

12.42 hrs.

**MESSAGE FROM THE PRESIDENT**

MR. SPEAKER: I have to inform the House that I have received the following message dated the 1st March, 1979 from the President:

"I have received with great satisfaction the expression of thanks by the Members of the Lok Sabha for the Address which I delivered to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on the 19th February, 1979."

12.44 hrs.

**MESSAGES FROM RAJYA SABHA**

SECRETARY: Sir, I have to report the following messages received from the Secretary-General of Rajya Sabha:—

(i) "In accordance with the provisions of sub-rule (6) of rule 186 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to return herewith the Copra Cess Bill, 1979, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 20th February, 1979 and transmitted to the Rajya Sabha for its recommendations and to state that this House has no recommendations to make to the Lok Sabha in regard to the said Bill."

(ii) "In accordance with the provisions of rule 127 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to inform the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha, at its sitting held on the 1st March, 1979, agreed without any amendment to the Coconut Development Board Bill, 1979, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 20th February, 1979."

(iii) "In accordance with the Provisions of rule 111 of the Rules

of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to enclose a copy of the Brahmputra Board Bill, 1979, which has been passed by the Rajya Sabha at its sitting held on the 1st March, 1979."

—

**BRAHMAPUTRA BOARD BILL**

AS PASSED BY RAJYA SABHA

SECRETARY: Sir, I lay on the Table of the House the Brahmputra Board Bill, 1979, as passed by Rajya Sabha.

12.46 hrs.

**CALLING ATTENTION TO MATTER OF URGENT PUBLIC IMPORTANCE**

—

**REPORTED FAILURE OF GOVERNMENT TO FULFIL ASSURANCES GIVEN TO STUDENTS OF THE DELHI UNIVERSITY COLLEGE OF MEDICAL SCIENCES**

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO (Mormugao): Sir, I want to call the attention of the Minister of Health and Family Welfare to the reported failure of the Government to fulfil the assurances given last year to the students of the Delhi University College of Medical Sciences in removing several handicaps faced by them in the college including lack of Hostel facilities and the two-week long strike launched by the 500 students of that College to press for the fulfilment of their demands.

THE MINISTER OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI RABI RAY): Sir, it is a long statement, so I lay it on the Table of the House.

*Statement*

Hon'ble Members will recall that 'Agreement' was reached by the Government of India with the Delhi Medical students on 19th May, 1978

in regard to a number of demands put forward by them.

2. Most of the decisions taken by Government then have since been implemented. However, in regard to the University College of Medical Sciences (UCMS) it has not been possible so far to implement a few demands mainly because of the fact that more than one authority is involved in fulfilling them.

3. The major issue in regard to the UCMS pertains to the question of appointment of a Director of the UCMS. The 'Agreement' dated 19th May, 1978 reached by Government with the students stipulated as follows:—

"For the University College of Medical Sciences, the Delhi University would appoint a Director from the Central Health Service who shall function as the Medical Superintendent of the Safdarjung Hospital as well as the Director of the University College of Medical Sciences. The Principal will be re-designated as the Dean and shall have only academic functions and work under the overall supervision of the Director. The Director would be appointed within a reasonable time and shall be in overall charge of both the College and the Hospital."

4. On 22-6-1978 the Union Health Ministry sent a panel of three names to the University of Delhi for consideration for appointment as Director of UCMS. Although the University of Delhi were fully associated with the negotiations with the students in April/May, 1978 and they were a party to the 'Agreement' yet it was subsequently revealed by them that under the University Regulations it will not be possible for them to appoint a "Director" for

the Medical College. Subsequent to this development, the Union Health Ministry have been having a regular dialogue with the Vice Chancellor of the University of Delhi to see how the object of the 'Agreement' of having an acceptable unified control of the college and the hospital could be achieved.

