

[Shri Rajiv Gandhi]

This will give an opportunity for the Tamils in Sri Lanka to see who really represents the Tamils and represents them through the ballot box, not through the barrel of a gun.

An encouraging indication or index of the return to normalcy is the return of the refugees. A steady stream of refugees has been going back to their homeland.

I must take this opportunity to pay the highest tribute to the gallantry of our soldiers in the IPKF for the discipline and courage with which they have carried out this delicate task. It is deplorable that anyone in this House should give credence to the malicious fabrications about the work of the IPKF.

*(Interruptions)\*\**

MR. SPEAKER : No interruptions please. Do not record.

SHRI RAJIV GANDHI: We are always in danger of getting too engrossed in the minutiae of development. Yes, statistics and indices are important but we must look to the larger vision of India. India has mattered in the world. We have led in the world of Ideas. Our major contribution has been to enduring values and standards, to the soul and the spirit of human kind. Our national task is to take India again to its rightful place to the front rank of human civilization. Development is an essential tool in this endeavour, but the real challenge is the response to what lies beyond mere development and mere growth. To that great task the nation is summoned in this 40th year of our independence.

Mr. Speaker, Sir, I wish to express my support to the motion of thanks to the President for his inspiring Address and urge the House to do likewise.

MR. SPEAKER : A number of amendments have been moved by Members to the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address. Shall I put all the amendments to the vote of the House together ?

*\*\*Not recorded.*

MANY HON. MEMBERS : Yes, yes.

MR. SPEAKER : All right.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Mr. Speaker, Sir, one submission to you. Under Rule 184 I have given a notice of a motion authorising you to set up a House Committee to enquire into the allegations made by the former President of India against sections of the Cabinet as well as the opposition. Please consider that.

MR. SPEAKER : I shall now put all the amendments moved to the Motion of Thanks together.

*All the amendments were put and  
negatived.*

MR. SPEAKER : The question is :  
"That an Address be presented to the President in the following terms :

'That the Members of Lok Sabha assembled in this Session are deeply grateful to the President for the Address which he has been pleased to deliver to both Houses of Parliament assembled together on the 22nd February, 1988.'

*The motion was adopted.*

-----

16-40 hrs

# AUTHORISED TRANSLATIONS (CENTRAL LAWS) AMENDMENT BILL—Contd.

[English]

MR. SPEAKER : The House will now take up further consideration of the following motion moved by Shri Chintamani Panigrahi on the 23rd February, 1988, namely :—

"That the Bill to amend the Authorised Translations (Central Laws) Act, 1973, as passed by Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration."

Shri Saiffudin Soz : Absent.

Shri G.M. Banatwalla.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, the mover of the Motion of Thanks has to reply. Has he surrendered even that to the Prime Minister ?

*(Interruptions)*

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : The Prime Minister intervenes; the reply is given by the mover.

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE : The Prime Minister was only intervening. He was not replying. The mover has to reply. But he is sitting quietly. Does he not want to take this opportunity to say something ?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, he can atleast say. "I confirm everything that the Prime Minister has said."

THE MINISTER OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF INFORMATION AND BROADCASTING (SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT) : Sir, I do not know what Prof. Dandavate is speaking about.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Sir, he is a former Speaker but I think he has forgotten the conventions. The Prime Minister intervenes and the mover always replied,

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT : This again shows the poverty of his knowledge. I am surprised at what Prof. Dandavate is saying. Nowhere has the mover of the Motion of Thanks on the President's Address ever replied. It is never done. You know it.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : The mover has a right. He may surrender it. They are always surrendering to the Prime Minister.

SHRI H.K.L. BHAGAT : No, it has never been done.

*(Interruptions)*

SHRI SAIFUDDIN SOZ : What is your ruling ?

MR. SPEAKER : My ruling is that Shri Banatwalla has the floor of the House.

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE : Of course, we must thank you for this.

SHRI G.M. BANATWALLA (Ponnani): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I rise to support the Bill namely the Authorised Translation Amendment Bill. Due credit must go to Government for having come forward with this Bill to provide for the translation of our Central laws. I congratulate the Government and I am happy that it has come forward with a Bill which is of very vital importance.

Sir, the laws affect our people and indeed there can be no denying of the fact that when laws affect people, they must be available in the language spoken by the people. That is the healthy principle on which the Government has come forward with the Bill. I congratulate the Government. The principle is very healthy. It gives vigour and vitality to democracy. The vigour and vitality of democracy lies in the fact that we approve here must be available to the people in the language in which they speak. That is the way in which the involvement of the people can be had in our democratic process and in our national life.

16.44 hrs

[SHRI SHARAD DIGHE *in the Chair*]

Sir, my only complaint is that the Bill is a little half-hearted measure. It is based on a very healthy principle but it does not go all the way to translate the principle into practice thoroughly and completely. The aims and objects say and I quote "there has been a general demand for an authoritative text of Central Act." Indeed that is correct. But the question is whether the provisions of this Bill fully meet the demand. The point that I am making is that the provisions of the Bill are not adequate enough to compel the Government to translate all the Central laws in the various languages that are mentioned in

[Shri G.M. Banatwalla]

the Schedule. Indeed the translation of a Central Act or an order etc., published under the authority of the President shall be deemed to be the authorised translation.

