

MR. SPEAKER : I have disallowed it.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY  
(Katwa) : When you disallowed that ?  
*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I disallowed it.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : But I have  
not received it, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER : I have sent it to you.  
But even that does not bar.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I disallowed it.  
Overruled.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY : What is the  
rule under which the Prime Minister is  
Making the statement ? *(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : Why do they stand  
up without any purpose.

-----

STATEMENT RE : APPOINTMENT OF  
SUPREME COURT JUDGE TO EN-  
QUIRE INTO ISSUES CONNECTED  
WITH FAIRFAX GROUP OF  
UNITED STATES OF AMERICA

*[English]*

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI RAJIV  
GANDHI) : Mr, Speaker, Sir. on 31st  
March, 1987, this Hon'ble House had a  
comprehensive discussion on the question of  
utilising the Fairfax Group of the United  
States of America. The Government placed  
before the House the information that was  
available. Nevertheless, questions continue  
to be raised. In view of the importance of  
the matter, all controversies must be set at  
rest. Government, have, therefore, decided  
to appoint a sitting judge of the Supreme

Court in consultation with the Hon'ble the  
Chief Justice of India to enquire into the  
issues connected with the above matter.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : No questions. There  
is rule 372.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU. DANDAVATE  
(Rajapur) : I have seen that. But I want  
to point out to you, Sir, that some of us  
have given a substantive motion demanding  
setting up of a House Committee to enquire  
into the matter. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Not allowed.

*(Interruptions)\**

MR. SPEAKER : Mr Namgyal.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : What  
about the terms of reference ?

MR. SPEAKER : They will have to tell  
us. They will tell us. They will follow.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir,  
you ask the Prime Minister what will be the  
terms of the Enquiry Commission that is  
going to be appointed. *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Naturally, they will  
tell us.

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : Not now ..they will  
tell you on Monday.

*[English]*

MR. SPEAKER : I will ask them to give  
you.

*(Interruptions)*

---

\*Not recorded.

MR. SPEAKER : Naturally, they will tell us.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : No question. I will look after that.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I have listened to you.

*[Translation]*

I also fail to hear, what should I do ?

*[English]*

MR. SPEAKER : Please see rule 372. No questions. I cannot allow.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : What are the terms of the one man Commission which they are going to appoint ?

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : Professor Sahib, this is what I was telling you that...

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. SPEAKER : Professor, I am saying that I will ask them to furnish it to you.

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : I will get it done, you take your seat.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, have you ever seen a Commission being set up without terms of reference ? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY : Have you seen it, Sir ?

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : That has to be there. That is a must.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. SPEAKER : That has to be there.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : How do you allow the announcement of the Commission without the terms of reference ?

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : The rule is clear.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing now.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat) : Sir, we have no right to know anything ?

MR. SPEAKER : You have the right, Sir, that is why I said that. But you cannot ask any question at this time. The rules will follow.

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot say anything. It is not my rule.

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : Just sir it is very simple.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : We are not allowed to ask a single question.

MR. SPEAKER : The permit it.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Why remain in this House ? If I cannot say anything then what is the use ?

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I am not doing anything against the rule.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY : You have to follow the rule, Sir.

MR. SPEAKER : Which rule should I follow then—this one or something else ?

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : I cannot. You have given this rule and I am following this rule. If you want me to follow your rule, then I will close this book.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolsapur) : What is the rule, Sir ?

MR. SPEAKER : Rule 372. It says :

"A statement may be made by a Minister on a matter of public importance with the consent of the Speaker but no question shall be asked at the time the statement is made."

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : I will get it done

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. SPEAKER : I will convey and I will take it.

*(Interruptions)*

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : This is what I am saying.

*[English]*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : The statement must be self-consistent.

*(Interruptions)\*\**

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing goes on record.

**\*\*Not recorded.**

*(Interruptions)\*\**

MR. SPEAKER : The things he has asked I will ask them to give. I will convey to you on Monday morning.

