

1202 hrs.

**Re. Revised Action Taken Report on Securities Scam**  
[English]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): Sir, I have given notice for adjournment.

SHRI BUTA SINGH (Jalore): Sir, I hope you will take notice of what we have written to you.....(interruptions).....  
[Translation]

SHRI VILAS MUTTEMWAR (Chimur): More important than it, is the issue of the massacre of the Adivasis in my Constituency. Many Adivasis have been killed there.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Today is the first day of our Session. We shall have time to discuss all important issues. We propose to discuss them one after the other and if they are not discussed one after the other and discussed together then nothing would be heard. So, let us pick and choose.

... (Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Midnapore): This is not an item for discussion. We are not pressing for any discussion.

MR. SPEAKER: We will take it up. If you are really interested in making your points and getting some response from the Government, the procedure would be that one of you would stand up and make those points after I give you the floor and not before I give you the floor. And then I would request, in appropriate cases that the Government should respond. Otherwise, you know, we all will be talking together.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Sir, you will remember, a major part of the last Session was taken up by a form of protest, in the form of boycott of the proceedings of the House by all the opposition parties. The issue being that the so-called Action Taken Report on the Joint Parliamentary Committee's report which had been produced by the Government was totally unacceptable and every Member here in the opposition felt that that was no Action Taken Report. There was neither any action nor any response to carry out—I may remind you, Sir—the unanimous recommendations of the JPC. For the first time a unanimous Report of the JPC, consisting of Members of both the Houses and of all the parties, had been placed before the country and the Government was expected to respect it, accept it and implement it otherwise such a Report has no meaning at all in the Parliamentary system.

Even when that boycott was proceeding, thanks to your intervention and your efforts to bring about some solution, a compromised formula was devised largely at your initiative and that was accepted by both the Government and the Opposition. That formula was that the points to which the Opposition is taking objection in the ATR, the points which they are not prepared to accept and the points which are only partly accepted by the Government but have not been fully implemented, the Government should prepare a revised Report on those points and that revised Report should be produced before the House. On that basis there were assurances given by the Government at that time that they would withdraw that

report, reconsider it and revise it in the light of what the Opposition Members had been saying and then bring a revised Report before the House. Only then we would be in a position to consider it. That was the position. Normal functioning in the House was made possible only after that.

Naturally, so much time has elapsed since then. We were all expecting that on the first day of this Session the Government would inform us that they have brought that modified Report and that they are laying it on the Table of the House and making it available to all the Members so that we can see whether it is acceptable to us or not or whether there has been any improvement in it or not. And, there has to be a full-scale discussion on that. But, we do not find in the Agenda or in the List of Business any such item which pertains to this ATR which had been promised by the Government. Therefore, we consider that it is difficult to take up any other business until that is cleared out of the way. We must know what is the position. It is as though the Session has to be resumed from the point where it ended last time. It ended on the note that the Government was going to withdraw that Report and revise it.

In between there were series of meetings with the Finance Minister and the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs. They wanted to consult, separately not together, representatives of different parties to get a clearer idea as to what exactly we want or what is it that we are objecting to or what all is acceptable to us and what is not acceptable. Those meetings took place. I do not know whether all the parties participated in them or not but our Party participated in those meetings. We had a lengthy, discussion with the two Ministers. After all that exercise has been gone through the least we can expect now is that a revised report should be brought before the House immediately without any further delay.

This is going to be a very short Session. We have only 12 or 13 working days and we do not want the Government to delay it by one means or the other and to see that no opportunity is given to the Members to study this revised Report and discuss it in this Session. So, the essence of the matter is that we want that the Report should be brought before the House without further delay. The Minister is here in the House. He can explain what the Government is doing about it, when we can get it and when we are in a position to discuss it. Without that clear assurance from the Government we are not in a position to apply our mind to any other item of business.

Our friends from BJP have raised a very important matter. We are all exercised over this question of Utrakhand or what has happened in Muzaffarnagar to the peaceful demonstrators who were coming to Delhi. It is not that only one party is exercised over that. The whole country is exercised over that. But,

even then I would say that this question of a revised ATR is a matter left over from the last Session. So, it should not be dropped in the middle and other items should not be brought in only to interrupt or interfere in it.

