

of assisting beneficiary families who were assisted during Sixth Plan but were not able to cross the poverty line, for no fault of theirs by providing supplementary assistance.

Against the targets of 11,49,945 and 20,40,000 in 1985-86 and 1986-87 the achievement in regard to second dose has been 9,25,280 and 10,59,687 (Provisional upto January, 1987) respectively.

12.00 hrs.

[*English*]

#### RULING BY SPEAKER ON QUESTION OF PRIVILEGE

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Hon'ble Members, I have received several notices of privilege under 222 as well as under Direction 115 in regard to the statements made by the Minister of State for Finance on the question of engaging the services of a foreign agency, namely, FAIRFAX GROUP, of the United States. I have also received several notices under rules 184 and 193 demanding a discussion on the subject or/and on the statement made by the Prime Minister in the House on 3 April.

Earlier, in response to the notices received under rule 193 from Prof. Madhu Dandavate and Sarvashri Jaipal Reddy and Ram Bahadur Singh on 24 March, 1987, I allowed a discussion on the subject on 31 March, 1987 because I strongly felt that such a discussion could not be barred and Parliament was entitled to know the full facts in the possession of Government. In reply to the discussion, the Minister of State for Finance had clarified the position and had tried to answer the various points raised by Members.

Subsequently, the newspapers published reports of an interview purported to have been given by the President of the Fairfax Group. On 3 April, 1987 S/Shri Jaipal Reddy and E. Ayyapu Reddy gave notices under Direction 115 pointing out what according to them, were the discrepancies in the Minister's statement read in conjunction

with the aforesaid interview. I also received notices of privilege from Prof. Madhu Dandavate and Shri Madhav Reddy on the same subject. I referred all these notices to the Minister of State for Finance for comments. The Minister, in his reply dated 3 April, 1987, pointed out that the only basis for the allegation was a news-item published in a daily paper purporting to be a statement of a foreign national. The Minister has stated that whatever he had said in reply to the debate in the House was based on the information and on the records available with the Government and there was no attempt or intention on his part to conceal the facts or to mislead the House.

Every Minister is a Member of Parliament, is part of Parliament and responsible to this House. Once he makes a statement on the floor of the House it is presumed that it is made with full sense of responsibility and it is to be accepted as such unless incontrovertible evidence to the contrary is brought before the House. I find that in the present case the Minister's statement is sought to be controverted only on the basis of certain statements by certain individuals as published in the newspapers. In the absence of any authentic evidence, I have to rely on the Minister's statement on the floor of the House. There is nothing to prove that the Minister made an incorrect statement or one deliberately to mislead the House. As such, I rule out all notices of breach of privilege on the Subject.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : When I am speaking, you would keep quiet.

[*English*]

when I am speaking, please sit down. Only what I am saying, just listen to that.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : So far as notices under Direction 115 received from S/Shri Jaipal Reddy and E. Ayyapu Reddy, are concerned, the Minister of State for Finance has reiterated in his letter of 6th April, 1987

that whatever he had said in the House on 31st March, 1987, was based on the information available with the Government in the Finance Ministry.

As members are aware, the Prime Minister made a statement...

*(Interruptions)*

AN HON. MEMBER : Not statement but announcement.

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever it is.

As members are aware, the Prime Minister made a statement in the House on 3rd April, 1987, announcing the appointment of a sitting Judge of the Supreme Court to go into the entire affair with a view to set all controversies at rest. After the Prime Minister's statement, several members stood up and wanted some clarifications. I pointed out that in the light of the specific provisions of rule 372, I could not allow any question to be raised. However, several members from both sides of the House continued to speak without my permission. I strongly deprecate the tendency on the part of the members to stand up in groups and impede the orderly conduct of business. This is most deplorable. In such a situation, the observations of the members cannot be recorded. While there is no question of expunction on my part of any portion of the Members' speeches, except what is unparliamentary, I would only reiterate that in such situations, nothing that is spoken without my permission can form part of the record of the House. I take this opportunity once again to clarify this position and would seek Members' cooperation in the matter.

