

**COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE
TABLE (2021-2022)**

69

SEVENTEENTH LOK SABHA

Sixty Ninth Report

**{Delay in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts
of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR)}**

(Presented on 17 December, 2021)



**LOK SABHA SECRETARIAT
NEW DELHI
December, 2021 / Agrahayana, 1943 (Saka)**

CONTENTS

		Page
COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2021-2022)		(iii)
INTRODUCTION		(v)
REPORT		
Delay in Laying of the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR).		1
ANNEXURES		
I	Statement showing the year wise Grant-in-Aid from the Ministry of Science and Technology, Govt. of India to the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research.	
II	Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports of Council of Scientific and Industrial Research for the years 2012-13 to 2017-18.	
III	The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research for the financial years 2012-13 to 2018-19.	
APPENDICES		
I.	The Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (2020-2021) held on Thursday, 28 th January, 2021.	
II.	The Extracts of the Minutes of the sitting of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (2021-2022) held on Monday, 13 th December, 2021.	

**COMPOSITION OF THE COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE
TABLE (2020-2021)**

CHAIRPERSON

Shri Ritesh Pandey

MEMBERS

2. Shri Shafiqur Rahman Barq
3. Shri Margani Bharat
4. Dr. A. Chellakumar
5. Shri Pallab Lochan Das
6. Shri Chowdhury Mohan Jatua
7. Choudhary Mehboob Ali Kaiser
8. Dr. Amol Ramsing Kolhe
9. Shri Raja Amareshwara Naik
10. Shri Jamyang Tsering Namgyal
11. Smt. Aparupa Poddar
12. Shri T.N. Prathapan
13. Shri S. Ramalingam
14. Shri Saptagiri Ulaka
15. Shri Ashok Kumar Yadav

SECRETARIAT

- | | | | |
|----|--------------------------|----|-----------------------------|
| 1. | Smt. Suman Arora | -- | Joint Secretary |
| 2. | Smt. B. Visala | -- | Director |
| 3. | Shri Munish Kumar Rewari | -- | Additional Director |
| 4. | Smt. Seema Sharma | -- | Assistant Executive Officer |

INTRODUCTION

I, Chairperson of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table (2021-2022), having been authorised by the Committee to present this Report on their behalf, present this Sixty Ninth Report in respect of the delay in laying the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR).

2. In terms of the recommendations of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in their First Report, Second Report (5th Lok Sabha) and Second Report (6th Lok Sabha) presented to the House on 8th March, 1976; 12th May, 1976 and 22nd December, 1977 respectively, the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Organisation / Company are required to be laid on the Table of the House within nine months of the closure of the respective accounting year.

3. The Committee considered the matter of delays in laying the Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) and took oral evidence of the representatives of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) under the Ministry of Science and Technology in this regard at their sitting held on Thursday, 28th January, 2021.

4. The Committee considered and adopted the Report at its sitting held on Monday, 13th December, 2021.

5. The Committee wish to express their thanks to the representatives of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) under the Ministry of Science and Technology for furnishing the written replies, other material / information and for placing their views in the matter before the Committee.

6. The Observations / Recommendations of the Report of the Committee have been printed in bold letters at the end of the Report.

New Delhi.
15 December, 2021
24 Agrahayana, 1943 (Saka)

Ritesh Pandey
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table
Lok Sabha

REPORT

Delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific & Industrial Research (CSIR).

The Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR), an autonomous body under the Department of Scientific & Industrial Research, Ministry of Science and Technology has a dynamic network of 38 national laboratories, 39 outreach centres, 3 Innovation Complexes and 5 units. CSIR's R&D expertise and experience is embodied in the thousands of scientists and students, producing publications, patents and developing technologies for the benefit of the country.

2. It covers a wide spectrum of science and technology – from radio and space physics, oceanography, chemicals, drugs, genomics, biotechnology and nanotechnology to mining, aeronautics, instrumentation, environmental engineering and information technology. It provides significant technological intervention in many areas with regard to societal efforts, which include environment, health, drinking water, food, housing, energy, farm and non-farm sectors.

3. Pioneer of India's intellectual property movement, the CSIR today is strengthening its patent portfolio to carve out global niches for the country in select technology domains. It granted 90% of US patents granted to any Indian publicly funded R&D organization. On an average, CSIR file about 200 Indian patents and 250 foreign patents per year. It is a leader in terms of filing and securing patents worldwide. The scientific staff of the CSIR only constitute about 3-4% of India's scientific manpower but they contribute to about 10% of India's scientific outputs.

