

up Similar statement was given in the Parliament by the President. But no steps to this effect have been taken.

There has been a long standing demand for creation of 'Uttarakhand' in our neighbouring state. The Bhartiya Janata Party Government in Uttar Pradesh sent a proposal to the centre in this regard in 1992 but the Central Government has not so far accepted the proposal. The reason is that the Central Government is not interested in it. It does not want prosperity of that region. According to a rural saying if good education is available in villages, every one in village will cast his vote sensibly. Now being illiterate they cannot decide to whom they should vote. That is why the Central Government does not want spreading of education and is not interested in creation a new state which can ensure development of that region. If a separate Uttarakhand is creating, I will then be the first man to prove its justification and would show how the region makes progress. But the Government lacks the courage to creat it. As a matter of fact the Government does not want to see the prosperity of at region.

I do not have much time at my disposal since I am scheduled to go somewhere else. I would therefore like to submit that the Government should set up a commission and should accept the demand for creation of Uttarakhand. If whatever has been promised in President's Address is fulfilled, there will be no problem left in the country. The issue of Kashmir will also be automatically solved. With these words I conclude and express thanks for providing me an opportunity to speak. I oppose this Address since it is a bundle of false promises. Therefore, I oppose this.

17.44 hrs.

[English]

SUPPLEMENTARY DEMANDS FOR GRANTS (RAILWAYS), 1993-94.

THE MINISTER OF RAILWAYS (SHRI C.K. JAFFER SHARIEF) : I beg to present a statement (Hindi and English versions) showing the Supplementary Demands for Grants in respect of the Budget (Railways) for 1993-94.

[Pleased in Library at See No. LT 5445/94]

17.45 hrs.

MOTION OF THANKS ON THE PRESIDENT'S ADDRESS - *CONTD.*

[Translation]

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR YADAV (Nalanda): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I am thankful for providing me an opportunity to speak on the Motion of Thanks on President's Address. President's Address contains the policies of the Government to be followed in future. I hold the President's Address reflects the achievements of the Government in an exaggerated manner. It should however, also reflect the failures of the Government, only then a balanced policy for future can be formulated. This is however, not done. The Government is busy in self praise and goes a long way in self praise and goes a long way in self exaltation.. [interruptions]

[English]

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh) : There is no Minister here. That is not the place for a Minister. He should apologise first for that. What is this?

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (DEPARTMENT OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS) AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKUL WASNIK) : I understand this.

[*Translation*]

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR YADAV : I would like to suggest that this system of having President's Address should either be abolished or if it is to be continued, then it must reflect the true picture of both the achievements and failures of the Government and only then certain conclusion can be arrived at.

It was a great pleasure to me to listen to the speech of the hon. Minister of Home Affairs yesterday. I do not know how the hon. Prime Minister will take it. I would like to know if that is actually the policy of the Government as had been reflected in the speech of the Minister for Home Affairs. So far, we had the impression that our Government was not to speak anything against America even if the latter might adopt any stand. Now the whole of the country is obliged to the hon. Minister of Home Affairs for the manner in which he spoke openly against America yesterday. If that has become the part of Congress Party's policy, I would further suggest that the policy matter concerning America and Kashmir as expressed by the hon. Minister of Home Affairs yesterday should be included in the President's address with due amendment. Moreover, the hon. Prime Minister should also make the similar statement, only then America can get a befitting reply.

When India got independence, there used to be cordial relations between Centre and States based on the philosophy of

mutual co-operation. I am sorry to say that with the passing of days, the relations between Centre and State are becoming far from cordial. The Centre wield complete control over the resources of States and consequently the States have been rendered in miserable condition. As a result of which states are demanding more and more rights to ensure their own development. Regional imbalance is growing in the country. Some states get special favour from the Centre whereas the Centre is hostile against those states from where ruling party at Centre does not get votes. Consequently, the States like Bihar, Orissa, Bengal or any other such state are going constantly backward in terms of facilities like industries, agriculture, electricity, railway communication (*Interruptions*) So, the point is how the country can go on like this? A mention should have been made in the President's Address that allocation of funds by the Central Government the development plans and release of funds through Planning Commission would be done according to the position of unemployment, starvation, lack of infrastructure in different States. Such backward states should get special attention and special financial assistance so that they may be brought at par with other developed States of the country. Such an important and vital factor which is of real nature, is awfully missing in the President's Address.

Sir, the Rail Budget which was introduced in the House a couple of day ago and the earlier Railways Budgets two presented in the House were unanimously opposed the representatives of Orissa, Bihar, Bengal and other similar North-Eastern States. People stood against the role of the hon. Minister of Railway. Last time the hon. Minister has also made some promises to do something and in response to that, several Members met him, but nothing was done so

far. If this neglecting attitude of the Government in terms of railway, industries, electricity etc. continue, the unity of the country cannot be maintained for a longer period.

On the one hand Pakistan and America are trying to create disturbances in the area and on the other hand this area is also a victim of poverty and unemployment. That is why, there is a wide spread resentment among the common people and it cannot be suppressed for a long time.

Sir, it is essential that the Congress Government should pay special attention towards the backward states if it wishes to promote unity and integrity of the country. These states should be provided special assistance so that they can make progress and can be put in the line of developed states. Sir, at present Congress is in high spirits for its victory in recent elections and Congress thinks that it is the victory of the policies of the Government, but it is not a reality. Actually it was the impact of wrong policies of BJP. They demolished Babri Masjid which created an atmosphere of apprehension and fear among the people of the country which are normally secular in mind; they were frightened by these activities. They forgot the wrong policies of Congress for a while and voted in favour of Congress. They thought that their first and foremost duty was to defeat the communalism and save the country from the clutches of communalism. For this purpose the people from all the communities whether they are congress minded or otherwise voted in favour of congress and wherever the congress candidates were in main contest the people voted for him. Now what these people are doing after getting power. Anti-defection law was enacted by the Congress itself, but today it is promoting defection. Congress is the biggest political party of India and that is why on the moral ground it

is not proper for the Congress to indulge in Horse Trading. It is not proper for such a big party to buy the people's representatives in fifty lakh or one crore. This type of campaign is going on, I would like to tell Nitishji specially that in Janata Dal too such efforts are still being made. At present people are not ready to defect but you are assuring them Rs. 50 lakh. You are assuring these persons for giving one petrol pump and a small piece of land if they cross the floor.

[English]

SHRI MUKUL WASNIK . Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I would like to draw your attention to the fact that the hon. Member is trying to make allegations which are totally irresponsible and baseless. I think such baseless allegations should not form part of the record. This is going to convey a wrong impression. It is baseless in its totality
[Interruptions]

[Translation]

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR YADAV : I have not mentioned the name of the hon. Minister.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (Barh) : You are trying to avoid it by calling it baseless, but today it is the main subject of the discussion. The Congress has given ministership to one of the defectors violating the moral values and it is contrary to the Anti-defection Law brought by your party. Whatever was said at that time during the debate in this House, while making the Law, is being contradicted in action today by the same party which enacted the law. Now your party is giving a clear message to the other members that they should defect and get ministership. Today this issue is being discussed everywhere and the objection raised by the hon. Minister is baseless.

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR YADAV : It was the need of the hour that a big political party like Congress would have taken steps to eradicate the prevailing political corruption. It would have glorified the name of the party whether it would have remained in power or not. This method was adopted at the time when nobody was going to topple down the Government. Even today it is not making any promise to bring any law regarding election reforms. Election commission and Goswami Committee report has recommended that comprehensive law on election reforms should be brought. It would have been mentioned in President's Address but no such commitment has been made.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir just now the issue regarding reservation was mentioned. Nons will disagree with me that OBC people should also be given five years relaxation in age as SC/ST candidates are getting in Government services. They should also be given more chance to compete in examinations. In the context of the creamy layer as mentioned in the decision I would like to tell that poor people are not trained and their family tradition is different than the elite class. So I would like to say that arrangement for coaching classes should be made for OBCs also like SC/STs. Quota should be fixed for them in technical institutions also and they should be given more chances to take part in examinations.

The Hon. Finance Minister has discussed about the interest on loans. I would like to state that we are being entrapped in it, is not proper to mention that the payment of loan to IMF is being made before time. But main thing is that these loans are being taken at the cost of self-respect and sovereignty of the country. There was a time when Indian voice was listened very carefully in international politics but it is the impact of these loans that today India cannot even put

the right thing due to the pressure of US, IMF and World Bank.

SHRI MRUTUNJAYA NAYAK (Phulbani) : It was said yesterday.

SHRI VIJAY KUMAR YADAV : I have appreciated it but it should also be done by the Prime Minister.

I was saying that the loan has started showing its effect. The policies mentioned in the President's Address appear to be framed under the pressure of these loans.

