

[English]

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:
Let me answer Sir. They raised the point
about the Dahiya Charitable Trust.

[Translation]

Please listen to my reply (*Interruptions*)

SHRI GHULAM NABI AZAD: Answer
my question first about the shares.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:
I am coming to it. I will cover one by one.

Sir, with all the responsibility, I authorise
the Government to forfeit all the property of
the Dahiya Charitable Trust and put the
members of the Trust behind the bars.

.PROF. K.K. TEWARY: How can you say
that?

SHRI S. BUTA SINGH: It is very brave
and generous of Shri V.P. Singh now to offer
the Dahiya Trust for public action when he
has sold even the non-existing trees on the
property. He auctioned five lakh trees when
there is no tree on that land. You can fool a
few people with this kind of Jugglery and this
kind of *tamasha*. But you cannot fool the
country for all the time to come.

[Translation]

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:
You don't worry, I will answer to all your
points one by one. And when you will listen
to this cassette, you will cut but a sorry figure.
(*Interruptions*)

[English]

SHRI V. KISHORE CHANDRA S. DEO
(Parvathipuram): Sir, I am on a point of
order. What is the debate and what is going
on in this House? Is this debate about the
personal credential of Shri V.P. Singh?
(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: While

initiating the discussion, the motion was
about the documentary evidence regarding
payment of commission under Bofors gun
deal and the reaction of the Government
thereto. This was the subject matter of the
discussion. (*Interruptions*)

PERSONAL EXPLANATION UNDER
RULE 357 BY SHRI B. SHANKARAN-
AND

17.05 hrs.

[English]

THE MINISTER OF LAW AND JUSTICE
AND MINISTER OF WATER RE-
SOURCE (SHRI B. SHANKARANAND):
Since Mr. V.P. Singh took my name (*Inter-
rptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Ra-
japur): Are you withdrawing your Report?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Since Mr.
V.P. Singh took my name in the course of his
speech and he threw a challenge at me, I
was simply wondering till today where was
Mr. V.P. Singh when the inquiry was going
on. I never expected this from Mr. V.P. Singh.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE
(Bolpur): Mr. Buta Singh is prompting him.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY
(Mahbubnagar): Mr. Shankaranand was
also prompted in the Committee.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Don't
spoil his case.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS
(S. BUTA SINGH): Because you have al-
ready spoiled Mr. V.P. Singh.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I fully
stand by the Report which was presented to
this House. (*Interruptions*) Mr. V.P. Singh
never made anything to support his conten-

[Sh. B. Shankaranand]
tion that the Report of the JPC is not based on evidence.

I don't think he has made that remark.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:
May I authenticate this now? (Interruptions)

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Let him deny it. (Interruptions)

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH:
He should say yes or no. That was only the private matter; it is a public property. He must say, yes or no. (Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please take your seats. Have you finished it?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I cannot shout. I have to answer it.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Who drafted this Report? (Interruptions)

SHRI G.G. SWELL (Shillong): You cannot provoke us like this. (Interruptions)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Don't you think that you have lost yourself when you are sitting on that side? (Interruptions)

SHRI G.G. SWELL: If you want to provoke us, I will speak. (Interruptions)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: In the Report it has been shown that the Bofors contract was signed on the recommendation of Mr. V.P. Singh himself as the Finance Minister. The then Finance Secretary said, "We briefed the Finance Minister."

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Wrong!

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Why are you interfering? Let him say. (Interruptions)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: It is expected of a Minister, who held the Finance portfolio in the Government of India that he when signs, he knows everything. (Interrup-

tions)

S. BUTA SINGH: You were not the Home Minister, Professor. You were the Railway Minister. You have never been to the South Block.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND. Mr. V.P. Singh never appeared before the J.P.C. Neither did he write to us, "I want to give evidence."

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Why did you not call him?

S. BUTA SINGH: We called everyone of you, but you never came.

SHRI RAMPYARE PANIKA (Robertsganj): Why shall we call him?

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND, Mr. Reddy, the report has shown what you are. Please sit down. We have written much about you in the report itself.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: You agreed with Mr. Win Chadha in the report. (Interruptions)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Let anybody say that the findings of the JPC are not based on evidence on record.

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: What I said or not, I have been asking right or wrong, they have been asking about private affairs, yet I am cooperating on the floor of the House with all the responsibility. But this is in public interest. I swear, what you said, right or wrong, this is public interest. On this depends the inquiry and national interests are there.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have not allowed him. Why are you yielding?

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Whether Morberg said or not, (Interruptions) if you see the report, so, all winding up

charges are on this theory.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I will resume after he finishes his speech. Has he finished or not? If he wants to speak, you may allow him to speak.