First of all, I would request you to kindly direct the Government to bring that revised Report before the House and lay it on the Table of the House so that we have enough time to discuss it.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): Mr. Speaker, Sir, this is just to remind ourselves that your observations which ended the dispute for the time being were made on the 17th of August during the last Session and thereafter more than three and a half months have elapsed. You had been kind enough to make it very clear that the modified report shall be submitted as early as possible. Sir, more than ample time has gone by. In a matter like this the fact that even after three and a half months the Government do not come in with their report on the first day of this Session shows that their intentions are not conducive to proper functioning of this House.

Sir, apart from that what is disquieting is the trend of discussions that had taken place. The trend of discussions of the hon. Ministers with different party leaders and party functionaries shows that the Government have not really had an open mind when the discussions have taken place. Your efforts and your intervention, which have been referred to by Mr. Gupta and which we are very happy to reiterate, helped easing the situation at that time and we came back to the House. Those efforts have not at all been responded to by the Government. The wishes of the hon. Speaker and the efforts made by the Hon. Speaker seemed not to be taken note of by the Government in proper perspective, otherwise there cannot be any reason why the Government will not respond to any issue of corruption in the country. Be it the issue of ATR, be it the issue of sugar scam or be it the issue of Bofors, everything is remaining hanging.

Therefore, Sir, we are very much exercised on this and I join Mr. Gupta in demanding that the Government must immediately come with this report, and should make their position very clear. I am afraid the Government ought to have decided by this time. If it is not decided even by today what would be the nature of objections that we have raised. Then it would mean that the Government is only trying to delay the matter so that they can exhaust the 13 days duration of this Session. This will only create a very bad precedent when the intervention of the Chair is not being taken note of.

If the Government sits idle and does come with its report today itself, Sir, as it has already been said, we feel very much exercised, and it will not help in carrying out the proceedings of the House in a proper manner. The very conduct of this Government shows that it is a recalcitrant Government, to say the least. Therefore, Sir I request you earnestly to put some sense into their heads and kindly give a direction to them that they should come with the Report today itself.

[Translation]

SHRI SHARAD YADAV (Madhepura): Mr. Speaker Sir, I agree with Somnathji and Indrajit Babu, who have just now rightly observed that the deadlock on the issue of A.T.R. is as it was earlier and still doubts persist about it. The credibility of the Government on this issue has become cloudy, so much so that it is beyond our imagination. Our credibility is also in the crisis. A solution to this problem was found by holding several meetings with you, by somuch of persuasions and hard labour and by narrowing down all sort of differences but even after three months nothing has been done. On the final day of the last session also, we had submitted to you that such a big scam had never taken place in our country. The Government should have solved it by itself since it was aware of this big deadlock. The crisis of loss of faith has further aggravated because even after holding all parties meeting the Government has not at all changed its stand on it. As far as the stand of the Government and our own stand on this issue is concerned, *status quo* persists. This is a very short session and we want to raise all the issues whether it is the Nagpur issue, Utrakhand issue, issue of Implementation Report on Mandal Commission's recommendations and the issue of atrocities on women. But before all these—, there is a big issue before the nation and no solution to it has been found till date. My submission is that the unanimous report of the House, the J.P.C. should not be treated in such a way and the deadlock should not be allowed to continue, all the business of the House should be transacted and the House should run smoothly for 13 days. We want to discuss all the issues. The Five Year Plan and the Agricultural Policy are to be discussed. I appeal to the Government and specially to the hon. Minister of Parliamentary Affairs who always starts with a 'No' and speaks like a machine-- that he should speak like a man to run all these things smoothly. If he does not speak like a human being even on such a major issue then when will he be a man. You keep sitting like a robot. At least run the House in a smooth manner. The House has not been run smoothly by you throughout. At least do it this time. He is smiling but there should be some meaning of it.

We are afraid of the discussion you have done. We feel that they are maintaining the deadlock on this issue. Do not make the issue so much complicated that the whole House may get entangled into. Therefore, say something on it today itself. They say that they have accepted each and every thing but they are not ready to accept the four major observation made in this report. Our submission to you is that if those four things are accepted, a message will go to the country, their image will become more clear and the crisis of distrust will also be resolved.

Therefore, I would like to urge upon the Government through you that a *suo-moto* statement should have been made by the Government on it but it is not doing so. Lest your efforts should go waste, the Government should make its stand clear on it and it should also make the format of the revised report clear. A trailer of the revised report will have to be shown today otherwise it will be difficult to run this House smoothly since it affects our integrity also. Therefore, I agree with both the comrades and submit that it should be done today itself.

