

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: Professor, tempers cool down with the passage of time and tension is diffused. I thought that heat would subside and we would be able to proceed with the business. If you do not want it, it is a different matter.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It would have been good if things had worked that way but unfortunately business can not be conducted in this way.

[*English*]

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN (Bahraich): Sir, you talk to him and persuade him to resign.

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: My job is to conduct the business of the House. What you say is not my job but yours.

(Interruptions)

I request you with folded hands to take up the matter yourself.

(Interruptions)

18.48 hrs.

MOTION RE: EXTENSION OF TIME FOR SITTING OF THE HOUSE

[*English*]

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT): Sir, I beg to move:

"That the sitting of the House be further extended upto 8 P.M."

(Interruptions)

We have so much business to go through. May I ask the Members to cooperate?

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): An elderly lady is behaving like a child, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: I am not childish, I am very serious. We have a responsibility to run the House.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA (Bankura): You are not at all serious.

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: Do you say, I am not serious? I am very serious because we have the responsibility to run the House, and we have to run the Government *(Interruptions)*

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: A judge will have to be appointed to decide as to who is serious.

(Interruptions)[*English*]

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: What is the purpose of extension?

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: The hopes are that you might cooperate with us and we can get on with the business of the House.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SOMNATH CHATTERJEE (Bolgur): Sir, I am moving an amendment to the motion moved by Shrimati Sheila Dikshit. I beg to move:

"For 8 P.M., substitute '12 midnight."

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: We will

think about 12 0' Clock when we come to the business of the House. (*Interruptions*)

[*Translation*]

MR. SPEAKER: I shall agree to what hon. Shri Somnath says, not to what you say.

(*Interruptions*)

[*English*]

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: Sir, I am terribly sorry. We want to get on with this business and we are asking for extension of time; they call it a joke. But when they want the House to be adjourned every ten minutes, they do not call it a joke. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: We want the resignation of the Prime Minister.

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: You have no right to ask for the resignation of the Prime Minister. Either you bring a No-Confidence Motion or face the elections in a couple of months.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: We are serious. Therefore we are demanding the resignation of the Prime Minister. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, has Mr. Somnath Chatterjee's Amendment been accepted? Instead of 8 0' clock, he has suggested 12 0' clock. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: For me, the House is supreme. I have no objection from my side.

(*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI DIKSHIT: I have proposed 8 0' clock and I intend sticking to it. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: The Amendment to the proposal is that it may be 12 0' clock...

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: No, Sir.

For the moment, I reject the Amendment. The House is the master of its time. For the moment, I am proposing 8 0' clock..... (*Interruptions*)

Sir, I am terribly sorry. They are making extension of time a joke. (*Interruptions*)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Indian Parliament will come to life. Put it at 12 0' clock. (*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT: Sir, this is a serious matter. I have proposed that the time of the House be extended upto 80' clock. (*Interruptions*)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (Jadavpur): Sir, they do not want to discuss the matter. I they have the guts, let them discuss the matter in the House. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: Now, I have got two things. One is the proposal to extend upto 8 0' clock, and second, there is an Amendment. First I have to put the amendment to vote.

The proposal as put forward by Shrimati Sheila Dikshit is about the extension of the House till 8 0' Clock and there is Shri Somnath Chatterjee's amendment to that to extend the House till 12 0' Clock.

First, I shall put the amendment of Shri Somnath Chatterjee to the vote of the House.

The question:

"For '8 P.M.' substitute '12 midnight'."

Let the lobbies be cleared.

19.00 hrs.

Now, the Lobbies have been cleared.

I shall put the amendment moved by Shri Somnath Chatterjee to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"For '8 P.M.', substitute '12 midnight'."

(*Interruptions*)

SHRIMATI GEETA MUKHERJEE
(Panskura): Sir, it is already 7 0' Clock. You cannot count the votes. (*Interruptions*)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN: Sir, the sitting of the House was extended up to 7 0' clock. Unless the time is extended, it cannot be put to the vote of the House. (*Interruptions*)

MR. SPEAKER: We are in the process. The question is this. If the process has started before that, then we are in order. If the process has not started, then we are not in order. The process has started before 7 0' clock.

(*Interruptions*)

The Lok Sabha divided

19.02 hrs.

[Division No. 1]

AYES

Acharia, Shri Basudeb

Banatwalla, Shri G.M.

Barman, Shri Palas

Bhoopathy, Shri G.

Chaliha, Shri Parag

Chatterjee, Shri Somnath

Chowdhary, Shri Saifuddin

Dandavate, Prof, Madhu

Datta, Shri Amal

Deo, Shri V. Kishore Chandra S

Dora, Shri H.A.

Goswami, Shri Dinesh

Gupta, Shri Indrajit

Hannan Mollah, Shri

Hansda, Shri Matilal

Het Ram, Shri

Iyer, Shri V.S. Krishna

Jhansi Lakshmi, Shrimati N.P.