5. Immediately after I took over the Health Ministry I had looked into the matter and had held meetings with the Vice Chancellor of the Delhi University as well as the Students' Union. On the 24th February, 1979, the Delhi University and the Health Ministry reached an agreement to provide for coordinated working of the UCMS and the Safdarjung Hospital, New Delhi. Under this agreement Dr. D. B. Bisht, now working as Deputy Director General (Medical) in the Dte. General of Health Services will be appointed immediately as Medical Superintendent of Safdarjung Hospital. He will also be made the Vice Chairman of the Governing Body of the UCMS. This will provide for unified control of the College and Hospital. The functions of the Medical Superintendent-cum-Vice Chairman of the Governing Body as well as the Dean-cum-Principal of the College were clearly defined and mutually agreed to between the Health Ministry and the Delhi University. A high-powered Joint Council to look after any problems that might arise in the working of the unified authority with the Health Secretary and the Vice Chancellor, Delhi University as co-Chairman was also provided for. However, when this formula was put to the Students Union in the presence of the Vice Chancellor and the Dean of Colleges they flatly rejected it, as they felt that in the light of past difficulties, the only arrangement which would work satisfactorily

[Shri Rabi Ray]

would be a unified authority for both the College and Hospital. The Delhi University's request for allotting to the College the required number of beds in the Safdarjang Hospital could not be agreed to by my Ministry as such a step would adversely affect patient care. It has to be kept in mind that Safdarjang Hospital is one of the major Hospitals serving the public of Delhi and the adjoining areas of neighbouring States as well as one of only two hospitals for the Central Government Health Service. It has been our experience that divided responsibilities in hospital administration have led to difficulties in working as well as difficulties for the patients. In the light of this position my Ministry told the Students' Union in the presence of the Vice Chancellor that Government would now consider making arrangements for the single unified authority and in this context would also consider the possibility of taking over the College.

6. In their letter received in my Ministry on 27-2-1979 the Students' Union of the UCMS have reiterated that "the only answer to our college problems in the present circumstances is take over of our college by Ministry of Health".

7. Meanwhile in a communication to me dated 28th February, 1979 the Vice Chancellor of the Delhi University has informed as follows:—

(i) The Delhi University Teachers' Association has requested the Delhi University to run the College.

(ii) The Academic Council of the Delhi University has constituted a Committee to look into the whole question.

(iii) Government should keep the strong feelings of the teachers

and the Academic Council Members in mind while considering the alternative solution to the problems.

8. I may mention that even after these developments, the students' representatives have met the officers of the Ministry and have reiterated that nothing less than the early take over of the College by the Ministry would satisfy them. That is the proposal on which we are presently working.

9. I may point out in this connection that as early as October, 1978, the Vice Chancellor of the Delhi University had written to my Ministry to take over the College in the interim period till the regular buildings for the College/Hospital come up in Shahdara in a few year's time as per Government's earlier decision. Government have already decided that when the buildings are completed in Shahdara, the College will be shifted to that place and the Delhi Administration will run the College/Hospital as a permanent measure.

10. Another important problem which my Ministry is trying to solve relates to the provision of hostel accommodation for the students/interns of the University Colleges of Medical Sciences. The 'Agreement' of 19th May, 1978 stipulated as follows:—

"The barracks situated opposite the UCMS, now with the Defence Ministry, will be taken over and repaired and modified/adapted to the extent necessary, to function as a hostel for the students of the UCMS. This work would be completed expeditiously so that the hostel is ready by the 1st January, 1979."

The Union Ministry of Defence had agreed to place at the disposal of the Union Health Ministry certain

barracks in the Factory Road opposite the college provided alternative accommodation was made available to the Defence personnel now occupying the barracks. The Ministry of Works and Housing had certain difficulties in allotting General Pool accommodation to Defence personnel. However, I am glad to inform the House that the Ministry of Works and Housing have now given physical possession to the Ministry of Defence of 30 units of type I and II quarters against the total number of 54 units of accommodation needed by them. As regards the balance of 24 units of type III quarters, the Ministry of Works and Housing have allotted the quarters but have not yet given physical possession. The matter is being pursued with that Ministry further. As soon as the Defence personnel move out of the barracks and give their vacant possession to the Union Health Ministry, the repair/renovation work of the barracks will start. I may mention here that as early as in September, 1978 the necessary administrative approval and expenditure sanction for a sum of Rs. 7.9 lakhs for this work had been issued.