[English]

SHRI JASWANT SINGH (CHITTORGARH): Sir, I join my voice with that of my Party to the concern expressed by my other colleagues in the Opposition on the question of the action that the Government proposes to take on the unanimous Report of the Joint Parliamentary Committee; as so far they have not taken any action.

Sir, I find it necessary to remind this august Assembly that the largest banking and securities scandal that this country has known is now almost three years old. Of those three years, for long 18 months, a Committee of this Parliament deliberated over the issue and then gave an unanimous Report.

In response to that unanimous report, an Action Taken document was presented to the House with which the House was most aggrieved. Sir, I received a kind invitation from the Union Finance Minister, I did not receive an invitation because of some postal mishap which the Parliamentary Affairs Minister says was sent to every one. But the Union Finance Minister did have the courtesy to invite me. Even then it was my view, which has been strengthened by the experience of my colleagues who went through the futile exercise of going through consultations on an issue on which the Government's mind is totally closed and it was because we were convinced that the Government's mind is totally closed that the revision of this unsatisfactory, wholly unsatisfactory, Action Taken Report cannot be interpreted as a joint exercise between the Government and the Opposition and

that the responsibility of coming forward with a satisfactory, revised Action Taken Report is solely that of the Government, we did not participate in the so-called discussions.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: There is no question of joint exercise.

SHRI JASWANT SINGH: Exactly. In any case the experience of my colleagues, including Shri Indrajit Gupta, who went through this exercise has only strengthened our apprehensions. Even now what I am saying is that, let the Government come forward and give its response to what we are seeking. What we are seeking is that probity in public life, accountability of the executive to the Legislature be established.

I am not going into the details of what the Joint Parliamentary Committee wants or does not want. But this process of consultation was an empty, proforma exercise engaged in by the Government. Three years after the incident we have a situation wherein not a single principal accused, not one single principal accused, has yet been punished. Not one person other than being transferred or posted or sent on leave or sent home has been found as punishable by being arrested. Three years after the incident, the Government continues to maintain this position. Then we say to establish probity in public life and to establish accountability of the executive to the Legislature, the Government must give it positive response, firstly about the response that it has in mind in the revised report and secondly, when it is going to come forward with the revised report.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (DUMDUM): Sir, I have tabled an Adjournment Motion on this issue.

MR. SPEAKER: I disallowed that.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: May I know why? (Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: when this matter comes up for discussion everyone will be given an opportunity.

SHRI P.G. NARAYANAN (GOBICHETTIPALAYAM): Sir, the Government should have presented the revised Action Taken Report by this time as promised.

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not repeat what has already been expressed by the Hon. Members. Do you also endorse that the report should be tabled as soon as possible?

SHRI P.G. NARAYANAN: Yes, Sir.

[Translation]

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV (Azamgarh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, that report should have been laid today. I would not like to talk about that only and....

**MR. SPEAKER:** Do not want to talk about that?

**SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV:** I do not want to go even into its details. You know that the problem had cropped up in this House on this issue and this House could not run for 12 days. It was continuously boycotted and you put your best efforts to resolve the crisis. On account of your continuous efforts the situation became normal and the House again started from functioning properly. It was sure that the Government would present the revised report here on such a major issue which involves several thousand crores of rupees, and is concerned with the lives of the crores of the people of the country. Such a big scam has taken place for the first time, it has shattered the whole set up and people have lost their faith in the banking system. When the issue of corruption comes up, the Government tries to patch it up. What has happened in the Bofors case? How the faith of the people can be restored? The hon. Prime Minister had himself taken the responsibility of enquiring into the Bofors case, he had also assured to monitor it himself and to make a timely submission of the report accused that scandal—which has not only rocked the whole country but has also damaged our reputation in the world—has not been punished till date. None of them was served the charge-sheet and none of them was prosecuted. The Government has complicated the case out of proportion so that the culprits may not be trapped.

The question is that the Government is being challenged. The Government does not enquire into some particular cases deliberately. Those questions always remain unsolved.

Secondly, there is the issue of sugar. It is also connected with the life of the common man. It involves crores of rupees of the country. It is an issue of corruption.