So far so good. But then, read all the provisions and you will find that there is no provision that requires preparation and publication of these translations. If the translations are published, they would be an authoritative text. It is good enough. But there is no compulsion on the Central Government to publish the laws in all the languages mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution. Such translations as may be published by the Government will be the authoritative text. But the Government may or may not come forward to publish translation of all Central laws and in all the languages mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the constitution. That is the major defect. The Bill is in the right direction. No doubt about it. Due credit to the Government for that. But as I said, it does not go all the way. It is absolutely necessary for people to have translations in the language they speak. The provisions of the Bill therefore must have made it compulsory for the Government that all laws passed here must be published in all the languages mentioned in the Constitution. There is no such compulsion. To that extent the Bill is defective, I say. Therefore, I have also given notice of an Amendment which I shall be bringing at the appropriate stage. Whether it is the Commissioner of Linguistic Minorities, whether it is Minorities Commission, whether it is even the Sarkaria Commission, they have all stressed the need for orders, instructions, laws in the various languages which people speak. I may here for an analogy quote from the report of the Sarkaria Commission on Centre-State relations. It says at page 526, para 20.1, 20 "The work of the Government which involves or affects the local people obviously must be carried on in the local language. This is even more important in a Welfare State. It is necessary that all the forms, applications, letters, Bills, notices, etc. are available in the local language as well as in the official language. This has a particular relevance

to the various Department of the Union Government as, of ten this important aspect is lost sight of in a bid to bring about a mindless uniformity. It is equally relevant in the case of State Governments also."

Similarly, in the same spirit authoritative texts of Central laws must be made available in all the languages mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution. It must be the statutory responsibility of the Government to so publish the translation of all laws.

I must here strike another note of caution, i.e. with respect to Urdu. Urdu, unfortunately, is not the official language of any State. Therefore, it suffers. I am not referring to the State of Jammu and Kashmir which has a special position, but apart from that, in no other State, Urdu is an official language and, therefore, it is bound to suffer. The publication of Central laws also in Urdu is bound to suffer. Moreover, Government is relying on one aspect, and that aspect is that these translations will enable the authoritative texts of Central Acts etc. to be quoted in courts of law. You are therefore, confining yourself to the working in courts of law, and to see that authoritative text in various languages are available, and can be quoted in courts of law. If you confine yourself only to the working of courts of law, then I am afraid a grave injustice will come to Urdu, and I am afraid Urdu, though mentioned in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution, may get neglected, if this narrow objective alone is maintained. The objective has to be a wider one, that the translations should be available not only for being quoted in courts of law as authoritative texts, but also to secure the involvement of the people. The people have a right to understand authoritatively the various provisions of the law. I, therefore, say that it is not sufficient only to provide that if the laws are published in languages other than Hindi and English, then those laws shall be considered to be incorporating authoritative texts. Mentioning this is not sufficient. You have also to place a statutory responsibility upon the Government to see that laws, translations of all laws are published in all the languages mentioned in the Constitution. That statutory responsibility is not

so placed in the Bill. Therefore, I say that while the Bill is in the right direction, for which every congratulation and every credit is extended to the Government, it is inadequate, it is inadequate in the light of the various recommendations of the Commissioner for Linguistic Minorities. It is inadequate in the light of the recommendations made, in the spirit of the recommendations made by the present Sarkaria Commission on Centre-State relations. I, therefore, urge on the Government that when I rise to move my amendment, that said amendment should be accepted by the Government, and Government must cheerfully accept the responsibility to provide to the people of our country the Central laws, the authoritative texts of the Central laws in all the languages which they speak.

With these words, I thank you.

**SHRI SRIBALLAV PANIGRAHI (Deogarh):** Mr. Chairman, Sir, I rise to support this Bill—Authorised Translations (Central laws) Amendment Bill. This is a very simple and innocuous Bill with a lot of significance behind it. There is no controversy absolutely about this Bill. In fact, it should have come much earlier; it is very late; of course, better late than never.

With this enactment made, now authoritative translations of the different central laws could be used in different courts. While supporting this Bill, I do not have much to speak. A lot has been said on this Bill and only few observations I would like to make and seek clarifications from the hon. Minister.

Admittedly thanks to the vision of Pandit Jawaharlal Nehru, the first Prime Minister and the chief architect of modern India that in a country like India, a multilingual country, where language poses a threat even to the integrity sometimes, it used to pose, he very rightly adopted a three-language formula, which has been pursued and should be vigorously pursued. English, as all of us know, is the international language. Hindi is the national language and promotion of regional languages. In this background in India, we have to create a climate where all these languages can remain and promote

themselves in a very peaceful atmosphere, peaceful coexistence; peaceful coexistence of all these languages is a must in a country like India; and in that background, somewhere, some vested interests want to promote or pursue their policy of hatred towards certain languages, Hindi, etc.; that has to be given up. Politics should be kept above languages; languages should not be brought into this narrow political arena because a language has got a lot to do with our unity and integrity.

The attention that ought to have been given to the promotion of regional languages has not yet been given. I would request the hon. Minister that adequate attention should be given to the promotion, to the advancement of regional languages; and under that, we will prominently bring this matter of translation of different laws in different languages. It is only in a few States like Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan and Bihar that a regional language is used in subordinate courts, even in High Courts. But elsewhere, even the Hindi speaking States, it is yet to be used. Further I find that there may be a problem and I would like to seek clarification from the hon Minister. As you know, in different High Courts, we have judges from outside the State, who obviously do not possess any knowledge of the language of the soil. Therefore, they may not be able to understand language or interpretation that the lawyers may be advancing or even sometimes a party may be advancing. Whether the government would like to continue with the policy of inducting or having judges from outside the State in the High Courts, particularly, so far as the Chief Justice is concerned. The tendency is, the approach is, the policy is to fill up that highest post by a judge brought in from outside the State.

