

the formulation of new environment policy. I have received advice from the Government of Rajasthan that no such consultation has taken place in respect of formulation of this new environment policy. I did not raise this matter as serious enough to warrant a breach of privilege. The hon. Speaker was good enough to suggest that this be raised in this form and that the Chair would direct the Government and the hon. Minister of State to verify and to state correctly what is the correct position. Did the Government of India consult any of the State Governments and if it did, which State Governments, in what form and when? Also, did the Ministry of Environment consult the Government of Rajasthan in the formulation of new environment policy and if it did, when and in what form? I had also requested the hon. Speaker that this information must be made available to us during the current session itself so as to enable to proceed further. That is all the submission that I have to make. Perhaps you will direct the Minister to respond to it.

**THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF ENVIRONMENT AND FORESTS (SHRI KAMAL NATH):** Sir, the hon. Member had written to the Speaker. A copy of his letter was forwarded to me by the Speaker's office and I have replied to it. The hon. Member has also sought in that letter, as far as I remember, permission from the Speaker to raise it in the House. I do not know whether he has got that consent of the speaker... (*Interruptions*).

**SHRI JASWANT SINGH:** Otherwise I would not have been able to raise it.

**SHRI KAMAL NATH:** I am saying I do not know. I am not saying you have not.

**SHRI JASWANT SINGH:** It is a fact accomplished that the Speaker has given the consent.

**SHRI KAMAL NATH:** I have replied to

the hon. Speaker giving the facts and I will request the hon. Member to have a look at my reply which I have given to the Speaker's office and then perhaps respond to it.

**SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOUDHURY (Katwa):** Sir, I want to refer to a most horrifying incident that took place in 1988 at Ujan Maidan in Tripura. The allegation was that the jawans of the Assam Rifles gang raped tribal women. Many times in this House and outside, this issue has been raised and all the time the State Government of Tripura denied it vehemently and imputed motives on those people who made those allegations. The women organisations have filed a case in the Supreme Court. The Supreme Court had appointed a Commission—the Deb Commission. The findings of the Deb Commission have come out now. It has clearly been stated here, and I quote:

“Some jawans of Assam Rifles had gang-raped at least Radhika, Banapati, Sonakali, Subhalaxmi and raped Parvati, Laximiti and a jawan of Assam Rifles had molested Panchalaxmi in Ujan Maidan during May 31–June 2, 1988”.

This report also says:

“The State of Tripura and the army officers are trying to hush up the afore said crime and the police investigation has proceeded in that direction”.

The issue of gang-rape of tribal women had been raised. It has been denied and refuted by the Government. They actually tried to hush up the case. I want to know—under these circumstances—what right the Government of Tripura have got to continue any more in office. This criminal Government must go forthwith. There must be early action to see that a Government with moral conscience—a civilized Government—is

installed in Tripura. (*Interruptions*) This is a very serious matter which is not to be laughed about. It is really a very serious matter. All the time we have been raising this issue in this House.

If this is the way in which our Police and paramilitary forces behave—and that too with our womenfolk—we cannot, in the near future, claim to be a civilized country unless we take very strong action in this matter. This Government in Tripura should be dismissed forthwith and elections should be held immediately in Tripura. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Shri Rabi Ray.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE : It is a total failure of the administrative machinery (*Interruptions*)

SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA: I want to speak on the same issue. (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Let Shri Rabi Ray speak.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRISAIFUDDIN CHOUDHURY: This is not an allegation. This is finding of the Commission. How can the Government in Tripura be allowed to continue in power? (*Interruptions*).