[English]

**MR. SPEAKER:** We will have time for discussing other issues also.

[Translation]

**SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV:** Mr. Speaker, Sir, I am raising one or two basic questions. The Government tries to cover up each and every issue of corruption and it does not want to do anything more than this. I would like to appreciate your efforts. When the whole of the opposition was unanimously asking for withdrawal of this report, you made efforts to settle down the issue. The Government should have taken it seriously. The hon. Members, belonging to BJP did not take part in the discussion but we did. How this issue can be solved, we gave our opinion on it also. I had expected that the Government would present the report itself on the very first day since it had already created an uproar in the House. Now what is the compulsion on the Government? When will it present the report, what steps will be taken and who will be punished? It is keeping mum on all these things. It will further

aggravate the grimness of the situation. If the Government assures us today then we will not have to raise this issue. If our questions are not replied then the House will not run smoothly and problems will crop up. Therefore, my submission is that since you have intervened in it and found a way out so you should direct the Government in this regard. The Government should inform us, when it is going to present the report in the House?

[English]

**THE MINISTER OF WATER RESOURCES AND MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA):** We had very useful discussion in your Chamber yesterday on all those points that hon. Members have been pleased to raise here. We had explained at length the stand of the Government. I would like to repeat it here because all Members of the House were not present in those discussions. During the discussion, we had made it clear on behalf of the Government that Government is not at all interested in shielding any guilty person nor are we trying to put any *parda* over any action of anybody.

The action taken has been reported and if there was any point, according to the agreement that was worked out with your good offices, on which there is no agreement or partial agreement or any new objections are raised, we could discuss it first and after that prepare a supplementary ATR. ....(Interruptions)

**SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura):** When? This is not a fact, Sir. ....(Interruptions)

**SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA:** On those very points. ....(Interruptions)

**SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA:** What about the formula which you had suggested?

**SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOUDHARY (Katwa):** You are not to place a Supplementary Report but a revised one. ....(Interruptions)

**SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA:** You may call it a Supplementary Report. ....(Interruptions)

**SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA:** It is not the question of revising the report in the light of our stand. ....(Interruptions)

**SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA:** We are not going to corner you over words. I will recall precisely what Shri Indrajit Gupta should remember. Our agreement was only on such points on which objections are raised, a revised report will be presented. Only on those points and not the whole report ... (Interruptions) Only on such points on which objections are raised....(Interruptions) Only on such points a revised report is being prepared and I am glad to inform the House that we have made a good deal of progress in our action that has been taken against the guilty persons the persons who have been identified ....(Interruptions) I should be allowed to make my submission. If I am not allowed to make my submission then our friends like Shri Sharad Yadav keep on saying that there is no response from the 'robot'.

On the points that the hon. Members raised during discussion, all those points were examined and action has

been taken on many of those points and when  
...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: What action have you taken?

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Acharia, why do not you keep quiet? It is not correct.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: He is misleading the House.

MR. SPEAKER: You hear him first.

...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: No, this is not all right.

...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: You can respond in a proper manner, not like this.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: After discussion on those points, which the hon. Members have been pleased to raise either in writing or in discussion with the Finance Minister or myself, we have gone through the entire matter carefully and we have prepared a report which is under preparation for presentation to this hon. House and to the other House. It will be presented in good time. ...*(Interruptions)* during this Session. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI CHANDRA JEET YADAV (Azamgarh): Please tell the date. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: Why do not you exercise some patience? Nobody is running away from it...*(Interruptions)* I want to indicate *(Interruptions)* I cannot speak like this. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: You had more than three months' time. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dum Dum): I have given a motion for adjournment. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, we have given a motion for adjournment, please allow us to speak. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I have disallowed all the adjournment motions

...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is going on record, unless I take the names. Let the Minister complete his statement.

...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: You hear the Minister completely, then you can speak, if you want. Yes, Mr. Minister. ...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: I was interrupted. I have to make my submission. ...*(Interruptions)*

I do not want to join issues unnecessarily. All kinds of allegations are being unnecessarily made on us. I do not want today to provoke the Members by replying to all those unnecessary, unwarranted and unfair allegations that are being hurled on us in this House.