17.00 hrs

Again, there are so many laws, acts, etc., and so many new laws are also being enacted. So, how long will the work of translating them take? For instance, what is our experience about the translation of the Constitution itself? The translation of the Constitution itself, the progress in that regard, has been very very slow. And if that is the speed with which the translation of central laws into regional languages



[Shri Sriballav Panigrahi]

is to be taken up, it will take quite a long period, and the objective underlying this Bill and also the general expectation of the masses, of the common people, will be defeated. Therefore, there has to be a greater urgency in the implementation part of it. It would also require some agencies to be built up and also more financial expenditure

I would like to know what will be the agency for such translation. If it is the Central Government alone, I, am afraid that the urgency may be realised and delay will not be overcome. If it is entrusted to the State Governments also, then I think this can be expedited. Of course, then financial support will have to be provided to the State Governments.

At the same time, I would like to point out, that there are allegations. I have heard many members. They have been giving their opinion. There is a sense of neglect among the people in certain States about their language etc., and in a country of India's dimensions and complexity of the problem, I think steps should be taken to see that no such reasonable doubt is there, or is going to be created in the minds of the people.

I do not like to take more time. This is a very good Bill. We were really expecting this since long to come, but not only that. After being enacted it should not be kept in the cupboard of the Central Secretariat, but it should really be implemented in its true letter and spirit, as given in the Bill.

At the same time there is another problem. Of course, it is not strictly relevant to this Bill, or to the Home Ministry but it will go a long way—it may concern the Human Resources Ministry—if an Institute of Translation Studies, or an Institute of Translation is established with branches at different places, at least with regional headquarters at different regions. There can be branches with an apex organisation. In these translation studies, not only these laws, but at the same time good works of different literatures, from good literatures of Oryia, Bengali, Gujarati, or Kannada, of any

language may be translated, good and rare writings: they may be translated into different languages. That will also be laudable and that will strengthen the much needed unity and integrity of India.

With these words, I give full support to this Bill and I request the hon. Minister to clarify some of the points I have raised and to strengthen the system, and also to see that the intended purpose is achieved as quickly as possible.

**SHRI N.V.N. SOMU (Madras North):** Mr. Chairman, after 40 years of independence now only the Central Government is thinking of regional languages. The Constitution of India is the basis of all the Acts and Ordinances. But the Constitution of India is not translated into the regional languages. It has got an official translation only in Hindi.

Till now the regional languages are being neglected by the Central Government. So, I request the hon. Minister to translate the Constitution also in the regional languages, including my mother tongue, Tamil.

Illiteracy in this country is growing fast. You can utilise the amount spent for Hindi to wipe out illiteracy in regional languages. I am a Member of Parliament here but I cannot raise a question in my mother tongue, that is, Tamil. Equally, other Members also cannot raise questions in regional languages. Either I have to ask the question in English or in Hindi. My mother tongue is represented by nearly six crores of people, but I cannot raise a question in Tamil. That is the pitiable situation of mine. So, when the Central Acts and the Ordinances issued by the President are going to be translated in regional languages, I request, through you, to the Government that simultaneous translation should be made in regional languages and the Members should be allowed to raise questions and to take part in the debates in their mother tongue. This will make the debate more lively, and useful thought can be given to the functioning of better democracy.

Our DMK Party is for the unity of India, not for the uniformity. But under the name 'India', the Hindi zealots are

trying to create a 'Hindia'. I stand for 'India', not for 'Hindi'. As a fervent supporter of Indian unity, I want to enlighten the Hindi zealots. I quote from a historical book :

"What is India ? There is no such country, and this is the first and the most essential fact about India that can be learnt. India is a name which we give to a region, including a magnitude of different countries. The difference of the countries of Europe are undoubtedly smaller than those between the countries of India. Scotland is more like Spain than Bengal is like Punjab. There are no countries in civilised Europe in which people differ so much as the Bengali differs for the Sikh, and the language of Bengal is as unintelligible in Lahore as would be in London."

This I have quoted from Sir John Strachey. So, Sir, such was the condition before the common name India came into being. That is why I say that regional languages should be given more credence and importance. Not only that, our former Ambassador to Moscow, Mr. K P.S. Menon, has stated in his book 'Memories And Musings'. I quote from page 20 of his book :

"Stalin asked whether Hindu—he said Hindu, not Hindi—was our national language. I said, 'Yes, Hindi was the language of the majority people of India.' 'What was the common language before Independence ?' asked Stalin. I said that a language called Hindustani had been evolving itself as the language of the people of both Hindus and of Muslims, but after partition Hindi was becoming highly Sanskritised and Hindustani or Urdu was becoming highly Persianised. It was taking a large number of words from Persian and Arabic."

Then what Mr. Stalin said to have replied to Dr. K.P.S. Menon was "it cannot be a real people's language". This is what the former Soviet Union Premier, Mr. Stalin,

said. Why I am quoting this here is that the Central Government should respect the feelings of the non-Hindi speaking people and act accordingly.

Sir, whenever Mahatma Gandhi wrote letters to Rajaji, he used to write in English. Once it struck to Mahatma Gandhi. He wrote a letter to Rajaji in Hindi. Rajaji was taken aback. He immediately wrote a reply to Mahatma Gandhi in Tamil. From then onwards, Mahatma Gandhi did not write to Rajaji in Hindi. He wrote letters only in English. So while Rajaji was essential to correct Mahatma Gandhi, the D.M.K. is more essential to correct Rajiv Gandhi. I want to emphasise this point here, Sir,

Sir, not only that. The step-motherly treatment of the Central Government towards regional languages should be immediately given up. What Mahatma Gandhi, our political mentor and Father of the Nation, told about Tamil is this and I quote him here :

"What the Tamils have done in the freedom struggle no other Indian community has done. Therefore, to show my gratitude to them, I have decided to study the Tamil language and it is a sweet and interesting language. Tamils in their midst have great poets and scholars."