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: This is the finding of the Commission.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI MANORANJAN BHAKTA: Whether it is in Tripura or in West Bengal, anywhere if such incidents take place they should be condemned. The atrocities on tribal women should be stopped. There

have been instances of rape in West Bengal also...(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have allowed Shri Rabi Ray. He is on his legs. Let him speak. Please resume your seats.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI HANNAN MOLLAH (Uluberia): It is a very serious matter. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIGVJAYA SINGH (Rajgarh): It is an allegation against the jawans. I have nothing to say about that. But it is wrong to make allegations against the State Government of Tripura. It is incorrect. Let the Supreme Court direct the Government to institute criminal proceedings against these persons. Let them go to court. (*Interruptions*) Why should you make political allegation against us? (*Interruptions*) The rape was not committed under the direction of the Chief Minister. Let the Members not politicalise the issue. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE: It is more than two years now. What was this Government doing all the time? (*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have called Shri Rabi Ray.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Hon. Members, kindly listen to Shri Rabi Ray.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI DIGVJAYA SINGH: Let us not politicalise a sensitive issue (*Interruptions*).

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: If so many Members speak simultaneously, it won't serve any purpose and it will not go on record.

*(Interruptions)**[Translation]*

SHRI RABI RAY: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to request the Congress Members that perhaps they are unable to understand the importance of the matter raised by Shri Saifuddin Choudhury. Through you, I would like to inform the whole House that the Tripura Government has not Constituted the Deb Commission. In fact the Supreme Court of India, has constituted it. The terms of reference of the Commission was to investigate the facts about the rape incident with Adivasi women. Sir, I would like to tell the Congress men again that the Commission was set up by the orders of the Supreme Court and Shri Saifuddin Choudhury has come to know about the findings. I would like to state one thing about it.

*[English]*

"Justice Deb has submitted his report to the court. It is a damning indictment of the Tripura Government and the army authorities".

*[Translation]*

This is the first case when any commission has been constituted by the orders of the Supreme Court. Secondly, this report also deals with the conduct of State Government and army authorities. The subject matter is the Adivasi women. I want to draw your attention towards the prevailing resentment among the people. The Government has not kept its promise to form a popular Government in Meghalaya by 16th. I am sorry that Shri Chevan did not keep his promise which he made on the floor of the House. Sir, I do not think that there is anything objectionable if Shri Saifuddin Choudhury places the judicial commission findings regarding Tripura.

Sir, Through you I would like to submit that it was a black day when the women of Scheduled Tribes were raped and they were insulted. Sir, I would like to request you to direct the Central Government to investigate the matter and find out the reality about the incident of rape with Scheduled Tribes Women. It is the responsibility of the Central Government. Its next responsibility is to look into the complaints made against the army authorities. It is a serious matter, so I would like that Central Government should investigate this matter.

*[English]*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I am glad that the hon. Members on the Congress Bench have said that they have no objection to the tabling of the Commission's report or taking action on that. I will read only four lines from the Commission's report. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH: From what paper is he quoting? As per the rules, there are well laid down procedures to lay the papers on the Table of the House. He cannot read it out of context. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI K.V. THANGKABALU: Sir, so many rape incidents have taken place in West Bengal and so far no action has been taken. If the Tripura Government is to be dismissed on this ground, then the West Bengal Government also should be dismissed on this ground. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Sir, I am not reading out of context.

The report says:

"The State of Tripura and the Army officers are trying to hush up the aforesaid crimes and the police investigation has proceeded in that direction."

This is the finding of the Commission. I want to know the reaction of the Government to this report. Let the Home Minister react to this. What Shri Saifuddin Choudhury said was based on the Commission's finding and as Rabi Rayji has correctly said, it is not the question of allegation. When such complaints and charges were made, the Supreme Court itself appointed a Commission because the Tripura Government was not holding any enquiry and the Supreme Court directed the Tripura Government to allow this Commission to function. This Commission has said that the Tripura Government and the Army officers were trying to hush up the enquiry. This is the complicity of the State Government. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI K.V. THANGKABALU: Sir, in the police stations of West Bengal, with the help of CPI(M) volunteers, these barbaric acts are happening and nobody is preventing them. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: Sir, the BJP and Congress (I) have united on economic and political matters. Today, that has been made clear by their not uttering a word about the Tripura incident. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI GUMAN MAL LODHA (Pali): Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, I want to draw your attention towards a serious matter. On 27th November Shri Paras Dutt, General Secretary of Bhartiya Janata Party was assaulted in West Bengal. Shri Manoranjan Dutt, president of Midnapur district was also with him. The names of C.P.M. Workers who assaulted them are in the report and I am telling you... (*Interruptions*) Their names are : Kalipada Singh, Mihir Hansada, Viren Kila, Niranjan Singh, Sanyasi Ghosi, Anil Payra, Kagali Ojha... (*Interruptions*) Tapanpatra and his brother Mantru were killed on 28th at Vorai gram in Mohanpur while they were

