

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Mr. Swell, I have got very strong words to speak for you. Do not do that ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI G.G. SWELL: You are free. Go on ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The only purpose for this committee was to find out full information about the entire contract. Whatever was possible, we did. But the motive he is attributing to the Chairman, I entirely refuse it. I am not speaking out of frustration like you Mr. V.P. Singh.

17.16 1/2 hrs.

[*Translation*]

DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

Commission reported to have been paid by M/s. Bofors in Howitzer Gun Deal—*Contd.*

THE MINISTER OF ENERGY (SHRI VASANT SATHE): Sir, we are once again having this Bofors ...(*Interruptions*)

17.17 hrs.

[SHRI SHARAD DIGHE *in the Chair*]

Sir, Mr. V.P. Singh was very eager when he resigned "that he wants to fight corruption and that is why he brought this matter." He said that this House may not be told the truth, but the people of the country want to know the truth. Therefore, he has been raising these issues not only in the House but in the public .. (*Interruptions*)

Sir, Bofors has been discussed for such a long time now. It has virtually been reduced to bluffers. What is the essence of the matter today? (*Interruptions*)

In addition to what has already appeared in JPC Report and what has already

appeared in 'The Hindu', which was discussed here earlier, so much has been said already on the so-called numbers, etc. What is the latest provocation, for which this discussion has started. I think we should restrict ourselves to that under Rule 193 (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Prime Minister's admission. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: All right, I will come to that. Mr. Dandavate has earlier today said that the Prime Minister must be treated differently from other Members. That means, in the eyes of the law, the Prime Minister has the same position as any other citizen. What is the elementary principle of law? If any one levels an accusation or a charge, the burden of proof is on him to prove that charge. This is the elementary provision of the law....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Except in the case of Defamation Bill..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: That has been withdrawn. Fortunately it has gone.

Today I read that an eminent leader of one of the parties says that although this is the normal law of the land, for the Prime Minister the burden of proof changes. I cannot understand this. Today the crux of the matter is that a square allegation has been made publicly in Patna by the so-called leader of the Janata Dal Morcha. So many names yet to change. What is the allegation made and this is what I want to come to. The allegation made is that the Janata Dal President—this is the report—Mr. Vishwanath Pratap Singh today accused the Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, of having deposited—every word is important—Rs. 8 crores taken as commission in the Bofors Gun deal in his Swiss account. This is the square charge made publicly by Mr. V.P. Singh. Is this a small, non-serious matter? Further talking to newsmen here today, Mr. Singh while reiterating his charge, said, he would renounce his political life for ever if the Prime

Minister was able to prove his innocence—it came to that if this information is wrong. He said, he had more secret information, etc. Then he further goes on to say about the Lotus account and gives the account number 00021 TU Swiss Bank Corporation, Geneva. I would, therefore, want Shri V.P.Singh—and this is what I was waiting the whole day and the Speaker also began by asking him—to authenticate this very document which he has publicly stated and which has been reported. He says that Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, has deposited eight crores of rupees in Swiss Bank Corporation, name of the Corporation also, in his account called Lotus which in Sanskrit means Rajiv. These are your specific charges. These are your words. I would like the hon. Mr. V.P.Singh to say in this House, because then the question of Privilege and all that will come, that he repeats this charge squarely against Mr. Rajiv Gandhi that Mr. Rajiv Gandhi has deposited in his account number 99921 and named Lotus this amount. I was hearing very patiently his entire speech. I was waiting. He produced the tape. He produced this and that. He produced those documents. The documents which he was reading, were all there. This is nothing new. They have been produced in *The Hindu*. They were discussed... (*Interruptions*) A man of credibility was talking that the Prime Minister has lost credibility. O.K. fine. Mr. V.P.Singh is the latest man of credibility in this country. Now a man of credibility must show some elementary courage to at least repeat what he has said publicly in this House. What debate can we have; what discussion can we have? A concrete allegation with documentary proof is made against him. Mr. Ghulam Nabi Azad produced a copy of the deposit of his son and daughter-in-law with account number etc. signed. All that he is asking him is, come on Mr. Credible, come on Mr. Honest man come on Mr. Cleanest man of the country, the saviour of the entire opposition, come on now and say at least honestly - and it is only three lakhs of rupees and not much. Come on and say that this is either true or is not true. Let him say that his son no has no such account, his daughter-in-law

