

12.00 hrs.

MOTION RE: SUMMONING THE ATTORNEY GENERAL

[English]

PROF MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): Arising out of your action, I want to say something so that we can implement it. You had referred the matter to the Attorney-General. We learn that the Home Minister had written to both the Presiding authorities of the Parliament that they had already consulted the Attorney-General; and then you sought the opinion. Therefore, since your ruling is based on the opinion that you privately secured from the Attorney-General, I want to seek your permission to move a motion which you allowed yesterday.

MR. SPEAKER: There is no point of order.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: You told Mr. Jaipal Reddy that he can seek to move a motion inviting the Attorney-General.

MR. SPEAKER: Not in this connection.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): I have also tabled a motion. (Interruptions)

PROF P.J. KURIEN (Idukki): In Kerala, the lives of three MLAs are in danger because of the utterly callous attitude of the Marxist Government and agitation is going on. It is something against Parliamentary democracy. You should do something. You should express concern for the lives of those MLA. The Home Minister is here. You direct the Home Minister to make a statement. (Interruptions)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Government had already consulted the Attorney-General.

MR. SPEAKER: Might be...(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Why do you get angry? I will look into it. Please sit down.

[English]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat): Did you receive my motion?

MR. SPEAKER: Yes Sir, I did.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SATYAGOPAL MISRA (Tamluk): Yesterday after giving the ruling. ....\*\* ...

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH): This is the greatest insult on the Chair. I take very serious objection to this remark. He cannot comment on the Chair like that. This is devoid of decency. This is highly unparliamentary. This should not be allowed to go on record. This is not a question of your person. This is an insult on the Chair.

MR. SPEAKER: What can I do about it?

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Let us be calm.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I do not know...

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I cannot bring him to his senses. It is something which he should have realised as to what he is talking about. This is something derogatory.

*(Interruptions)**[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER: You should have a little bit of understanding. It makes no difference to me.

*[English]*

I am not me; I am you. I am representing you. I might be doing something which I think is right. If I do something wrong, you throw me out. But as long as I am here, I have to do according to what I think and not what you think. It is so simple.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: I was making a submission. Yesterday you had explained that if the Attorney-General has to be invited here, there is a procedure.

SHRIBASUDEB ACHARIA: Yesterday you assured us. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I never assured anything. I can only say about the Attorney-General also, that there is a method; there are simple rules. I never challenged that. I am doing something. Let me do it. Let us be peaceful. I have got that motion. You asked me yesterday whether the Government has done it or not. I am not responsible for the Government. I am only responsible for my action. I can only seek the advice according to the Constitution.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Whether the Government had written to the Presiding Officers of Parliament that they have already consulted the Attorney-General?

MR. SPEAKER: I am not concerned with that. I do not know.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: No. Nothing doing. If I

have got it in my office, I would have put it straight there.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: That letter was shown to the Leaders of Opposition in the Rajya Sabha,

MR. SPEAKER: I do not know. It is not to me. You should take my word here. If I have got, I would have put it before you. Why should I hide it? There is no question.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Mahbunagar): Thank for your clarifying.

PROF. MADHU DANAVATE: There is discrimination between the two Presiding Authorities.

MR. SPEAKER: Might be. I am the least concerned about this. I am concerned with what I am doing. Now the question is there are four ways to call the Attorney-General. Firstly, he can come to the House himself, if he wants to, on any question. Secondly, the Government can call him to give his advice to the House on any matter. Thirdly, the House can call him by adopting a motion to that effect. That is now with you, if you want to call him. The fourth one is for me, whether I call him or take his advice. That is for me to do it. That I have already done. Now, if you want him for any other action, it is for you, because on this I have given my ruling. I heard all about it in the House. I consulted whatsoever books or precedents or rules I could. I consulted the Attorney General on my own. I had written to him; I have got it in writing. That is with me. I have gone according to that. Now if you want to do it, you put a motion. Let the House decide.

PROF. MADHU DANAVATE: I have given a motion...*(Interruptions)*

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: I have given a motion.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: On certain points, we want to seek clarifications from the Attorney-General.