We are going to present the Report here. In consultation with you, Sir, we will fix the date and present the Report. Yesterday in the meeting I had assured all the leaders of the parties who were present in the meeting that there would be enough time for the discussion on the

Report, that will be given to the House and there would be no paucity of time. I had also specifically said that the Report is not going to be presented in this House on the last day of this Session and it will be presented well before that, much before that, so that everybody will have time to study it and to discuss it in this House, if necessary in both the Houses. Therefore, Sir, all these unnecessary and totally unwarranted allegations that we want to hide something or want to protect somebody, that are made here, are wrong...*(Interruptions)* Your allegation that we want to hide something is wrong. We do not want to hide anything. If you make the allegation that we want to protect the guilty persons, that is also wrong and I refute it. We do not want to protect any guilty person. All such allegations, that are made, are absolutely wrong. We will give the Report here in time and that Report will come in time for the Members to study and to discuss that. That Report will be the final Report on the Action Taken.

I will again repeat that we have most respectfully dealt with the JPC's recommendations and the response of the Government has not only been open but it has also been a very purposeful and a very useful response.

I want to thank the JPC again for giving a good Report on which the Government has been able to take proper action. Only after the hon. Members see what action has been taken, they will be able to know and they should not presume that the Report, which is going to come, is not going to be satisfactory.

Our friends sitting in the Opposition benches here seem to assume that nothing is going to come in the Report. How can they assume that without looking at the Report? Therefore, I will again request them to have a little patience and the document that they are going to get will be a useful document, will satisfy many of the queries that were raised during our discussions. And many of the queries and many of the points that were raised during our discussions and interaction after the last Session ended have been incorporated. In the meantime, we have also received certain reports from the CBI and on those reports also, some action has been initiated. All these things will be contained in the Action Taken Report. I do not want to present a Report here which will not be complete in all respects. We want to give a complete Report here so that this matter can be taken as final. It should not be taken further after that Report is taken up and discussed in this House. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Buta Singh.

SHRI BUTA SINGH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, on the 30th of November, the whole country was shocked. ...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: If we open the discussion, it will continue. If you please do not mind, we need not continue this discussion. There are other issues also. So, I request you not to continue this discussion...*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI ATAL BIHARI VAJPAYEE (Lucknow): I would like to know your reactions to the discussion on the Action

Taken Report. It must be noted that you had mediated between both the sides and evolved the formula that

[(English)]

as early as possible modified

[Translation]

report would be presented ....(Interruptions). The report should have been presented on the very first day. Now you should intervene in this matter.

[English]

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE Dumdum): You should listen to us. The Minister should know as to why we are not satisfied.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: You should allow us to make our submissions.

[Translation]

SHRI LAL K. ADVANI (Gandhi Nagar): Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Minister has a genuine grievance that he is not being heard. But he is also supposed to take notice of interruptions and resentment being expressed here which is also genuine. We had a pretty long sequence of parleys in order to resolve this statement and the Government proposed to the opposition to treat it as an interim report and assured that the final report will be presented later on. The another proposal of the Government was that the report should be considered as the first part and its supplementary report will be presented thereafter. You must remember that the entire opposition felt discontented with this approach and that is why the stalemate was not being resolved. We said that we did not treat it as an Action Taken Report.

(English)

It betrays and shows the closed mind. Therefore, we do not want to discuss this Report.

(Translation)

The Government told that time also that the discussion should be held and a Supplementary Report would be presented on the basis of the outcome thereof. You must remember that nobody was ready to accept it and ultimately your formula was approved. The crucial words were 'revised report.' Had the words 'revised report' not been there, and 'supplementary report' would have been proposed by the Government, the stalemate would not have been resolved.

Secondly, the words 'as soon as may be' were used at every stage, even during the discussion. These words 'as soon as may be' give ample scope to the Government to keep the fulfilment of its commitment pending and sit inert. In the course of an informal discussion somebody had proposed.

(English)

Why not it be by the end of this Session?

(Translation)

He suggested so because after 17th August some days were still left. Again it sounded impractical as the words 'as soon as' had ample scope.

(English)

Now here in the House, he says 'as early as possible' and here the House is sitting after three and a half months and that day, the Minister comes forth and says that the Report is prepared and is under preparation and on a day at any good time, the Report will be presented to the House. The statement made by the Minister naturally causes anguish and resentment in the Opposition ranks which went to the extent of feeling so strongly about the issue that the Parliament could not function for 13 days.

(Translation)

It could have worked without your intervention. The Government had adopted a totally different attitude. But we already had a conviction that the Government is closed minded and therefore did not want to do anything at all. Nominal 2 or 3 points will be added and nothing more will be done in this regard. It has been confirmed from today's statement also. Therefore, your intervention has again become a must.