11. I may also mention that pending the renovation/repairs of the barracks, I have allowed the students/interns of the College to utilise the Dharmshala opposite the college on an "as is where is" basis. The students have welcomed this gesture.

12. As regards provision of play ground facilities this too has been arranged. Administrative approval and expenditure sanction of Rs. 62,100/- for grassing the play ground has been issued on 5-2-1979.

13. Another decision taken on 19-5-1978 was in regard to expediting

the construction of the Out-Patient Department Block (Phase II) of the Safdarjang Hospital for use of the college. Here too the Union Health Ministry had issued the necessary expenditure sanction of Rs. 31.125 lakh on 1-11-78. The procedural formalities necessary to be completed before the construction can be started are being expedited by the C.P.W.D.

14. From the above detailed account which I have given, I am sure the House will appreciate that the Union Health Ministry has been continuously giving attention to this matter and has been earnest in its desire to settle the problems of the students of the UCMS in a satisfactory manner. I am hopeful that before long all these problems would be resolved to the satisfaction of the students.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: You are laying it on the Table of the House. Mr. Speaker, Sir, I take a strong objection to the off the cuff manner in which statement is made in para 14 at the last page namely, page No. 8. I quote:

"From the above detailed account which I have given, I am sure the House will appreciate that the Union Health Ministry has been continuously giving attention to this matter and has been earnest in its desire to settle the problem of the students of the UCMS in a satisfactory manner..."

Now, this is what I call an 'off the cuff' statement. This is a statement which does not tally with the realities. Sir, having the highest regard for the hon'ble Minister and the person who occupies this office I should give him the benefit of doubt as it is drafted in a casual manner and, it seems, he has not applied his attention to this matter because from this portion of

[Shri Eduardo Faleiro]

the statement several other mis-statement and untrue statements arise.

Sir, this Medical College, as far as I know, is the most unfortunate Medical College in this country and, I hope, there are no other Medical Colleges in such an unfortunate and sad position. Let me say at the outset that I do not want to confront the hon'ble Minister who has taken the office very recently but I do hope that he will in this very first instance show his statesmanship and political ability and bring about a sound solution to this problem. This is a Medical College which does not have recognised teachers. It does not have a building. It does not have hostel facilities at all. In 1971 it was proposed to have this Medical College under the auspices of the Delhi Administration and it was planned that within 18 months from that day this college would come up in Shahadara, in the trans-Jamuna area. Eighteen months passed and only in December 1977 the foundation stone for this college was laid and my information is that nothing more was done and for that matter the foundation stone itself was stolen and is not to be found there. In 1971 when the college was to come within a period of eighteen months the Government of India arranged that during that interim period the College would function in the premises of Safdarjang Hospital. It was to be there for 18 months but has been going on for 8 years with the result, Sir, that there are no recognised teachers in that college at all. None of its teachers is recognised. I am talking about All India Medical Council. There are no recognised teachers. And for that matter strictly speaking this degree cannot be recognised by the All India Medical Council. But due to political pressure, on an ad hoc basis, this degree is being recognised from year to year. The doctors who work there are not having teaching qualifications. These doctors themselves have gone on strike. About the standard of teaching I do not want

to comment because I am myself not a medical man. But the doctors have gone on strike because their work there is not recognised and they were not having any teaching allowance for the purpose. Sometime in 1977 it was agreed that they will get an allowance of Rs. 150 per month but this allowance itself was dropped in 1978. As far as teaching is concerned this is the position: They don't have a hospital of their own, 1400 beds or thereabouts are there in this hospital but not a single section of the hospital is reserved for the medical college with the result that medical students from this college go there, they are not welcome, they don't get any training, they are treated as trespassers or transgressors into the wards, the doctors don't recognise them, don't help them, and they are not welcome. The position is this. Mr. Speaker, you will kindly bear with me for a few minutes until I make out this case of mine. The point which I wish to mention is this. You will see how serious the situation is.