MR. SPEAKER: Nothing, on that score you cannot, but otherwise you can.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: With due respect, the Attorney-General giving his advice to the Parliament is not the same as his advice given privately to you. that you can do, you can also ask him, but he must come in the Parliament. I have given a motion for that...*(Interruptions)*

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S BUTA SINGH): Sir, before this motion is moved in this House, I would like to make a brief submission. This is a matter which has been gone into by this very august House yesterday in the form of a breach of privilege. All the aspects of this matter have been gone into...*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MANDHU DANDAVATE: Privilege is different; that is for misleading the House.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: That is different.

S. BUTA SINGH: The House has expressed itself yesterday in a greater detail and at the end, you were kind enough to give your ruling which is final; You have already consulted the Attorney General and according to the rules, you have given your ruling yesterday. Now, for this House to send for the Attorney General and getting his opinion will tantamount to upsetting the ruling given by the hon. Speaker. Therefore, at this point of time, we are not in favour of calling the Attorney General. After having consulted him, you have given a ruling which is final in this House. Therefore, it is another political move of the opposition parties to reopen the issue which has been finally settled through the ruling of the hon. Speaker... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: The hon. Home Minister is apprehending that if the Attorney General comes here and gives his advice, it may lead to upsetting your ruling. Why is he making a presumption like that? It may lead to upholding your ruling and strengthening your ruling. Why is he saying like that?

MR. SPEAKER: Please move your motion.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: I beg to move:

"That the House resolves to invite the Attorney General to the House to give his considered opinion as to whether or not the Thakkar Commission documents laid on the Table so far, constitute the full Report, as claimed by the Government."

MR. SPEAKER: Motion moved:

"That the House resolves to invite the Attorney General to the House to give his considered opinion as to whether or not the Thakkar Commission documents laid on the Table so far, constitute the full Report, as claimed by the Government."

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Since he has moved his motion, within one minute I want to quote five precedents. They are very important.

MR. SPEAKER: I accept that they have been called earlier.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Not only that, on the issue on which ruling had been given by the Speaker...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: No discussion.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Please allow us to make submissions.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: No submissions, nothing doing.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, I am on a point of order.

MR. SPEAKER: No point of order.

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: This discussion has to precede the motion.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Why we want the Attorney General to be called that needs to be explained..*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Under what rule I am denied the opportunity to make a few observations in support of the Motion? I have given an identical Motion and I want to argue it.

MR. SPEAKER: No question.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Are you admitting it under Rule 184? If a motion is admitted under Rule 184, in that case when the motion is moved, we have a right to say something in support of the motion.

MR. SPEAKER: I have already admitted his Motion.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I had asked him, not you.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: You cannot shut us down like that.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: That is all right. Whosoever moves the motion..*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: No, I am not shutting you down. *(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Under rule 184 and Article 88 of the constitution..*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: If I had to shut down, why should I have allowed it.

*[English]*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, before the Motion is put to vote allow us to make submissions.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: In order that the House might apply its mind, we want to argue it..*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: I have given an identical Motion. Please permit me to make a few observations in support of the Motion.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Under what Rule are you preventing us from making observations?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Why don't you allow some Members to express themselves on this?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I have a right to tell the House as to why the Motion should be supported. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: How is the House to form an opinion if Members are not allowed?

MR. SPEAKER: Nobody is allowed.

*(Interruptions)\**

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Sir, when you permitted the Home Minister to oppose the Motion then you must permit the Members on this side to speak in support of the Motion. *(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have said that I have admitted it.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Just for a minute order, order, I am working. Why are you disturbing me? Let me handle the situation.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Shri Ram Singh, will you do me a favour. What has to be done now. I have already admitted it, what more do you want now?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: I want to express my views.

MR. SPEAKER: What do you want to say, I give you two minutes.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please, sit down. I will listen to you also.

*(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Sir, before Prof. Dandavate speaks, I may only point out that you were not only kind enough to admit my motion, but you permitted the Home Minister to oppose it. Therefore, why should you not allow some Members on this side to speak? *(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Two minutes have been given to him.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Now, please sit down for two minutes. Pleases it down.

*(Interruptions)*

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I am thankful to you for having confirmed the rules. There is reason why I am supporting the motion moved by Shri Indrajit Gupta. I have given an identical motion...