has no such account. Let him say so. Let him have some courage. What are we debating? We are debating in generality the credibility of this country, the character of the leader of this country. The leader of this country, the Prime Minister, has categorically publicly denied that he has no such account either in Swiss Bank or in any other foreign bank. What are we shouting about in this House and outside? The question was — and that is where he could have held this Government to account two things — that did the Government buy a weapon — the question of morale of the army is concerned — which was not fit for the army, or which was not..... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat):
Who says that?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: V.P. Singh himself publicly says that the Government bought a weapon which demoralised the army.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Are you referring to the Bofors gun or the German submarine?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: Yes, I am referring to the Bofors gun. So much was said about comparatives. He quoted another General and about comparatives. V.P. Singh has gone on record in public speeches saying that this gun was not a proper gun, not a good gun, and he also quoted one other General. But here, in the JPC, when the inquiry was made by the Parliamentary Committee, two persons, who know something of the army, Gen. Arora and Jaswant Singh, were called. Jaswant Singh himself fired the gun because he knows what it is. All of them have said that this is one of the best guns and the best weapons that this country has bought... (*Interruptions*). Indrajit Gupta Ji, two points arise. What are the people of this country concerned with? First and foremost is the quality of the gun and second is the price — was it bought at a reasonable price. No one has stated that the gun was not bought at a reasonable price. Actually the amount was slashed down substantially in

[Sh. Vasant Sathe]
negotiations. This is what has come on record. That is also not the allegation. The third and the most important thing, I agree, is that if anyone could say that this person in the Government, whether Prime Minister or Defence Minister or 'X' or 'Y' has taken a consideration — call it by whatever name you like: commission, fee, this or that — for giving this contract, then squarely a case is made out. Indirect evidence and other things whether commissions were paid or not, whether there were middlemen or not, I personally feel are irrelevant. And that is why I was happy that there is for the first time a leader of the Opposition coming forward publicly and saying: "You, Mr. so and so — Vasant Sathe or Mr. Pant and now actually the Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi — have taken Rs. eight crores and put them in the Swiss account." This is an allegation which must be taken serious note of. Correct. We all will take serious note of it. If necessary, by appointing a committee or by whatever method, we will ourselves find out. But the elementary requirement is — I think Indrajit Gupta Ji will agree and Madhu Dandavate Ji also will agree — that this was the best occasion for Mr. V.P. Singh to say that yes, he repeats that Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, the Prime Minister of India took Rs. eight crores as consideration in Bofors and deposited in this account in Swiss Bank. Let him say that. But he does not have the guts he does not have the courage, he does not have the courtesy because he does not have any other proof. All that he has produced in those old things which have already been published and which do not show anything, and they were not under discussion.

[Translation]

Bofors has been discussed for such a long time. Now the country has no more interest in Bofors as it is an unending affair. Perhaps you think that by making Bofors a scandal and matter of controversies, the Government will hold the midterm poll but I tell you that the Government will not hold any midterms. The elections will be held at the end of the full term. The Government have to

undertake a number of works and programmes for the country. Perhaps Sh. V.P. Singh is thinking that if midterms are held in haste, the people out of fear will come with him, but we give you a period of one year. Tomorrow a meeting of another opposition party is going to be held. Mr. Bahuguna, Mr. Ramdhan and many others are going to assemble there. You may continue to change from one party to the other. You require nobody's help because you yourself are quite self sufficient. Mr. Madhu Dandavate, please remember one thing... (*Interruptions*)

AN HON MEMBER: You speak this to your party. (*interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: I am returning the same coins to you. That is in your tone. There is a maxim that "Ungrateful person is a foe to his own benefactors. Even in Sanskrit the same thing is described like this "Ankam Aarunya Suttam hi, hatwa kim nam pau-rusham". There is no bravery in killing a man who has trusted you. This man whom I have repeatedly mentioned here and whom Shri Rajiv Gandhi had given the regard of an elder brother and Mrs. Gandhiji also used to rely, used to say—"Indira ji is my mother — she is my mother (*Interruptions*)..... He used to recite, "Tiranga jhanda, Vijayi Vishwa tiranga pyara and it is my flag and I will remain fully devoted to it." These are the words he had uttered in the A.I.C.C. meeting... (*Interruptions*) Rajiv ji is Shankaracharya for us and my only leader is Mr. Rajiv Gandhi... (*Interruptions*)..