Before getting loan people from your party used to express their views boldly but now it is not so; even ministers do not say anything. whatever instructions are given by Shri Rao, they all follow them. He does not want to express his internal views and considers it better to maintain a big silence. He is trying to remove poverty and unemployment but due to new economic policies, factories are being closed. Public sector is being handed over to capitalists. Constitution of India favours socialism but now it should be amended because the Government is going to establish a total capitalism in the country. The method being adopted by the Government....[Interruptions].... has been proved useless. You are working against the spirit of the constitution. Neither you are giving the right to work nor implementing the progressive law of land reforms. You are neither distributing the land properly nor trying to promote Jawahar Rozgar Yozna or any other employment oriented schemes, but the problem of unemployment is not going to be removed by it. Prices of essential commodities have been raised before the budget, which is not proper. It should not be done in such a haste. When your party is in majority in the Parliament, what was the necessity to raise the prices before presenting the Budget? It has

been said that inflation is decreasing, but the real value of rupee for poor can be calculated by the goods, they are getting by it. The Government takes into account the whole sale prices, but the crores of people in the country have to pay retail prices everyday. They are facing a lot of difficulties in the market. In the context of atrocities against women, firm attitude should be adopted. This matter was discussed here for 2-3 days but it is being ignored by saying that it pertains to state Governments, but it is a matter which relates to the whole country. Atrocities against any section of society pertains to the whole country. All these points should be included in the president's Address. Otherwise, I oppose it.

[English]

SHRIN. DENNIS (Nagercoil): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, while supporting the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address, I wish to make a few points.

The President at the outset in his Address has rightly observed with a sense of optimism that the country has a different atmosphere than that it has existed at the beginning of 1993. Now there is deep sense of stability, security, confidence and progress in the country. A stable Government alone could formulate and implement progressive policies; they alone could evolve sound policies and programmes for effective administrative transition.

A Government which has to spend its whole time for its survival cannot find time to evolve sound policies, for implementation. The country has passed through testing times previously. The country has faced a number of challenges and problems. Apart from political and economic problems, communal disharmony has threatened the very unity, integrity and secular fabric of our

country. Thus president, in his Address last year has given top most priority for the restoration of communal harmony and preservation of national unity and secularism.

Effective steps have been pursued to solve these problems. There is a positive trend of progress on all fronts. The recent Assembly Elections in five states have demonstrated the confidence reposed by the people in the policies and programmes of the Government. They have exhibited their faith in communal harmony and secularism. Those who believe in communal harmony and secularism should join together to combat the forces of communalism and hatred. Religion should be separated from politics by legislation and, if necessary, by constitutional amendment.

By improving the position in all fields, the Government has established national and international confidence.

Regarding Kashmir, it is the consistent policy of the Government that Kashmir is an integral part of India and no power could delink it from India.

As in Punjab, the Government is striving hard to establish an elected Government in Kashmir. The elected Government would reflect the true voice of the people and solve the problems to their satisfaction. The Government is trying its best to check terrorism and restore normally.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: You continue for another two minutes. There are so many persons to participate. The time allotted is already coming to an end.

SHRI N. DENNIS: The patience, prudence and utmost care displayed by the Government in dealing with the Hazaratbal shrine problem is exemplary and widely

[Sh N Dennis]

appreciated. In spite of earnest efforts of the Government to bring peace and harmony in the region and restore democratic process by conducting elections, the involvement of forces across the border are inciting hatred and preventing restoration of normalcy. There is instigation to create disorder and destabilisation in the country. Let us hope and trust that normalcy would be restored and democratic election would take place in that State.

Our relations with foreign countries have considerably improved. The visits of foreign dignitaries and Heads of Government of neighbouring and other countries and the visits of our Prime Minister to other countries have enhanced our ties and better relations with foreign countries and thereby trade and commerce with them too improved. Understanding arrived at with China is a step in the right direction. Our relationship with Pakistan did not progress because of its negative stance.

On the economic front, our economy is in the process of revival and recovery under the new economic policy, industrial policy and trade policy. The procedures have been made easier and liberal.

MR DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please conclude.

SHRI N DENNIS: I have started just now. I would like to speak at least for ten minutes.

MR DEPUTY SPEAKER: In ten minutes many people can participate.

SHRI JAGMEET SINGH BRAR (Fardkot): This is unfair. The people from the opposition have spoken for a much

longer time. [Interruptions] Mr. Devegowda spoke for one hour.

SHRINITHKUMAR (Barh): He should be given time. [Interruptions]

SHRI N DENNIS: There is boost in production and exports. The balance of payments position has greatly improved and there is comfortable foreign exchange reserve. Rate of inflation has also been controlled. When production increases, there would be larger employment opportunities and this is what is going on in our country. Regarding poverty alleviation programmes, setting up of a special cell by the Prime Minister to monitor the progress of the implementation programme of the weaker section is a welcome step. Now the district industrial centres and other authorities are directing the banks to release loans but the banks are not honouring the directions because they are not committed to these programmes. So, the intention of the Government to implement the programme to the poor is defeated. So, some policy has to be evolved or some machinery has to be set up so that the beneficiaries should get loans as is intended by the Government. Proper implementation agencies have to be set up in this regard.

Regarding agriculture, food production has increased three times and there is self-sufficiency in this field.

We are in a position to export also. Our food stock position is also comfortable. The credit goes to the agriculturists and agricultural scientists and also to the Government but we should not be complacent on this. The per hectare production of food grains is less than in many other countries and the per capita availability of rice is low. Population is increasing faster than food production. There are drought and desert-prone

areas in our country which have to be given special attention.

Regarding fisheries, we have a long coastline and there are places where in fishing harbours have to be opened. The West coast of Kanayakumari district is one such place where in a fishing harbour has to be opened at the earliest. Persons affected by natural calamities have to be given prompt assistance like that of this assistance extended to the earth quake in Maharashtra. Assistance there was extended to the victims by the Government and by other social service organisations. But I would like to point out that a similar case in Southern Tamil Nadu. In kanyakumari district more than 25000 houses have been damaged and for rebuilding those houses, adequate assistance is not given so far and the persons whose houses have been damaged remain as homeless wanderers. I would like to bring it to the notice of the Government that effective steps should be taken to provide them assistance for rebuilding their damaged houses.

Another point is about the constitution of Minorities Financial Development Corporation with a share capital of Rs. 500 crores which we welcome. Perviously, Minorities Commission was also set up. But I would like to point out that due to lack of follow-up action, the Minorities Commission is not functioning effectively. Here also, effective steps have to be taken for the proper functioning of it and also the Minorities Commission.

I welcome the 27 per cent reservation for the backward classes which is a longstanding aspiration of the backward class people. That aspiration has been fulfilled and I welcome this decision.

SHRI D. VENKATESWARA RAO (Bapatla): Thank you very much, Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, for giving me an opportunity

to speak on the Motion of Thanks to the President's Address to Parliament. Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, I rise to oppose the Motion and while opposing, I would like to place before the Government the various problems that are being faced by our people. Here I would like to highlight how the common man is suffering due to sustained price increase in most of the essential commodities; how the farmer is suffering due to unremunerative prices; how the domestic industry is suffering due to import and other policies of the Government; how external and internal debts are adding to our burdens; how corruption is becoming rampant day by day while the Government does not make any effort to control it; how population is growing at an alarming rate and how this growth in population, in turn, is affecting our employment sector, how unemployment is growing day by day and how the Government is not able to tackle the problem effectively; how fertilizer shortage is going to adversely affect our food production in near future; how external funds are misutilised by various institutions as well as the Government; and how the Government and the party in power are destroying the traditions of Parliamentary democracy and other institutions.

Coming to the price hike, Government has increased prices just before the Budget. Price of sugar registered an increase of nine per cent; rice 23 per cent; wheat 21 per cent; LPG 12 per cent; and petrol and diesel have registered an increase of 7 per cent in their prices. Moreover, due to increase in freight charges by rail and road, there is an increase in the prices of almost all other commodities. As opposed to this increase in prices of all commodities, the common man is not getting a proportionate increase in his salary or income. On the other hand, he has to spend about 20 to 25 per cent extra because of the general price hike. I fail to

[Sh. D. Venkateswara Rao]

understand how the common man can sustain and able to meet his basic requirement with such a kind of price hike. I am very sorry to state that the Government is not coming forward to invoke any solution for alleviating the misery of the common man.

If we take a look at the farming community, farmers too are in a sad plight. They do not get remunerative prices for their produce at all. I will give just one example of paddy and rice to prove that for the last four years, there is virtually no increase in the prices of farm produce. While the cost of paddy is Rs.250 per quintal, rice is being sold at Rs.12 a kilo. The price of sugarcane is Rs.400 a tonne. The situation is same for cotton which is being sold for Rs.1400 or 1500 per quintal. The prices remained constant for the last four years. Similarly, mirch and other farm produce also have not registered any increase in their prices. On the one hand, the poor farmer does not get remunerative prices for his produce and on the other hand, he has to incur additional expenditure due to price hike in fertilizer, pesticide and due to increased transportation charges. These increases vary between 20 and 60 per cent and sometimes, it is as high as one hundred per cent. In such a situation, the farmer is not in a position to carry on his cultivation activities without incurring losses. But the Government is not coming forward to help him in any way. Ours is an agrarian society and 80 to 85 per cent of our population belongs to farming community. But no effort is being made to improve their lot or to make them happy. There are no 'reforms' on the side of the Government to give any relief to the farming community.

