

[English]

I have already referred it to the Privileges Committee and they will take appropriate action. So simple it is.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down, I am going to give my ruling. It is so strange. Everything has got its limit. You are the hon. Members of the house. Please speak quietly. I shall do what you will dictate. I do what you say. The House is yours or mine ?

(Interruption)

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : Will you allow me for a minute because you have allowed everybody ?

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : First I should give the ruling. Did I ever prevent ? I only asked him to apologise and nothing else.

(Interruptions)

12.10 hrs.

ANNOUNCEMENT BY THE SPEAKER
INDIAN RE. EXPRESS CASE

[English]

Mr. SPEAKER : I have received a notice from Prof. Madhu Dandavate seeking to raise, through a point of order, the interpretation of the 'sub-judice' rule. Obviously, his reference is to my observations in the House yesterday regarding the INDIAN EXPRESS case. I had observed that Government had already filed a case in a court of Law and it was for the courts now to pronounce on the merits of the issue. I had also observed that I would not bar any discussion which is under the rules.

In this connection, I would like to draw the attention of the House to the report of the Committee of Presiding Officers (1968) where in it has been pointed out that the test of 'Sub-judice' should be that the matter sought to be raised in

the House is substantially identical with the one on which a court of law has to adjudicate. In such cases, discussion on the matter is postponed till judgement of the court is delivered. In the instant case, the matter is already before the High Court and the issue sought to be raised by the Member is, to my mind, substantially the same on which the court is required to adjudicate.

The Committee had further observed that the rule of 'sub-judice' has application only during the period when the matter is under active consideration of a court of law or courts-martial. That would mean as under :—

- (a) In criminal cases—from the time charge-sheet is filed till judgment is delivered;
- (b) In civil suits— from the time issues are framed till judgment is delivered;
- (c) Injunction petitions—from the time they are admitted till orders are passed.

Since I do not have the full facts of the case before me, the precise nature of proceedings in the High Court will have to be ascertained before I am in a position to give my ruling in the matter.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur) : One submission to you, Sir. Prof. Sahib,

MR. SPEAKER : If there is anything on this issue, then don't do it.

Then I will take it up later on.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : I want only clarification.....
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You come to me and I will give the clarification to you.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Only Clarification, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER : I will give the clarification tomorrow and discuss it with you.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, I have a clarification to seek.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : Please meet me tomorrow.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : No discussion now...

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur) : Sir, the Government has filed a suit and they have to tell you.....

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : I want only information about the ruling.

MR. SPEAKER : You give it to me and I will consider it.....

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : You may give it later on, I will definitely look into it.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : I want you to refer to the ruling of the Chair given on 9.5.1968.....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Not now, Sir...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Not now, Sir, I will let you know I have done that

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Goswami, your calling Attention has been accepted for tomorrow.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Gawahati) : Sir, you have given a Calling Attention for tomorrow but a very serious situation has developed and it cannot wait till tomorrow... (*Interruptions*).

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : What I can do...? An hon. Member from your side is already speaking.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Ask him to stop speaking.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER : Hon. Members, look here. If you can be just patient and stand in your places, it will be more appropriate and more honourable to you also...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Don't do like this. I talked to him. We had a meeting of the Business Advisory Committee yesterday. What has been put down for today, if the hon. Members can have it tomorrow, I can do it...

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me. This has to be done according to the time that is available. You have to be reasonable. I cannot be unreasonable. I have got no magic wand or magic lantern with which I can do it off and on. What you, Mr. Goswami, wanted, I have done it.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Please listen to me what I am saying.

MR. SPEAKER : I can, but the hon. Members must stand in their own places. You can give it to me.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Sir, a serious situation has arisen.....

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : The limits are being crossed by you,

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Sir, a serious situation has developed which cannot wait till tomorrow because tomorrow is the election.

MR. SPEAKER : I do not know. I cannot do it. This cannot be solved even now.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Listen to me, Sir. Why don't you allow the facts to go on record ? I have given notice, Sir, Two police forces are standing face to face. The CRP, and the BSF have been deployed by the Central Government, and tomorrow morning the elections are..... (*Interruptions*).