THE MINISTER OF HOME AFFAIRS (S. BUTA SINGH): What is he supporting when the motion is yet to be moved?

MR. SPEAKER: No, He has already moved the motion.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Kindly tell the Home Minister that the motion is already moved.

MR. SPEAKER: Yes. He has already moved his motion.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I want to point out to you that there are certain issues involved in this motion which will set up a precedent for the future. Firstly, while opposing this motion, the Home Minister has said that you have already consulted the Attorney General and you have given the ruling. Let me go on record that as far as the speaker consulting the Attorney General is concerned, it is his private affair—affair in a good sense, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Let him say whatever he likes. It is his view, not mine. Why are you

shouting?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Therefore, the House as a House has the right to adopt the motion inviting the Attorney General to come over here and elucidate his views and allow us to seek clarifications. Sir, in support of my contention I would like to bring it to the notice of the House through you that on 25.2.1950 when Shri M.C. Setalvad was the Attorney General, he was here when the Preventive Detention Bill was discussed.

MR. SPEAKER: I have seen it. I knew it. It is all right.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: On 9.5.1953 also Shri Setalvad was here when the Vindhya Pradesh Legislative Assembly (Prevention of Disqualification) Bill was discussed. Again on 28.2.1956, Shri Setalvad came to the House to give his opinion on the Sales Tax Validation Bill. Shri Daphtary also came here on 29.4.1963 in connection with the Compulsory Deposits Bill. So, my contention is that independent of the rulings given by the Speaker, independent of the views held by the Government and independent of the views held by the members of the Opposition, he has been invited here not only to express his views but also to answer when the members want his clarifications. Even that is permitted.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have accepted it.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Therefore, through you I want to persuade the majority in the House not to reject the motion but to accept it in the best traditions of this House. (*Interruptions*)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF EXTERNAL AFFAIRS (PROF. K.K. TEWARI): Sir, I am on a point of order. Prof. Madhu Dandavate was allowed a point of order and in the guise of that point of order, he was questioning your ruling. This is unprecedented. This has never happened in the House.

MR. SPEAKER: No please. It was not a point of order.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Why can't you keep quiet. I will myself listen to all the things.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

MR. SPEAKER: Mr. Tewari, for your information, my dear friend, it was not a point of order. I allowed him to speak.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Yes. Mr. Acharia, do you have anything more to add?

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: How can I allow every body? Professor Sahib has already had his say.

[*English*]

SHRIBASUDEBACHARIA: Sir, we are not discussing your ruling here. Yesterday also, before you gave your ruling, we pointed out that the Attorney General must be invited.

MR. SPEAKER: That is over. Do you have anything more to add?

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI T. BASHEER (Chirayinkil): How long will they take the time of the House?

MR. SPEAKER: Do you want to make it longer? Please sit down.

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (Panaji): Under what rule is he permitted? Have you framed some other rules for the Opposition?

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I have allowed him. You take your seats.

SHRI T. BASHEER: No Sir.

MR. SPEAKER: What no Sir? I ask you to sit down. I want you to take your seat.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK: There are many important matters to be discussed. The discussion on Bodo Agitation has been postponed. How long will they go on wasting the time of the House? *(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER: Listen, you are insisting. It was to take 5 minutes, now it will take 5 hours.

*[English]*

The question is that I know perfectly well that we are not discussing the things that we ought to. We have got the Budget also. But the time is passing away. But I also know which is important. I know everything. Still I have to act accordingly and see that this House might run. Please help me in it.

SHRI T. BASHEER: But you have al-

ready disposed of that matter. That are still persisting...*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please sit down. I know it. I am trying to do it. And let me do it.

SHRI T. BASHEER: Under what rule are they permitted? *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: Please take your seat. I overruled you. What is this? Mr. Minister, can you ask him to sit down? Yes Mr. Acharia, do you have anything more to add?

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, in support of the Motion moved by Shri Indrajit Gupta, I want to make a submission. Yesterday also we pointed out that the Attorney General of India be invited...

MR. SPEAKER: That has been already said. Say if there is something more.

*[Translation]*

You do not talk about commission. You have to talk about motion.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: He should be invited. Before you gave your ruling I pointed out that there are some points on which we want to seek clarifications from him.

MR. SPEAKER: That is over now.