Coming to the debt scenario, external debt is nearly 85 billion dollars, that is about

two lakh sixty thousand, one hundred and sixty seven crores. And this comprises 38.3 per cent of our GDP! The debt-servicing ratio is 30.4 per cent. All this external debt is supposed to be paid by us and we are paying roughly 8.9 billion dollars per annum just as interest. To pay the interest, we are again going in for more loans.

This is the kind of situation which is prevailing in the country and how we can come out of this situation, is the major question before us.

Coming to another area, our domestic industry is suffering because of the new Import Policy. Import duties are being reduced as a result of which there is no relief for the domestic as well as the small scale industry. This is also creating unemployment problem in the country.

We know very well that we have a very high percentage of population growth. It is about 27 per cent. Every year we are adding population equivalent to the Australian population. In every minute three thousand births are taking place. This increase in population will ultimately lead to unemployment problem which will affect the economy of our country. We will continue to face this problem if no effective measures are taken in the field of family planning.

Coming to fertilizers, I would like to say that our fertilizer consumption is very low. It is about 72 kg. per hectare, whereas for the European countries it is 200 kg. per hectare; for Japan, it is 365 kg. per hectare and for China it is 150 kg. per hectare. Even Pakistan and Bangladesh have higher fertilizers consumption than India, which is 89 kg. per hectare and 99 kg. per hectare, respectively.

Our foodgrain production is about 180

million tonnes per annum. In China, it is about 450 million tonnes per annum. The total cultivable area of China is a little higher than India but they are in a position to achieve higher production level by using better and effective methods of cultivation. In 1951, our per head consumption of foodgrains was 394 gm. and this has come to 465.6 gm. In 1993, in 50 years the increase is only 65 gm. If we go ahead in this way, we may end up with the bad health of the individuals as well as of the country.

Now, since subsidy on fertilizers has been abolished, there is less consumption of fertilizers and as a result of this we are far behind our schedule of foodgrain production. If you look at the fertilizers production at the moment, only 85 per cent of the required Nitrogen fertilizer is being produced here, and in the case of Phosphatic fertilizer it is only .70 per cent of our requirement, which is being produced here. We are not at all producing the Potash fertilizers in our country. This year, already there is 4.5 per cent less consumption of fertilizers and if we continue producing fertilizers in this way, our foodgrains production is going to be affected very severely, which is bad for the economic growth of our country.

Coming to corruption, the Government has no answer to scandals such as Bofors, Scam and purchase of ABB Railway Locomotives. We know very well that ABB Railway Locomotives were purchased against the wish and recommendation of the Railway Convention Committee. Even after the Joint Parliamentary Committee to inquire into Scam submitted its report, no action has been taken by the Government. This is how the Government is destroying a democratic institution like Parliament.

You take the example of Justice

Ramaswamy's case. The Government did not punish the corrupt personality of the Judiciary. In other words, the Government gives an impression that it wants to promote corruption.

We have so many areas where the Government is not responding properly. Take the example of my State, Andhra Pradesh. Even though the Prime minister belongs to Andhra Pradesh, we are denied assistance for projects like Telugu Ganga, Handriniva, Polavaram, Pulichentala, Jurala and Srisailem. There are many other projects which are still pending before the Government. The Prime Minister had promised many times about clearance of these projects but none of these projects had been cleared so far. He had also made so many promises in his Constituency about Nandyala Underground Drainage System, provision of T.V Transmitter and conversion of metre gauge into broad gauge line. Till date, nothing has been implemented whether it is at the level of the State Government or at the level of the Central Government.

He promises so many things at the time of elections but never implements them. He had visited his Constituency in Andhra Pradesh six times. Huge expenditure is involved for his visits. According to me it comes to Rs. 6 crore. He hires helicopters; he takes the help of police for Rayalaseema and he is accompanied by so many SPG commandoes. So, this is the fate of his constituency. All these put together, the expenditure comes to Rs. 1 crore per trip. *[Interruptions]*

DR. R MALLU (Nagar Karnool): He must remember that he is the Prime Minister of our country. The Prime Minister must come to our State. He had also cleared so many projects. The people of Andhra Pradesh are very happy about his visit. I

[Dr. R. Mallu]

would like to bring to the notice of the House that whenever he comes, automatically, protection is given to him. He is being provided helicopter not because he is interested in it but because he is the Prime Minister of India. But I am sorry that Hon. Member has understood him wrongly. He is after all our Prime Minister and he should not be treated as a mere Member of Parliament. (Interruptions)

SHRI D. VENKATESWARA RAO: The Government which is ruling Andhra Pradesh is destroying Parliamentary democracy. Now, I would like to refer to JPC In spite of JPC's report, no action has been taken. The JPC consisted of Members of all the Parties. So, the sanctity of JPC has been lost because of the ineffective action on the part of the Government. In the same way, the Party in power is resorting to all kinds of undemocratic measures, whether it is the question of Anti-Defection Bill or some such thing. The Anti-Defection Bill which was introduced by the Congress Government, is being damaged by the very same party. When the National Front Government which consisted of Members of BJP, Janata Dal and other Parties, was there, at that time, they did not do anything as far as this Bill is concerned. Now, all sorts of nasty things are being done.

With these few words, I conclude my speech. I also expect that the Government, while replying, will keep all these points in mind before answering them.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr. Brar, before you start your speech, I have a request to make. Mr. Upendra Nath Verma wants to go, let him speak before you.

SHRI JAGMEET SINGH BRAR: All right.

SHRI UPENDRA NATH VERMA (Chatra) : Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, when I went through the President Address, I immediately got a feeling as if an old man was simply making empty promises which were not going to be fulfilled at any time.

18.30 hrs.

SHRI NITISH KUMAR (*in the chair*)

When we go through the first para of President's Address we find that the country is making an all round progress constantly but in fact, it is not so. I want to know that what progress have you made to make the country self-reliant? What progress have you made to check the price rise? Some progress has been made but it is not true that we have made an all round progress. If I deal these issues separately it will be time consuming affair, therefore I am expressing my opinion quickly and in short.

So far as the question of self-reliance is concerned, I very much remember those days when we used to boycott the imported clothes under the leadership of Gandhiji and other leaders and to set the imported clothes on fire. Today, such is the situation that we are inviting them here. I want to tell that the way the multi-national companies are coming to our country and dumping their goods is posing a threat to our indigenous industry. All of you might be knowing that our paper industry is going through a crisis as paper worth Rs. 50 crore is lying in godowns but they are unable to sell it in competition with the foreign one, which is available at cheaper rates. (Interruptions) Naturally, it is going to cause the closure of our factories. Thereafter, they will increase their prices. What happened to fertilizers. What is the plight of our weavers? They are leaving their traditional occupations. This is a great danger. The closure of our indigenous industries will

lead to an employment. You may say anything but this is a fact that our indigenous industries are being ruined. Some factories are even showing false production. It was detected in case of coal. What to say about iron-ore. There is one Steel Authority of India. It's Raw-material division appointed more than 50 persons without making advertisement for the posts and without sending its requirements to the employment exchange. It is said that these appointments have been made by taking an amount of Rs.50000 to Rs. 1,00,000 from the individuals. Will it add to the development of this industry. Not only this, the same Steel Authority of India bought 5 Hydraulic shovel machines for 25 crore rupees which are gathering dust as a result thereof the money invested in these machines has blocked. I want to put a stress on the fact that during the last ten years the Government of India, State Governments and Semi-Government Organisations have purchased machineries worth Rs.500 crores. Which has not been used till date. These machines were purchased just to get commission but we do not focus our attention to this fact. We did pay attention in the bofors case but not in the rest of the cases. what will happen to this nation?

They say that Law and Order situation has improved a lot. I represent Gaya, Chatra and Palamau districts of Bihar, which is the most backward area of the country. People are being killed there daily. Three young people were killed there on 14th February. In my region two youths were killed while travelling on a bike, by forcibly blocking their way by a truck. Their bike and the truck were set on fire. Thereafter, after 6 days, on 20th February another incident took place in Pratappur block of Chatra district. Be it Karim Nagar district of Andhra Pradesh, Bastar Bilaspur and Sargūja of Madhya Pradesh, Kalahadi of Orissa or any

other backward region this sort of incidents are a common feature these days all over the country. The situation is very grave in the Central Bihar region in Bihar, but they claim that law and order situation has improved a lot. I would like to say that there is no improvement on this account, more people have been killed in these areas in comparison to the total number of people killed in Punjab, Jammu and Kashmir. You should not take it lightly that there is lot of improvement in the situation.