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing goes on record... (*Interruptions*) **

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : First ask him to stop speaking.

[*English*]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : I shall control them, Sir.

Mr. SPEAKER : Control them.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : I Shall control them provided you permit me to have my say.

MR. SPEAKER : I have already permitted you.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : All right, Sir. Tomorrow is the date of the Nagaland elections.

MR. SPEAKER : Right.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Now, the Government of Nagaland have tried to set up seventeen polling booths within the territorial jurisdiction of Assam... (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : May I just interrupt you for a minute ? Whatever falls under the purview of the Election Commission, that you should not raise here.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : I am not raising about the Election Commission, Sir.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : Let our views be exchanged.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : The Central Government has deployed BSF and CRP in that area. I am not raising the Election Commission matter. The Central Government has made an announcement that come what may, election will take place. Now two forces are standing side by side-BSF and CRP, and the Assam Police. It is not a matter of Election Commission.....(*Interruptions*.)

It is an explosive situation. If there is a law and order problem, the election is to be postponed. That is not a matter of Election Commission. The Central Government has taken a partisan attitude., (*Interruptions*.)

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot allow a discussion on the conduct of the elections.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : I am not raising a discussion on the conduct of the election.

MR. SPEAKER : This is what it is, Sir. Now, what the Election Commission has drawn up, I cannot do anything about it. I had a promise with you that I will get this border problem discussed and that I have done. Nothing more.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Sir, you had informed the Home Minister last week but no reply has come from the Home Minister.

MR. SPEAKER : I have already done it. Tomorrow it will be taken up.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Tomorrow is the election, Sir. What is the use of doing it tomorrow ? (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot do anything more, Sir.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : Sir, the established position of law is.....
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot do anything more, Sir.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : You can, Sir. The House can.

MR. SPEAKER : What can I do ?
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have put a discussion. That is all.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : The House is the competent authority.....
[(Interruptions)

(Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : There is no use getting annoyed with me. I have already allowed the Calling Attention for tomorrow.
(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Yes, I have done. But it also requires the presence of the hon. Minister.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : How can I do within a minute ? Do I possess any magic ward ?
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Wherefrom can I get it done ?
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have called for the Minister also and have done everything. The purpose will be served only when a thing is discussed.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You tell me, what can I do ? I am prepared.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : If you want to do a thing, do that properly. Is this the way to get a thing done ?

[English]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : What else to do, Sir ? The Home Minister has not responded.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will adjourn the House if you do like this.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing forms part of the record. I have not allowed anybody.

(Interruptions) **

MR. SPEAKER : I have not barred any discussion at all.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : If you do like this, I shall adjourn the House.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have no other option but to adjourn the House.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : What can I do ?
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I am going to adjourn the House.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : What I have to say is that this is your House.

[Translation]

If you behave like this, it is very unbecoming of you. If I prevent you.....
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please at least listen.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : When have I prevented you ?
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Dinesh, I have not prevented you.....
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have not prevented you and in accordance with what you said...
(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I shall have to name all these Members.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI : You name all these Members. We do not mind.

MR. SPEAKER : All right. If you want, I will name them.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have put it down for tomorrow.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have not allowed anybody to go on record.

[Interruptions]*

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : This will not do.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You are seeing that

(Interruptions)

Opposition leaders are also sitting here.

I have not stopped any one.

[English]

I have already allowed discussion.

(Translation)

I have not at all stopped anyone. What else I can do.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You are forcing me to resort to dictatorship.

[English]

If you want to murder democracy, than I can't help.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing goes on record.

(Interruptions)**

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot say anything to anyone. What was in my power, I have done.

(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER : I am waiting for you. I cannot force anyone. He said to me.