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, I am rising on a point of order. My point of order is that every statement that is made before the House has to be seen by the Speaker...

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : You give me in writing. I will get it done.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Are you satisfied ?

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : You draft a motion.

*[English]*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, are you satisfied ?

*[Translation]*

MR. SPEAKER : You give me in writing, I will get it done.

*(Interruptions)*

*[English]*

MR. SPEAKER : I will look into it.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, every statement has to be shown to the Speaker and only with his permission the statement can be read in the House. Are you satisfied that the statement is self-consistent ?

*(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER : Give it to me and I will get to the bottom of the thing and then let you know.

**\*\*Not Recorded.**

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Are you satisfied ? (*Interruptions*) According to the rule which you read, no question can be asked. Submission can be made. It does not mean that a submission cannot be made.

(*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : You give in writing.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : I was saying that the rule which you read out precludes us from asking any question. (*Interruptions*) You can't hear me. You put on headphones.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER : I will, but the position remains the same. Some noise is there.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : You hear my submission. If anybody asks a question, you can debar him from asking under the rule. But if I do not ask a question and only make an observation, how can you prevent me from making it under the rule ?

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY :  
That is right.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : No observation should be disallowed.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Under rule 372, no question shall be asked, at the time the statement is made.

(*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : The rule is, before every statement is made by the Minister, it must be seen by the Speaker and only if he is satisfied, the statement may be made in the House. Are you satisfied that the statement that is made in the House is

self-consistent ? (*Interruptions*) That is the question. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : This is the rule that I have quoted. This is the only rule which is there.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Again, the same ruling is there. When Members are not satisfied with the statement made by a Minister for any alleged inaccuracy, they may give a notice under Direction 115 pointing out the inaccuracy. If Members want a discussion on the statement, they may table notices under rule 184 or 193. Raising matters in the garb of points of order at the time—statement is made is not proper.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : This is your rule, not my rule. I am to be guided by this rule. There is no point of order.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : This is the rule book I have.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Now Mr. Namgyal to speak.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : This is the only book I have which I have to go through. There is no other book with me.

(*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER : Give me a notice, I will consider.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : You have rightly observed that the rule says no question should be allowed. The rule says that no question would be allowed. I will not ask a question. I am not raising a point of order. I do not want to raise a point of order. (*Interruptions*) Whatever else I say, you

cannot disallow it under the rule. Only questions and points of order are not allowed.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Whatever you have given me, I am looking into it. Whatever next you will give to me I will look into it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You give it to me in writing and I will consider it.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA : Why should I give it in writing ? You can hear me just now.

MR. SPEAKER : No. Not at this time.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Mr. Namgyal to speak.

(Interruptions)

RESOLUTION RE : ECONOMIC  
POLICIES—Contd.

[Translation]

SHRI P. NAMGYAL (Ladakh) : Mr. Speaker, I do not support the resolution brought before this House regarding wrong policies of the Government. I oppose it. Be it the economic policy, industrial policy or any other policy of the Government...

(Interruptions)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : I will allow what comes under rules. What goes beyond rules, I will not allow.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will do something when the time comes. Write to me and I will allow you.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing whatsoever goes on record without my permission.

(Interruptions)\*

MR. SPEAKER : I will allow what comes under the rules. What does not come under the rules, I cannot.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Give me in writing. Not allowed. Nothing goes on record.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : No point of order.

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER : What can I do ?

[English]

I cannot do anything except following this book.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : I will not break the rules. I will follow your rule, not mine.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Give me under Rule 193 or under Direction 115 and I will consider it. That is all. Nothing goes on record.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : At this time, Professor Sahib, not allowed.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : You give me under Rule 193 or under Direction 115 and I will consider it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER : Nothing doing. Give me under Rule 193 or under Direction 115 and I will consider it very sympathetically.

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : In your presence in the morning, the Minister of State for Finance said that he will make a full statement in the evening.