4. In term of recommendations of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in Paras 1.16 and 3.5 of its First Report (5th Lok Sabha), Paras 4.16 and 4.18 of Second Report of 5th Lok Sabha and Paras 1.12 and 3.6 to 3.8 of Second Report of 6th Lok Sabha presented to the House on 08.03.1976, 12.05.1976 and 22.12.1977

respectively, the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts together along with Review Statement of the Institutes/Organizations (Statutory/Autonomous Organizations, Public Undertakings, Corporations, Joint Ventures, Societies etc.) are required to be laid within 09 months of the closer of the respective accounting year. To comply with this requirement proper time schedule should be laid down for compilation of Annual Report and Accounts and their auditing.

5. On being asked about the funding pattern to the Council, the Ministry in their written reply stated that the funding to the Council by the Government of India is done on Annual basis, however, it is released by the Department of the Scientific and Industrial Research on monthly / quarterly basis. The funding pattern of the Council for the years from 2012-13 to 2019-20 is given in **Annexure-I**.

6. While replying about the Act, Rule or Regulation under which Papers of the Council are laid on the Table of the House, the Ministry, in its written reply, stated that as per Rule-68 and 69 of the CSIR Rules & Regulations, a draft of the Annual Report and yearly accounts of the CSIR Society as certified by the Comptroller and Auditor General of India together with the Audit Report thereon is placed before the Society for its consideration and approval before placing the same on the Table of both the Houses of Parliament.

7. On being asked about the delay in laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Council for the years 2012-13 to 2018-19, the Ministry in its written submission stated that the Annual Reports and Annual Accounts of the CSIR Society for these financial years had been approved by the Governing Body, however, the said Annual Reports and Annual Accounts of the CSIR Society were required to be considered and approved by the CSIR Society before laying the same on the Table of both the Houses of Parliament. Therefore, the Annual Report & Audited Accounts of the CSIR for these years could not be laid on the Table of the Rajya Sabha and Lok Sabha.

8. While replying to the question that the delay in laying of these documents indicated that the Ministry did not give due importance to timely laying of the Papers before Parliament, the Ministry, in its written reply, stated that the CSIR accorded highest priority in matters related to the Parliament. Post reconstitution of the CSIR Society, the meeting was held on 14th February, 2020 in which the Annual Reports for the years 2014-15, 2015-16, 2016-17 and 2017-18 had been got approved and subsequently they were placed before the Parliament **Annexure-II**.

9. On being asked about the stages identified by the Ministry where delays occurred during these years, the Ministry in its written reply stated that “there exist a monitoring mechanism for reviewing the preparation of the report”. The Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of these four financial years had been approved by the Governing Body of the CSIR and status of the same had been submitted to the Ministry of Finance and the Parliament every year. Also Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of Autonomous Bodies are uploaded on the website of the administrative Ministry. Further, as per Rule 15 of the CSIR Rules & Regulations, the CSIR Society will review the progress and performance of CSIR, give the policy direction to the Governing Body and approve the Annual Report and yearly accounts of the CSIR.

10. While enquiring on the issue of whether the Council faced any problem in connection with translation of the documents into Hindi and subsequent printing thereof, the written reply of the Ministry stated that the CSIR translated its Annual Reports and Audited Accounts in Hindi through its internal Hindi Cell and had no problem in this regard.

11. On enquiring about whether there is any internal auditing mechanism to ensure timely compilation of accounts and to minimize the audit queries at the time of auditing, the Ministry replied in the affirmative. The Ministry further stated that the CSIR has a dedicated division to monitor the annual accounts related activities, which undertook periodical reviews for individual labs / units as well as consolidation at Headquarters.

The activities are done in a very systematic and meticulous manner. The division ensured timely compilation of accounts and also earnestly strived to minimize the audit queries at the time of the auditing.

12. The chronological sequence, as submitted by the Ministry, in respect of finalization of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Council for the years 2012-13 to 2018-19 are given at **Annexure-III**.