(English)

And I immediately took notice and I put it down for tomorrow.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Then what do you lose ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me. You are getting angry. What I can do ? This much I would like to tell you that without the (requisitioning the Election Commission, the CRP or the B.S.F. cannot be sent there.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : If they have sent, I have no knowledge of it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : This had happened in the case of Haryana. For Haryana, they had requisitioned the force. The Home Minister is here. If he wants to say anything in this matter, I have no objection.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : This does not behave you. You are harming yourself. (Interruptions) That is why it was set aside. Therefore, I say if it sent without their consent, That is why election was held in Garhwal.

(Interruptions) Are forces sent there to maintain law and order or for other purposes ?

[English]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur) : Why don't you say that the Home Minister should clarify the situation?
(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : He is sitting here. I have never prevented him.

[English]

He is always there and I allow any hon. Member to make a statement and also the Minister in charge to make a statement. What I could do, I have already done. When he makes any statement, I have no problem.

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI BUTA SINGH) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want to...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : But before he starts I would like to say one thing that I did not like this.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : If you go back to your seats, then I will allow him to make a statement.

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I don't allow.
(Interruptions)**

MR. SPEAKER : It is most shameful.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I always deplore it. It is always deplorable. I have got no respect for this type of misdeeds and hooliganism.

(Interruptions)

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : They are holding the House to ransom for nothing.

MR. SPEAKER : You are right.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Order, order. No cross-talking. Please sit down.
(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please sit down... Stop him.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : What is all this 'tamaisha' ?
(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Let us hear him.

S. BUTA SINGH : Mr. Speaker, Sir, ..
(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Kindly listen to me.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : If you go on making a noise, how the proceedings will be conducted ?
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You have seen as to how things have gone out of control.

AN HON. MEMBER : It is for the good.

MR. SPEAKER : What good is this ? This way democratic structure of the country will crumble down.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Kindly listen to me. Please take your seats.
(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : New things are coming up one after the other and these are continuing. At my instance, Shri Arif has apologised. He said that he had committed a mistake. I don't know what has happened there and I could not follow

**Not recorded.

what was said there due to the extreme noise.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me. I want to say...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Tantiji, you are losing your temper. The shift will get torn and that will cause loss to you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : The point is that if he has said anything objectionable to him, I have not heard it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Kindly listen to me.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN (Babraich) : You have seen that he has left his seat.

MR. SPEAKER : Kindly listen to me. Kindly stop speaking after my preventing you to do so. You make me judge and at the same time do not listen to me.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : If impartial verdicts are given, there will be no pandemonium. You hear my voice but do not hear their voice.

MR. SPEAKER : I hear everyone. I will not come under any one's pressure.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI (Ghosi) : May I know why Mr. Tewary left his seat?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Let me speak in this matter. May be I am going to say on that very matter. Mr. Arif whatever I heard, I have told you.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN : He should also apologise for it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have accepted. Even if I do not accept, please listen to me. I acknowledge that you accepted it. I have been telling that you accepted. I saw him rising up and advancing. He has threatened him in this way.

It is not only to-day, earlier also he has done this. I will neither favour you nor him.

[English]

I do not do it...I do not know what you have said, Mr. Tewary. You must explain.

[Translation]

Hon. Members sitting there know very well what happened. They took menacing steps towards each other. It does not behave any body.

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY (Buxar) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, what preceded this was really very unfortunate...*(Interruptions)*. What happens in Nagaland and Assam about the.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : No, No. You may please express only your views.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : How to deal with these people?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : This is not the way to decide things. If punishment is to be given to some body he must be given opportunity to explain. There is a method for everything. If making uproar is the only way, you may go on doing so. I can adjourn the House for the whole day.

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : I will just explain to you. As the hon. Members came out from their seats and started squatting in the Well of the House, I was

just arguing with Shri Goswami and I heard something from this side, some very unmentionable words.

(Interruptions)

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : I never lacked any decorum and dignity while speaking in the House and I did not utter a word which is objectionable towards the hon. Member. As I was going out, I merely said...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Just wait a minute. Let me hear.

