

den of rising prices? That is a primary problem. Are the employers to bear it or is the Government of India to bear it or are the workers or the common people to bear it? This is a simple issue. Our Government says that they are not going to allow this policy of throwing the burden of this crisis on the working class who were not responsible for its creation; it has been created by the others; and they are going to use the State machinery for protecting the workers. Therefore, these two lines of action have certainly been contending and I am absolutely certain that the Government of India does not want the second line of action to be followed. If the West Bengal Government is allowed to help the working class within the limitations of its powers, which are already crippled, if within those limited powers the West Bengal Government is allowed to use the State machinery for the purpose of helping the downtrodden people, then it will be an epidemic; the democratic movement in the country will develop; the people in the other States will say, "Why not we do the same thing?" That is why, I say that the spokesmen of the Congress Party and the Swatantra Party say the same thing; in the ultimate analysis, both of them represent the same interests, the interests of Tatas and Birlas of this country, and in order to be able to do that, they will have to drown the people of West Bengal. I know, they are prepared for that. Sometime back, they were prepared for that, and once again, if they want to prepare themselves for that, all right. That is a different question. But all that I want to point out is that, by this, they will only be proving the thesis that we have stated in our Party Programme and which we have claimed from house-tops that the ruling class of this country, when they find that the downtrodden people, the common people, will utilise, the facilities afforded by the Parliamentary system, in order to assert their rights, will not hesitate to use the Police and the Military in order to subvert democracy itself, in order to subvert the Parliamentary democracy itself. Let the people learn from experience let them experience it and they will learn it; they will find some other way of fighting. I would, therefore, warn this Government here that if they want to do it, that is not going to help them in the ultimate analysis. There are these talks of China; we have heard them hundred times. They said the same thing

with regard to the elections in Kerala. My hon. friend's predecessor said the same thing with regard to the elections in Kerala in 1965, and he had said the same thing in regard to West Bengal also. Ultimately, it is the people who are to decide. We are prepared to be judged by the people of this country, not by the Congress Party. It is ultimately the people of our country that are to judge. Even in West Bengal, we are prepared to be judged by the people of West Bengal. That was why four months ago we started the slogan 'Go back to the electorate'. Even now, we are prepared to go back to the electorate and let the people of Bengal give a verdict. I am sure the Congress Party will not be prepared to go back to the people because they know what the verdict of the people will be.

12.41 Hrs.

PERSONAL EXPLANATION UNDER
RULE 357

(Shri B. P. Mandal)

MR. SPEAKER : Now, Shri B. P. Mandal. He said that he wanted to make some personal explanation. There should be no speech-making, but only a personal explanation. Let him be clear about that.

श्री बिं० प्र० मंडल (माधोपुर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब मैं कल इस सदन में आया तो मैंने माननीय सदस्य श्री नाथ पाई का एक प्रस्ताव देखा जिस से मैं सहमत नहीं हूँ। अध्यक्ष महोदय, उस प्रस्ताव के द्वारा यह कहा गया है कि बिहार का गवर्नर

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE (Kanpur) : This is no personal explanation.

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : You have called me to give a personal explanation. I shall make the personal explanation, but I also want to speak.

MR. SPEAKER : No, I called him only for personal explanation, not for making a speech now.

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : I am making my personal explanation.

अध्यक्ष महोदय, कल माननीय सदस्य श्री मधु लिमये ने कहा बिहार के सम्बन्ध

[Shri B. P. Mandal]

में बोलते हुए वहाँ के गवर्नर के बारे में कि चूँकि एक ऐसे आदमी जो कि कुछ दिन तक मंत्री रह चुके थे और उन्हीं को ये लोग नेता बना कर बिहार में दूसरा मंत्रिमंडल बनाना चाहते हैं और उसमें बिहार के गवर्नर सहमत उनके साथ नहीं हुए इसलिए सेंट्रल गवर्नमेंट बिहार के गवर्नर को हटाना चाहती है..... (व्यवधान)

एक माननीय सदस्य : छः महीने के लिए कहा... (व्यवधान) ...

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : Shri Madhu Limaye is not here, but I may say that Shri Madhu Limaye never said that.

SHRIMATI TARKESHWARI SINHA (Barh) : He was the person who was referred to by Shri Madhu Limaye. It is, therefore, his understanding which matters. (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER : Will the hon. Members kindly keep silence? If we allow him he would take only two minutes, but instead of 2 minutes we would be wasting 20 minutes if there are shouts in this manner.