After the Prime Minister's statement, I have received a notice of privilege under rule 222 from Shri Bhattam Sriramamurthy. I have also received notices under rule 184 from Shri Somnath Chatterjee and 25 other members seeking to discuss the issue. Notices under rule 193 have also been received from Shri Amal Datta, Shri Madhav Reddy, Prof. Madhu Dandavate and nine other Members. The points raised by the Members in these notices are :

(a) By appointing a Judge to inquire into the matter, a discussion on the subject in the House is intended to be barred;

and (b) Instead of instituting an enquiry by a sitting Judge of the Supreme Court, a Parliamentary Committee be asked to go into the entire affair,

As I have already said and I reiterate, this House is fully entitled to discuss all matters of public importance involving ministerial responsibility to this House. I, therefore, find that notices under Rules 184 and 193 for discussion on the Prime Minister's statement are both admissible. I leave it to the House to have a full discussion on the Prime Minister's statement either rule 184 or under rule 193. As far as I am concerned, the discussion can be held rightaway, if the House so desires. But before the discussion starts, if the Government desires to further clarify the statement made on Friday, they may do so.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : If you want to do it right now, I am ready. *(Interruptions)* Please sit down.

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT) : We welcome your decision to allow a discussion under rule 193 or rule 184, as the House pleases. We have absolutely no objection. We welcome that decision to discuss, and we are prepared for it. I would suggest that we can have it at 4 o'clock today itself. But before that, I would like to make it clear that the proposed enquiry by a sitting Judge of the Supreme Court with regard to the issues connected with Fairfax will be under the Commission of Inquiry Act, and its report will be laid before the House. Other details regarding the terms of reference, and the appointment of a particular Judge would be announced later. The notification in this connection would also be laid on the Table of this House. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : So, what do we do now ? At 4 o'clock ? Or, do we start it the day after tomorrow ?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): I have one submission. The entire Opposition's contention is that a single Judge enquiry will be a private enquiry.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: It is for you to decide.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Order, order please. You have a discussion on it. (*Interruptions*) Now please don't shout. Why are you shouting now unnecessarily? It is only a question of when you want to have a discussion. We are open for discussion. I only want your opinion as to when you want to have the discussion—either you want to have it just now, rightaway, or the day after. (*Interruptions*) Whatever it is.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: We can have it at 4 o'clock. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Order please...is it then at 4 o'clock?

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Okay—All right, at 4 o'clock. Mr. Bhagat, is there anything more?

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: Now, Sir, I want to express my apologies to you, and to the leaders of the Opposition for one mistake committed by me the other day, as a result of which some misunderstanding took place. Many Members of the House had come to me and told me that today, i.e. the 6th should be a closed day, because two holidays were there, and tomorrow is a holiday. I should have, in the normal course of practice, talked to the Opposition leaders. That day, somehow or the other I could not... (*Interruptions*)

SHRI NARAYAN CHOUBEY (Midnapore): He is always abnormal, Sir.

SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT: I express my regrets to you, and to the Chair. I had requested the Chair. Some misunderstanding

has been created, as if the Chair wanted to add one holiday, and Government...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: That is all right. Forget it.

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijayawada): Sir, I have given a notice. The tobacco growers in Andhra Pradesh are facing a crisis due to the non-purchase of tobacco.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: It is coming. I shall look into it. It will come.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Please, sit down What is it going on?

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: This perturbs me a lot. There can be nothing worse than this.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Kuppuswamy, will you sit down? This is too much. You are exceeding every limit. Is this the way to behave? I can listen to everything. There is no problem with me. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Why do you get so angry?

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please explain to me. It would not work. I am there for you all the time. (*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: I am with you, any time. You come to me, and I will take it up. Why should you shout like this? This is not a mad House.

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: Sir, I have given a notice. There

should be a discussion. The tobacco farmers are suffering.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : You can come and talk to me. Did I ever prevent you. ?

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : It will be done. Please, do not do so.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : You may please come and explain to me. I shall get it done.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : If you do not sit down, I will ask you to do something else. Please sit down.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirghat) : What time have you fixed for the discussion today ?

MR. SPEAKER : Four o' clock today.