SHRI THAMPAN THOMAS: You say, winding up charges.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Thampan Thomas, you are wasting the time.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Is he on a personal explanation or is he intervening in the debate? If he is on a personal explanation, he must only answer the pointed question. Because, as Chairman he saw to it that only soft and comfortable questions should be put to the witnesses from Bofors. That is the point. Has he said it? If he is on a personal explanation, he cannot go on making a speech.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: He is only explaining it.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I do not know why Mr. Somnath Chatterjee is agitated so much not Mr. V.P.Singh.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Because you are misusing the floor of the House. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Are you not misusing the floor? If we are misusing are you not misusing the floor of the House? I am also a member of the House.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nobody can misuse the floor of the House. Mr. Shankaranand you come to the point and finish it.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I should say that, Shri V.P.Singh has said about the examination of the witnesses. He wanted to make that a point. We wanted to get full information from these people. (*Interruptions*).

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: Is it right or not, what I have said.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: You must listen. You must listen to me now. ...

SHRI VISHWANATH PRATAP SINGH: I will listen to you. You come to the point.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Do not provoke me to say something else.

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRIISHNAN (Badagara): Please do, please do.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Let me deal with this, only what you have said. Otherwise it is not good. I will be something also.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Do not blackmail us.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: I do not blackmail anybody. (*Interruptions*) Because, for many long years, he was with me on this side. Perhaps, I know many things which he did not know.

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRIISHNAN: Through innuendoes he is trying to say something.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: We are not discussing Mr. V.P.Singh.

SHRI K.P. UNNIKRIISHNAN: What are you doing? Ask. Mr. K.K.Tewary.

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The only intention of the Committee was to extract as much information as possibly by persuading those people. Otherwise, they may refuse to give evidence. (*Interruptions*) We wanted the information, full information from these people. Now is it not the purpose of the Committee to find out information from them?

SHRI G.G. SWELL: By crawling before them. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: Mr. Swell, I have got very strong words to speak for you. Do not do that ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI G.G. SWELL: You are free. Go on ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI B. SHANKARANAND: The only purpose for this committee was to find out full information about the entire contract. Whatever was possible, we did. But the motive he is attributing to the Chairman, I entirely refuse it. I am not speaking out of frustration like you Mr. V.P. Singh.

17.16 1/2 hrs.

[*Translation*]

DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

Commission reported to have been paid by M/s. Bofors in Howitzer Gun Deal—*Contd.*

THE MINISTER OF ENERGY (SHRI VASANT SATHE): Sir, we are once again having this Bofors ...(*Interruptions*)

17.17 hrs.

[SHRI SHARAD DIGHE *in the Chair*]

Sir, Mr. V.P. Singh was very eager when he resigned "that he wants to fight corruption and that is why he brought this matter." He said that this House may not be told the truth, but the people of the country want to know the truth. Therefore, he has been raising these issues not only in the House but in the public .. (*Interruptions*)

Sir, Bofors has been discussed for such a long time now. It has virtually been reduced to bluffers. What is the essence of the matter today? (*Interruptions*)

In addition to what has already appeared in JPC Report and what has already

appeared in 'The Hindu', which was discussed here earlier, so much has been said already on the so-called numbers, etc. What is the latest provocation, for which this discussion has started. I think we should restrict ourselves to that under Rule 193 (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Prime Minister's admission. ...(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: All right, I will come to that. Mr. Dandavate has earlier today said that the Prime Minister must be treated differently from other Members. That means, in the eyes of the law, the Prime Minister has the same position as any other citizen. What is the elementary principle of law? If any one levels an accusation or a charge, the burden of proof is on him to prove that charge. This is the elementary provision of the law....(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE: Except in the case of Defamation Bill..(*Interruptions*)

SHRI VASANT SATHE: That has been withdrawn. Fortunately it has gone.

Today I read that an eminent leader of one of the parties says that although this is the normal law of the land, for the Prime Minister the burden of proof changes. I cannot understand this. Today the crux of the matter is that a square allegation has been made publicly in Patna by the so-called leader of the Janata Dal Morcha. So many names yet to change. What is the allegation made and this is what I want to come to. The allegation made is that the Janata Dal President—this is the report—Mr. Vishwanath Pratap Singh today accused the Prime Minister, Mr. Rajiv Gandhi, of having deposited—every word is important—Rs. 8 crores taken as commission in the Bofors Gun deal in his Swiss account. This is the square charge made publicly by Mr. V.P. Singh. Is this a small, non-serious matter? Further talking to newsmen here today, Mr. Singh while reiterating his charge, said, he would renounce his political life for ever if the Prime