श्री बि० प्र० मंडल : जहाँ तक छः महीने से कुछ दिन कम मंत्री रहने का प्रश्न है इसके सम्बन्ध में मैं यही कहना चाहता हूँ कि पार्लियामेंट का सदस्य तो मैं चुना गया था लेकिन अपने मन में बिहार का मंत्री नहीं बना। कोई भी आदमी बिहार के गवर्नर या किसी भी गवर्नर को यह शब्द कह कर कि हमको मंत्री बनाओ मंत्री नहीं बन सकता। जिस मशीनरी से संयुक्त सोशलिस्ट पार्टी के कर्पूरी ठाकुर या रामानन्द तिवारी या अन्य मंत्री, मंत्री बने थे उसी तरह से मेरा भी नाम लिया गया था। तो इसमें मेरा दोष नहीं था।... (व्यवधान)

दूसरी बात मैं बिहार को छोड़ कर इस्तीफा दे कर लोक सभा में बैठने के लिए आना चाहता था लेकिन इसमें मेरा क्या दोष यदि बिहार वाले हमें बहुत चाहते हों... (व्यवधान)

SHRI S. M. BANERJEE : It is a totally wrong thing which he is saying.

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : According to the best of my memory it is correct, and it can be checked up also from the records. I have seen the records and I have also heard the hon. Member, and I speak with full responsibility.

अध्यक्ष महोदय, इस में कहीं भी शंका की गुंजाइश नहीं है बिहार में एक शोषित दल का निर्माण हुआ है।

That is the party of the exploited people. All these people belonging to all these parties had been exploiting the down-trodden. (Interruptions).

श्री रवि राय (पुरी) : सीधे कांग्रेस में जाओ।

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : This is not the way. I cannot be bullied in this way.

तो हमने एक अपनी पार्टी बनायी और उसके अलावा कांग्रेस पार्टी से एक कोलीजन एलायंस में हम ने एंटर किया।

श्री भोगेन्द्र झा (जयनगर) : अध्यक्ष महोदय, एक व्यवस्था का सवाल है।

MR. SPEAKER : No, not now. Shri B. P. Mandal is on his legs. Let him complete what he wants to say and then I shall hear the point of order....

श्री भोगेन्द्र झा : अध्यक्ष महोदय, व्यवस्था का सवाल सुन लिया जाय।

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : I am on my legs, and I may be heard now.

MR. SPEAKER : He is raising a point of order.

श्री भोगेन्द्र झा : व्यवस्था का प्रश्न यह है कि लोक सभा के एक सदस्य की हैसियत से एक अवधि निर्धारित है जिस से कि ज्यादा गैरहाजिर हम नहीं रह सकते हैं। हमारे मित्र मंडल महोदय का स्थान मेरे पास है। मार्च से आज तक पहली बार यह कल यहाँ आ कर बैठे हैं। इस पर आप व्यवस्था

दें कि लगातार नौ महीने के बाद, यह पहली बार कल यहां पर आये हैं। . . . (व्यवधान) इस बात का मैं साक्षी हूँ। यहां पर बैठे सभी साक्षी हैं। पूरे नौ महीने के बाद इस रिक्त स्थान की पूर्ति हो रही है, अध्यक्ष महोदय।

MR. SPEAKER : We cannot go on like this. After all, he is an elected Member of this House. If he did not sit here all these days it was his job. As long as his seat has not been declared vacant in this House and he is sitting here it is all right. It is the same Mandal who had been a Minister for six months in Bihar along with the members belonging to the Opposition parties here. So, why should I be troubled now ? Now, Shri B. P. Mandal may complete what he wants to say.

श्री बि० प्र० मंडल : अध्यक्ष महोदय, हमारे माननीय सदस्य इसी तरह से डेमोक्रेसी का इंटरप्रिटेशन हर एक बात में करते हैं। मेरा नाम लोक सभा के सदस्य में है। मैं कहां हूँ, हाजिर हूँ या नहीं इस का रेकार्ड होता है और यह कोई बात उठा देना कि मैं लोक सभा का सदस्य नहीं हूँ मैं समझता हूँ कि इट इज ए मैटर आफ प्रिविलेज आलसो।

अध्यक्ष महोदय, तो मेरा कहना यह था कि माननीय सदस्य श्री मधु लिमये का यह कहना है तो मैं क्या करूँ ? बिहार वाले वहां पर एम० एल० ए० लोग हैं, वही अपना नेता चुनते हैं। यदि 185 एम० एल० ए० हमें अपना नेता चुनते हैं तो इसमें मेरा कोई कसूर नहीं है। . . . (व्यवधान) . . . अध्यक्ष महोदय, यह लोग जरा शांत रहें। मधु लिमये जी वम्बई स्टेट से बेचारे डिस्कार्ड हो गए और हमारे बिहार स्टेट में उनको शरण मिली। हमको अपना स्टेट डिस्कार्ड नहीं करता तो हम क्या करें ? इसीलिए मैंने परसनल एक्सप्लेनेशन की . . . बात की। मेरा परसनल एक्सप्लेनेशन यही है, गवर्नर के सम्बन्ध में . . . (व्यवधान)

SHRI A. SREEDHARAN (Badagara) : On a point of order . . . (Interruptions).