*[Translation]*

Bhatiaji please sit down calmly. Shri Bhatiaji, why are you doing like this?

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, there are a number of precedents.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I have heard you. There is nothing more you are adding.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, before you had consulted the Attorney General, the Government had consulted him.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: For God sake, please sit down now. Why are you wasting the time?

[*English*]

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: That letter was not shown to you.

MR. SPEAKER: That is all right. Why should it be shown to me? I don't understand.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: But it was shown to the Chairman of the other House.

MR. SPEAKER: Might be. I do not know. I am concerned with myself.

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI (Guwahati): I have given a notice also for summoning the Attorney General to the House in exercise of our rights under Article 88 of the Constitution.

MR. SPEAKER: I agree with you. What is the point?

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: The legal point is whether the Parliament has the right to ask the Government to place the documents of a Report on which the discussion is based. After all the...

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Tell something new.

[*English*]

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: You have

given a ruling that this is the only Report. I want to know from the Attorney General this legal point where the executive is accountable...

MR. SPEAKER: That is what the Motion is for.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: You have concluded.

Now I put the question...

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: I am not questioning your ruling. I am only pointing out the inherent power of the Parliament to call the executive.

MR. SPEAKER: I have already told you that I have read it. There is no problem. Why are you repeating it all the time?

SHRI DINESH GOSWAMI: Therefore, the Motion should be put to vote.

MR. SPEAKER: That is what I am doing. You are not letting me to do it. I am doing it.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: But Sir, your judgement should not be prejudiced by the Home Minister saying that if the Attorney General is called here, your ruling may be upset.

MR. SPEAKER: I am not prejudiced by anybody. I am leaving it to the House because now it is the property of the House.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Why are they afraid that the Attorney General will upset your ruling?



MR. SPEAKER: I do not know. Please sit down.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: He said it.

MR. SPEAKER: I am not judging anybody. Nor do I want the Parliament to be judged. It is all right.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: He has not taken him seriously.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Is there any other point? Please speak, what have you to say?

[*English*]

SHRIS. JAIPAL REDDY: You have the ruling yesterday. But today...

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Please let me know, what you want to say.

[*English*]

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: Today, we want to seek clarifications...

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have heard it. Tell something new.

[*English*]

SHRIS: JAIPAL REDDY: Not in regard to your ruling Sir, but in regard to the inherent power of Parliament to have access to the documents on the basis of which that Report was prepared.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I have already seen it.

You are wasting time for nothing.

[*English*]

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY: I want to know whether any discussion by the House would be intelligible, without referring to those documents. We would like to seek certain clarifications from the Attorney General.

MR. SPEAKER: The question is

"That the House resolves to invite the Attorney General to the House to give us considered opinion as to whether or not the Thakkar Commission documents laid on the Table so far, constitute the full Report, as claimed by the Government".

*The Lok Sabha divided:*

Division No: 2

12.29 hrs.

AYES

Abdul Hamid, Shri

Acharia, Shri Basudeb

Athwal, Shri Charnjit Singh

Banatwalla, Shri G.M.

Basu, Shri Anil

Bhattam, Shri S.M.

Chatterjee, Shri Somnath

Chowdhary, Shri Saifuddin

Dandavate, Prof. Madhu

Datta, Shri Amal

Deo. Shri V. Kishore Chandra S.	Reddy, Shri C. Janga
Dora, Shri H.A.	Reddy, Shri K. Ramachandra
Ghosh Goswami, Shrimati Bibha	Reddy, Shri S. Jaipal
Gill, Shri M.S.	Roy, Dr. Sudhir
Goswami, Shri Dinesh	Roypradhan, Shri Amar
Gupta, Shri Indrajit	Saba, Shri Ajit Kumar
Hannan Mollah, Shri	Saikia, Shri Muhiram
Het Ram Shri	Samant, Dr. Datta
Iyer, Shri V.S. Krishna	Selvendran, Shri P.
Kurup, Shri Suresh	Shahabuddin, Shri Syed
Masudal Hossain, Shri Syed	Singh, Shri Ram Narain
Mishra, Shri Vijay Kumar	Somu, Shri N.V.N.
Misra, Shri Satyagopal	Tanti, Shri Bhadreswar
Mukherjee, Shrimati Geeta	Thota, Shri Gopal Krishna
Patel, Dr. A.K.	Tulsiram, Shri V.
Pathak, Shri Ananda	Walia, Shri Charanjit Singh
Ram Bahadur Singh, Shri	NOES
Ramaiah, Shri B.B.	Abbasi, Shri K.J.
Ramaiah, Shri Sode	Adbul Ghafoor, Shri
Rao, Shri A.J.V.B. Maheswara	Abdullah, Begum
Rao, Shri Srihari	Agarwal, Shri Jai Prakash
Reddi, Shri C. Madhav	Akhtar Hasan, Shri
Reddy, Shri Bezawada Papi	Alkha Ram, Shri
Reddy, Shri B.N.	Anjiah, Shrimati Manemma

