

kers. But what are the workers doing? They are going on strike. The electrical engineers, the doctors were threatening to go on strike. On each one of them the society had spent more than a lakh of rupees. But then they get jobs and go on strike; they do not care for their fellow-beings. We had four wars with Pakistan and one war with China. We had cyclones and droughts and floods. The country suffered some losses on account of these. But the losses suffered on account of strikes and lockouts are almost double the other loss. Government believes in socialism and wants to do good to these people. But is there any social discipline among those people? There the Government has miserably failed. I want the Government to see that there is no strike. If there is even one day strike, they must be dismissed from service and new people available in the country must be appointed. The Government should be prepared to face the consequences of it. They are not even 08 per cent and they are ruining and eating away more than 75 per cent of the budget of the municipalities, State Governments and Central Government.

Fertiliser supply in the country today is not more than 50 per cent. The water available in the country is going waste. I want that there should be indigenous production of fertilisers. I am not interested whether the fertiliser factory is located in my district or in my State or elsewhere. Previously they said they will have 12 fertiliser factories. Now they have reduced it to 5. I submit that we should have at least 20 fertiliser factories so that we may have enough food for our people.

**SHRI KRISHNA CHANDRA HALDER (Ausgram):** He is blaming the opposition parties. How many children has the President of India got?

**SHRI BHAGWAT JHA AZAD (Bhagalpur):** Sir, I welcome this document, which makes it clear that there shall be no plan holiday, which has come with some important objectives and which has exploded many a myth. I find it has got triple objectives. It has been stated categorically that growth by itself is not sufficient to raise the standard of the people. When a few of us were trying to challenge it some years back, we were told by the economist in the Planning Commission that growth will take care of other things as well, I mean social objectives. I am happy that Mr. Dhar and Mr. Dharja now tell us that it is not so. Of course wisdom has dawned on the Planning Commission after a long time that growth by itself is not enough for the attainment of the social objectives we have laid down. We have seen all these years that growth has increased the disparity between the rich and the poor. Therefore, I welcome this document which says that growth, self-reliance and social justice must go together. It was said that self-reliance cannot be had in this country if you want growth. Our economists used to say, we must have lean from outside as much as we can from America and other countries.

**MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER:** You can continue on Monday. This debate will continue on Monday.

Before we take up private members' business, I will hear Mr. Madhu Limaye's point of order.

15.00 hrs.

**RE: NON-CIRCULATION OF ANSWERS TO TWO QUESTIONS TO PRESS CORRESPONDENCE**

**श्री मधु लिमाये (दांडा) :** उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, मैं ने आपको जो चिट्ठी दी है, पहले मैं उस को पढ़ता हूँ और फिर मैं अपने व्यवस्था के प्रश्न को पेश करूँगा। मैं ने आपको यह पत्र लिख कर दिया है :

[श्री मधु सिमरो]

Written answers to my Unstarred Question No. 5121 (which was the subject matter of the point of order this morning) and Unstarred Question No. 5231 have not been laid on the Table today by the Minister concerned.

This is a grave lapse and contempt of Parliament.

I checked this with the Press people and also our Library. The bunch of questions and answers supplied to the former by the PIB also does not contain answers to these questions.

I do not know whether the Ministry of Finance or the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting (PIB) is responsible for this.

It is the bounden duty of the Press to report proceedings of Parliament faithfully and fairly. But if important documents and papers are withheld from them, a breach of privilege and contempt is committed, and in this case it must be the Ministry/Minister or Ministries/Ministers concerned who should be held responsible for this breach, for this contempt.

इस वक्त मैं सदन की मानहानि का सवाल नहीं उठा रहा हूँ। हमारे नियमों का जो उल्लंघन हुआ है, मैं इस वक्त केवल उस का प्रश्न उठा रहा हूँ और इससे सम्बन्धित तथ्यों को आप के सामने रखना चाहता हूँ। मैं जानता हूँ कि अगर कोई विशेषाधिकार का सवाल बनता है, तो वह फॉयट ऑफ आर्डर में नहीं उड़ेगा। उस के लिए मैं बाद में नोटिस दूंगा।

शकधर साहब की किताब के पृष्ठ 385 पर लिखा है :

"In the case of unstarred questions, written answers thereto are laid on the Table by the Ministers concerned."