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : I did not mention even a word which can be taken objection to. I merely said that "since you belong to our party and if you have such views—"this, I think, I said merely because I felt when I heard those words which I cannot repeat in the House; I should not. No Member in the House with any sense of dignity, with any concern for the dignity of the House should repeat it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Did you threaten him ?

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : No, no, not at all. How can I think of threatening anybody. I will be the last person in the House to hold out threat to any Hon. Member. I merely said, "since you are holding such views, why don't you go and join your friends that side ?" This is all, I said. And in return, I got barrage of abuses which each Member sitting there will testify. After all, this House has to be run by you with the cooperation of the Hon. Members. We have been watching for some time that in the name of small grievances, proceedings of the House are being stalled. This is an organised attempt to paralyse the House.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I could not hear what he was saying. But I was seeing

that there was menacing step towards him.

(Interruptions)

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : I did not take menacing step. I was going out and merely pleading with him, "if you hold these views, it is no use paralysing the proceedings of the House. Please go and sit on that side." I was merely walking.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Whoever does it, it is the same.

(Interruptions)

PROF. K.K. TEWARY : When they all came, you remember, when Hon. Members from the opposition.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN (Lalganj) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have a point of order. I want to say something to you. If you do not allow this, how this House will run ?

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I think you are not listening to me. The House does not seem to be in a mood to discuss. They are just rambling. We could sort out things by mutual consultation and by mutual acceptance of each other's points of view—that is what the discussion is. If you are not prepared to do it, I adjourn the House till 2 p.m. and then we shall just sit together and find out some means to work.

12.41 hrs.

The Lok Sabha adjourned for Lunch till Fourteen of the Clock

— — —

The Lok Sabha re-assembled after Lunch at thirty one minutes past Fourteen of the Clock.

[MR. SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

[English]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolpur) : On a point of order, Sir, you

adjourned the House till 2 o'clock. We assembled here. A large number of Members were present. The quorum was there. We found that the Secretary-General announced a further adjournment till 2.30, when the learned Deputy Speaker was sitting here. I don't think anybody can exercise the power of even adjournment without being a Member of the House. We have elected you to the Chair. Therefore, it is Chair's prerogative to adjourn the House when the House is going on.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa) : That should be from the Chair.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : When the House is prorogued, only the President can call it. Otherwise it is only the Speaker's right to call it. When there is quorum and when the Deputy Speaker is present, the Secretary-General announces the adjournment...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Now listen to me.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : This is a very serious matter.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me. If I take action without giving due thought, I will be easily caught by you. This action was taken after due consideration.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : We have no attitude of catching hold of anybody. It is a question of the dignity of the House.

[English]

I am not interested in catching anybody.

MR. SPEAKER : No, no; I didn't mean by that yourself. I meant the other way. It is not that you wanted to catch anybody.

[Translation]

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : You had said about catching a point,

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I have got some precedents. I have got some things. According to that, we decided it.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : But your decision will have to be announced in a proper manner.

MR. SPEAKER : That's what he did. It was not out of order, I did it and I have full responsibility. According to the procedures and precedents, I did it. Don't worry about that. I will take care of that. I am not going to antagonise you.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : I have ample experience. We have never seen this. I can understand your decision being announced by a notice on the notice board. It could have been a notice on the notice board.

MR. SPEAKER : Look here. I will not try to confuse the rules. I will be the last person to do that. Let me read out to you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Tanti, now I am reading it. Why don't you listen now ?

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Is there any rule ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : There are precedents that I can convey a message to the House that this has been postponed. So, this is not out of the way that I have done.

SHRI SURESH KURUP (Kottayam) : Only through the Deputy Speaker...

MR. SPEAKER : I know what I can do.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I have got the proceedings. There are so many, you see.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : It is my discretion. I did it on precedents and according to conventions.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Only one clarification. We are not disputing that you have taken a decision. But when the House assembles here with a quorum, then how is that decision of yours to be communicated when Deputy Speaker is present ?

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : Communication may be by a notice on the notice board.