Even now, there are great poets and scholars there. I further quote him :

"If there is one nation in India, those who reside outside Madras Presidency must know Tamil."

Sir, here Madras Presidency means that in those days it covered the four States of Tamil Nadu, Andhra Pradesh, Kerala and Karnataka, I would like to ask the Government whether they are the true followers of Mahatma Gandhi. I would request them to follow the advice of Mahatma Gandhi. Thank you.

SHRI CHINTAMANI JENA (Bala-sore) ; Mr. Chairman, Sir, I am very very grateful to you for giving me the opport-

[Shri Chintamani Jena]

unity to speak a few words on this very useful Bill which has been brought forward by our hon. Minister of State of Home Affairs. I am specially grateful to him because he being the former opposition leader of the State Assembly of my own State, has been able to pilot this useful Bill in this House. Sir, I would now like to speak in my own mother tongue. I have already informed the Secretariat about this so that they may kindly make arrangements for interpretation of my speech in English.

\*Mr. Chairman, Sir, I rise to support the Authorised Translation (Central Laws) Amendment Bill. While speaking on this Bill I feel proud that the hon. Minister who is piloting the Bill belongs to my State. Sir, since last 40 years the people living in different parts of the country have been demanding the translation of Central laws in regional languages. I am grateful to our hon. Prime Minister Shri Rajiv Gandhi who responded quickly to this genuine demand and the Bill has been introduced in this House. This Bill will go a long way in the fulfilment of the desires of the people. Now the Central laws will be translated in all the languages mentioned in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution. The common men who do not know English can read the translated version of Central laws. Many hon. Members have taken part in the discussion. They have given some valuable suggestions. I do not want to take much time of the House. I would only like to seek some clarifications and also would like to give some suggestions. I hope the hon. Minister will pay proper attention to my suggestion and will take all possible steps to implement them.

Sir, this is a simple but very useful Bill. It has received support from all sections of the House. I hope the hon. Minister will take note of the spirit of the Members and see personally that the translation work is expedited. In fact, the Bills are always good, but the implementation takes a lot of time due to constraint of resources or some reasons or the other. In the case of the present Bill, the transla-

tion work should not be delayed for these reasons. Therefore, I would like to have a specific reply from the hon. Minister in this regard. I hope while replying to the debate he will specify a date by which the translation of Central laws would be completed. I want to know the date, because people are anxiously waiting to see the translation of Central Laws in their languages. An hon. Member was saying that many problems may arise while doing that translation work. These may be constraint of resources, man power and other factors which may delay the translation work. Moreover if the translators do not have sufficient knowledge, the translation may not satisfy the people for whom it will be done. The lawyers in the court may make different interpretation of laws. Therefore, proper emphasis should be given in selecting the translators. The translation should be correct and simple. The common men must follow the language in which it would be translated. So this aspect should also be looked into. In this context I would like to say as it is said in Oriya language—It should be done, It will be done and it is going to be done. The purpose of my state is that the Central laws may to be translated in regional languages. The Bill seeks to achieve that objective. Therefore, the translation work should not be delayed. While doing different works it is commonly said by some people that it may be done, while some other people say it should be done and the Govt. say that it shall be done. I hope in the case of translating the Central laws the Govt. should see to it that it is done expeditiously. In order to expedite the translation work the Central Govt. should consult the concerned State Govts. Proper co-ordination should be maintained between the Central and the concerned State Govt. departments in the matter of selecting the translators and adopting the level of translation. It should be followed by the people even by those who do not know English.

Sir, I shall be failing in my duty if I do not say about late Pt. Utkalmani Gopabandhu Dash. Gopabandhu is remembered and respected by every Oriya speaking person. He has always said that "the promotion of regional language is very necessary in order to promote national integration". Therefore the promotion of

\*The speech was originally delivered in Oriya

regional languages is very necessary. When we go to different States we find one common thing. The people of these regions want that their language should get due respect at the national level. They want that their languages should be promoted properly. The Constitution should be translated in every language. There are some fine languages like Manipuri etc. Some languages/dialects spoken by some people have not been included in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution. As those people have been demanding due recognition being given to their languages, they should be included in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution and the Central Laws should be translated in these languages also. I do not mean to say that the translation of Central laws in regional languages should be held up till those languages are included in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution. Rather I would like to urge upon the Govt. that all the provisions made in the Bill should be implemented expeditiously.

Then I would like to say that the translation should be correct and understandable. Why I would like to say this is that some translations have been done in my language Oriya. Some high sounding words have been used in those translation. If some one reads the translation work he cannot say it is in Oriya language. So while translating the Central laws this aspect should also be looked into. Then Sir, I would request the hon. Minister to say in his reply regarding the allocation made in the Central Budget for implementing the translation work in different regional languages.

Sir, an hon. Member alleged in his speech that the Central Govt. is showing step motherly attitude towards Tamil language. I take strong objection to it. I would like to tell him that our Govt. has always been showing equal respect to every regional language. He may not be knowing that if a Member wants to put supplementaries in regional language he is allowed to do so in Upper House. This provision is also here in Lok Sabha. He should not be under the impression that if he puts a question in Tamil, he will not get reply from the hon. Minister. Perhaps he does not know that the translation facility is available in the both House of Parliament.