(English)

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Nirmal Kanti Chatterjee please.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: I want to remind Mr. Advani Mr. Advani has been pleased to say.

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Shuklaji, would you like to respond to other Members also?

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: Why we are not satisfied is ....(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Press the button.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I have done my part of the job Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: You have not done it. If you have done it, there will be a red light.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I have done this. But there is something wrong.

MR. SPEAKER: You press the button.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: So it is obvious. Unless we make repeated efforts, the red light would not be put on.

The problem is very simple. I want to tell the other Members also, why is it that we have to again and again raise this question is because of the enormity of the problem. I do not think even the Minister is seized of it. You see, out of a transaction of Rs. 13 lakh crore in the course of a year, Rs. 1 lakh crore of income was generated. Just imagine Rs. 1 lakh crore. It is their own estimate. It is a question of Rs. 13 lakh crore. Where has that money gone? Imagine the enormity of the problem.

MR. SPEAKER: Are you discussing?

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: No, I am not discussing. I just like to draw your attention as to why we are so insisting. Why is it? We have no other way but to raise it even on the first day of the new Session. Now this Rs. 1 lakh crore has travelled far and wide. (Interruptions)

The second point which I am making is that the constituents tell us that even if we agree that the

Government is against corruption, not only because of AIR but because of so many other things, some action should be taken.

If not corrupt, you are worthless because you are unable to haul it down.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: It is not you but the Government.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: The Government is corrupt and the Parliament is powerless to haul them up. As a Member of Parliament, as one who has been elected by those people, I am answerable to them that even after discovery by all parties unanimously that so much of income has been generated and percolated all round, we are unable to haul them up. Now, it is said that they are considering a revised Report. Now, what is it? They have to act. It is a Report on Action Taken. In the course of three months, no further action has been taken; no heads in the Ministry have rolled; no action has been taken. Therefore, there is no Report on the revised action. *(Interruptions)*

Secondly, we have not taken any further action on foreign banks in the course of last three months. Not only that, you have not taken any other action against the staff of Reserve Bank of India. The Supreme Court, because of your inaction, we misled into appointing the ex-Governor, Shri Venkitaraman to the post of neutral arbitrator—just imagine a person who was held guilty by the JPC...

MR. SPEAKER: Is this the way we should continue?

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: Sir, I will tell you why. It is their inaction that has led to this.

MR. SPEAKER: I will give you enough time to make all these points when the Report comes up for discussion.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I want to say one sentence only. The Supreme Court has appointed one of the persons found guilty by the JPC as a neutral arbitrator and just imagine only because the Chief Justice of Supreme Court's attention was drawn to this JPC Report, could that be cancelled? Can you imagine what your non-action is leading to? It is not only corrupting the people it is not corruption but it is the attitude to corruption that is important.

MR. SPEAKER: You will have enough time to make all these points when this matter comes up for discussion. There are other topics also and the Members are interested to make their points on them.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: Our constituents will not allow us to function. Our constituents say that unless you settle this matter do not come to us.

MR. SPEAKER: You please make your long speech and I will hear you for any number of hours you would like to speak when it comes up for discussion.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I am impressed by your activity last time.

MR. SPEAKER: I must thank you very much.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I want you to be as kind not only to us but to Parliament...

MR. SPEAKER: This is exactly what I am doing. You please hear me first. I am telling you that when the matter comes up for discussion, you will have no difficulty in speaking in the House for as much time as you like. But,

now, that there are other topics to be taken up, you please conclude now.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I have no difficulty in understanding you. I want you to understand this.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Unless this particular topic of AIR is disposed of in some way or the other, I hope you will not permit other topics to be taken up.

MR. SPEAKER: No, no. But would you not like other topics to be taken up?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Let us come to certain conclusions about this.

MR. SPEAKER: That is exactly I am trying to do.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Before that please do not ask other topics to be taken up. *...(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: That is exactly I am trying to do. But you cannot continue this way.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: I have understood your position. I want you to kindly understand our position that unless and until...

MR. SPEAKER: In making your position clear you are taking the time and the opportunity of other Members. I had to ask Shri Buta Singh to sit down.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: You are absolutely right and that is what I requested you to appreciate that the entire people of the country elected us and we elected you. You have to appreciate the sentiments of the people outside.