[*Translation*]

SHRI C. JANGA REDDY (Hanamkonda) : The tobacco growers are facing difficulty. I have given a notice in this regard.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : You can come and discuss it with me, not like that.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Kumaramangalam, I have already told.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : How does it benefit us.

[*English*]

SHRI P. R. KUMARAMANGALAM (Salem) : We have given calling attention notice and we want to bring it to your notice, but it is not coming up.

MR. SPEAKER : I say, whatever you say I will do.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI P. R. KUMARAMANGALAM : CPWD engineers are on strike.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : What can I do ? You give some thing. You may give it under 377.

[*English*]

You can give it under 377 if you like.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

SHRI C. JANGA REDDY : You are also a farmer. The tobacco growers are facing difficulty.

MR. SPEAKER : I have already said that discussion on agricultural demands is coming up.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : Agricultural Demands for Grants are going to be discussed. That is why I am keeping quiet.

[*Translation*]

SHRI C. JANGA REDDY : I have given a notice. There should be a separate discussion on it.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : This is too much.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : The House should discuss the tobacco crisis.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : You cannot take this House for a ride. Mr. Madhav Reddy, you ask your members to behave. This is too much.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : If you do like that, it is not proper on your part. I have the highest regard for your party. But you are shouting at me.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : The tobacco growers of Andhra Pradesh are suffering.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I can do it but very properly, but not like this. This will not cut any ice with me.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Rao, you do not understand. We are going to discuss Agricultural Demands.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : Today there is a calling attention on civil aviation. What about farmers ? It is not there.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing will go on record, whatever the Hon. Members says, without my permission.

*(Interruptions)\*\**

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : We are walking out in protest against the discriminatory attitude...

*(Interruptions)\*\**

MR. SPEAKER : You may walk out. This is too much.

*(Interruptions)\*\**

MR. SPEAKER : This is too much. I never deny anything, but how can you force me like this ?

*(Interruptions)\*\**

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : Calling attention about civil aviation has been allowed today...

MR. SPEAKER : It concerns men's lives.

*(Interruptions)\*\**

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : What about suffering of the farmers ? Is this not important ?

*(Interruptions)\*\**

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down. Don't force me to name you.

Please withdraw from the House. I am also a farmer. I know.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Madhav Reddy, this is too much.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA  
RAO : I will go myself.

12.16 hrs.

*At this stage, Shri V. Sobhanadreeswara Rao left the House.*

*(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

SHRI C. JANGA REDDY : Please listen for a minute only.

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : I would not listen now.

*(Interruptions)*

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You may please explain to the Hon. Member. It is a very bad thing.

[English]

Mr. Janga Reddy, you go and sit down in your seat properly. Don't speak from the aisle.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : I have agreed. Did I ever disagree ?

[English]

I have never disagreed, but I cannot do it like this.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I can do it in the proper way.

[Translation]

SHRI C. JANGA REDDY : The tobacco growers are suffering.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever the Hon. member says is without my permission, and I will ask the member not to stand in the aisle but go back to his seat. Otherwise, I will ask him to withdraw from the House.

(Interruptions)\*\*

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Nobility has got its own limits. If you do, it is bad and if you do not do, it is bad. If you are hanged, it is bad; if you survive, it is bad. It is just like that one advises others, but does not follow himself.

12.13 hrs.

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

[English]

Annual Report and Review on the working of All India Federation of Cooperative Spinning Mills Ltd. Bombay for 1985-86 and National Federation of Labour Cooperative Ltd., New Delhi for 1985-86 etc. etc.

THE MINISTER OF AGRICULTURE (DR. G. S. DHILLON) : I beg to lay on the Table :

(1) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the All India Federation of Cooperative Spinning Mills Limited, Bombay, for the year 1985-86 along with Audited Accounts.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the All India Federation of Cooperative Spinning Mills Limited, Bombay, for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-4137/87]

(2) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions) of the National Federation of Labour Co-operatives Limited, New Delhi, for the year 1985-86 along with Audited Accounts.

(ii) A copy of the Review (Hindi and English versions) by the Government on the working of the National Federation of Labour Cooperatives Limited, New Delhi, for the year 1985-86.

[Placed in Library. See No. LT-4138/87]

(3) (i) A copy of the Annual Report (Hindi and English versions)