Kalanidhi, Dr. A.

Kalpana Devi, Dr. T.

Khan, Shri Arif Mohammad

Khan, Shri Mohd. Mahfooz Ali

Kurup, Shri Suresh

Malik, Shri Purna Chandra

Mandal, Shri Sanat Kumar

Masudal Hossain, Shri Syed

Misra, Shri Satyagopal

Patel, Dr. A.K.

Patel, Shri Shantilal Purushottambhai

Pathak, Shri Ananda

Patil, Shri D.B.

Pradhan, Shri K.N.

Raju, Shri Vijaya Kumar

Ram Bahadur Singh, Shri

Ramaiah, Shri B.B.

Rao, Shri A.J.V.B. Maheswara

Rao, Dr. G. Vijaya Rama

Arunachalam, Shri M

Rao, Shri Srihari

Bairagi, Shri Balkavi

Rao, Shri V. Sobhanadreeswara

Balaraman, Shri L

Reddi, Shri C. Madhav

Banerjee, Kumari Mamata

Reddy, Shri B.N.

Basavarajeswari, Shrimat

Reddy, Shri Bezawada Papi

Basavaraju, Shri G.S

Reddy, Shri K. Ramachandra

Basheer, Shri T.

Reddy, Shri Shri P. Manik

Bhagat Shri H.K.L.

Reddy, Shri S. Jaipal

Bharat Singh, Shri

Roy, Dr. Sudhir

Bhoi, Dr. Krupasindhu

Saha, Shri Ajit Kumar

Bhumij, Shri Haren

Saha, Shri Gadadhar

Birbal, Shri

Saikia, Shri M.R.

Birinder Singh, Shri

Sambu, Shri C.

Buta Singh, S.

Shahabuddin, Shri Syed

Chandrakar, Shri Chandulal

Somu, Shri N.V.N.

Chandrasekhar, Shrimati M.

Swamy, Shri D. Narayana

Charles, Shri A.

Tiraky, Shri Piyus

Choudhary, Shri Nandlal

Tulsiram, Shri V.

Dalbir Singh, Shri

Zainal Abedin, Shri

Das, Shri Bipin Pal

Das, Shri Sudarsan

NOES

Akhtar, Hasan, Shri

Deora, Shri Murli

Alkha Ram, Shri

Dev, Shri Sontosh Mohan

Ansari, Shri Abdul Hannan

Dhariwal, Shri Shanti

Ansari, Shri Z.R.

Dighe, Shri Sharad

Antomy Shri P.A.

Digvijaya Singh, Shri

Dikshit, Shrimati Sheila

Law, Shri Asutosh

Ganga Ram, Shri

Mallick, Shri Lakshman

Ghosal, Shri Debi

Malviya, Shri Bapulal

Ghosh, Shri Bimal Kanti

Manorama Singh, Shrimati

Gupta, Shrimati Prabhawati

Meira Kumar, Shrimati

Jaffar Sharief, Shri C.K.

Mishra, Dr. Prabhat Kumar

Jain, Shri Virdhi Chander

Mishra, Shri Ram Nagina

Jangde, Shri Khelan Ram

Modi, Shri Vishnu

Jatav, Shri Kammodilal

Mohanty, Shri Brajamohan

Jeevarathinam, Shri R.

Motilal Singh, Shri

Jena, Shri Chintamani

Murthy, Shri M.V. Chandrashekara

Jujhar Singh, Shri

Mushran, Shri Ajay

Kamla Kumari, Kumari

Naik, Shri G. Devaraya

Kaul, Shrimati Sheila

Naik, Shri Shantaram

Ken, Shri Lala Ram

Namgyal, Shri P.

Keyur Bhushan, Shri

Odeyar, Shri Channaiah

Khan, Shri Aslam Sher

Oraon, Shrimati Sumati

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ayub (Jhunjhunu)

Pandey, Shri Madan

Khan, Shri Mohd. Ayub (Udhampur)

Pandey, Shri Manoj

Khan, Shri Zulfiquar Ali

Panigrahi, Shri Sriballav

Krishna Singh, Shri

Panika, Shri Ram Pyare

Kujur, Shri Maurice

Pawan, Shri Ram Bhagat

Kumaramangalam, Shri P.R.

Pathak, Shri Chandra Kishore

Kunjambu, Shri

Patil, Shri Balasaheb Vikhe

Kurien, Prof. P.J.