यह बिल्कुल साफ दिया हुआ है। आगे चल कर पृष्ठ 387 पर कहा गया है :

"Copies of printed 'Lists of questions' are distributed to the accredited press correspondents or sold to the public at a fixed price one hour before the Question Hour begins."

आखिर में पार्लियामेंट ऐंड दि प्रेस के बारे में जो लिखा है, मैं उसका एक उद्धरण देना चाहता हूँ :

"The question of privileges of Parliament vis-a-vis the press arises mainly in two ways, the publication of the proceedings of Parliament and comments casting reflection on either House, its committees or members."

जब प्रेस वालों के द्वारा कोई गलती होती है, तो हम लोग उनको तत्काल पकड़ते हैं और उन में माफी भी मंगवाते हैं। लेकिन शकधर की किताब में प्रेस इनफॉर्मेशन ब्यूरो की यह ड्यूटी दी गई है :

"The Press Information Bureau, whose officers are attached to the different Ministries of the Government of India and who have to perform functions analogous to those of correspondents in giving publicity to the proceedings of the House is allotted one seat in the press gallery. Against this seat some 30 Press Information Officers are issued press gallery cards on alternative basis."

इतनी सुविधायें हम लोग उन को देते हैं। प्रेस वालों का कहना है कि कई दफा ऐसे महत्वपूर्ण प्रश्नों को गायब कर दिया जाता है, जिन के बारे में इनफॉर्मेशन ऐंड ब्राडकास्टिंग मिनिस्ट्री या दूसरे किसी मंत्रालय को एम्बरसेसमेंट हो सकती है। आज वे पकड़े गए हैं। मैंने प्रेस वालों की प्रश्नोत्तर की सूची को एक कर लिया है। उस में ये दोनों प्रश्न कहीं

थे। मैंने लाइब्रेरी में भी चैक किया है। वहाँ भी ये दोनों प्रश्न नहीं थे। जब मैंने ऐनराज किया, तब जा कर ये प्रश्नों पर मुझे मिले हैं।

मैं इन प्रश्नों के पथ्यों में गड़ी जा रहा हूँ लेकिन एक ही बात मैं कहना चाहता हूँ कि आज सबेरे मैंने यह व्यवस्था वा प्रश्न उठाया कि जिन ताराकित प्रश्नों को बरीयता मिलनी चाहिए थी वे अताराकित प्रश्नों में चले गए। अखबार वालों को उन के जवाब नदी दिए गए हैं और न ही उन को लाइब्रेरी में रखा गया है।

मन्त्री महोदय ने यह स्वीकार किया है कि

"It has also been reported by the Collector that the Security Officers are alleged to have used abusive language and also tried to slap the Customs Officer"

उन्होंने आगे कहा है

"While the officers were at the Police Station, Class IV staff remain on duty and continued their vigilance at the Naka They have reported that within five to seven minutes of the departure of the Customs Officers one car sped away at full speed in spite of the efforts made by the Class IV staff on duty to stop it."

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: What is the point of order?

श्री मधु लिखड़े इस में मेरा पायट आफ ऑर्डर-यह है कि अगर प्रेस इनफर्मेशन ब्यूरो अताराकित प्रश्नों के लिखित जवाब प्रेस वालों को नहीं देता है और टैबल पर ले नहीं करता है—“ले” का मतलब है लाइब्रेरी में रखना—, अगर उन प्रश्नों को गायब कर दिया जाता है, तो यह हमारे नियमों का उल्लंघन है। अगर मैंने इस बारे में जांच न की होती, अगर प्रेस वालों से मेरी मुलाकात न हुई होती, तो मुझे पता नहीं चलता—कल पार्लियामेंट की डाक में

मझे ये जवाब मिल जाते, लेकिन हिन्दुस्तान के एक भी अखबार में महाराष्ट्र के किसी भी अखबार में, वे न छाने।

उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, हमारी कइस्टीट्यूशन का इतना डिक्लाउन, इतनी अधोगति हो गयी है। इसके लिए कौन जिम्मेदार है— फिनाश मिनिस्ट्री, प्रेस इनफर्मेशन ब्यूरो या हमारा क्वेश्चन ब्रांच? आप इस की जांच कीजिए, और अगर इसमें प्रिविलेज का सवाल बनता है, तो सोमवार को मुझे सदन की मानहानि का सवाल उठाने की इजाजत दीजिए, इस वकन तो मैं केवल यह व्यवस्था का प्रश्न उठा रहा हूँ कि सदन की प्रक्रिया और नियमों का उल्लंघन हो रहा है और वह गम्भीर अपराध है।

MR DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I can give you some information even now.