13. The representatives of the Ministry of Science and Technology (Council of Scientific and Industrial Research) were called for oral evidence at the sitting of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table held on Thursday, 28th January, 2021 to discuss the reasons for delay in laying of Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Council. During the sitting, the representatives of the Department of Scientific and Industrial Research (DSIR) presented a power-point presentation about the Council.

14. On being asked by the Committee as to what were the reasons for not having meetings of the CSIR Society since 2016, the Director General, CSIR stated as under :-

“..... many of the reasons were beyond our control. The Society was not able to meet. When the Society met on 20th February, we passed a resolution that in future such a thing – this particular embarrassing situation where we are not able to place the Report-should not arise.”

The Director General, CSIR further elaborated as under:

“..... currently, the Annual Report and Annual Audited Accounts have to be passed by the Governing Body and then they are placed before the Society. If Society approves it, it is placed before the Parliament. We have taken a dispensation from the Society that we do not need to wait for the Society meeting to take place so that the Report can be placed before the Parliament. Instead, with the permission of the Vice-President of the Society, that is the Hon. Minister of Science and Technology, we will be able to place the Report before the parliament in future. We are quite committed that in future this thing will not happen.”

15. On being asked about who were responsible for the finalization of the Reports, the Director General stated that

“..... there are a number of people who are involved in making of the Report. Annual Report is prepared by one person. We will make that person responsible for preparing it in time. Similarly, Annual Audited Accounts have to be audited by the C&AG. Every year that process gets over by July. Last year was exceptional because of COVID-19, a lot of things were disrupted and many things did not happen. They are on track now, and as soon as it is done, we will place it before the Parliament. We have committed that by June that process will be over and that is why we are requesting for extension till 30th June this year.”

16. In their list of replies, the CSIR has stated that they have introduced a new procedure to approve the Annual Reports and Annual Accounts and that will be chaired by the Vice President. During the course of the sitting, the Committee directed the Director General, CSIR to elaborate how the new procedure would improve the functioning of the approval of the Annual Report and Annual Accounts of the CSIR. The Director General, CSIR stated as under :-

“..... we were unable to do things in time and also were unable to lay those reports in time. When the society met this time, we proposed that it is not necessary that Annual Reports and Annual Audited Accounts be placed before the Society. That delegation of power may be given.....”

Observations / Recommendations

17. The Committee note that the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) have not complied with the time frame stipulated in the recommendations of the Committee on Papers Laid on the Table contained in Paras 1.16 and 3.5 of its First Report (5thLok Sabha), Paras 4.16 and 4.18 of Second Reports of 5thLok Sabha and Paras 1.12 and 2.6 to 3.8 of Second Report of 6thLok Sabha presented to the House on 08-03-1976, 12-05-1976 and 22-12-1977 respectively regarding laying of Annual Reports and Audited Accounts on the Table of the House within nine months from the closure of the accounting year. The documents of the CSIR for the years 2012-2013 to 2017-2018 have been laid on the Table of the House with delays ranging from four years and nine months to one year and seven months. The Committee also note that in all the years mentioned above, the Council did not lay documents on time. The Committee note that the Council took more than four years' time for laying the documents on the Table of the House for the year 2014-2015, which were required to be laid within nine months of the closure of the financial year.

18. While examining the reasons for delays in laying of the documents of the CSIR, the Committee note that an undue delay had occurred because the society did not meet for the four consecutive years i.e. 2014-15, 2015-16, 2016-17 and 2017-18-19. The Committee observe that finally the Society met on 14th February, 2020 and thereafter the documents of these years were laid on 22nd September, 2020 on the Table of the House. The Committee view it seriously and ask the Ministry to devise a new mechanism that would improve the functioning of the approval of these documents of the CSIR.

19. The Committee further note that the Reports have been delayed by 31 months, 19 months, 57 months, 45 months, 33 months and 21 months. The Committee express its regret that such an esteemed Institute which is chaired by

the Prime Minister of India, submitted its Reports to the Parliament with such long delays.

20. The Committee note that the Ministry of Science and Technology had apparently not been able to put in place an effective monitoring mechanism to ensure laying of documents of the CSIR on the Table of both the Houses of Parliament. The Committee recommend that the Ministry must make all-out efforts to ensure that henceforth documents of the CSIR from 2018-2019 onwards are laid within the stipulated time.

21. The Committee observe that for laying the documents of the Institute on time, someone should be made accountable and Society should meet every year. The Committee direct the Council that efforts should be made to present the Reports in time before Parliament and hope that the two pending Reports for the years 2018-19 and 2019-20 would be presented to the House at the earliest.