making a stage—Killers, names are: Ramani Jana, Manoranjan Chanda and Ravindra Das. Avinash Das was again assaulted on the same day and the assaulter was Shyam-pada Acharya. (*Interruptions*) Avinash Babu was bleeding profusely and Dr. Sanska was also seriously injured. Amulya Jana, Mantu Panda, Prabhatkar, Krishnapada Giri, Binay Mishra, Kedar Senapati, Ram Krishna Paricha and Haripada Giri were the assaulters... (*Interruptions*) Hon. Home Minister should make a statement on this issue and should dismiss the antidemocratic Government. (*Interruptions*) Do they wish that no political party may function there? (*Interruptions*) We approached the Home Secretary and the State Government and urged that an enquiry should be made in the matter... (*Interruptions*) Fatal attack is being made on our party workers and we are asked to investigate it in Uttar Pradesh. (*Interruptions*) They have created a jungle rule there. Other party workers are not heard. They do not allow other parties to work there. (*Interruptions*) I request that both these incidents should be investigated. The West Bengal Government has proved a complete failure... (*Interruptions*) Freedom of speech has been provided to all by the Constitution. It should be defended (*Interruptions*)

SHRI RAM VILAS PASWAN: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, Shri Saifuddin sahib has raised a very serious matter. Tribals of the whole country are drifting away from the mainstream. It has been discussed again and again. An hon. Member has stated about the report of a Commission. I think there should be no objection either to the Ruling Party or to the opposition if findings of the Commission may be laid on the Table of the House. Hon. Home Minister should make a statement about it. I am of the opinion that you must take positive steps to curb such incidents taking place anywhere. Otherwise the condition in which the tribals are living and the incidents of atrocities taking place everywhere, if ignored by the House,

will have alarming consequences. Owing to it they are demanding formation of separate state and alienating themselves from the national mainstream. They are the victims of rape and discrimination. The House should have an unanimous attitude towards it and this matter should be discussed in this august House.

*(Interruptions)*

**SHRI RAM SARAN YADAV (Khagaria):** Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, owing to the erosion in Kosi river in the Khagaria district of Bihar... *(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

**SHRIDIGVJAYASINGH:** Sir, you have promised me. I want to rise the same issue. It is an important matter. Serious allegations have been levelled against the Government. *(Interruptions)*

**MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER:** We are reducing the zero hour to a point which carries no meaning. We have to raise issues which are of very great importance in order to bring matters to the notice of the Government. Now what is going on here? We start the matter to be discussed threadbare. Is there any procedure? There is no procedure. Zero hour is very sensitive hour. Matters of very great importance which you cannot raise prior to 12 o'clock should be raised during zero hour. You come to this House between 11.00 hrs and 12.00 hrs. Within these 60 minutes, if any extraordinary matters come to your notice, only such matters should be raised on the floor of the House. But what is going on here? Routine regular matters which even come under the jurisdiction of the States are raised here with the result that many Members do not get the chance and very important matters also lost sight of. This is number one.

Number two is, some two or three

Members speak and they expect that Government should look into the whole matter and that some effective action should be taken at the hands of the Government. This is normally what you expect. If two or three Members speak, how do you expect the Reporters to take down the matter and the matters to get to the notice of the Government? Therefore let us have some restriction. Every day all the 500 Members cannot have the chance.