Patil, Shri Uttamrao

Lachchhi Ram, Shri

Patil, Shri Veerendra

357	<i>Ext. of Time</i>	ASADHA 29, 1911 (SAKA)	<i>of House</i>	358
	Pattnaik, Shri Jagannath		Sharma, Shri Nand Kishore	
	Poojary, Shri Janardhana		Shastri, Shri Hari Krishna	
	Potdukhe, Shri Shantaram		Shingda, Shri D.B.	
	Puran Chandra, Shri		Singaravadivel, Shri S.	
	Qureshi, Shri Aziz		Singh, Shri Chandra Pratap Narain	
	Rai, Shri I. Rama		Singh, Shri Kamla Prasad	
	Raj Karan Singh, Shri		Singh, Shri Krishna Pratap	
	Rajhans, Dr. G.S.		Singh, Shri N. Tombi	
	Ram Prakash, Ch.		Sodi, Shri Mankuram	
	Ram, Shri Ram Ratan		Soren, Shri Harihar	
	Ram, Shri Ramswaroop		Sparrow, Shri R.S.	
	Ram Awadh Prasad, Shri		Sukhbuns Kaur, Shrimati	
	Ram Samujhawan, Shri		Sultanpuri, Shri K.D.	
	Ramachandran, Shri Mullappally		Sunder Singh, Ch.	
	Rana Vir Singh, Shri		Swami Prasad Singh, Shri	
	Ranga, Prof. N.G.		Tewary, Prof. K.K.	
	Rao, Shri K.S.		Thara Devi, Kumari D.K.	
	Rao, Shri V. Krishna		Thomas, Prof. K.V.	
	Raut, Shri Bhola		Thorat, Shri Bhausahab	
	Rawat, Shri Prabhu Lal		Thungon, Shri P.K.	
	Shai, Shrimati Krishna		Tigga, Shri Simᳵn	
	Sethi, Shri Ananta Prasad		Tripathi, Dr. Chandra Shekhar	
	Shah, Shri Anoopchand		Yadav, Shri Kailash	
	Shaktawat, Prof. Nirmala Kumari		Yazdani, Dr. Golam	
	Shanmugam, Shri P.		Yogesh, Shri Yogeshwar Prasad	
	Sharma, Shri Chiranji Lal		Zainul Basher, Shri	

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: *Subject to correction, the result of the division is:

Ayes : 56

Noes : 135

The amendment was negatived

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, I am on a point of order... *(Interruptions)*

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Sir, I am on a point of order... *(Interruptions)*

MR. SPEAKER: I am replying to that point of order.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: Whose point of order?

MR. SPEAKER: I am replying to Shrimati Geeta Mukherjee's point of order. The question is that if we had not started before 7 O' Clock, then it would have been *ultra vires*.

(Interruptions)

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa): We have just rejected the proposal for the extension of time of the House.

MR. SPEAKER: Please listen to me. We have been proceeding according to the general procedure which is already in order. Otherwise, why should I bother? I will not press for anything which is not legal.

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN: This is a question of rules.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: You must follow the rules.

MR. SPEAKER: I am following the rules. But you are not... Any process which has started should not be left undone. This is the general procedure. We have always been following this. You cannot leave things half way. When you have started the process, you have to complete it. All along, we have been doing it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: I shall now put the motion moved by Shrimati Sheila Dikshit to extend the time of the House till 8 O' Clock, to the vote of the House.

The question is:

"That the sitting of the House be further extended upto 8 P.M."

The motion was adopted

(Interruptions)

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE: Sir, the Government may commit a blunder. But let not the blunder be committed from the Chair. This is my humble request.

MR. SPEAKER: I am not committing any blunder. This is the general practice. All along we have been following this. If I had started the process after 7 O' Clock then it would have been *ultra vires*.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: So, the time of the House is extended upto 8 O' Clock.

(Interruptions)

*The following Members also recorded their Votes:

AYES: Sarvashri E. Ayyappu Reddy, Chita Mahata, M. Subba Reddy and Gopal Krishna Thota.

NOES : Sarvashri Janak Raj Gupta, Subhash Yadav, Deep Narain Van and Dal Chander Jain

MR. SPEAKER: If you want, again I can put it to division. I have discussed it. I am completely on firm grounds.

SHRI BASUDEB ACHARIA: What is the rule?

MR. SPEAKER: This is the general rule. This is the general practice we have been following all along. It is not for the first time we are doing it.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Can you quote any rule by which you are objecting?

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Under what rule you are...

MR. SPEAKER: It was already in process.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: It was process before that.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: What process?

MR. SPEAKER: I had already started the process before that.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: The ruling has been given.

(Interruptions)

19.06 hrs.

RE: DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

Paragraphs 11 and 12 of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor, General of India for the year ended 31st March, 1988 (No. 2 of 1989)—Union Government Defence Services (Army and Ordnance Factorles)

[English]

MR. SPEAKER: Now, do you want to start the discussion?

(Interruptions)

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: Please start the discussion.

[English]

Can you start the discussion?

PROF. MADHU DANDAVATE (Rajapur): What is this, Sir? When there is such a clear indictment by the CAG on the entire Government...

[Translation]

MR. SPEAKER: You can say that during the course of discussion.

[English]

You can say whatever you want to say in the discussion.

(Interruptions)

MR. SPEAKER: Professor Sahib, can I say something about that?

(Interruptions)