As we have done in the last Session, exactly similarly you have to tell them that unless they are responding to it immediately, the people outside would not allow us to discuss anything else in the House. And it is this that I want to convey.

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: Sir, I have been at pains to explain that we have taken action on the points that were raised during our discussion. During our discussion, many useful points came and we have taken action on those...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: What are those actions?

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: I am pleading for some patience because I have promised the Report to be given to the House as early as possible. It is not that I have to give it on the first day or the last day. It will be given...*(Interruptions)*.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE: You want receipts of bribes taken. How can we give you receipts?

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: Unless the hon. Speaker gives the floor to you, I am not yielding to anybody here.

Sir, the main thing is that we have taken purposeful action on this. The Report on those points...*(Interruptions)* I want to remind Mr. Advani on this particular matter that the agreement...*(Interruptions)*.

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing is going on record *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: I am not yielding, Sir.

I want to say that the hon. Members should have patience to look at the new Report that is coming. The new Report that is going to come should be able to find lot of answer to their queries. The queries that they are raising now will be all answered in the new Report and unnecessarily if they raise the queries today, it will be of no use because all the queries are reported or replied in the Report that is going to come up here.

Mr. Advani was pleased to make one observation and, as usual, it was only a half-made observation. He said that the crucial point was that there would be a revised and modified Report, but he forgot to mention that in the agreement that they have made, it was agreed that this modified and revised Report will be only on those points which they raised, not the entire thing...*(Interruptions)* This modified and revised Report will be only on those points that were raised by the hon. Members, either verbally during the discussion or in writing, and we are going to lay it on the Table of the House in good time so that you can allot the time for the hon. Members to read the whole thing, study the entire thing and discuss it purposefully. And that Report, I am sure, will be much more satisfactory than most of the Members anticipate...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seats. It is quite possible for us to understand the feelings of the Members on this issue. In the last Session also the Members were very agitated and for a long time it was not possible for us to transact the business. Then very kindly everybody cooperated and we could find a solution to this problem.

I would like to explain to you that when the Minister of Parliamentary Affairs and others wanted to know as to how they should go about in this matter I had told them that they could adopt any method they like. But, at the same time, I had suggested to them that if they agree, they should call for the objections on the points in writing and, if necessary, they should invite them also for discussion and after discussion, if they can explain their points of view, face to face sitting with each other, it would be better. If it is not possible, then the Government may give its own Report and that Report should be discussed on the floor of the House.

No I understand from the Government that the Government is about to complete the Report and the Government is likely to present that Report well in time so that all the Members in the House have enough time to study the Report and enough time to discuss it also. If, for any reason, the Report is presented at the fag end of the Session, it would be my responsibility to see that you have enough time to study it and discuss it.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: If you want approximate time to be given and if the Minister is in a position to give the time, he may give the approximate time. I am not asking for the day but I am asking for the week.

SHRI NIRMAL KANTI CHATTERJEE (Dum Dum): Sir, no action has been taken...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI VIDYACHARAN SHUKLA: Sir, as you rightly

observed, we want this Report. We ourselves are anxious that this Report should be discussed threadbare when it comes before the House. So, we will have enough time. It would be during the middle of the Session when we will present the Report here...*(Interruptions)*

Sir, we intend to present this in the House and it will be in your hands by the middle of this Session.

MR. SPEAKER: The Minister says that in the middle of the Session the Report will be tabled.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: No Report; No House.

DR. RAM CHANDRA DOME: Sir, it should be presented today.

12.58 hrs.

(At this stage, Shri Mohammad Ali Ashraf Fatmi and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: If one hundred people have died, do you not want to discuss that?

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I would like to request the hon. Members that the Government has said that the Report will be tabled in the middle of the Session. It will give you enough time to discuss it. There are other issues to be discussed. If you take this attitude, the country would think that you are not alive to other problems. Please do not attract that kind of criticism. Please do not do it.

*(Interruptions)*

13.00 hrs

MR. SPEAKER: Please do not make this House a street please. May I request you to please understand where you are standing?

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: The House stands adjourned to meet again at 2.00 p.m.

13.01 hrs

*The Lok Sabha then adjourned for Lunch till Fourteen of the Clock.*

14.04 hrs.

The Lok Sabha re-assembled after Lunch at four minutes past fourteen of the Clock.

