

17.55½ hrs.

STATEMENT RE : WEST BENGAL  
GOVERNOR'S ADDRESS TO BOTH  
HOUSES OF THE STATE  
LEGISLATURE

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN) : Sir, I am making a very brief statement. The Government have not received so far any report from the State Government regarding the Governor's Address to the Legislative Assembly and Legislative Council of West Bengal today. However, we gather that while delivering his Address, the Governor decided to omit two paragraphs from the printed text ..

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Shame, shame. (Interruption).

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : We further gather that at this state the Chief Minister protested against the omission of the paragraphs.....

SOME HON. MEMBERS : Hear, hear.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : The Governor interrupted his Address to draw attention to the correspondence which he had already exchanged with the Chief Minister in regard to these paragraphs.

AN HON. MEMBER : Nonsense.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : Thereupon, the Governor read the rest of the Address.

SOME HON. MEMBERS rose—(Interruptions).

AN HON. MEMBER : There is a constitutional deadlock.....

SHRI S. A. DANGE (Bombay Central South) : Did he advise the Governor to omit those two paragraphs or no ?

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : No, Sir.

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : (बलरामपुर)  
मैंने पहले आपसे निवेदन किया था कि यह बड़ी महत्वपूर्ण घटना है। जो कुछ पश्चिम बंगाल की

विधान सभा में हुआ है वह संविधान की दृष्टि से बड़ा महत्वपूर्ण है। यह प्रश्न केवल एक राज तक ही सीमित नहीं है, इसका प्रभाव सारे देश पर पड़ेगा। मैं चाहता हूँ कि इस पर सदन को चर्चा करने का अवसर मिलना चाहिए, यह मन्त्री चर्चा के लिए तैयार होंगे।

एक बात स्पष्ट नहीं हुई है। विधि मन्त्रालय के बारे में कहा जाता है कि उसने सलाह दी कि राज्यपाल चाहे तो भाषण के कुछ अंश पढ़ने से इनकार कर सकता है। यह मन्त्री ने अपनी स्थिति स्पष्ट कर दी लेकिन विधि मन्त्री को भी स्पष्ट करना चाहिए कि राज्यपाल ने जो कुछ किया वह केन्द्र की सलाह से किया या अपने मन से किया। और फिर इस पर चर्चा होनी चाहिए कि अपने मन से करने का अधिकार है या नहीं।

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDY (Kendrapara) : It has come in papers, this morning, that the Law Minister consulted the legal opinion about it and the Government of India advised him not to read those paragraphs. Let us know about it.

SHRI RANGA (Srikakulam) : Sir, it is quite possible he has consulted our friend here, in Delhi, and, as generally happens, it is also possible for these people to have said 'yes' or 'no' or kept mum. But it is their secret. Since, mutually, they have sworn each other to secrecy, my hon. friend might think he is justified in giving that answer that he has given today. I am not concerned so much with that as with the constitutional and political consequences of this.

What happens here ? Here is a Governor who goes against the general convention and the Centre allows him to do it. The country is expected to accept things as they are with the result that, in future, when such things come to be indulged in, by certain sections in the country, the ordinary people would not be able to blame them at all because, as my hon. friend from Bikaner said earlier, Congress Party took the initiative in Rajasthan and now they take the initiative on a much higher plane in West Bengal. This is likely to do great

harm to the country and to our conventions of parliamentary system of democracy.

MR. SPEAKER : I wanted to know from the hon. Members, from both the sides, whether we should go into details now itself.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : Let us have a discussion on it tomorrow.

MR. SPEAKER : That I have to decide. I think. It is a constitutional point, as Mr. Ranga and everyone of you would want to say. Everyone of you may try to see the legal aspect and the constitutional aspect of it before we can discuss it. But here and now we cannot discuss it. It is already 6 O'Clock. You will have to prepare your case also. There is no use getting excited. Of course, there is a reason for getting excited on both the sides. I do not want this excitement. Therefore, I say, you study the matter.

Therefore, let us study the question and discuss it in a calm atmosphere. I will fix some time. The Home Minister has said clearly that they have not given instructions... (*Interruptions*).

18.00 hrs.

श्री रवि राय (पुरी) : झूठ बोल रहे हैं ।

SHRI J. M. BISWAS (Bankaura) : The Home Minister has given instructions. He does not have the moral courage to say that... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order.

SHRI S. A. DANGE : The telephones are manned by our workers. We can know what is happening.

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Dange may have better sources. But I am not to take notice of them—the other sources, how people get and all that... (*Interruptions*). Will the hon. members please sit down ?