The Ayodhya issue has also been mentioned in it. I would like to recall three dates relating to this issue. First is the period during the rule of Prime Minister Jawahar Lal in 1949, second is 1st January 1986 when Rajiv Gandhi was our Prime Minister and the third one in 6th December, 1992. Now you just see that what happened. In 1949 Lord Ram's statue was put in the Babri mosque and it was said that Ramlala was born there. When this led to tension then a lock was put on it. Which continued to be there for a long period. And when....

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Verma, how much time do you want ?

SHRI UPENDRANATH VERMA: When you will ask I will conclude.

I want to submit that this lock was opened in January 1986 and with this a controversy started. The then Prime Minister went there to ease the situation and he rather started his election campaign from Ayodhya and laid the foundation stone of the Ram temple. I want to submit that, when Government official or Prime Minister of a secular country will act in this manner then what will happen to secularism.

For the last 10-12 years I have been watching in Bihar that temples are forcibly

[Sh. Upendra Nath Verma]

being constructed on the Government land. When you go from Patna to Bakhtyarpur, there is a place called Fatwa. A temple was built in the police station there and it was named as 'Baba Thaneshwarnath'. Similarly a temple was constructed in a power station which was named as 'Baba Bijleswarnath'. Somewhere these are named as Anchleshwarnath at other place as Prashandeshwarnath, and things like this are going on....*(Interruptions)*

All least one dozen temples were built in the colony of Bihar State Electricity Board during the last ten years and when a temple is built.....*[Interruptions]*

Then demands are also raised for constructing mosques and Churches, which is but natural. It leads to tension. If you intend to wipe out communalism then you will have to give due attention towards it otherwise this situation will remain forever. I also want to submit that as you have made a mention of Standing Committees of the Parliament it should also have been mentioned there that the present duration of one hour of Question Hour should be increased considering the increasing number of questions. Not only this, even the duration of the session is being cut short.

I would like to strongly submit that reducing the duration of the sessions of the Parliament and the State Legislatures is an attack on democracy. It should have attracted the attention of both the Hon. President and the Govt. fortunately neither has paid any attention towards it.

Sir, I would like to submit that rural development and agriculture sector have been discussed at length in the House. It is a fact that farmers, agricultural labourers and sci-

entists have joined hands to boost agricultural production from 5 crore tonnes to 18 crore tonnes. However, now what further progress is being made? In my constituency Chatra, tomatoes are being sold for 25 paise per Kg. This is the situation in whole of my area....*(Interruptions)*. However, nothing has been done in this regard by the Ministry of Food Processing during the last few years? Not a single plant was set up there. Only licences for liquor were issued. I just want to submit that how the situation is deteriorating. As far as education is concerned, Directive Principles of State Policy are not being adhered to. It is clearly enshrined in the Constitution that within 10 years all the children in the age group of 6 to 14 years would be sent to the schools. However even now about 5 crore children have yet to start going to the schools. Though it is proclaimed that education to all will be provided, yet where are we drifting to? At the time of independence, there were 21 crore illiterates but gradually, the number increased to 28 crore and then to 36 crore which in 1981 increased to 43 crore and even today half of the world's illiterates are in India. Whichever party came into power openly flouted the directives of the Constitution. I would like to know whether the Government has got courage to promise that free, compulsory and uniform education will be provided to all? Until and unless facilities for compulsory education are made available, the situation is not going to improve.. *(Interruptions)*...

Sir, in the end I would like to submit that the root cause of all the problems in the country is mainly politics and when the standard of politics declines, then nobody can do anything. However, what have we done to check this trend? Many people claim that the country has marched forward in various fields. I will conclude in two minutes. I would like to urge the Govern-

ment to compare pre-independence and post independence situations. In the pre-independence era, when the country was under the yoke of slavery greatman like Noble Laureate Rabindra Nath Tagore was born. Whole world recognised his genius. In the same period scientists like Jagdish Basu, C.V.Raman and Bhaba and also Gama, the world champion in wrestling who remained at the top for 20 years, were born. Swami Vivekananda and Mahatma Gandhi were also born during the days of slavery and India was World Champion in Hockey. Then why in the post-independence era India has not been able to produce world class literature writers, orators, scientists, wrestlers or sports persons? There must be some fault somewhere and we must rise above politics to remove the fault.

With these words, I oppose the Motion of Thanks on the Address.

[English]

MR. CHAIRMAN. Shri Yaima Singh, you have asked only three minutes. Kindly conclude within three minutes.

SHRI YAIMA SINGH YUMNAM (Inner Manipur): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the President has rightly mentioned that the insurgency situation in the North East has shown improvement. It is correct in respect of Manipur. Before the President has delivered his Address, that is before the 21st February, the situation was very bad. After the imposition of President's Rule the situation in Manipur has improved now.

Sir, since the situation in Manipur has been improved now, I demand that a popular Ministry should be restored in the State. This is my first demand.

Secondly, I demand for the declaration

of general amnesty to the insurgents in the Valley of Manipur. It was experienced in Assam and it was quite successful and the response was good. So, I am proposing to the Government to offer general amnesty to the insurgents in Manipur and it will be a good measure. The present situation in Manipur has arisen out of a temporary truce. It will not be a permanent settlement. The permanent settlement will be offering general amnesty to the insurgents and at the same time taking up the programmes for rehabilitation, for employment and for other demands made by the underground people, when they come overground. And that will be of much help. Frustration is there. In Manipur, there is no Central University; there is no paper mill; there is no sugar mill and there is no Engineering College. So, there is frustration among the youth in Manipur. As a result of that, they are taking up to arms.

Sir, the ethnic conflict between Nagas and Kukis will have to be solved. It was rightly pointed out in the Governor's Report that some Ministers were indirectly instigating or involving in the ethnic conflict. Now, they are not there. So, ethnic conflict between Nagas and Kukis will have to be solved.

The insurgents in the Valley will come out if we can assure them employment opportunities, rehabilitation and some other incentives.

Manipur has got plenty of bamboos. But the paper mill has been snatched to Silcher. It should have been given to Manipur. There are plenty of sugarcane. But no sugar mill is there. It is but natural that the youths in the State are frustrated.

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have given you four and a half minutes.

SHRI YAIMA SINH YUMNAM: As you know, in the recent National Games, the State of Manipur had secured 13 gold medals and some other medals. However, there is no proper stadium. There is no playground and no other infrastructure for the development of sports. But in spite of that our sport persons secured 13 gold medals and some other medals.

The State of Manipur is very neglected in all respects. I think, this is the reason why the youngsters are revolting there. So, I request the Government for offering a general amnesty to these youngsters for solving this problem. They must be rehabilitated and they must be employed.

So, with these words, I thank you for giving me an opportunity to speak. (*Interruptions*)

Sir, I am on a point of order. Under the rules of the House, a mover of the Motion must have a right to speak. Here, I am a mover of the amendment to the Motion. Instead of allowing me to speak as a right under the rules, I am begging for allowing me to speak. While another Chairman was allowing more than one hour to a certain Member, I am being given only three and a half minutes. It is not fair.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Your name was called day before yesterday. You were not present. So, please take your seat.

Now, I am calling Shri Jagmeet Singh Brar.

[*Translation*]

SHRI JAGMEET SINGH BRAR (Faridkot): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I rise to support the motion of Thanks on the Presidents Address moved by S/Shri Mathur and

Thomas of my party. Attendance both of the Ministers and the hon. Members at the fag end of the day is very thin. I promise not to repeat the points already raised in the House and would like to start my speech from the human rights. Human rights has become a hotly debated topic in the world. As a citizen of India, I am pained to hear the sermons on human Rights violations from the world leaders of all hues, like Shri Bill Clinton, Shrimati Rabin Raphel and Ms. Benazir Bhutto. While glancing through the pages of the World History, I am reminded of the comments of the then American President, Truman, at the time of dropping of atom bombs on Hiroshima and Nagasaki. U.S. Army had advised against use of atom bombs in the face of surrender by Germany even though Japan was fighting bravely. However, atom bombs were dropped and within 3 minutes two lakh persons perished. All these incidents have been clearly etched out in the minds of their later generations. When after the dropping of atom bombs Mr. Truman was contacted next day by the World Press for his comments, he stated in response to a query that previous night he slept well as the experiment proved to be quite successful. Those who themselves have been indulging in violation of human rights are giving us sermons on human rights by attacking Indian culture. A statement has been issued by Justice Mishra the Chairman of the Human Rights Commission of India, and I would like to read it out:

[*English*]

"In fact, our jurisdiction on human rights would be more wider than the Supreme Court."

[*Translation*]

In the light of this statement, India does not need to be given sermons. While going

through the map of India, my eyes are automatically focussed on the great region of Kashmir, the land known for its pursuits in Buddhism, Hinduism and mysticism.