New Delhi.
December, 2021
Agrahayana, 1943 (Saka)

Ritesh Pandey
Chairperson
Committee on Papers Laid on the Table
Lok Sabha

ANNEXURE-I

Statement showing the year wise Grant-in-Aid from the Ministry of Science and Technology, Govt. of India to the Council of Scientific & Industrial Research (CSIR) for the year 2012-13 to 2019-20 is as under :-

S. No.	Year	Funds released to CSIR (Rs. In Cr.)
1.	2012-13	2,909.93
2.	2013-14	3,098.70
3.	2014-15	3,335.88
4.	2015-16	3,988.14
5.	2016-17	4,013.06
6.	2017-18	4,582.12
7.	2018-19	4,521.28
8.	2019-20	4,831.58

ANNEXURE-II
(vide Para7 of the Report)

Statement showing the dates of laying of the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR) for the years 2012-13 to 2019-20 vide Bulletin Part-I.

Year(s)	Date by which required to the laid	Date of laying of Annual Report	Date of laying of Audit Accounts	Extent of delay
2012-13	31-12-2013	03-08-2016	03-08-2016	Two years and seven months.
2013-14	31-12-2014	03-08-2016	03-08-2016	One year and seven months.
2014-15	31-12-2015	22-09-2020	22-09-2020	Four years and nine months.
2015-16	31-12-2016	22-09-2020	22-09-2020	Three years and nine months.
2016-17	31-12-2017	22-09-2020	22-09-2020	Two years and nine months.
2017-18	31-12-2018	22-09-2020	22-09-2020	One year and nine months.

Annexure-III
(vide Para 11 of the Report)

The chronological sequence in respect of finalization of Annual Report and Audited Accounts of the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research for the financial years 2012-13 to 2018-19.

S. No.	Particulars	2012-13	2013-14	2014-15	2015-16	2016-17	2017-18	2018-19
1.	The date on which Council approached the audit Authorities to appoint the auditors for auditing the Accounts.	--	--	--	--	--	--	04-05-18
2.	The date of compilation of Annual Accounts of the Council.	26-07-13	09-07-14	09-07-15	16-06-16	29-06-17	28-06-18	27-06-16
3.	The date on which the Annual Accounts were submitted to Auditors for auditing.	26-07-13	09-07-14	09-07-15	16-06-16	29-06-17	28-06-18	27-06-19
4.	The date and duration for auditing the Annual Accounts of the Council by Auditors.	Aug 2013 to Feb 2014	Aug 2014 to Jan 2015	Aug 2015 to Jan 2016	Jul 2016 to Oct 2016	Aug 2017 to Jan 2018	Aug 2018 to Oct 2018	Jul 2019 to Oct 2019
5.	The dates of queries raised by Auditors during auditing of Annual Accounts.	Aug 2013 to Feb 2014	Aug 2014 to Jan 2015	Aug 2015 to Jan 2016	Jul 2016 to Oct 2016	Aug 2017 to Jan 2018	Aug 2018 to Oct 2018	Jul 2019 to Oct 2019
7.	The date on which the replies to the audit queries were furnished to the auditors and time taken to resolve these queries.	The replies to the Audit queries were furnished to the Auditors during the course of Audit.						
8.	The dates on which draft audit reports were issued by the audit authorities.	21-01-14	29-12-14	27-11-15	04-11-16	08-11-17	16-10-18	06-12-19
9.	The dates on which the final audit Report received by the Council.	26-05-14	17-06-15	25-02-16	06-03-17	05-02-18	20-03-19	16-07-20

10.	The date of finalization of Annual Reports.	Once the Audited Reports and Annual Reports are finalized, they are immediately placed before the General Body for consideration and approval.
11.	The date on which documents were got approved from the Competent Authority.	Once the Annual Report is finalized, it is placed for consideration of the ensuing meeting of the Governing Body of CSIR.
12.	The date on which documents were taken up for translation & printing.	This is a routine and parallel exercise and no extra time was taken for doing this translation. Soft copies of Annual Reports are uploaded on the website as it is approved by the both the Houses of the Parliament.
13.	The dates and time taken for sending the documents to the Ministry for being laid in the House after completion of printing work.	Once the Annual Report is approved by the Governing Body of CSIR, softcopy of which is submitted to the Ministry for laying in both the Houses of Parliament whenever is in session.
14.	The date of laying of the documents on the Table of the House.	When the Parliament is in session, suitable dates for the S&T Departments are requested through the Ministry from the Speaker of Lok Sabha and the Chairman, Rajya Sabha respectively, for laying Annual Reports and the Audited Accounts from the Council.