[English]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: You had also said the same thing about the socialist great plan, but you threw away that and came to this.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: You have also done that. (*Interruptions*)

[Translation]

To which dynasty he belongs? Does he belong to Raghuvansh or Chandravansh....

(Interruptions)

AN HON. MEMBER: He is a Raghuvan-shi.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: "Raghukulreet sada chali aai, pran jaye par vachan na jaye". As I have said just now "Ankam Aar-uhya Suttam hi, hatwa kim naam pau-rusham". He has betrayed his benefactor. Perhaps he thinks that opposition is sterile and without any leader to head it and he will become the head of the opposition, if he changes over to it and thus all including Mr. Madhu Dandavate and others etc. will take shelter under his feet and he will be able to exploit them. Mr. Hegde also joined him but I may tell you that traitor is always a traitor. As he has betrayed his leader, so he will do with you... *(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: As you have done with the socialist movement *(Interruptions)*

[English]

You have betrayed the Opposition. *(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

SHRI VASANT SATHE: He is**.

[English]

His latest qualification is of the first order. *(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

A person who can say something outside the Parliament but does not have the courage to repeat the same in the Parliament House, what can be said about him and he has been entirely exposed. The media of the country should at least bring all this to light. You have grilled this much. He could not show any courage and fled away. First he is** secondly** and thirdly, a deserter.

(Interruptions)

He has fled from the field.... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. TULSIRAM: You talk about your Prime Minister. Why do you speak like this. You should think twice before you speak. You should not give such a chance to others. You say that Shri V.P. Singh has fled. Where is your hon. Prime Minister? He is missing since morning. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI VASANT SATHE: You are the follower of 'Nataraj'. You are the follower of a Chief Minister who sleeps on the pavements. Please sit down for a while. -

SHRI V. TULSIPAM: You are talking about Bofors or about the people who sleep on the pavements? What does it mean? You talk about the people who sleep on the pavements. You sleep on the pavement. If I want to produce the documents against you it would be a large number of them. I can give proof of your misdeeds. I can submit a big bundle to the Hon. Prime Minister containing the evidences of your onnoxious activities. What are you talking about?

SHRI VASANT SATHE: A thrashed army resorts to rampage. Shri V. Tulsiram and our other hon. friends are piqued. We should not deal with such persons. *(Interruptions)*

[English]

SHRI M. RAGHUMA REDDY (Nalgonda): Where is the Prime Minister?... *(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMEN-TARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT): I have already stated in this House that I do not have any account whatsoever... *(Interruptions)*

**Expunged as order by ther Chair

SHRI VASANT SATHE: The Hon. Prime Minister has stated the same inside this House and outside as well. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. CHAIRMAN: One at a time.

SHRI VASANT SATHE: As I said, the man who made the charge himself is not willing to reiterate it in this House. He does not deserve the presence of the Prime Minister in this House to reply to this** (*Interruptions*). How can be reply to it? (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANAVATE: He himself is not in Parliament. Even Parliament does not deserve his presence. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: The man who does not have the guts—

SHRI VASANT SATHE: I am not saying Parliament. I am saying... (*Interruptions*). The man who does not have the guts, he does not deserve the presence of the Prime Minister. We are good enough to meet this. The Prime Minister is not required to face** and a** man. Therefore, I sincerely hope, Madhuji,

[*Translation*]