Sir, a word about Sanskrit language. the central laws are not going to translate in Sanskrit. But every possible step should be taken to promote this language. I would like to say so, because Sanskrit is the mother of every other languages. But it is regrettable that the promotion of Sanskrit language has not received proper attention from the Govt. of India. I say this from my own experience. A Sanskrit University has been established in Orissa, but the Sanskrit teachers are very much neglected there. Adequate step has not been taken to promote Sanskrit language. Since the hon. Minister comes from Orissa he must be aware of these facts. Moreover, he is incharge of different languages including Sanskrit. So I hope he will look into the Problems of Sanskrit teachers and take immediate steps to help them.

Lastly, Sir, I would like to say something about Hindi. We have accepted this language as our national language. The aim of doing so is to promote national integration. Despite that I would like to say that the promotion of Hindi language has not received due attention in non-Hindi speaking States as it should have been paid. The Hindi teachers are appointed in the non-Hindi speaking States under the Centrally scheme. But they are not getting pay for years together. The grant from Central Govt. do not reach to the States in time. As a result of that the Hindi teachers are facing a great difficulty. The hon. Minister is perhaps aware of this fact as the Hindi teachers working different high schools in his constituency are facing the same problem, Hindi teachers working in Orissa do not have service security. Sometimes it is said that their pay is sanctioned from out of Plan Scheme and sometimes it is said that they will get it from non-Plan scheme. This point may not be related to the Bill, but it comes under his Ministry. So he should look into this matter, Sir, I have already said about the translation. The translation Bureau should be set up in different states. If both the translation and publication works are done daily the works cannot make much progress. It may prolong even till the end of the 8th or 9th Plan period. Therefore, translation and publication Centre should be set up in different



[Shri Chintamani Jena]

States. Lastly, I would like to refer to the speech made by an hon. Member. He gave the definition of India and Hindia. I would like to make it very clear that these definitions have not been given by the Congress Govt. I do not want to go into any controversy, because it will take a long time. So long the Congress Govt. was in power it has always worked for the national integration. The Congress Govt. under the leadership of Shri Rajiv Gandhi has been paying proper attention for the promotion of all the languages spoken in all over India. Both at the national and international level it has stood firmly for the unity and integrity of this great country. When the Opposition was in power it has never worked for the preservation of the country's golden tradition and culture as it is being done by Shri Rajiv Gandhi. Every body is aware of this fact. Therefore it is not proper to make any allegation regarding turning India into Hindia. I wholeheartedly support the Bill and thank you very much to take part in the discussion.

[Translation]

**SHRI HARISH RAWAT (Almora) :** Sir, this is a very small Bill having a vital objective. There are numerous Central laws in our country about which the people, for whom they are meant, have no knowledge. I think that it is not sufficient to merely enact laws. To make the people concerned aware of these laws is also very necessary. It would be so nice to provide this knowledge to the concerned people in their own language in which they are well-versed. Rendering authentic translation of existing laws in all the regional languages is in itself a gigantic task. In my view, this work should not only be taken up but should be completed as early as possible.

Some hon. Members have said that if in a country like India where several languages are spoken, the law is translated only in one language, then it gives rise to a kind of jealousy among the people. I also agree with them. If we translate any Central law into Hindi, as was done in the case of the Constitution recently, this facility should be made available in regional

language also, besides Hindi. These laws should be translated in all the languages recognised by the Constitution. It will create a sense of satisfaction among the people and they will feel that this language is being given the same importance as is given to any other language. Language has always been a sentimental thing for human beings. Besides economic and other interests, our sentiments are closely related with language. So, I would like to request the Home Minister that efforts should be made to provide knowledge about the Constitution and other laws in local as well as regional languages.

This work requires both money and expert translators. At present, the Translation Bureau is so much handicapped that it appears that it has been set up merely to fulfil the constitutional obligation. There is need to strengthen this Bureau. If some documents are sent to the Translation Bureau for translation by any Ministry, the work relating to translation remains pending for months. It causes heavy loss besides creating a feeling of resentment among the people. I would like to urge the hon. Home Minister—and that is why I sought the permission of the Chair to speak—to strengthen the Translation Bureau. Linguists of more and more languages should be employed in it and the maximum possible resources should be made available to it so that it could accomplish its task properly and we are able to complete the gigantic work, which we are going to take up. The Hon. Home Minister should certainly make arrangements for this purpose.

**SHRI RAM BAHADUR SINGH (Chapra) :** Sir, I welcome this Bill because it is a very good beginning. But our past experience in this regard has not been a very happy one. I wish to draw the attention of the Government to that experience also. This Bill should have been brought forward immediately after the Independence and English language should have been removed straightway thereby paving the way for the official language Hindi and other regional languages to replace English in official work. After Independence, Gandhiji had also hinted towards it by saying "Tell the world that Gandhi does not know English". He had said that he



opposed English because there was English mentality in it and it represented a culture which distorted our own culture. There was another great man named Dr. Ram Manohar Lohia who fought for the development of national language and other regional languages throughout his life. Gandhiji and Dr. Lohia knew that the language was closely related with human blood and mother's womb. Therefore, it is natural that a person learns any subject matter very quickly and easily in his own language. No individual can learn any subject matter so quickly and easily in any other language as he can do in his own language. Therefore, it is necessary that general public of our country should awaken and learn the subject-matter quickly and easily so that they can understand what the country is, how the country is to be developed and how the unity and integrity of the country is to be safeguarded. Therefore, it is necessary that the official work in Government offices as well as in public sector undertakings is done in regional languages so that our own languages could occupy a dominant position and the dominance of a foreign language could be ended. I wish to urge the Government to ponder over the idea of getting the Central Acts translated in all those languages which are spoken in our country besides the ones which are included in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution of India. If the Government wants the country to develop speedily, if it wants the unity and integrity of the country to remain intact, then the Government should also make efforts to increase awareness among people and should also take steps to ensure that information on various subjects is made available to the masses easily and quickly. I doubt whether same earnestness will be shown in implementing this law as is being shown in the presentation of the Bill. The reason is that in spite of the laws in regard to the national language, English continues to dominate. Today I read in the newspaper that the students of I.T.I. are sitting on *dharna* in front of Shastri Bhawan, where the offices of the Ministry of Human Resource Development are located, because even after 40 years of independence, the examination for admission to I.T.I. is held in