(Mr. Deputy-Speaker in the Chair)

*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Papers to be laid on the Table.

14.04 1/2 hrs.

(At this stage, Shri Mohammad Ali Ashraf Fatmi and some other hon. Members came and stood on the floor near the Table.)

*(Interruptions.)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have made a suggestion. You have impressed the Government.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: There is a limit. You have



impressed the Government that the report should come. They have heard it.

[Translation]

SHRI MOHAMMED ALI ASHRAF FATMI (Darbhanga): Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, three and a half months have passed.

[English]

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You have impressed the Government and the Government has heard it. We have made a progress. Let me complete this.

...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: We are sitting for a very short time. Kindly resume your seats.

...(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Today you have impressed the Government. The Government has heard it.

[Translation]

SHRI DEVENDRA PRASAD YADAV (Jhanjharpur). Even after an interval of three and half months the Government is giving a negative response. (Interruptions).

[English]

14.06 Hrs.

#### Papers Laid on the Table

*Report of the Justice Saikia Commission of Inquiry on Meham incidents and Memorandum of Action Taken thereon etc.*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI P.M. SAYEED): On behalf of Shri S.B. Chavan, I beg to lay on the table:

- (1) A copy each of the following papers (Hindi and English versions) under sub-section (4) of section 3 the Commissions of Inquiry Act, 1952:
  - (i) Report of the Justice Saikia Commission of Inquiry on Meham incidents.
  - (ii) Memorandum of Action Taken on the above Report.
- (2) Statement (Hindi and English versions) showing reasons for delay in laying the papers mentioned at (1) above.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-6428/94]

(3) A copy of the Special Order (Hindi and English versions) dated the 19th October, 1994 issued by the President regarding increase in the amount in respect of Tours Expenses relating to the Governor of Madhya Pradesh for the financial year 1993-94 under sub-section (3) of section 12 of the Governors (Emoluments, Allowances and Privileges) Act, 1982.

[Placed in Library. See No. L.T.-6429/94]

*Annual Report, Annual Accounts and Review on the working of National Cooperative Housing Federation of India, New Delhi for 1993-94*

THE MINISTER OF URBAN DEVELOPMENT (SHRIMATI SHEILA KAUL): I beg to lay on the Table—

- (1) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English

versions) of the National Cooperative Housing Federation of India, New Delhi, for the year 1993-94.

- (2) A copy of the Annual Accounts (Hindi and English versions) of the National Cooperative Housing Federation of India, New Delhi, for the year 1993-94 together with Audit Report thereon.
- (3) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the National Cooperative Housing Federation of India, New Delhi, for the year 1993-94.

[Placed in library See No. LT-6430/94]

*Explanatory Statement giving reasons for immediate legislation by the Cable Television Networks (Regulation) Ordinance, 1994.*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (DEPARTMENT OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS) AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKUL WASNIK) on behalf of Shri K.P. Singh Dev, I beg to lay on the table an explanatory statement (Hindi and English versions) giving reasons for immediate legislation by the Cable Television Networks (Regulation) Ordinance, 1994, under rule 71(2) of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in Lok Sabha.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-6431/94]

*Annual Report and Review on the working of Wadia Institute of Himalyan Geology, Dehradun; Institute for Plasma Research, Gandhinagar; Birbal Sahni Institute of Palaeobotany, Lucknow for 1993-94, etc.*

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HUMAN RESOURCE DEVELOPMENT (DEPARTMENT OF YOUTH AFFAIRS AND SPORTS) AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS (SHRI MUKUL WASNIK) on behalf of Shri Bhuvnesh Chaturvedi, I beg to lay on the table:-

- (1) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Wadia Institute of Himalayan Geology, Dehra Dun, for the year 1993-94, alongwith Audited Accounts.
- (ii) Statement (Hindi and English versions) regarding Review by the Government on the working of the Wadia Institute of Himalayan Geology, Dehra Dun, for the year 1993-94. [Placed in Library, See No. LT-6432/94]
- (2) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Institute for Plasma Research, Gandhinagar, for the year 1993-94, alongwith Audited Accounts.
- (ii) Statement (Hindi and English versions) regarding Review by the Government on the working of the Institute for Plasma Research, Gandhinagar, for the year 1993-94. [Placed in Library, See No. LT-6433/94]
- (3) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and