That you should pay attention to serious matters sometimes at least. Let us come to matters relating to the nation building. This will not do and neither will it be in the interest of the nation. Do some introspection. This will not be of any benefit either to you or to the people in the opposition. I would also say that the House should consider all these matters sometimes. Before I went outside for a medical check-up, I had written a letter to all of you. I want to submit very humbly and politely even today that we should talk about nation-building. You say that Rs. 40 thousand crores are there in the shape of unac-

counted money. If you honestly want to serve the country, then you should unearth that money. If you indulge in character assassination, it will affect you as well. You will not have the courage to save yourself. You do not have even the guts to unearth some of the amount. You charge us publicly but you do not have the courage to repeat the same inside the House. You do not make your intentions clear in this regard. You should repeat and clearly define the charges in this House. When your commander has fled from the battlefield, then what can happen to the soldiers? Whom are you defending, Prof. Dandavateji? (*Interruptions*) Please, let him go. He has not charged. It is I who has done so. It is Shri V.P. Singh who has done it. But Shri V.P. Singh does not have courage to repeat the charges which he has levelled. He has not produced even the necessary evidences here in this regard. He has said that he will be prepared to substantiate the charges. It takes two to make a quarrel. They also have skeletons in their cupboards. If evidences are not available about them directly, then I will produce the evidences of their own relatives... (*Interruptions*) You, the defector, you may go. What can I say to you? (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

Today we are not discussing V.P. Singh. When that comes, if that comes at all, we will be able to say many things about him. But today the small matter was this. Again I end with this. The crux of the matter today was and the whole country was with bated breath and the entire media which wanted to report tomorrow were watching with bated breath, "Oh, here, now V.P. Singh will say something which will be worth reporting tomorrow." But what happens now. Simply, it has fizzled out like flat soda — all his enthusiasm. Therefore, I believe that this should be the last occasion when anybody would ever utter the name of Bofors and bluffers because the main person has withdrawn — not only the charge by not reproducing it but has withdrawn himself from the House.

**Expunged as ordered by the Chair.

[*Translation*]

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH): Mr. Chairman, Sir, the background of the subject which is under discussion in this august House today is regarding the allegations made by hon. Shri V.P. Singh, who is a Member of Parliament, during the course of his public addresses in Patna and subsequently in Lucknow that the Hon. Prime Minister of India, Shri Rajiv Gandhi has an account in some foreign bank and the alleged kickbacks received in the Bofors gun deal have been deposited in that account. He has made another startling announcement today. He has said that he would prove that Hon. Shri Rajiv Gandhi does have a foreign bank account. I will retire from public life if I am not able to prove this. This point is being discussed in the House today and Prof. Dandavate, Shri Somnath and many other hon. Members have tried to give it a new twist by feeding new facts and the subject under discussion in the House is being discussed for a long time and an authoritative reply thereto has already been given by the Government. A high-level committee of this august House presented a report on this subject after going deep into it and today that report is being referred here. This implies that a horse is being put before a cart. Prof. Dandavate and others, treading the path of Shri V.P. Singh who misled the people, will also try to mislead the House today by raising the charges levelled by Shri V.P. Singh. But this will not be possible because it is very clear in the press statement given by him. This should be discussed in the House today and therefore I would mention it in the House today.

[*English*]

"Janata Dal President Mr. Vishwanath Pratap Singh today accused the Prime Minister Rajiv Gandhi of having deposited Rs. 8 crores taken as commission in the Bofors gun deal in the Swiss account. He said he had more secret information about Mr. Gandhi's personal accounts with the Swiss bank, and that he would divulge the same at

the appropriate time."

[*Translation*]

Sir, if this supreme body of the country is not an appropriate forum to discuss and if today is not an appropriate time for this, then what else can be a better place or time to do it? Shri V.P. Singh has left the house, but I would like to ask Shri Dandavate, and I have quoted, in which he has said that he would furnish it at the appropriate time. Which forum and time are appropriate in your view, when Shri V.P. Singh will furnish the proof.

Did he talk to you or tell his greatest advocate Shri Somnath Chatterjee about this matter?

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: I am not anyone's advocate. (*Interruptions*) If at all I am so, I am an advocate of 'Janata' (the masses).

