

श्री रवि राय : सरकार के दल और विरोधी दलों की ओर से यह मांग है कि इस पर बहस होनी चाहिए।... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI PILOO MODY : In the present political situation in the country where this thing is happening almost every week it is needless to say that the last resort that we have got is at least to discuss it threadbare in Parliament, whatever the rights or wrongs in the situation may be. When we see that Assemblies are dissolved or prorogued in order to suit the convenience of the majority of the ruling party, I think, it is high time that this Parliament took very serious note of it, no matter how much of the business there is before Parliament ; I think they should all be suspended and these things should be discussed. The condemnation that should normally come from the Press is not forthcoming when such blatant violations of the Constitution are taken place. Therefore, I beg of you and I entreat you not to thwart this Parliament from discussing these problems whenever they arise and as many times as they arise.

SHRIMATI SUSHILA ROHATGI (Bilhaar) : May I express my point of view also ?... (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Personally speaking, I also view it with great concern. I also view everything that is going on about prorogations and adjournments with grave concern.

12.55½ hrs.

PAPER LAID ON THE TABLE

Statement Re : Correction of Date in Notification

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF INDUSTRIAL DEVELOPMENT, INTERNAL TRADE AND COMPANY AFFAIRS (SHRI RAGHUNATHA REDDY) : I beg to lay on the Table a statement (Hindi and English versions) regarding correction of date in Notification No. S. O. 4665, laid on the Table on the 9th December, 1969. [Placed in Library. See No. LT-2886/70]

ESTIMATES COMMITTEE

Hundred and Sixth, Hundred and Seventh and Hundred and Ninth Reports

SHRI THIRUMALA RAO (Kakinada) : I beg to present the following Reports of the Estimates Committee :—

- (1) Hundred and sixth Report regarding action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Seventy-fourth Report on the Ministry of Shipping and Transport—Inland Water Transport.
- (2) Hundred and seventh Report regarding action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Eighty-third Report on the Ministry of Health and Family Planning and Works, Housing and Urban Development (Department of Works, Housing and Urban Development Department of Printing and Stationery (Printing Wing).
- (3) Hundred and ninth Report regarding action taken by Government on the recommendations contained in their Seventy-eighth Report on the Ministry of Home Affairs—Central Bureau of Investigation.

12.56 hrs.

PERSONAL EXPLANATION BY MEMBER

SHRI S. K. PATIL (Banaskantha) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, when I was not here yesterday, some charges and some allegations were made by some Members against me. I wrote to you a letter which I am reading out for the sake of brevity. It reads thus :

"I am sorry ...

श्री जार्ज फरेनेन्डीज (बम्बई दक्षिण) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। नियम संख्या 357 के अन्तर्गत मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है। आप उसे सुनिए।... (व्यवधान) ...कल जब इस सदन में... (व्यवधान)...

MR. SPEAKER : I have already allowed him. Let him make his statement. It is his right. Then, I shall listen to the hon. Member.

श्री मधु लिमये (मुंगेर) : इनको सुन लीजिए ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री रवि राय (पुरी) : व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है, उसको सुन लीजिए ।... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI S. K. PATIL : It reads thus :

"I am sorry I could not be present at the Lok Sabha yesterday..."

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।... (व्यवधान)...

MR. SPEAKER : I have already called him. Let him finish. Then, I shall hear his point of order.

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है... (व्यवधान)... रूल नं० 357 के मातहत मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है... (व्यवधान)...

श्री रवि राय : आप इनकी व्यवस्था सुन लीजिए । नियम 357 पर इनकी व्यवस्था है ।... (व्यवधान)...

MR. SPEAKER : How can he know what the hon. Member is going to say ? How can I know on what *vayavastha kaa prashna* he wants to speak ?

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : नियम 357 पर मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।... (व्यवधान).... पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन को लेकर मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है ।... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI SHEO NARAIN (Basti) : On a point of order. When you call a Member, he must be allowed to make his statement. But we find that you call a member to speak but somebody else starts with a point of order. What is this ?

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot help it, when he rises on a point of order.

श्री शिव नारायण : ये जब भी चाहें गाली देते रहें ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री मधु लिमये : कोई भी गाली नहीं दी गई ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री रवि राय : आप पहले इसको सुन लीजिए ।... (व्यवधान)...

SHRI P. G. SEN (Purnea) : Does he mean to say that this challenge should go unchallenged ? Is that the procedure of the House which he wants ?

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : अध्यक्ष महोदय, पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन का लेकर मेरा व्यवस्था का प्रश्न है । इसमें दिया हुआ है :

"A Member may with the permission of the Speaker make a personal explanation, although there is no question before the House..."

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Balrampur) : You have allowed the hon. Member Shri S. K. Patil. How can there be any point of order on this ?

MR. SPEAKER : The point of order must be heard.

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज :

"but in this case, no debatable matter may be brought forward, and no debate shall arise."... (व्यवधान)...