A famous Urdu poet's couplet goes as follows:

"Vatan ki fikr kar Nadan, Musibat Aane
Vāli Hai,
Teri Barbadiyon ke Mashvire Hain
Aasman Mein."

It is painful to see how we have tackled Jammu & Kashmir even after 45 years of independence.

[English]

We have thousands of miles of undemarcated and unagreed borders.

[Translation]

Contiguous to China and Pakistan.

I would like to quote the opening para of the book 'My Frozen Turbulence' by the former Governor of Jammu and Kashmir Shri Jagmohan. In it, Shri Jagmohan has written that while aboard a BSF aircraft, he noticed the plane to be going up and down while passing through clouds. I am pained to notice the difference of opinion between the hon. Minister of Home Affairs and the hon. Minister of State in the same Ministry. Their differences may not snowball into the experiences of the above said aircraft journey and we may see that

[English]

In the end, it makes a nosedive never to fly again.

[Translation]

Though, attempts are being made at

the international level to separate Jammu and Kashmir from India yet they will not succeed. I feel proud to say that Kashmir has been once the crown of India. It is said that upto 1947, the entire area of Jammu and Kashmir was 84,000 square miles whereas at present, it is 42,000 sq.miles only. All this I am quoting from the speech of the former ruler of the State and father of Dr. Karan Singh, Shri Hari Singh Ji. We must keep in mind that already we have lost half of the territory.

I pity Generals of Pakistan. In 1965, Ayub Khan was Army General there and he used to say:

[English]

The ultimate solution to Kashmir is war.

[Translation]

But what happened in 1965? Indian Armed Forces and the people of India made great sacrifices on the borders to thwart the designs of the enemy. That war pushed Pakistan 25 years behind.

[English]

19.00 hrs.

The whole State of Punjab joined the Army to strengthen their attack by providing food and other material.

[Translation]

The adventure of Military Generals of Pakistan cost that nation dearly. A great personality like Abdul Gaffar Khan wrote somewhere in the light of the statements of these Generals.

[English]

"If India were to offer not one but half a

[Sh. Jagmeet Singh Brar]

dozen Kashmir. India would find that peace would not be established with Pakistan."

[Translation]

That country's designs are nefarious and it is hatching conspiracy through ISI to harm our country. I would therefore like to urge the Government of India that Kashmir is not Punjab. I disagree with my colleagues. Historically it will differ from Punjab. There is tremendous sufferings in Kashmir today. During the secretary level talks in Islamabad, the Foreign Secretary has been clearly told that Simla Agreement is not relevant and what is relevant is plebiscite.

[Translation]

The Kashmir problem and the Punjab problem are not similar, there is a great difference between them. I would like to refer to the statements made. In a meeting held in Pakistan our foreign Secretary was told:

[English]

"Repression is at its climax in the Indian held Kashmir."

[Translation]

Therefore, the serious problems should be solved seriously by the Government, Mrs. Benazir, Hobin Raphael and Madan Lodi have been after us.

[English]

These three are after the whole 'Nation'. They have become individual adventurers of American President-

[Translation]

and they are a source of constant irritation to us. The Ministry of External Affairs should take an initiative in this regard.

An extensive discussion has taken place on Kashmir. Whenever the M.Ps from Punjab get an opportunity they discuss the problem of Punjab. However I would like to submit that I agree with Shri Aiyar - my able colleague - who has suggested that Bharat Ratna should be conferred on Shri Beant Singh and I fully agree with him. The State Government and the people made repeated requests to the Central Government but all in vain. Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs - all communities in Punjab fought together against terrorism. But the State still owe about Rs. 6600 crores. Not to talk of waiving off the loan, the Central Government have not even given any relaxation in tax. It is something very regrettable. Shri Surjit Pattekar has been a great poet of Punjab, who has got Sahitya Akademy award. He wrote that grief, violence, terror etc. have become a part of the life in Punjab. The hon. President has stated on page 3 that:

[English]

"We have been able to consolidate our gains in Punjab."

[Translation]

In this context, a poet has said:

"Mahrume Haquikat Hai, Sahil Ke
Tamashai
Hum Doob Ke Samjhe Hain Dariyaon
Ki Gehrai."

In order to understand the gravity of the matter I would like to read out a couplet of Iqbal also.

Recently when I got an opportunity to visit the village of Sant Harchand Singh Longowal the local residents enquired about the accord made by late Shri Rajiv Gandhi. About one lakh people had gathered in the sports festival organised there. The local people asked the representatives that the former Prime Minister and ruling party had reached an accord about Punjab.

[English]

But now your party has totally gone back on the Accord. The Home Minister has dozen of times announced packages about Punjab nothing has been announced.

[Translation]

This Punjab accord was signed in 1985 which contained 11 clauses but not even a single clause has been implemented so far. This is the tragedy of Punjab. This could be very dangerous in the prevailing situation and circumstances in the State. That is why I would like to mention it here at this moment.

The BJP has come into power in Delhi now. Shri Khurana used to sit with us, and he assured that those who were involved in the communal riots in Delhi would be punished and that the murderers of humanity would be apprehended if their party came into power. He used to blame the Congress party for it. But today I would like to ask the members of Bhartiya Janata Party what initiative have they taken after they came into power in Delhi. People in every corner of the country want to know this. No arrest has been made as far in this regard. Not a single political leader has been arrested by the BJP Government.

I would like to submit to the Government that recently the hon. Home Minister had been to Punjab but did not sanction

any funds for the construction of Thein Dam. I am sorry to say that very few people would be aware that at the time of partition 23 out of the total 25 canals went into West Pakistan. Only two canals were left to East Punjab. However a Re-organisation Act was formulated in 1966 and the section 78 and 80 was incorporated into it to enable the Government to withdraw the irrigation rights from Punjab - though they have been given to all other State - and thus the farmers of the state were deprived of the water whereas Punjab is being condemned all over the country for not releasing water.

[English]

Punjab is the only State in the country which is giving 75 percent of its river resources to the other States like Haryana and Rajasthan. We are ready to give anything to our brothers in Rajasthan and Haryana. But see our position.

[Translation]

At present there is shortage of water of about 14 million acre feet. A historic event took place when hundreds of people residing in Shekhupura, Ludhiana, Sargodha and Lahore left hundreds of acres of fertile land and took barren land in Punjab when they migrated.

[English]

Biggest ever human migration in history happened. Now they have made more production.

[Translation]

Under such prevailing circumstances depriving the State of water is a great injustice to them. I would urge upon the hon.

[Sh. Jagmeet Singh Brar]

Minister of Water Resources to review the whole situation and solve the dispute regarding the distribution of the water of Ravi, Beas and Sutlej rivers.

MR CHAIRMAN: You have already taken 20 minutes. Please conclude.

SHRI JAGMEET SINGH BRAR: I would also like to submit that Shri Narasimha Rao is the head of our national polity. I am glad that I am a member of that Congress party which is led by a scholar statesman. I am not saying so.

[English]

The Statement made by the President of the World Economic Forum at Davos comes before me.

"One of the not yet recognised successful stories on earth is Klaus Schwab. So I believe that the leader like Shri P V Narasimha Rao who has been involved in the negotiations of the Punjab situation, who has been involved in the secret parleys of Punjab, who has been involved as the Home Minister to solve the Punjab problem will definitely implement the Rajiv Longowal Accord to make permanent peace in Punjab. Congress being the custodian of the nation, I want to make this request to my party leaders.

[Translation]

On this occasion I am reminded of an advice given by a former Prime Minister of England, Sir Robert Peel, as to how the political leaders should rise above the party interests. That speech of his is remembered as the shortest and the best in the world

history even today. When he resigned as a Prime Minister, he kept the national interest above the party interest. He had stated that

[English]

"I understand that my effigies will be burnt in the palaces, but I am satisfied that my picture will be hanged in the cottages."

[Translation]

If our Prime Minister Shri P V Narasimha Rao succeeds in finding out a permanent solution to Punjab problem, people of the entire world would be grateful to him.

Mr. Chairman, Sir, I would like to make another important submission. I am proud that ours is a democratic party but I maintain a different opinion and I have not taken the permission of my party to express my opinion here. The Congress party has a glorious history of 109 years. The total number of members of the Parliament and those of State Assemblies in the country from the year 1967 to 1972 was 4000. Shri Subhash Kashyap, who was the former Secretary General of Lok Sabha, wrote a book in which it is stated that 2000 members out of the total 4000 defected. This is on record and it was only due to this that late Shri Rajiv Gandhi had to bring an Anti-Defection Bill. But the true spirit and the feeling of that Bill is not there anymore. This is my feeling. There is a migratory bird named Rosy Starling. The hon. Members would be surprised on this reference. But it is said that this bird in large flocks migrate overnight through a narrow route. Just now one of the hon. Member stated that the Congress party encouraged them. If it was so, then why did Shri Vajpayee, Shri Jaswant Singh and Shri Somnath not defect?