Sir, there are no proper classrooms and there are no proper library facilities. In fact there are 500 students as mentioned here plus some 100 interns and the library can cater only to 20 students. The common room for students is half for the students and half for the animals, the animals being the guinea pigs and other animals on whom they have to operate. They are in the same common room.

SHRI HARI VISHNU KAMATH  
(Hoshangabad): Animal farm?

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: That is Animal farm from a different point of view. Now, Sir, the Union Room for the students is 5' x 6' (Interruptions) The Housing Minister may also take a note of this instead of cutting jokes because the Housing Ministry is also concerned with it. I will come to it just in the course of my submissions. Now, Sir, many of the teachers are having their rooms in the lavatories.

This is the position. Since you have rung the bell I will just mention their demands. Their demands are to this effect: They want that hostel facilities should be given to them. There are no hostel facilities at present. Secondly, the position is this. The whole trouble is this. This particular college is under dual authority. It is an University College and therefore it is subject to university rules. However, it is running in the premises of health Ministry, that is, Safdarjung hospital and therefore it is subject to the control of the Health Ministry. This conflict is the main reason for the trouble and for the precarious and unfortunate situation of this college at present. There is absolute rift between the Principal and the Vice Chancellor on the one side and the Health Secretary and the Superintendent of the Safdarjung Hospital on the other side. They are not invited to each other's functions. They don't have any such social intercourse and the relationship between them is cut. And in this tug-of-war, who suffers? It is the students who suffer. Now I will point out to you the mis-statement made here. Please see para 2. I want to point this and I request the hon. Minister to correct them on the floor of the House to show us his sincerity about which we have had full trust upto this time and I hope we will continue to have that. In Para 2 you will see this. He says that most of the decisions taken by Government then have since been implemented. He was referring to the earlier agreement. Then he says "However in regard to the University College of Medical Sciences it has not been possible so far to implement a few demands mainly because of the fact that more than one authority is involved in fulfilling them." This is what he says. Whatever demands are there, the hon. Minister stated them in the Rajya Sabha in reply to Unstarred Question No. 819 dated...

MR. SPEAKER: You don't exhaust all your ammunition here.

You must reserve something for the Health Ministry Demands.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: What I say is this, Sir. This Unstarred Question refers to some Memorandum. It is mentioned here...

MR. SPEAKER: Kindly come to the question. You have taken a very long time.

SHRI EDUARDO FALEIRO: What I say is this: Not a single of these demands mentioned here has been fulfilled. I am drawing the Minister's attention. Please see paragraph 2. I am drawing his attention to demand Nos. 3 to 8 which concern this college. Not a single demand has been fulfilled. This is my first point. So, this is a wrong statement. It is a mis-statement which has been made.

The second point on which I wish to draw your attention is this. They want to appoint one Dr. Bisht working as Deputy Secretary-General (Medical) to coordinate between the institution of the Safdarjung Hospital on the one side and the Medical College on the other side. Dr. Bisht himself has refused earlier, saying that it is not possible to do this work. As a matter of fact, two other persons were suggested, but they have refused, saying that they cannot do this work. In this statement, there are a series of mis-statements. Sir, you have cut short my time. It is your prerogative. It may be your right also. But I just want to point out this thing. Of course, there are many other things. I would like the Minister to come out clearly with a statement in this regard. I want him to give a definite reply on this point. The previous Ministers have gone and it is all to the good. We do not want a bureaucratic reply from you. Simply saying "it is under consideration" will not do. Eight years have passed like that. That will not do. I would like to know from the hon. Minister what immediate steps have been taken to bring this