SHRI NAMBIAR (Tiruchirappalli) : My submission is on a different point....

MR. SPEAKER : I am on my legs. Are you questioning the Speaker being on his legs ?

SHRI NAMBIAR : He cannot continue as the Governor there ..

MR. SPEAKER : What you want to do now, I want to regularise please submit notice...

श्री रवि राय : मैंने दिया है ।

MR. SPEAKER : If you think the same notice which was given by 4 or 5 hon. members...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : मैंने एक नया नोटिस दिया है । वह मन्त्री ने अभी जो बक्तव्य दिया है उसके ऊपर चर्चा उठाने का नोटिस दिया है ।

MR. SPEAKER : It is all right then.

SHRI S. A. DANGE : It has to be done early because another deadlock in thanks-giving will arise... (*Interruptions*).

SHRI NAMBIAR : My submission is that the Governnor has violated the Constitutional provision ; he did not read what the Government gave him ; therefore, he is no more to be considered as the Head of the Government there ; he cannot continue as the Governor there. This is a very serious thing.

SHRI H. N. MUKERJEE (Calcutta North East) : Some of us have already given notice of motions to the effect that in view of what has come to be known, the Governor of West Bengal should at once be dismissed by the President, recalled and so on and so forth. In view of your observations earlier today, I am expecting that as soon as ever it is possible we have an opportunity of discussing a motion of that sort whoever the sponsor of it might be. In any case, if tomorrow we have about two hours before the non-official business begins, if we can have a break in the discussion of the General Budget, possibly we can have this matter thrashed out. We can think over it overnight. It is a matter which has been agitating us for days. We do not need too much of time for cogitation. The Home Minister can very well find out what he has to say about it. We may have it tomorrow.

MR. SPEAKER : I know, a number of notices are there ; I have not gone through all of them. Just now they are coming slowly ; one came for the dismissal of the Governor, another for discussion on the Home Minister's statement ; I do not know, some other might come to dismiss somebody and appoint somebody else. Whatever it is, I will have to consider them before admitting any one of them' I cannot admit all of them. I will have to study. Naturally I will have to select only one of them : it cannot be all of them. I cannot also say which one will be admitted .. (Interruption). I am only trying to regularise what should be done.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDI : The only question is whether we will have a discussion tomorrow, whichever motion you admit. The only question is whether it will be possible for you to allot time tomorrow for discussion.

MR. SPEAKER : I would like to consult the Government also because they must get from the West Bengal Government... (Interruption). Kindly allow me...

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : I have no quarrel with you : I have quarrel only with them.

MR. SPEAKER : I know, you will never quarrel with me. I would only say that your quarrelling with them should be done in a sportly way ; you should give them a chance to find out from the Government there. They have teleprinter news and you have teleprinter news.

Officially, the West Bengal Government is there, elected by the people. All of us have read the teleprinter news. All of us know it from our friends. But authoritative news will come from the State Government. There is an Assembly there, there is a Government in office elected by the people. We cannot usurp all those powers.

I cannot say here and now that we will have a discussion tomorrow. I think we should have a reasonably good discussion. We must hear from the West Bengal Government also. I agree discussion must be there. But let us take it up in a little calmer atmosphere, not tomorrow. To-

morrow the West Bengal Government would give information.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : I would certainly welcome a discussion. It should be a well-informed discussion. If it has to be so, I must get certain facts before I can do anything. I personally do not think a discussion would be advisable tomorrow.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Alipore) : The Governor is coming here at 9 P. M. The Ministers are coming here tomorrow morning. Why does he not consult them early ?

MR. SPEAKER : This is no use. The Governor may be coming tomorrow.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : To night.

MR. SPEAKER : May be. I am sure Shri Banerjee and Shri Indrajit Gupta would not accept what the Governor says. After all, they must have information from the Government.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : The Chief Minister is coming.

SHRI J. M. BISWAS : The Chief Minister and Deputy Chief Minister are coming here tomorrow.

MR. SPEAKER : Before I adjourn the House, I have to make an announcement.

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BASU (Diamond Harbour) : They can send a teleprinter message to the Chief Secretary and get the information.

MR. SPEAKER : I appeal to all sections of the House to help me. I want this discussion to be useful, because this is not going to be the first and last time. We have got States ; we have got Governors. After all, this is going to be a discussion in a very academic and useful way. Let the Government give some information. I am saying now that we cannot have this discussion tomorrow. It may be Monday. Let us see.

The House now stands adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11 A. M.  
18.07 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till eleven of the clock on Friday, March 7, 1969 (Phalgun 16, 1890 (Saka)).