श्री मधु लिमये : आप तो अपोजीशन के लीडर हैं । हमारी बातों को एक्सपोज करवाते हैं । और फिर पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन देते हैं ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री अटल बिहारी वाजपेयी : पहले आप सुनिये तो कि एक्सप्लेनेशन क्या है । हर बात में प्वाइंट आफ ऑर्डर रोज करना कहाँ तक उचित है । इस सदन की कोई गरिमा है या नहीं ।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री मधु लिमये : कल नहीं थे, आज बोल

रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान) इन लोगों ने एक्सपोज करवाया है।... (व्यवधान)...

श्री रवि राय : नाइडू ने एक्सपोज करवाया है, हम तो उनको कह रहे हैं।... (व्यवधान)...

13.00 hrs.

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप मेरी बात सुनिये। इस नियम के अनुसार अगर पाटिल साहब को कोई भी पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन देना हा तो मैं आप का ध्यान उस जुमले की ओर आकर्षित करना चाहता हूँ जिसमें कहा गया है : 'No debatable matter may be brought forward'.

MR. SPEAKER : This is no point of order. I cannot allow it. How can I say whether it is debatable or not without listening to what is coming? He has not read anything so far. After hearing him, I will decide.

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप मेरी बात सुन लीजिए... (व्यवधान)

श्री रवि राय : जो बातें हम ने आप के सामने रखी थीं...

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आर्डर, आर्डर।

श्री रवि राय : आप हमारी बात सुनिये। कल जो जो बातें हमने कहीं थीं उनको आपने एक्सपोज किया, उन्हें हटा दिया। अगर आप हमारी कल की बातों को प्रोसीडिंग्स में रहने देते तो फिर पर्सनल एक्सप्लेनेशन वाली बात आ सकती थी लेकिन आप ने उनको तो हटा दिया... (व्यवधान)

अध्यक्ष महोदय : आप बैठिये। श्री पाटिल।

SHRI S. K. PATIL : The letter reads :

"I am sorry I could not be present at the Lok Sabha yesterday. I find in today's edition of *patriot* that some

allegations were made by Mr. George Fernandes against me and some others that we were in some way connected with some smuggler. To substantiate that charge, I read in the same press, he wanted to produce some photographs of a reception gathering in my honour. I do not know what exactly the allegation was. That part of it might have been expunged by you at the request of the Leader of the Opposition and some other hon. members. Since the matter was mentioned in the House and since my name was mentioned, I thought it as proper on my part to write to you that the allegation was most cowardly and mendacious..."

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BASU (Diamond Harbour) : That is debatable.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, व्यवस्था... (व्यवधान) यह बया कह रहे हैं कीवर्डली और मैडेशन बनलाते हैं इस तरह में काम नहीं चलेगा... (व्यवधान)

श्री रवि राय : अध्यक्ष महोदय, व्यवस्था... (व्यवधान) यह कीवर्ड का विशेषण किस लिए लगाने है? यह कीवर्डली और मैडेशन के गेडजैक्टिव्म क्यों लगाते हैं? आप इन शब्दों को भी एक्सपोज कीजिए।

अध्यक्ष महोदय : कोई व्यवस्था नहीं। श्री पाटिल।

SHRI S. K. PATIL : I do not know the name of the smuggler, nor have I ever met him in my life. If he was in a photograph, so were a bunch of other people. Even Mr. Fernandes can be in a photograph with me and that does not prove that he is connected with me: except in the sense that he wants to abuse me. Since this matter was discussed on the floor of the House, I hope you will do me the usual courtesy of either reading this letter to the House or mentioning in your own words my emphatic refutation of the allegation.

"With my kindest personal regards".

श्री रवि राय : अध्यक्ष महोदय, व्यवस्था का सवाल सुनिये... (व्यवधान)

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, प्वाएंट प्रीफ आर्डर को सुन लीजिए... (व्यवधान)... इस तरह से सदन को हम नहीं चलने देंगे।

श्री रवि राय : अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरा व्यवस्था का सवाल आप सुन लीजिए... (व्यवधान)

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : क्या पालियामेंटरी कमेटी के सामने आने के लिए वह तैयार है ? ... (व्यवधान)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, please. I will look into these words. If they are unparliamentary, I am prepared to expunge them.

SHRI S. K. PATIL : I have not completed my personal explanation.

I have to add that I have to bring to the notice of the House that there is a case in a Bombay Court and this particular smuggler has made an affidavit that he was induced by some of the political busybodies and some government officials that anyhow he should involve some of us like Shri Morarji Desai, Shri Chavan and myself so that he should be bailed out, because he is in custody. He has made a written affidavit and the matter is before the court. I cannot say anything on a matter which is *sub judice* (Interruptions)

It will be seen, therefore, that the boot is on the other leg.