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order. All hon. Members may resume their seats. I may tell Shri B. P. Mandal that he need not go into the whole history now.

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : I would just take only one or two minutes more to give a clarification. But my hon. friends are disturbing me. So, what can I do ?

SHRI A. SREEDHARAN : On a point of order. Shri Mandal said that Shri Limaye was shunted out of Bihar.

SOME HON. MEMBERS : No, no.

SHRI A. SREEDHARAN : I would like to know whether that is included in his personal explanation. If that is not included in his personal explanation. I submit his remarks should be expunged from the proceedings of the House.

MR. SPEAKER : I give him one minute more to conclude.

SHRI B. P. MANDAL : What I said was that Mr. Limaye did not get a place in his own State, and he had to seek election from Bihar.

अध्यक्ष महोदय, मेरे कहने का मतलब यह था कि बिहार के गवर्नर के सामने यह प्रश्न नहीं था कि कौन व्यक्ति चीफ मिनिस्टर हो, उनके सामने प्रश्न उठा जब 185 आदमियों की लिस्ट हमने दिया और उनमें से 127 कांग्रेस के और 31 हमारे मेम्बरों का फिजिकल वैरिफिकेशन उनके सामने कराया . . . (व्यवधान) . . . अध्यक्ष महोदय, जब 127 कांग्रेस के और 31 हमारे कुल 158 एम० एल० ए० चाहते हैं कि यह मंत्री मंडल न रहे

श्री स० मो० बनर्जी : अध्यक्ष महोदय, आप इनका फिजिकल वैरिफिकेशन कर लीजिये, ताकि मामला खत्म हो जाये।

श्री बि० प्र० मंडल : महामाया प्रसाद सिंह के साथ 172 मेम्बर थे तथा 5 कांग्रेस में डिस्कट कर के आये. इम प्रकार 177

[श्री बि० प्र० मंडल]

हुए, इसमें से 27 आदमी हमारे साथ आये, तो उनकी संख्या 150 रह गई, जब कि हमारा संख्या 158 थी... (व्यवधान)...

MR. SPEAKER : It is too long. Now he must conclude. He will sit down.

SOME HON. MEMBERS *rose*—

MR. SPEAKER : All of you to sit down please. I now request the Home Minister to reply to the debate.

SHRI YOGENDRA SHARMA (Begusarai) : On a point of order. How long will Mr. Mandal continue to be a Member of this House and simultaneously a member of the Bihar Assembly.

MR. SPEAKER : I am really surprised. He is not a member of the Assembly.

12.53 HRS.

MOTION RE GOVERNORS OF STATES.—*contd.*

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN) : I am glad that an important debate has taken place in this House since yesterday, and I must say that the speeches on both sides were worth hearing yesterday. I cannot say the same thing of the speech that I heard this morning.

Basically, the question of the role of the Governors and the working of the Constitution is under discussion, and a charge has been made by the mover of this motion that the office of the Governor has been used for party purposes in the last 20 years and also this is being done today, taking the examples of Bihar and Bengal. Also, a very sweeping statement was made that incompetent, inconvenient, defeated persons were appointed as Governors.

I must say that anybody who speaks with a sense of responsibility on the floor of the House should not have the monopoly of competence to declare everybody else incompetent.

They also made mention of persons like Shri Sri Prakash, Shri Pattabhi Sitaramayya, and our *ex*-Speaker, Hukam Singhji. They also mentioned—they want really to protect him—Shri Anantasayanam Ayyangar who is at the present moment the Governor of Bihar.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : "Protect" is not correct.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : I would like to remind them that they are all Congressmen, and they are very competent persons. I can certainly mention a long list of persons....

SHRI HEM BARUA : Are they competent because they are Congressmen ?

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : All of you were Congressmen some time.

SHRI SURENDRANATH DWIVEDI (Kendrapara) : We are proud of that heritage. Do not forget that Congress was a national movement, Congress was not a coterie.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : Do not forget, being a Congressman at one time or the other is not a disqualification.

SHRI BAL RAJ MADHOK (South Delhi) : Let there be no family quarrel here.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : There is no objection to able Congressmen, objective Congressmen, competent Congressmen, being appointed as Governors, as I have no objection to appointing people competent, convenient, PSP members, even Communist members if it comes to that.

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE : Convenient ?

SHRI HEM BARUA : I know he makes a reference to that very often, but he should remember that his valued comrade Mr. Asoka Mehta, when he was a leader of our party, described that as a political piracy. You indulge in political piracy. Don't forget that.

SHRI Y. B. CHAVAN : Even though Shri Asoka Mehta has said that, only because he said that, it does not become a truth for me.

It is much better that we come to the facts instead of making these sweeping statements. My main point was that we are discussing the function of a very important office in the political life of our country, because the Governor's office is very important office in working out the Constitution, and therefore, while we are discussing this, we should be rather moderate