MR. SPEAKER : You are a very fine gentleman, Sir. You just listen to me and I will explain to you. There is no problem. A meeting of the BAC continued till beyond 12.15 hours. At 12.20 hours, the Secretary-General informed Members in the House that the Speaker had told him that House would meet at 12.45 hours. This is what is going on.

(Interruptions)

SHRI G.M. BANATWALLA (Ponnani) : Was the Deputy Speaker present at that time ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Banatwalla, I know that... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Now listen to me. Let us now be logical. You are shouting. Well, I could have done it. I knew that the Hon'ble Deputy Speaker was there. The House would have assembled.....I knew it.

(Interruptions)

SHRI G.M. BANATWALLA : It does not look good. Don't do it again. He should have done it.

MR. SPEAKER : I knew it; he could have done it. Why are you getting agitated unnecessarily ?...I have done it. We did it earlier and we can do it again. But this is the proper method we adopted.

*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER : Not allowed. Please sit down. That is O.K.
*(Interruptions)***

MR. SPEAKER : No.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, just now, when you asked to clarify the position, he levelled such charges against me. It, therefore, becomes my first duty to clarify the position.

MR. SPEAKER : You give me in writing. I will allow you.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Not in writing. When you allow one hon. Member to make his statement, it becomes your first duty to allow other hon. Member also to make his statement.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, the hon. Member has levelled the charges against me. In such a situation you should allow me also to clarify my position.

MR. SPEAKER : You may say what you want.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have been elected to this House for the fourth time...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Now you may please keep quiet and let him say what he wants...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI RAM DHAN : If these people are not stopped.

MR. SPEAKER : I am already asking them to stop speaking.

SHRI RAM DHAN : If you go through the records of 6th Lok Sabha, you will see that I have never said objectionable words. It is in the records. A very untoward incident took place to-day. ...*(Interruptions)*. My life is in danger. When you adjourned this House and left, I was surrounded by people in this House. They were 4 to 5 Members.
(Interruptions)

[English]

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH) : On a point of order, Sir... (*Interruptions*). I am explaining to the Speaker. How can you object to it ?

AN HON. MEMBER : Under what rule ?

S. BUTA SINGH : Speaker's permission is the rule. He has permitted me. (*Interruptions*).

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : I ask for the point of order. If that is not there, I will give my ruling.

[English]

S. BUTA SINGH : My humble submission to you is that the hon. Member was offering his personal explanation and for that there is a procedure and that procedure is given in the Book. That should be according to that procedure... (*Interruptions*). That is what I am saying. Why don't you listen ?

[Translations]

MR. SPEAKER : Why do not you let me listen ?

(*Interruptions*)

[English]

S. BUTA SINGH : Is this the way we will run the House, that they can dictate anything and we cannot even refer to the procedure.. (*Interruptions*).

[Translation]

SHRI RAJ KUMAR RAI : Mr. Speaker, Sir, these people want that nothing they have said should go on record.

MR. SPEAKER : You may please sit down

(*Interruptions*)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen. Rule 357 reads :

"A member may, with the permission of the Speaker, make a personal explanation although there is no question before the House; but in this case no debatable matter may be brought forward, and no debate shall arise.

Now, what do you object to ?

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF FOOD AND CIVIL SUPPLIES (SHRI H. K. L. BHAGAT) : I object because he is not making any personal explanation. He can explain something said about him. But he is making an absolutely new allegation that after the House adjourned...

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please do not talk. Resume your seat.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Bhagat, Shri Ram Dhan, please listen to me.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, the treatment I got in this House.....

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me. Whatever you said and someone else said to you in this House, you may narrate that in good words. Thereafter I shall see what could be done

SHRI RAM DHAN : I am referring to the same thing.

MR. SPEAKER : No, not the things that happened after the adjournment. First of all you may narrate whatever took place in the House. We can take up outside things later.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I want to tell about what took place in the chamber.

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE
MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY
AFFAIRS (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKS-
HIT) : Nothing took place in the House.