Since this matter is *sub judice*... (Interruptions)

श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज : अगर वह कावर्ड नहीं है तो वह पालियामेंटरी कमेटी के प्रीव के लिए तैयार हो जायं . (व्यवधान)

श्री रवि राय : कल जब इस सदन में श्री जार्ज फरनेन्डीज, श्री मधु लिमये और श्री बनर्जी ने तीन व्यक्तियों के बारे में शिकायत की, बिहार के गवर्नर, महाराष्ट्र के मन्त्री श्री याज्ञनिक और श्री एस० के० पाटिल के बारे में शिकायत की तो उन बातों को डा० राम सुभग सिंह के कहने पर प्रोसीडिंग्स में से उनको आपने ऐक्सपंज कर दिया। उसको ऐक्सपंज

करने के बाद भी आज जो आपने अभी पाटिल साहब को पर्सनल ऐक्सप्लेनेशन देने की इजाजत दी तो यह कहाँ तक ठीक रहा। जो हम लोगों ने उनकी बाबत कल कहा उसे तो आप ने प्रोसीडिंग्स में आने नहीं दिया और उन्हें यहाँ यह हमारे लिए कावर्डली और मैडेशस आदि विशेषण लगाने दिया तो इन शब्दों को भी ऐक्सपंज किया जाय। दूसरे जैसा कि कल भी हम लोगों ने इस सारे मामले पर जांच के लिए एक पालियामेंटरी कमेटी ब्रैठाने की मांग की थी उसके लिए पुनः विनती करते हुए कठना चाहूँगा कि क्या पाटिल साहब हम लोगों का यह चैलेंज मानने को तैयार है कि यह एक पालियामेंटरी कमेटी के सामने जाय ? हम लोग भी उस कमेटी के सामने जाने को तैयार हैं और वह सब मामला उस पालियामेंटरी कमेटी के सामने चला जाय... (व्यवधान)

श्री फाँवर लाल गुप्त : सुबह की प्रोसीडिंग्स में से आप ने उन बातों को हटाया लेकिन लंच के बाद दुबारा उन्होंने वही बातें दुहराई और अखबार में आज वह चीज सब छपी है तो यह उचित ही था कि उनको पर्सनल ऐक्सप्लेनेशन का मौका दिया जाता। बाकी आप यह तय कर दीजिए कि यह कावर्डली और मैडेशस पालियामेंटरी है अथवा अनपालियामेंटरी ... (व्यवधान)

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : Yesterday, when this matter came up, my hon. friend Shri Fernandes, myself, Shri Madhu Limaye and Shri Rabi Ray produced certain photographs showing that the king of smugglers was welcoming Mr. Patil after his victory in Banaskantha.

श्री मधु लिमये : अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह इस तरह से उन्हें नहीं कहने देना चाहिए और इस की इजाजत देकर आप बिल्कुल पक्षपात कर रहे हैं आखिर वह हमें कावर्ड कहने वाले हैं कौन ? अरे, इनको तो बम्बई के लोगों ने फंका दिया था और यह हार गये थे... (व्यवधान)

SHRI S. K. PATIL : Is it an allegation or is it a point of order ?

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Banerjee, what is your point of order ?

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS *rose*.

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order. (*Interruptions*.)

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA (Barh) : Sir, I would humbly submit that this kind of thing should not be permitted. Four copies of photographs can be combined to make one photograph and photographs from very many different papers are used to produce one photograph, completely distorting the pictures and getting them all together. This is a most dangerous precedent.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : I have not finished, Sir.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS *rose*—

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order. No personal allegation can be made. You confine yourself to the point of order. (*Interruption*) I cannot allow any personal allegation. What is the point of order ?

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : My point of order is this. As has been pointed out, when Dr. Ram Subhag Singh made his observation, soon after you expunged some of the remarks made by us. Perhaps it was made with a genuine feeling. And you expunged them. We protested. And today Mr. Patil has made a personal explanation based on a newspaper report, appearing in the *Patriot*.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS *rose*—

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Banerjee, no speech can be made now. What is the point of order ? (*Interruptions*)

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS *rose*—

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA : Let them go and prove this case in the court. (*Interruption*)

AN HON. MEMBER : Sir, a point of order.

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : Sir, the personal explanation given by Shri Patil is only based on the newspaper report, whereas a personal explanation can be based only on the proceedings in Parliament. He has brought extraneous matters. (*Interruption*) I want a Parliamentary Committee to be appointed immediately to investigate into the charges including Mrs. Tarkeshwari Sinha... (*Interruption*)

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA : That is objectionable. I want an enquiry on the activities of those Members there, including Mr. Banerjee, including the Communist party friends, and also on the point as to where the money comes from, the money which they use... (*Interruption*)... I challenge them.

SEVERAL HON. MEMBERS *rose*—

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order. We are already late by 15 minutes. I adjourn the House for Lunch. We will meet at quarter past two.

13.14 hrs.

The Lok Sabha adjourned for Lunch till fifteen minutes past Fourteen of the Clock

The Lok Sabha re-assembled after Lunch at eighteen minutes past Fourteen of the Clock

[Mr Deputy-Speaker in the Chair]

RE. CALLING ATTENTION NOTICE
(Query)

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BASU (Diamond Harbour) : Sir, I have seen you in your chamber also and sought your permission. Under rule 377, I want to raise a very important matter. Myself and many other hon. members of this House had given a calling attention notice on the deployment of the CRP in Calcutta without the consent of the State Cabinet while it was in existence. (*Interruptions*.)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER : I would request the hon. Member to read out rule 377 for the benefit of the House...

SHRI JYOTIRMOY BASU : I have taken recourse to that rule and I am making my submission.