ANNEXURE-II

**EXTRACTS OF THE MINUTES OF THE FOURTH SITTING OF THE
COMMITTEE ON PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE (2020-2021)**

The Committee sat on Thursday, 28th January 2021 from 14:00 hrs to 15:30 hrs. in Committee Room 'D', Parliament House Annexe Building, New Delhi.

PRESENT

Shri Ritesh Pandey - Chairperson

MEMBERS

2. Shri Shafiqur Rahman Barq
3. Shri S. Ramalingam
4. Shri Saptagiri Ulaka
5. Shri Ashok Kumar Yadav

SECRETARIAT

1. Smt. Suman Arora - Joint Secretary
2. Smt. B. Visala - Director
3. Shri Munish Kumar Rewari - Additional Director
4. Shri R. K. Chaudhary - Under Secretary

**REPRESENTATIVES OF
THE MINISTRY OF CULTURE &
THE NATIONAL MUSEUM INSTITUTE OF HISTORY OF ART,
CONSERVATION AND MUSEOLOGY (NMIHACM), NEW DELHI.**

XX

XX

XX

XX

XX

- Shri Raghvendra Singh, - Secretary (Culture)

**REPRESENTATIVES OF
THE MINISTRY OF SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY
(DEPARTMENT OF SCIENTIFIC & INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH) &
THE COUNCIL OF SCIENTIFIC AND INDUSTRIAL RESEARCH (CSIR), NEW
DELHI**

- Dr. Shekhar C Mande - DG, CSIR & Secretary, DSIR
- Shri K. R. Vaidheeswaran - JS (Administration), DSIR/CSIR
- Shri Chetan Prakash Jain - JS & FA, DSIR/CSIR
- Shri K. Venkatesubramanian - Chief Scientist & Head (CPD), CSIR
- Ms. Kamini Mishra - Scientist F, DSIR
- Shri VNS Bhatnagar - OSD(Parl.), CSIR

2. At the outset, the Chairperson welcomed the Members of the Committee to the sitting and explained the purpose of convening the meeting.

3. XX XX XX XX

4. XX XX XX XX

5. XX XX XX XX

6. Thereafter, the representatives of the Ministry of Science and Technology (Department of Scientific & Industrial Research) and the Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (CSIR), New Delhi, were ushered in to tender oral evidence before the Committee with regard to the delay in laying the Annual reports and Audited Accounts of the CSIR, New Delhi, for the years 2012-2013 to 2018-2019.

7. The Chairperson welcomed the representatives of the Ministry and CSIR to the sitting of the Committee and apprised that the meeting had been called to enquire about the reasons for the delays in laying the Annual Reports and Audited Accounts of the CSIR, New Delhi, for the aforesaid years. The Chairperson also informed the witnesses about the provisions of Direction 58 of Directions issued by the Speaker, Lok Sabha, regarding confidentiality of the proceedings.

8. The Secretary, at first, gave a small background about the genesis, functions and achievements of the CSIR. The Secretary submitted that non-convening of the meeting of CSIR Society during the period from 2016 to 2020 was the main reason for the delays, as documents of the CSIR could not be approved during those years. The Committee was assured that steps had

been taken to avoid such delays in future and that a resolution had been passed in the meeting of the newly reconstituted Society on 20.02.2020, to ensure that such a situation did not arise in future.

With regard to the status of the requisite documents for the year 2018-2019 and 2019-2020, the Secretary, further assured the Committee that the same would be laid by the Monsoon session. The Chairperson directed the Ministry to provide details in writing about the changes and system put in place to ensure that the subsequent Reports would be laid in time.

9. Thereafter, the Hon'ble Chairperson thanked the representatives of the Ministry and the CSIR for the useful discussion in connection with the examination of the subject.

The witnesses then withdrew.

A copy of the verbatim proceedings of the sitting of the Committee has been kept on record.

The Committee then adjourned.

XX Does not pertain to this Report.