English only. The question papers are set in English and the students are supposed to answer them in English. Right now a conspiracy is going on in the country through which the people knowing English want to perpetuate their control over the trade and the administration of the country. According to the survey reports, 90 per cent of the students studying in I.T.I. have been found to have studied through English medium. On the one hand, the children of the rich study in English medium schools and on the other hand, the children of common man study in Hindi medium schools or regional language schools. But the work in Government offices is being done in English only. This means that only the children of the rich stand chance to participate in the running of Government and trade in the country. Therefore, I caution the Government that this conspiracy should be thwarted with a heavy hand. A little while ago, an hon. Member was saying, and this has been a common complaint also, that Hindi which developed in the post-independence era was Sanskritised Hindi and Urdu was dominated by Arabic and Persian words. I strongly oppose this. Translation in Hindi should be intelligible and simple. The words of other languages, which have become common, for example, station, should be used as it is in translation from one language to another. But see what kind of translation we come across now-a-days. Station was translated into Hindi as 'Vasteya Sapath Vishramalaya'. Similarly translation of Ambulance which carries patients has been rendered as *Rugna Vahika*. The people doing such kind of translation do not want Hindi to develop and spread across the country. Everyday, we see the increasing use of English. Excuse me, even in this august House, the people knowing Hindi also try to speak in English. The people knowing regional languages also speak in English on the pretext of not getting adequate coverage in the media. If this is so, then they too are requested to avoid all such things.

17.38 hrs.

[MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER *in the Chair*]

If the people knowing Hindi start speaking in Hindi, people knowing Tamil start speaking in Tamil, the people know-

[Shri Ram Bahadur Singh]

ing Urdu start speaking in Urdu, then ultimately all these media people will have to listen to us seriously.

Another question which is often raised is that national language Hindi is not rich, it is poor. As long as people do not talk in a language, even the most rich language will become poor with the passage of time. Utensil shines on cleansing and if it is not cleansed, algae deposits on it. The same is true of a language. Through usage even a poor language gets enriched and in the absence of usage, even a rich language becomes poor. Thousands of rules and codes are required to be translated into Hindi, but due to shortage of staff, this is not taking place. For this, an excuse is given that there is paucity of staff in the Bureau/Directorate which undertake translation work and that there is a ban on fresh recruitment. When the people making appointments and imposing ban are the same, then why such hindrances are not removed. On the one hand, they do not remove such hindrances and on the other, they bring forward Bills in Parliament just to show the people that steps are being taken to promote and develop all the national languages including the ones included in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution. Now the time has come when no one will believe them.

Therefore, I would like to draw the attention of the Government to the past experience and request that it should learn lessons from them so as to promote and develop not only the national language—Hindi, but all those languages which are included in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution. With these words, I support this Bill.

[English]

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HOME AFFAIRS (SHRI CHINTA MANIPANIGRAHI): Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, I am extremely grateful to all my colleagues in this august House who have given their unanimous support to such an innocuous and a very simple Bill like this which has been introduced in this House. I am also

happy that all our friends—Shri Krishna Iyer, Prof. Soz, Shri Banatwalla, Shri Sriballav Panigrahi, Shri Chintamani Jena, Shri Ram Bahadur Singh, Shri Harish Rawat and Shri Somu—have given very good suggestions while appreciating this endeavour of our Government to help the regional languages so that they can get the authorised text of all the Central Laws and Acts.

It is with a very simple and a limited objective that this Bill has been introduced. The purpose of introducing this Bill is to make available the authorised text of the Acts enacted by the Central Government. At present there is a provision in the Official Language Act 1963 for providing authorised Hindi text of Central Acts; but there is no provision for making available such authorised texts in other languages besides Hindi which are in the 8th Schedule. That is why the translation of these Acts cannot be quoted in the Subordinate Courts located in various parts of the country even where the proceedings in the regional languages have been permitted, because only an authorised text must be quoted. We had to take recourse to English text alone when this Bill was not there. But, as almost all the Members have pointed out it is not befitting our national dignity and honour that we shall depend for years to come for everything on English. It is, therefore, imperative that the authorised text of the Acts enacted by the Central Government are available in all the languages mentioned in the 8th Schedule of the Constitution.

After enactment of this Bill, the President will be able to issue authorised text of the Central Acts under his authority. At present, the arrangement for the authorised translation of Central Acts exists with the Legislative Department of the Ministry of Law and Justice of the Government of India. The authorised translation and authentic texts as well are issued under the authority of the President. That is why, it would be in the fitness of things that this work is taken up by the Central Government at this stage. But there is no bar if the State Governments also get the translation of the Laws done.

SHRI SHANTARAM NAIK (Panaji): When the texts are published—of course;

they are not available now—and if the texts of the Acts and the Rules framed under the Act are made available in one volume, it would be very helpful.

**SHRI CHINTAMANI PANIGRAHI :**

That is a different thing. We have to think over whether the authorised texts will be in one volume or in different volumes.