"Yurope Ki Gulami Par Razamand
Huja Tu,
Muzh Ko To Gila Tujh Pe Hai, Yurope
Pe Nahin "

Nobody can encourage the others to defeat Why people defect people change their paths to gain strength and power In this regard I differ from my Party

[English]

"I differ with my party that with the majority in Parliament we may have increased our numbers but we have lost in the ground realities of politics "

[Translation]

The number of Members hardly matters the Government are run only by a single person Whatever views I had in this regard I have expressed When a ruddy goose ask Aaon (Shall I come) the female fuddy goose reply Aao' (Do come) What I want to say is that some of our Members consider themselves as ring masters of defection and now-a-days they are quite busy

There are some people who defect enmass to another party It has never happened in this history of the country that the whole party defected to some other party

[English]

I think with such a great leader of my Party as the Prime Minister we should not at any stage encourage such type of thing

[Translation]

This is what I feel in my heart as an

elected representative and I have shared it with you

They say that the great Hanumanji had gone to pick up a herb but lifted the hill and brought it there Similarly the whole party has been hijacked which is unprecedented I think it is a big setback to the spirit which is behind our anti-defection law for which our late leader had sacrificed his life in party interests

Mr Chairman Sir the poet Shri Iqbal has said

'Sach kah doon ai birahmin gar tu
bura na mane
tere sanam kadon ke but ho gar
purane '

The old traditions and practices have become outdated

I would like to request the leader of Bhartiya Janata Party Shri Advani who is not present here now to divert his chariot which he had once moved towards Rajasthan where their party is in power He might ask me as to why should be do that It is because it is a holy place of chishti gharanas after the holy Mecca Sharief Ajmer is the most sacred place He should go there and seek forgiveness You have broken hearts by pulling down the masjid belonging to a minority community of the country The people of India forgive Our former Home Minister went there and he was forgiven and was showered with love and affection That is why I would urge that all the leaders should go in the chariot and seek forgiveness at Ajmer Sharief because they were responsible for the destruction of the masjid It will be good for the welfare of the nation It will help in strengthening the integrity and unity of our country

[Sh. Jagmeet Singh Brar]

[English]

Pit the Younger has said:

*"England is safe by the exertion of
its people;
Eurpoe is safe by the example of
England.*

[Translation]

If our party behaves in this exemplary manner before this country and all other political parties support us then, the nation can be saved. I would like to say one thing with a heavy heart that it is not that Clinton alone has not written a single letter on the condition of Punjab, it was in fact, a part of an international conspiracy. They are not there to teach us on human rights. Our country has produced the champion of human rights, like Guru Tegh Bahadur who did not see eye to eye with the Brahmin society and their policies, yet, he sacrificed his head for them and gave a new direction to the world. We can also sacrifice our heads but would not allow the traditions of our country to die.

With these words I strongly support what has been said by the senior leaders of the party, Shri Mathur and Shri Thomas on the Address by the President.

[English]

PROF. K. VENKATAGIRI GOWDA (Bangalore South): Mr Chairman, Sir, I rise to speak on Rashtapatiji's Address to the Parliament on 21st February, 1994. The former President Shri Venkataraman told an audience in Bangalore that these Addresses a meaningless formality. I agree with him.

Even though we got Independence 47 years ago, it is unfortunate that we are imitating the Westminster model to guide our Parliamentary behaviour.

The speech delivered by the President is full of pious platitudes, vague generalisations, promises for the future which cannot be kept. The President has given a beautiful picture of India's economic, social and political scenario without realising that he is hiding many dark patches.

In the opening paragraph, the President has given a beautiful picture of the Indian economic scene. He claims that inflation rate has been brought down. I agree with him. He also claims that foreign exchange reserves are comfortable.

I agree with him. He also says that exports have spurted; he also says imports have declined and he also says that the rate of economic growth has picked up. But the examination of these claims shows that most of them are untenable. It is true, the inflation rate was 17 per cent in August 1991. But thanks to the competent management of the economy by Dr. Manmohan Singh, the inflation rate come down to 7 per cent last August. This is Manmohan Singh's miracle. That miracle is wearing thin with the passage of time. Now it has gone up to 8.5 per cent, with the possibility of its rising to the double digit zone.

Just two months ago, the price of sugar was raised, the price of LPG was raised, the prices of food articles like wheat and rice were raised. And last week, the railway fares and freight rates were also raised. They will have cascading effect on the rate of inflation. The Government says that the rise in prices of food articles was caused by the rise in procurement prices. I agree with them. When the prices of inputs rise, when

the rates of wages rise, the farmers demand higher procurement prices. They must be given; it cannot be denied that they have got inflationary effect. When the prices rise, then there will be a rise in their wages also. Rise in wages generates two kinds of inflation, that is, cost inflation and demand inflation. These two inflations get entwined and become in the course of time difficult to disentangle. They also reduce the competitiveness of India's exports; they also encourage India's imports, with the result, they will have adverse effect on India's trade balance.

The President says that exports have picked up. That is correct. But the point is that due to the delayed effect of successive devaluations, exports have picked up; at the same time, imports have also declined due to the fact that there is an industrial recession. The growth of industry has declined to 1.8 per cent or so, with the result their demand for imported goods, capital goods and raw materials has fallen. This is not a comfortable situation at all.

The President claims that foreign exchange reserves have risen to US \$13 billion. But 70 per cent of them are foreign funds, funds lent by IMF, World Bank and foreign investors. Only 30 per cent are made up of our export earnings and these foreign funds are recallable within 24 hours notice and they are hot money, they are speculative funds. When they leave the country, India's payments position will be in jeopardy.

It is true the growth rate has declined. The Eighth Five Year Plan said that the economy will grow at the rate of 5.5 per cent per year. But the rate of economic growth has never risen above 3.8 per cent. In contrast, the Chinese economic growth rate in 1993 was of the order of 13.4 per cent.

This is in grave contrast with the Chinese experience. What is this due to? This is due to several factors which I will elucidate later on. And this shortage of adequate foreign reserves deters the Finance Minister from undertaking capital account convertibility. And if he had done it, then the Indian economy would have been in great trouble. At the same time, the industrial sector is in great recession. The concessions given to industry by the previous Budget have not helped the industrial sector to recover from the sluggish rate of economic growth. Last year, in the Budget, the Finance Minister reduced excise duty in the hope that the manufacturers will pass on the benefit to the consumer in the form of lower prices and this will increase the demand for goods and that would revive the system, but this has not happened. The manufacturers have failed to pass on the excise duty to the consumers in the form of lower prices, as a result the demand for industrial goods has not risen. Therefore, industry has not recovered.

At the same time the Reserve Bank of India reduced the lending rate in the hope that industrial sector will borrow more and invest more. Even that has not happened, with the result the industrial sector is in grave recession. Therefore I must say that the claims advanced by the President are grossly untenable.

The Indian economy is plagued by two crises. One is inflation crisis and the other is balance of payment crisis. They are not new to India. They were the gift of Pundit Jawaharlal Nehru to India in 1956. In 1956 the Second Five Year Plan was launched and this inflation potential was built into it. When the Plan was half way through, it had to be pruned because India was not able to meet the challenges of inflation crisis and the balance of payment crisis. These crises are threatening even now.

[Prof. K. Venkatagiri Gowda]

In the month of January, Prime Minister Narasimha Rao paid a visit to Switzerland and in Davos he addressed the World Economic Forum. He addressed the audience consisting of prestigious industrialists, foreign investors, economists and citizens of the country. There he paid glowing tributes to Nehruvian and said India is following the Nehru's middle path. What is the middle path? Nehruvian model was a mixed economy model. There were two sectors, private sector and public sector. In the Nehruvian model, public sector was given the predominant place and the private sector was its poor relation. So this middle path as enunciated by the Indian Prime Minister Shri Narasimha Rao, is not the same as the Nehruvian middle path. The Nehruvian middle path leans towards public sector, but the Narasimha Rao's middle path is leaning towards the private sector. There is the talk of globalisation, liberalisation and there is privatisation. Therefore it is wrong to say that the two middle paths are the same. What I choose to call the Rao, Singh model is far different from Nehruvian model. It is hoped that the Narasimha Rao's model will make the economy grow fast.

The President claims success for the family planning programmes. The Government of India has been spending large sums of money every year; but the results on the family planning front are not very encouraging. The population of India at present is 88 crores. Before the end of this century it would reach the one billion mark. This population is taking away a lot of resources. The growing population has more children than producers. Children are consumers and not producers. Children consume, with the result saving rate will fall. The Harrod-Domer model economic growth says that the rate of growth depends on rate of

new investment. Investment depends upon savings and when more and more children are born, the savings of the family are taken away with feeding them, clothing them and educating them, with the result the saving margin is low. As a consequence there will be a fall in the investment margin also. This reduce the rate of economic growth. Therefore growth economists say that India is caught in the low level equilibrium growth trap. Therefore the family planning scheme should be made more effective and the rate of population growth should be reduced to just one per cent. The Government should encourage the one child family norm, so that greater population growth falls and family planning programmes should be enforced on people of all religion, irrespective of their caste, community, race or religion. Only then India will be able to control the population growth.