Thirdly, some hon. Members want to raise very important matters. But they are having a feeble and low voice and they cannot be heard. Those who have been bestowed with lung-power only get the chance. I would request you to just observe in the Lobby what our friends are speaking. We should also take cognizance of that. So, let us be just.

**SHRIDIGVJAYA SINGH:** Please allow us from this side also to speak. They said something about Tripura. Will you allow me to say something on that? I want only one minute.

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER:** The hon. Member is on his legs. Let him complete.

*(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

**SHRI RAM SARAN YADAV:** Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, the villages Amni, Saudpur, Chandhali, Paura, Basua, Idmadi, etc. which come under the Khagaria district of Bihar are being severely affected by a devastating erosion. This has rendered thousands of people homeless and thousands acres of land is gradually turning barren.

As such, through you I request the Government to take requisite measures to contain this erosion and provide relief to the affected people. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI DIGVIJAYA SINGH; Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, the matter raised by Shri Saifuddin Choudhury regarding molestation of Adivasi women is very important and we unanimously condemn such behavior being meted out to Adivasi women. However, we have strong objection against the views expressed by Shri Chaudhury against the Tripura Government. If the Supreme Court has issued any directive, the Tripura Government would abide by it.... (*Interruptions*) As per my information the Supreme Court prepared a paper a few days back expressing certain views. The Tripura Government should take stringent action against the culprits as per directives of the Supreme Court. However, we object to giving such incidents a political colour.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI BASU DEB ACHARIA: Why has the Report not been placed on the Table of the House?

[*Translation*]

SHRI BHUWAN CHANDRA KHANDURI (Garhwal): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, the facilities and the benefits of T.V. services which should have been available to the Pauri Garhwal region of Uttar Pradesh and the border district of Chamoli could not be made available till date. The total area of these two districts is approximately 15,000 square kilometres and since it is a hilly region it is difficult to travel from one place to the other. The total population of this area is around fifteen lakhs but it is still deprived of Doordarshan facility. There are three transmitters in all in these two places. They are not capable to extend facilities to the people.

I want to inform the Government and the Ministry of Information and Broadcasting that the borders of Chamoli district touch Tibet. This is an important border State and as such people should be given Doordarshan facilities. I would urge the Minister of Infor-

mation & Broadcasting to send a survey team to know the needs of the people regarding transmitter facility and make necessary arrangements for telecasting the Doordarshan programmes in these places.... (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRIMATI MALINI BHATTACHARYA: Sir, it seems that somehow the poor people of Tripura have been suffering from the disease of invisibility. Only a few days back, in this House, we raised the matter of starvation deaths in Tripura. The hon. Minister, no less than Shri. Arjun Singh, made a statement saying that the matter would be referred to the Cabinet and he would come back to us. But so far nothing has happened and the condition is continuing unabated. Now, we find that this Ujjan Maidan gang-rape case report has come. I wrote a letter to the Welfare Minister on this as soon as the Report of the Supreme Court's Commission came out. Do you know what reply I got from the Welfare Minister? The Welfare Minister not only had not read my letter; he was neither acquainted with the report of the Commission nor was he acquainted with the incident. He said: "I will probe into this matter of alleged rape of a tribal women at Ujan Maidan." This is the state of disinformation and non-information that is prevailing about Tripura. And we want the Home Ministry to take serious account of this and we want the Commission's report not only to be placed on the Table of the House but a copy also should be sent to the Ministers to read the same. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI G.M.C. BALAYOGI (Amalapuram): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, the people belonging to SC/ST and other weaker sections are worried about their future in Indian industry in view of Government's new industrial policy which envisages privatisation of Indian industry. There is no constitutional guarantee to provide employment opportunities to SC/ST and other weaker sections in private industrial units.

Therefore, I urge upon the hon. the