Some hon. Members suggested that supposing it is done only here at Delhi then it may take lot of time. If the experties is available with the State Government and the State Government can train people there in the methodology and technique of translation we can take their help also and translation can be done there.

Some hon. Members said that step-motherly attitude is being shown to the development of regional languages. It has been said in the House many a time and by the Prime Minister also that there is no discrimination so far as development of the regional languages is concerned because every language is an official language of this State. Though Hindi is the official language of the nation, Oriya is the official language of Orissa and Tamil is the official language of Tamil Nadu. Though they are in the Eighth Schedule yet they are official languages of the States. Therefore, there cannot be any discrimination or step-motherly attitude.

Last time I pointed out that so far as development of State official languages are concerned we are giving more funds. In the Sixth Plan we had allotted for the development of regional languages Rs. 10.83 crores and in the Seventh Plan the allotment has gone upto Rs. 11.04 crores. As regards Hindi in the Sixth Plan it was Rs. 5.68 crores and in the Seventh Plan it has been increased to Rs. 8.85 crores. The development of official languages of the States is not with the Home Ministry. This aspect is with Human Resources Development Ministry and we will forward again the suggestion given by the hon. Members to that Ministry so that they may think of giving more funds to the development of regional languages. The regional languages are very very developed languages. Nobody can say Tamil or Kannad is not a developed language. We are proud of those languages. We hope

that more and more funds would be given to them.

The purpose of introducing this Bill is very limited. In the States where Central Acts are used in the courts of law and education of law is imparted through the medium of regional language the availability of authoritative text in regional language would be more useful to them. Several members have raised the question of development of regional languages and there we are doing our best.

As regards arrangements of translation of official documents, the Central Translation Bureau of the Government of India takes up the translation of manuals, codes, related forms, etc of Central Government only. Some hon. Members wanted to know the strength of this Translation Bureau and the work of translation is that is going on. At present the annual translation capacity of the Bureau is 46,000 standard pages but every year more material for translation is accumulated in the Bureau than its annual capacity permits. Because more and more we are going in for development of Hindi and also regional languages. A scheme is under consideration for disposing of this backlog within a period of three years. New translation training centres have been set-up in Bombay, Bangalore and Calcutta under Plan schemes to train the employees of the Central Government engaged in the day-to-day work. A training centre has already been functioning in Delhi itself. In addition to this, the Central Translation Bureau conducts condensed courses of translation in various cities of the country as required.

Some friends suggested that the language should be very simple. The policy of the Government is to use simple language and easy words in official work and also adopt technical and scientific terms in their original form to the extent possible. Even then certain translations might also be difficult because we may use some words which we are not used to. But during the course of years, we will get used to these words. Then, these will be very common words. The difficulty will not arise after sometime. But we shall try to make it as simple as possible.

Sir, we have also given incentive schemes. It is being run in Central

[Shri Chintamani Panigrahi]

Government offices for working arrangements. Shri Ram Bahadur Singh pointed out that we are not encouraging them. They have been introduced for training of Hindi language, Hindi typing and Hindi stenography.

So far as use of electronic equipment in Central Government offices is concerned, it is emphasised that only bilingual equipment, computers and word processors, should be purchased. A direction has been given so that gradually it can be English and Hindi at the same format to enable us to use whichever language we want whether it is English or Hindi. Instructions have been issued in this regard and its implementation is being monitored. Teleprinter in bilingual form is expected to become available very shortly. Hindustan Teleprinters Limited a Government of India undertaking, is manufacturing some teleprinters in collaboration with a French company.

Some hon Members have also suggested inclusion of some other languages in the Eighth Schedule. As I said earlier, including a language in the Eighth Schedule does not mean that once it is included in that Schedule, it will be improved. You see we have included certain languages. But it is not that because a language is not included in Eighth Schedule should not be given and funds for its improvement or for development. Manipuri language is not included in the Eighth Schedule. But we are giving assistance for development of Manipuri language and publishing their literature. Similarly it is for other languages. The present Bill, as hon. Members have said, is an important step towards ensuring a proper place for the regional languages in the field of law. In the winter session, the Parliament passed an amendment for Authoritative text of constitution in Hindi

Some friends mentioned about this. I think we have none it. So far as other languages are concerned, the translated texts of the Constitution of India are available in all the languages mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution except in Tamil, Kashmiri and Sindhi. I hope the friends from Tamil Nadu would try. It is hoped that translation in Sindhi will

be available shortly, followed by translation in Kashmiri. The translation in Tamil text of the Constitution was done but it could not be finalised due to the fact that concurrence by the State Government is awaited. For the last 4-5 years, we are awaiting. I hope Mr. Somu will go and tell them to expedite it. The translations in the regional languages would be done expeditiously.

Some friends asked whether money is available for implementing the provisions of this Bill. I think the resource constraint is not likely to come in the way of getting translation in all the regional languages.

We pay honorarium also to those friends whose help is considered necessary. Honoraria are paid to them for translation work. Therefore, there would be no difficulty in this.

