

SHRI T. BASHEER (Chirayinkil): I will sit, Sir. But one thing—we are all requesting that our Parliamentary Affairs Minister... *(Interruptions)* I will sit. But you must keep this in mind that you are allowing them to say everything. But they are disturbing and stalling the proceedings of the House. This is very bad.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: They are now all right, don't worry. I will take care of them. Please sit down.

AN HON. MEMBER: I have a point of order, Sir.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Afterwards. After Mr. Rao, I will call you. Please sit down.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I have not called you.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please order.

14.49 hrs.

RE: DISCUSSION UNDER RULE 193

[English]

Paragraphs 11 and 12 of the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General of India for the year ended 31st March, 1988 (No. 2 of 1989)—Union Government Defence Services (Army and Ordnance Factories)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO (Vijayawada): Never before the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General was discussed in this House. Now, by putting for

discussion the Report of the Comptroller and Auditor General there is every possibility—because already we had some experience where some hon. Members from the ruling party have already cast aspersions on the Comptroller and Auditor General and during the discussion when the hon. Members cast aspersions on the Report, it invariably leads to... *(Interruptions)*

15.00 hrs.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I will allow you next. After he speaks, I will call the Madam and then I will give my ruling.

(Interruptions)

SHRI V. SOBHANADREESWARA RAO: Will not these aspersions adversely affect the independent functioning of that highest body? *(Interruptions)* So, in view of the fact that earlier there were lot of discussions on the contract with Bofors and finally the Comptroller and Auditor General has given the report, only action should be taken now. No discussion should be allowed... *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not giving my ruling. I want to add one more thing, because not only Members on the Treasury Benches but Opposition Members also have given notice.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you want, I will give you the names.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Prof. Madhu Dandavate, Shri Jaipal Reddy, Shri Basudeb Acharia, Kumar, Mamata Banerjee, Shri Sharad Dighe, Shri Harish Rawat and Shri Narayan Choubey, all have given notice

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you want my ruling, first allow me to listen to everyone.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Madam, do you want to say something?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am not giving my ruling.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Am I the Deputy-Speaker or are you the Deputy-Speaker?

(Interruptions)

I am ready to listen. First I will listen to Prof. Madhu Dandavate and then to Mr. Rao. Thereafter, I will call the Madam. .

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: It is the same point which is being raised. I want to listen to other Members also. Then only I can give my ruling...

(Interruptions)

SHRI SURESH KURUP (Kottayam): The whole country is concerned about the CAG report. The Prime Minister should come here. Where is he?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Jaipal Reddy, till now you have cooperated very well. Why can't you cooperate for some more time?

SHRI S. JAIPAL REDDY (Mahbubnagar): Shri Saifuddin Chowdhary will speak.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Without my permission, if anybody speaks, it will not come on record. I will not allow.

(Interruptions)

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF PARLIAMENTARY AFFAIRS AND MINISTER OF STATE IN THE PRIME MINISTER'S OFFICE (SHRIMATI SHEILA DIKSHIT): I am sorry to note that the Opposition is running away from the debate. It had asked through motions for a discussion on the CAG report. Prof. Madhu Dandavate is now wanting to avoid the discussion. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please order.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing goes on record. Not allowed.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If you allow Madam, I will call you later.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing goes on record. I have not permitted them.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Nothing will go on record. I am not permitting it.

*(Interruptions)**

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Purushothaman, take your seat.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order, please.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I want to give one chance to this side and then I will call you.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa): All right, you give them a chance.
(Interruptions)

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA (Basirhat): Mr. Deputy-Speaker, at 3.30 P.M., Private Members' Business has to be taken up. I humbly suggest to you that you may adjourn the House now till 3.30 P.M.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Why? There are only ten minutes left.

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: Everybody will be in a mood...

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: If all of you accept that, then only I can do it. How can I do it on my own?

SHRI INDRAJIT GUPTA: It is better to cool down and then begin Private Members' Business. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Order, please.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am allowing Kumari Mamata Banerjee. Mr. Rao has already raised a point of order and I have to give my ruling.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: I am conducting the proceedings.

(Interruptions)

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE (Jadavpur): It is a matter of concern that unnecessarily they are wasting our time every day.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: You wanted to raise a point of order. What is your point of order?

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Please allow her to speak. Then I will call Shri Saifuddin Chowdhary next.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE: Madhu Dandavateji has given notice for a discussion under Rule 193 to discuss the CAG Report. First of all, it is very surprising that they don't want to discuss this matter. They want the Prime Minister to resign. If they have guts, they should bring a No Confidence Motion here; then they will see the result. Otherwise this matter should be discussed in the House. We want to discuss the CAG Report in the House. They cannot misuse public money like this..... *(Interruptions)*.....*

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Why are you saying this? I don't allow.

KUMARI MAMATA BANERJEE: You allow the discussion. We want to discuss this Report. Dandavateji has given notice for this. He wanted a discussion. Now, I don't know why he is backing out. But we want to discuss it today itself. We have decided it in the Business Advisory Committee. I know this because I am also a member of the Business Advisory Committee. Please allow

the discussion today itself.

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY (Katwa): After yesterday's stalemate, today the people at large outside expected that the Prime Minister will come and face the House... *(Interruptions)*... But we are surprised to see that the Prime Minister could not summon the courage to come to the House and face the House.

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: Mr. Chowdhary, please listen to me. Do you want to say about the point of order raised by Shri V. Sobhanadreeswara Rao?

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: Point of order on this will be taken up on Monday, not today. Today the question is why is the Prime Minister not present in the House. We have been demanding it. Why cannot he muster up the courage to come to the House?

MR. DEPUTY-SPEAKER: What is your point of order?

(Interruptions)

SHRI SAIFUDDIN CHOWDHARY: The whole controversy regarding Bofors has been centering around the Prime Minister and nobody in the Government or the Treasury Benches is in a position to give any reply.

The House has the right to know. As Members of the opposition, we have the right to request you to explain to the House as to why the Prime Minister has not come. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: It is not a point of order.

(Interruptions)

SHRI A. CHARLES (Trivandrum): Sir, under Article 148 of the Constitution, the C&AG should report to the President of India, who shall place it before the House and it is the right of the House to discuss it. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Please listen to me.

SHRI A. CHARLES: I am on a point of order. It is the right of the House to discuss it. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I want to make it clear to the House....

(Interruptions)

SHRI ARIF MOHAMMAD KHAN (Bahraich): I insist on my right to be heard before you give a ruling. *(Interruptions)*

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Nobody is listening to me; everybody is shouting as he likes.

(Interruptions)

MR. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I will allow you to speak only on Shri V. Sobhanadreeswara Rao's point of order. We have every right to discuss whatever reports are placed before the House. We have never discussed the C&AG's report before. But when Members from both the sides requested for a discussion, the Speaker has allowed it. The Business Advisory Committee approved it and this House also approved it. How can do back now? We have already decided and there is no point of order in this matter. When the House has already adopted the BAG report, what can I do? It is not my wish. It is the wish of the House.

(Interruptions)