[Shri Eduardo Faleiro]

college under the Health Ministry immediately. Secondly, what steps have to be taken to recognise the teachers who are working there, or to bring fresh teachers, if the college is to be under the University, on deputation to the University. Then, there are the hostel facilities. The dharamsala will not do. It is a common hall. There should be at least some partition, until the barracks are given to them as hostel. Fourthly, there is the question of hospital facilities. You must have a portion of the hospital for the use of the medical college until you have a separate hospital. They have asked for 600 beds. How much are you prepared to give. You have to give consideration to the demands of the students in a reasonable manner. Finally, they do not have a library. The existing library can be useful only for post-graduate research. So, they should be given suitable facilities for a good library. Sir, it is not possible for you to give more time. But I would say that the Minister should take this opportunity not to give a stereotyped reply but to show his political maturity.

SHRI RABI RAY: My hon. friend has made some critical references and he was some what harsh against the decision of the Government. But I want to assure Parliament that after I have assumed office I took personal interest in the matter. If the hon. Member has gone through the statement, he would agree with me that, so far as the agreement that was arrived at between the Health Ministry, the University and the students in May 1978 is concerned, out of the 17 conditions, 11 conditions have been fully implemented, four are in an advanced stage of implementation and only two are under consideration. I agree with him when he says that I have to take personal interest in this matter when the students are suffering. After I assumed office, I did not want that under my very nose they should suffer. Hence, the House would

appreciate, I called the Vice-Chancellor and the students on the 24th February. I met the students in the presence of the Vice-Chancellor and there was agreement between us, between the Ministry and the Vice-Chancellor, to translate the formal agreement into action. I think the whole thing has been described in the reply. I do not want to go into the details. In the presence of the Vice-Chancellor, I asked the students to explain their difficulty. They said that there should be no dual control and that the Ministry should take over; since the Vice-Chancellor has failed, the Ministry should take over. At that stage I intervened and asked what I should do, because I did not want the students to suffer. Then there was discussion. Then the Vice-Chancellor himself wrote a letter to me in which he has appreciated what I have done. There he says:

"Dear Rabi Ray,

We are immensely grateful to you for all the kindness and courtesy that you have shown for improving the situation in the University College of Medical Sciences since you have assumed office of Minister for Health and Family Welfare, I must say that it is for the first time that this matter has been discussed thoroughly and in great detail with serious attention, when the Minister himself has kindly spared so much of his time, despite his multifarious engagements for the resolution of the difficult problems which have accumulated during the last 8 years in connection with the institution . . ."

The students in their letter received by the Ministry on the 27th of last month have said that the only answer to their college problems is take over of the college by the Ministry of Health.

The hon. Member has raised the question of hostel for the students. This dharamshala was built up to

cater to the needs of the patients visiting Safdarjang hospital. The students have agreed to take the dharamshala and I have assured them that it would be placed at their disposal. The dharamshala would be available to them in a week's time till the barracks are made available to them. My friend, Shri Sikandar Bakht has taken special care to see that the students are not put to any difficulty. We will see that no unnecessary inconvenience is caused to the students. The students have also assured me that they would immediately leave the dharamshala after the barracks are made available to them.

As far as the Library facilities are concerned, the National Medical Library has been made available to the students of University College of Medical Sciences. There is no difficulty on that score. The playground will also be ready for them very soon. About the library, if there is any further difficulty, I will look into the same.

The main problem is to have a unified control on the UCMS. The students do not want dual control and I think, I will have no other go but to take over the college so that the students are not put to any inconvenience.

12.52 hrs.

[MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

SHRI MALLIKARJUN (Medak): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, Sir, it is very unfortunate that the Health Minister's reply is only an eye wash. He has mentioned that out of the 17 demands of the students, he has already met 11 demands. I would like to refresh the memory of the hon. Minister that it was on the 9th May, 1978 that an agreement was reached because of the strike of all the medical students, not of this particular college. They had a number of demands and out of those demands probably he had met some of them.