Mr. Banatwalla raised a very important point. It gave weight to our views. I would just like to mention here only one thing that there is no difference between our objective and what Mr. Banatwalla has pointed out. I have read the whole thing again and again. But there is no difference except one thing that Mr. Banatwalla, out of his sincerity and devotion while welcoming this Bill, said that there should be some kind of an element of compulsion. That's what I could understand. So, there is no fundamental difference between your amendment and the Bill presented by us. The difference is only that some sort of compulsion is indicated on the President that he should publish the authoritative texts of all Central legislations in languages other than Hindi, mentioned in the Eighth Schedule and it should be compulsory. If you can read the whole thing, the whole aim and object is that we should see expeditiously that all the Central laws and acts are translated in all the said official languages. So, it is a kind of interest compulsion. It is inherent in the whole thing. I hope, Mr. Banatwalla will not Press for his amendment. No doubt we appreciate his sincerity and we appreciate his suggestions. I hope that we will make all efforts and we shall satisfy Mr. Banatwalla's desire that there should be some kind of com-



pulsions in expediting the translations into the official languages of the country. Therefore, I may ask Mr. Banatwalla to withdraw his amendment. I thank all the hon. Members who have participated in the debate. I am extremely grateful that this Bill has got unanimous support. I commend this Bill to the House to be passed.

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : The question is :

"That the Bill to amend the Authorised Translations (Central Laws) Act, 1973, as passed by Rajya Sabha, be taken into consideration."

*The motion was adopted.*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER : Now, the House will take up Clause by Clause consideration of the Bill. The question is :

"That Clauses 2 and 3 stand part of the Bill."

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clauses 2 and 3 were added to the Bill.*

*Clause 4 (Amendment of Section 2)*

SHRI G.M. BANATWALLA ; I beg to move :

Page 1,—

*for clause 4, substitute—*

'4. For Section 2 of the principal Act, the following section shall be substituted, namely :—

"2. (1) The President shall cause to be published under his authority a translation in every language (other than Hindi) specified in the Eighth Schedule to the Constitution,—

(a) of any Central Act or of any Ordinance promulgated by the President ; or

(b) of any order, rule, regulation or bye-law issued under the Consti-

tution or under any Central Act.

(2) The translation published under this section shall be deemed to be, for all purposes, the authoritative text in such language."(1)

Mr. Deputy Speaker Sir, I move the amendment. Shri Panigrahi is a very competent Minister. You see how he couched the whole thing and we all agree. I agree with the Government that they are also very sincere in seeing that the authoritative texts are made available in all the languages that are mentioned in the Eighth Schedule of the Constitution. I appreciate his assurance that he has given that every effort will be made to see that these translations and these authoritative texts are made available. My only appeal to him is that those very sentiments and these very ideas should be unequivocally translated into the language of the Bill. Where is the difference? We both agree. Let us have a language of the Bill which really brings out what we agree without leaving any scope for any sort of interpretation later on. I have a little apprehension not on the part of the hon. Minister but I do have an apprehension. The whole importance and the stress is now being shifted from authorised translations to authorised texts. We must understand the implications and the consequences of this shift in the importance and in the stress. Now the objective is also limited. It is mentioned in the Statement of Objects and Reasons of the Bill and it is also reiterated very faithfully by the hon. Minister. The objective of this shift in the emphasis from having authorised translations to having authoritative texts is that these texts should be available to be quoted in Courts of Law, in States where those languages are official languages. In other words, the Centre will now be primarily concerned in making authorised texts those languages which are Court languages in some States or the other I am afraid Urdu may suffer. Urdu is not the official language anywhere, leave apart the question of Jammu and Kashmir. There is a certain constitutional position there, nowhere else.

16.00 hrs

Your intentions are good ; I welcome and congratulate you, but in your anxiety



[Shri G.M. Banatwalla]

to make authoritative texts available and not mere translations, you will be going in primarily for the translations of Central laws into those languages which are used as official languages in certain States so that in those States these authoritative texts can be quoted in the courts of law. This is the limited objective and this objective will therefore affect the priorities for the work. I, therefore, want to make it compulsory without leaving and loophole whatsoever. I want it to be made statutorily compulsory that authoritative texts should be made available in all the languages mentioned in the 8th Schedule so that no language like Urdu may get neglected and may hang in the balance. That is the only apprehension.

**SHRI CHINTAMANI PANIGRAHI :** I appreciate the sentiments expressed by Shri Banatwalla, but I have explained to him the difficulties to accept his amendment. But we will definitely keep in mind the question of Urdu.

I appreciate his sentiments and can assure him that Urdu language will not be neglected in this regard as it is one of the languages included in the 8th Schedule.

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER :** It is already 6 O'clock. We would complete this Bill and then take up half-an hour discussion. I hope the House agrees with it.

**MANY HON. MEMBERS :** Yes, yes.

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER :** Mr. Banatwalla.

**SHRI G M. BANATWALLA :** I appreciate this assurance. Urdu should not be neglected because of technicalities. In view of the assurance, I seek leave of the House to withdraw my amendment.

*Amendment No. 1 was, by leave,  
withdrawn.*

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER :** The question is :

"That Clause 4 stand part of the Bill."

*The motion was adopted.*

*Clause 4 was added to the Bill.*

*Clause 1 (Short title)*

**Amendment made :**

Page 1, line 4—

for "1987" substitute "1988"(2)

[Shri Chintamani Panigrahi]

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER :** The question is :

"That Clause 1, as amended, stand part of the Bill".

*The motion was adopted*

*Clause 1 as amended, was added to  
the Bill*

*Enacting formula*

**Amendment made :**

Page 1, line 1—

for "Thirty-eighth" substitute

"Thirty-ninth"(1)

[Shri Chintamani Panigrahi]

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER :** The question is :

"That Enacting Formula, as amended, stand part of the Bill"

*The motion was adopted.*

*The Enacting Formula, as amended,  
was added to the Bill.*

*The Title was added to the Bill.*

**SHRI CHINTAMANI PANIGRAHI :** I beg to move :

"That the Bill, as amended, be passed".

**MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER :** The question is :

"That the Bill, as amended, be passed".

*The motion was adopted.*