Indian Education system is in a crisis. Universities are in a doldrums, financially and academically. Teachers are not teaching at all. They teach on the basis of the bazaar notes which they borrowed or purchased from the market; and the students follow suit. The doctoral research is in a doldrums. It is said that Ph.D. thesis are undetected plagiarism. In many universities, Ph.D.s are produced on a very large scale with the result, they are employed as middle school teachers. Therefore, unless the system of education in the universities improves, the country will have no future at all.

There are several Institutes of Technology; and the Government spends Rs. 135 crores on maintaining them. These Institutes of Technology spend nearly Rs. 7 lakhs on training one student; 70 per cent of them go abroad in search of better opportunities of employment and higher salary. Therefore, the Government should pursue a

policy of reverse brain drain so that the skills which were acquired in India remain here and then they promote economic growth.

Indian Agriculture is the backbone of Indian economy; but agriculture is backward. The President speaks of comfortable food production. India is producing 180 million tonnes of foodgrains. But, that is not enough to feed the population at nutritional standards. India requires at least 235 million tonnes to feed the population at adequate nutritional standards. This must be improved. But the point is that the Government of India wants to reduce the subsidy on fertilizer. When the fertiliser subsidies are reduced, the fertiliser prices rise with the result they become costly. The experience shows that the fertiliser prices cause a fall in the demand for input of fertiliser with the result the food output and other outputs fall. When the food output falls, food prices rise and the Government is not able to pay subsidy. Subsidies enlarge the fiscal deficits and they are inflationary. If subsidies are removed, then, food prices rise; even then, the Government has got to pay subsidies. Government is now in a dilemma between giving subsidies and maintaining the fiscal deficit at a lower level.

India is badly in need of electoral reforms to make our democratic base very strong. Shri T. N. Seshan is the right man to introduce the electoral reforms. A Member of Parliament had called him an unrestrained bull'. For India, those bulls are necessary and not timid cows and timid calves.

India is on the road to economic reforms. India wants to stabilise the economy. Indian tiger was, for a very long time, chained. The time has now come to unchain it so that it may go forward, dash forward with courage and confidence. I am sure, the Rao-Singh model which is the basis for Indian

economic reforms will make India grow, free from the constraints of inflation and balance of payments crises.

Lastly, I thank the President formally for his Address to the Parliament. At the same time, I must also thank the Chief Whip of the BJP for making me wait for more than four days and today also to wait till late in the evening, to be called upon to make a speech. I request him not to irritate me any more.

[Translation]

SHRI MOHAN SINGH (Deoria): Mr. Chairman, Sir, almost all our friends have put forth their views. I only want to say something against the motion of Thanks.

The present Cabinet of our country lacks perception and it is not concerned about the progress and to chalk out a brighter future for the country because in reality it is not a Cabinet of Ministers but a gossip club of retired politicians.

[English]

This is a gossip club of retired politicians.

[Translation]

The average age of a minister is 66 years. Every minister of the present cabinet must have been young student of 17-18 years at the time of the final leg of our freedom struggle in 1942. And the youth of this age were participating in the freedom struggle at that time but the fact that a member of the present cabinet did not participate in the struggle creates a doubt. It would, therefore, be useless to expect that they would be committed for safeguarding the national issues and values. Only one member Shri Ram Lakhan Babu who is new

[Sh. Mohan Singh]

to the cabinet was jailed and the manner in which Shri Ram Lakhan Babu found a berth in the cabinet shows that even the active participants of the freedom struggle of 1942 must have hung their heads in shame at his activities. It is useless to expect that such party and such cabinet will safeguard our national values.

Today's congress party is not the congress of Jawahar Lalji who had initiated the policy of mixed economy in the country and had said that it would lead to competition between public sector and private sector and eventually the public sector would be preferred. Today the congress party has rejected that policy. Later, Indiraji effected nationalisation of Banks and did away with privy-purses of Maharajas. Though we could have had a difference of opinion with her, yet we supported her over some values. But the present congress party is all for the privatisation of banks and the foreign banks are being openly invited to participate in the country. The only achievements of the third Prime Minister of the Congress Party, Shri Rajiv Gandhi, was passing of Anti-Defection Bill. It was approved by the Parliament on 30th January, 1985 and it was termed as a true homage to the memory of Gandhiji. Later when the present Prime Minister was delivering his first speech he had assured that his Government would follow Shri Rajiv Gandhi's principles. But I would like to say that this Government is neither following Shri Rajiv Gandhi's principles, nor those of Shrimati Indira Gandhi nor Shri Nehru's principles but it is following the policies of late Rajgopalachari and his Independent party and it is acting as an Independent party. The concept of Independent party has again gained ground under the leadership of Shri Narasimha Rao. This party in fact has been ruling since 1991 and that

too without any mandate.

The president maintains that the question of Ayodhya has been solved in this country but is it correct? The collector and the police Inspector of Ayodhya who were to be punished by the Central Government are yet to be chargesheeted either by the CBI or the Central Government and in fact, he has been reinstated after revoking his suspension. Are you taking the responsibility of solving this problem in this way? And not to talk of suspension, the U.P Director-General of police who was responsible for this incident has instead been promoted.

The Director-General of police U.P who was responsible for the destruction of Babri Masjid has been appointed as the Director-General of central security forces under the Government of India. And the President assures us that it is his responsibility and the Ayodhya problem will be solved and the steps to this effect have been taken. What steps have been taken? Some people are providing to be above constitution in this country. Maratha University was rechristened as Dr. Bheemrao Ambedkar University. An agitation was launched against it but the Central Government did not take any action against the person who started the agitation, encouraged and provoked the sentiments of the people and openly supported it. Today the reporters are being beaten there and the atmosphere is being communalised but your Government do not have guts to take action against that person. This is a group of retired old people and they lack capability. Government is run by certain rules and regulations. These rules are both strict as well as soft. For peace loving people of the country, these rules are soft whereas these are harsh to those who are out to subvert the unity of the country. In his Address, the President has said that the law and order situation in the north east has

improved. It has been reported in the newspapers and this issue was also raised in Parliament twice that the boy of the family of senior freedom fighter Bardolai Ji, who had led the national movement in Assam, has been released after 380 days of his captivity by terrorists on their own and not by the efforts of the Government. Although he was a senior officer in a big industrial institution, yet the Government could not do anything in getting him released. The Ex-MLA of Bihar is not traceable. We do not know as to where has he gone and when will he turn up? His wife has been wandering in search of him from pillar to post and requesting for his release but none has come for her help. I do not want to kill your precious time. But I do assert that the President's Address is directionless. Therefore, I oppose it because the Government is incompetent.

[English]

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA (Guwahati) Mr Chairman, Sir, I rise to support the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address to the Joint Session of Parliament moved by honourable Shri Shiv Charan Mathur and seconded by Prof. Thomas.

Sir, the Address of the President is universally accepted as a statement of Government. It is an elucidation of the plans and programmes of the Government.

Sir, is there a problem of Quorum?

MR CHAIRMAN You have to speak now and you yourself are raising the quorum issue.

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA No, Sir, I am not raising the quorum issue. I only want to know if there is any problem.

MR CHAIRMAN There is no problem.

You may continue with your speech. If you are not in a mood to speak, you may as well sit down and I will call another member.

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA. I abide by your direction Sir. But I do want to speak and I am already on my legs.

MR CHAIRMAN Then, please go ahead. Don't waste the time of the House.

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA The Presidential Address is a performance paper of the Government and an elucidation of the plans and programmes of the Government for the current year. As everyone has pointed out, this year the Address of the President is different in many respects from the previous Addresses both in tone and content. The tone is undoubtedly optimistic and the Address is very detailed. In fact, right from the beginning, the Address itself points out that the country today is in a frame of mind different from the one it was in, this time last year. The Presidential Address also points out that the country has shown a steady progress on all fronts and that there is an emerging feeling of optimism, cautious optimism' as is rightly stated.