MR. SPEAKER : I shall listen to
others' views also as also to you. Please
resume your seat.

[English]

You will get my permission. I will
listen to you also...

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker,
Sir, I have been assaulted. Should I not
even make a mention of it ?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to me.
I am now concerned with the present
moment. If you talk about outside
things.....

SHRI RAM DHAN : I am not talking
of outside things. I am talking about an
incident that took place in the chamber.

[English]

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK(Panaji) :
He cannot make a false statement.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Why do you not
allow me to handle ?

[English]

Now I am doing it, I do not want any
advocacy at this stage. I can take case
of it.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Please let me do.
I shall talk,

[English]

I am talking to Shri Ram Dhan. Let
me talk to him.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Shri Ram Dhan,
you may talk about what has happened
while the House was in session. About
the incident that took place afterwards
that somebody made an assault on you,
that you give in writing to me.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I am mentioning
the same thing.

[Translation]

SHRI VIDYA CHARAN SHUKLA
(Mahasamund) : Mr. Speaker, Sir, I want
to say that if any hon. Member is attacked
inside or outside the Parliament, he has
every right to tell about that.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I am also saying the
same thing.

[English]

But that is not a personal explana-
tion. Personal explanation is some thing
about which he is wrongly implicated.

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK : If a
person has any allegations to make, under
Rule 353, notice has to be given.....
(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
I am on a point of order. Mr. Tewary has
made an allegation against him. Has he
given any notice to you ?

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : Kindly listen to me.
Personal explanation is given only when
there is any allegation against someone.

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN :
Shri Tewary had mark the allegation.

MR. SPEAKER : I am also saying the
samething. If any allegation has been made
against him, he can repudlate that and
that is why he has been allowed.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You sit down. I
have heard what you have said and I am
aware of it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Naik, if you don't lose temper then I will be able to do my work.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Please listen to him. Mr. Ramdhan, please speak.

SHRI RAMDHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, first let an atmosphere be created in which it becomes possible for me to speak.

14.45 hrs.

PERSONAL EXPLANATIONS BY
MEMBERS

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You may speak freely. Whatever allegation has been made against you, you can tell about, it and refute it.

SHRI RAM DHAN (Lalganj) : I was about to say the same thing when there was pavdemonium *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Order, Order. Now finish the matter quickly.

SHRI RAM DHAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, Shri Tewary has alleged in his statement that I have hurled unprintable abuses against him.

SHRI C. MADHAV REDDI (Adilabad) : Unspeakable.

MR. SPEAKER : It is the same thing.

SHRI RAM DHAN : I want to say that the whole country knows those persons who are habitual offenders. And if I have said anything like this.....

(Interruptions)

[English]

PROF. K.K. TEWARY (Buxar) : You give me one minute.

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : You will also give your explanation.

(Interruptions)

SHRI RAM DHAN : On oath I say that whatever I have said he may repeat it. *(Interruptions)* .. I only told him as to why he should behave like this and because of such kind of behaviour he has apo gised in the House in the past and removed from the Council of ministers. This much I have certainly said. This enraged him so much that had hon. Minister Shri Sontosh Mohan Dev not intervened and made him set Shri Tewary could have gone to any extent. I don't want to say anything more in this regard. I don't want to add anything more to the remarks you have made. I want to say one thing more. You have allotted me seat here and my division number is also here. Still Shri T. Basheer and two-three other Members came to me from behind and pressurised me to change my seat and go to the other side.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will make the recommendation. You are a Member of the Congress Party. Why do you make a noise.

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (Panaji) : This is like a school boy's complaint.

[Translation]

SHRI RAM DHAN : About what are you going to recommend ? Kindly give your ruling.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I accept that whatever you have said in the House is not unparliamentary, or it is not an abuse or it has not been said with mala fide intentions. I accept it. Please sit down...

(Interruptions)

[English]

SHRI SURESH KURUP (Kottayam) : There cannot be any debate on personal explanation.

(Interruptions)