S. BUTA SINGH: He also belongs to 'Janata Dal', today you are his advocate.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: I am an advocate of 'Janata'.

S. BUTA SINGH: The manner in which Shri Dandavate and Shri Somnath Chatterjee have tried to defend Shri V.P. Singh today, I really pity these stalwarts. Today you are very happy at having selected Shri V.P. Singh as your leader. Just now Shri Vasant Sathe and other hon. Members, Shri Ghulam Nabi Azad, Shri K.K. Tewari etc. referred to the properties of Shri V.P. Singh's. Since you people ask for proofs, are these proofs not enough? I did not want that any personal discussion about Shri V.P. Singh is made in the House today, but if you want proof, I would like to present them. The foremost evidents against him comes from Shri V.P. Singh's wife. I do not know her name nor do I want to mention her name either, because the name of the person not present here should not be mentioned. (*Interruptions*)

I would like to present a proof coming

[S. But Singh:]
from Shri V.P. Singh's wife.

His wife had filed an affidavit under her signature in the Allahabad High Court, and the reason of that affidavit was that Shri V.P. Singh donated his land under the great bhoodan movement either on your advice or being misled. After the land was donated, his wife approached the Allahabad High Court and said that her husband was an insane. Her affidavit is in the Allahabad High Court. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

"Smt. Sita Devi filed not only an affidavit but she filed a writ in the Allahabad High Court claiming that her husband Shri V.P. Singh often suffers from bouts of insanity and it was during one of these bouts he had wrongly donated his land. The claim of bouts of insanity was further substantiated by a discharge slip from the Agra Mental Hospital." (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur): I am on a point of information... (*Interruptions*) Did this Government appoint an insane person as Finance Minister and Chief Minister? (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: You talk to Prof. Dandavate, who is going to appoint him something of the President of the Janata Dal, which is yet to be born.... Janata Dal President, National Forum Convenor and what not... (*Interruptions*) We have discovered and it has been proved... (*Interruptions*) They wanted proof. What could be a better proof than the affidavit of the High Court? I am not making any allegation (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: Order please. Let him speak now.

(*Interruption:*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I do not want your certificate. People know it.

S. BUTA SINGH: We will not have a certificate for you because we know your life-partner is a much more respectful person. She will not give a certificate like this to you. What I was saying was that you wanted proof. This is a proof on record from no less a forum than the High Court of the State of which he happened to be the Chief Minister for a short while.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: You should not refer to my wife. She is not in this House. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: She is our very respected sister. She is doing a laudable job... (*Interruptions*) This is one proof. I will give another proof... (*Interruptions*) I will give another proof, another proof is no less a person than Shri V.P. Singh himself. Shri V.P. Singh was talking about the Dahiya Trust. You know what he has said on Dahiya Trust. You will be just surprised. This hon. Member, to save some property, had gone to the extent... (*Interruptions*) May I, with your Permission, say what he has said on record? — Family Trust.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat): What is this?

S. BUTA SINGH: My notes. For Family Trust whose Kartha was the Mother of Shri V.P. Singh.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: You have authenticated it. You are telling about his wife, his mother. Have some respect to them. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: What can I do if they are part of the proceedings in the High Court? I know that tomorrow when I am going to talk about Shri N.T. Rama Rao, I am going to quote from the High Court. What can I do? These are the things in the High court. I have to do it, unfortunately. This is the most unpleasant duty when you have to expose the truth. You have to expose the truth. You will have to. In that famous Dahiya Trust case, Shri V.P. Singh himself went to the extent of disowning his own mother. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: What is this? Has this anything to do with the Bofors case? (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: It is on record. Because he was the *Karta* of that Trust, he said: "my family has nothing to do with the Trust." (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Has it anything to do with Bofors? There is a limit to it. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: They wanted the proof. Am I not entitled to give proof which has been on record? On the record, the proof is nothing else but Mr. V.P. Singh himself. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: This is the level of a Cabinet Member. You can imagine what will be the fate of others. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: I do not bother about what they have to say. But I have stated the facts and the truth; is always bitter. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: We have never uttered about the individual life of the Prime Minister nor his mother, nor his father and nor his grand-father. There is a height to which he can reply. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: He claimed that his family has nothing to do with the Trust. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: A Cabinet Minister sinking to that level. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: Mr. Dandavate, when you ask the truth, we have to say the truth. How bitter it is, it is only known to you. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: What has it to do with Bofors? (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: They asked my distin-

guished colleague Shri Sathe about the proof. This is the proof. When I quote the proof, it is very bitter. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: You talk about the interview.