The Presidential Address has also enumerated in detail the various achievements of the two and a half years of our Government led by our elderly statesman Shri P. V. Narasimha Rao. On all fronts, there is improvement. On law and order, there is perceptible improvement. The non-issue called Ayodhya has been totally relegated to the background, as it should be. The Human Rights Commission has been established and most of us have already pointed out that this is a major step in justifying the Government's stand in international fora and as well as in taking care of the people within the country. The disastrous aftermaths of the unprecedented earthquake in Maharashtra

[Sh. Kirip Chaliha]

have been well responded to. A number of extremely important welfare measures have been announced by the Government which are in the process of implementation. The Literacy Campaigns have been intensified. In the field of Space, Science and Technology, the country's progress has been universally acclaimed by one and all. And even in foreign policy affairs, as the President's Address rightly points out, India has once again become the leading voice of sanity and peace amongst the comity of nations. It is equally true that the Address of the President has very rightly reflected the success story of the two and a half years old Government of our great leader Prime Minister Narasimha Rao Ji. And I thank the President for this correct appraisal. In fact, I would say that the president has been rather restrained in his Address and although the Address is in great detail, there is no hyperbole involved in this Address and it is indeed a very correct appraisal. Unfortunately, a man is always influenced by the company he keeps. And we have been amidst the company of so many cynics for the last two and a half years. This infectious disease of cynicism of many of the Opposition members who are totally sceptical-if I may say so, scepticism has become a basic characteristic of their life-has started afflicting us also.

That is why I thought it pertinent to say, why point out the obvious improvements taking place on all fronts and why not go in to the details and try to understand the psychology of these opposition leaders, many of whom are my great idols.

I come from a very small town of Assam. Even today, I hold leaders like Advaniji, Vejpeyeeji, Jaswant Singhji, Mdrajit Gupta,ji,

Nitish kumarji, Uma Bharatji, and Dipikaji, in great reverence and veneration. And, that is why I value their opinion. Therefore, before coming to the conclusion about the basic truth involved in the President's Address and before arriving at the correct appraisal. I thought of recollecting what the opposition leaders have been saying about the present Government ever since its inception. I have certain revelations to make. I would just like to point out one or two predictions of the leading opposition leaders which have not come true till today.

The Prime Minister himself said very strongly and I quote:

" I do not really attach any great importance to the numbers. Whatever number I am short of or the number I am at, these numbers are not really material."

The Prime Minister made it very clear that he was not at all concerned with this game of numbers in the Parliament. But, Opposition leaders have been, right from the beginning, harping on one aspect that this Government is a minority government. You can always see the omnipotent condescension of Shri Somnath Chatterjee. On July 16 he said and I quote:

" We could have got this Government dismissed yesterday. We did not do it. We should not be taken for granted."

Then, in July 1991, Shri Jaswant Singh talked about the arithmetic of numbers in his Oxfordian accent. He said very clearly and very lucidly and I quote:

"The arithmetic of numbers is against the Council of Ministers. That is the central reality."

Vajpayeeji, though he is a statesman, at times, stoops to the level of impeaching. He said very sarcastically:

"This Government is passing the days just like digging the well everyday for drinking water. There should be some permanent solution."

Almost all the opposition leaders have been harping on the minority character of our Government. They have always been telling us to do something to bring stability. Sir, our country has progressed on all fronts because of the dynamic leadership of our Prime Minister. And still many of the big opposition leaders could not come to Parliament because they could win elections. On the other hand, many leaders—who are leaders by their own right—decided to come over to this side, because they felt that there was a need for political realignment. This was when the virus of communalism and cynicism was trying to devour the entire political system.

When we were in a minority Government, opposition ridiculed us and criticised us. Today we are in majority, still the opposition is complaining. I am sure the opposition is not a nagging wife who wants to nag at everything—if you dress well, why you have dressed well; and if you have not dressed well, why you have not dressed well. I do not know what they want.

When gold was being mortgaged, Vajpayeeji said and I quote:

"Gold has been sent abroad and, in such a manner as if it is being smuggled out. It was taken out stealthily".

He has an inimitable style of giving emphasis to gestures. He was speaking as if the whole Government was a thief. Many of the opposition leaders at that time shouted that this Government consists of thieves and looters and it wants to sell gold abroad.

They consider themselves as the biggest exponents of national intergration, patriotism and what not. They think that they have the monopoly on all these things. You must remember what Mr. Vajpayee had said on 18th July. On the 18th July itself, Sir, the Finance Minister said that:

"This gold which had been sent from our country because of certain exigencies of the situation will be brought back."

It was brought back. Did any of the senior leaders or even junior Leaders of the opposition ever praised the Government for this? Did they eat their words? Anyway, today who is having the last laugh after two-and-a-half years?

Sir, I will come back to the topic which is again going to be discussed. We have had a discussion on Dunkel. We are going to have a discussion on GATT. It was said that the Congress Government had become an agent of IMF and the World Bank. It was said that whatever we are doing, we are doing because of the diktats of IMF. We are tired of hearing that. In fact, I quote what Mr. Somnath Chatterjee had said on March 4, 1992:

"The Government will go down in the history as the one which had mortgaged our country to the imperialist financial marauders for some tainted juice. Our economic sovereignty and national prestige

[Sh. Kirip Chaliha]

have become negotiable and we are projected to the whole world as cringing supplicants of imperialists and capitalists. He called our Government as one which is in bondage, a Government held a leash led by the nose by the combine of Mr. Bush, Mr. Camadassus and Mr. Preston."

Sir, this is the kind of attitude which we are seeing from the responsible opposition. After all, the opposition is the foil through which the character of the ruling party shines. The opposition is the most fundamental instrument through which success or failure of Government is determined. I will even go and accept the maximum viz. give me a good opposition, I will give you the best of Government.

I am sorry to say one thing. During my childhood or student days, I used to have my own idols. Sir, today, from heroes, they are becoming zeroes. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Chaliha, the House is scheduled to sit till 8 'o' clock. Only three minutes are left. You conclude now.

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA: Sir, if you do not be a little sympathetic to the people like us who come from far off places, then who will sympathise with us?

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have already given you fifteen minutes.

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA: No. Sir. I am just starting.

Sir, the Prime Minister had talked of a

vision to fulfil the promises. That we have to keep in mind. He had called for a unified effort to translate this vision into action. He had asked for pursuance of the policy of continuity with change. He had also asked for social justice with social harmony. Do you know what is the national agenda of the biggest opposition party that we have today? Sir, the problem of poverty is not at the top priority item of their political agenda. The problem of hunger is not at the top priority item of their political agenda. The problem of unemployment is not at the top priority item of their political agenda. Their one and the only issue is to demolish the mosque and build a mandir there.

[*Translation*]

With the demolishing of the Mosque, they have achieved their goal.

PROF. RASA SINGH RAWAT (Ajmer): Who has entered into an agreement with Muslim League in Kerala today? (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA: If that happens then everything will be all right in this world. So, this party had demolished the Mosque. Sir, I do not want to take more time on this poisonous serpent called the BJP. This communal virus which is not only endangering the communal harmony within this country but is also endangering the territorial sovereignty of this country. (*Interruptions*)

I do not want to speak anything more about BJP.

Now, I will come to Janata Dal. Sir, Janata Dal is the second biggest opposition party. I must tell you that they are the best

fighters in this country. Unfortunately, they do not fight poverty. They do not fight the basic problems facing the country. But, they always fight amongst themselves. This Janata Dal or the Janata party still remains as a Party although without *Janata* behind them and in the process Mr. Morarji Desai fought with Mr. Jagjivan Ram. Mr. Jagjivan Ram fought with Mr. Charan Singh Mr. Chandra Shekhar was waiting and watching from outside angrily, fretting and fuming.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Bhogendra Jha, please don't disturb.

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA: In the second round, again Mr. V.P. Singh and Mr. Devi Lal combined together and started fighting with Shri Chandra Shekhar Ji; and like this, this man fought that man. And again Mr. Chandra Shekhar is sitting alone fretting and fuming and scolding every one.

Historical events occur twice. First as a tragedy; second time as a force. What do you speak about the third unity at the time of Janata Dal? Again Shri Chandra Shekhar fought Shri V.P. Singh, Shri Biju Patnaik fought with Shri Srikanta Jena and Shri Nitish Kumar fought with Shri Laloo Prasad Yadav. This man fought with that man. They were fighting among themselves and fighting with nobody else. And for that, if somebody comes to our side to strengthen ourselves, to strengthen our party so that the party and all the leaders can do something substantial for the country, why do you blame us?

20.00 hrs.

When this country was in the worst of darkness, when this country was in a state of utter chaos and turmoil, Mr. P.V. Narasimha Rao came on the Indian political scene like a sun and has taken the country out of this turmoil and is now shining in the whole of India.

[Translation]

MR. CHAIRMAN: Today, the House is scheduled to sit upto 8 'o' clock. Would you like to continue your speech or intend anything else?

SHRI KIRIP CHALIHA: You must give me some time to speak.

DR. LAXMINARAYAN PANDEYA (Mandsaur): Mr. Chairman, Sir, if you want to continue the House after 8 'o' clock then our Members should also be given an opportunity to speak. Our Member should be given chance to speak if time is extended to accomodate them.

[English]

MR CHAIRMAN: You can continue the next day. The House stands adjourned to meet tomorrow at 11 A.M.

20.01 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Friday, March 4, 1994/ Phalgun 13, 1915 (Saka)