

12.06 hrs.

**RULING RE : LAYING ON THE TABLE
REPORTS BY PRIVATE
MEMBERS**

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Yesterday, Prof. Madhu Dandavate had sought my permission to lay on the Table of the House a copy each of the three parts of the Report submitted to Government in October, 1980 (Part I), February, 1981 (Part II) and March, 1981 (Part III) of the Enquiry Committee on High Rate of Mortality and other Malpractices at the Central Sheep and Wool Research Institute at Avikanagar. I have looked into the matter. In the case of private members, the question of laying a paper on the Table normally arises when a member quotes from a document and is called upon to lay it on the Table or if a question of privilege is involved and the member is required to substantiate the allegations made in that connection with documentary evidence. In the present case, Prof. Madhu Dandavate had neither quoted from the reports sought to be laid on the Table by him nor any question of privilege is involved. There was also no demand for the reports being laid on the Table. Moreover, no member has in the past been allowed to lay a document independent of any relevant business before the House.

In this context, I may point out that the interim report of the Wanchoo Committee on Direct Taxes which was treated by the Government as a secret document and which the Government thought would not be in public interest to lay on the Table, was allowed by the Speaker to be treated as a Paper laid on the Table since Shri Jyotirmoy Bosu, who had made the request, had not only referred to the Report but quoted from it during discussion on a motion regarding unprecedented rise in prices of essential commodities on 10th August, 1972.

Earlier, on March 3, 1965, Shri H. V. Kamath was allowed by the Speaker to lay on the Table a document purported to be a CBI report on Orissa Ex-Chief Ministers, etc. and also a Cabinet Sub-Committee findings thereon since the Member had quoted from the documents and there was a demand both from the Opposition and ruling party Mem-

bers that the documents be permitted to be laid on the Table.

In view of the position explained above, I am unable to give permission to Prof Dandavate to lay the reports on the Table. Next time I will see.

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur) : A submission, Sir. There is an inaccuracy in your statement. You say that there was no demand that the report should be laid on the Table of the House. I wish to point out to you that I have the proceedings of 8th April, 1985. There, no less a person than myself had demanded from Shri Buta Singh that this should be laid on the Table of the House. It is there.

It is there.....8th April, 1985.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You may give me the facts. I shall rectify it.

[English]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, I want to defend your dignity. A very wrong statement will go in your mouth.

MR. SPEAKER : I will rectify whatever is wrong. Authenticity will be observed.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Kindly expunge your own statement; You have made a wrong statement. I have heard you saying that nobody demanded that this particular report should be laid on the Table. I have got the proceedings of 8th April, 1985. It is on page No. 6498. I have said here lay it on the Table.

MR. SPEAKER : I am not referring to you. I am referring to the Wanchoo Committee.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : No. No. You are confusing between me, Jyotirmoy Bosu and Wanchoo.

SHRI AMAL DATTA (Diamond Harbour) : Unfortunately, you have been misled and misinformed.

MR. SPEAKER : Don't say these things. [English]

SHRI AMAL DATTA : You have been misled.

We are tied down by the rules. We have to go according to the rules.

MR. SPEAKER : Why misled ? I am going according to the records before me. I can make a mistake. I am a human being.

SHRI AMAL DATTA : We are all demanding that the report should be laid on the Table.

PROF. MADHU DANDEVATE : I don't say you are misled. Inadvertantly you are confused.

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Amal Datta, the problem is that you get excited.

SHRI AMAL DATTA : The problem is that you are misled and misinformed.

MR. SPEAKER : In the present case Prof. Dandavate has neither quoted from the report...

MR. SPEAKER : Again you are using that word. I do not know why you should get excited. If there is some sort of discussion and when it comes into that then we will consider. Why don't you understand this thing ?

PROF. MADHU DANDEVATE : At another place you have said that nobody has demanded.

SHRI AMAL DATTA : You have pointed out in your statement that nobody has demanded it.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please go through it, then we shall rectify. The mistake can be corrected.

MR. SPEAKER : It is an earlier question. I have already told you.

[English]

PROF. MADHU DANDEVATE : Shall I explain whatever is incorrect ?

SHRI AMAL DATTA : Now, I am demanding it.

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever is incorrect, we will rectify.

MR. SPEAKER : Why don't you understand this thing ?

SHRI AMAL DATTA : Let this be sorted out.

SHRI AMAL DATTA : If the only contention is that nobody has demanded it, we are demanding it now.

PROF. MADHU DANDEVATE : Anyway, Sir, today while speaking on Supplementary Demands I am going to refer to it.

MR. SPEAKER : Please use some sort of commonsense. If there is a discussion and if it is regarding that then you can demand and not otherwise.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : I shall go through it again.

SHRI AMAL DATTA : If we know the Report is there and it is being suppressed by the Government can we not demand it ?

[English]

When you will give to me then I will see accordingly.

MR. SPEAKER : My God, No. The biggest problem is that you do not read first and then talk.

Translation]

There is no bar on it.

PROF. MADHU DANDEVATE : Sir, in your statement it is said that there was also no demand for the report being laid on the Table. I quote :

"In the present case Prof. Madhu Dandavate had neither quoted from reports sought to be laid on the Table by him nor any question of privilege is involved. There was also no demand for the reports being laid on the Table."

It is not correct.

SHRI AMAL DATTA : Your statement is contradictory.

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. I always say and I have always said on the Floor of the House that I am a human being and if there is any mistake committed I am ready to own it. I am not an omnipotent God.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat) : All these precedents of Mr. Kamath, Prof. Dandavate and so on are cited by you in the background of the Government claiming that this is a matter of public interest. In the public interest they cannot lay it. Have they said in this particular case of Jyotirmoy Bosu that it is not in the public interest to lay the report ?

MR. SPEAKER : You can come and discuss with me in my Chamber. I cannot allow a discussion on my ruling on the Floor of the House. I am open to you any time.

(Interruptions)

SHRI AMAL DATTA : You are protecting them.

MR. SPEAKER : I am saying it openly. Your arguments are always misplaced. I have repeatedly requested you. If there is any mistake, I am ready to correct it. I do not feel any sort of let down in it.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : To put the record straight.....

MR. SPEAKER : No no. Later on please. Not now.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Is it a fact that it 1981 when in three parts, the reports were submitted by Shri Jyotirmoy Bosu.....

MR. SPEAKER : You may come to my room. I will discuss it with you. I will correct whatever I have said, if there is any wrong.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Your chamber is not a substitute for this Chamber.

MR. SPEAKER : It is not mine. It is yours.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER : Not allowed.

12.17 hrs.

MESSAGE FROM RAJYA SABHA

[English]

SECRETARY- GENERAL : Sir, I have to report the following message received from the Secretary- General of Rajya Sabha :—

"In accordance with the provisions of rule 127 of the Rules of Procedure and Conduct of Business in the Rajya Sabha, I am directed to inform the Lok Sabha that the Rajya Sabha, at its sitting held on the 3rd December, 1985, agreed without any amendment to the Citizenship (Amendment) Bill, 1985, which was passed by the Lok Sabha at its sitting held on the 20th November, 1985."

12.19 hrs.

COMMITTEE ON PRIVATE MEMBERS' BILLS AND RESOLUTIONS

Eighth Report

[English]

SHRI M. THAMBI DURAI (Dharma-puri) : I beg to present the Eighth Report (Hindi and English versions) of the Committee on Private Members' Bills and Resolutions.

*Not recorded.