As far as this University College of Medical Sciences is concerned, they have only three demands. One, they wanted that there should be a unified control, a single authority should have the control over it. As it was, it is under the dual control of the University and the Health Ministry. Their second demand was for a hostel and the third demand was for the construction of the OPD, phase II. Unfortunately, for phase II construction, nothing has been done except sanctioning some small amount for this, so far as the hostel is concerned, they want to keep them in barracks. They have now offered them dharamshala. I do not know, if they are satisfied with this. They are also human beings. Being medical students, they need proper attention to be paid to them. They have to devote a lot of time to their studies and practical training.

The students of this college have to go to the Safdarjung Hospital for their clinical training. I do not know, whether the same doctors or professors who teach them in their college go and teach them in so far as their practical training in the hospital is concerned. And because of the dual control, we do not know how the doctors and others treat them at the Safdarjang hospital.

In the light of the agreement of 19th May, 1978, when a proposal was sent to the University to appoint a Director-cum-Medical Superintendent, they have rejected it because within the regulations of the University, it does not come in. Again, the Vice-Chancellor has written last year.

I think in the month of October, a letter was there that Government must immediately take over the College, in order to give proper education to the pupils, particularly the medical students who are going to save the lives of the Health Minister, of myself and everybody else. When the University Vice-Chancellor himself has written, I do not know what is the hitch for the Ministry to take it over.



[Shri Mallikarjun]

Again, there is a resolution of an association which has been forwarded. It is at page 4. It says.

“(i) The Delhi University Teachers' Association has requested the Delhi University to run the College.

(ii) The Academic Council of the Delhi University has constituted a Committee to look into the whole question.

(iii) Government should keep the strong feelings of the teachers and the Academic Council Members..”

What has the teachers of Humanities got to do with medical faculty? I do not understand. Here, the Vice Chancellor has written a letter suggesting taking over. Again, a resolution was adopted. In the light of all these things, medical students were very restive. They even gheraoed the Principal. Again, recently, to have a unified coordination, Dr. Bisht was appointed. For this unified coordination, Dr. Bisht was appointed, but this was also totally rejected by the pupils. Now the students want complete take over. Either you take it over, or let the University do it. Since the University can only conduct examinations and it is an academic institution, it will be wise on the part of the Government of India to take over the administration immediately and see that hostels are constructed immediately. So far as the barracks and their vacation by the Defence people are concerned—the hon. Minister of Housing was very generous to give some accommodation to the Defence personnel—all these things are not going to help the medical profession, with which everybody has got some concern. Therefore, I request the hon. Minister to let us know: **within how much prescribed time he is going to take over the institution as a whole, and then arrange for the proper construction of library and hostel facilities and for the provision of other amenities required for**

the medical students, to continue their profession? Or else, you completely close that institution and send all those medical students to the Maulana Azad Medical College or some other college and teach them regularly there. It should be a time-bound programme.

**SHRI RABI RAY:** I want to remove one misconception which both the Members who have put the questions, have. That misconception relates to Dr. Bisht. On the 24th of last month when we arrived at an agreement, it was decided that Dr. Bisht would do it. He agreed. Both the Members are under a misconception that he refused. (*Interruption*). Rejection was a previous decision. On the 24th of last month, we decided to send him, but the students rejected the whole agreement. That is the problem. I told you that Dr. Bisht was to be sent.

And I think one fundamental thing has been lost sight of by both the Members. It is that these are all interim arrangements. The entire medical complex is being built at Shahdara, and we have already sanctioned Rs. 8.72 crores. The total expenditure is Rs. 15.19 crores. It is only an interim arrangement and during this interim arrangement, these difficulties have cropped up. Hence, as I told you earlier, the Ministry, I think, will have no other go but to take over the institution.

—  
12.59 hrs.

**SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (RAILWAYS), 1978-79**

**THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE):** I beg to present a statement showing Supplementary Demands for Grants in respect of the Budget (Railways) for 1978-79.

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER:** Now matters under rule 377. Dr. Vasant Kumar Pandit. We will have the lunch hour after we finish matters under rule 377.

—