Ansari, Shri Abdul Hannan

Charles, Shri A.

Anthony, Shri P.A.

Chaturvedi, Shri Naresh Chandra

Arunachalam, Shri M.

Chaturvedi, Shrimati Vidyavati

Awasthi, Shri Jagdish

Chavan, Shri Ashok Shankar Rao

Azad, Shri Ghulam Nabi

Chavda, Shri Ishwarbhai K.

Bairwa, Shri Banwari Lal

Chokka Rao, Shri J.

Bajpai, Dr. Rajendra Kumari

Choudhary, Shri Jagannath

Balaraman, Shri L.

Dabhi, Shri Ajitsinh

Banerjee, Kumari Mamata

Dalbir Singh, Shri

Basavaraju, Shri G.S.

Dalwai, Shri Hussain

Basheer, Shri T.

Das, Shri Sudarsan

Bhagat, Shri H.K.L.

Dennis, Shri N.

Bhakta, Shri Manoranjan

Deora, Shri Murlī

Bharat Singh, Shri

Dev, Shri Santosh Mohan

Bhardwaj, Shri Parasram

Dhariwal, Shri Shanti

Bhatia, Shri R.L.

Dhillon, Dr. G.S.

Bhumij, Shri Haren

Digal, Shri Radhakanta

Bhuria, Shri Dileep Singh

Dighe, Shri Sharad

Birinder Singh, Shri

Digvijaya Singh, Shri

Budania, Shri Narendra

Dikshit, Shrimati Sheila

Buta Singh, S.

Gadgil, Shri V.N.

Chandrakar, Shri Chandulal

Gaekwad, Shri Ranjit Singh

Chandrasekhar, Shrimati M.

Ghosh, Shri Tarun Kanti

Chandresh Kumari, Shrimati

Gowda, Shri H.N. Nanje

Guha, Dr. Phulrenu	Lowang, Shri Wangpha
Gupta, Shrimati Prabhawati	Mahabir Prasad, Shri
Harpal Singh, Shri	Mahajan, Shri Y.S.
Jain, Shri Virdhi Chander	Mahalingam, Shri M.
Janarthanan, Shri Kadambur	Makwana, Shri Narsinh
Jatav, Shri Kammodilal	Malik, Shri Dharampal Singh
Jena, Shri Chintamani	Mallick, Shri Lakshman
Jhikram, Shri M.L.	Manorma Singh, Shrimati
Kamal Nath, Shri	Mehta, Shri Haroobhai
Kamble, Shri Arvind Tulshiram	Mishra, Dr. Prabhat Kumar
Kamla Prasad Singh, Shri	Mishra, Shri Ram Nagina
Kamson, Prof, Meijinglung	Mishra, Shri Shripati
Khan, Shri Khurshid Alam	Mishra, Shri Uma Kant
Khan, Shri Mohd. Ayub	Misra, Shri Nityananda
Khattri, Shri Nirmal	Mohanty, Shri Brajamohan
Kolandaivelu, Shri P.	Motilal Singh, Shri
Krishna Pratap Singh, Shri	Mundackal, Shri George Joseph
Krishna Kumar, Shri S.	Naik, Shri Shantaram
Krishna Singh, Shri	Naikar, Shri D.K.
Kuchan, Shri Gangadhar S.	Namgyal, Shri P.
Kumaramangalam, Shri P.R.	Nawal Prabhakar, Shrimati Sunderwati
Kunjambu, Shri	Nagi, Shri Chandra Mohan Singh
Kurien, Prof. P.J.	Netam, Shri Arvind
Law, Shri Asutosh	Odeyar, Shri Channaiah

Pandey, Shri Damodar

Rao, Shri J. Vengala

Panigrahi, Shri Sriballav

Rao, Shri K.S.

