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-9075/75.]

MR. SPEAKER: I am not allowing it.

MESSAGES FROM RAJYA SABHA

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir, I have to report the following messages received from the Secretary-General of Rajya Sabha:—

- (i) "In accordance with the provisions of Rule 111 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to enclose a copy of the Air Force and Army Laws (Amendment) Bill, 1975, which has been passed by the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 27th February, 1975."
- (ii) "In accordance with the provisions of Sub-rule (6) of Rule 186 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to return herewith the Indian Tariff (Amendment) Bill, 1975, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 18th February, 1975, and transmitted to the Rajya Sabha for its recommendations and to state that this House has no recommendations to make to the Lok Sabha in regard to the said Bill."

AIR FORCE AND ARMY LAWS (AMENDMENT) BILL

AS PASSED BY RAJYA SABHA

SECRETARY-GENERAL: Sir I lay on the Table of the House the Air Force and Army Laws (Amendment) Bill, 1975, as passed by Rajya Sabha.