It is a little unfortunate that the Answers to these Questions to which you referred were received rather late this morning. But they have been received and sent to the Library at 12 noon. I am giving you this information. Our Secretariat has taken up the matter with the Ministry of Finance about this.

श्री मधु लिखड़े और जो पी० आई० बी० ने सक्लेट नहीं किया ?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The position is that the P.I.B. itself collects these answers. Either the Information Officer of a particular Ministry hands over these to the P.I.B. or the P.I.B. itself collects these answers and circulates to the press people. That is the position. Our Secretariat does not give out the papers.

श्री मधु लिखड़े वह तो ठीक है। आप अभी इतना कीजिए कि जो प्रश्नों के उत्तर प्रसारित नहीं किए गए हैं, उन का अभी सक्लेट-

[श्री मधु लिमये]

सैंट किया जाये। उस में दोष किस का है यह देखा जाय और अगर प्रिविलेज का सवाल बनता है, तो मैं उसके बारे में सोमवार को बाकायदा नोटिस दूंगा।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: They are in the Library.

SHRI MADHU LIMAYE: They have to be circulated to the press.

यह उनको ड्यूटी है।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Other necessary steps will follow, I suppose.

श्री जगन्नाथ राव जोशी (शाजापुर) :  
उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, यह जांच करना बहुत आवश्यक है कि उन दो अनस्टाई क्वेश्चन्स के बारे में देर क्यों हो गई, जब कि उन का नोटिस इतना पहले दिया जाता है।

श्री मधु लिमये : बीस दिन पहले नोटिस दिया गया था—बल्कि पच्चीस दिन, क्योंकि वे ट्रांसफर हो गये थे।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I just now told you that our Secretariat has taken up the matter with the Finance Ministry, that is, the concerned Ministry. What else can we do at this stage? I am giving you the facts.

SHRI P. M. MEHTA (Bhavnagar): It should be probed thoroughly as to who is responsible, who suppressed such an important information to the press.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: This is not a question of suppression. This is a question of being laid only.

श्री मधु लिमये : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, अभी हम की सफाई नहीं हुई है।

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We have written to the Finance Ministry. Let us get the reply from them. Since these Answers have been placed in the Library, the P.I.B., I think, must have received them now.

श्री मधु लिमये : उपाध्यक्ष महोदय, रिवाज यह है कि प्रेस इनफार्मेशन ब्यूरो के द्वारा सभी प्रश्नों के उत्तर कारेसपोण्डेंट्स को दिए जाते हैं। यह उन का काम कर्तव्य है। आप उन के लिए तीस पास देते हैं। मैंने आप को शकधर की किताब से पढ़ कर बताया है कि :

Their function is analogous to that of parliamentary correspondents.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The Answers have been placed in the Library. If they have not collected them, they should do it now. The P.I.B. is in the know of the matter. They should collect these Answers and circulate them to the press.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): The matter becomes more serious because it is related to the behaviour of a Minister and, therefore, a suspicion arises that this is deliberately done.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: The subject-matter of the Question is a different matter. No more about it.

श्री मधु लिमये : दूसरा प्रश्न उन पांच सौ से अधिक जीपों के बारे में है, जो 1071 के लोक सभा के चुनावों के समय कांग्रेस पार्टी को मिली और जिन का दाम सवा करोड़ रुपए था।

15.12 hrs.

COMMITTEE ON PRIVATE MEMBERS' BILLS AND RESOLUTIONS—  
contd.

THIRTY-FIRST REPORT

श्री सुखदेव प्रसद द वर्मा (न्दाद)  
श्रीमन्, मैं प्रस्ताव करना हू कि सभा, गै-सरकारी सदस्यों के विधेयकों तथा मंत्रालयों संबंधी मामिलों के 31वें प्रतिवेदन से, जो सभा में 29 अगस्त, 1973 को पेश किया गया था, सहमत है।