Panika, Shri Ram Pyare

Rao, Shri P.V. Narasimha

Parashar, Prof. Narain Chand

Rao, Shri V. Krishna

Pardhi, Shri Kesharao

Rath, Shri Somnath

Patel, Shri U.H.

Rathawa, Shri Amarsinh

Patil, Shri Balasaheb Vikhe

Rathod, Shri Uttam

Patil, Shri Prakash V.

Raut, Shri Bhola

Patil, Shri Uttamrao

Ravani, Shri Navin

Patil, Shri Veerendra

Rawat, Shri Harish

Patnaik, Shri Jagannath

Sakargaym, Shri Kalicharan

Panwar, Shri Satyanarayan

Sankhavar, Shri Ashkaran

Peruman, Dr. P. Vallal

Santosh Kumar Singh, Shri

Purohit, Shri Banwari Lal

Satyendra Chandra, Shri

Purushothaman, Shri Vakkon

Sathe, Shri Vasant

Rai, Shri Ramdeo

Sayeed, Shri P.M.

Raj Karan Singh, Shri

Sethi, Shri Ananta Prasad

Rajhans, Dr. G.S.

Shaktawat, Prof. Nirmala Kumari

Ram Awadh Prasad, Shri

Shankarlal, Shri

Ram Singh, Shri

Shankaranand, Shri B.

Rampal Singh, Shri

Shanmugam, Shri P.

Rana Vir Singh, Shri

Shanti Devi, Shrimati

Ranga, Prof. N.G.

Sharma, Shri Chiranji Lal

Ranganath, Shri K.H.

Sharma, Shri Nand Kishore

Shervani, Shri Saleem I

Tomar, Shrimati Usha Rani

Shivendra Bahadur Singh, Shri

Tombi Singh, Shri N.

Singaravadivel, Shri S.

Tripathi, Dr. Chandra Shekhar

Singh, Shri Lal Vijay Pratap

Vanakar, Shri Punam Chand Mithabhai

Singh, Shri S.D.

Vir Sen, Shri

Singh Deo, Shri K.P.

Vyas, Shri Girdhari Lal

Sodi, Shri Mankuram

Wadiyar, Shri Srikanta Datta

Soz, Prof. Saifuddin

Yadava, Shri Bal Ram Singh

Sparrow, Shri R.S.

Yogesh, Shri Yogeshwar Prasad

Sreenivasa Prasad, Shri V.

Zainul Basher, Shri

MR. SPEAKER: Subject to correction,\*  
the result of the division is:

Sukh Ram, Shri

Ayes : 50

Sukhadia, Shrimati Indubala

Noes : 185

Sukhbuns Kaur, Shrimati

*The Motion was negatived*

Sultanpuri, Shri K.D.

Suman, Shri R.P.

[English]

Sundararaj, Shri

MR. SPEAKER: Now we take up Pa-  
pers laid on the Table.

Surendra Pal Singh, Shri

Shri Buta Singh.

Suryawanshi, Shri Narsingrao

*(Interruptions)*

Swami Prasad Singh, Shri

Tapeshwar Singh, Shri

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (Panaji): I  
have given a notice of privilege against Mr.  
Jaipal Reddy for disobeying the Chair yes-  
terday. He said that he will not agree to your  
ruling. He has threatened you in this  
manner....*(Interruptions)*

Tewary, Prof. K.K.

Thakkar, Shrimati Usha

Thorat, Shri Bhausaheb

MR. SPEAKER : I will look into it. I will  
ask Jaipalji about it *(Interruptions)*

Tigga, Shri Simon

\*The following Members also recorded their votes:-

Ayes : Sarvashri H.M. Patel, Zainul Abedin, P. Panchalliah and Ataur Rehman

Noes: Dr. Digvijay Sinh, Dr. B.L. Shailesh, Shri Jujhar Singh, Shri Bapulal Malviya, and Shri  
Madan Pandey.