S. BUTA SINGH: I am coming to that interview. Have patience, have guts and have courage to listen to the truth. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Mr. Chairman, are you convinced that this has something to do with the subject matter?

MR. CHAIRMAN: Allegations are made by both sides.

(*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: Mr. Chairman, I am only giving just a few instances of the man who made these reckless charges.

In any case, I am not a lawyer. Luckily, I have never been to a court. But I understand that in a case like this where reckless charges are made, the other party's counsel is free to probe into the personality who is making such charges. Mr. V.P. Singh has made reckless charges, politically motivated charges and I have every right to expose in this House what kind of a man Mr. V.P. Singh is. And what I am stating is nothing new. I am not making any counter charges. What I am trying to put before this august House is a picture of the man who stands by the truth, honesty, by integrity. And I will not repeat how he has been termed in a writ petition by his own wife. These are the things which we must know that kind of personality that Mr. V.P. Singh has and the opposition was asking the proof. I am prepared to give the proof. Mr. V.P. Singh last week declared his assets in Delhi.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE DEPARTMENT OF POWER AND THE MINISTRY OF ENERGY (SHRI KALPNATH RAI): From where did he get?

S. BUTA SINGH: I am not going to question it. Authorities will question it, if it is referred to any authority. I am going to put a question on the additional property that Mr. V.P. Singh has in Delhi. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: I am on a point of order. In what forum, in what circumstances will that be discussed and decided. If that disclosure of asset is wrong, certainly, Government can take any action against him. But the question is 'et the debate on the subject be continued. Let us not allow a deliberate attempt to derail the debate to any other point than Bofors. It should not be permitted.

18 hrs.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No point of order.

S. BUTA SINGH: I am not going to comment on what Mr. V.P. Singh has declared; I am not going into the details. It is for his colleagues to believe whether that is true or not. But I am entitled in this august House to add to what he has not declared.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Mr. Buta Singh, how long will you take?

S. BUTA SINGH: I will take another one hour, may be a little more. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: We are not going to sit. It is already 6 O'clock.

MR. CHAIRMAN: For one hour we will extend and have the rest of the debate tomorrow.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No, Sir. Let us continue the discussion tomorrow. (*Interruptions*)

S. BUTA SINGH: I am not going to mention about his declared assets; that is for the appropriate authorities and forums to

examine. I will list the property which has not been declared by Mr. V.P. Singh. If the Opposition is so concerned about Mr. V.P. Singh, may I pose a question to Mr. Somnath Chatterjee and Prof. Dandavate? I will not touch his declared property. Are they willing to advise Mr. V.P. Singh at least to exchange his undeclared property with mine?

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: What about your properties?

S. BUTA SINGH: Yes, I am prepared. I am not asking for his declared property, but the undeclared property that I am going to list, are they willing to advise him to exchange?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: When he has referred to his mother; he is capable of referring to anything

S. BUTA SINGH: I have not said it, Mr. V.P. Singh said it; it is not we who have said that. It is Mr. V.P. Singh; to save a few acres and a few trees, he has disowned that great person to whom he was born.

[*Translation*]

Today, the condition of that poor fellow is that he is nowhere. You have finished him. (*Interruptions*)

SOME HON. MEMBERS: Now we are not going to sit. Let us continue tomorrow Sir. (*Interruptions*)

MR. CHAIRMAN: The House stands adjourned to re-assemble tomorrow at 11 a.m.

18.03 hrs.

The Lok Sabha then adjourned till Eleven of the Clock on Wednesday, November 16, 1988/Kartika 25, 1910 (Saka)